PROCEEDINGS

OF THE

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION.

VOLUME I.—PROCEEDINGS RELATING TO THE PUNJAB.

SECTIONS I, II AND III.

CALCUTTA:

PRINTED AT THE BENGAL SECRETARIAT PRESS.

1887.

PROCEEDINGS

OF

THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION.

PUNJAB.

VOLUME I, SECTIONS I—III.

CONTENTS.

SECTION I.

SUB-SECTION A.—NOTICE AND LETTERS INVITING EVIDENCE AND INFORMATION RELATING TO THE PUNJAB.

No.		PAGE
I.	MEMORANDUM and Notice	1
II.	LETTERS calling for information	*ib.*
II*a*.	LETTER No. 4, dated 16th November 1886, from the Secretary, Public Service Commission, to the Secretary to the Government, Punjab, Lahore	2
II*b*.	LETTER No. 19, dated 30th November 1886, from the Secretary, Public Service Commission, to the Secretary to the Government, Punjab, Lahore	*ib.*
III.	LIST of persons who were invited or summoned, or who volunteered to give evidence before the Commission	4

SUB-SECTION B.—INFORMATION SUPPLIED BY THE GOVERNMENT OF THE PUNJAB.

I.	REPLIES of the Punjab Government to the questions of the Public Service Commission (Set A)	14
II.	MEMORANDUM on the special features of the Punjab	31
III.	LETTER and rules referred to in the answers of the Punjab Government to questions 70 and 276 to 286	39
IV.	LETTER No. 3, dated the 16th November 1886, from the Secretary, Public Service Commission, to the Secretary to Government, Punjab, calling for detailed returns relating to the executive and judicial administration of the Punjab	64
V.	LETTER No. 1, dated the 3rd January 1887, from the Under Secretary, Punjab Government, to the Secretary, Public Service Commission, supplying the information called for in No. IV	65
VI.	LETTER No. 89, dated the 5th January 1887, from the Secretary, Public Service Commission, to the Secretary to Government, Punjab, calling for statistics regarding the educational tests passed by persons employed in the Subordinate Judicial Service and Subordinate Executive Service in the Punjab; and the reply, No. 552, dated the 16th March 1887	68
VII.	LETTER No. 102, dated the 22nd January 1887, from the Secretary, Public Service Commission, to the Secretary to Government, Punjab, calling for returns showing the nationalities and castes of persons employed in the Subordinate Judicial Service and Subordinate Executive Service in the Punjab; and the reply, No. 922, dated the 17th April 1887	69
VIII.	LETTER No. 112, dated the 15th February 1887, from the Secretary, Public Service Commission, to the Secretary to Government, Punjab, calling for a return of the number of persons who have passed University Examinations, and the nationalities and castes to which they belong; and the reply, No. 875, dated the 22nd April 1887	70
IX.	LETTER No. 131, dated the 7th March 1887, from the Secretary, Public Service Commission, to the Secretary to Government, Punjab, calling for information showing the extent to which encouragement is offered to Natives of the Punjab, by means of Government scholarships or otherwise, to proceed to England for the purpose of completing their education; and the reply, No. 742, dated the 6th April 1887, and enclosure	72

SECTION II.—MINUTES OF EVIDENCE TAKEN IN THE PUNJAB.

(SITTINGS AT LAHORE.)

No.		PAGE
I.	The Hon'ble Colonel W. G. DAVIES, C.S.I., First Financial Commissioner	1
II.	MAHOMED HYAT KHAN, C.S.I., S.C.S., Assistant Commissioner, Officiating District Judge, Mooltan	9
III.	T. W. SMYTH, Esq., C.S., Barrister-at-Law, Officiating Judge, Chief Court, Punjab	19
IV.	T. C. LEWIS, Esq., M.A., Principal, Government College, Lahore	28
V.	SHEIKH NANAK BUKHSH, Pleader, Chief Court, Punjab	35
VI.	BABU JADU NATH MOZAMDAR, M.A., Editor, *Tribune* newspaper	46
VII.	R. T. BURNEY, Esq., C.S., Barrister-at-Law, Judge, Chief Court, Punjab	56
VIII.	W. MACKWORTH YOUNG, Esq., M.A., C.S., Secretary to Government, Punjab	68&209
IX.	J. BRIDGES-LEE, Esq., Barrister-at-Law, practising at Lahore	75
X.	SARDAR GURDIAL SINGH, S. C. S., Assistant Commissioner, Kohat	78
XI.	F. C. CHANNING, Esq., C.S., Deputy Commissioner, Officiating District Judge, Lahore	93
XII.	G. R. ELSMIE, Esq., C.S., Commissioner and Superintendent, Lahore Division	96
XIII.	C. A. ROE, Esq., C.S., Divisional Judge, Lahore	101
XIV.	COLONEL W. R. M. HOLROYD, Director of Public Instruction, Punjab	106
XV.	J. A. E. MILLER, Esq., U.C.S., District Judge and Commissioner of Income Tax, Punjab	111
XVI.	SARDAR DYAL SINGH, Majithia of Lahore	115
XVII.	RAI BUTA MAL, U.C.S., Extra Judicial Assistant Commissioner, Judge, Small Cause Court, Lahore	119
XVIII.	BABU PROTUL CHANDER CHATTERJI, M.A., B.L., Pleader, High Court, practising at Lahore	124
XIX.	LALA KUNHYA LAL, Pleader, Chief Court, Punjab, Nominee of the *Indian Association*, Lahore	129
XX.	S. Le P. T. Clifford, Esq., U.C.S., Extra Judicial Assistant Commissioner, District Judge, Delhi	132
XXI.	LALA SAGAR CHUND, B.A., U.C.S., Assistant Professor, Government College, Lahore	134
XXII.	CARR STEPHEN, Esq., U.C.S., Barrister-at-Law, Extra Judicial Assistant Commissioner, District Judge, Ludhiana	137
XXIII.	E. W. PARKER, Esq., U.C.S., Extra Judicial Assistant Commissioner, Dalhousie	140
XXIV.	BABU KALI PROSONO ROY, M.A., B.L., Pleader, High Court, practising at Lahore	144
XXV.	LALA LAL CHAND, M.A., Pleader, Chief Court, Punjab	149
XXVI.	J. SIME, Esq., B.A., U.C.S., Educational Department, Tutor to His Highness the Maharaja of Patiala	151
XXVII.	KAZI MAHOMED ASLAM, S.C.S., Assistant Commissioner, Rawalpindi	157
XXVIII.	SYAD MAHOMED LATIF KHAN, U.C.S., Extra Assistant Commissioner, Bannu	159
XXIX.	MAULVI INAM ALI, B.A., nominee of the *Anjuman-i-Islamia*, Lahore	161
XXX.	MIAN NIZAMUDDIN, President of the *Zemindars' Reforming Society*, Lahore	163
XXXI.	PANDIT GOPI NATH, Editor, *Akhbar-i-Am* newspaper, Lahore	165
XXXII.	NAWAB ABDOOL MAJID KHAN, MULTANI, Honorary Magistrate, Lahore	167
XXXIII.	FAKIR SYAD KAMARUDDIN, Honorary Magistrate, Lahore	170
XXXIV.	LALA NARAIN DAS I, M.A., U.C.S., Extra Assistant Commissioner, Shahpur	171
XXXV.	PANDIT CHANDAR BAL, U.C.S., Extra Assistant Commissioner, Gurgaon	175
XXXVI.	LALA AMOLAK RAM, U.C.S., Munsiff of Lahore	178
XXXVII.	SHEIKH MAHOMED SHAH, Pleader, nominee of the *Anjuman-i-Islamia*, Amritsar	180
XXXVIII.	GOLAK NATH CHATTERJI, B.A. (*Cam.*), U.C.S., Assistant Professor, Government College, Lahore	182
XXXIX.	BHAI JOWAHIR SINGH, Nominee of the *Guru Singh Sabha*, Lahore	185
XL.	MUNSHI DEWAN CHAND, Editor of the *Rufai-i-Am* newspaper, Sialkot	187
XLI.	LALA HARSUKH RAI, Proprietor of the *Koh-i-Nur* newspaper, Lahore	189
XLII.	COLONEL G. GORDON YOUNG, B.S.C., Commissioner and Superintendent, Jullundur Division	190
XLIII.	HONORARY SURGEON RAHIM KHAN, *Khan Bahadur*, U.C.S., Superintendent, Vernacular Department, Medical College, Lahore	197
XLIV.	SARDAR CHARAT SINGH, U.C.S., Extra Assistant Commissioner, Gurdaspur	199
XLV.	LALA MULRAJ, M.A., U.C.S., Extra Assistant Commissioner, Jhang	201
XLVI.	MUNSHI MUHARRAM ALI, *Chishti*, Editor of the *Rafik-i-Hind* newspaper, Lahore	203
XLVII.	MAULVI MAHOMED ISMAIL, Peshawar	205
XLVIII.	G. LEWIS, Esq., B.A., U.C.S., Officiating Junior Government Advocate, Punjab	206

SECTION II—*concluded.*

PAGE

XLIX.—SODHI MAN SINGH, Landed Proprietor, Honorary Magistrate, Ferozepore . 212
L.—RISSALDAR BAHADUR, SIRDAR MAN SINGH, C.I.E., President of the Managing Committee of the *Darbar Sahib*, Amritsar 213
LI.—W. E. PURSER, Esq., C.S., Deputy Commissioner, Rohtak 214
LII.—D. C. J. IBBETSON, Esq., B.A., C.S., Deputy Commissioner, Delhi . . 216
LIII.—LALA LACHMAN DAS, *Poplai*, B.A., U.C.S., Extra Assistant Commissioner, Delhi 220
LIV.—LALA CHUNI LAL, M.A., U.C.S., Extra Assistant Commissioner, Ludhiana . 222
LV.—MUNSHI GYAN CHAND, Editor of the *Victoria* newspaper, Sialkot . . . 224
LVI.—MUNSHI BRIJ LAL, Editor of the *Khair-Khwah-i-Punjab* newspaper, Gujranwalla 226
LVII.—RAI BAHADUR KUNHYA LAL, M.I.C.E., late Executive Engineer, Public Works Department, Punjab 227
LVIII.—SHEIKH UMAR BUKHSH, Barrister-at-Law, practising at Mooltan, nominee of the Deputy Commissioner, Mooltan 229
LIX.—R. G. THOMSON, Esq., C.S., Senior Secretary, Financial Commissioner, Punjab 231
LX.—R. MACONACHIE, Esq., B.A., C.S., Deputy Commissioner, Gurgaon . . 233
LXI.—NAWAB IMAM BUKHSH KHAN, C.I.E., Chief of the Mazari Tribe, Rajanpore, Dehra Ismail Khan, Punjab 239
LXII.—SARDAR BIKRAMA SINGH, C.I.E., *Ahluwalia*, Jullundur 240
LXIII.—W. COLDSTREAM, Esq., C.S., Deputy Commissioner, Gurdaspur . . . 242
LXIV.—LALA BHAWANI DASS, M.A., U.C.S., Extra Assistant Commissioner, Mooltan . 245
LXV.—LALA HAKÚMAT RAI, Representative of the *Indurpurst* Society, Delhi . . 246
LXVI.—MAHOMED UMAR KHAN, U.C.S., Extra Assistant Commissioner, nominee of the Deputy Commissioner, Peshawar 247
LXVII.—RAI BAHADUR GUNGARAM, Executive Engineer, Lahore 248
LXVIII.—SODHI HUKM SINGH, U.C.S., Extra Assistant Commissioner and Mir Munshi, Punjab Secretariat 249

NOTE.—The letters C.S., S.C.S., and U.C.S. indicate that the officers to whose names they are attached belong to the Covenanted Civil Service, the Statutory Civil Service, and the Uncovenanted Civil Service, respectively.

SECTION III—WRITTEN ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS OF THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION.

SUB-SECTION A.—ANSWERS OF SOCIETIES AND ASSOCIATIONS IN THE PUNJAB.

I.—The ANJUMAN-I-ISLAMIA, Lahore 2
II.—The ANJUMAN-I-ISLAMIA, Gujrat 12
III.—The ANJUMAN-I-PUNJAB, Lahore 13
IV.—The ANJUMAN-I-FAIZAN-I-AM., Gujranwalla 14
V.—The ANJUMAN-I-ISLAMIA, Jullundur 24
VI.—The ANJUMAN-I-ISLAMIA, Amritsar 32
VII.—The INDIAN ASSOCIATION, Lahore 41
VIII.—The KYASTHA SABHA, Lahore 49

SUB-SECTION B.—WRITTEN ANSWERS OF PERSONS EITHER INVITED OR SUMMONED TO APPEAR, BUT UNABLE TO ATTEND THE SITTINGS OF THE COMMISSION.

I.—SIR H. M. PLOWDEN, B.A., Barrister-at-Law, Senior Judge, Chief Court, Punjab 52
II.—DEWAN RAM NATH, S. C. S., District Judge, Hoshiarpur 54
III.—SARDAR MAHOMED AFZAL KHAN, S. C. S., Assistant Commissioner, Kohat . . 63
IV.—CHAUDRI RUGNATH SINGH, President, Local Board, Delhi, nominee of the Deputy Commissioner, Delhi 74
V.—GHULAM AHMED KHAN, U. C. S., Tahsildar, nominee of the Deputy Commissioner, Amritsar 81
VI.—MAULVI PIRZADA MAHOMED HUSSAIN, M.A., U. C. S., Extra Assistant Commissioner, Punjab 90
VII.—C. L. TUPPER, Esq., C.S., Junior Secretary to Government, Punjab . . . 91

NOTE.—Incomplete replies were received from the Editor, *Aftab-i-Punjab* newspaper, Lahore; Editor, *Danish-i-Hind* newspaper, Multan; and Daulat Ram, Pleader, Chief Court, practising at Amritsar. These hav not been published.

SUB-SECTION C.—SELECTED ANSWERS OF PERSONS WHO VOLUNTEERED TO GIVE EVIDENCE.

Note by certain Junior Civilians of the Punjab 106

ERRATA.

Volume I.—Section II.

Page 4, *Question* 24, *line* 2. *Insert* "not" *after* "it."
„ 6, „ 54, „ 2. *For* "patronage" *read* "nomination".
„ 6, „ 55, „ 12, *For* "patronage" *read* "nomination".
„ 10, „ 97, „ 6. *For* "examinaton" *read* "examination".
„ 37, „ 470, „ 8. *Transfer* comma *after* "present" *to after* "England".
„ 45, „ 613, „ 4. *Insert* full stop *after* "less" *instead of* comma.
„ 46, „ 638, „ 3. *For* "for" *read* "from".
„ 54, „ 116, „ 2. *For* "Not" *read* "It is not".
„ 56, „ 648, „ 2. *For* "arefour" *read* "are four".
„ 69, „ 871, „ 5. *For* "these" *read* "any".
„ 76, „ 949, „ 12. *Insert* "with" *after* "compete".
„ 77, „ 965, „ 24. *For* "made" *read* "allowed."
„ 78, „ 971, „ 8. *Insert* "the" *after* "in".
„ 78, „ 973, „ 5. *Insert* full stop *after* "reason" *instead of* comma, and *for* "but enrolment" *read* "Enrolment".
„ 78, „ 973, „ 6. *Insert* "already" *after* "was," and *in line 8 insert* (:) *instead of* (.)
„ 81, „ 1016, „ 5. *For* "hold" *read* "decided".
„ 83, „ 1051, „ 8. *Omit* "much" *after* "very".
„ 83, „ 1054, „ 8. *For* "examination" *read* "examinations".
„ 85, „ 1076, „ 3. *For* "Covennanted" *read* "Covenanted".
„ 86, „ 1096, „ 7. *Omit* "not," and *after* "Divisions" *insert* "do not".
„ 86, „ 1096, „ 21, *After* "Persons" *insert* "who" and *in line 22 for* "life in" *read* "lives hold".
„ 90, „ 1166, „ 1. *For* "cascin" *read* "case in".
„ 96, „ 1234, „ 4. *For* "Covenanted Service" *read* "Commission".
„ 97, „ 1230, „ 4. *For* "extra" *read* "the further".
„ 101, „ 1262, „ 4. *For* "nominations" *read* "nomination".
„ 105, „ 1328, „ 5. *For* "and" *read* "can".
„ 112, „ 1369, „ 9. *For* "talks about" *read* "speaks of"; *in line 10, for* "really" *read* "only"; *in line 12, for* "talk of" *read* "describe", and *for* "means" *read* "includes".
„ 113, „ 1393, „ 4. *Insert* comma *after* "necessary".
„ 117, „ 1456, „ 2. *For* "classes" *read* "offices"; *in line 3 insert* "of" *after* "men", and *in line 4 insert* "ability" *after* "tried".
„ 120, „ 1477, „ 5. *Omit* "of" *after* "allow".
„ 126, „ 1555, „ 5. *Insert* dash *after* "reservation".
„ 129, „ 1588, „ 10. *For* "persens" *read* "persons".
„ 132, „ 1629, „ 3. *For* "rule swhich" *read* "rules which".
„ 150, „ 1828, „ 1. *For* "that there are" *read* "any".
„ 150, „ 1832, „ 4. *Insert* "court" *after* "subordinate."
„ 151, „ 1843, „ 3. *For* "fet" *read* "felt."
„ 153, „ 1863, „ 9. *For* "We have got" *read* "Natives possess".
„ 155, „ 1898, „ 2. *For* "are turned out" *read* "graduate"; *in line 3 insert* "In" *before* "The", *and in line 4* omit "turned out" *and insert* "graduated" *after* "950".
„ 155, „ 1899, *lines* 2 *and* 4. *For* "turned out" *read* "who graduate".
„ 155, „ 1904, *line* 11. *For* "provide" *read* "secure".
„ 155, „ 1909, „ 3. *For* "remained" *read* "mixed" and *for* "among" *read* "with".
„ 162, „ 2011, „ 3. *Insert* full stop after "hundred".
„ 165, „ 2045, „ 15. *For* "were" *read* "are".
„ 165, „ 2046, „ 4. *For* "of" *read* "and".
„ 168, „ 2078, „ 4. *For* "Satisfy" *read* "satisfy".
„ 173, „ 2116, „ 2. *Insert* "understood to be" *after* "are".
„ 182, „ 2234, „ 1. *For* "Sansorit" *read* "Sanskrit".
„ 186, „ 2292, „ 5. *Omit* comma *after* "class" and *insert* comma *after* "that".
„ 190, „ 2327, „ 1. *For* "What is your opinion" *read* "Do you approve of it"; and *in line 2, insert* full stop *after* "altogether".
„ 194, „ 2383, „ 1. *For* "Your" *read* "Admission through your".
„ 204, „ 2500, „ 3. *Insert* "the" *after* "from"; *for* "profession" *read* "professions," and *insert* "from" *after* "and".
„ 208, „ 2545, „ 1. *Insert* "some of" *after* "that," "*in line 2 for* "taken out of the ordinary course under special orders" *read* "exempted from the general orders", and *in line 4 insert* "of 1879," *after* "State".
„ 209, „ 2562, „ 1. *Insert* "there are" *after* "Yes".
„ 218, „ 2679, „ 6. *For* "placed" *read* "appointed".
„ 218, „ 2689, „ 1. *Omit* "any"; *in line 2 for* "No" *read* "Yes", and *for* "the" *read* "The".
„ 229, „ 2782, „ 3. *For* "kind" *read* "degree".
„ 232, „ 2805, „ 28. *For* "result. For" *read* "result: for".
„ 236, „ 2828, „ 50. *Before* "institution" *insert* "the".
„ 245, „ 2957, „ 9. *For* "beyond" *read* "except".
„ 249, „ 3004, „ 6. *After* "better" *insert* comma *instead of* semi-colon, and *in line 8 for* "more mature" *read* "nomination".

PROCEEDINGS

OF THE

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION.

VOLUME I.—SECTION I(A).—NOTICE AND LETTERS INVITING EVIDENCE AND INFORMATION RELATING TO THE PUNJAB.

I.

MEMO.

1. On the 30th November 1886, the following NOTICE was published in the leading journals of the Province, and in three issues of the *Punjab Government Gazette* :— Vol. I. Sec. I. Sub-Sec. A. Paper I.

NOTICE.

As the sittings of the Public Service Commission will shortly commence, persons resident in the Punjab, who may be desirous of tendering evidence on the subject of the Commission's enquiries, are invited to intimate their names and addresses to the Secretary to the Public Service Commission, Lahore, on or before the 13th December 1886, together with a brief note of the points on which they would wish to give evidence.

2. On the same date, letters were addressed by the Secretary of the Public Service Commission, by order of the President, to the Deputy Commissioners of Lahore, Amritsar, Peshawar, Delhi and Multan, forwarding sets of questions which had been prepared in connection with the enquiries of the Commission, with a request that they would be good enough to issue them to individual Natives in their districts whom they might consider capable of giving intelligent and useful replies.

3. Letters enclosing sets of questions were also addressed to all the important Societies in the Province, as well as to the Editors of all the leading newspapers, whether published in English or Vernacular, throughout the Province.

4. In communication with the Punjab Government, invitations to give evidence were issued to a large number of officials and other persons whose examination before the Commission was thought to be desirable.

5. The annexed list will show the names of gentlemen who were summoned or invited, or who volunteered to appear before the Commission at its sittings at Lahore. Those whose names are shown in italics did not appear, but several of them sent in written answers to the sets of questions. These written answers will be found in section III of this volume.

6. The sets of questions prepared and circulated are as follows :—

Set (A)—Local Governments and Administrations.
" (B)—Selected officers of the Covenanted Civil Service.
" (C)— " " " Statutory Civil Service.
" (D)— " " " Uncovenanted Service.
" (E)—Associations, Societies, Editors of newspapers, and members of the general public.

7. The letter No. 19 of 30th November 1886, annexed, will show the steps taken in regard to this matter.

Vol. I.
Sec. I.
Sub-Sec. A.
Paper II*a*.

II.

LETTERS CALLING FOR INFORMATION.

II(*a*).—No. 4, dated Lahore, the 16th November 1886.

From—F. C. DAUKES, ESQ., Secretary to the Public Service Commission,
To—The Secretary to the Government of the Punjab, Lahore.

I AM directed to request that, with the permission of His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor, the Public Service Commission may be favoured with a list of the names of selected officers serving in the Punjab and belonging to (*a*) the Covenanted Civil Service, (*b*) the Statutory Service, and (*c*) the Uncovenanted Service, whose opinions the Punjab Government may consider it desirable for the Commission to invite on the subject-matter of the enquiries with which it has been entrusted as set forth in the Resolution of the Government of India in the Home Department, No. 34—1573-80, dated 4th October 1886. I am also to request that the Commission may be favoured with a list of (1) any local Associations or Societies, (2) the Editors of the leading newspapers, both English and Vernacular, published in the Punjab who should, in the opinion of His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor, be consulted by the Commission. The Commission would further be glad if the Punjab Government would be good enough to suggest the names of any members of the general public, not being in Government service, who might with advantage be consulted on the subject-matter of the enquiries in question.

2. It is hoped that His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor will be good enough to let it be generally known throughout the Punjab that the Public Service Commission will be glad to receive the opinions of any Association or Society or of any gentlemen, whether or not in the service of Government, who may wish to lay their views before the Commission.

NOTE.—His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor of the Punjab being also President of the Public Service Commission, no separate reply was sent to this letter. The Hon'ble Sir Charles Aitchison himself supplied the information necessary under this letter. The list of persons invited, &c., will be found in No. III of this part.

II(*b*).—No. 19, dated Lahore, the 30th November 1886.

From—F. C. DAUKES, ESQ., Secretary to the Public Service Commission,
To—The Secretary to the Government of the Punjab, Lahore.

IN continuation of my letter No. 4, dated 16th November 1886, I am directed by the Public Service Commission to forward herewith five separate sets of questions bearing on their enquiries which the Commission desire to address—(1) to the several Local Governments and Administrations, (2) to selected officers of the Covenanted Civil Service, (3) to selected Statutory Civilians, (4) to selected officers of the Uncovenanted Service, and (5) to such Associations and Societies, Editors of newspapers, Vernacular and English, and members of the general public, not being in the service of Government, as it may be considered desirable to consult on the subject-matter of the enquiries of the Commission.

2. With reference to the questions (marked A) addressed to the Punjab Government, twenty-five copies of which are forwarded, I am to say that the Commission would be glad if His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor, after consulting such officers as he may see fit with regard to any of them, would be good enough to cause replies to be furnished to me with as little delay as possible. It is not necessary that the replies should be detained until all the questions have been answered, and it might be convenient if answers were sent from time to time as prepared, provided that the serial number attached to each question is correctly entered opposite the reply thereto. As some of the questions deal with statistical matters, it might further be convenient if the replies to these were thrown into a tabular form; but if this course is adopted, I am to request that care may be taken that the question or questions which each tabular statement embraces are accurately noted. Other questions, again, may possibly be better answered orally than in writing; and if this should appear to the Punjab Government to be the case, the Commission would be glad if His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor would indicate in what way the answers to such questions could most conveniently be given, either by the deputation of some special officer to represent the views of the Local Government, or in any other manner which may be deemed preferable.

3. As regards the other sets of questions, I am to explain that those marked B, C, and D, respectively, are intended to be addressed to such officers, being members of the Covenanted Civil Service, the Statutory Service, ort he Uncovenanted Service, as might, in the opinion of the Lieutenant-Governor, be consulted with advantage by the Commission on the subject-matter of their enquiries. Fifteen* copies of set B (for selected officers of the

* The enclosures B, C, D, and E have been separately distributed under the orders of His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor.

Covenanted Service) are forwarded herewith, with five* copies of set C (for selected Statutory Civilians), and twenty* copies of set D (for selected officers of the Uncovenanted Service); and I am to request that, with the permission of His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor, a copy of each set of these questions with one of the letters attached thereto in original may be supplied to those officers serving in the Punjab whom His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor may consider it desirable to consult. It will be noticed that alternative covering letters are attached to each of these sets of questions, the object being to distinguish between the cases of officers whom, owing either to their position in the service of Government or to the nature of the evidence which they may be expected to give, it is considered desirable to *summon* as witnesses before the Commission, and of those whom it is not deemed necessary to summon as witnesses, but who might be invited voluntarily to offer evidence. It is left to the Punjab Government to determine the officers in the Punjab who should be classed under each of these categories, and to distribute accordingly all the sets of questions, or as many sets as may be considered necessary, accompanied by the appropriate covering letter in each case. In order to meet the case of officers of Government or others who, although not specially consulted, may nevertheless be desirous of offering evidence before the Commission, it is proposed to issue a Notification inviting such persons to intimate their names and addresses to the Secretary to the Commission with a brief note of the particular points on which they wish to give evidence. When the plan of the Commission's operations has been further settled, copies of the Notification will be communicated to the Punjab Government for insertion in the local Gazette and in some of the leading local newspapers, English and Vernacular.

4. The remaining set of questions, marked E, of which forty* copies are forwarded, is intended for issue with the attached letters to selected local Associations and Societies, Editors of newspapers (English and Vernacular), and members of the general public. It will be observed that two covering letters are attached to this set of questions, one of which is intended for issue to the Editors of newspapers or members of the general public, and the other to Associations or Societies. The Commission would feel obliged if His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor would be good enough to cause these sets of questions to be issued, with the appropriate covering letter in each case, to such bodies or individuals of the classes named in the Punjab as may, in the opinion of the Punjab Government, be expected to give useful advice on the subject-matter of the present enquiries.

5. It is hoped that the questions will be issued under the supervision of some responsible officer and with as little delay as practicable, and I am particularly to request that the Commission may be furnished with a complete and accurate list of all Associations, Societies, or persons, whether official or non-official, to whom sets of the questions may be communicated, the names of the Government officers who may be summoned to attend as witnesses, or who may be invited to give evidence, being separately given with their addresses in each case. The replies should, in all cases, be sent direct by those consulted to the Secretary to the Public Service Commission; and if additional copies of any of the sets of questions are required, they will be at once supplied on application.

---

* The enclosures B, C, D, and E have been separately distributed under the orders of His Honour the Lieutenant Governor.

III.

List of persons belonging to the Punjab who were invited or summoned, or who volunteered to appear before the Public Service Commission at Lahore, during its sittings from the 15th to the 27th December 1886.

Serial number.	NAMES OF WITNESSES.	Appointment (if in Government service) or profession of witness.	Whether summoned, invited, or voluntary.	Date of Examination.	REMARKS.
1	The Hon'ble Colonel W. G. Davies, C.S.I., Bengal Staff Corps.	Financial Commissioner, Punjab ...	S.	15th December.	
2	Mahomed Hyát Khan. C.S.I., Native of India appointed to Covenanted Grades otherwise than through the competitive channel.	Officiating District Judge, Mooltan ...	S.	Ditto.	
3	*W. H. Rattigan, Esquire,* LL.D., *Barrister-at-Law* ...	*Officiating Government Advocate, Punjab* ...	*I.*	*Ditto* ...	*Unable to appear.*
4	T. W. Smyth, Esquire, Covenanted Civil Service ...	Officiating Judge, Chief Court, Punjab ...	S.	16th December.	
5	J. D. Tremlett, Esquire, ditto	Ditto ditto ...	S.	Ditto.	
6	T. C. Lewis, Esquire, M.A., Educational Department ...	Principal, Government College, Lahore ...	S.	Ditto.	
7	*C. H. Spitta, Esquire*	*Barrister-at-Law, Lahore*	*I.*	*Ditto* ...	*Unable to appear.*
8	Sheikh Nanak Bakhsh	Pleader of the Chief Court, Punjab ...	I.	Ditto.	
9	Jadu Náth Mozamdár, Editor of the *Tribune* newspaper, Lahore.	Editor	I.	Ditto.	
10	R. T. Burney, Esquire, Covenanted Civil Service ...	Judge, Chief Court, Punjab	S.	17th December.	

11	W. M. Young, Esquire, Covenanted Civil Service ...	Secretary to Government, Punjab ...	S.	17th December.	
12	F. C. Channing, Esquire, ditto	District Judge, Lahore	S.	Ditto.	
13	J. Bridges Lee, Esquire	Barrister-at-Law, Lahore	I.	Ditto.	
14	*C. J. Michôd, Esquire ... ...*	*Agent, Bank of Bengal ... ...*	*I.*	*Ditto ...*	*Unable to give evidence.*
15	*Editor, "Civil and Military Gazette," Lahore ... ...*	*Editor ... ...*	*I.*	*Ditto ...*	*Ditto.*
16	Sirdár Gurdiál Singh, Native of India appointed under the Statute of 1870 to a post in the Covenanted Grades.	Assistant Commissioner, Dera Ghazi Khan	S.	Ditto.	
17	G. R. Elsmie, Esquire, Covenanted Civil Service ...	Commissioner, Lahore	S.	18th December.	
18	C. A. Roe, Esquire, ditto	Divisional Judge, Lahore	S.	Ditto.	
19	J. A. E. Miller, Esquire, Uncovenanted Service ...	On special duty, Lahore	S.	Ditto	
20	Sardár Dyál Singh, Majithia, Amritsar	.....	I.	Ditto.	
21	*Editor, "Anjaman-i-Punjab" newspaper, Lahore ...*	*Editor ... ...*	*I.*	*Ditto ...*	*Unable to appear.*
22	Colonel W. R. M. Holroyd, Bengal Staff Corps ...	Director of Public Instruction, Punjab ...	S.	Ditto.	
23	*R. Udny, Esquire, Covenanted Civil Service ... ...*	*Deputy Commissioner, Kohát ... ...*	*S*	*20th December ...*	*Excused.*
24	E. W. Parker, Esquire, Uncovenanted Service ...	Extra Judicial Assistant Commissioner, Dalhousie.	S.	Ditto.	
25	S. LeP. T. Clifford, Esquire, ditto	District Judge, Delhi	S.	Ditto.	
26	*J. L. Kipling, Esquire ... ...*	*Principal School of Art, Lahore ...*	*S.*	*Ditto ...*	*Excused.*
27	Protúl Chander Chatterji, M.A.	Pleader, Chief Court, Punjab	I.	Ditto.	
28	*H. E. Perkins, Esquire, late of the Covenanted Civil Service*	*Church Missionary Society, Amritsar ...*	*I.*	*Ditto ...*	*Unwilling to appear.*

List of persons belonging to the Punjab who were invited or summoned, or who volunteered to appear before the Public Service Commission at Lahore, during its sittings from the 15th to the 27th December 1886—continued.

Serial number.	Names of Witnesses.	Appointment (if in Government service) or profession of witness.	Whether summoned, invited, or voluntary.	Date of Examination.	Remarks.
29	Carr Stephen, Esquire, Barrister-at-Law, Uncovenanted Service.	Extra Judicial Assistant Commissioner, Ludhiána.	S.	20th December.	
30	*The Revd. S. S. Allnutt*, M.A.	*St. Stephen's College, Delhi*	*I.*	*Ditto* ...	*Unable to appear.*
31	Rai Buta Mul, Uncovenanted Service	Judge, Small Cause Court, Lahore ...	S.	Ditto.	
32	*Nominee of the "Anjaman-i-Punjab Society," Lahore* ...	.....	...	*Ditto* ...	*No delegate nominated.*
33	*Editor of the "Aftab-i-Punjab" newspaper, Lahore* ...	*Editor*	*I.*	*Ditto* ...	*No reply received to invitation.*
34	Lala Sagar Chand, B.A., Educational Department ...	Assistant Inspector of Schools, Lahore ...	S.	Ditto.	
35	Lala Kanhya Lal, nominee of the *Indian Association*, Lahore.	Pleader, Chief Court, Punjab	I.	Ditto.	
36	Kaliprosono Roy	Ditto ditto	V.	21st December.	
37	Lal Chand, M.A.	Ditto ditto	V.	Ditto.	
38	J. Sime, Esquire, M.A., Educational Department ...	Tutor of the Maharaja of Patiála ...	S.	Ditto.	

39	Kazi Muhammad Aslum, Native of India appointed, under the Statute of 1870, to a post in the Covenanted Grades	Assistant Commissioner, Ráwalpindi ...	S.	Ditto.	
40	Syad Muhammad Latif Khan, Uncovenanted Service ...	Extra Assistant Commissioner, Bannu ...	S.	Ditto.	
41	*J. W. Russell, Esquire*	*Agent, Bank of Bengal, Delhi*	*I.*	*Ditto* ...	*Unable to appear.*
42	Inám Ali, B.A., nominee of the *Anjaman-i-Islámia*, Lahore.	Assistant Professor, Government College, Lahore.	I.	Ditto.	
43	Pandit Gopi Náth, Editor of the *Akhbár-i-Am* newspaper, Lahore.	Editor	I.	Ditto.	
44	*Mirza Suleimán Shah, nominee of the Deputy Commissioner, Delhi.*	*Honorary Magistrate, Delhi*	*I.*	*Ditto* ...	*Unable to appear.*
45	Nizam-ud-din	President of the Zemindars' Reforming Society, Lahore.	V.	Ditto.	
46	Nawab Abdul Majid Khan, Multani	Honorary Magistrate, Lahore	I.	22nd December.	
47	*Nawab Nawazish Ali Khan*, C.S.I.	*President of the Lahore Municipal Committee*	*I.*	*Ditto* ...	*Unable to appear owing to absence from the Province.*
48	Fakir Sayad Kamr-ud-din	Honorary Magistrate, Lahore	I.	Ditto.	
49	*R. Clarke, Esquire, Covenanted Civil Service*	*Officiating Divisional Judge, Dera Ismail Khan.*	*S.*	*Ditto* ...	*Proceeding on leave. Unable to appear.*
50	*Dewán Rám Náth, Native of India appointed to a post in the Covenanted Grades otherwise than through the competitive channel.*	*District Judge (on leave)*	*S.*	*Ditto* ...	*Excused on ground of ill-health.*
51	Nárain Dás (1), M.A., Uncovenanted Service	Extra Assistant Commissioner, Shahpur ...	S.	Ditto.	
52	Pandit Chandar Bal, ditto	Ditto ditto, Gurgáon ...	S.	Ditto.	

List of persons belonging to the Punjab who were invited or summoned, or who volunteered to appear before the Public Service Commission at Lahore, during its sittings from the 15th to the 27th December 1886—continued.

Serial number.	NAMES OF WITNESSES.	Appointment (if in Government service) or profession of witness.	Whether summoned, invited, or voluntary.	Date of Examination.	REMARKS.
53	*Nominee of the "Delhi Literary Society"*	.....	*I.*	*22nd December* ...	*No delegate nominated.*
54	Sheikh Mahomed Shah, nominee of the *Anjuman-i-Islámia*, Amritsar.	Pleader	I.	Ditto.	
55	Bhai Jowahir Singh, nominee of the *Guru Singh Sabha*, Lahore.	.....	I.	Ditto.	
56	Munshi Diwan Chand, Editor of the *Rafa-i-Am* newspaper, Siálkot.	Editor	I.	Ditto.	
57	Golaknath Chatterjee, B.A., Uncovenanted Service ...	Assistant Professor, Government College, Lahore.	V.	Ditto.	
58	Lala Harsukh Rai, Proprietor of the *Koh-i-Nur* newspaper, Lahore.	Newspaper Proprietor	I.	Ditto.	
59	Amolak Ram, Uncovenanted Service	Munsiff of Lahore	V.	Ditto.	
60	Colonel G. Gordon Young, Bengal Staff Corps ...	Commissioner, Jullundur	S.	23rd December.	
61	*Sirdár Mahomed Afzal, Khán Bahádur, Native of India appointed under the Statute of* 1870 *to a post in the Covenanted Grades.*	*Assistant Commissioner, Kohát*	*S.*	*Ditto* ...	*Unable to appear owing to illness.*

62	Sirdár Charat Singh, Uncovenanted Service	Extra Assistant Commissioner, Gurdáspur...	S.	Ditto.	
63	Mulráj, M.A., Uncovenanted Service	Ditto ditto, Jhang ...	S.	Ditto.	
64	*Nominee of the "Anjaman-i-Gujránwála"*	.....	*I.*	*Ditto* ...	*No delegate nominated.*
65	*Editor, "Safir-i-Hind," Delhi*	*Editor*	*I.*	*Ditto* ...	*Unable to appear owing to illness.*
66	*Chaudri Raghnáth Singh, nominee of the Deputy Commissioner, Delhi.*	*President, Local Board, Delhi*	*I.*	*Ditto* ...	*Ditto.*
67	*Haji Ghulám Hassan, nominee of the Deputy Commissioner, Amritsar.*	.....	*I.*	*Ditto* ...	*Unable to appear.*
68	*Daulat Rám, ditto ditto* ...	*Pleader*	*I.*	*Ditto* ...	*Ditto.*
69	Maulvi Mahomed Ismail, Pesháwar	.....	I.	Ditto.	
70	Khan Bahadur Dr. Rahim Khan, Medical Department ...	Honorary Surgeon, Lahore	I.	Ditto.	
71	G. Lewis, Esquire, Uncovenanted Service	Officiating Junior Government Advocate, Punjab.	I.	Ditto.	
72	Muharram Ali Chíshti, Editor of the *Rafiq-i-Hind* newspaper, Lahore.	Editor	V.	Ditto ...	*Jadu Nath Mozamdár, Editor of the "Tribune," was also further examined.*
73	Sodhi Mán Singh of Ferozepore	.....	I.	24th December ...	*Mr. W. Mackworth Young, Covenanted Civil Service, Secretary to the Punjab Government, was recalled and gave further evidence at the commencement of the proceedings.*
74	Sirdar Báhadur Mán Singh of Amritsar	.....	I.	Ditto.	
75	W. E. Purser, Esquire, Covenanted Civil Service ...	Deputy Commissioner, Rohtak ...	S.	Ditto.	
76	D. C. J. Ibbetson, Esquire, Covenanted Civil Service ...	Ditto, Delhi ...	S.	Ditto.	

List of persons belonging to the Punjab who were invited or summoned, or who volunteered to appear before the Public Service Commission at Lahore, during its sittings from the 15th to the 27th December 1886—concluded.

Serial number.	Names of Witnesses.	Appointment (if in Government service) or profession of witness.	Whether summoned, invited, or voluntary.	Date of Examination.	Remarks.
77	Luchman Dás, Poplai, B.A., Uncovenanted Service ...	Extra Assistant Commissioner, Delhi ...	S.	24th December.	
78	Chuni Lál, M.A., Uncovenanted Service	Ditto ditto, Ludhiána ..	S.	Ditto.	
79	*Nominee of the "Anjaman-i-Peshawar"*	.....	*I.*	*Ditto* ...	*No delegate nominated.*
80	Gyán Chand, Editor of the *Victoria* newspaper, Siálkot ...	Editor	I.	Ditto.	
81	*Ghulam Ahmad Khan, nominee of the Deputy Commissioner, Amritsar.*	.....	S.	*Ditto* ...	*Excused at his own request.*
82	Sheikh Umar Bakhsh, Barrister-at-Law, nominee of the Deputy Commissioner, Mooltan.	Barrister-at-Law	I.	Ditto.	
83	*Pandit Raj Nath, Editor, "Danish-i-Hind," Mooltan, nominee of the Deputy Commissioner, Mooltan.*	*Editor*	*I.*	*Ditto* ...	*Unwilling to attend.*
84	Brij Lál, Editor of the *Khair-khwah-i-Punjab* newspaper, Gujranwala.	Editor	I.	Ditto.	
85	Rai Bahádur Kanhya Lál, nominee of the Deputy Commissioner of Lahore.	Retired Executive Engineer and M.I.C.E.	I.	*Ditto* ...	*Munshi Diwan Chand was also recalled and the translation of his written statement was read and put in as evidence.*
86	R. G. Thomson, Esquire, Covenanted Civil Service ...	Senior Secretary to the Financial Commissioner.	V.	Ditto.	

87	J. R. Maconachie, Esquire, Covenanted Civil Service ...	Deputy Commissioner, Gurgáon ...	S.	27th December.	
88	Nawab Imam Baksh Khan, C.I.E., Chief of the Mazaris...	.....	I.	Ditto.	
89	Sirdar Bikrama Singh, C.S.I., Ahluwalia	..... .	I.	Ditto.	
90	W. Coldstream, Esquire, Covenanted Civil Service ...	Deputy Commissioner, Gurdaspur - ...	S.	Ditto.	
91	Bhawani Das, M.A., Uncovenanted Service	Extra Assistant Commissioner, Mooltan	S.	Ditto.	
92	Hakumat Rai, Representative of the *Indarparast Society*, Delhi.	.....	V.	Ditto.	
93	*Lala Murli Dhar, President of the "Anjaman-i-Rafi-i-Am," Umballa.*	.....	*I.*	*Ditto* ...	*Unable to appear.*
94	Mahomed Umar Khan, Uncovenanted Service, nominee of the Deputy Commissioner, Peshawar.	Extra Assistant Commissioner, Peshawar ...	S.	Ditto.	
95	Gunga Ram, Public Works Department	Executive Engineer	S.	Ditto.	
96	*Sirdar Narindar Singh, nominee of the Deputy Commissioner of Lahore.*	.....	*I.*	*Ditto* ...	*Declined.*
97	Sodhi Hukm Singh, Uncovenanted Service	Extra Assistant Commissioner and *Mir Munshi*, Punjab Secretariat.	V.	Ditto.	
98	*H. M. Plowden, Esquire, Barrister-at-Law*	*Senior Judge, Chief Court, Pujnab* ..	*I.*	.....	*Prepared to submit his views in writing.*
99	*C. L. Tupper, Esquire, Covenanted Civil Service* ...	*Junior Secretary to Government, Punjab* ...	*I.*	*Ditto* ...	*Absent on leave.*

PROCEEDINGS

OF THE

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION.

VOLUME I.—PROCEEDINGS RELATING TO THE PUNJAB.

CONTENTS OF SECTION I.

SUB-SECTION B.

INFORMATION SUPPLIED BY THE GOVERNMENT OF THE PUNJAB.

		PAGE.
Paper	I.—Answers by the Punjab Government to questions put by the Public Service Commission	14
„	II.—Memorandum on the special features of the Punjab	31
„	III.—Letter and rules referred to in the answers of the Punjab Government to questions 70 and 276 to 286	39
„	IV.—Letter No. 3, dated the 16th November 1886, from the Secretary, Public Service Commission, to the Secretary to Government, Punjab, calling for detailed returns relating to the Executive and Judicial Administration of the Punjab	64
„	V.—Letter No. 1, dated the 3rd January 1887, from the Under-Secretary, Punjab Government, to the Secretary, Public Service Commission, supplying the information called for in Paper IV	65
„	VI.—Letter No. 89, dated the 5th January 1887, from the Secretary, Public Service Commission, to the Secretary to Government, Punjab, calling for statistics regarding the educational tests passed by persons employed in the Subordinate Judicial Service and Subordinate Executive Service in the Punjab; and the reply No. 552, dated the 16th March 1887 ..	68
„	VII.—Letter No. 102, dated the 22nd January 1887, from the Secretary, Public Service Commission, to the Secretary to Government, Punjab, calling for returns showing the nationalities and castes of persons employed in the Subordinate Judicial Service and Subordinate Executive Service in the Punjab; and the reply No. 922, dated the 27th April 1887	69
„	VIII.—Letter No. 112, dated the 5th February 1887, from the Secretary, Public Service Commission, to the Secretary to Government, Punjab, calling for a return of the number of persons who have passed University examinations and the nationalities and castes to which they belong; and the reply No. 875, dated the 22nd April 1887	70
„	IX.—Letter No. 131, dated the 7th March 1887, from the Secretary, Public Service Commission, to the Secretary to Government, Punjab, calling for information showing the extent to which encouragement is offered to Natives of the Punjab, by means of Government scholarships or otherwise, to proceed to England for the purpose of completing their education; and the reply No. 742, dated the 6th April 1887, and enclosure ...	72

VOLUME I.—SECTION I.—SUB-SECTION B.—INFORMATION SUPPLIED BY THE GOVERNMENT OF THE PUNJAB.

I.

ANSWERS BY THE PUNJAB GOVERNMENT TO THE QUESTIONS PUT BY THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION.

I.—Working of the existing Statutory System.

Vol. I. Sec. I. Sub-Sec. B. Paper I.

Punjab Government.

1. What systems of selection or nomination for the purposes of the Statutory Rules have been adopted in your Province?—The system followed in the Punjab is that prescribed by the Government of India in paragraphs 3 and 4 of the Home Department letter No. 41—1629, dated 4th September 1879, viz., the submission of the names of a certain number of candidates nominated by the Lieutenant-Governor, the final selection resting with the Government of India. The qualifications essential for nomination have been held to be good family and social position, combined with educational, moral, and physical fitness. A list of eligible candidates was drawn up on these lines in 1879 on the publication of the rules now in force (Notification No. 1534, dated 22nd August 1879), and this list has been supplemented from time to time as necessity arose after enquiries from the local authorities and others whom the Lieutenant-Governor saw fit to consult, the annual nominations being then submitted to the Government of India. No competitive examination has ever been held.

2. What subsidiary rules, if any, have been framed in your Province for the purpose of giving effect to the general Statutory Rules?—No rules subsidiary to those now in force have been framed in this Province.

3. How many Statutory Civilians have been appointed in your Province under the Statutory Rules on the ground of merit and ability proved in the service of Government?—None; and therefore questions 4 to 9 require no answers.

10. How many Statutory Civilians have been appointed in your Province on the ground of merit and ability proved in the practice of a profession?—None; and therefore questions 11 to 15 require no answers.

16. How many persons have been appointed Statutory Civilians in your Province on the ground of intellectual qualifications alone?—None; and therefore questions 17 to 34 require no answers.

35. How many Statutory Civilians have been appointed in your Province on the ground of high birth, of social position, or general influence?—Five.

36. If Statutory Civilians have been appointed in your Province on the ground of high birth, social position, or general influence, were any preliminary qualifications required?—Yes.

37. If so, what were they?—General educational, social, and moral qualifications were required.

38. What appointments did persons selected on any of these grounds receive under the Statutory Rules?—They were appointed Assistant Commissioners of the 3rd class on probation.

39. What rate of pay did they receive on appointment under the Statutory Rules?—Rs. 200 on first appointment, and Rs. 250 on passing the departmental examination prescribed for Assistant Commissioners by the Lower Standard. Rs. 320 on being confirmed, provided the departmental examination had been passed by the Higher Standard.

40. Have persons been appointed in your Province to Covenanted posts on any other grounds than those above mentioned?—Yes; seven.

41. If so, on what grounds?—In five cases the appointments have been made on the ground of approved service in the Uncovenanted Service in this Province. One officer was transferred direct from Bengal, another was transferred to Burma as a Supernumerary Assistant Commissioner while serving as an Extra Assistant Commissioner in the Punjab, and was re-transferred to this Province as Assistant Commissioner after two years' service in Burma. The last appointment (that of District Judge, 2nd grade) was conferred on a Native of India, at the time of the reorganisation of the Punjab Commission in November 1884, on the ground of merit and ability proved in the service of Government, and in lieu of an

appointment under the rules framed by the Government of India under section 6, Statute 33 Vic., chap. 3.

42. What appointments did the persons concerned receive?—Assistant Commissionerships of the 3rd grade.

43. What rate of pay did they receive on appointment?—Rates varying according to the departmental examination passed by officers, viz.,—Rs. 400 if they had not passed; Rs. 450 if they had passed by the Lower Standard; Rs. 500 if they had passed by the Higher Standard.

44. How many Muhammadans and how many Hindus have been appointed to the Statutory Service in your Province?—Two Hindus and three Muhammadans.

45. Have any Eurasians been appointed to the Statutory Service in your Province?—None.

46. If not, are there any particular reasons why they have not been appointed?—There have been none possessing the necessary qualifications.

47. Whatever system of selection or nomination may have been adopted, has it been usual to require a probationary period before the appointment was finally confirmed?—Yes.

48. If so, what have been the incidents of such period as to duration and pay?—The probationary period has been two years, at the end of which confirmation has been recommended if the probationer has passed his examination by the Lower Standard and otherwise acquitted himself satisfactorily. On first appointment a pay of Rs. 200 has been allowed. On passing examination by Lower Standard this has been increased to Rs. 250; and this has been finally raised to Rs. 320 (64 per cent. of Rs. 500, the pay of a passed Assistant Commissioner, 3rd grade, under section 10 of the Pay and Acting Allowance Code) on confirmation and when examination by the Higher Standard has been passed.

49. Has the requirement of a probationary period been waived in the case of any appointments hitherto made under the Statutory Rules?—No; and therefore question 50 requires no answer.

51. To what positions have the persons selected on the various grounds above noted respectively attained in the public service?—Four are Assistant Commissioners of the 3rd grade. One is still a probationer.

52. Have any practical difficulties been experienced in regard to the promotion of Statutory Civilians after their appointment? None; but in no instance has any Statutory Civilian served long enough to enable him to rise from the lowest grade of Assistant Commissioners.

53. How far have Statutory Civilians succeeded in passing the departmental examinations in cases where such examinations were required?—Three have passed by the Higher Standard in all subjects of the examination; one had passed by the Lower Standard in all subjects except in the subject of treasury and local funds up to September 1884, when he proceeded on duty with the Afghan Boundary Commission, and has not since had an opportunity of qualifying in the subjects in which he had failed. Another has not yet passed in any subject.

54. After what periods from the dates of original appointments were the examinations by the Lower and Higher Standard, respectively, passed in each case?—The words "*original appointments*" in this question are held to mean "appointment as probationer to the Native Civil Service." On this understanding—(1) One passed by the Higher Standard in nine months after appointment. (2) One had passed by the Higher Standard previously as Extra Assistant Commissioner. (3) One passed by the Lower Standard in all subjects (except treasury and local funds) eleven months from date of appointment, and since then has not had an opportunity to qualify by the Higher Standard (*vide* answer to question 53). (4) One passed by the lower Standard in one year and seven months, and by the Higher Standard in all subjects in four years and seven months from the date of appointment.

55. In how many cases has there been failure to pass by either test within the two years' probationary period?—In one case only, in which the probationer appointed in January 1884 has not passed in any subject. (There is also the case noticed in questions 53 and 54 in which the candidate had only one opportunity of appearing at the examination.)

56. After what periods from the dates of original appointment have Statutory Civilians in your Province been confirmed in their appointments?—Invariably two years, the only exception being that of the candidate who has failed to pass his examination noticed in answer 55.

57. Has the period before confirmation in any case extended beyond the probationary period of two years?—Yes, in one case (*see* No. 55).

58. If so, under what circumstances?—Because the candidate had failed to pass the examination, and it was thought desirable to give him a further chance.

59. What is the prevalent feeling in your Province regarding the existing Statutory system? If the feeling is one of dissatisfaction, is the dissatisfaction general, or is it confined to certain sections of the community?—Interest is not much awakened. The aristocracy and probably the Muhammadan community are not averse to the existing system. Educated Hindus do not approve of it.

60. What are the grounds upon which any such feeling is based?—The system being one of favor and affording no guarantee of qualifications.

61. Is the feeling of dissatisfaction, if it exists, directed against the Statute itself (33 Vic., chapter 3, section 6, or is it directed against the rules framed thereunder?—

It is considered that the Statute requires amendment; some would repeal it altogether as inconsistent with earlier Statutes and the Queen's Proclamation. But the general objection is to the rules.

62. If the Statute itself is objected to, is it because its provisions admit persons to specific appointments only and not to membership in an organised "Service?"—No objections on this ground have come to notice.

63. Are the objections based on other, and if so what, grounds?—See answer to No. 61.

64. If a desire is felt for enrolment in a general service, what are the reasons for this desire?—See answer to No. 62.

65. *What amendments do you advocate in section 6 of the Statute?—It should be repealed, power being reserved in very special and exceptional cases to appoint men of distinguished merit to the Civil Service offices under suitable restrictions and conditions.

66. Do you consider that section 6 of the Statute supplies such a definition of the words "Natives of India" as describes with sufficient clearness, fulness and accuracy the various classes of persons for whose appointment to Covenanted posts it is desirable to provide?—No. The children of officers who are practically resident for the greater part of their lives ought to be included, and residents of Native States; but see answer No. 65.

67. If not, can you suggest any more complete or more satisfactory definition?—See answers Nos. 65 and 66.

68. If the objections are directed against the rules framed under the Statute, do they relate to the mode or modes of selection actually adopted?—Yes.

69. Do they relate to the general conditions in regard to pay, promotion, and retiring annuity under which Statutory Civilians hold their offices?—The objections relate to pay and promotion, but not to retiring annuity.

70. Assuming the Statutory system to be retained, what amendments would you suggest in the rules with a view to remove any reasonable objections which may be felt to them?—See letters No. 2554, dated the 7th November 1885, and No. 144, dated the 19th of January 1886, copies of which are annexed.

71. How do Statutory Civilians compare, in regard to their work as public servants, with Native Civilians who have passed in by the channel of the English competition?—We have no such Native Civilians.

72. How do Statutory Civilians nominated or selected by competition compare, in regard to their work, with Statutory Civilians selected on the ground of merit and ability previously proved in the Uncovenanted Service, or other branches of the Government service, if any such selections have been made?—We have no Statutory Civilians selected from the Uncovenanted or other services on the ground of merit or ability.

73. Do Statutory Civilians regard themselves as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the Covenanted Service through the competitive channel?—See answer No. 71. As compared with Europeans, they do. This answers questions 74 to 76.

77 & 78. Do the general public view with any difference the status of Statutory Civilians and that of Uncovenanted Officers?—They make practically little distinction. The system has been too short a time in force.

79. How is the present Statutory system regarded by members of the Uncovenanted Service?—With the utmost dislike.

80. Do competitive Civilians, English and Native, and members of the Uncovenanted Service, respectively, stand on a footing of cordiality with Statutory Civilians, or is there any friction between them?—We have no Native Civilians. As regards others, yes; there is no friction.

81 & 82. Has the Statutory system had the effect of securing men who, in point of education or natural ability, are superior to the average of those appointed or promoted to the higher ranks of the Uncovenanted Service?—Certainly not.

83 & 84. Do young men among the landed aristocracy or of good family display unwillingness to accept employment under the Statutory Rules?—No.

85. Has experience shown that the Statutory Civilians of aristocratic family are as punctual and regular in the discharge of their duties as those selected from other classes?—Yes.

86 & 87. Do young men among the landed aristocracy or of good family display unwillingness to accept posts in the Uncovenanted Service, and a willingness to accept employment under the Statutory Rules?—No; they are willing to take either.

* 6. Whereas it is expedient that additional facilities should be given for the employment of natives of India, of proved merit and ability, in the Civil Service of Her Majesty in India: Be it enacted, that nothing in the "Act for the Government of India," twenty-one and twenty-two Victoria, chapter one hundred and six, or in the "Act to confirm certain appointments in India, and to amend the law concerning the Civil Service there," twenty four and twenty-five Victoria, chapter fifty-four, or in any other Act of Parliament or other law now in force in India, shall restrain the authorities in India by whom appointments are or may be made to offices, places, and employments in the Civil Service of Her Majesty in India from appointing any native of India to any such office, place, or employment, although such native shall not have been admitted to the said Civil Service of India in manner in section thirty-two of the first-mentioned Act provided, but subject to such rules as may be from time to time prescribed by the Governor-General in Council, and sanctioned by the Secretary of State in Council, with the concurrence of a majority of members present; and that for the purpose of this Act the words "natives of India" shall include any person born and domiciled within the dominions of Her Majesty in India, of parents habitually resident in India, and not established there for temporary purposes only; and that it shall be lawful for the Governor-General in Council to define and limit from time to time the qualification of natives of India thus expressed; provided that every resolution made by him for such purpose shall be subject to the sanction of the Secretary of State in Council, and shall not have force until it has been laid for thirty days before both Houses of Parliament.

88. How many Natives in your Province have been appointed under the Statute 24 and 25 Vic., chapter 54, sections 3 and 4,* to offices reserved for Covenanted Civilians?—None. So questions 89—92 require no answers.

93. Has the appointment of Natives under the Statutory Rules or under 24 and 25 Vic, chapter 54, produced uncertainty or uneasiness in the minds of Covenanted Civil Servants as to their promotion and prospects?—The appointments under the Statutory Rules, which have been mentioned in the answer to question 35 *et seq.*, have produced no uncertainty or uneasiness, as these persons have all been entered at the bottom of the list of the Punjab Commission.

Although no Natives have been appointed under 24 and 25 Vic, chap. 54, to posts reserved by that Statute for Covenanted Civilians, it is proper to mention, in connection with this subject, the appointments to which allusion has been made in the reply to question 40. The appointment of Muhammad Hyat Khan probably produced no uneasiness for the same reason as that mentioned above, but the appointment of Diwán Rám Náth undoubtedly produced considerable uncertainty and uneasiness.

94. Seeing that the proportion of Natives has been fixed, and that the scale of recruitment for the Civil Service has been adjusted accordingly, is this feeling of uncertainty or uneasiness, if it exists, well founded?—The Lieutenant-Governor considers that there were not sufficient reasons for it.

95. Has it had an appreciably injurious effect either on recruitment or on the efficiency of Civil Servants?—Cannot say.

II.—Mode of Selection of Statutory Civilians.

96. On the assumption† that the Statutory system is retained, how would appointment to the Statutory Service by nomination be regarded by influential sections of the Native community in your Province?—The older school would look upon it favorably, probably also a good many Muhammadans, who are conscious of their inability to compete.

97. How would a system of nomination to be followed by a period of probation be regarded by the same classes?—As in answer No. 96.

98. Would a system of nomination, with or without probation, be likely to secure well-qualified persons?—Not under present circumstances in the Punjab.

99. Has experience actually shown such a system to secure well-qualified officers?—No.

100. Do you consider that nominations should be confined to persons of proved merit and ability?—Yes, if the system is maintained.

101. If so, how do you consider that merit and ability should be held to have been proved for this purpose?—By approved service under Government or by the attainment of marked distinction in some profession.

102. How would a system of limited competition amongst persons nominated for this purpose by the Local Governments or by the Universities, or by those authorities concurrently or alternately, be regarded?—Nomination by the Punjab University has been tried in regard to the Uncovenanted Service and found to be impracticable. A system of limited competition among persons nominated by the Lieutenant-Governor for appointments in the Uncovenanted Service has given satisfaction since its introduction in 1882.

103. In preference to either of the above systems (nomination and limited competition), would a system of open competition pure and simple for the Statutory Service commend itself to the Native community?—Only to the young and more advanced sections.

104. If competition (whether limited or open) is preferred, should there be one competition for all India or separate competitions in each Province?—Separate competition for the Punjab is essential. This makes answers to questions 105 and 106 unnecessary.

107. Under any of the three systems of nomination, limited competition, and open competition, would you prescribe any tests of preliminary qualifications on the part of nominees or candidates in regard to (1) age, (2) intellectual capacity, (3) moral, social, and physical fitness?—Certainly

108. If so, what should be the tests under each of the heads specified?—(1) Not under twenty or over twenty-five years of age last birth-day. (2) The candidate must be a B A. or must pass an examination of equal difficulty, or be certified by competent authority to

---

* 3. Where it appears to the authority in India by whom an appointment should be made to any office, place, or employment specified in the said schedule, that such appointment, under the special circumstances of the case, should be made without regard to the recited qualifications, conditions, and restrictions of the said Act, it shall be lawful for such authority to make such appointment accordingly; provided that no person shall be so appointed who has not resided for at least seven years in India, and that every person previously to his being so appointed to any of the offices in the Revenue and Judicial Departments specified in the said schedule shall pass an examination in the vernacular language of the district in which he is to be employed, where such examination is now required, and shall be subject to all the departmental tests and other qualifications and restrictions which are or may be imposed in the like case on covenanted civil servants.

4. Every such appointment shall be provisional only, and shall forthwith be reported to the Secretary of State in Council of India, together with the special reasons for making the same; and unless the Secretary of State in Council shall approve such appointment, with the concurrence of a majority of members present at a meeting, and shall within twelve months from the date of such appointment notify such approval to the authority by whom the appointment was made, then such appointment shall be cancelled.

† The questions which follow down to No. 118 inclusive are put subject to the same assumption.

have proficiency equivalent to the B.A. standard. (3) He must give satisfactory evidence of (*i*) good moral character, (*ii*) habits of personal activity, and (*iii*) gentlemanly bearing, and must furnish the certificate of physical fitness prescribed by section 106, clause 2, of the Civil Pension Code (6th Edition).

109. Do you consider that (after selection whether by nomination or competition) there should be a period of probation?—Certainly.

110. If so, what should be the duration of the probationary period?—Two years.

111. Should the period of probation be passed in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service or of the Covenanted Service, or in what other manner?—In the discharge of the duties to which the appointment is made.

112. Do you consider that after selection and before entering on probation (or on duty) the person selected should undergo special training?—The special training should be undergone during the period of probation.

113. If so, should the special training be carried out in India or in England?—In India in the ordinary course of duty.

114. If in India, would it be possible, and if possible advisable, to establish an Indian Civil Service College on the basis of the Haileybury College which formerly existed in England?—No.

115. If you do not consider special training in England essential, would you encourage nominees or selected candidates to visit England with a view to add to their qualifications for the service?—It should be left purely optional. The creation by Government of special privileges for special purposes to special classes, of which other classes are not permitted to avail themselves, is objectionable. This makes answers to questions 116 to 120 unnecessary.

121. Do you think that any distinction should be made between the emoluments of nominees or selected candidates who have been trained in England or have gone to England to add to their qualifications and those who have not?—No.

122. If the opportunity of residence in England at a University for two years with a sufficient allowance were offered to nominees or selected candidates, is it likely that it would be taken advantage of to any great extent?—It probably might.

123. If the system of examination in England were revised with the result that Natives availed themselves of it in considerble numbers, would it still be necessary to retain the Statutory system?—Certainly not. The Statutory system should be abolished. No answer required to question 124.

III.—Competition in England for the Indian Civil Service.

125. What has been the experience in your Province, in regard to their work as public servants, of Natives who have entered the Covenanted Civil Service through the competitive channel in England?—None, and therefore questions Nos. 126 and 127 require no answers.

128. Is competition of Natives in the examination in England favorably looked upon by large and important classes in India?—Increasingly so. The opinion is gaining ground.

129. Should additional facilities be given to Natives for proceeding to England and entering the Indian Civil Service by the channel of the English competition?—No preferential facilities should be given. See answers to question 115. No answer is required to questions 130 and 131.

132. What is your opinion as to giving Statutory appointments to Natives who, though they may have failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, have shown merit in the English competition?—The idea is objectionable. It is to establish, side by side with the system of open competition, another of limited competition amongst a restricted class. The Statutory Service is to be the refuge of the Native failures, who cannot find places in the Covenanted Service.

133. Assuming it to be advisable to appoint to the Statutory Service in India Natives who have failed in the English competition, should such persons receive the same training as successful candidates in England, and be subject to the same final examination?—Yes, before they return.

134. Should they on appointment to the Statutory Service in India be subject to the same incidents as apply to other persons appointed under the Statutory Rules?—Certainly.

135. Can you say what number of Natives belonging to your Province have presented themselves annually at the competitive examination in England, and what degree of success they attained?—Very few, if any. None have succeeded.

136. What class or classes of Natives in your Province readily go to England?—Almost any.

137. Are objections entertained to going to England? and, if so, what are they, and by what classes in particular are they felt?—Not generally, and such objections as exist among conservative persons are gradually dying out.

138. Should the examination for Natives in England be distinct in standards and conditions from that for English candidates, or should there be one and the same examination for all?—No; one and the same examination for all; therefore no answers are required to questions 139, 140, 142 and 143.

141. If a fixed proportion of appointments were allotted for a Native examination

in England, do you consider that in view of the objections against a voyage to England and life there, the cost thereof and the chances of failure, a sufficient number of suitable candidates from your Province would be available to make the competition a real competition?—In the present backward state of the Province, certainly not.

144. Assuming only one examination in England for both English and Native candidates, do you consider that the subjects and standards of examination and the conditions as to age and other matters in any respect place Native candidates at a disadvantage as compared with English candidates?—Certainly.

145. If so, in what respects are Native candidates placed at a disadvantage, and what alterations would you recommend with a view to remove that disadvantage?—The age is too low to admit of their completing an education in India so as to compete with chance of success. The limit of age should be raised. This is the chief disadvantage. The subjects ought not to be altered so as to make the examinations of a more Oriental character. It was from the first intended that the educational qualifications for the Covenanted Civil Service should be of the highest possible English, and not of an Oriental, type; and it is absolutely necessary to maintain this high standard. Any lowering of the distinctive English character of the examination for the Covenanted Civil Service would be deplorable.

146. If there should be only one examination for all candidates, should the limits of age for Natives be higher than those at present fixed for European candidates? and, if so, what should the limits for Native candidates be?—The maximum limit of age for Natives should be twenty-three or not less than twenty-two, but a differential age is indefensible.

147. If higher limits of age were fixed for Native than for European candidates, might not the latter complain that they were placed at a disadvantage?—Certainly.

148. How do Natives, who have been successful in the English examination since the reduction of age was made, compare, in regard to their work as public servants, with Natives who entered by competition when the limit of age was higher?—We have none.

149. What is the average age at which Natives at the Indian Universities pass the examinations for F.A., B.A., and M.A. respectively?—The average ages are as follows:—

(*a*) For the F.A. Examination ... 19½ years.
(*b*) For the B.A. Examination ... 21½ years.
(*c*) For the M.A. Examination ... 22½ years.

150. From what classes of Native society are the persons who graduate at the Indian Universities usually drawn in your Province?—Graduates of the Punjab University belong usually to the middle classes, and their parents are for the most part persons of slender means.

IV.—Competition in India for the Indian Civil Service.

151. Do you advocate a competition in India for the Civil Service simultaneously with the competition in England, the same question papers being used at both examinations?—No; the system would be impracticable.

152. How would this method of selecton be regarded by the Native community generally?—With great favor by the young and more advanced sections of the community.

153. If you advocate such a system, would you restrict the competition in India to Natives, and that in England to English candidates, or would you admit both classes freely to either examination?—If such a system were adopted, both classes should be freely admitted.

154. If Native candidates were admitted to the competition in England, while English candidates were excluded from the competition in India, on what grounds could this distinction be justified?—Could not be justified.

155. Do you consider that the educational institutions available in India are at present capable of giving the very high class education which it was the object of the competitive system as introduced in 1855 to secure?—Certainly not.

156. Would an open competition in India be likely to give decided advantages to any particular class or classes of the Native community over others?—Certainly. It would be more favorable to Hindus than Muhammadans, and to particular classes of Hindus.

157. Would it be likely to lead to the undue preponderance of any one class or caste in the public service?—Yes, for the reasons given in answer No. 156.

158. Do you think there are any objections on political or administrative grounds to open competition in India?—Decidedly to one competition for all India. It would in the present state of education and feeling in the Punjab lead to the administration of the Province to a large extent by foreigners.

159. Would the introduction of an open competitive examination in India have the effect of deterring cadets of leading families from aspiring to enter the ranks of the Civil Service?—It would deter many Punjab families.

160. Under such a system how would it be possible to provide against the Natives of a Province in which education is comparatively backward, being excluded from appointments in their own Province?—It would be impossible.

161. Would a system of provincial examinations be preferable to one examination for the whole of India?—Yes, decidedly.

162. Under a system of open competition in India, would the successful candidates be regarded as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the service through the channel of the open competition in England?—Impossible to say.

163. Supposing that the Covenanted appointments were allotted in fixed proportions, a certain number to be obtained by competition in England and a certain number by competition in India, the examinations in each case being open on fairly equal conditions to Native and English candidates alike, and the Statutory system being abolished, how would such a system be viewed?—Favorably by the younger and better educated classes.

164. If an open competition were established in India, what should be the preliminary qualifications required on the part of candidates in regard to age?—Nineteen to twenty-three years.

165. In regard to minimum educational attainments?—A degree or its equivalent.

166 and 167. In regard to moral, social and physical fitness, and in other respects (if any)?—Satisfactory evidence of—

(i) good moral character;
(ii) habits of personal activity; and
(iii) gentlemanly bearing;

and furnish the certificate of physical fitness required by section 106, clause 2, of the Civil Pension Code (6th Edition).

168. Should the subjects and conditions of the examination be the same as those prescribed for the competitive examination in England, or should they be different?—On the supposition that the number of appointments to be competed for in India was fixed, the examination need not be the same.

169. If different, what should they be?—The examination in England should be such as to secure in the candidates the very high class education recommended by the Commissioners in 1855. The requirements of the Indian examination might be less severe and of a more Oriental and practical character. It is not understood that details are asked for.

170. Circumstances being different in the case of persons who enter through the examination in England and of persons who enter through the examination in India, is there any reason why the rules in regard to pay, leave, pension, &c, should not also be different?—No reason.

171. Should successful candidates go through a period of special study in India like the English candidates who spend two years in special preparation?—Unnecessary. The needful training can be gained in the practical discharge of duty.

172. Would it be preferable (*a*) to require them to go to England, or (*b*) to give them the option of going to England, suitable allowances being given to enable them to prosecute their studies there?—Not so. There should be no compulsion and no special inducements to any special class.

173. Should successful candidates at the Indian competition be required to pass through a probationary period before final appointment?—Yes.

174. If so, what should be the duration of the probationary period?—Two years.

175. How should it be passed—in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service, or otherwise?—In the practical discharge of the duties to which the appointment is made.

V.—Promotion from the Uncovenanted Service.

176. To what extent does the Uncovenanted Service in your Province include in its ranks persons eligible on the ground of proved merit and ability for appointment to offices ordinarily reserved for members of the Covenanted Civil Service?—The Uncovenanted Service contains several members as eligible for such appointments on the ground of proved merit and ability as those appointed under the Statutory Rules.

177. If there are such persons in the Uncovenanted Service, could they be appointed to the lowest grade of the Covenanted Service without suffering in pay?—Most of them could not.

178. Under existing rules as to pay, &c., how would such appointment be regarded by Uncovenanted officers?—They would consider it hard treatment.

179. Do you think they would be willing to forego pay for the sake of the advantages which admission to the Civil Service might afterwards bring?—It depends on the amount of the sacrifice. They would not consent to enter at the bottom of the list.

180 What special provision, if any, do you think should be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of deserving members of the Uncovenanted Service?—Such Covenanted posts as it is considered desirable to give to others than Covenanted servants should be separated from the Civil *cadre*, and be made available for members of the Uncovenanted Service or of a liberal profession who have proved their merit and ability, and occasionally, but exceptionally, for other persons of distinguished ability.

181. If such appointments are made, should they be restricted to the holders of any particular classes of appointments in the Uncovenanted Service, and, if so, what classes?—They should be open generally to all members of the Uncovenanted Service directly engaged in the executive and judicial administration of the country.

182. Should persons so appointed be appointed provisionally and be required to pass through a period of probation before final confirmation?—No probation needed where merit and ability are proved in the service of Government or of a profession.

183. Should provision be made for the appointment of qualified members of the Uncovenanted Service to the *higher* Covenanted offices without requiring them to pass through the lower grades?—Yes, provided such Covenanted offices were set apart (see answer No. 180). But also very exceptionally to the Civil Service *cadre* under suitable restrictions and safeguards, either those prescribed in 24 and 25 Vic., chapter 54, or some equivalent.

184. If certain appointments in the Covenanted grades are set apart for the Statutory Service, should a fixed proportion of those appointments be expressly reserved for persons of proved merit and ability in the Uncovenanted Service?—No.

185. Should special provision be made for the promotion to Covenanted posts of European members of the Uncovenanted Service?—See answer No. 180. European members should be exactly on the same footing as to eligibility as others.

186. Should special provision be made for the promotion to such posts of Eurasian or other members of the Uncovenanted Service who, though not Natives of pure descent, fall within the meaning attached in the Statute of 1870 to the term "Natives of India"?—See answer No. 180. All members of the Uncovenanted Service should be on the same footing as regards eligibility.

187. Ought not the Uncovenanted Service, equally with the Covenanted Service, to be open to all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty who possess the qualifications that may be from time to time prescribed?—Certainly; otherwise the Acts of Parliament and Her Majesty's Proclamation are directly violated.

188. If the Uncovenanted Service is closed to any natural-born subjects of Her Majesty, on what grounds, bearing in mind the terms of Acts of Parliament and Her Majesty's Proclamation of 1st November 1858, is this to be justified?—It could not be justified.

VI.—Pay, Leave and Pension for Natives of India appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than through the channel of competition in England.

189 & 190. Is the rate* of pay at present granted to Statutory Civilians during probation and on final appointment respectively sufficient? If not, on what grounds do you consider it insufficient, and what rates of pay should, in your opinion, be granted to Statutory Civilians (*a*) while on probation, and (*b*) on final confirmation in their appointments?—For appointments made direct to the lowest grade, the rates are sufficient, except that the initial pay of Statutory Civilians is less than that given to Extra Assistant Commissioners, and should be raised to Rs. 250 a month.

191. Would these rates of pay be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the Uncovenanted Service?—Not if the post held in the Uncovenanted Service carried higher pay; otherwise yes.

192. Would they be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the professional classes?—Not if the earnings from the profession were greater than the pay; otherwise yes.

193. If not, how would you treat in regard to pay persons selected from these two classes if appointed to the lowest grade of the Covenanted Service?—They could not be so appointed at all unless willing to forego pay.

194. How would you treat in regard to pay such persons if appointed to any of the *higher* Covenanted posts without being required to pass through the lower grades?—Persons of such exceptional merit as to justify appointment to the higher posts direct should receive the pay of such posts without deduction.

195. Do you consider that a difference should be maintained between the rates of pay granted to Covenanted Civilians who enter through the competitive channel in England and to persons holding Covenanted posts who do not enter through that channel?—Most certainly, except in the case of persons referred to in answer No. 194. This answers questions 199 and 200.

196. If so, what would you consider the fair rate of reduction to be made in the case of persons holding Covenanted posts who do not enter through the competitive channel in England?—The present rate.

197. Would you approve of an arrangement by which the pay of appointments would be a fixed sum to be drawn by the holder whether he is a Covenanted or a Statutory Civilian, with an additional staff allowance to be drawn by those only who enter the service through the examination in England?—This is a complicated arrangement and is undesirable. The staff allowance will give constant ground for comparisons and become the object of attack. There will always be a tendency to reduce it and produce unsettlement. Between systems so essentially different as recruitment in England and recruitment in India there can be no real comparison, and none should be attempted. The pay for each service should be fixed by the considerations necessary to secure the qualifications that are wanted, and not on comparisons which may or may not be invidious.

* Two hundred rupees a month on first appointment as probationers. Two hundred and fifty rupees a month after passing the Departmental Examination by the Lower Standard. After passing the Departmental Examination by the Higher Standard (unless specially exempted), and after having been confirmed in their appointments, 64 per cent. of what would be the gross pay or salary of the office if it were held by a Covenanted Civil Servant appointed after competitive examination in England.

198. Can you suggest any other way of providing different rates of pay?—See answer to No. 197.

199. If you consider there should be no difference of pay, how do you justify the application of the same rates of pay in the case of Natives who have satisfied the very high tests required by the examination in England and Natives who have not?—See answer No. 195.

200. On the same assumption, what are your reasons for holding that the high rate of pay which is considered to be necessary to secure the services of persons of tested qualifications in a country far from their homes, and under various other unfavorable conditions, should be given to persons whose qualifications have not been so tested and who serve in their own native country?—See answer No. 195.

201. Have you any remarks to make on the leave rules embodied in the Civil Leave Code which apply to Statutory Civilians?—None.

202. At what age do you consider that Natives appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than through the competitive channel in England should be entitled to retire on pension?—They should have the same rules as Uncovenanted officers.

203. After what length of service do you consider that such persons should be entitled to retire on pension?—They should have the same rules as Uncovenanted officers.

204. At what age should they be obliged to retire on pension?—They should have the same rules as Uncovenanted officers.

205. After what length of service should they be obliged to retire on pension?—They should have the same rules as Uncovenanted officers.

206. What amount of pension should, in your opinion, be granted to Natives so appointed if they serve the prescribed period for voluntary and compulsory retirement respectively?—They should have the same rules as Uncovenanted officers.

207. If, before serving the prescribed period for pension, they are compelled to retire on medical certificate, what gratuity, if any, would you give them?—They should have the same rules as Uncovenanted officers.

VII.—General.

208. How far is the existing system of education in the higher schools and colleges in India well adapted for training young men to the public service? Can you suggest any improvements?—It is adapted for training men for the Subordinate Executive and Judicial Administration. (Too large a subject to answer here.)

209. In 1854 Lord Macaulay's Committee were of opinion that the best, the most liberal, and the most finished education to be procured in England was a necessary qualification for admission to the Civil Service. Do Indian schools and colleges at present supply an education of so high a standard?—Certainly not. The whole system in India is inferior both as regards standards exacted, the qualifications and attainments of teachers available, and in almost every respect.

210. Do you consider that Indian schools at present develop the force of character and other qualities required for English administration?—Not as a rule.

211. What has been the actual experience in your Province as to the general efficiency of educated Natives—graduates of the Indian Universities—employed in administrative work?—They have been generally efficient.

212. How have Natives, placed in charge of sub-divisions or in other quasi-independent positions, discharged their duties in your Province?—Exceedingly well as a rule.

213. Do we now obtain for Government service Natives of the classes who under Native rule carried on the civil administration of the country?—Yes, to a very great extent. No answer needed to No. 214.

215. How far would any system of appointment which involves a journey to and residence in England be regarded by the Native community as open to objection on the ground that it requires Hindu candidates to abandon their caste as a condition of entering the Civil Service?—Such objection as exists is among the older men, and is rapidly disappearing in the younger generation.

216. How far would such a system be regarded as open to objection on the ground that it restricts the field of selection to those candidates who are wealthy enough to undertake the cost of a journey to and residence in England?—It would not be objected to on that ground.

217. Are the Natives who go to England from your Province for purposes of education limited to the wealthier classes?—No; they chiefly belong to the middle classes, but as yet very few have gone.

218. Are they limited to any particular section of the community or to any particular creed?—No; but among Hindus those who have gone are mainly Khatris.

219. Does a voyage to or residence in England involve the loss of social position or other unfavorable consequences in the case of any section of the Native community?—It has not generally been found so with those who have gone.

220. Does it result in placing those Natives who undertake it more or less out of touch and sympathy with their fellow-countrymen on their return to India?—It has not been found so with them who have gone.

221. Would the requirement of a temporary residence in England as a condition

precedent to or following on appointment to the Government service have the effect of excluding from such appointment any considerable or important section of the Native community?—Not necessarily.

222 & 223. If the Statutory system is discontinued, should special provision be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of Natives who, for religious or other sufficient reasons, are unable or unwilling to undertake a journey to and residence in England?—No.

224. If the Statutory system is discontinued, do you consider that special provision should be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of capable members of the professional classes?—Occasionally, but exceptionally, and under precautions as already stated.

225. If so, what provision should be made for this purpose?—A provision similar to sections 3 and 4, Statute 24 and 25 Vic., Chap. 54, or some similar arrangements.

226 & 227. Whatever system or systems may be adopted, ought power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted post candidates of high family subject to such antecedent guarantees of fitness as may be considered sufficient in each case?—Very exceptionally, and subject to the restrictions mentioned in answer to 225.

228. If a thorough knowledge of English were made an essential qualification for appointment to Covenanted posts, would the field of selection in the case of persons already in the Uncovenanted Service, or engaged in the exercise of a profession, be unduly limited thereby?—Natives of India in the ordinary sense who possess a thorough knowledge of English are as yet very few in the Punjab.

229. If such is likely to be the case, could the difficulty be obviated by requiring proficiency in the English language to be tested by periodical examinations *after* selection, but during a probationary period?—No, certainly not.

230. Should provision be made for the occasional appointment in very special and exceptional cases to Covenanted posts of persons of known ability and local influence whom, although they may never have held office and may not possess special professional qualifications, and although their age may exceed the limit laid down for untried candidates, it might nevertheless be considered desirable to appoint to the higher grades for political or other reasons?—Occasionally, but very rarely, and under restrictions as in answer No. 225.

231. To what extent if any, could the prescribed Covenanted Civil Service *cadre* in your Province be reduced without increase to the Uncovenanted Service?—It could not be reduced without such increase.

232. To what extent could the prescribed Covenanted Civil Service *cadre* in your Province be reduced if a corresponding increase were made in the English element of the Uncovenanted Service, or in the Native element, or partly in one and partly in the other?—The sanctioned scale of the Punjab Commission is that appended to the Government of India despatch No. 313, dated 5th November 1883, to the Secretary of State for India.

2. Since this scale was sanctioned another Judge has been added to the Chief Court Bench, and the Senior Settlement Officer has been converted into a Director of Settlements and Revenue Records.

3. One of the principles accepted by the Secretary of State in the recent reorganisation of the Service is that stated as follows in the papers noted,* viz.,—

"That the Covenanted Civil Service† shall be looked upon as a *corps d'élite*, and its number limited to what is necessary to fill the chief administrative appointments of the Government, and such a number of the smaller appointments as will ensure a complete course of training for junior Civilians"

This number to be sufficient to provide for a due proportion of officers absent on leave of all kinds.

4. The number of "charges," that is, of posts requiring to be provided for, so that the administration may be duly carried on, was fully discussed in the abovementioned papers, and the proportion of this number, which it was considered necessary to fill from the ranks of the 'Covenanted' Service (including Military and Uncovenanted Officers of the Commission), was given (under the arrangements then existing) at 104.

5. To determine the actual number of such charges under existing arrangements, the revised scale sanctioned by the Secretary of State must be taken, and the same principles applied to this scale.

6. This scale will be found from the papers mentioned in the first two paragraphs of this answer to be as follows:—

(1).	Administration‡ ...	15
(2).	Headships of Districts ...	31
(3).	Chief Court ...	3
(4).	Divisional Judges ...	13
(5).	District Judges § ...	9

The above are definitely fixed. Those which follow have to be determined on averages, as the numbers vary.

(6). *Government of India.*—An average of 7 was taken by the Government of India in 1881. The actual number was 10 At

* Government of India, Home Department, Resolution No. 68—2024-35, dated 15th December 1881.
Government of India, Financial Department, letter No. 2229, dated 29th December 1881.

† Including in the Punjab, Military and Uncovenanted Officers of the Commission.

‡ Lieutenant-Governor 1
Secretaries and Under-Secretaries 4
Financial Commissioners 2
Financial Commissioner's Secretaries 2
Commissioners 6

§ One held at present by a Native of India.

the present time, including officers permanently transferred, it is 14.* Judging from the demands hitherto made on the ranks of the Punjab Commission for such appointments, it would not be safe to take a lower average than 10.

(7). *Sub-divisional charges.*—The total number of Sub-divisional charges is 14†—the same as given in the Government of India calculation; but some of these are, in practice, held from time to time by Uncovenanted Officers as well as by officers of the Covenanted Service.

(8) *Miscellaneous Appointments.*—The number assumed as an average by the Government of India in 1881 was 13. The actual number at the present time is 11.‡ There is no reason for taking more than 11, as there were 7 Settlement Officers among the 13 taken by the Government of India, and this number is not likely to be required in future.

7. Our present *cadre* appointments are therefore, on the above calculation, 106.§

8. If to this be added, according to the scale adopted by the Government of India—

		Per cent.
(1) For men on leave	...	27·39
(2) Ditto in training	...	10·58
		37·97

we have a total of 146 for the whole Commission, including officers permanently transferred.

9. Assuming that Natives cannot at present be employed with advantage in classes (1), (2), and (3) of the classes composing the Covenanted Civil Service *cadre*, given in the foot-note to paragraph 7 of this Note, (viz., Government of India, Administration and Headships of districts), the other posts could perhaps ultimately be reduced by the following:—

Sub-divisional offices	...	6
Chief Court ...	...	1
Divisional Judges ...	...	3
District Judges ‖ ...	...	4
Miscellaneous ...	...	1
		15

provided such posts could be efficiently officered from the Uncovenanted Service or other effective agency, and the appointments could be so given away without undue prejudice to the interests of present members of the Covenanted Service. This will have the effect of giving 20 appointments away from the Covenanted Service.¶

10. If these posts were officered from the Uncovenanted Service or the professional classes, inequalities in the promotion of Covenanted judicial officers in the *cadre* would not arise. Nor would the general efficiency of the administration be injuriously affected, provided care is taken to give the appointments only to men of proved merit and ability whose practical efficiency is established beyond question, as the work can be done by Natives probably as well as by Europeans.

11. At the same time, in the special circumstances of the Punjab, a large staff of European officers is essential for the efficient administration of the country, and the above reduction in the Covenanted *cadre* could only be made if the orders of the Secretary of State of 1879 were cancelled, and the Uncovenanted Service, equally with the Covenanted Service, were thrown open to all qualified subjects of Her Majesty. The Local Government should also watch the effect of the system of recruitment of the

---

* 1 Agent, Biluchistan.
1 Do., Central India.
1 Do., Hyderabad.
1 Do., Mysore.
2 Commissioners, Burma.
1 Deputy Commissioner, Burma.
1 Major the Hon'ble G. C. Napier.
1 Khyber Officer.
1 Boundary Commission.
1 Under-Secretary, Revenue Department.
3 Assistant Political Officers or Assistant Commissioners in Administrations under the Government of India.

14

1. Murree.
2. Dalhousie.
3. Kulu.
4. Kasauli.
5. Mardan.
6. Thal.
7. Rajanpur.
8. Pind Dadan Khan.
9. Attock.
10. Sirsa.
11. Fazilka.
12. Kasur.
13. Bhakkar.
14. Mianwali.

‡ 1 Registrar.
1 Government Advocate.
1 Income Tax Officer.
1 Superintendent of Kapurthala.
1 Private Secretary.
1 Director of Settlements.
5 Settlement Officers.

11

§

1.	Government of India	10
2.	Administration	15
3.	Headships of Districts	31
4.	Sub-divisional Officers	14
5.	Chief Court	3
6.	Divisional Judges	13
7.	District Judges	9
8.	Miscellaneous	11
		106

‖ One appointment is now held by a Native

¶ *Cadre* appointments				106
Leave and training at 37·97 per cent.				40
				146
Cadre appointments (106-15)			91	
Leave and training at 37·97 per cent.			35	
				126
Difference				20

Uncovenanted Service; and if that system should result in a continued reduction of European officers in its ranks, the system would have to be altered so as to secure the appointment of a sufficient number of European officers.

12. One question remains to be considered, viz., whether the direct appointments of members of the Uncovenanted Service to the posts proposed for reduction from the Covenanted Civil Service *cadre* would at the present time afford reasonable dissatisfaction to the officers superseded.

13. The power to make such appointments previous to 1870 was not barred by any Statute, though not expressly reserved. By 33 Vic., cap. 3, section 6, the power was expressly taken, though rules under the Statute were not framed till 1879. There is, therefore, no legal bar to making the appointments proposed above. The objection to such appointments is based upon the expectation regarding promotion formed by the members of the Commission, on the procedure ordinarily adopted by Government, in regard to such appointments.

14. This expectation is not an unreasonable one, and cannot be disregarded. But here the existing possibilities come to our aid. It is not probable that so many men qualified for these posts could be found at the present time. What is desired is to provide a career, not necessarily to make the appointments at once; and if the appointments to District and Divisional Judgeships were not filled up from outside the Covenanted Service until members of the Covenanted Service who competed before 1870 had received their promotion, and if the intentions of Government were publicly declared, all reasonable ground of dissatisfaction ought to be removed.

233. Assuming a fixed proportion to be maintained between Europeans and Natives in the Civil Service *cadre*, in what posts or classes of appointments do you consider that Europeans and Natives respectively might be employed with most advantage to the interests of the public service?—On the assumption mentioned; and speaking generally and with reference to the present circumstances of the Punjab, Europeans might be employed with most advantage in executive, and Natives in judicial charges.

234. Would it be desirable to rule that the proportion of persons, being Muhammadans and Hindus respectively, who are from time to time or over a series of years appointed to the Covenanted ranks in any Province, should bear a certain relation to the number of the two classes composing the population of the Province concerned?—There need be no fixed proportion, but it is desirable that in a general way offices should be fairly distributed between Hindus and Muhammadans. Sikhs should also be considered separately.

235. What classes, ranks or professions of the Native community should be included among Muhammadans and Hindus, respectively, for the purpose of ascertaining the proportion of the population of each of those classes in the several Provinces?—Unnecessary to go into such a detail, as the proportion of appointments held by each section should not be fixed.

236. How far should appointments in each Province to Covenanted posts be restricted to Natives of the Province concerned?—Persons appointed to the Civil Service by competition in England should be available for service wherever the Government thinks fit. Persons appointed otherwise should, unless in very exceptional cases, be Natives of the Province in which they are to serve.

237. How would the following scheme be regarded by the Native community:—

(1) The Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of European officers, admission being by competition in England confined to European candidates only.

(2) The appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, Natives only being eligible?—The Native community, who take any great interest in the question, would regard it unfavorably. What they desire is equality of treatment.

238. How would you regard such a scheme?—The Lieutenant-Governor would object to it very strongly.

239. How would the Native community regard the following:—

(1) The Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of appointments to be filled by competition in England to which Natives and Europeans alike would be admitted.

(2) The appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, both Natives and Europeans being eligible?—Uncertain, but would probably be looked upon with favor.

240. How would you regard such a scheme?—The Lieutenant-Governor is strongly in favor of it.

241. If either of the above schemes were adopted, how would the Native community view a proposal to combine the higher appointments of the Uncovenanted Service with the appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service so as to form an enlarged Civil Service to be recruited in India?—As No. 239.

242. How would you view such a proposal?—As No. 240.

243. How would the Native community regard the following scheme:—

(1) A certain number of appointments in the Covenanted Civil Service to be reserved for Natives.

(2) A a certain proportion of that number to be filled by competition or by some other system in India.

(3) The remainder to be filled by competition in England?—As No. 237.

244. How would you regard such a scheme?—*Vide* No. 238.

245. Assuming a system of nomination or of limited competition among nominated candidates, would Native opinion be in favor of giving a preference, as between candidates possessed of certain preliminary essential qualifications and having on general grounds fairly equal claims, in the following or any other order, to—(*a*) members of families of tried loyalty and distinguished service; (*b*) persons of good social status and influence in the country; and (*c*) persons of superior educational attainments, such as persons who have taken the degree of M.A.?—Men of the old school would.

246. What is your opinion as to giving such preference?—On the distinct assumption that a system of nomination or of limited competition among nominated candidates is maintained, the Lieutenant-Governor approves of it.

247. How would the Native community regard a system of nomination on the ground of merit and ability shown in the service of Government or in the exercise of a profession, alternating with a system of selection by means of competition, whether entirely open or amongst nominated candidates?—The Lieutenant-Governor does not think that it would be acceptable.

248. How would you regard such a system?—The Lieutenant-Governor would strongly object to it, as introducing invidious distinctions between officers of Government holding practically the same offices.

249. If the Statutory system were maintained, and if a probationary period were required from nominees or selected candidates before final appointment, would it be necessary to insist upon such probationary period in all cases, *e.g.*, in the case of a person who has done good service in the Uncovenanted ranks?—No.

250. In the case of persons nominated from the professional classes, is it desirable that a probationary period should be prescribed?—No.

251. If so, is it necessary that the incidents of such period as to duration and pay should be the same as those attached thereto in the case of Statutory Civilians appointed on probation to the lowest grade of the Covenanted Service?—No.

252. On what principle should the promotion of Natives appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than by the channel of the competition in England be regulated?—Where appointments are made to particular posts and not to a service, it will be difficult to regulate promotion otherwise than by considering the manner in which they have discharged their duties in the posts they hold.

253. Would you regulate such promotion only by considerations of fitness and approved personal merit?—The Lieutenant-Governor sees no other way.

254. How would the appointment of Natives to the higher reserved posts without passing through the lower grades affect the vested rights or the reasonable expectations and prospects of officers who entered the Covenanted Civil Service before the year 1870?—It would affect them very slightly, inasmuch as the appointments would be made only exceptionally, and the earlier Statute of 1861 gave distinct intimation that such appointments might be made.

255. If those rights, expectations, or prospects would be prejudicially affected, how could they be safeguarded?—No special measure is necessary.

256. Should Natives appointed to Covenanted posts be required to pass the departmental examinations?—Yes, if new men. No, if appointed as a reward for long and tried service.

257. Should they be required to pass the departmental examinations by both the Lower and Higher Standards within their probationary period, subject to the penalty of forfeiture of appointment if they fail to pass within that time, unless the period is for special reasons extended?—Yes, in the case of men appointed otherwise than as a reward for long and tried service.

258. Should a period longer than the probationary period be allowed for passing the departmental examination by the Higher Standard?—No.

259. Should the present rule be maintained under which probationers may be confirmed in their appointments at the close of the probationary period of two years, provided that they pass within that period the departmental examination by the Lower Standard prescribed for Covenanted Civilians appointed in England, no obligatory period being fixed for passing the Higher Standard, but no promotion or increase of pay being attainable until the Higher Standard examination has been passed, and power being retained to the Government to dispense with the services of a Statutory Civilian who may fail to pass by the Higher Standard within a reasonable time?—No. If they do not pass the Higher Standard they ought to be removed. The rules for such very high appointments should be very strictly enforced.

260. What rule in regard to passing the departmental examinations should be applied in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts on the ground of merit and ability proved in the service of Government or in the exercise of a profession?—They should not be required to pass.

261. Should subjects of Native States be eligible for appointment to Covenanted posts in British India?—Yes.

262. If so, should this be extended to all Native States in alliance with the Crown, or only to those in subordinate alliance?—Only to those in subordinate alliance.

263. What system, if any, is at present adopted in your Province for bringing into the public service persons who, from their

position or otherwise, cannot be expected to enter the service of Government in the lowest grades, and for giving them the necessary apprenticeship?—See rules for appointment of Extra Assistant Commissioners, Tahsíldárs and Munsifs forwarded with answers Nos. 276 to 286.

264. Does the system work well, and what improvements can you suggest?—The system might be improved by adopting for Tahsíldárs a double system of appointment analogous to that prescribed for Extra Assistant Commissioners.

VIII.—Composition, recruitment, &c., of the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services.

265. Of what different classes of appointments is the Subordinate Executive Service in your Province composed, including in the term "Subordinate Executive Service" all Subordinate Executive offices down to and including the office of Tahsíldár or other office corresponding to that of Tahsíldár, which are not reserved by law for, or not ordinarily held by, members of the Covenanted Civil Service?—(1) Extra Assistant Commissioners. (2) Tahsíldárs. (3) Superintendents of Settlements.

266 & 267. Into what grades is each class of the above executive appointments divided in your Province, and of how many appointments does each grade consist? What rate of pay is attached to each grade?—The following table gives the information asked for in these two questions:—

Grades.	No. of appointments.	Rate of pay.
77 Extra Assistant Commissioners.		Rs.
1st Grade	2	800
2nd "	2	700
3rd "	3	600
4th "	8	500
5th "	24	400
6th "	23	300
7th "	15	250
123 Tahsildars.		
1st Grade	18	250
2nd "	27	200
3rd "	36	175
4th "	42	150
22 Settlement Superintendents.		
1st Grade	3	250
2nd "	5	200
3rd "	6	175
4th "	8	150

268. Of what different classes of appointments is the Subordinate Judicial Service in your Province composed, including in the term "Subordinate Judicial Service" all Subordinate Judicial offices down to and including the office of Munsif or other office corresponding to that of Munsif, which are not reserved by law for, or not ordinarily held by, members of the Covenanted Civil Service?—(1) Extra Judicial Assistants. (2) Munsifs.

269 & 270. Into what grades is each class of the above judicial appointments divided in your Province, and of how many appointments does each grade consist? What rate of pay is attached to each grade?—The following statement gives the information required:—

Grades.	No. of appointments.	Rates of pay.
17 Extra Judicial Assistants.		Rs.
1st Grade	2	1,000
2nd "	2	800
3rd "	2	700
4th "	8	600
5th "	8	500
84 Munsifs.		
1st Grade	13	250
2nd "	18	200
3rd "	25	175
4th "	28	150

271. In the existing Subordinate executive staff how many persons are (1) Europeans; (2) Natives of India of pure descent; (3) Eurasians and others who, though not Natives of India of pure descent, fall within the meaning attached to the words "Natives of India" by the Statute of 1870 (33 Vic., cap. 3, section 6); and (4) persons who are neither Europeans nor Natives of India, whether of pure descent or within the statutory meaning?—

(1) Europeans 1
(2) Natives of India of pure descent ... 213
(3) Natives of India within Statutory definition 8*
(4) Other persons 0

* Note.—In (2) are included Natives of Afghanistan (see Government of India, Home Department, Resolution No. 12—441-457, dated 20th March 1882). There are a few such, but the exact number cannot be stated without enquiry; several of those who originally came from Afghanistan have become domiciled in India and fulfil the conditions of (3).

272 & 273. What particular appointments in the Subordinate Executive Service are at present held in your Province by persons falling under each of the above classes? What rates of pay are attached to the appointments thus held in each case?—

(1) The only European is an Extra Assistant Commissioner of the 4th grade on Rs. 500.
(2) Of the 213 Natives of India of pure descent, 68 are Extra Assistant Commissioners of different grades, 123 are the Tahsíldárs referred in questions Nos. 266 and 267, 22 are the Settlement Superintendents.

(3) Of the eight Natives of India within the Statutory definition—

One is an Extra Assistant Commissioner ...	...	1st grade, on Rs.	800
Ditto ditto	...	2nd „ „	700
Ditto ditto	...	4th „ „	500
Ditto ditto	...	5th „ „	400
Three are Extra Assistant Commissioners	...	6th „ „	300
One is an Extra Assistant Commissioner ...	...	7th „ „	250

(4) There are no other persons.

274 & 275. What particular appointments in the Subordinate Judicial Service are at present held in your Province by persons falling under each of the above classes? What rates of pay are attached to the appointments thus held in each case?—

(1) There are four Europeans holding appointments as follows:—

One is an Extra Judicial Assistant ...	...	1st grade, on Rs.	1,000
Ditto ditto	...	3rd „ „	700
Ditto ditto	...	4th „ „	600
Ditto ditto	...	5th „ „	500

(2) There are 92 Natives of India of pure descent, including Natives of Afghanistan—see 271, note; 84 hold the 84 appointments of Munsifs specified in answers 269 and 270; the other 8 are Extra Judicial Assistants holding the following appointments:—

One is an Extra Judicial Assistant ...	...	2nd grade, on Rs.	800
Ditto ditto	...	4th „ „	600
Six are Extra Judicial Assistants ...	...	5th „ „	500

(3) There are five Natives of India—

One is an Extra Judicial Assistant ...	...	1st grade, on Rs.	1,000
Ditto ditto	...	2nd „ „	800
Ditto ditto	...	3rd „ „	700
Ditto ditto	...	4th „ „	600
Ditto ditto	...	5th „ „	500

(4) There are no persons other than those specified above.

276 to 286. Under what system of selection or nomination are appointments at present made in your Province to the Subordinate Executive Service, as above defined?

Under what system are appointments similarly made to the Subordinate Judicial Service, as defined above?

Have any rules been framed for the purpose of regulating such appointments, and, if so, what are they (*a*) in the case of the Subordinate Executive Service, and (*b*) in that of the Subordinate Judicial Service?

What preliminary qualifications, if any, are required in the case of the Subordinate Executive Service and in that of the Subordinate Judicial Service, respectively, in regard to the age of candidates?

In regard to their educational attainments?

In regard to their moral, social and physical fitness?

In other respects (if any)?

Are the same qualifications, if any, required on the part of the holders of all appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, as above defined, or are different qualifications required on the part of candidates for different classes of appointments?

If the latter, what are the qualifications required, and to what class or classes of appointments do they respectively apply?

Are appointments to the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, as above defined, made on probation?

If so, what is the length of the probationary period required?—The rules for the appointment and probation of—

(1) Tahsíldárs,
(2) Munsifs,
(3) Extra Assistant Commissioners,

are contained in the following papers, copies of which are enclosed:—

(1) Financial Commissioner's Book Circular 2 of 1873.
(2) Chief Court's Book Circular XIV of 1884.
(3) Punjab Government Notification No. 804S, dated 25th July 1885; No. 1397S, dated 19th September 1885.

287. What are its incidents as to pay and in other respects?—Officers officiating in any of the appointments referred to in the foregoing answers (Nos. 276–278) draw rates of pay under the rules of the Pay and Acting Allowance Code, varying according to the appointments in which, and the substantive appointments, &c., from which, they officiate. There is the single exception in the case of persons appointed to the post of Extra Assistant Commissioner by competition, who get only Rs. 100 a month for the period of probation in the Settlement Department noticed in Rule 16, Punjab Government Notification No. 804S, dated 25th July 1885.

288. If a probationary period is required, is it insisted upon in all cases, or is it dispensed with in any, and if so in what, cases?—A probationary period is insisted upon in all cases. It is never dispensed with.

289. What departmental examinations (if any) are persons appointed to the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, as above defined, required to pass?—*Tahsíldárs and Munsifs* are required to pass the departmental examination prescribed for them, unless specially exempted, but the cases of exemption are now very rare.

Extra Assistant Commissioners are required to pass the departmental examination prescribed for Assistant Commissioners and Extra Assistant Commissioners by the Higher Standard.

Extra Judicial Assistants and Settlement Superintendents must have passed their respective examinations as Extra Assistant Commissioners and Tahsildárs, respectively, before they attain to their positions as Extra Judicial Assistants and Settlement Superintendents.

290. Within what period (if any) from the date of original appointment must such examinations be passed?—*Tahsildárs* (unless specially exempted) and *Extra Assistant Commissioners* appointed *by selection* must pass their respective departmental examinations before appointment.

Extra Assistant Commissioners and Munsifs appointed by competition are required to pass within two years of their appointment as Officiating Extra Assistant Commissioners and Munsifs respectively.

Munsifs appointed by selection are required to pass before appointment unless they are specially exempted, or have already passed the final examination in law of the Punjab University.

291. What is the penalty for failure to pass the examinations within the period prescribed?—*Munsifs appointed by competition* cannot be confirmed in their officiating appointments until they have passed. Extra Assistant Commissioners appointed for political reasons, or by competition, are liable to removal from their officiating appointments if they fail to pass their Departmental examinations in two successive years after their appointment, unless there are special reasons to account for their failure.

292 to 295. How is promotion regulated in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, as above defined?

Does such promotion depend on fitness only or merely on seniority? *or*

Is it regulated by considerations of fitness combined with considerations based on seniority?

If so, what relative weight is attached to fitness and seniority respectively?—Promotions in the Subordinate Executive Service and in the grades of Munsifs are regulated by seniority combined with fitness, as much weight being attached to one as to the other In making appointments to the post of Judicial Extra Assistant Commissioner, more weight is attached to fitness for judicial work than to seniority.

296. How is the present system of regulating appointments to the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, regarded by influential sections of the Native community?—Generally the older men prefer nomination and patronage. The younger generation and educated classes would prefer either the system for Extra Assistant Commissioners or open competition.

297. Has the existing system the effect of securing for the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, persons who are found to be thoroughly qualified for the performance of their duties?—Yes.

298. To what sections of Native society do the persons belong who accept under existing conditions appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively?—The middle and poorer upper classes.

299. To what extent do Natives of good family and education in your Province offer themselves as candidates for Subordinate Judicial and Executive appointments?—Freely, especially if the family is poor.

300. Do Natives who have been to England for purposes of study on their return to India willingly accept such appointments?—Too few Natives have been to England to admit of this question being answered.

301. How far are such appointments in your Province restricted to persons *bonâ fide* resident in (and connected with) the Province?—Almost entirely so restricted, though there are some from the North-West Provinces and a few from Afghanistan.

302. How far are the professional classes represented in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, in your Province?—Hardly at all.

303. Do members of the professional classes in your Province readily accept employment in those services?—No. The prospects are not good enough for professional men whom it would be worth while to employ.

304. Whatever system or systems may at present be adopted for the purpose of regulating appointments to the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, are any class or classes of persons expressly or practically excluded from such appointments?—Europeans are expressly excluded from all appointments above Rs. 200 per mensem, except with previous sanction of the Secretary of State

305. If so, how is such exclusion justified?—The Lieutenant-Governor considers that it cannot be justified.

306. Is it the case that certain classes of Uncovenanted appointments are practically reserved for Natives of pure descent owing to the fact that conditions are imposed which have resulted in shutting out Eurasians and other Statutory Natives of mixed descent?—Not in the Punjab.

307. If so, how is such reservation justified?—The Lieutenant-Governor considers that it could not be justified.

308. What has been the effect on the efficiency of the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services in your Province of the orders of the Government of India, dated 18th April 1879, which debar, unless with the previous sanction of the Governor-General in Council, (1) the appointment of any person, not being a Native of India within the Statutory meaning, to an office carrying a salary of Rs. 200 a month or upwards; and (2) the promotion

to such an office of persons, not being Statutory Natives, who entered the department concerned after the 1st January 1879? —The number of Europeans has been reduced, and Government has lost the services of some good men. It would be difficult to say whether the efficiency of the service has been affected, except that the reduction in the number of Europeans has occasionally been felt by Government as inconvenient to the Administration.

309. Since the issue of the orders above cited, have any undomiciled Europeans or other persons, not being Statutory Natives of India, been appointed either to the Subordinate Executive Service or to the Subordinate Judicial Service in your Province?—A few Natives of Afghanistan have been appointed under the orders of the Government of India.

310. If so, how many such persons have been appointed, and under what circumstances were the appointments made?—No persons other than "Natives of India" have been appointed permanently to the Subordinate Executive or Judicial Services in the Punjab. Two Kabul Sardárs have been appointed to officiate, with the cognizance of the Government of India, in the Foreign Department, and still hold their officiating appointments.

311. Is it, in your opinion, necessary that there should be a proportion of Europeans either in the Subordinate Executive Service or in the Subordinate Judicial Service, or in both of those services?—Most decidedly.

312. If so, on what grounds do you consider that an admixture of Europeans is necessary?—The same grounds that make a Covenanted Civil Service necessary. The Lieutenant-Governor would rather not go into the details.

313. What, in your opinion, is the requisite proportion to be maintained between Europeans and Natives in those services?—The number of Europeans employed in the Commission and in the Uncovenanted Service should not be less than that at present employed; and with reference to the fact that, owing to the orders of the Secretary of State issued in 1879, Europeans who are not Statutory 'Natives of India' have not been appointed in recent years, the number is at present abnormally low.

314. How do European members of the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, work with Native members of those services?—Exceedingly well.

315. Has experience shown that Europeans serving in such capacities become dissatisfied with their position and with the general conditions as to pay, promotion and retiring annuity under which they hold their appointments, and that their efficiency as public servants is consequently impaired? —Yes; but it cannot be said that their efficiency has become impaired except in a general way.

316. Are you in favor of laying down a rule that high educational capacity should be regarded as an essential qualification for appointment to the Subordinate Executive and to the Subordinate Judicial Services as defined for the purposes of these questions?—Yes.

317. If so, what test would you apply? —In the case of all persons not appointed as a reward for good service, the Entrance Examination, at least, for the next few years for those for whom such test or a higher one is not already prescribed, and thereafter a University degree.

318. Do you think that the test should vary according to the character of the office to be filled?—Yes.

319. Generally, what system do you advocate for filling appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services as above defined?—A double system, partly (1) appointment as a reward for good service in inferior appointments, and partly (2) direct appointment by competition, either limited or open, according to circumstances.

320. What preliminary qualifications would you require on the part of candidates for those appointments in regard to age and in other respects?—Those prescribed for Extra Assistant Commissioners.

321. Is it possible to devise any one system which would be equally applicable to all Provinces, having regard to the varying educational standards reached in the several Provinces and the varying conditions prevalent therein?—Certainly not.

322. Do you advocate the requirement of a probationary period, and, if so, what should be the incidents of such period as to duration, pay, and in other respects?—Yes. One or two years' apprenticeship in the department in which the work of the office can be best learnt, on pay not less than two-thirds of the lowest pay of the appointment.

323. Would you require a probationary period in all cases, or would you dispense with it in certain, and if so in what, cases? —Should be dispensed with in all cases of appointments given as a reward for service in lower posts.

324. If an open competitive examination were held in India for the Covenanted posts reserved for Natives, would persons who gained high marks in that examination and showed decided proficiency, but who failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, form suitable nominees for Subordinate Judicial and Executive appointments in the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes, on the suppostion that appointments to the Subordinate Executive and Judicial Services are made by nomination.

II.

No. 2067, dated Lahore, the 26th December 1886.

From—H. MAUDE, ESQ., Under-Secretary to the Government of the Punjab and its Dependencies,

To—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission.

Vol. I. Sec. I. Sub-Sec. B. Paper II.

Punjab Government.

I AM directed by the Lieutenant-Governor to forward, for the information of the Members of the Public Service Commission, copies of a memorandum on the special features of the Punjab which bear upon its administration.

Memorandum on the special features of the Punjab bearing upon its administration.

THE area of the Punjab with its Feudatory States, thirty-four in number, is 142,449 square miles, and its population 22,712,120 souls. Of the area, 106,632 square miles are British territory, with 18,850,437 inhabitants; while 35,817 square miles, with a population of 3,861,683 persons, are comprised within the Native States. With the exception of some 220 miles on its eastern boundary, adjoining the North-West Provinces, the Punjab is almost entirely surrounded by Native States and independent tribes. Contiguous to the latter are 704 miles on the north-western frontier. Among the former are the important States of Jummoo and Kashmír on the north, and on the south that of Bahawalpur and some of the States of Rájputáná. Lying within the British dominions are the territories of Patiála, Jínd and Nábha, which stretch from the Simla Hills nearly across the south-eastern portion of the Punjab, and almost completely sever the districts of the Delhi Division from the more northerly regions of the Province.

2. More than 30,000 square miles of British territory in the Punjab consist of rugged mountains and unculturable waste, while nearly 40,000 square miles, though culturable, have not been utilised. The cultivated area is nearly 37,000 square miles, or little more than one-third of the Province.

3. The mass of the population, whether including or excluding the Native States, consists of Mussalmáns, Hindús and Sikhs, the number of Jains, Buddhists, Christians and others being numerically unimportant. The following table gives the numbers of Mussalmáns, Hindús and Sikhs :—

	Mussalmáns.	Hindús.	Sikhs.
British territory	10,525,150	7,130,528	1,121,004
Native States	1,137,284	2,121,767	595,110
Total ...	11,662,434	9,252,295	1,716,114

More than eleven millions of the Mussalmáns are Sunnís; Shiáhs and Wahábís forming but a very small percentage.

4. Only three towns in the Punjab contain 100,000 inhabitants, viz.,—

Delhi	173,393
Amritsar	151,896
Lahore	149,369

and only in the following five instances does the population exceed 50,000 :—

Peshawar	79,982
Mooltan	68,674
Umballa	67,463
Ráwalpindi	52,975
Jullundur	52,119

There are thirty-eight towns containing less than fifty but more than ten thousand inhabitants, and in eighty-six there are less than ten but more than five thousand residents The population of these 132 towns amounts to 2,082,034, so that the bulk of the provincial population may be classed as villagers, or as residents of towns which are little more than superior villages.

5. For administrative purposes the Punjab is divided into six Divisions or Commissionerships, which are subdivided into thirty-one districts, under the control of Deputy Commissioners. The names of the divisions and districts are as follows :—

Division.	District.
DELHI	Hissar. Rohtak. Gurgaon. Delhi. Karnal. Umballa. Simla.
JULLUNDUR	Kángra. Hoshiárpur. Jullundur. Ludhiána. Ferozepore.
LAHORE	Mooltan. Jhang. Montgomery. Lahore. Amritsar. Gurdáspur.
RAWALPINDI	Siálkot. Gujrát. Gujránwála. Shahpur. Jhelum. Ráwalpindi.
PESHAWAR	Hazára. Pesháwar. Kohat.
DERAJAT	Bannu. Dera Ismail Khan. Dera Ghazi Khan. Muzuffargarh.

The last two Divisions are the strongholds of the Biluch and Pathan races, the former being found in the Deraját, the latter mostly in the Pesháwar Division. The Játs and Rájpúts are the dominant tribes inhabiting the Cis-Indus districts of the Province, and together they comprise no less than 27 per cent. of the total population of the Punjab. The Bilúchís are manly and courageous, frank and open in their manners. Not less independent are the Pathána, but turbulent, treacherous and fanatical as they are, to control them is more difficult. Pride of blood is the characteristic of the Rájpúts: they regard manual labor as derogatory, and driving the plough as degrading: hence they are inferior cultivators, and generally less amenable to control than the races who are good husbandmen. Among these the Játs yields the palm to none. No less sturdy and manly than the frontier tribes and Rájpúts, and if anything more self-willed, he combines an honesty and industry which makes him *par excellence* the revenue payer of the Province. The Játs are chiefly found in the central tracts of the Punjab. Of the other castes, which, although individually few in numbers, collectively account for the greater part of the population of the Punjab, it is unnecessary to specify more than the Brahmins, the number of whom exceeds one million ; but it must not be forgotten that the minor agricultural and professional castes have their own occupations, interests and prejudices, and the prevention of friction on these accounts is an important part of the administration. Indeed, throughout the Punjab, with its manly and independent races of different creeds and castes, the repression of religious and other animosities requires constant vigilance and care.

6. Exclusive of Simla, which contains only 77 square miles, the area of the districts in the Punjab varies from 1,271 square miles in the case of Delhi to 9,296 square miles in that of Dera Ismail Khan. Roughly, it may be said that the average area is about 3,000 square miles. Each district is divided into tahsils or sub-collectorates, in charge of Tahsíldárs, while in some districts one or more tahsils form sub divisions in charge of Assistant Commissioners or Extra Assistant Commissioners, as the case may be. There are usually fourteen such Sub-Divisional Officers, while the number of tahsils aggregates 127.

7. The system of administration by Commissioners and Deputy Commissioners was imported from the North-West Provinces immediately after the annexation of the Punjab

Lord Dalhousie's instructions were that the Commissioner should perform the functions of the officer of the same denomination in those Provinces, but that he should be required to exercise a stricter supervision and control over the Deputy Commissioner than would be necessary where a regular routine of business was well established and understood. With regard to Deputy Commissioners, it was laid down that in the Departments of Revenue and Police they should exercise the powers of a Collector and Magistrate in the Regulation Provinces. Until very recently, Commissioners disposed of both civil and sessions cases in addition to their other duties, and Deputy Commissioners were the chief original civil courts of the districts. Since the reorganization of the Punjab Commission took effect in 1884, Commissioners have been relieved of all criminal and civil work, their numbers being reduced from ten to six; while Deputy Commissioners, though still in some districts nominally District Judges, are but very seldom required to decide civil cases, whether original or on appeal.

The Commissioner.

8. Excluding their political functions, which will be noticed separately, the duties of Commissioners may be briefly thus described. They have charge of any settlements which may be in progress in their Divisions; they are appellate courts in respect of revenue suits under the Punjab Courts Act; the supervision of land revenue, excise, and income-tax collections rests with them, and they control the working of District Boards and Municipal Committees. Assignments of land revenue and pensions, grants and leases of waste lands, matters connected with the Court of Wards, all claim their attention, while the general control of the various districts within the Division and the supervision of the different officers connected with the administration of them, in addition to other more exactly defined duties, renders the post of Commissioner very responsible and onerous.

9. The amount and nature of the Commissioner's political work varies with the number and importance of the Native States under his control, and, in the case of the officers in charge of the two frontier divisions, with the state of our relations with the independent tribes upon the border. The large States of Patiála, Bahawalpur, Jínd and Nábha are under the direct supervision of the Lieutenant-Governor, but the Commissioner of Delhi controls the Simla Hill States, twenty in number, which are under the more immediate superintendence of the Deputy Commissioner of Simla, and directly supervises the States of Maler Kotla, Kalsia, Pataudi, Loháru and Dujána. Under the Commissioner of Jullundur are the States of Kapurthala, Farídkot, Mandi, and Suket, and under the Commissioner of Lahore that of Chamba.

In a brief sketch like the present it is impossible to explain the precise nature of the duties which the control of the various States entails upon Commissioners, but generally it may be said that they are required to see that the various Chiefs fulfil the engagements of the treaties under which they hold their fiefs, and that injustice and oppression are not practised.

No Native State is included within the limits of the Commissionership of Ráwalpindi, but that division marches for many miles with the State of Jummoo and Kashmír, and questions of extradition, boundary disputes, and irrigation rights in rivers and streams are not unfrequently referred to the Commissioner for investigation or decision.

The nature of the political work in the frontier divisions will be treated separately in connection with the independent tribes abutting on our border.

The Deputy Commissioner.

10. In many respects the work of the Deputy Commissioner in his district is similar to that of the Commissioner in his Division; the same subjects demand his attention, his subordinate officers require the same supervision and control. But as the immediate executive representative of Government, the Deputy Commissioner is brought into closer contact both with the people of his district and also with the officers of other departments of Government who are either not under his control at all, or who are only generally subject to his orders. Among the latter are the District Superintendent of Police and his Assistants, the Civil Surgeon, the Cantonment Magistrate, where such exists, the Superintendent of the Jail, and the officers of the Educational and Registration Departments. Forest Officers are also now under the control of the Deputy Commissioner.

By law the administration of the Police throughout a district vests in the District Superintendent, but subject to the general control and direction of the Deputy Commissioner, who is District Magistrate. The relations between these officers must therefore be close and intimate. The Civil Surgeon, who is usually also the Superintendent of the Jail, superintends the hospitals and dispensaries throughout the district. His advice is also required on sanitary questions. The Cantonment Magistrate is, under the Cantonment Act, a Magistrate in charge of a division of a district, and as such subordinate to the Deputy Commissioner.

11. The Departments of Government with which the Deputy Commissioner has no direct concern are in the Punjab, as elsewhere in India, numerous: it is sufficient here to mention the Postal, Railway, Telegraph, and Salt Departments. The Public Works Department, including the Irrigation Branch, has many interests common with those with which the Deputy Commissioner is charged, but its officers, as elsewhere, are not under his control.

12. But there is one class of Government servants which assumes more prominence in the Punjab than in any other province of India, namely, the Military servants of the Crown. On March 31st, 1886, no less than 39,740 troops of the Bengal establishment were quartered in the Punjab, while the Frontier Force on the same date comprised 13,281 men, making a total of 53,021 of all arms. Of these, 18,064 were British troops, distributed over nineteen cantonments, forts or hutted camps. Excluding the frontier, with the exception of the Pesháwar District, the European and British troops were quartered in thirty different localities. On the frontier, exclusive of Pesháwar, there are seven cantonments occupied by the Punjab Frontier Force, besides numerous small outposts which will be referred to afterwards. Altogether in the Province there are thirty-seven places, excluding frontier outposts, in which troops are quartered, and in nineteen of these places the normal number of men exceeds one thousand. Chief among these may be mentioned the important cantonments of Delhi, Umballa, Jullundur, Mián Mir, Ferozepur, Mooltán, Siálkot, Ráwalpindi, and Pesháwar.

The presence of so large a garrison in the Province demands the performance by many Deputy Commissioners of duties of a special character. The Deputy Commissioner is *ex-officio* a member of the Cantonment Committee; where Cantonments and Municipalities adjoin each other, questions such as taxation, drainage, or water-supply affecting both institutions are often referred for his consideration : supplies and carriage are matters constantly demanding his attention; so that for a variety of reasons a cordial understanding between the civil and military officers is imperative.

The duties devolving upon Deputy Commissioners in connection with this subject during the Abyssinian Campaign in 1868, the Afghánistán Campaigns of 1878—1880, the Campaign in Egypt in 1884-85, and the recent Military preparations in 1885 were specially arduous.

The Sub-Division.

13. The following are the fourteen civil outposts or sub-divisions of districts in the Province:—

1. Murree.	8. Pind Dadan Khan.
2. Dalhousie.	9. Attock.
3. Kulu.	10. Sirsa.
4. Kasauli.	11. Fázilka.
5. Mardán.	12. Kasúr.
6. Thal.	13 Bhakkar.
7. Rajanpur.	14. Miánwáli.

The first four are Hill sub-divisions, and, with the exception of Kulu, are required on account of the British soldiers and other Europeans residing at those places during the hot weather. Kulu is a remote tract in the Kángra district, where a Sub-Divisional Officer is necessary on account of the distance of the sub-division from Dharmsala, the head-quarters of the district; a number of European planters have also settled in the Kulu valley. Mardán, Thal and Rajanpur are all frontier sub-divisions, and, with the exception of Thal, are cantonments of the Punjab Frontier Force. Pind Dadan Khan is an outpost in the Jhelum district, where the salt mines require the presence of a civil officer. The above remarks are sufficient to indicate the reasons why it is considered expedient that a European Assistant Commissioner should be in charge of the first eight sub-divisions; and when sufficient officers are available this arrangement is carried out. At Sirsa also it is desirable that a European officer should be posted, as it is a central point on the Rewari-Ferozepur Railway, where a number of Europeans are employed in connection with the workshops and other matters pertaining to the railway. The remaining sub-divisions are generally officered by Native Extra Assistant Commissioners.

The Assistant Commissioner or Extra Assistant Commissioner in charge of a sub-division, so far as the law goes, is only distinguished from any other officer of the same grade by the fact that he is Sub-Divisional Magistrate under the Code of Criminal Procedure, and as such has certain powers which other Subordinate Magistrates are not ordinarily competent to exercise; but so far as the administration is concerned, he is considered primarily responsible for the sub-division, subject to the control of the Deputy Commissioner of the district. Where he is not competent to pass orders himself, the orders of the Deputy Commissioner are issued through him, and are carried out under his supervision. Generally it may be said that the Sub-Divisional Officer has an independent charge, though in some respects the Deputy Commissioner exercises a more active control within the sub-division than does the Commissioner within the districts under him.

In the frontier sub-divisions the Assistant Commissioner in charge has much to do with the independent tribes; indeed, the Thal outpost was recently established in order to give the Turis of the Kurram Valley the benefit of a British officer to advise and aid them in administering their affairs.

Frontier Commissioners and Deputy Commissioners.

14. In the frontier divisions and districts the work of the Commissioners and Deputy Commissioners is rendered very responsible by the necessity for maintaining relations with the numerous independent tribes which fringe the British border. Although it is in a general sense customary to regard Afghánistán and British India as contiguous, nowhere does the direct authority of the Amír of Kabul extend over the tribes which

actually touch our frontier. Each tribe is independent, and although the weaker units are sometimes coerced by their more powerful neighbours, the British Government can appeal to no central authority for the reparation of wrongs, nor, except by its own power, can it exact punishment for outrages committed on its subjects. The maintenance of friendly relations with the tribes, and the concurrent prevention of outrages upon our territory, is one of the most important duties of frontier officers; and the arduous nature of the task will be more readily apprehended when the number of fighting men among the tribes is borne in mind. The following table shows approximately the fighting strength of each tribe beyond the Punjab frontier :—

Locality.	Tribe.	Race.	Number of fighting men.
Adjoining the Hazára district ...	Cis-Indus Swátis ...	Pathán ...	10,800
	Hassanzais		2,000
	Akazais		700
	Chigárzais		5,300
	Paráchi Saiads ...		400
	Mada Khel		3,000
	Amazais		1,500
	Utmanzais		400
Adjoining the Pesháwar district ...	Gaduns		2,500
	Khudu Khel ...		1,800
	Chamláwals ...		1,000
	Bonerwáls		8,000
	Swát Baizais ...		6,000
	Swát Ranizais ..		3,000
	Utman Khel ...		5,000
	Mohmands		20,000
Adjoining Pesháwar and Kohát ...	Afridís		26,500
Adjoining Kohát	Urakzais		24,800
	Zaimushts		3,500
	Turis		6,100
Kohát, Bannu and Dera Ismail Khan	Wazírís		41,500
	Batánis		3,000
Bannu	Dawáris		9,000
Dera Ismail Khan	Shiránis		3,500
	Ustáránis		900
Dera Ghazi Khan	Kasránis	Bilúch ...	1,500
	Bozdárs		2,700
	Khosas		4,000
	Lagharis		3,700
	Khetráns	Pathán and Bilúch...	2,200
	Gurchánis	Biluch ...	2,600
	Mazáris		2,000
	Marris		3,000
	Bugtis		1,500
		Total ..	213,400

The above figures, which are only approximate, comprise all the male adults capable of bearing arms, and no single tribe could bring into the field more than half the numbers given, even if the deadly feuds which are always rife among the Afgháns permitted the presence of so many men as half. Still the danger of raids and other outrages is always very real, and special measures have had to be adopted to preserve the peace of the border.

To this end, the regiments of the Punjab Frontier Force are stationed in seven cantonments* from Abbottabad in the north to Rájanpur at the extreme southern limit of the Punjab frontier, and a line of posts, military militia and police, has been established for the defence of the plain country against incursions from the hills.

* Abbottabad.
Mardán.
Kohát.
Edwardesabad or Bannu.
Dera Ismail Khan.
Dera Ghází Khan.
Rájanpur.

The following table, compiled from the Quartermaster-General's Return for November 1st, 1886, gives a list of the Military and Militia posts in which regular troops or Militia,

the Punjab Frontier Force, were maintained on that date. The position of these posts will be seen from the accompanying map:—

HAZARA DISTRICT.
* Oghi (Agror).

YUSAFZAI DISTRICT.
* Abazai.

KOHAT DISTRICT.
* Fort Garnett.
* Fort Muhammadzai.
* Láchi.
* Bánda.
* Bahádur Khel.

BANNU DISTRICT.
* Latammar.
Barghanatto.
Gumatti Tower.
Gumatti.
* Kurram.
Barán.
Tochi.
Burji
* Jání Khel.
Walli.
Tajori.
Khairu Khel.

DERA ISMAIL KHAN DISTRICT.
Bain Pass.
Mullazai.
Kot Nasran.
* Tánk.
* Tánk Zám.
Kot Khirgi.
* Girni.
* Jatta.
* Mánjhi.
Luni.
Zarákni.
* Drában.

DERA GHAZI KHAN DISRTICT.
Vihowa.
Jhok Bodo.
* Mangrotha.
Mahoi.
Nurpur.
* Vidor.

RAJANPUR DISTRICT.

Rajanpur District Head-Quarters.
* Harrand
* Drigri.
* Muhammadpur.
Rumka Thul.
Sabzalkot.
Toziáni.
Dilbar.
* Bandowála.
Shekhwáli

Of the military posts it is unnecessary to say more than that they are garrisoned by the regular troops of the Punjab Frontier Force, relieved at stated intervals by fresh detachments.

The Militia outposts require more explanation; but first it may be noted that the Militia as here described are found only on the frontier of the Deraját; the Border Militia in the Pesháwar Division, which will be afterwards referred to, being quite distinct. Previous to the year 1872 the Frontier Militia or Military Police on the Deraját border were far from efficient. The numerous retainers of Chiefs who had rendered conspicuous service in the war of 1848-49 had to be provided for, and were nominated to the Militia. In the course of years many were found to be incapable from old age; others, being strangers in that part of the country, were found deficient in local knowledge of the border, an essential qualification of a frontier militia. The whole system was consequently reformed, and under that now adopted, nominations to horse and foot are given to each tribe according to the number of passes and the length of its territory on the border. But while the power of nomination rests with the Chiefs of the tribes, subject to the approval of the Deputy Commissioner, the right of rejection and discharge rests with the Military Officer commanding the outposts. Thus the relations between the Deputy Commissioner and the military authorities are somewhat close so far as the management of the Militia on the Deraját border is concerned.

In the Pesháwar Division the Border Militia, as they are termed, are constituted on a different system. Throughout the Deraját, troops stationed in the cantonments, or quartered for a period at the outposts, all belong to the Punjab Frontier Force, the officers of which, as it is a local force, have, as a rule, an intimate knowledge of the frontier and of the languages of its tribes. But the troops in the Pesháwar Valley (with the exception of the Corps of Guides at Mardán) have always formed part of the regular Bengal Army under the control of His Excellency the Commander-in-Chief. The officers of the Pesháwar Brigade have generally been wanting in local knowledge of the border, and of Pashtu, the language of the residents in and around the valley. It was therefore considered necessary to separate the Border Militia entirely from the Military authorities and to place the control in the hands of the Deputy Commissioner, with a specially selected police officer under his immediate orders. This system was also adopted in the district of Kohát, although no police officer has been specially appointed to the charge. In Hazára no Militia has yet been organized as a service paid by Government, but the various Chiefs and Kháns have ere this been called upon to furnish contingents of armed retainers as a condition of their service grants.

* The military posts have an asterisk placed before them. The remainder are Militia.

But although the Border Militia in the Peshâwar Division are not directly or indirectly controlled by the Military authorities, it has often happened that the regular troops have been required to co-operate with the Militia in the defence of the border, and it is as essential in Peshâwar as in the Derajât that the most cordial relations should exist between the civil and military officers.

The staff required for administering the divisions, districts and sub-divisions.

15. Such being a brief indication of the work to be performed by Divisional, District and Sub-Divisional Officers, both generally and on the frontier, the agency at the disposal of the Local Government may now be considered. This agency consists of the officers of the Commission and those of the Uncovenanted or Subordinate Service.

Excluding the highest offices, such as Lieutenant-Governor, Judges of the Chief Court, Financial Commissioner, and the Secretariat Offices attached to them, the sanctioned strength of the Commission is as follows :—

	No.
Administrative.	
Commissioners of Divisions	6
Deputy Commissioners of districts (3 grades)	31
Assistant Commissioners (3 grades)	30
Judicial.	
Divisional and Sessions Judges (3 grades)	13
* District Judges (2 grades)	9

These appointments are held by Covenanted Civilians, by Military Officers, and by Uncovenanted Officers. There are also at the present time (December 1st) twenty-six supernumerary Assistant Commissioners, who fill the places of officers on leave, or who are considered to be in training. Of the total number of officers employed in the Commission, as above mentioned, 69 are Covenanted Civilians, 33 are Military Officers, 6 are Uncovenanted European Officers, and 7 are Natives. The subordinate service consists of the following officers :—

Extra Judicial Assistant Commissioners, 1st grade	2
Ditto ditto, 2nd „	2
Ditto ditto, 3rd „	2
Ditto ditto, 4th „	3
Ditto ditto, 5th „	8
Total ...	17
Extra Assistant Commissioners, 1st grade	2
Ditto ditto, 2nd „	2
Ditto ditto, 3rd „	3
Ditto ditto, 4th „	8
Ditto ditto, 5th „	24
Ditto ditto, 6th „	23
Ditto ditto, 7th „	15
Total ...	77
Tahsildârs	123
Munsifs	84

Of these the Extra Judicial Assistant Commissioners and the Munsifs perform only judicial functions. In the subordinate service there are 18 European and 283 Native Officers. Excluding, therefore, the judicial officers both in the Commission and in the subordinate service, there remain the following for carrying out the administration of the various units into which the Province is divided—

6 Commissioners for the 6 Divisions.
31 Deputy Commissioners for the 31 Districts.
14 Assistant Commissioners or Extra Assistant Commissioners for the 14 Sub-divisions.
123 Tahsildârs for the 127 Tahsîls or Sub-Collectorates.†

Allowing for the necessary number of Assistant Commissioners and Extra Assistant Commissioners to replace officers on special duty and absentees, the remaining Assistant Commissioners and Extra Assistant Commissioners are employed in the districts as Revenue Officers and Subordinate Magistrates, or as Civil Judges, or generally to assist in the administration of the district.

Special features in the Punjab.

16. A general idea having been gathered of the nature of the duties imposed upon the officers immediately responsible for the administration of the Province, and statistics having been given of the staff thus employed, it will not be out of place to consider any special features in the circumstances of the Punjab which perhaps do not exist elsewhere. Whether from climatic influences or from the fact that the British rule in the Punjab dates from less than forty years ago, there is no doubt that its races are more independent than the inhabitants of Hindustan and Southern India. But, though in some respects impatient of control and tenacious of their rights, the tribes of the Punjab have not lost their respect for their feudal Chiefs. There is

* One of these is at present held by a Native of India.
† Four of these are controlled by Nâib-Tahsildârs.

in this Province a very distinct aristocracy; through extravagance and inattention to business it has perhaps lost much of its material wealth; and in point of education it has certainly been far outstripped by the middle classes, but its influence is still powerful. In the Himalayan tracts there are Rajput Chiefs who practically control estates larger than some of the Simla Hill States; in the centre of the Province there are Sikh Chiefs or Sardars (in some cases relatives of the rulers of the independent Sikh States) whose authority is widely recognised; in the Derajat Division the Biluch Tumandárs are acknowledged, not only by the people, but by Government, as tribal Chiefs; and in Peshâwar the Arbâbs and Kháns assert prerogatives over their fellow-tribesmen which are not disputed or denied.

Much assistance in the administration, especially in times of emergency, has been rendered to our Deputy Commissioners by these Chiefs.

Religious animosities.

17. The necessity of repressing religious animosities has already been briefly alluded to. The following brief summary of facts is an example of the difficulties with which the officers of Government have during the last five years been forced to contend. In 1881 in Mooltan a serious disturbance occurred between the Muhammadans and Hindus, in connection with the slaughter and importation of beef into the city. Although no lives were lost, order was for some time completely subverted in that city; a number of religious edifices were destroyed or partially damaged, property to the value of more than two lakhs of rupees was lost, and military force was required to restore tranquility In the cities of Lahore and Karnal riots occurred last year on the occasion of the celebration of the Dasehra and Muharram festivals, troops being called out in the former case to re-establish order. On the occasion of the 'Id festival last September, there were disturbances at Umballa and Ludhiana owing to the religious antagonism of the Muhammadans and Hindus. More recently at Hoshiarpur and Delhi very serious riots resulting in loss of life broke out at the synchronous celebration of the Dasehra and Muharram festivals: in each case it was found necessary to invoke military aid. It is true that in all these cases, except the first, the coincidence of a Hindu and Muhammadan festival precipitated a collision between the rival sects, which otherwise might not have occurred, but instances are not wanting in which serious religious antagonism has prevailed in the absence of such special circumstances. For example, in one large municipality, Muhammadan members of the committee refused to serve unless one of their co-religionists was elected president, and similarly the Hindus objected to any but a Hindu president. In another important municipality the Hindu members of the committee refused to guard the public rights when a Brahmin appropriated a public well; while the minority, consisting of Muhammadans and a few Christians, could only record a futile protest. It is needless to cite more instances of religious animosities: it will suffice to remark that elements of discord on this account are never absent in the Punjab. The question of the slaughter of kine is of itself a matter requiring the unremitting attention of all District Officers, and it is only the strictest impartiality which prevents religious disturbances from being more frequent than they are.

Conclusion.

18. A brief sketch has now been given of the work of administration as required in the Punjab; the character of its people, the position of its aristocracy has been alluded to, the special circumstances of its long line of frontier have been considered. It remains to note some of the material improvements which have been made in the Province under its present system of administration. In 1875-76 the capital invested in canals in the Punjab amounted to Rs. 3,32,71,760; in the year 1885-86 this sum has risen to Rs. 6,71,67,121, and the irrigated area has increased within the same period from 1,098,500 to 1,787,567 acres. The extension of the Railway system during the last few years has been remarkable. There are now 1,535 miles of open line in the Province, while the Sind-Sagar line is being rapidly pushed on. It is in great part due to this increase in the means of communication with the seaboard that the export of wheat from the Punjab has assumed the importance which it has. During the past year 1885-86 no less than 16,417,760 maunds of wheat were exported by rail and river from the Province. This alone is a sufficient indication of the improved condition of the Punjab; much, however, remains to be done in developing the resources of the country.

---

*Explanation of the Map.**

The Commissionerships or Divisions are marked with a blue line; those independent Native States which are under the control of the Commissioner are included in the Delhi, Jullundur, and Lahore Divisions.

The districts are denoted by a narrow red line.

The head-quarters of each sub-division are shown in shaded red.

The Military and Militia outposts mentioned in paragraph 14 are numbered in order from north to south, commencing with Oghi in the district of Hazara. It has not been found practicable to show the posts held by the Peshâwar Border Militia.

* The map will be found in a pocket in the binding.

III.

LETTER AND RULES REFERRED TO IN THE ANSWERS OF THE PUNJAB GOVERNMENT TO QUESTIONS 70 AND 276 TO 286.

No. 2554, dated Lahore, 7th November 1885.

From—C. L. TUPPER, ESQ., Officiating Secretary to Government, Punjab,
To—The Secretary to the Government of India, Home Department.

Vol I.
Sec. I.
Sub-Sec. B.
Paper III.

Punjab Government

I AM directed by the Lieutenant-Governor to acknowledge the receipt of your confidential letter No. 25—1078, dated 8th June 1885, which forwarded a draft set of revised rules for the appointment of Statutory Civilians, and requested an expression of the opinion of His Honor upon these rules. The Government of India has also asked to be furnished with a draft of the subsidiary regulations (referred to in rule 3) which the Lieutenant-Governor would propose to lay down for the Punjab.

2. In reply, the Lieutenant-Governor desires me to forward copies of the opinions expressed by the officers marginally noted, and to say that these rules, considered merely as rules under the Statute, are, if the Statutory system is to be maintained, a considerable improvement upon the old rules. In particular, they remove the unquestionable illegality in the former rules, to which attention was drawn in paragraph 8 of His Honor's Minute of the 7th July 1884, communicated to the Government of India with my letter No. 231, dated the 11th July 1884. Sir Charles Aitchison, however, thinks that they still require very material alteration, and, instead of attempting to deal with this question in the Secretariat by correspondence, he would suggest to the Government of India the advisability of nominating a Committee representing the different Administrations and Governments to report on the whole question, and (if the system is to be retained) submit draft rules for the consideration of the Government of India.

D. G. Barkley, Esq.
Financial Commissioners.
Mr Fryer.
Sardar Bikrama Singh, C.S.I.
Pandit Ram Narain.
Colonel Nisbet.
Mr. Macnabb.
,, Perkins.
Colonel Gordon Young.

3. As regards details, the Lieutenant-Governor would observe that the definition of "Native of India" is narrower than the definition in the Statute, and is open to the objection taken to it by Mr. Barkley, that the draft rule as it stands would exclude any child of Indian parents born during a temporary absence of the parents from Her Majesty's dominions in India, even if absent in the service of the State, say, at Gwalior or Quetta, or serving in Berar. His Honor thinks also that rule 2 is objectionable, inasmuch as it bases the calculation of nominations on the total number of Civil Servants appointed by the Secretary of State for the whole of India in each year, and puts no limitation upon the distribution of the nominees to the various Local Governments and Administrations. Under this rule, not only would it be possible for one Local Government to get more than its proper number of nominees, but it would be possible for one Province to have nominees of another Province sent to it either in addition to or in lieu of Civilians appointed in England. It is needless to enlarge on this serious objection. The measures to prevent it are two, viz., to rule—

1*st*—that nominees shall be eligible for service only in the Province which nominates them, unless other Provinces are willing to accept them; and

2*nd*—that the provincial nominations in each year shall not exceed the proportion fixed for recruitment in India in that Province by the letter of the Government of India in the Financial Department, No. 22290, dated the 29th December 1881.

This would also meet the enquiry made by the Government of India in paragraph 9 of their letter under reply as to the mode of securing regular promotion to the Covenanted Civil Service. So long as the proportion of admissions under the Statutory system does not exceed the proportion calculated as correct for recruitment under that system, practical difficulties are not likely to arise so far as initial appointments go. But a very important point is raised by Colonel Nisbet, which ought certainly to be provided for, viz., the retirement of the Statutory men. The rule of compulsory retirement on the attainment of 55 years of age, or the completion of a fixed period of service, ought to be embodied in the rules and strictly enforced, otherwise it will result that the high appointments will be choked with Statutory men as they are now in the Punjab by Military Civilians.

4. Sir Charles Aitchison thinks that the general rules ought to prescribe English qualifications. This is too important a matter to be left to Local Governments, and he

begs to draw attention to the stress laid by Lord Macaulay and the Parliament of 1855 on the paramount importance of English education for Civil Servants in India. The education which they considered essential was not merely education in the English language, but "the best, the most liberal, the most finished education" which England could give—an education indeed which cannot be obtained in India at the present time. The lowering of the educational standard expected in candidates for these exceptional, first class appointments will be a grave injury to the administration of the country. For this reason the Lieutenant-Governor thinks that the Government of India ought to prescribe the standard in the rules; and, however much more Local Governments may choose to exact, it ought not to be in their power to accept less.

5. His Honor is inclined to think that rule 5 will prove inconvenient. The examinations referred to in rule 6 ought, he thinks, to be the ordinary provincial examinations to which officers in the service are subjected, and the approval of the Governor-General in Council is an unnecessary complication. Lastly, he agrees in the opinion of Colonel Gordon Young, that to give retrospective effect to the cancellation of the Government of India Resolution No. $\frac{36}{1322-27}$ of the 25th August 1880, will have a very bad effect and be considered a breach of faith. Whatever may be done for the future, it is not advisable to withdraw privileges from men already admitted to appointments under the Statute; all the conditions in force at the time of their appointment, or subsequently extended to them, should, in the Lieutenant-Governor's opinion, be continued to them individually, even at the cost of much inconvenience.

6. As regards the Punjab, the Lieutenant-Governor would ask the Government of India to excuse him from attempting to draft subsidiary rules until the general principles are settled and rules definitely framed by the Government of India. Till then he does not see that the drafting of subsidiary rules can be usefully attempted. So far as he can judge at present, the nominees from the Punjab will be so few that elaborate subsidiary regulations will not be required. The scale of recruitment as fixed by the Governor-General in Council for the Punjab is for the whole Commission 6·21 per annum, of whom 3·63 are to be recruits from England, 1·55 recruits from the Military and Uncovenanted Services, and 1·03 recruits in India, by which His Honor understands Statutory Civilians to be meant. The nominees from the Punjab will therefore be only one every year, and two in every thirty-third year. With so small a number it appears to be sufficient for the present (while retaining power to nominate untried men) to look in the first instance to Natives of proved merit in the Uncovenanted Service, giving a nomination in alternate years to a Hindu and a Muhammadan. But, as already said, the Lieutenant-Governor would prefer to reserve the making of any specific rules or proposals till the Government of India has finally settled the question of principle.

7. For his own part Sir Charles Aitchison is sincerely sorry that it has been determined to adhere to the Statutory principle at all. It was an ill-considered provision adopted at the eleventh hour of discussion of a Bill introduced for a totally different object and suddenly tacked on at the fag end of it, and it has been the fruitful source of unnumbered evils. It has its foundation in indefensible distinction of race; it confessedly accepts inferior qualifications, and as a consequence, invidious differences in pay: it causes discontent in the Civil Service proper; and it is practically a reflection on the intelligence and ability of the Natives. Whatever rules may be framed, the system will never, in the Lieutenant-Governor's opinion, work well, or result in anything but anomalies and difficulties. And he begs to repeat the opinion given at length in his Minute of the 7th July 1884, that the true solution of the question is to raise the age for admission to the examination in England, so as to let the Natives compete on fair and equal terms, to close the side-door of admission by nomination in India, to considerably reduce the cadre of the Civil Service, reserving it strictly for those who enter by the examination, and in lieu of the reduced numbers to create a parallel service to be officered exclusively in India. The Lieutenant-Governor strongly advises the appointment of a representative Committee to report and advise the Government of India in the matter, because he hopes that, instead of merely amending the rules in a manner that cannot lead to a final solution of the problem, this opportunity may be taken to review the whole principle.

Dated Lahore, 16th July 1885.

From—D. G. Barkley, Esq., Judge, Chief Court, Punjab,
To—The Officiating Secretary to Government, Punjab.

With reference to your confidential No. 649S, dated 13th instant, I have the honour to say that the draft rules for regulating the appointment of Natives of India to offices ordinarily reserved for members of the Covenanted Civil Service appear suitable.

The only amendment I have to suggest is, that in the 1st rule the wording of the Act should be more closely followed by substituting "include" for "mean." The rule as it stands in the draft would exclude any child of Indian parents born during a

temporary absence of the parents from Her Majesty's dominions in India, *e.g.*, a child born in London, Goa, Pondicherry, Ceylon or the Mauritius.

I understand that my opinion is asked only as to the rules, and I do not think that I could make any useful suggestion as to the local rules to be framed in addition to the instructions of the Government of India on the subject.

No. 66C, dated Simla, 17th July 1885.

From—R. E. YOUNGHUSBAND, Esq., Offg. Junior Secretary to Financial Commissioner, Punjab,

To—The Officiating Secretary to Government, Punjab.

IN reply to your letter No. 649S, dated the 13th instant, I am directed to submit a copy of a memorandum recorded by Colonel W. G. Davies, C.S.I., the First Financial Commissioner.

MEMORANDUM.

ON receipt of Secretary to Government, Punjab's confidential letter No. 649S of the 13th instant, forwarding for my opinion a confidential letter No. 25—1078 of 18th June (with enclosure), from the Government of India, regarding the revision of the rules for regulating the appointment of Natives of India to offices reserved ordinarily for members of the Covenanted Civil Service, I sent the papers confidentially for the opinion of the Senior and Junior Secretaries, and received from them notes of which the following are copies :—

Notes on Revised Rules for Statutory Civilians.

THESE revised rules do not appear to me to differ essentially from those already in force; for the distinction between appointment to a post and appointment to a service will in nearly all cases be found to be unimportant and illusory in practice, and the publication of a code of local regulations for selection of nominees is mainly a matter of detail. But I confess I look with apprehension and dislike upon the 5th and 7th rules in the present draft, and upon the commentary which is supplied in the 7th and 8th paragraphs of the Government of India letter. If these rules are adopted as they stand, I do not say that evil results are inevitable; but I do think that we create large facilities for a long series of most undesirable jealousies, doubts, and heart-burnings, such as we have already had a brief experience of in connection with the case of Ram Nath. What I object to is the power given to appoint and promote Native Statutory Civilians regardless of all seniority and gradation. As the rules stand there is nothing to prevent a Statutory Civilian being appointed direct to the post of Deputy Commissioner, or District or Divisional Judge. Indeed, in regard to Natives who are already in the Uncovenanted Service, such direct appointments are directly inculcated by the Government of India. Every time that such a direct appointment is made we shall have all the old jealousies, outcries about race distinctions, endless complaints, petitions, and invidious comparisons of merit. Nothing, in short, can be conceived better fitted to make the rules work badly and to do more harm than good. I say nothing about the uncertainty which will attach to every one's prospects, although it is clear that no one will know how often he may be superseded at every stage of his career. I quite admit the difficulty of the case. The natural plan is for every one to enter at the foot of the ladder, and this plan is perfectly sufficient so far as the younger generation is concerned. But I admit that it is desirable to attract to the Government service some of the men who have made their mark in independent professions, and to offer some prospects of further promotion to men who have proved really capable in the Uncovenanted Service. This can only be done by an offer of direct appointment to posts not in the lowest grade. But if this offer is to be made, I think it should be accompanied by some guarantees to the men already in the service, whether European or Native. The only possible form of guarantee is that of numerical limitations. Thus I would say that so many posts of Assistant Commissioners and so many District Judgeships shall be held by Statutory Civilians if so many are available and competent. That is to say, I would give Local Governments power to make appointments up to a certain maximum number, but not beyond. I do not think this is an ideal solution of the case, but it seems to me the only practical one to meet the just claims both of the Native aspirants and of the men already in the service. The latter will of course lose so many appointments; but, on the other hand, they will secure a reasonable certainty, and their impaired general prospects can be separately considered if need be.

The 14th July 1885. R. G. THOMSON.

I HAVE nothing to add to Mr. Thomson's note, except that I think it represents the feelings of most of the Junior Civilians. Recognizing the desirability of holding out hopes of rising to Uncovenanted men, and especially to Natives, and also the fact that Government must and will provide for their advancement, I think that the claims of officers already in the Commission, whether Civilians, Military men, or Natives, should also be recognized, and that a certain fixed number of appointments should be set apart for men in the Uncovenanted Service and professional men, to be held exclusively by such persons if competent to do so.

The 14*th July* 1885. R. E. YOUNGHUSBAND.

After reading these I added a marginal note to the following effect:—

"This, it seems to me, is practically done by laying down that the number of nominations of Natives of India for appointments ordinarily reserved for members of the Covenanted Civil Service, to be made each year, shall not exceed *one-fifth* of the total number of Civil Servants appointed by the Secretary of State in that year. There is the further restriction that untried men admitted for the first time to the service, and the younger men promoted from the Uncovenanted Service, would at starting be posted only to be Assistant Commissioners of the *lowest grade*. After a Native has once been appointed to one of the posts reserved for members of the Civil Service, he would ordinarily rise in the same way as other men in the Commission, and would not be promoted out of his turn unless he showed special aptitude for some particular post. In this respect he would be on the same footing, I imagine, as every other member of the Commission. It would be impossible to lay down beforehand that so many particular appointments shall be allotted to the Statutory Civilians, and so many to Covenanted Civilians and to Military Civilians."

I then sent the papers to the Junior Financial Commissioner for perusal and any remarks he might wish to add. In reply Colonel Wace furnished me a short memorandum, of which the following is a copy:—

Revised Rule for Statutory Civilians.

THE proposed rules appear to me to be a distinct improvement on the existing rules, for the reason that under them it will be in the power of Government to appoint Natives of India to offices hitherto reserved to the Covenanted Civil Service without thereby making the nominees members of that service.

To take this power and see that it is rightly used, will, I think, be better than to, continue the present rule under which Government is restricted from utilising in its service as occasion arises, men of established merit and distinction.

At the same time I hope the considerations urged by Mr. Thomson will be borne in mind, and it would much improve Government's position in respect of this question if some favourable response could be made to the petitions recently submitted by the less fortunate junior members of the Civil Service.

E. G. WACE, *Lieut.-Col.*,

The 16*th July* 1885. *2nd Financial Commissioner, Punjab.*

I will only add, in conclusion, that, for the reasons given by him, I concur with Colonel Wace in thinking that the proposed rules are an improvement on the existing rules.

W. G. DAVIES,

The 16*th July* 1885. *1st Financial Commissioner, Punjab.*

No. 1451, dated 23rd July 1885.

From—F. W. R. FRYER, ESQ., Deputy Commissioner, Hazara,
To—The Officiating Secretary to Government, Punjab.

IN reply to your confidential letter No. 6498, dated the 13th instant, regarding the revision of the rules for regulating the appointment of Natives of India to offices reserved ordinarily for members of the Covenanted Civil Service, I have the honour to say that the draft rules proposed appear to me to be unexceptionable.

2. In selecting the nominees for the Punjab, I would suggest that the pupils at the Umballa Wards' School should receive a nomination to be competed for annually. This would act as an encouragement to pupils to join the school, and the class from which the pupils at this school are drawn is one from which it would be very suitable to select Statutory Civilians.

3. A knowledge of English should not, I think, be insisted upon in the Punjab as yet. It might be demanded from untried men; but in the case of men already in the service, or men in the exercise of a profession, to make a knowledge of English an essential qualification for appointment to offices ordinarily reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service, would very much limit the Local Government in its choice of nominees.

Dated Jullundur City, 27th July 1885.

From—Sardar BIKRAMA SINGH, Ahluwalia,
To—The Offg. Secretary to Government, Punjab.

WITH reference to your letter No. 649S, dated the 13th instant, I have the honour to submit respectfully my opinion on the subject of the revision of the rules for regulating the appointment of Natives of India to offices reserved ordinarily for members of the Covenanted Civil Service.

It appears from the printed enclosures to your letter that it is the intention of Government practically to abolish the branch of service known as the Statutory Indian Civil Service, which was opened for the Natives of India. The service will no longer exist, but candidates will be selected from among the Natives of India for appointment to offices, places and employments reserved for members of the Covenanted Civil Service.

The proposed rules show that a limited number of men will be selected every year for such appointments, and consequently in the course of a few years there will be a considerable number of men eligible for such appointments and actually holding such appointments.

It does not appear what the position and prospects of such men will be. The appointments are not to be graded, nor will there be any definite rules for promotion, as are provided in other branches of service. It does not appear, therefore, what special advantage these men will have; a man being appointed once may never have a chance of promotion, specially his promotion will depend upon recommendation and not on any rule.

It appears to be desirable, therefore, that there should be grades of offices and rules of promotion for the service.

As regards the rules for the selection of candidates, I would submit that there should be some regard for family distinction in the selection, and a proportion of candidates should be members of families distinguished for loyalty and services to Government. There is an universal desire now even among the higher classes of Natives for the acquisition of superior educational qualifications, and there will soon be young men in the Punjab belonging to high families possessed of adequate educational qualifications. Special consideration should be shown to such young men in the selection of candidates.

Dated Lahore, 28th July 1885.

From—Pandit RAM NARAIN, Pleader, Chief Court, Punjab,
To—The Officiating Secretary to Government, Punjab.

IN reply to your office letter No. 649S, dated 13th July 1885, I beg to submit herewith my remarks on the proposed rules for regulating the appointment of Natives of India to offices reserved ordinarily for members of the Covenanted Civil Service.

REMARKS.

THE subsidiary regulations to be framed for this Province would relate to the mode of appointment of—

(*a*) untried men to be admitted for the first time to service;
(*b*) younger men to be promoted from the Uncovenanted Service; and
(*c*) men of more senior standing or superior qualifications eligible for higher offices.

2. A competitive examination for the whole of India with each province as a centre of examination will sooner or later have to be established for the selection of candidates for the lowest grade of Assistant Commissionership. The highest candidate or candidates from each province in such examination could then be nominated to the vacancy or vacancies in that province. In the absence of such an examination a competitive examination for each province can only be suggested as the door for admission of young untried men to the lowest appointment in the Civil Service.

3. Nomination by Government of untried young men without a competitive examination is open to very serious objections. Some of these objections are well described in His Honor's Resolution of 4th September 1882 (paragraph 2), and I do not propose to discuss the subject here any further.

4 The qualifications prescribed in rule 7 of the rules for the appointment of Extra Assistant Commissioners in the Punjab would for the present be sufficient for the selection of candidates for this competitive examination, with this modification only, that the candidate should at least have passed the B.A. examination.

5. I am, however, very doubtful whether a competitive examination in this Province will attract the best candidates, unless the examination is held every year, and the number of appointments available in any year is notified at least six months previously. A competitive examination held not every year and on such a short notice as could be given under rule 3 of the draft rules framed by the Government of India would be practically useless as a public examination.

6. Strictness in the selection of candidates to these appointments is both necessary and desirable in the interest of the State as well as of the public. Duly qualified Natives, if appointed, will not fail in soon proving themselves to be useful and valuable public servants. In the course of a few years the Government will have in its service a large number of competent Natives from amongst whom really efficient and well-deserving men could be selected for promotion to higher offices. The present cry of higher appointments not being thrown open to the Natives and the usual reply that none are yet competent, will thus gradually disappear.

Bearing this object in view, and being under the impression that the number of appointments in this province, under the rules in question, is not to exceed one or two in a year, I think it would be desirable at present to give the lowest grade of Assistant Commissionership only as a prize to the most efficient Extra Assistant Commissioner of three years' standing appointed from Register B. The Government will thereby be appointing gentlemen "of proved merit and ability" (as required by Statute 33 Vic., cap. 3, section 6), and the chances of the nominee not proving an efficient member of the service will be reduced to a minimum.

7. This system will further render competition for the post of Extra Assistant Commissioner more keen, as thereby extra inducement will be held out to really good men to compete for that examination.

8. A competent knowledge of English should, in my opinion, be held to be indispensable in the case of all candidates appointed to posts reserved for members of the Civil Service. An imperfect knowledge of English in the case of any nominee would mar his efficiency, and must prove a great obstacle in the way of his promotion.

9. With regard to appointments to higher offices of men of senior standing or superior qualifications, no hard-and-fast rule can be suggested. A good deal must depend on the opinion which the Local Government may have formed of the personal qualifications of the individual concerned, his education, character, reputation and fitness for the post to which he is to be nominated.

10. The rules proposed by the Government of India are altogether silent on the subjection [*sic*] of promotion. If the ordinary rule of promotion by seniority is not to apply to such appointments, the principle laid down in paragraph 8 of the letter should be published in the rules. This will avoid all misunderstandings in future. It is only fair both to the Government and its servants that the terms of service (which naturally include prospects of promotion) should be definitely laid down and thoroughly understood on both sides.

RAM NARAIN, *Pandit,*
Pleader, Chief Court, Punjab.

No. 1724G, dated 30th July 1885.

From—Major R. P. NISBET, Deputy Commissioner, Rawalpindi,
To—The Officiating Secretary to Government, Punjab.

IN reply to your confidential No. 649S, dated 13th July 1885, forwarding for opinion copy of a confidential letter No. 25—1078, dated 18th ultimo, with enclosure, from the Government of India, regarding the appointment of Natives of India to offices reserved ordinarily for members of the Covenanted Civil Service, I have the honour to reply as follows.

2. In No. 2 of the draft Rules attached to Government of India letter, it appears to me that the nomination of Natives of India to offices ordinarily reserved for members of the Civil Service, in the proportion of one-fifth, would be unreasonably high at first, or for some few years to come. The number of Covenanted Civil Servants in the Punjab Commission being now 89, I think one-eighth would, at present, be as fairly high a proportion of Natives of India as could expect to be nominated to such appointments.

3. Although nominations in future are not to be confined to young men or others of high family, I certainly trust that in the Punjab—a Province where there are still plenty of men of good position, and where much regard is had by the people to hereditary descent and family dignity—social position, when associated with a high standard of

educational qualifications, will always be allowed great weight. In fact, if nomination could be accepted by a percentage of marks for different qualifications, after allowing 50 per cent. for educational, I would allow as much as 30 per cent. for social, as although the latter without the former is, of course, valueless, yet where both are secured, the nominee of family and position will, in the Punjab, be a more valuable officer than one who has nothing but good conduct, literary talents and ability to pass a high standard of examination to recommend him.

4. Natives of India nominated under the rules by one Local Government should be eligible for employment only under such Government, and not borne on a general list by the Government of India for service in any Province in India. Every province should, as a rule, get only its own nominees.

5. In draft rule 4 I would add: "A Native of India shall not be nominated, &c., &c., *before the age of* 21 *years*, or after he has attained the age of 25 years, unless, &c., &c."

6. In draft rule 7, I think it should be clearly laid down that a Native of India admitted to any office will come in only as junior of the grade or rank to which he may be appointed, though taking promotion afterwards with others of his same rank or grade in the regular course, that is, a Native of India appointed an Assistant Commissioner, District Judge, Divisional Judge, &c., in the Punjab, should, in the first instance, be brought in only at the bottom of the lowest grade of such rank.

7. The rules should, I think, provide that Natives of India appointed under these rules will be ordinarily required to retire on completion of 25 years' service, and in any case, at 55 years of age, when a Native, much more than an European, is an old man.

No. 419, dated Delhi, 5th August 1885.

From—J. W. MACNABB, Esq., Commissioner and Superintendent, Delhi Division,
To—The Officiating Secretary to Government, Punjab.

IN reply to your letter No 649S, dated 13th ultimo, I have the honour to submit that the printed draft of Statutory rules seems to me hardly to set forth in a sufficiently clear and unmistakeable manner the principle laid down in Secretary of State's despatch of 8th March 1883, supposing the rules are intended for publication by themselves.

2. I would suggest the following alterations:—

Preamble—after "Her Majesty in India" I would insert: "Not to the general ranks of the Covenanted Civil Service, but to specific" offices, places; and
Rule 5—omit "nature of the."
Rule 7—before the word "office" insert "specific" in both places.

3. As to the special regulations for the Punjab—

The main question will doubtless be whether or not the admission of "untried candidates" shall be exclusively on the competitive system.

4. There are 34 Officiating Extra Assistant Commissioners in the last Civil List. Of these only seven are Muhammadans. Of these seven only one has, I believe, got in by competitive examination.

5. A competitive examination, whether open or modified by selection for candidateship, would practically exclude Muhammadans.

You might have privately two lists, one for Hindus and another for Muhammadans; but you could not have two separate competitive examinations, and the two lists would not prevent the Muhammadans being practically beaten out of the field.

6. Then, again, as to the class of men who at present succeed at competitive examinations. Although the order confining selections to young men of high family has been altogether withdrawn, still I think it will be admitted that such appointments should not be thrown altogether into the hands of one set.

7. If the list of successful candidates for the Extra Assistant Commissioners' examination, since competition has been started, is examined, I believe it will be found to consist almost entirely of Káiths, Sudhs, Baniás and Khatrís, *i.e.*, professional hereditary penmen and money-lenders, and that Brahmans, Rájpúts, Jats, Sikhs, &c., are entirely excluded.

8. In the Resolution instituting competitive examinations for Extra Assistant Commissioners, reference is made to "importunity and influence." As far as Commissioners' concern with the matter goes, there is more of this than ever, the numbers being greater.

9. As to the withdrawal of the order confining selection to young men of high family, I hope that this is not to be understood as withdrawing the same preference as that now given in selecting Extra Assistant Commissioner candidates, namely, to persons of good birth and character and local influence, and specially to persons belonging to families of tried loyalty and attachment to the British Government.

10. Such a course would indeed be giving up the personal Government by which the Indian Empire has been created, and be a step in the direction of turning Government into a mere piece of machinery.

Vol. I. Sec. I. Sub-Sec. B. Paper III.

Punjab Government.

11. What I would propose, then, as regards "untried candidates" is that they should be appointed by selection, subject to passing a special examination of a high standard.

Demi-official dated Murree, 17th August 1885.

From—H. E. PERKINS, ESQ., Commissioner and Superintendent, Rawalpindi Division,

To—The Officiating Secretary to Government, Punjab.

IN reply to Mr. Leigh's note, forwarding draft Rules for the admission of Statutory Civilians to the service, I only need say that I have no specific amendments to suggest, save this, that seeing how large is the excess of Hindus over Muhammadans in the public service, in every branch save the Educational Department (where Mussalmans fully hold their own), I should like it to be carefully considered whether some proviso could not be added that the proportion of Hindus to Mussalmans nominated should bear a certain relation to the numbers of the two classes composing the population in the province whose Government makes the nomination.

Dated Dharmsala, 31st August 1885.

From—Colonel G. GORDON YOUNG, Commissioner and Superintendent, Jullundur Division,

To—The Officiating Secretary to Government, Punjab.

I HAVE the honour to reply to your confidential letter No. 649S, dated 13th ultimo, with which copies of certain papers relating to the appointment of Natives of India to the Statutory Civil Service were enclosed for opinion.

2. The rules now proposed must be considered from two points of view, viz., (1) as affecting the class for whose benefit they are framed, and (2) as affecting the prospects of the Covenanted Civil Service.

3. The immediate effect of cancelling the Resolution, No. 36—1322, dated 25th August 1880, and explaining that the appointments hitherto made, and to be made in the future, will not place the nominee in the ranks of the Covenanted Civil Service, will undoubtedly cause disappointment to men who believe themselves already duly appointed to the ranks of such service, and will inevitably be regarded as a breach of faith, and will cause dissatisfaction as discouraging hopes which they may have justly held, and which it is now found inadvisable to gratify.

4. Against this backward step, however, is to be placed the improved prospect now held out of allowing the Local Governments to confer at once on persons they may esteem fit, whether already in Government employ or not, posts of value, far beyond any hitherto granted, except to English officers after a considerable period of approved service. I cannot doubt that this will be esteemed a great boon by Natives of India; and it is probable that, under the provisions of this rule, the Government may be able to avail itself of conspicuous talent in exceptional cases to the distinct benefit of the Government service at large.

5. But in considering the suitability of this rule to the case of the Punjab, it appears to me probable that either the Government in practice will not make appointments to any comparatively high offices (as *e.g.*, District Judgeships) or, if pressed to do so, will perforce appoint very second or third-rate men.

6. The only learned profession from which the public service is likely to be recruited, as far as I can see, is that of the law; but any man of ability so conspicuous as to be a worthy nominee to, say, a District Judgeship, if he has been "a reasonable time in practice" will probably be earning more than the emoluments such an appointment would afford; and hence not the best men, but men who are comparatively failures in their own profession, will form the field for selection.

7. And now as to the second consideration. The time has gone by for attempting to argue that if there are Natives of India to be had as well qualified as European Covenanted Civilians, they are not entitled to expect that the field should be opened to them, and there can be no valid objections to the appointment of such persons; but it cannot for a moment be said that a Native of India of no administrative experience, of little natural ability, and perhaps of doubtful moral character, trained—not in the school of Government service, but—in the highly unpleasing surroundings of the Native Bar—can have any claim to such a prize, nor that there can be any justification for giving it him.

8. But the inevitable must be accepted, and I conceive it is contemplated that direct appointments shall be made to even higher grades, that is to say, to Divisional

Judgeships, to the Bench of the Chief Court, and such posts as that of Accountant-General; and, if so, I think that, in the interests of the European branch of the Civil Service, some *limit* should be fixed as to the number of such appointments to the higher grades that may be made. That is to say, it might be laid down from the first that not more than one-third or one-fifth of the direct appointments to be made should be made to any but the lowest grade of Assistant Commissioner, as this would tend to remove any uncertainty the Covenanted Civil Servants may feel as to how the Government is likely to exercise the patronage which will come to it, and will enable them to calculate their own prospects accordingly.

9. But paragraph 9 of the Government letter enquires what steps should be taken to secure a fair proportion of the higher offices to Natives of India, "*with due regard to maintenance of regular promotion in the Covenanted Civil Service,*" and this is a very important and pertinent question; for anything more unfortunate than the spirit of discontent with their prospects which lately pervaded the junior members of the service in this Province it is difficult to conceive.

10. The only system that I can think of under which promotion or, in the absence of promotion, compensation can be secured is—

(1) By granting personal allowances to men who do not attain to the emoluments after so many years' service which may be found to be such as, on the average, they should reach—as, say,

Rs.		
1,000	after 10 years	Or whatever other sums may be fixed on as fair.
1,200	„ 12 „	
1,500	„ 15 „	
2,000	„ 20 „	

(2) By again offering to military officers in civil employ the terms offered a few years back of one year's pay as a bonus in sterling at *par*, in addition to retiring pension; and

(3) By tendering graduated pensions to Covenanted Civilians proportionate to service.

11. To sum up. I may say that I think the new departure will please no one, and will accentuate the differences between Europeans and Natives. It would be better to let the Statutory Civilians *already appointed* remain in the list, and new appointments be made only to the lowest grade, as a rule, allowing perhaps one in every five appointments to be made to one of the superior appointments; or perhaps a rule should be prescribed that only one appointment in each grade above that of Assistant Commissioner, 3rd class, *i.e.*, one Divisional Judge (not one in each grade of Divisional Judge), one District Judge, one Assistant Commissioner, 1st class, one Assistant Commissioner, 2nd class, should be held at one time by a Native of India, so as to remove *uncertainty* on the point as much as possible (and which is what, I believe, at present causes uneasiness in the junior ranks); while, if a certain number of valuable appointments are thus set aside for Natives, a scheme to compensate Covenanted Civilians for the loss of prospects should be devised.

The Rules attached to the Government letter appear suitable.

No. 144, dated Lahore, 19th January 1886.

From—C. L. Tupper, Esq., Offg. Secretary to Government, Punjab,
To—The Secretary to the Government of India, Home Department.

In compliance with the request contained in paragraph 7 of your letter No. 2039, dated the 8th December 1885, I am directed by the Lieutenant-Governor to submit a proposed draft of local subsidiary regulations for the appointment of Natives of India to offices, places, and employments ordinarily reserved for members of the Covenanted Civil Service.

Proposed Draft Rules for regulating the appointment of Natives of India to offices, places, and employments reserved for members of the Covenanted Civil Service in the Punjab.

I.—The number of appointments ordinarily available in the Punjab for Natives of India under Statute 33 Victoria, chapter 3, section 6, is one per annum.

II.—In making these appointments preference will generally be given, in the first instance, to persons who have proved their merit and ability in Government employment,

and next to persons who have proved their merit and ability in the practice of a learned profession.

III.—When it is proposed to make the appointment from the above classes, the Lieutenant-Governor will submit to the Governor-General in Council three names, with all necessary information, for consideration and selection.

IV.—When in any year it is proposed to make the appointment from other classes than the above, the following rules shall be observed, subject to the provisions of the general rules published in Government of India Notification No. , dated :—

1. A notification of the intention will be published in the *Punjab Gazette* in at least three issues between the 1st of January and 31st of March.
2. Six candidates for the appointment will be nominated by the Lieutenant-Governor.
3. The qualifications indispensable as a preliminary to nomination are the following:—
   (*a*) The applicant, if not a B.A., must pass an examination of equal difficulty to the B.A. Examination of the Punjab University, under arrangements to be made by Director of Public Instruction.
   (*b*) He must furnish the certificate of physical fitness prescribed by section 106, clause 2 of the Civil Pension Code (6th Edition).
   (*c*) He must give satisfactory evidence of (*i*) good moral character; (*ii*) habits of personal activity; and (*iii*) gentlemanly bearing.
4. Among applicants possessed of the above essential qualifications, preference will invariably be given in the following order to—
   (*a*) Members of families of tried loyalty and distinguished service.
   (*b*) Persons of good social status and influence in the country.
   (*c*) Persons of superior educational attainments, such as persons who have taken the degree of M.A.
5. Applications for nomination should be made to the Financial Commissioner, and the Financial Commissioner's recommendations must reach the Lieutenant-Governor not later than 30th June. If any candidates considered by the Financial Commissioner to be in other respects suitable have not satisfied the requirements of Rule IV (3) (*a*), the Director of Public Instruction will, on the requisition of the Financial Commissioner, arrange for the examination of those candidates in time to admit of the submission of recommendations by the prescribed date.

   The Lieutenant-Governor reserves power to make nominations otherwise than on the recommendation of the Financial Commissioner.
6. The six nominees will be subjected to a competitive examination to be held at Lahore about the middle of October, commencing on a date to be previously notified in the Gazette.
7. The subjects prescribed for examination and the conditions of examination will be notified at the same time and in the same issues of the Gazette as the notification under Rule IV, clause (1).
8. A fee of Rs. 50 shall be paid by every candidate before admission to the examination. The fee may be paid into any Government Treasury.
9. The names of the two candidates who stand highest in the examination will be submitted with all necessary information to the Government of India for consideration and selection.

Financial Commissioner's Book Circular No. 2-69, dated Lahore, 4th January 1873.

To—All Commissioners and Deputy Commissioners, Punjab.

Rules for the appointment, transfer, and removal of Tahsíldárs and Náib-Tahsíldárs.

THE Financial Commissioner is pleased to issue the annexed rules for the appointment, transfer, and removal of Tahsíldárs and Naib-Tahsíldárs, which have received the approval of His Honor the Lieutenant-Governor, and which supersede all previous instructions upon the subject.

2. The rules have been framed with advertence to the terms of section 4 of the Punjab Land Revenue Act, 1871, which vest the authority to appoint or remove Tahsíldárs in the Deputy Commissioner, with the previous sanction of the Financial Commissioner. On the same principle the appointment of Náib-Tahsíldárs has now been declared to rest with the Deputy Commissioner, the sanction of the Commissioner, however, being required.

3. The following circulars and orders, containing the previous rules on the subject, are declared to be no longer in force:—

Punjab Government Notification No. 2341, dated 11th September 1860, so far as not superseded by Act XIX of 1865.

Punjab Board of Administration's Circular No. 23 of 1850,—Fining of Tahsíldárs.

FINANCIAL COMMISSIONER'S CIRCULARS.

No. 25 of 1854,—Criminal prosecutions of Tahsíldárs, so far as not already superseded.
Book No. III of 1858,—Nomination Rolls of Tahsíldárs.
Do. „ LXI of 1859,—Creation of Office of Náib-Tahsíldár.
Do. „ LXXVIII of 1859,—Nomination Rolls of Tahsíldárs.
Do. „ XXVII of 1860,—So far as it relates to candidates for Tahsíldárships.
Do. „ XLIV of 1860,—Gazetting of Tahsíldárs.
Do. „ XLVIII of 1861 }
Do. „ XLIV of 1863 } ,—Nomination for entry in the list of accepted candidates.
Do. „ XXVIII of 1864 }
No. 21 of 1868,—Appointment of Náib-Tahsíldárs.
Book No. XIII of 1871,—Suspension and dismissal.
Do. „ VII of 1872,—Promotion of Náib-Tahsíldárs to the post of Tahsíldár.

(*Translated.*)

APPOINTMENT, TRANSFER, AND REMOVAL OF TAHSÍLDÁRS AND NÁIB-TAHSÍLDÁRS.

Rules made by the Financial Commissioner as Chief Controlling Revenue Authority, and approved by the Lieutenant-Governor of the Punjab and its Dependencies.

Registers of approved candidates.

REGISTERS of approved candidates for the offices of Tahsíldár and of Náib-Tahsíldár respectively are kept up in the Financial Commissioner's office.

Recommendation of candidate for entry in the register.

2. When a Deputy Commissioner is satisfied that a subordinate official, or a Native gentleman of his district desirous of employment, is specially qualified for the office of Tahsíldár or of Náib-Tahsíldár, he may submit, through the Commissioner of the Division, to the Financial Commissioner, a nomination roll, in the annexed form (A), with the certificates of the candidate. In the nomination roll, or in the covering letter, the qualifications of the candidate for the office should be fully stated, especially as respects education and ability, character, and social standing.

Such nomination roll may be submitted by the Commissioner without any recommendation by the Deputy Commissioner, when he has had special opportunities of forming an opinion of the qualifications of the candidate, as when he has been serving in the Commissioner's own office.

Powers of Commissioner.

3. The Commissioner may decline to forward the nomination roll if he considers the candidate ineligible; otherwise he shall forward it to the Financial Commissioner after adding his remarks.

Procedure after receipt of nomination roll by Financial Commissioner.

4. The Financial Commissioner will consult the Chief Court as to the qualifications of the nominee for judicial office, and, if he approve of his admission as a candidate for the post for which he is recommended, will cause his name to be entered in the proper register, and the Commissioner and Deputy Commissioner will be informed that this has been done. The name of the candidate will then be entered in a similar register in the offices of the Commissioner and Deputy Commissioner, with a reference to the number and date of the Financial Commissioner's letter.

If the Financial Commissioner approve of the nomination of a candidate who is considered by the Chief Court not to be qualified to exercise judicial functions, he will refer the case to Government for decision before ordering the entry of the candidate's name in the register.

Approved candidates eligible for employment in any district.

5. When a candidate has been approved by the Financial Commissioner, he shall be eligible for the post for which his name has been registered in any district in the Province, so long as his name remains upon the register.

Half-yearly return of candidates.

6. A half-yearly return (B) shall be submitted by Deputy Commissioners on or about the 1st April and 1st October of each year, showing the names of persons who have been recommended during the preceding six months for the offices of Tahsíldár and of Náib-Tahsíldár, and the names of persons who have ceased to be available during that period.

Appointment of Náib-Tahsíldárs.

7. On the occurrence of a vacancy, temporary or permanent, in the office of Náib-Tahsíldár, the Deputy Commissioner of the district may, with the sanction of the Commissioner of the Division,

appoint any person whose name appears in the register of approved candidates for that office, or for the office of Tahsíldár, kept up in the Financial Commissioner's office. If the candidate has not already passed the Tahsíldárs' examination, such appointment shall be provisional until he passes the examination, or is specially exempted from examination by the Local Government. Unless so exempted, he shall be required to present himself at the first annual examination of Tahsíldárs occurring not less than six months after the date of his appointment; and if he fail to pass at the second such examination, the Financial Commissioner may direct his removal from office.

Appointment of Tahsíldárs.

8. On the occurrence of a vacancy, temporary or permanent, in the office of Tahsíldár, the Deputy Commissioner of the district shall submit, through the Commissioner of the Division, for the sanction of the Financial Commissioner, a nomination roll, in the annexed form (C), containing the name and stating the qualifications of the person whom he proposes to appoint. The Commissioner shall forward this nomination roll to the Financial Commissioner, after adding his remarks.

Qualifications requisite.

9. The person whom it is proposed to appoint must be either a Náib-Tahsíldár who has held that office for two years, and has passed the Tahsíldárs' examination, or a candidate whose name is in the register of approved candidates for the office of Tahsíldár, maintained in the Financial Commissioner's office.

The nominee must have passed the Tahsíldárs' examination.

10. No candidate shall be eligible for appointment as Tahsíldár until he has passed the Tahsíldárs' examination, unless specially exempted from examination by the Local Government.

When nominee may be placed in charge of the Tahsíl, pending sanction.

11. If an unforeseen vacancy occurs, the nominee of the Deputy Commissioner, if approved by the Commissioner, may be placed in charge of the Tahsíl pending the sanction of the Financial Commissioner. Whenever possible, however, the nomination should be made in sufficient time to allow of the receipt of the orders of the Financial Commissioner before the office becomes vacant.

Appointment in what grade to take effect.

12. The appointment of a Tahsíldár or Náib-Tahsíldár to fill a permanent vacancy shall be considered as an appointment to the lowest grade in the district, unless his appointment to any higher grade which may be vacant be sanctioned by the Financial Commissioner.

Transfer within district.

13. Tahsíldárs or Náib-Tahsíldárs may be transferred from one Tahsíl to another within the same district by the Deputy Commissioner with the consent of the Commissioner of the Division.

Transfer to another district.

14. The transfer of a Tahsíldár or Náib-Tahsíldár to another Tahsíl in a different district of the same division may be directed by the Commissioner if the Deputy Commissioners of both districts agree to the transfer.

Transfer to another division.

15. When a transfer to another division is proposed, the orders of the Local Government must be obtained through the Financial Commissioner. Government also reserves the power of directing any transfer which may be required by the exigencies of the public service.

Enquiry into charges. Suspension.

16. Before a Tahsíldár or Naib-Tahsíldár is called upon to answer a charge of any offence or misconduct, otherwise than under the orders of a Criminal Court having jurisdiction to entertain the charge, the Deputy Commissioner must obtain the sanction of the Commissioner to institute the enquiry. The Deputy Commissioner may, if necessary, with the previous sanction of the Financial Commissioner, suspend the Tahsíldár or Náib-Tahsíldár, if invested with judicial powers, from office pending the enquiry. A Náib-Tahsíldár, without judicial powers, may be suspended with the sanction of the Commissioner, but such suspension shall be immediately reported to the Financial Commissioner and shall be subject to his orders. Provided that in a case of political emergency, the Commissioner, or in his absence, the Deputy Commissioner, may suspend, without previous sanction, any Tahsíldár or Náib-Tahsíldár whose conduct he deems unsatisfactory, such suspension being immediately reported to the Financial Commissioner and being subject to his orders.

Removal from office.

17. If the Deputy Commissioner consider that a Tahsíldár or a Naib-Tahsíldár, exercising judicial powers, should be removed from office for proved incompetence or misconduct, he shall report the grounds on which he recommends his removal to the Commissioner of the Division, who shall submit them, with his remarks, to the Financial Commissioner for orders. A Náib-Tahsíldár, not exercising judicial powers, may be removed by the Deputy Commissioner with the sanction of the Commissioner. Such removal shall be at once reported to the Financial Commissioner and shall be subject to his orders.

A.

Nomination Roll of a candidate recommended to fill the post of

Name, with caste and age.	Parentage and place of family residence.	Previous offices held under British Government.			Remarks of Deputy Commissioner.	Remarks of Commissioner.
		Post and pay.	Date of appointment.	Date of transfer, resignation or removal.		

Deputy Commissioner's Office;
DISTRICT,
The 18 .

Deputy Commissioner.

The certificates of the candidate should accompany this nomination roll. If he has been employed in any Government office, a certificate of character from the office where he last served should in all cases be given. If he has already passed the Tahsíldárs' examination, this should be certified, with the date of the examination.

B.

Return of candidates recommended, or who have ceased to be available for the post of——during the half-year ending——

DISTRICT.	Date and No. of Commissioner's report to Financial Commissioner.	Name and caste of candidate.	Name of candidate who has ceased to be available.	Cause, whether death, promotion, or otherwise.	REMARKS.

Deputy Commissioner's Office;
DISTRICT,
The 18 .

Deputy Commissioner.

C.

Nomination Roll of a Tahsíldár to be appointed in the district of

1	2	3	4	5	6
Name, with caste and age.	Parentage and place of family residence.	Name of Tahsíl to which appointed, and in whose place.	Brief account of past services.	Remarks of Deputy Commissioner.	Remarks of Commissioner.

Deputy Commissioner's Office;
DISTRICT,
The 18 .

Deputy Commissioner.

If the nominee is an accepted candidate, it will be sufficient, in filling up column 4, to give a reference to his nomination roll as a candidate recommended for the post of Tahsíldár, with a statement of offices held subsequent to the date of submitting that roll.

In filling up column 5, the Deputy Commissioner should state whether the nominee has filled the office of Náib-Tahsíldár for two years, or is an accepted candidate, and whether he has passed the Tahsíldárs' examination, giving the year.

The covering letter should state the qualifications of the nominee, unless these are sufficiently stated in column 5 or in a previous nomination roll, and should specify the judicial powers with which it is desired that he should be invested; and if he is a Náib-Tahsíldár exercising judicial powers, what powers he exercises as such.

Book Circular No. XIV—2559½, dated Lahore, 23rd October 1884.

From—T. GORDON WALKER, ESQ., Registrar, Chief Court, Punjab,

To—All Divisional Courts, Deputy Commissioners, and District Judges in the Punjab, and other persons concerned.

Rules for the appointment of Munsifs.

THE following rules for the appointment of Munsifs, having been sanctioned by the Hon'ble the Lieutenant-Governor, are issued for general information and guidance in supersession of all former rules on the subject.

(*Translated.*)

GENERAL RULES.

I.—Two registers of candidates for the office of Munsif will be kept in the Chief Court Office, viz.:—

A.—A register of candidates who are eligible for appointment without passing the competitive examination hereinafter provided for.

B.—A register of candidates who are only eligible for appointment after passing the competitive examination above mentioned.

II.—Admission to Register A and appointment therefrom will be regulated by the rules contained in Schedule A attached hereto. Rules for the admission of candidates to Register B and for the examination and appointment of such candidates are contained in Schedule B.

III.—On the occurrence of a vacancy, permanent or temporary, in the office of Munsif, the Deputy Commissioner or the District Judge of the district in which the vacancy occurs shall send immediate intimation of the fact, through the Divisional Court,

to the Chief Court. Permanent vacancies will be filled up alternately from Register A, and the candidates selected by competition from Register B. Temporary vacancies will ordinarily be filled up from Register A; and, in appointing to such vacancies, the recommendation of the local authorities will be duly considered.

SCHEDULE A.

Rules for the admission of Candidates to Register A and for the appointment of such Candidates to be Munsifs.

1. The number of candidates admissible to Register A in each Judicial Division will be intimated hereafter.

2. The only persons who will ordinarily be admitted to Register A are—

(*a*) Officials who appear to be fitted for the office.
(*b*) Members of families who have rendered good service to the Government.
(*c*) Persons of good social position and influence in the country.

3. When a Deputy Commissioner or District Judge is satisfied that an official or other person described in the preceding rule is in all respects qualified for admission to Register A, he shall cause his name to be entered in a register to be maintained for that purpose in each District Office. An official in any department under Government may be recommended by the head of his office to the Deputy Commissioner or District Judge for entry in the district register, but it will rest with the Deputy Commissioner or District Judge to accept or reject the recommendation.

4. Deputy Commissioners or District Judges should submit to their respective Divisional Courts, between the 1st and 15th of September in each year, nomination rolls of the candidates whom they desire to recommend to fill any permanent vacancies which may have occurred during the preceding year in the list of the Division to which their districts are attached, or to complete the Divisional list, where the sanctioned number has not been reached. The rolls must be prepared in the prescribed form (Civil Form No. CXXVI), and should be accompanied by certified copies of the candidates' certificates. In the appropriate column of the roll the qualifications of the candidates should be fully stated, especially as regards education, ability, character, and social standing. The Deputy Commissioner or District Judge should also specify the order in which he desires to recommend the candidates.

5. With these rolls should be submitted a list, in the annexed form, of the candidates who have from any cause ceased to be available for appointment during the previous year, or who are liable to be removed from the register of accepted candidates under rule 8 of this schedule. In the case of these last, the Deputy Commissioner's or District Judge's recommendations should be recorded in column 3.

6. On receipt of the Deputy Commissioner's or District Judge's nominations, the Judges of the Divisional Courts shall, not later than the 1st October, forward, with their own remarks duly recorded, the rolls of such of the candidates as they desire to recommend for acceptance, with the rolls of any additional candidates, not exceeding two in number, of whose qualifications they have had opportunities of personally judging: Provided that the total number of candidates recommended shall not exceed twice the number of Divisional vacancies, and that in making their selections from Deputy Commissioner's or District Judge's nominations, and specifying the order in which they desire to recommend the selected candidates, Divisional Courts shall be generally guided by the scale to be hereafter prescribed for the purpose.

In the same cover should be forwarded the list referred to in rule 5, the Divisional Courts' recommendations being recorded, when necessary, in column 4.

7. The nomination rolls received from Divisional Courts will be laid before the Judges of the Chief Court. When orders have been passed thereon, the name of each accepted candidate will be entered in Register A, and intimation will be given to the Divisional Court concerned, which will cause the name of such candidate to be registered in its office, with reference to the number and date of the Chief Court's letter of acceptance. The rolls and certificates of the rejected candidates will be either retained in the Chief Court Office or returned, according as it is intended that the rejection be final or that the candidate may be again recommended in a subsequent year.

8. Every candidate on Register A will be eligible for an appointment in any district in the Province as long as his name remains on the register. A candidate's name will ordinarily be retained on Register A for five years only, and will then be removed, unless for special reasons the Court thinks fit to retain his name on the register for such further period as shall be specified in its order for such retention.

9. Every candidate admitted to Register A will, unless he has already qualified in this respect, be expected to present himself at the first departmental examination held

after his acceptance; and, if he fails to pass at that examination or the one next following, will be liable to have his name removed from the list of accepted candidates. As the result of each examination is published, Divisional Courts will be requested to report regarding the candidates whose names should be struck off under this rule, and on the receipt of these reports final orders will be passed in the matter.

10. No candidate on Register A will be given a permanent appointment, and ordinarily no such candidate will be appointed to officiate as Munsif, unless he has passed, or has been specially exempted from passing, the departmental examination prescribed for Tahsíldárs and Munsifs, or the Final Examination in Law of the Punjab University, which will be deemed equivalent thereto.

Every candidate appointed to a permanent vacancy will, in the first instance, hold his appointment on probation for a year, at the end of which period he will be reported on by the Divisional Courts and Deputy Commissioners or District Judges under whom he has served: Provided that if the fitness of the candidate has been satisfactorily established during officiating appointments, the Judges may, at their discretion, dispense with a further period of probation.

11. A revised list of candidates on Register A will be prepared annually in the Chief Court Office and circulated to Divisional Courts, Deputy Commissioners, and District Judges.

Statement showing the names of Candidates of the District who have ceased to be available for Munsifships during the year ending 31st August 188 , or who have been five years on Register A.

1	2	3	4
Name of candidate.	Reason for removing his name from Register A of accepted candidates for the office of Munsif.	Recommendation of the Deputy Commissioner or District Judge.	Recommendation of the Divisional Court.

SCHEDULE B.

Rules for the admission of candidates to Register B and for the examination and appointment of such candidates.

1. In each Civil Divisional Office shall be kept a register of candidates whom the Divisional Court desires to recommend for admission to Register B.

2. The persons eligible for nomination are Natives of India, as defined in 33 Vic., chap. 3, section 6, who possess the following qualifications:—

(*a*) The applicant must be a Native of, or domiciled in, the Punjab or the territories adjacent thereto, and must be not under 20 nor over 24 years of age last birthday.

(*b*) He must have graduated as B.L., B.A. or B.O.L. at one of the recognised Universities in British India, or have passed the Final Examination in Law or the High Proficiency in Arts Examination of the Punjab University, or give satisfactory evidence that his educational attainments are not inferior to those required for one of the above tests.

(*c*) He must furnish the certificate of physical fitness required by rule 2 under section 102 of the Civil Pension Code (5th Edition).

(*d*) He must give satisfactory evidence of good moral character and gentlemanly bearing.

(*e*) If Urdu is not his vernacular, he must give satisfactory evidence that he possesses a thorough knowledge of that language.

3. Recommendations should be submitted to the Chief Court yearly, in the month of July, by Divisional Courts. Recommendations should be made in Form A attached hereto, and should be accompanied by certified copies of the candidates' certificates. In the case of candidates who have not graduated at any University or passed one of the examinations mentioned in clause (*b*) of the last rule, clear proof should be given that the candidate possesses the necessary educational attainments.

4. The names of the candidates who are accepted by the Chief Court will be entered in Register B, and a certificate (in Form B attached) will be forwarded to every

accepted candidate through the Divisional Court who recommended him. Candidates who are not accepted will be so informed through the same channel.

5. An estimate will be made every year in the month of July and published in the issues of the *Punjab Government Gazette* during the month of August of the number of appointments expected to become available for candidates on Register B in the following year, and these appointments will be conferred in accordance with the results of a competitive examination as provided below.

6. If the actual number of vacancies in any year falls short of the number notified, the successful candidates for the notified number of vacancies will be appointed without further examination during the following year, and the estimate of available vacancies for that year will be correspondingly reduced. On the other hand, if the actual number of vacancies exceeds the number notified, the vacancies will either be filled up temporarily from Register A and the number be added to the estimate of the following year, or the first of the unsuccessful candidates (provided that he has duly qualified as required by rule 10 below) be appointed, as the Chief Court may in each case determine.

7. An examination will be held annually at Lahore, simultaneously with the departmental examination for Tahsildárs and Munsifs, during the month of September or on some subsequent dates, to be notified in the Gazette. Every candidate whose name is on Register B may, on presentation of the certificate referred to in rule 4, appear at this examination, provided that he has, on or before the 1st of September, signified in writing to the Divisional Court in which he resides his intention to do so. Any candidate on Register A who has passed the departmental examination may likewise, with the permission of the Divisional Court of the Division to which he belongs, appear at this examination.

8. The name of every candidate on Register B who fails to gain an appointment at the first examination held after he attains the age of 25 will be removed from the register.

Revised Rules.

9. The examination will be held in the following subjects:—

		SUBJECT.
First day ...	Morning ...	Composition—A subject for an essay will be prescribed at the time of the examination.
	Afternoon ...	History of India.
Second day ...	Morning ...	Civil Procedure Code and Law of Evidence.
	Afternoon ...	Acts VII of 1870, IX of 1872, I, III, and XV of 1877, I of 1879.
Third day ...	Morning ...	Mathematics—Arithmetic, Algebra, and Euclid.
	Afternoon ...	Candidates who answer in English will have their knowledge of Urdu tested.

Three hours will be allowed for each paper, and each paper will carry a maximum of 100 marks. Answers may be written in English, and extra marks, not exceeding 10 in each paper, will be awarded to candidates who answer in English and show a competent knowledge of that language. Candidates who answer in English will be required to show that they possess a competent knowledge of Urdu by reading a petition written in that language and translating a judgment from English into Urdu.

10. No candidate will be held to have qualified for an appointment unless he obtains three-fifths of the aggregate marks assigned for the whole examination and two-fifths of the marks assigned for each subject. For the purposes of this rule, the two papers in Law will be deemed to constitute one subject. The qualified candidates who obtain the highest aggregates of marks will, up to the number of estimated vacancies, be deemed to be successful candidates. Successful candidates will be appointed to vacancies in the order of merit in which they pass.

11. If at any examination a sufficient number of candidates do not qualify for the estimated number of vacancies, any vacancies which may fall to Register B in the following year in excess of the number of qualified candidates will be filled up permanently from Register A, and not as provided in Rule 6 above.

12. Every Munsif appointed from Register B will hold his appointment on probation for two years, within which period he will be required to pass the prescribed departmental examination, unless he has already qualified in this respect. Failure to pass the departmental examination within the prescribed period will be held to disqualify the probationer for confirmation, and no probationer will be confirmed if it appear that he is from any other cause unfit to hold a judicial appointment. Before a probationer is confirmed, reports as to his fitness will be called for from the Divisional Courts and Deputy Commissioners or District Judges under whom he has served.

Nomination Roll of a Candidate recommended for admission to Register B of Candidates for the office of Munsif.

A.

Name and caste of candidate.	Date and place of birth.	Parentage and domicile of parents.	Where educated, what examinations passed or degrees obtained.	Extent of knowledge of English.	Present appointment or occupation.	Opinion of Deputy Commissioner or District Judge.	Opinion of Divisional Court.
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8

B.

Certificate of Acceptance.

THIS is to certify that has been admitted to Register B of candidates for the office of Munsif, and that he is entitled to appear at any examination held for the selection of Munsifs by competition up to and during the year 188 .

Registrar, Chief Court, Punjab.

Notification No. 8048, dated 25th July 1885.

THE following Rules for the appointment by competition of Extra Assistant Commissioners in the Punjab have been approved by the Lieutenant-Governor, and are published for general information in supersession of those annexed to Resolution No. 2808, dated 4th September 1882:—

GENERAL.

Two registers shall be kept in the Office of the Secretary to Government, viz.—

Register A.—Containing the names of officials who, by approved service, are considered to have earned a claim to the appointment of Extra Assistant Commissioner.

Register B.—Containing the names of approved candidates for admission to the competition for direct appointments.

2 Nomination to, and appointments from, Register A will be governed by separate rules made in that behalf.

3. Register B will consist of persons not already in the service of Government; but—

(*a*) any official on Register A may, with the permission of the Lieutenant-Governor, have his name transferred to Register B; and may, if he fails in the competition, and the Lieutenant-Governor so directs, be restored to Register A in such place as may be considered appropriate;

(*b*) persons of special merit may be recommended for entry in Register B, notwithstanding they may have already accepted office, and the name of no candidate shall be removed from Register B merely on the ground of his having entered the service of Government after his admission to the Register.

4. The Lieutenant-Governor may, for reasons which appear to him sufficient, remove any name from Register B.

Nomination to Register B.

5. The qualifications which are indispensable for nomination, in persons other than officials on Register A whose names may be transferred to Register B, under Rule 3 (*a*), are the following:—

(*a*) The applicant must be a Native of India as defined in Statute 33 Vic., chapter 3, section 6.

(*b*) He must not be under 20 or over 25 years of age last birthday.

(*c*) He must give satisfactory evidence that he possesses a minimum educational qualification equivalent to the Entrance standard of the Punjab University.

(*d*) He must furnish the certificate of physical fitness prescribed by section 106, clause 2 of the Civil Pension Code (6th Edition).

(*e*) He must give satisfactory evidence of (*i*) good moral character; (*ii*) habits of personal activity; and (*iii*) gentlemanly bearing.

(*f*) If Hindustáni is not his vernacular, he must have passed the examination in that language by the higher standard, as laid down in G. G O. (Military Department) No. 734, dated 9th September 1864.

6. Among applicants possessed of the above essential qualifications, preference will generally be given to Natives of, and persons domiciled in, the Punjab, and the Natives States in political connection with the Punjab; and special preference will invariably be given in the following order to—

(*a*) members of families of tried loyalty and distinguished service;

(*b*) persons of good social status and influence in the country;

(*c*) persons of superior educational attainments, such as graduates of an Indian University.

7. Recommendations may be submitted by the Financial Commissioner and the Chief Court from time to time as may be convenient, and should be made in the Form A attached to these Rules.

Subject to such inquiries as may be deemed necessary with reference to Rule 6, the Lieutenant-Governor will be glad to receive recommendations in the Form A (omitting columns 9, 10 and 11) from the Senate of the Punjab University.

8. Recommendations, at whatever time submitted during the course of the year, will be considered by the Lieutenant-Governor together once in the year, usually in the month of March or April.

9. The number of names to be borne on the Register will not for the present exceed fifty at any one time.

10. Every candidate whose name is admitted to the Register will receive a certificate in the Form B attached to these Rules. The certificate will be forwarded through the authority by whom the candidate was recommended.

11. Recommendations on behalf of candidates not accepted may be again submitted in future years if not finally rejected by the Lieutenant-Governor, and if the candidate continues to be admissible under these Rules.

Appointment.

12. An estimate of the number of appointments expected to become available for award by competition will be published in the *Punjab Government Gazette* during the months of August and September in each year.

As many of these appointments as are actually available will, as vacancies occur, be conferred upon successful candidates.

If the actual number of vacancies in the course of the year following the competition falls short of the estimated number notified for competition, the successful candidates for the

notified number of vacancies who have not been provided with appointments will be appointed, without further examination, during the succeeding year, before candidates who are successful at the competition held in the latter year; and the estimate of available vacancies for that year will be correspondingly reduced.

Appointments to vacancies will be made from among successful candidates in the order of merit in which they pass.

13. Half of the appointments to be given by competition in each year will be reserved for candidates possessing a thorough knowledge of English.

14. The name of every candidate who fails to gain an appointment at—

(*a*) three competitive examinations, or
(*b*) the first examination held after he attains the age of 25 years,

shall be removed from the Register.

NOTE.—Rule 14 (*b*) does not apply to officials whose names have been transferred from Register A to Register B under Rule 3 (*a*).

15. If a sufficient number of candidates to fill the vacancies notified in any year do not appear at or pass the examination, the appointments remaining unfilled will be held available for deserving officials on Register A, or for direct appointments under Rule 17.

16. Successful candidates will be appointed, subject to the rules* relating to departmental examinations for the time being in force.

A successful candidate who has not served in a settlement or as Tahsíldár will, after his examination, be required to serve for 12 months in a settlement, and will ordinarily be so employed for such period on a salary of Rs. 100 a month.

17. Notwithstanding anything in these Rules, the Lieutenant-Governor reserves power, for political or other sufficient reasons in special cases, and generally in Frontier districts, to make direct appointments to the office of Extra Assistant Commissioner without requiring an examination to be passed.

THE COMPETITIVE EXAMINATION.

18. A competitive examination† will be held annually at Lahore, about the middle of October, commencing on such date as may from time to time be notified in the Gazette.

19. Any candidate admitted to Register B may, subject to the provisions of Rule 14, present himself at any competitive examination held under these Rules; provided that he has on or before the 1st October signified in writing to the Commissioner of the Division in which he resides his intention to do so.

20. A fee of Rs. 20 shall be paid by every candidate before admission to examination A like fee shall be paid on each occasion on which a candidate is admitted to examination. The fee may be paid into any Government Treasury.

21. Every candidate shall produce his certificate of admission to Register B, and the Treasury receipt for the fee, on the first day of the examination, and before the first paper is given out. The officer superintending the examination will retain the Treasury receipt for the admission fee, but will return the certificate after noting on it the examination to which admission has been made.

22. The examination papers shall be set, marks awarded, and the results announced by the following Committee of Examiners:—

The Accountant-General,—*President;*
The Registrar, Chief Court;
One of the Secretaries to the Financial Commissioners; and such other officers as may be nominated Examiners by the President.

An officer will be appointed (on special duty) Secretary to the Committee of Examination. An Extra Assistant Commissioner, possessing a competent knowledge of English, will be deputed to assist the Secretary of the Committee. The Secretary of the Committee and Extra Assistant Commissioner so deputed shall conduct the examination and all correspondence connected therewith, and shall act generally under the orders of the President of the Committee.

23. There shall be three fixed and three optional subjects. Every candidate must take up all the fixed subjects, and may take up not more than two of the optional subjects.

The fixed subjects shall be (1) Composition, (2) Indian Law and Revenue, and (3) Mathematics. The optional subjects shall be (1) Elementary Principles of British Government, (2) History, and (3) a Classical Language.

* These rules are at present contained in the Resolution of the Punjab Government in the Home Department, No 5158, dated the 19th September 1884; Notifications No. 1032, dated 15th April 1885, and No. 7068, dated 15th July 1885.

† Rules 18 to 28 inclusive will not take effect till the examination to be held in October 1886. The examination to be held in October 1885 will be regulated by the rules annexed to Resolution No. 2808, dated the 4th September 1882.

The details of fixed and optional subjects are given in Table C.

24. A candidate who fails to obtain one-half of the maximum number of marks in each of the three fixed subjects shall be deemed to have failed.

Unless one-half of the maximum number of marks is obtained in any optional subject taken up by a candidate, his marks for that subject shall not be counted in the examination.

25. The candidates who qualify shall be arranged in order of merit, according to the aggregate number of marks obtained by them, respectively, in all subjects taken up under Rule 23 in which they have qualified.

26. The subjects of competitive examination are the same for all candidates, and the questions may be answered either in English or Vernacular. But (with reference to rule 13) candidates competing for appointments reserved for those possessing a thorough knowledge of English will—

(*a*) be expected to record their answers in English;
(*b*) if their vernacular is not English, or if they have not graduated in English in any University, have their knowledge of English tested by a special examination in that language.

27. In order to qualify in the special English test, half the maximum number of marks allotted to that subject must be obtained. The marks obtained in this test examination will not form part of the aggregate number of marks mentioned in Rule 25.

28. Failure to pass by the English test will not disqualify a candidate for any of the other appointments which in other respects he may have earned.

Illustration.—In 1885 there are two appointments. One of them is reserved for a candidate with English qualifications. The three highest candidates in the general examination are—A, who gains 90 per cent., B, who gains 80, and C, who gains 75 per cent. C is the only one of the three who qualifies in English. The appointments go to A and C.

Similarly, in 1886, there are two appointments. D gains 85 per cent., E 80 per cent., and F 75 per cent.; D professes English in addition, but fails; E and F do not profess English. D gains an appointment, and the English appointment remains vacant.

FORM A.

Nomination Roll of a Candidate for the Competitive Examination for the office of Extra Assistant Commissioner.

1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12
								OPINION OF			
DISTRICT.	Name, age with date of birth, caste, place of birth.	Parentage and domicile of parents.	Services, social status, or influence of candidate or his family.	Where educated, examinations passed or degrees obtained.	Extent of knowledge of English possessed.	Present appointment or occupation.	Abstract of certificates of recommendation accompanying the application.	Deputy Commissioner.	Commissioner.	Chief Court or Financial Commissioner.	REMARKS WITH SPECIAL REFERENCE TO PREFERENCE UNDER RULE 6.

Notes.—(1) The same form, omitting columns 9, 10, and 11, may be used by the Senate of the University.
(2) A separate recommendation must be submitted for each candidate.
(3) Authorities submitting nomination rolls should keep copies of them, as the originals will be filed for record in the Secretariat.

FORM B.

THIS is to certify that _____ has been accepted as a candidate for admission to the competitive examination for the appointment of Extra Assistant Commissioner in the Punjab; and that he is entitled to appear at any examination (not exceeding three in all) held under Punjab Government Notification No. 804S, dated the 25th of July 1885, up to and including the examination in October 188

Secretary to Government, Punjab.

---

1. This candidate was admitted to the examination which commenced on
188

Secretary to the Committee of Examination.

2. This candidate was admitted to the examination which commenced on
188

Secretary to the Committee of Examination.

3. This candidate was admitted to the examination which commenced on
188

Secretary to the Committee of Examination.

TABLE C.

Details of fixed and optional subjects of Examination.

No.	Subject.	Paper, day, and time.	Subjects and marks.		
	FIXED SUBJECTS.			*Maximum Marks.*	
I	COMPOSITION ...	PAPER (1) *First day. Time 3 hours.*	Writing an original essay on a subject prescribed at the time of examination...	100	
		PAPER (2) *First day. Time 3 hours.*	Writing an analysis or précis of an official document or file of papers ...	50	150
II	INDIAN LAW AND REVENUE.	PAPER (3) *Second day. Time 3 hours.*	Outlines of the system of Revenue Administration in the Punjab	75	
		PAPER (4) *Second day. Time 3 hours.*	The Indian Penal Code; the Indian Contract Act; and the Indian Evidence Act	75	150
III	MATHEMATICS ...	PAPER (5) *Third day. Time 3 hours.*	The whole of Arithmetic	100	
		PAPER (6) *Third day. Time 3 hours.*	(*a*). Algebra to Simple Equations, including Ratio and Proportion	50	
			(*b*). The first three books of Euclid ...	50	200
	OPTIONAL SUBJECTS.				
IV	ELEMENTARY PRINCIPLES OF BRITISH GOVERNMENT.	PAPER (7) *Fourth day. Time 3 hours.*	Outlines of General Jurisprudence ...	75	
		PAPER (8) *Fourth day. Time 3 hours.*	Outlines of the Constitution of the Government of England and India ...	75	150
V	HISTORY	PAPER (9) *Fifth day. Time 3 hours.*	The History of India	75	
		PAPER (10) *Fifth day. Time 3 hours.*	The History of England	75	150
VI	A CLASSICAL LANGUAGE, VIZ.:— Arabic or Sanskrit.	PAPER (11) *Sixth day. Time 3 hours.*	Grammar and Explanation	50	
		PAPER (12) *Sixth day. Time 3 hours.*	An easy essay in the language	50	100
	SPECIAL EXAMINATION IN ENGLISH QUALIFICATIONS.	PAPER (1) *Seventh day. Time 1½ hours.*	Grammar and Explanation	50	
		PAPER (2) *Translation. Seventh day. Time 1½ hours.*	Translation from and into English ...	50	100

MEMORANDUM.—No special text-books are prescribed, but questions will not be put from books which are not available in the vernacular languages. The following list of books and references will indicate the standard to be required and the nature of the test in each subject:—

Subject II, Paper (3)—Barkley's Directions for Settlement Officers and Collectors of Land Revenue; Powell's Manual of the Land Revenue systems of India, pages 395 to 428;* The Punjab Land Revenue and Tenancy Acts.

Paper (4)—The Indian Penal Code and amending Acts; the Indian Contract Act; and the Indian Evidence Act.

Subject III, Papers (5) and (6)—Todhunter's School Series in English; or the Vernacular text-books in Arithmetic, Algebra and Euclid prescribed by the Punjab Educational Department.

* No questions will be set from these pages until they are translated.

Subject IV, Paper (7)—As in the Law Manual of the Punjab University, No. 1.
Paper (8)—As in first five chapters of Blackstone and the Indian Council's Act and amending Acts.
Subject V, Papers (9) and (10)—The Outlines of the History of England and India as in Collier's History of the British Empire (*Táríkh-i-Saltanat Englishia*), and Lethbridge's Easy Introduction to the History of India.
Subject VI, Papers (11) and (12)—Entrance (Arts) Standard, Punjab University.

Notification No. 1397S, dated 19th September 1885.

THE following Rules have been approved by the Lieutenant-Governor and are published for general information :—

RULES FOR THE APPOINTMENT BY SELECTION OF EXTRA ASSISTANT COMMISSIONERS IN THE PUNJAB.

A Register (Register A) shall be kept in the office of the Secretary to Government containing the names of officials who, by approved service, are considered to have earned a claim to the appointment of Extra Assistant Commissioner. Nominations to, and appointments from, the Register will be made in accordance with the following rules.

2. No candidate whose name is not already on Register A shall be recommended unless he has passed the examination for Extra Assistant Commissioner by the Higher Standard.

3. The maximum number of candidates who will at any one time be shown as accepted candidates in Register A shall be forty, of whom ten will be nominated from the list of the Chief Court, and twenty-five from the list of the Financial Commissioner.

4. Recommendations may be submitted by the Financial Commissioner and Chief Court from time to time as may be convenient, and should be made in the Form A attached to these Rules.

5. The Lieutenant-Governor will, from time to time, make selections to fill vacancies in the Register.

6. The candidates will ordinarily be tahsíldárs, Superintendents of Settlements and Munsifs, but the claims of Head Clerks of divisional and district offices should not be overlooked.

7. Candidates who have not served in a Settlement or as tahsíldárs will after appointment be required to serve for twelve months in a Settlement.

8. Every accepted candidate will be eligible for appointment as an Officiating Extra Assistant Commissioner, in any district in the Province, as long as his name remains on the Register.

9. The Register will be revised periodically, and names will not be retained on it for an indefinite time.

10. If any authority who has recommended a candidate sees subsequent reason to modify or withdraw his recommendation, he is expected to communicate the fact to Government without delay.

FORM A.

Nomination Roll of a candidate for appointment by selection to the office of Extra Assistant Commissioner.

1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11
							REASONS FOR RECOMMENDATION GIVEN BY			
DISTRICT.	Name of candidate, age with date of birth, native place, caste, parentage.	Where educated.	Whether and to what extent he knows English.	What examinations he has passed.	Present appointment, date from which he has held it, and abstract of services.	Whether nominee enjoys a personal allowance.	Deputy Commissioner or District Judge.	Commissioner or Divisional Judge.	Financial Commissioner or Chief Court.	REMARKS.

Law Manual No. 2 of the Punjab University is in course of publication, and is recommended when available.

NOTES.—(1) A separate recommendation must be submitted for each candidate.
(2) Authorities submitting nomination rolls should keep copies of them, as the originals will be filed for record in the Secretariat.
(3) In the case of a Native candidate, it should be stated in column 4 whether his knowledge of English is sufficient for the charge of a Treasury.
(4) In the case of a candidate recommended by the Financial Commissioner, it should be stated in column 10 whether the candidate is competent to exercise the Revenue powers of a Deputy Commissioner under the Punjab Court's Act for the purpose of trying original suits.

Vol. I.
Sec. I.
Sub-Sec. B.
Paper IV.

Punjab Government.

IV.

No. 3, dated 16th November 1886.

From—F. C. DAUKES, Esq., Secretary, Public Service Commission,
To—The Secretary to the Government of the Punjab.

WITH reference to the Resolution of the Government of India in the Home Department, No. 34—1573-83, dated 4th October 1886, on the subject of the appointment of a Commission for the purpose of enquiring into the question of the employment of Natives of India in the Public Service, I am directed to request that, with the permission of His Honor the Lieutenant-Governor, you will be good enough to favor the Commission with full details showing the number of "charges" or offices in which Covenanted and Uncovenanted officers, engaged in the Executive and Judicial administration of the country, are at present employed, together with complete information as to the apportionment of these "charges" or offices amongst members of the Covenanted and Uncovenanted Services respectively in the Punjab.

2. Columns 2—14, inclusive of the statement embodied in paragraph 7 of the Resolution of the Government of India in the Home Department, No. 68—2024-35, dated 15th December 1881, show the nature of the statistics required, and I am to request that the return now asked for may be rendered as complete as possible so as accurately to represent existing facts. I am at the same time to enclose detailed lists of appointments upon which the figures given in the Resolution of 15th December 1881, in regard to the Punjab, were based, and to request that corresponding details may be furnished of the figures entered under each column of the present return.

3. The Commission would also be glad to be furnished with figures showing the existing *cadre* of the Covenanted Civil Service in the Punjab, together with information regarding the proportion to the total strength of that service of (1) effective, (2) officers on leave and other non-effectives, and (3) officers in training respectively.

THE PUNJAB.

Government of India—7.

1 Agent, Biluchistan.
1 Forest Officer.
1 Khyber Officer.
1 Major the Hon'ble G. C. Napier.
1 Under-Secretary, Agricultural Department
1 Financial Department.
2 Messrs. Hewson and Lawrence, Political.
1 Resident, Baroda.
1 Governor-General's Agent, Central India.

Total 10

It has been considered sufficient to take 7 as a fair average.

Administration—18.

1 Lieutenant-Governor.
1 Financial Commissioner.
4 Secretaries to Lieutenant-Governor.
2 Secretaries to Financial Commissioner.
10 Commissioners.

Total 18

Headships of Districts—32.

11 Deputy Commissioners, 1st class.
11 Ditto ditto, 2nd „
10 Ditto ditto, 3rd „

Total 32

Sub-Divisional and similar officers—98.

13 Members of Commission.
78 Extra Assistant Commissioners.
7 Cantonment Magistrates (one belonging to Commission).

Total 98

Tahsils and similar minor Executive charges—128.

Total 128

High and Chief Courts and Judicial Commissioner—3.

3 Chief Court.

Total 3

District Judges—3.

2 Additional Commissioners
1 Civil and Sessions Judge.

Total 3

Assistant or Subordinate Judges and Munsifs—101.

14 Judical Assistants.
8 Extra Judicial Assistants.
5 Small Cause Court Judges (one Covenanted).
74 Munsifs.

Total 101

Average of higher miscellaneous appointments held by Covenanted Civil Servants or other Members of Commission of rank of Assistant Commissioner and upwards—13.

1 Registrar.
1 Government Advocate.
7 Settlement Officers.
1 Census Officer
2 Political Department.
1 Private Secretary

Total 13

V.

Vol. I.
Sec. I.
Sub-Sec B.
Paper V.

Punjab Government

No. 1, dated the 3rd January 1887.

From—H. MAUDE, Esq., Under-Secretary to the Government of the Punjab,
To—The Secretary, Public Service Commission, Allahabad.

I AM directed to forward two revised statements showing (1) the number of "charges" or offices amongst members of the Covenanted and Uncovenanted Services in the Punjab, and (2) the existing strength of the Covenanted Civil Service in the Punjab, in supersession of those forwarded with my letter No. 2013, dated the 18th December 1886.

[No. 2.]

Statement showing the existing strength of the Punjab Commission.

GRADES OF OFFICERS.	Effective.	Non-effective.	In training.	Total.	REMARKS.
Commissioners	6	.....	.....	6	
Deputy Commissioners, 1st grade ...	* 7	3	.....	10	
Ditto ditto, 2nd " ...	8	2	.....	10	
Ditto ditto, 3rd " ...	8	3	.....	11	
Divisional Judges, 1st " ...	.....	3	.....	3	
Ditto, 2nd " ...	5	.. ...	.....	5	
Ditto, 3rd " ...	5	.....	.....	5	
District Judges, 1st " ...	5	.....	.....	5	
Ditto, 2nd " * ...	3	.....	.....	3	* One of these appointments is at present held by a Native Uncovenanted officer who is not a member of the Commission.
Assistant Commissioners, 1st " ...	6	1	.....	7†	
Ditto, 2nd " ...	12	2	.....	14	
Ditto, 3rd " ...	20	5	9	34	
Special appointments	7	9	.....	16	
Officers serving under Government of India...	1†	4	.....	5	† One Assistant Commissioner, 1st grade, who is Political Officer, Khyber, is serving under Government of India.
Grand Total ...	93	32	9	134	

The proportions to the total strength shown above, therefore, are as follows:—

Effective	69·4
Non-effective	23·8
Officers in training	6·8
Total ...	100

[No. 1.]

Apportionment of "charges" or offices amongst members of the Covenanted and Uncovenanted Services employed in the Executive and Judicial Administration of the Punjab.

Classification adopted in paragraph 7 of the Resolution of the Government of India, in the Home Department No. 68—2024-35, dated the 15th December 1881.	COVENANTED, INCLUDING MEMBERS OF COMMISSIONS.								UNCOVENANTED.					TOTAL.		
	EXECUTIVE.				JUDICIAL.				EXECUTIVE		JUDICIAL.					
			Districts.			Districts.										
	Government of India.	Administration.	Headships of districts and the like.	Sub-divisional officers.	High and Chief Court Judges and Judicial Commissioners	District or Special Judges and the like.	Assistant Judges and the like.	General.	Sub-divisional officers.	Tahsildars, mamlatdars, sub-deputies, &c.	High and Chief Courts Judges and Judicial Commissioners.	District or Special Judges and the like.	Subordinate Judges, Munsifs, and the like.	Covenanted.	Uncovenanted.	Grand Total.
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15	16	17
Number of officers in the Punjab	10	15	31	14	3	13	9	11	85	145	1	.....	101	106	332	438
Classification adopted to suit the present circumstances of the Punjab.	Government of India.	Administration.	Headships of districts.	Sub-divisional officers.	Judges of Chief Court.	Divisional and Sessions Judges.	District Judges.	Miscellaneous appointments.	Sub-divisional officers.	Tahsildars.	Judges of Chief Court.	Divisional and Sessions Judges.	Judicial Extra Assistants and Munsifs.	Covenanted.	Uncovenanted.	Grand Total.

EXPLANATORY NOTES.—Column 4 includes two appointments held by Uncovenanted Europeans, and one by a "Native of India" within the Statutory definition.
Column 5 contains six sub-divisional charges at present held by Extra Assistant Commissioners
Column 10 comprises eight Cantonment Magistracies and seventy-seven Extra Assistant Commissioners. These Extra Assistant Commissioners, however, perform duties similar to Assistant Commissioners who have been excluded from the statement of "charges." These duties are partly judicial and partly executive. No separation of judicial and executive duties in regard to these classes s been made.

Detailed statement showing executive and judicial charges held by officers in the Province of the Punjab.

Class of charge.	Names of officers or "charges." Covenanted.	Uncovenanted.	Where shown in abstract statement above.	Remarks.
Government of India.	1 Agent, Biluchistan. 1 Do., Central India. 1 Do., Hyderabad. 1 Do., Mysore. 2 Commissioners, Burmah. 1 Deputy Commissioner, Burmah. 1 Major the Hon'ble G. C. Napier. 1 Khyber Officer. 1 Boundary Commission. 1 Under-Secretary, Revenue Department. 3 Assistant Political Officers or Assistant Commissioners in Administrations under the Government of India.	*Nil*	Column 2.	An average of 7 was taken by the Government of India in 1881. The actual number was 10. At the present time, including officers permanently transferred, it is 14. Judging from the demands hitherto made on the ranks of the Punjab Commission for such appointments, it would not be safe to take a lower average than 10.
Administration.	1 Lieutenant-Governor. 2 Financial Commissioners. 4 Secretaries to Lieutenant-Governor 2 Secretaries to Financial Commissioners. 6 Commissioners.	*Nil*	Column 3.	
Headships of districts.	10 Deputy Commissioners, 1st grade. 10 Ditto ditto, 2nd do. 11 Ditto ditto, 3rd do.	2 Deputy Commissioners, 1st grade, at present held by Uncovenanted officers. 1 Deputy Commissioner, 2nd grade, at present held by an Uncovenanted officer	Column 4.	
Sub-divisional charges.	Fourteen sub-divisional charges at present.	Six sub-divisional charges at present held by Extra Assistant Commissioners. Eight Cantonment Magistracies. 77 Extra Assistant Commissioners.	Column 5 ... Column 10.	The six sub-divisions at present held by Extra Assistant Commissioners are— 1. Attock. 4. Kasur. 2. Sirsa. 5. Bhakkar. 3. Fazilka. 6. Mianwali.
Tahsildar.	.....	123 Tahsildars ... ... 22 Superintendents of Settlements.	Column 11.	
Chief Court Judges.	3 Judges, Chief Court	..... 1 Judge, Chief Court ...	Column 6. Column 12.	
Divisions and District Judges, Extra Judicial Assistants and Munsifs.	13 Divisional Judges ... ... 9 District Judges	..... 1 District Judgeship at present held by a Native Uncovenanted officer. 17 Extra Judicial Assistants. 84 Munsifs	Column 7. Column 8. Column 14.	
Miscellaneous.	1 Registrar. 1 Government Advocate. 1 Income-tax Officer. 1 Superintendent, Kapurthala. 1 Private Secretary. 1 Director of Settlements. 5 Settlement Officers.	*Nil*	Column 9.	

VI.

No. 89, dated Allahabad, 5th January 1887.

From— F. C. DAUKES, ESQ., Secretary, Public Service Commission,
To—The Secretary to the Government of the Punjab.

Vol. I.
Sec. I.
Sub-Sec B.
Paper VI.

Punjab Government.

I AM directed to request that, with the permission of His Honor the Lieutenant-Governor, you will be good enough to favour the Public Service Commission with accurate statistics showing how many persons at present employed in the Subordinate Judicial Service and in the Subordinate Executive Service in the Punjab have (1) passed the Entrance examination, (2) passed the First Arts or other corresponding examination, and (3) taken the degree of Bachelor or Master of Arts at an Indian University.

2. I am to explain that the information is required for each class of appointments separately, and that the terms "Subordinate Judicial Service" and "Subordinate Executive Service" are intended to embrace respectively all Subordinate Executive and Judicial offices down to and including the office of Munsif or Tahsildar, or other office corresponding to that of Munsif or Tahsildar, which are not reserved for, or not ordinarily held by, members of the Covenanted Civil Service.

3. The favour of an early reply is requested.

No. 552, dated Lahore, 16th March 1887.

From—H. MAUDE, ESQ., Under-Secretary to the Government of the Punjab,
To—The Secretary to the Public Service Commission.

IN reply to your letter No. 89, dated the 5th January 1887, I am directed to forward a statement showing for each class of appointments separately the number of officers serving in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services in this Province who have taken certain University degrees.

Statement showing the Executive and Judicial Officers of the Subordinate Services in the Province of the Punjab who have taken certain University degrees.

1	2	3	4
GRADE.	HAVE PASSED—		
	Entrance Examination.	First Arts or corresponding examination.	B.A. or M.A.
Subordinate Executive.			
Extra Assistant Commissioners	7	.....	7 M.As.
Tahsildars	5	.....	5 B.As.
Superintendents of Settlement	.....	1	.....
Subordinate Judicial.			
Extra Judicial Assistants	2	.....	1 B A.
Munsifs	4	3	2 M.As.* 5 B.As.
Total ...	18	4	20

* Besides these seven officers there is also one M.O.L. (Master of Oriental Learning).

VII.

No. 102, dated Bombay, 22nd January 1887.

From—F. C. DAUKES, Esq., Secretary, Public Service Commission,
To—The Secretary to the Government of the Punjab.

I AM directed to request that, with the permission of His Honor the Lieutenant-Governor, you will be good enough to favour the Public Service Commission with a return in the annexed form showing the nationalities and castes of the several persons at present employed in the Subordinate Judicial Service and in the Subordinate Executive Service in the Punjab.

2. I am to explain that the information is required for each class of appointments separately, and that the terms "Subordinate Judicial Service" and "Subordinate Executive Service" are intended to embrace respectively all Subordinate Executive and Judicial offices down to and including the office of Munsif or Tahsildar, or other office corresponding to that of Munsif or Tahsildar, which are not reserved for, or not ordinarily held by, members of the Covenanted Civil Service.

3. The favour of an early reply is requested.

No. 922, dated Lahore, 27th April 1887.

From—W. M. YOUNG, Esq., Secretary to the Government of the Punjab,
To—The Secretary, Public Service Commission.

IN reply to your letter No. 102, dated the 22nd January 1887, I am directed to forward a statement showing the castes and nationalities of the several persons employed in the Subordinate Executive and Judicial Services in this Province.

Statement showing the Castes and Nationalities of the several persons employed in the Subordinate Executive and Judicial Services in the Punjab.

CLASS OF APPOINTMENTS.	Europeans or Eurasians domiciled in India.	Europeans or Eurasians not domiciled in India at the time of appointment.	Mahomedans.	HINDUS. Brahmins including Shenvis.	Kshatriyas.	Kayasths (Parbhus).	Banyas and Vysias.	Sudras.	Others.	Sikhs.	Others.	Total for each class of appointment.
Subordinate Executive Service.												
Extra Assistant Commissioners ...	8	1	(1)32	9	14	1	5	...	3	4	...	77
Tahsildars	.....	.....	(2)55	15	26	(3)9	4	2	(4)4	7	1	123
Superintendents of Settlements ...	.....	.....	6	5	5	(5)2	(6)1	1	1	1	...	22
Subordinate Judicial Service.												
Extra Judicial Assistants	5	4	3	...	2	1	(7)1	...	1	...	...	17
Munsifs	.....	.....	(8)31	(9)12	25	5	4	3	...	3	1	84
Total for each caste or nationality...	13	5	127	41	72	18	15	6	9	15	2	323

(1) Two belong to the North-Western Provinces.
(2) One belongs ditto ditto.
(3) Ditto ditto ditto.
(4) Ditto ditto ditto.
(5) Ditto ditto ditto.
(6) Belongs to the North-Western Provinces.
(7) Ditto ditto ditto.
(8) Four belong ditto ditto.
(9) One belongs ditto ditto.

VIII.

No. 112, dated Madras, 5th February 1887.

From—F. C. DAUKES, Esq., Secretary, Public Service Commission,
To—The Secretary to the Government of the Punjab.

Vol. I.
Sec. I.
Sub-Sec. B.
Paper VIII.

Punjab Government.

I AM desired to request that, with the permission of His Honor the Lieutenant-Governor, the Public Service Commission may be favoured with a return in the annexed form showing (1) the number of persons who have passed the Entrance Examination, the First Arts or other corresponding examination, or who have taken the degree of Bachelor or Master of Arts at the Punjab University during each of the past five years, and (2) the nationalities and castes to which such persons belong.

2. The favour of an early reply is requested.

No. 875, dated Lahore, 22nd April 1887.

From—H. MAUDE, Esq., Under-Secretary to the Government of the Punjab,
To—The Secretary, Public Service Commission.

IN reply to your letter No. 112, dated the 5th February 1887, I am directed to forward herewith a copy of a letter, No. 689, dated the 18th March 1887, from the Director of Public Instruction, Punjab, submitting a statement showing the number of persons who have taken certain degrees at the Lahore University.

2. It will be observed that candidates who have taken the degrees of B.O.L. and M.O.L have been separately entered, and that the information is not given in the exact form in which it was asked for. I am to forward for information a copy of the correspondence noted in the margin, and to express regret that it has been found impossible to give the various castes of the successful candidates.

Punjab Government letter No. 653, dated 28th March 1887, to the Director of Public Instruction Punjab
From the Director of Public Instruction, Punjab, No. 882, dated 16th April 1887.

Copy of a letter No. 689, *dated* 18*th March* 1887, *from the Director of Public Instruction, Punjab, to the Secretary to the Government of the Punjab.*

WITH reference to your No. 434, dated 26th ultimo, and subsequent endorsement No. 473, dated 4th instant, regarding the information required by the Public Service Commission, I have the honor to forward a copy of letter No. 591, dated 17th March 1887, from the Registrar, Punjab University, together with an enclosure, in original.

It will be noticed that the Registrar expresses his inability to classify the persons who have passed the various examinations according to castes and nationalities.

Copy of a letter No. 591, *dated* 17*th March* 1887, *from the Registrar, Punjab University, Lahore, to the Director of Public Instruction, Punjab.*

IN compliance with your No. 568 of the 7th instant, I have the honor to enclose a statement shewing the number of candidates that have passed the various Arts examinations of the University since 1882, and to state that it is impossible for this office to classify the candidates into various castes to which they each belong.

YEAR.	Number of persons who have passed the Entrance examination.				Number of persons who have passed the First Arts examination.				Number of persons who have taken the degree of Bachelor of Arts.				Number of persons who have taken the degree of Bachelor of Oriental Learning.				Number of persons who have taken the degree of Master of Arts.				Number of persons who have taken the degree of Master of Oriental Learning.				REMARKS.
	Hindus	Mahomedans	Christians	Parsees.	Hindus	Mahomedans.	Christians.	Parsees.	Hindus.	Mahomedans.	Christians.	Parsees.	Hindus.	Mahomedans.	Christians	Parsees.	Hindus.	Mahomedans.	Christians.	Parsees.	Hindus.	Mahomedans.	Christians.	Parsees.	
1882* ..	62	13			10	3	1		1			..		1	.	..	2	1	...	..	..	.	..	...	
1883	96	26	1		19	2	..		5	1	..			1	...		2	1	.	...	..	3	.		
1884	155	54	3		29	5		..	7	2	...	..	2	1			3						.	...	
1885	240	81	3		27	4	1	...	13	...	1		1	1	...		3	1	1		1	1	..	.	
1886	193	50	3	1	57	15	..	.	13	2	..	.	..	2			2	.					...	..	

REGISTRAR'S OFFICE,
LAHORE,
March 1887.

F. LARPENT,
Registrar, Punjab University.

Copy of a letter No. 653, *dated* 28*th March* 1887, *from the Under-Secretary to the Government of the Punjab, to the Director of Public Instruction, Punjab.*

I AM directed to acknowledge the receipt of your letter No. 689, dated the 18th March 1887, forwarding a statement of the persons who have taken certain University degrees, but expressing an inability on the part of the Registrar of the Punjab University to classify the persons according to castes.

2. In reply, I am to say that it is a matter of importance that the castes should be given, and I am to request that another effort may be made to supply the information in the form required.

Copy of a letter No. 882, *dated* 14*th April* 1887, *from the Director of Public Instruction, Punjab, to the Secretary to the Government of the Punjab.*

WITH reference to your No. 653, dated 28th ultimo, requesting that another effort may be made to classify according to castes the candidates who have passed certain University examinations, I have the honour to forward for information a copy of my letter No. 788, dated 31st ultimo, to the Registrar, Punjab University, and his reply No. 729, dated 5th instant, in which he points out the reasons why he is unable to supply the required information.

Copy of a letter No. 788, *dated* 31*st March* 1887, *from the Director of Public Instruction, Punjab, to the Registrar, Punjab University, Lahore.*

WITH reference to your No. 591, dated 17th March 1887, forwarding a statement shewing the number of candidates who have passed the various Arts examinations since 1882, and stating your inability to classify the candidates according to the various castes to which they belong, I have the honour to forward a copy of letter No. 653, dated 28th March 1887, from the Secretary to Government, Punjab, requesting that another effort may be made to supply the information in the form required, as it is a matter of importance that the castes should be given; and to request that you will kindly do your best to supply the information required. Perhaps a reference to the original applications of candidates may help in furnishing the required information.

Copy of a letter No. 729, *datad* 5*th April* 1887, *from the Registrar, Punjab University, to the Director of Public Instruction, Punjab.*

IN reply to your letter No. 788, dated 31st March 1887, I regret that it is quite impossible with any degree of accuracy to classify the candidates at the various University Arts examination since 1882 according to the various castes to which they belong.

The original applications of candidates give only the following personal particulars:—

Age.
Race.
Religion.
Present occupation.

These particulars are not supplied accurately or upon any uniform plan; for instance, among six applications for the B.A. examination of 1887 now before me, the *race* of three is entered as Aryan and their religion as Hindu, while the race of two is entered as Hindu and their religion as Aryan. I can of course furnish a statement shewing the particulars of race and religion according to the entries in the original application of candidates, and will do so if the Government so desire; but such a statement cannot, for the reason given above, be of any value whatever.

Vol. I.
Sec. I.
Sub-Sec. B.
Paper IX.

Punjab Government.

IX.

No. 131, dated Calcutta, 7th March 1887.

From—F. C. DAUKES, ESQ., Secretary, Public Service Commission,
To—The Secretary to the Government of the Punjab.

I AM desired to request that, with the permission of His Honor the Lieutenant-Governor, you will be good enough to furnish the Public Service Commission with information showing the extent to which encouragement is offered to Natives of the Punjab, by means of Government scholarships or otherwise, to proceed to England for the purpose of completing their education. The Commission are aware of the fact that certain scholarships have been recently established for this purpose by the Government of India; but the present enquiry is made with a view to ascertain (1) whether any similar encouragement is offered by Local Governments and Administrations, and, if so, subject to what rules and conditions, and (2) to what extent advantage is taken of the same.

2. It would be convenient if you would be good enough at the same time to supply such information as may be available regarding scholarships, if any, which may have been established with a similar object in the Punjab, but the cost of which is not borne by the State.

Copy of a letter No. 761, dated 26th March 1887, from the Director of Public Instruction, Punjab, to the Under-Secretary to the Government of the Punjab, Revenue Department.

WITH reference to your endorsement No. 578, dated 21st instant, forwarding a copy of a letter, No. 131, dated 7th March 1887, from the Secretary to the Public Service Commission, in which the Commission desire to be furnished with information showing the extent to which encouragement is offered to Natives of the Punjab, by means of Government scholarships or otherwise, to proceed to England for the purpose of completing their education, I have the honour to state that there are no Government or other scholarships in this Province for the purpose referred to.

No. 742, dated Lahore, 6th April 1887.

From—The Secretary to the Government of the Punjab,
To—The Secretary, Public Service Commission.

COPY forwarded to the Secretary to the Public Service Commission, in reply to his letter No. 131, dated the 7th of March 1887.

PROCEEDINGS

OF THE

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

(SITTINGS AT LAHORE.)

MEMBERS PRESENT ON EACH DAY.

LAHORE, *the* 15*th December* 1886.

PRESENT :

The Hon'ble Sir Charles Aitchison, K.C.S.I., C.I.E., C.S., LL.D., *President.*
Sir Charles Turner, Kt., C.I.E.
The Hon'ble J. W. Quinton, C.S.
The Hon'ble Justice Romesh Chunder Mitter, M.A., B.L.
C. H. T. Crosthwaite, Esq., C.S.
F. B. Peacock, Esq., C.S.
H. J. Stokes, Esq., C.S.
T. H. Stewart, Esq., C.S.
W. B. Hudson, Esq.
W. H. Ryland, Esq.
D. S. White, Esq.
M. R. Ry. Salem Ramaswami Mudaliyar.
Syad Ahmad, Khán Bahádur, C.I.E.

LAHORE,	*the* 16*th December*		1886.	*The same as above.*
Ditto,	*the* 17*th*	„	„	*Ditto.*
Ditto,	*the* 18*th*	„	„	*Ditto.*
Ditto,	*the* 20*th*	„	„	*Ditto.*

LAHORE, *the* 21*st December* 1886.

(1). The Hon'ble Sir Charles Aitchison, K.C.S.I., C.I.E., C.S., LL.D., *President.*
(2). Sir Charles Turner, Kt., C.I.E.
(3). The Hon'ble Justice Romesh Chunder Mitter.
(4). The Hon'ble J. W. Quinton, C.S.
(5). C. H. T. Crosthwaite, Esq., C.S.
(6). F. B. Peacock, Esq., C.S.
(7). H. J. Stokes, Esq., C.S.
(8). T. H. Stewart, Esq., C.S.
(9). W. H Ryland, Esq.
(10). D. S. White, Esq.
(11). M. R. Ry. Salem Ramaswami Mudaliyar.

LAHORE, *the* 22*nd December* 1886.

(1). The Hon'ble Sir Charles Aitchison, K.C.S.I., C.I.E., C.S., LL.D., *President.*
(2). Sir Charles Turner, Kt., C.I.E.
(3). The Hon'ble Justice Romesh Chunder Mitter.
(4). C. H. T. Crosthwaite, Esq., C.S.
(5). F. B. Peacock, Esq., C.S.
(6). H. J. Stokes, Esq., C.S.
(7). W. H. Ryland, Esq.
(8). D. S. White, Esq.
(9). Syad Ahmad, Khán Bahádur, C.I.E.
(10). M. R. Ry. Salem Ramaswami Mudaliyar.

LAHORE,	*the* 23*rd December*		1886.	*The same as above.*	
Ditto,	*the* 24*th*	„	„	*Ditto*	except Syad Ahmad, Khán Bahádur, C.I.E.
Ditto,	*the* 27*th*	„	„	*Ditto*	ditto.

On the 21st December a Sub-Committee consisting of the following members was deputed to Allahabad, North-Western Provinces, to arrange in advance for the sittings of the Commission, and to take evidence :—

The Hon'ble J. W. Quinton, C.S.
T. H. Stewart, Esq., C.S.
W. B. Hudson, Esq.

PROCEEDINGS

OF THE

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION.

VOLUME I.—PROCEEDINGS RELATING TO THE PUNJAB.

SECTION II.—MINUTES OF EVIDENCE TAKEN IN THE PUNJAB.

SITTINGS AT LAHORE.

WITNESS I.—15th December 1886.

Examination of the Hon'ble Colonel W. G. DAVIES, C.S.I., First Financial Commissioner, Punjab; Additional Member of the Legislative Council of the Governor-General of India.

answer to the Hon'ble Sir Charles Aitchison, Colonel *Davies* stated:—

I am First Financial Commissioner of this Province. I have been nearly 33 years in the Punjab Commission, and have served in every grade from Assistant Commissioner up to Financial Commissioner.

The *President.*

1. What is the prevalent feeling in your Province regarding the existing Statutory system?—The prevalent feeling throughout the Province, among those who take any interest in the subject, is, I think, one of dissatisfaction.

2. Is the dissatisfaction general, or is it confined to certain sections of the community? and what are the grounds upon which any such feeling is based?—The feeling is confined to the educated classes, and chiefly to those from whom our officials are drawn. It is partly based on the ground that the front door of open competition having been closed to them by the reduction of the limit of age, the Statutory system is a kind of arrangement for admitting them by the back door; but it is, I think, still more founded on the fact that the rules under the Statute make invidious distinctions between Natives appointed under them and their Covenanted brethren, as regards pay and pension.

The *President*—continued.

3. If a desire is felt for enrolment in a general Service, what are the reasons for this desire?—Because if they were admitted to the ranks of the Civil Service their position would be more secure, their pay higher, and their prospects generally better.

4. Do you think the term "Natives of India" well defined in the Act?—I do not think it requires amendment.

5. Assuming the Statutory system to be retained, what amendments would you suggest in the rules with a view to remove any reasonable objections which may be felt to them?—The chief alteration I suggest in the rules is that a system of limited competition should be combined with one of simple nomination, which, I believe, is all that is required by the rules of 1879. The object of this change is to secure men of high attainments. The competitive examination should be in English, as I think a thorough knowledge of that language is indispensable.

6. Practically you approve of the system we have adopted in this Province for the appointment of Extra Assistant Commissioners?—Yes. My experience of the Statutory Civil Service is confined to Sirdar Gurdial Singh.

7. Does his work differ materially from that of the officers of the Uncovenanted Service?—I should say that his is distinctly

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

The Hon'ble Colonel *W. G. Davies*, C.S.I.

The *President*—continued.

better. I have not seen the work of the other Statutory Natives; but he is a man of very high educational qualifications. My experience of the Statutory system is very limited.

8. How would a system of limited competition amongst persons nominated for this purpose by the Local Governments or by the Universities, or by those authorities concurrently or alternately, be regarded?—I do not think nomination by the Universities would be a good system. They might, however, send up some names to Government.

9. In preference to either of the above systems (nomination and limited competition), would a system of open competition, pure and simple, for the Statutory Service commend itself to the Native community?—I should say it probably would, but the system would not be a good one, and would be practically difficult, if not impossible, to work owing to the great numbers who would compete. By it, moreover, you secure no guarantee as to moral and physical fitness. If there is to be any competition at all for these appointments, it should be a limited one amongst selected candidates.

10. If competition (whether limited or open) is preferred, should there be one competition for all India, or separate competitions in each Province?—I will deal with that question further on pretty fully. There is one great objection to a system of open competition: the result of it would be that Natives of the Provinces where education is most advanced would get all the appointments, and would not be fitted for employment in the frontier Provinces.

To Mr. *Crosthwaite*.—I am opposed to the Statutory system altogether.

11. Under any of the three systems of nomination, limited competition, and open competition, would you prescribe any tests of preliminary qualifications on the part of nominees or candidates in regard to (1) age, (2) intellectual capacity, (3) moral, social, and physical fitness? If so, what should be the tests under each of the heads specified?—As regards age: not less than 20 and not more than 25 years. As regards intellectual capacity, candidates should either have taken B.A. at one of the Universities or passed an examination equal to that required for that degree. As regards moral and physical qualifications, the conditions laid down for candidates for appointment as Extra Assistant Commissioner by competition in this Province should be prescribed.

Mr. *Hudson*.

12. If you have a competition combined with selection, would it be possible, in this Province, to select a sufficient number of persons to make a genuine competition?—Oh, yes. There would be no difficulty about that. There would be ample competition. There is great competition for the Extra

Mr. *Hudson*—continued.

Assistant Commissionerships. The nominations are made by the Financial Commissioner and the Chief Court under certain rules. The candidate must be between certain ages and fulfil a number of other conditions as to education, &c.

13. Would you be able to nominate a sufficient number of persons?—Any number. There would be a great number of applications for admission to the examination, and it would be very difficult to assign grounds for not allowing men to compete if they fulfilled the conditions.

I may mention that before they are accepted their names are submitted by the Financial Commissioner; and the Chief Court Judges, I think, send up a certain number of names every year. Of course the Financial Commissioner receives an immense number of applications which are not accepted, so that the number that applies is far greater than the fifty who are accepted by the Government. I think the number of nominations is 25 from the Financial Commissioner and 10 from the Chief Court Judges.

To Mr. *Stokes*.—I do not think there have been complaints from any persons that they have been unduly excluded from the competition for Extra Assistant Commissionerships. The man who obtains the highest number of marks is selected. It is a selection by pure competition after nomination by the Financial Commissioner and the Chief Court Judges and acceptance by the Local Government.

The *President*.

14. Should additional facilities be given to Natives for proceeding to England and entering the Indian Civil Service by the channel of the English competition? If so, what form or forms should such facilities take? What conditions, if any, should be attached to them?—The only facility which is, I think, desired by Natives in the Punjab is that the limit of age for admission to the competition should be raised to 21 years. I should myself be inclined to raise it still higher—to, say, 22 or 23 years. Twenty-one is what the Natives themselves wish.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*.

15. Do you not think the expense of the journey to England would be a bar?—It would certainly; but I think it is rather a good thing to have a bar of that kind. It will ensure having men of good social position.

Mr. *Ryland*.

16. Do not you think it would affect the Eurasian and European communities quite as much as the Natives?—Not the pure Europeans. It would certainly affect the domiciled Europeans. I approve of this bar for Eurasians as well as Natives of India.

Mr. *Ryland*—continued.

17. What class or classes of Natives in your Province readily go to England?—Very few have as yet gone to England from this Province. I only know of three. I believe if the age limit were raised many more would go home to study for the Civil Service. The reason that so few have gone is that the age limit is too low at present. The question of the raising of the age limit cannot affect those who have gone to England to study for the Bar.

I believe very few Natives of this Province have as yet gone. If the age were raised, I am quite sure large numbers would go.

Some have gone for the public competition, others for private objects.

The *President*.

18. Are objections entertained to going to England; and if so, what are they, and by what classes in particular are they felt?—Objections are certainly entertained to going to England, but the feeling is for the most part confined to Hindus, and, among Hindus, to Brahmins and men of the "bania" class. This prejudice is, however, rapidly wearing out as English education advances and in another generation will, I feel sure, altogether disappear.

To the Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*.—This is the result of personal enquiry. It is a well-known fact that men of the "bania" caste are very particular as to what they eat. None of that particular class have gone that I know of. My enquiries have been going on for some time. I have had conversations with Natives on the subject. I think it is desirable that such prejudices should be eradicated. Of the gentlemen I have referred to as having gone to England, one has returned qualified as a Barrister. He is about 33 or 34 years of age; I think he has had no difficulty with his caste. There is a prejudice amongst Hindus against crossing the seas. I think the men I have referred to as having gone to England occupy the same position as before as regards their families and society: I should not like to say so positively. There is one particular class of Brahmins in the Punjab that takes service very largely.

19. Assuming the examination in England to be the only examination for both English and Native candidates, do you consider that the subjects and standards of examination, and the conditions as to age and other matters, in any respect place Native candidates at a disadvantage as compared with English candidates? If so, in what respects are Native candidates placed at a disadvantage, and what alterations would you recommend with a view to remove that disadvantage?—Undoubtedly Native candidates are heavily handicapped as regards the subjects and standards of examination, and these disadvantages are increased by the low limit of age at which the competition takes place. The Native candidate has to compete with the European candidate in what is to

The *President*—continued.

the former a foreign language, which he probably does not commence to learn before he is 12 or 13 years of age; and he must therefore be greatly behind the latter at the age when the competition takes place. In addition to this, he has to undertake a long and expensive journey before he reaches the place where the examination takes place, and to live there among foreigners for at least two or three years. While there he must incur considerable expense and run risks to his health and to his morals, and, after having incurred all this expense and run these risks, he may fail at last to secure a place among the successful candidates.

These disadvantages cannot be altogether removed, but they may be greatly lessened by raising the limit of age as already proposed by me. The only other change that might be made would be to allow Indian candidates to take up Arabic and Sanskrit instead of Greek and Latin, and to mark the two former as high as the two latter languages. I am, however, somewhat doubtful as to this, as I think that a thorough knowledge of English is necessary in the case of members of the Indian Civil Service, and it is doubtful if this could be obtained without a knowledge of Latin at least.

20. The Commissioners of 1855 thought the standard of education for the Civil Service should be a distinctly English one, and the most finished that could be afforded in England. Would not that standard be affected if Arabic and Sanskrit be substituted for Latin and Greek?—I am doubtful about that.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

21. Would you offer no other facilities?—I am of opinion that only as regards age should Natives receive facilities for competition in England.

To Mr. *Ryland*.—I consider that a Native arrives at maturity, to some extent, earlier than an Englishman.

The difference, however, is not so very great. I think a Native and an Englishman would be more upon a par in that respect at 23 than at 17. My idea is that the age limit should be raised in both cases. I refer to Natives properly so called. I daresay my remark applies also, to some extent, to Eurasians.

22. Would an open competition in India be likely to give decided advantages to any particular class or classes of the Native community over others? Would it be likely to lead to the undue preponderance of any one class or caste in the public Service? Do you think there are any objections on political or administrative grounds to open competition in India?—To the first and second questions,—yes; to the inhabitants of those Provinces where education is more advanced, as Bengal, Madras, and Bombay, and the result would be a preponderance in the public Service of men of those parts of India who ordinarily enter our Service. These are chiefly Hindus.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

The Hon'ble Colonel *W. G. Davies*, C.S.I.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

To the third question,—yes. These men are for the most part weak and effeminate, wanting in moral and physical courage and independence of character; and owing to these defects of character, it would not be safe to employ them in the higher administrative posts hitherto almost exclusively filled by Europeans, especially in those Provinces, like the Punjab, Burmah, and parts of Bombay and the North-Western Provinces, where the population is composed of manly, independent, and, in places, excitable races who require a strong hand to rule them. My answer to the last question is given on the assumption that the competition is to be general for the whole empire.

Mr. *Stewart.*

23. To what class do you apply the terms "weak and effeminate?"—Generally speaking, to Hindus, but I particularly refer to those of Bengal. In the Punjab we have districts in very different degrees of progress. What I say would apply to the old Delhi Division, except that the inhabitants of that Division are a very martial race. Many of the Jats of Delhi enter our army in large numbers.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

24. Assuming there were an open competition for all India, would it still be competent for the Administration to assign to successful candidates the Provinces in which they should be employed?—Yes, but I mean to say that all the appointments might fall to Bengalis who are far more advanced in education.

25. Would you be content with indifferently educated persons?—I do not think it follows that they would be indifferently educated.

The *President.*

26. Would you rather have an indifferently educated member of a race in the Punjab than a highly cultured Bengali?—Most certainly. My answer is based, to a certain extent, upon actual experience.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

27. Can you cite any experience in which you have found a Bengali employed in an administrative capacity in the Punjab or any other Province?—I do not think there is a single Bengali in administrative employ in the Punjab.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

28. Are not Eurasians and domiciled Europeans largely employed in the Punjab?—I would not exclude them from employment here. Some of our best officers belong to that class.

29. Were those officers Natives of the Punjab, or taken from other parts of India?—One, at all events was.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

30. How would you arrange a competition in this Province?—You might have a Provincial one. Europeans and Eurasians would compete in their own Provinces. It should be an open competition.

Mr. *White.*

31. But subject to certain rules as to moral and physical fitness?—The only conditions of that kind you could impose would, I should think, be always fulfilled. They are, to a certain extent, formal. Physical fitness is, after all, merely relative. You want something more; you want strength of character. You could not determine that by any previous test. There are certain branches of the administration in which strength of character is less required. In the judicial branches, for instance.

The *President.*

32. Do you think you would get by open competition in India the qualifications required for dealing with a situation like the Delhi riots and frontier riots?—No, I do not think so.

33. Would it be preferable (*a*) to require the successful candidates at the examination in India to go to England, or (*b*) to give them the option of going to England, suitable allowances being given to enable them to prosecute their studies there?—If a competitive examination were held in India—a plan to which I am much opposed—I would require the successful candidate to go to England, giving him a suitable allowance to enable him to prosecute his studies there. I think contact with European civilisation, manners, and modes of thought is necessary to the completion of the education of a Native who is to be employed in the higher branches of the civil administration of this country.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

34. To make a European of him?—I would make him as much a European as is possible. I think his moral fibre would be strengthened by going to England.

The *President.*

35. Should provision be made for the appointment of qualified members of the Uncovenanted Service to the higher Covenanted offices without requiring them to pass through the lower grades?—If the Statutory system is maintained, I would allow Local Governments to fill up by selection from the Uncovenanted grades, to the extent allowed by the Government of India, posts usually held by Covenanted Civilians. No special provision appears necessary; the matter must be left to the discretion of Local Governments. For many years to come, in this Province the number of such appointments will be restricted by the difficulty of

The *President*—continued.

finding men in the Uncovenanted ranks with the necessary high English qualifications.

The power should be exercised only in very exceptional cases, *e.g.* Extra Judicial Assistant Commissioners might be appointed District and Divisional Judges. I could name several of the former of "proved merit and ability" who might well be so appointed. It would not, however, be necessary for this purpose to retain the Statutory system; the appointments could be made under Sections 3 and 4 of Statute 24 and 25 Victoria, Chapter 54, with the sanction of the Secretary of State.

Mr. *Ryland.*

36. You say you would not admit members from the Uncovenanted Service to the higher grades?—I do not say that. I said I would admit them, but only in very exceptional cases. In the case of a man of good family with distinguished educational attainments, for political reasons, I would allow the Local Government a power of nomination.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

37. Did not the appointment of Diwan Ram Nath affect the Covenanted Service?—The appointment of Ram Nath under the Act of 1862 did not prejudicially affect any Covenanted Civilians who joined after 1862, and, in point of fact, the men who complained they were affected by it would be presumed to have had notice and taken their appointments subject to the possible action of Government under that Statute. At the sametime, if that Statute were freely used, its effect would undoubtedly be prejudicial. I apprehend the Act was intended to meet purely exceptional cases, and that the reasons should be stated for the appointment, which would be merely provisional and subject to the sanction of the Secretary of State with the concurrence of the majority of the members of his Council.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

38. Should you object to vakils and practitioners being appointed?—I should object, because my opinion is that no appointment should be made to the Covenanted Civil Service except by competition in England.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

39. You say you would fill all the appointments under the Statute of 1870 by selection?—Nearly all.

40. Would you select from the senior or junior ranks of the Service?—I do not think we could select from the senior ranks, because we have not got the men fitted for it. I would select from wherever I found the men fitted for it.

Mr. *Ryland.*

41. Would you prevent a man rising to selected posts *pari passu* with the others?—Yes, because every appointment is a new appointment. I would do away with Section 6 altogether, and then I would promote them in the same way as any other Civil Servant.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

42. Do you think it desirable that the Local Government should have any power whatever to promote outsiders on the ground of merit to posts reserved for the Covenanted Service?—I have said I would give them that power in exceptional cases.

43. Then in point of fact you wish the power retained?—I would not have a separate Statutory Service. The difficulty is in the rules. I would retain the power to appoint in exceptional cases.

The *President.*

44. Do you consider that Indian schools at present develop the force of character and other qualities required for English administration?—I am not quite sure that I understand this question. I do not believe that schools develop force of character. This is in part inherited by individuals, and in part the characteristic of race. If it is there, the schools may, to some extent, strengthen it. They cannot unfold it if it is not there. It it sadly wanting in the majority of the classes which attend the schools in India, and the educational system in this country is not calculated to strengthen it, where it does exist, to the extent to which our schools in England do this.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

45. To what schools do you refer?—When I speak of schools in England I refer to public schools.

To Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*—The character of these schools may have some effect upon it, but they cannot, of course, supply force of character, which is inherent in certain races and individuals also.

To Sir *Charles Turner.*—I do not think our Indian schools have at their head men sufficiently qualified to strengthen character.

Mr. *Ryland.*

46. Do you think it so much the fault of the men as of the system?—I think it is the men.

47. To come back to the question:—Do you think it necessary there should be some sort of reservation of posts in the Covenanted Civil Service in the hands of Government for the appointment of Europeans, to meet cases of exceptional difficulty?—Yes, for those already in the Service; in future you will have no pure Europeans appointed to the Uncovenanted Civil Service.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

The Hon'ble Colonel *W. G. Davies*, C.S.I.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

48. If a larger number of the appointments which are now reserved to the Covenanted Service are thrown open to the Natives of India in general, would you, to countervail the larger introduction of Asiatics, give a special power to the Government to appoint Europeans to the Uncovenanted Service?—That question will be specially dealt with later on.

The *President.*

49. What has been the actual experience in your Province as to the general efficiency of educated Natives—graduates of the Indian Universities—employed in administrative work?—Very few of these men (there are I find twelve in all) have been employed in this Province in executive work; they have been chiefly employed in judicial work. The few who have been employed in executive business have performed it efficiently.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

50. Ought not the Uncovenanted Service, equally with the Covenanted Service, to be open to all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—My answer is yes.

51. Under any system of appointment would you say yes?—Yes.

52. Supposing the appointment is purely of patronage or selection?—Under any system, provided the candidate possessed the prescribed qualification.

Mr. *White.*

53. Would not that have the effect of abrogating the definition of "Native of India" in the Act of 1870?—That Act only refers to the Covenanted Service.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

54. What is your experience of a system of appointment by patronage?—I have had some experience of the working of patronage, and my opinion of its working is favourable generally.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

55. Do not you think that if the Uncovenanted Service is thrown open both to Europeans and Natives, no matter by what system of appointment and selection, it will infallibly lead to the appointment of relatives and sons of officers in the Service?—I hope not. That would depend a great deal on the system adopted. In almost every Province certain qualifications have been prescribed, and of course it depends upon what system is followed. I do not think I should approve of a system of pure patronage; but if such a system should be adopted, there is no reason why a European should not be appointed. Patronage only extends to the nomination. All candidates are obliged to pass the departmental examinations.

The *President.*

56 Is there any reason, with regard to appointment to the Uncovenanted Service, why there should be a different system in the appointment of Europeans and Natives?—Yes, I think so.

57. To what extent could the prescribed Covenanted Civil Service *cadre* in your Province be reduced if a corresponding increase were made in the English element of the Uncovenanted Service, or in the Native element, or partly in one and partly in the other?—It is difficult to answer this question off-hand, but there can be no doubt that the Civil Service *cadre* could be gradually reduced as the supply of highly educated Natives increases; and I am distinctly of opinion that as this takes place the more expensive agency of the Covenanted Service should be more and more restricted to such high appointments as cannot with safety, in the present condition of the country, be entrusted to Native officials, and that all the lower and less important posts should be filled by Natives.

58. There are certain parts of the Punjab where you come in contact with wild tribes. Do you consider that the proportion of European officers of the Civil Service should be reduced in those districts?—Certainly not, and therefore it would probably take much longer in that Province to reduce the number than in others. On the frontier, for instance, it will be some time before you can safely substitute Natives for Europeans.

59. Assuming a fixed proportion to be maintained between Europeans and Natives in the Civil Service *cadre*, in what posts or classes of appointments do you consider that Europeans and Natives respectively might be employed with most advantage to the interests of the public Service?—The Europeans should, for the present, be employed in the higher administrative posts, such as Financial Commissioner, Commissioner, and Deputy Commissioner; and Natives in such posts as Munsif, Tahsíldár, Extra Assistant Commissioner, Extra Judicial Assistant Commissioner, Judge of Small Cause Court, District and Divisional Judge, and Judge of the Chief Court.

60. Practically, then, you would say that the higher executive appointments should be in European hands, but the lower ones might be filled by Natives?—I do not think that system would have in it the element of finality, and perhaps in time you might appoint Natives to higher administrative posts. I think, however, that at the head it will always be necessary to have Europeans. I do not think there is a district in this Province at the present time to the Deputy Commissionership of which a Native could properly be appointed. In the Statutory sense, however, you have a Native Deputy Commissioner already.

61. Would it be desirable to rule that the proportion of persons, being Hindus and Mahomedans respectively, who are from time

The *President*—continued.

to time, or over a series of years, appointed to the Covenanted ranks in any Province, should bear a certain relation to the numbers of the two classes composing the population of the Province concerned?—It would be difficult, without lowering the standard of educational qualifications, to carry out a system of that sort.

62. How is the present system of regulating appointments to the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, regarded by influential sections of the Native community?—The following is the present system of regulating appointments to the Subordinate Executive and Judicial Services. I take the former first. *Tahsíldárs.*—These are appointed from among (*a*) Naib-Tahsíldárs who have passed the departmental examination prescribed for Tahsíldars and Munsifs and have served for two years in that post with credit, and (*b*) accepted candidates for the post of Tahsíldár. In accepting candidates for this post, regard is had to (1) good birth, (2) services rendered to the State by the family to which the proposed candidate belongs, and (3) educational attainments. It is under consideration to attach more and more weight to the third of these qualifications. Next, as to the Judicial Service. *Munsifs.*—Half are selected by competition under rules framed by the Chief Court and published with their Book Circular No. XIV of the 23rd October 1884, and the other half from a list of accepted candidates for the post. The rules for accepting candidates are given in the same Circular. *Extra Assistant Commissioners.*—These officers are employed in both executive and judicial duties. They are appointed partly by nomination from among the best Tahsíldárs and Munsifs, and partly by competition. The rules on the subject will be found in Punjab Government Notifications No. 804 of the 25th July 1885 and No. 1397 of the 12th September 1885. The larger proportion are appointed by selection from the posts of Tahsíldár and Munsif. All candidates of this class are required, before acceptance, to pass the higher standard examination prescribed for Assistant and Extra Assistant Commissioners. Opinions regarding this system, especially the competition portion of it, are much divided. The more influential section of the Native community, including in that term the nobility and *gentry* of the Province, do not like the system of competition, as it, to a great extent, shuts out their children from the appointments given under that system,—for the latter have no chance against the sons of the middle classes, including the clerks and munshis in the Government Service, who are from their youth trained to pass examinations, and have hereditary aptitude for acquiring book learning. Those who belong to this class, and the lower classes generally, have not the same objection to the competitive system, as it gives their children an opportunity of obtaining highly

The *President*—continued.

paid appointments at the outset of their career.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

63. What class of boys go to the Chief's College?—The boys who go to the Chief's College are boys of whom some would take service.

The *President.*

64. Has the existing system the effect of securing for the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, persons who are found to be thoroughly qualified for the performance of their duties?—Not that portion of the system which I have just referred to. The young men who obtain appointments by competition have every intellectual qualification for the performance of their duties, but have had no previous training, and are altogether wanting in experience. On the other hand, those appointed to posts in the Subordinate Executive and Judicial Services by nomination from inferior posts, such as Naib-Tahsíldárs and others to Tahsíldárships and Munsifships, and Tahsíldárs and Munsifs to Extra Assistant Commissionerships, must, under the rules referred to, be thoroughly qualified. The best men are selected from a large list of men who have served for many years in posts in which they have had opportunities of gaining both revenue and judicial experience, and before appointment to the superior grades they have to pass a severe departmental examination.

65. But is it not a fact that the Deputy Commissioners have reported very favourably of these competitive men?—Yes, but only after they had acquired experience.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

66. With regard to men appointed from inferior posts in the revenue branch, can you say from your experience of them that they have afterwards shown themselves more liable to corruption than men selected by competition?—No, they never come from very inferior posts. They generally begin as Naib Tahsíldárs on a pay of Rs. 50. Appointments below the grade of Extra Assistant Commissioner are not made by the Government, but by the Financial Commissioner, or, as regards those belonging to the Judicial Department, by the Chief Court. I do not think we have had a single case of judicial officers being appointed from the local Bar except to the Chief Court. I don't remember any case of a Pleader being made Munsif. I don't think a single member of the local Bar has been appointed to the public Service.

To Mr. *Crosthwaite.*—I don't think we have any members of the professional classes fit for such appointments. Extra Assistant Commissioners are paid up to Rs. 800, and

Vol I. Sec. II. Punjab.

The Hon'ble Colonel *W. G. Davies*, C.S.I.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

Extra Judicial Assistant Commissioners up to Rs. 1,000.

67. Do you see any reasons of a public nature why appointments should be offered to members of the professional classes?—It might be, as Sir Charles Turner says, a means of raising the general tone of the Bar.

68. A Pleader who has been ten years at the Bar is more likely to make a better judicial officer than a man who has had no experience at all?—Our Tahsildárs would have judicial experience, both civil and criminal. In special cases we have lately given our Naib-Tahsildárs judicial powers. We have also Sheristadars who have judicial experience to the extent that they have been reading in the judicial offices. They are often exceedingly able men.

The *President*.

69. If any class or classes of persons are expressly or practically excluded from appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Judicial Services, how is such exclusion justified?—I presume it is justified by the consideration that, by means of competition, you obtain men who are more highly educated and who possess high English qualifications. Against this has to be set the fact that the men who succeed in these competitions do not generally belong to the more manly and courageous races of this Province. My objection to the system of competition for high posts in the Uncovenanted Service is that its tendency is to exclude, in a great measure, men belonging to these races, whose co-operation in the administration must at all times be useful, and in any crisis would be invaluable.

70. What has been the effect on the efficiency of the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services in your Province of the orders of the Government of India dated 18th April 1879, which debar, unless with the previous sanction of the Governor-General in Council, (1) the appointment of any person, not being a Native of India within the Statutory meaning, to an office carrying a salary of Rs. 200 a month or upwards, and (2) the promotion to such an office of persons, not being Statutory Natives, who entered the Department concerned after the 1st January 1879?—The orders referred to have not, in my opinion, affected the efficiency of these services.

71. Is it in your opinion necessary that there should be a proportion of Europeans either in the Subordinate Executive Service, or in the Subordinate Judicial Service, or in both of those Services?—No, not pure Europeans.

72. How do European members of the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, work with Native members of those Services?—Very well. There are very few pure Europeans in these Services. As regards that last question, I understand it to mean working with them, not under them. Men holding the same positions relatively. They work well together. I have never known of a case of a European in this Province who refused to work under a Native, but I do not remember any case in which a European has been called upon to do so, and I don't think any case has occurred.

The *President*—continued.

73. Generally, what system do you advocate for filling appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services as above defined?—The existing system, barring the competition portion of it, is, I think, very suitable. The only change which I should be inclined to make would be to make all, or nearly all, enter at the bottom of the list. The exceptions should be in favour of the sons of men of very high rank, or of men who have very highly distinguished themselves.

74. What preliminary qualifications would you require on the part of candidates for those appointments in regard to age and in other respects?—Candidates should be between 20 and 25 years of age—should give evidence that they possess a minimum educational qualification equal to the Entrance examination of the Punjab University—should furnish a certificate of physical fitness—should give satisfactory evidence of (1) good moral character, of (2) habits of personal activity, and (3) gentlemanly bearing; and, if *Hindustani* is not their vernacular, should furnish proof that they have passed the examination in that language by the higher standard.

Mr. *Stewart*.

75. Where do they obtain their certificates?—They get their certificate of physical fitness from medical men; their certificates of moral character are generally got from their schoolmasters.

The *President*.

76. Do you advocate the requirement of a probationary period; and if so, what should be the incidents of such period as to duration, pay, and in other respects?—Yes, all appointments should be probationary until the prescribed departmental examinations have been passed—pay should be under the existing rules.

Mr. *Ryland*.

77. If any changes of a disadvantageous character are made in regard to Uncovenanted officers already in the Service, ought these changes to be allowed a retrospective effect?—I should say they ought not.

WITNESS II.—15th December 1886.

Examination of Sardar Bahadur MAHOMED HYAT KHAN, C.S.I., of the Statutory Civil Service, Assistant Commissioner; Officiating District Judge, Mooltan.

The *President.*

78. Would you be good enough to tell us briefly the nature of your official career?—I began public life as *Aid-de-Camp* to General Nicholson; after that I was appointed a Tahsíldár; then I became an Extra Assistant Commissioner, and on the 30th January 1872 I became an Assistant Commissioner. I am now an Assistant Commissioner of the first class, acting as District Judge.

79. What is the prevalent feeling in your Province regarding the existing Statutory system? If the feeling is one of dissatisfaction, is the dissatisfaction general or is it confined to certain sections of the community?—The existing Statutory system is not understood by the general public, but the enlightened members of the community regard it with dissatisfaction.

80. What are the grounds upon which that feeling is based?—There are several grounds—*first*, the enlightened section of the community regards the Statutory system as being productive of no good to the country, because the people of England,—nay, even the Government,—argue that, having devised this system of employing Natives of India in the higher posts, they are not bound to afford such facilities as are proposed to enable the Natives of India to take a share in the competitive Civil Service; *secondly*, the Statutory Civilians are not placed upon an equal footing with their Covenanted brethren; *thirdly*, they are not appointed to the posts to which they would have been appointed had they been members of the Covenanted Service.

81. What do you mean by that?—Statutory Civilians are passed over in favour of some other officers in the Service. I myself have been passed over several times. Sardar Gurdial Singh has also been passed over several times. Junior Assistant Commissioners are now acting in higher appointments than I am; for instance, men like Mr. W. O. Clark, who has been acting in the Lahore district for three years as Deputy Commissioner, whilst I have been acting as Assistant Commissioner, and now as District Judge. I am three or four places above him. Mr. Rennie was put above Gurdial Singh as acting Deputy Commissioner, and two or three Extra Assistant Commissioners, who are not even Covenanted men, have been put above him; for instance, Mr. Delmerick at Umballa. He was not

The *President*—continued.

superseded for any length of time, but I was. I am not a Statutory Civilian under the present rules, but was appointed in 1871 under the rules then in force. I complain that I was not selected for the charge of a district. No fault was found with my work that I know of. When my junior was appointed Divisional Judge, I again represented the matter to Government. That was a purely judicial appointment, and I should have got it. I got a reply that it was only temporary, for the purpose of clearing off arrears, and that there was no ground of complaint.

Reverting to question No. 80, *witness said:*—The *fourth* ground of dissatisfaction is that the Statutory Service is paid at a lower rate than the Covenanted—getting only 64 per cent. of the pay drawn by the latter; *fifthly*, the mode and standard of selection are not good.

82. Is the feeling of dissatisfaction directed against the Statute itself (33 Vic., Chapter 3, Section 6), or is it directed against the rules framed thereunder?—The feeling of dissatisfaction is directed against the rules.

83. What amendments do you advocate in Section 6 of the Statute?—The section requires no amendment.

84. Do you consider that Section 6 of the Statute supplies such a definition of the words "Natives of India" as describes with sufficient clearness, fulness, and accuracy the various classes of persons for whose appointment to Covenanted posts it is desirable to provide?—Yes, the definition of the words "Natives of India" is clear, full, and accurate.

85. If the objections are directed against the rules framed under the Statute, do they relate to the mode or modes of selection actually adopted?—There are objections to the rules framed under the Statute, and they relate to the modes of selection actually adopted. The selections have not yet been made by applying any test or standard of qualification; and it is with hesitation that men who are appointed are allowed their proper privileges and promotion in their turn; and this, instead of giving satisfaction, causes dissatisfaction and leads to the conclusion that the selection was not made on the ground of proved ability.

86. Do they relate to the general conditions in regard to pay, promotion, and retiring annuity under which Statutory Civilians

The *President*—continued.

hold their offices?—Yes, they do. Because Statutory Civilians are often in receipt of less pay than their Uncovenanted contemporaries, and the amount of pension and annuity of the former falls short of the latter.

87. Assuming the Statutory system to be retained, what amendments would you suggest in the rules with a view to remove any reasonable objections which may be felt to them?—The candidates should be selected by an open competition instead of by nomination. (2) If it be desirable to promote an Uncovenanted officer of proved merit and ability to such post, instead of passing through the lower grades, he should be admitted to the post for which his antecedents and emoluments qualify him. (3) Their pay, promotion, and retiring annuity should be regulated on the same basis as those of the Covenanted Service. (4) Except in the case of persons entering Government Service for the first time, the period of probation should not be compulsory.

88. Do Statutory Civilians regard themselves as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the Covenanted Service through the competitive channel?—Yes.

89. Are they so regarded by the general public?—Yes.

90. By their *confréres* in the Service who have entered through the competitive channel?—Yes.

91. Do the general public recognise any difference in the status of Statutory Civilians and that of Uncovenanted officers?—There is some jealousy of Native Civilians, and a kind of feeling among some Covenanted Civilians that they are passed over unfairly by men who have not passed a competitive examination. The two classes do not show great friendship for one another.

92. Do young men among the landed aristocracy, or of good family, display unwillingness to accept posts in the Uncovenanted Service and a willingness to accept employment under the Statutory rules?—Yes, but only for the sake of the distinction between the titles of the offices held.

93. On the assumption that the Statutory system is retained, how would appointment to the Statutory Service by nomination be regarded by influential sections of the Native community in your Province?—The enlightened do not regard a system of appointment by nomination with favour, but the *Raises* and men of good family do.

94. How many Statutory Civilians are there in this Province? Are they fit men?—There are only six Statutory Civilians in the Province. Some of them are well qualified, some are not.

95. How would a system of nomination, to be followed by a period of probation, be regarded by influential sections of the Native community?—The enlightened would deem it necessary for a new candidate's nomination to be followed by a period of probation; while the *Raises* and men of good family would adopt the course which affords them most facilities: the general public have no opinion on the subject.

A system of nomination, with or without probation, would be likely to secure well-qualified persons only to a very limited extent. Experience has shown that such a system secured very few well-qualified officers.

96. Do you consider that nomination should be confined to persons of proved merit and ability?—Yes, certainly, in the case of Government employés.

97. If so, how do you consider that merit and ability should be held to have been proved for this purpose?—The merit and ability of persons already in employ should be tested by their antecedents; and those of new candidates by a standard of examinat on not below the First Arts or B.A. degree of a University.

98. Are men of good family sufficiently advanced in point of education, and would they not object to compete?—They are not so advanced in education as others: they have no objections, on the score of dignity, to entering into competition.

99. How would a system of limited competition amongst persons nominated for this purpose by the Local Governments, or by the Universities, or by those authorities concurrently or alternately, be regarded?—The enlightened would not like a system of limited competition amongst nominated persons; but the *Raises* would prefer it to open competition. There should be separate competition in each Province. If there were only one general examination for the whole of India, it would be impossible to secure a due proportion of appointments to the population of the several Provinces. One system of selection for all India is impossible.

100. Under any of the three systems of nomination, limited competition, and open competition, would you prescribe any tests of preliminary qualifications on the part of nominees or candidates in regard to (1) age, (2) intellectual capacity, (3) moral, social, and physical fitness?—Yes, for new candidates (1) the age should not be more than 25 years, (2) education not less than a graduate, (3) good moral and gentlemanly behaviour, which every candidate should be taken to possess unless the contrary be proved. Sound health should be proved by a certificate of some medical officer. For persons promoted from the Uncovenanted Service a practical knowledge of English would be essential. There should be a period of probation for new candidates only, extending over two years. The probationary period should be passed in the ranks of the Covenanted Service. Special training after selection, and before entering on probation (or on duty), is requisite. Such special training should be carried out in England, the same pay being granted as for the probationary term; the period for training should be counted as part of the period of probation.

The *President*—continued.

101. Are you in favour of the establishment of scholarships tenable by Natives in England to enable them to qualify for the Civil or Statutory Service?—Scholarships should be established for the Civil Service only.

Mr. *Peacock.*

102. Would you pay the passages of any one who desired to compete?—All candidates who wish to go to England for competition should have their passages paid.

The *President*

103. Is competition of Natives in the examination in England favourably looked upon by large and important classes? Should additional facilities be given to Natives for proceeding to England and entering the Indian Civil Service by the channel of the English competition?—Competition of Natives in the examination held in England is favourably looked upon by all the enlightened classes. Additional facilities should be given to enable them to go and compete. I would pay passage-money to all who went, and would give Rs. 3,000 a year to successful candidates for the period required to complete their special study. The candidate should enter into an agreement with the Local Government binding himself (1) to appear in the competition, (2) to satisfy the Secretary of State quarterly or half-yearly that he is making progress, and (3) to repay the amount, on appointment, by instalments not exceeding 25 per cent. of his pay. But no person who dies or is thrown out of employment should be called upon to refund the amount thus received by him. Native audidates who had shown merit in the English competition, but had fallen short of success, might be appointed to the Statutory Service, or, in the absence of the Statutory Service, they should be given appointments in the Uncovenanted Service, having regard to their merits. Such persons should enter the Statutory Service on an equal footing with others. No Natives of this Province have, so far, presented themselves at the competition in England. Educated classes of every creed go readily to England.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

104. How many Natives of this Province have visited England for purposes of study?—Three Mahomedans and eleven Hindus have gone from this Province to England during the last six years. The Hindus belonged to various castes.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

105. How many have returned?—Nearly all of them have returned. The Hindus have all been taken back to their caste and

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter*—contd.

honourably treated except in one case, where the man married an Englishwoman. The objection against him was not on account of his going to England, but because of his marrying an Englishwoman. I do not know how many Brahmins have been to England. I think Suraj Bal is a *Gaur Brahmin.*

The *President.*

106. Are objections entertained to going to England; and if so, what are they, and by what classes in particular are they felt?—Formerly the people, being uneducated, entertained objections to going to England, but educational progress and development has considerably reduced the number of persons entertaining such objections, and now, on the contrary, persons returning, after having been trained in England, command respect from the educated and even more from their countrymen generally.

107. Should the examination for Natives in England be distinct in standards and conditions from that for English candidates, or should there be one and the same examination for all?—One and the same examination.

108. If a fixed proportion of appointments were allotted for Natives at the examination in England, do you consider that, in view of the objections against a voyage to England and life there, the cost thereof, and the chances of failure, a sufficient number of suitable candidates from your Province would be available to make the competition a real competition?—At present there would not be a sufficient number. But as soon as the proposed facilities and pecuniary help are granted, the number of such candidates will steadily and permanently continue to increase till such a time when a sufficient number for the competition will be available, and this difficulty is one of the grounds on which my reply to the last question was based.

109. If the examinations were distinct, what should be the limits of age for the Native examination?—In any case the limit of age for the Native examination should be 23 years.

110. Assuming only one examination in England for both English and Native candidates, do you consider that the subjects and standards of examination, and the conditions as to age and other matters, in any respect place Native candidates at a disadvantage as compared with English candidates?—Yes, certainly there are disadvantages.

111. If so, in what respects are Native candidates placed at a disadvantage, and what alterations would you recommend with a view to remove that disadvantage?—The disadvantages to the Native candidates are in respect of age, the limit of which should be raised from 19 to 23 years, on the following grounds, namely—the institutions for

The *President*—continued.

intellectual culture in India are not so well advanced and complete as in England, and hence the limit of 19 years of age does not suffice; the examination is held in a foreign language; the English candidates are natives of the soil and are examined on the spot. But it is not desired that the examination be not held in English, though the Natives have a great many difficulties to overcome. These, however, are small when compared with the advantages acquired by success. The addition of Urdu and Persian to the English, Latin, French, Greek, German, Arabic, and Sanskrit languages would make the examination more equal.

112. If there should be only one examination for all candidates, should the limits of age for Natives be higher than those at present fixed for European candidates; and if so, what should the limits for Native candidates be?—The limits of age should be the same for both, but the maximum should not be less than 23 years.

113. What is the average age at which Natives at the Indian Universities pass the examinations for F.A., B.A., and M.A., respectively?—F.A., 20 years; B.A., 22 years; M.A., 23 years.

114. From what classes of Native society are persons who graduate at the Indian Universities usually drawn in your Province?—The middle classes of Hindus and Mahomedans.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*.

115. In regard to the average age at which you say Natives pass University examinations, do you refer to this Province only?—My experience is confined to the Punjab.

The *President*.

116. Do you advocate a competition in India for the Civil Service simultaneously with the competition in England, the same question papers being used at both examinations?—No.

117. How would this method of selection be regarded by the Native community generally?—The Native community generally will regard the examination in India favourably.

118. Do you consider that the educational institutions available in India are at present capable of giving the very high class education which it was the object of the competitive system as introduced in 1855 to secure?—No.

119. Would an open competition in India be likely to give decided advantages to any particular class or classes of the Native community over others?—Looking to the present state of education among the several classes, a Hindu candidate would have the advantage in an examination—no matter where the competition is held.

120. Do you think there are any objections, on political or administrative grounds, to open competition in India?—Yes, simply because the preponderance of one class of persons in the public Service would give rise to dissatisfaction to the other, but the advantage gained by a competition should not be overlooked. I may say generally that I object to an examination in India. If Natives go to England, they will acquire wide knowledge of the world, and would thereafter mix more freely with Europeans. Besides, if they have passed in India, they will not be regarded by their European brethren as equal to those who have passed in England. All men of good family will prefer to go to England, and, though I am not hostile to the lower classes, yet, in the long run, the upper classes would be dissatisfied when they found that men of inferior social position went over their heads through competition in India. For administrative and political reasons, and for the good of the country, I would advocate competition in England. Such a system would surely create the closest friendship between the two nations.

Mr. *Stokes*.

121. What classes are sufficiently well off to go to England to compete?—I think men of the upper classes are sufficiently wealthy to be able to proceed to England; but very few of the lower classes are so, and perhaps also they have not spirit and courage enough to leave their homes. Besides, men of the upper class are more likely to mix in society in England.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar*.

122. What guarantee would the Government have, as regards the expenses incurred, that the person really intended to compete?—I propose that Government should pay their passage-money in the first instance, and, on their succeeding, allowances whilst in England. I would have the candidate give an undertaking to compete. I think if a candidate satisfies the Local Government that he is going to compete, that is sufficient.

Mr. *Stewart*.

123. Would you not require some test of his intellectual fitness?—I don't think so. The Civil Service examination is a sufficient guarantee, if he passes it, that a candidate is well educated.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

124. Would not a very large number of students without means avail themselves of the passage-money to go to England though they had no prospect of being successful?—They should give an undertaking to the Local Government, and every three months satisfy the Secretary of State that they are studying for the Civil Service, or refund the amount of their passage-money.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter*.

125. And would you not make them an allowance while preparing to compete?—Until a candidate passes the examination of physical fitness, I do not think Government would be justified in paying him an allowance. The passage-money would place him on an equal footing with English candidates. I would also pay his passage out in the event of his being successful.

The *President*.

126. Would the introduction of an open competitive examination in India have the effect of deterring candidates of leading families from aspiring to enter the ranks of the Civil Service?—The proportion will be inconsiderable, having regard to the present state of education. At first the members of leading families will have little chance, but as time passes they will become ambitious and will educate themselves.

127. Would the members of leading families be found willing to any great extent to educate themselves for a competitive examination?—I believe members of leading Native families would be willing to avail themselves of the same educational advantages as other people if they saw the benefit of doing so.

128. Under such a system how would it be possible to provide against the Natives of a Province in which education is comparatively backward being excluded from appointments in their own Province?—No other system save the one of Provincial examinations would prove effectual.

129. Would a system of Provincial examinations be preferable to one examination for the whole of India?—No, because the real object of testing high education by a competitive examination would not be gained, and a sufficient number of candidates would not be available in every Province so as to make the competition a real competition.

130. Under a system of open competition in India, would the successful candidates be regarded as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who entered the Service through the channel of the open competition in England?—Yes, because the examination would not be the only or the chief advantage of going to England: there would be other advantages to be gained, such as the development of thought and character; and, having regard to these, candidates who do not appear in the competition in England will be looked upon as being inferior.

131. Supposing that the Covenanted appointments were allotted in fixed proportions, a certain number to be obtained by competition in England and a certain number by competition in India, the examination in each case being open on fairly equal conditions to Native and English candidates alike, and the Statutory system being abolished, how would such a system be viewed?—The people generally would like it, but I should not.

Mr. *Stewart*.

132. I should like to know your reasons for the last answer?—Because it would give rise to invidious distinctions between persons who have passed in India and those who went to England to pass.

The *President*.

133. If an open competition were established in India, what would be the preliminary qualification required on the part of candidates in regard to age?—Twenty-three years of age.

134. In regard to minimum educational attainments?—No minimum educational qualification would be required, as the competitive examination itself would be sufficient to test the educational qualifications of the candidate.

135. In regard to moral, social, and physical fitness?—Of good moral character and social status, which a candidate should be taken to possess unless the contrary be proved; sound health, to be certified by a medical officer.

136. Should the subjects and conditions of the examination be the same as those prescribed for the competitive examination in England, or should they be different?—They should be the same with the addition of two other languages, viz. Persian and Urdu, though less marks might be allotted for each—say, 300 and 200 respectively.

137. Circumstances being different in the case of persons who enter through the examination in England and of persons who enter through the examination in India, is there any reason why the rules in regard to pay, leave, pension, &c., should not also be different?—This is open to objection, because it creates a difference in rank and dignity, which is disliked; also, and above all, because the money received by the Natives in the shape of pay or pension is used in the country, which derives benefit therefrom, but the amount received as such by the English is once for all taken out of India.

138. Would it be preferable (*a*) to require them to go to England, or (*b*) to give them the option of going to England; suitable allowances being given to enable them to prosecute their studies there?—Instead of their undergoing a special training in India they should be required to go to England.

139. Should successful candidates at the Indian competition be required to pass through a probationary period before final appointment?—There ought to be no other probationary period than the one of special training in England.

140. What special provision, if any, do you think should be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of deserving members of the Uncovenanted Service?—The special provision that should be made is that in each Province one-twentieth of the Covenanted appointments should be reserved for deserving Uncovenanted Civilians. There

The *President*—continued.

ought to be two lines of Service, viz. the Covenanted and the Uncovenanted, without any further distinction and difference as to designation; provided that when an Uncovenanted officer is promoted to a post higher than that which can be held by him in the Uncovenanted line, he should be entitled to receive 70 per cent. of the pay of the office to which he is promoted.

141. If such appointments are made, should they be restricted to the holders of any particular classes of appointments in the Uncovenanted Service; and if so, what classes?—Yes, to Judicial and Revenue Officers of the Uncovenanted line.

142. Should persons so appointed be appointed provisionally and be required to pass through a period of probation before final confirmation?—No.

143. Should provision be made for the appointment of qualified members of the Uncovenanted Service to the higher Covenanted offices without requiring them to pass through the lower grades?—Yes.

144. If certain appointments in the Covenanted grades are set apart for the Statutory Service, should a fixed proportion of these appointments be expressly reserved for persons of proved merit and ability in the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes.

145. Should special provision be made for the promotion to Covenanted posts of European members of the Uncovenanted Service?—No special provision is needed; they should be treated in the same manner as others.

146. Should special provision be made for the promotion to such posts of Eurasian or other members of the Uncovenanted Service who, though not Natives of pure descent, fall within the meaning attached in the Statute of 1870 to the term "Natives of India?"—No separate provision is required.

147. Ought not the Uncovenanted Service, equally with the Covenanted Service, to be open to all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty who possess the qualifications that may be from time to time prescribed?—No.

148. If the Uncovenanted Service is closed to any natural-born subjects of Her Majesty, on what grounds, bearing in mind the terms of Acts of Parliament and Her Majesty's Proclamation of 1st November 1858, is this to be justified?—Because the Parliamentary Acts and Her Majesty's Proclamation have not yet been acted upon as regards the facilities to be given to the Natives of India for admission to every branch of Service in India. The object of the Act and Proclamation was to give more privileges in the Service to the Natives of India; and to lay this line open to all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty other than the permanent Natives of India is to add to the restrictions under which the latter are suffering. As soon as the restrictions to the admission of Natives of India having regard to their ability, to every branch of the Service are removed, there will be no reason why the Uncovenanted Service should be closed to any natural-born subject of Her Majesty.

149. Is the rate of pay at present granted to Statutory Civilians during probation and on final appointment, respectively, sufficient?—No.

150. If not, on what grounds do you consider it insufficient, and what rates of pay should in your opinion be granted to Statutory Civilians (*a*) while on probation, and (*b*) on final confirmation in their appointments?—Because, as regards pay, an Extra Assistant Commissioner is in a better position; (*a*) while on probation the pay should not be less than Rs. 250 per mensem; (*b*) on confirmation their full pay should be regulated by that of the Covenanted Civilians, having regard to conditions as to departmental examinations.

151. Would these rates of pay be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the Uncovenanted Service?—With the exception of the pay for the period of probation, which would not be compulsory for an Uncovenanted officer, the scale of pay would be suitable. This does not apply to the case of an Uncovenanted officer of a higher grade who may be so appointed.

152. Would they be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the professional classes?—No.

153. How would you treat, in regard to pay, persons selected from these two classes, if appointed to the lowest grade of the Covenanted Service?—If appointed to the lowest grade, they must receive the pay fixed for that grade in the absence of any other course to follow.

154. How would you treat, in regard to pay, such persons if appointed to any of the higher Covenanted posts without being required to pass through the lower grades?—They should receive the pay of the grade to which they are appointed.

155. Would you approve of an arrangement by which the pay of appointments would be a fixed sum to be drawn by the holder, whether he is a Covenanted or a Statutory Civilian, with an additional staff allowance to be drawn by those only who enter the Service through the examination in England?—Yes, provided the pay of a Civilian be better than that of an Uncovenanted officer, an additional staff allowance should be drawn by those only who enter the Service through the examination in England. It is only just that a man who goes through a stiff examination like a competitive examination should get some extra pay. I do not think it would give rise to invidious distinctions. I would give it to both Natives and Europeans entering by competition in England.

156. If you consider there should be no difference of pay, how do you justify the application of the same rates of pay in the case of Natives who have satisfied the very high tests required by the examination in England and Natives who have not?—Because

The *President*—continued.

the posts and liabilities are equal, hence the pay should be equal, and a staff allowance would be fixed for those who have entered the Service by the competitive examination.

157. On the same assumption, what are your reasons for holding that the high rate of pay which is considered to be necessary to secure the services of persons of tested qualifications in a country far from their homes, and under various other unfavourable conditions, should be given to persons whose qualifications have not been so tested, and who serve in their own native country?—Because, under the existing system, the Statutory Civilians are in a position worse than that of an Extra Assistant Commissioner, while the office and responsibility are equal; therefore, to avoid this, it ought to be insisted on that no one, other than the successful candidates in the examination in England, should be appointed, with the exception of persons appointed to the posts reserved for the Uncovenanted Service.

158. Have you any remarks to make on the leave rules embodied in the Civil Leave Code which apply to Statutory Civilians?—The only remark is that during leave on medical certificate a Native Civil Servant should, like an Uncovenanted officer, be entitled to one-half his average salary for 30 months, and not, as laid down in Section 81 of the Civil Leave Code, for only 15 months.

159. After what length of service do you consider that such persons should be entitled to retire on pension?—The rule now in force for Native Civilians should hold good.

160. At what age should they be obliged to retire on pension?—The rule now in force might be retained.

161. After what length of service should they be obliged to retire on pension?—The rule now in force is suitable.

162. What amount of pension should in your opinion be granted to Natives so appointed if they serve the prescribed period for voluntary and compulsory retirement respectively?—The rules in force are suitable.

163. If, before serving the prescribed period for pension, they are compelled to retire on medical certificate, what gratuity, if any, would you give them?—According to the rules now in force.

164. How far is the existing system of education in the higher schools and colleges in India well adapted for training young men to the public Service? Can you suggest any improvements?—The existing system of education in India is good so far as it is required to qualify one for the subordinate posts, such as clerkships, &c., but it is not well adapted to secure the higher attainments required for the higher posts of the administration: therefore the establishment of a Central College in each Province is proposed for training a class in higher education, and in the various languages which are taught to the candidates for the Civil Service in England; and every student should be allowed to study in such class, no matter whether he is preparing for the Covenanted or Uncovenanted Service.

165. In 1854 Lord Macaulay's Committee were of opinion that the best, the most liberal, and the most finished education to be procured in England was a necessary qualification for admission to the Civil Service. Do Indian schools and colleges at present supply an education of so high a standard?—No.

166. Do you consider that Indian schools at present develop the force of character and other qualities required for English administration?—No.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

167. Does this apply to the Punjab only?—My experience is confined to the Punjab.

The *President.*

168. Do we now obtain for Government Service Natives of the classes who, under Native rule, carried on the civil administration of the country?—Not altogether, but there are persons in the Service whose ancestors carried on the civil administration during Native rule.

169. Where must we look for representatives of these classes, and how do you consider that their services could be best obtained?—To look out for and obtain them is not specially needed.

170. How far would any system of appointment which involves a journey to and residence in England be regarded by the Native community as open to objection on the ground that it requires Hindu candidates to abandon their caste as a condition of entering the Civil Service?—Experience in the Province leads to a belief that no objection to going to England exists on the ground that caste must be abandoned, and no Hindu who has visited England has as yet been so put out of caste.

171. How far would such a system be regarded as open to objection on the ground that it restricts the field of selection to those candidates who are wealthy enough to undertake the cost of a journey to and residence in England?—The objection as regards restriction of selection is partly removed by the proposal made for the passage-money to be paid out of the Public Treasury, and for the grant of a stipend of Rs. 3,000 a year to the successful candidates during the period of special training. The little objection, if any, that remains is outweighed by the political and educational advantages derived by the Natives of India from being trained for the competition in England: these are undeniably very great.

172. Are the Natives who go to England from your Province for purposes of education limited to the wealthier classes?—As far as I know eleven Hindus and three

The *President*—continued.

Mahomedans have been to England. These belong to the middle classes, but not to the wealthier or low classes.

Mr. *Stokes.*

173. Did they all go to England for purposes of study?—These fourteen persons all went for educational purposes.

The *President.*

174. Are they limited to any particular section of the community, or to any particular creed?—No.

175. Does a voyage to or residence in England involve the loss of social position or other unfavourable consequences in the case of any section of the Native community?—No, but on the contrary a person educated in England is regarded with respect and honour.

176. Does it result in placing those Natives who undertake it more or less out of touch and sympathy with their fellow-countrymen on their return to India?—Not at all.

177. Would the requirement of a temporary residence in England as a condition precedent to or following on appointment to the Government Service have the effect of excluding from such appointment any considerable or important section of the Native community?—No.

178. If the Statutory system is discontinued, should special provision be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of Natives, who, for religious or other sufficient reasons, are unable or unwilling to undertake a journey to and residence in England?—No.

179. If the Statutory system is discontinued, do you consider that special provision should be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of capable members of the professional classes?—No.

180. Whatever system or systems may be adopted, ought power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts candidates of high family, subject to such antecedent guarantees of fitness as may be considered sufficient in each case? Ought similar power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts persons who have proved their merit and ability in Government Service or in the exercise of a profession without preliminary examination or competition?—Yes, the power to appoint candidates of high family and proved ability to the one-twentieth of posts in the Covenanted Service reserved for the Uncovenanted should be reserved to Government. Similar power should be reserved to appoint to higher posts persons who have proved their merit and ability in Government Service or in the exercise of a profession without preliminary examination or competition. If a thorough knowledge of English were made essential for appointment to Covenanted posts it would, for a short period, limit the field of selection in the Uncovenanted Service and in the legal profession.

181. If such is likely to be the case, could the difficulty be obviated by requiring proficiency in the English language to be tested by periodical examinations after selection, but during a probationary period?—No.

182. Should provision be made for the occasional appointment, in very special and exceptional cases, to Covenanted posts of persons of known ability and local influence whom, although they may never have held office and may not possess special professional qualifications, and although their age may exceed the limit laid down for untried candidates, it might nevertheless be considered desirable to appoint to the higher grades for political or other reasons?—Yes, it is essential; but persons so selected should be appointed to posts reserved for the Uncovenanted Service.

183. Would it be desirable to rule that the proportion of persons, being Mahomedans and Hindus respectively, who are appointed to the Covenanted Service should bear a certain relation to the number of the two classes composing the population of the Province?—Yes, not only for Covenanted, but also for the Uncovenanted Service as well.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

184. How would you arrange this: you propose a competition in England only?—I would have only one competition—a general competition in England. I would have appointments to the higher posts in a Province given in the proportion of not more than one-half to Natives of the Province and the other half to Natives of other Provinces. I would include *Shias* and *Sunnis* among *Mahomedans*, and *Hindus* should include *Sikhs* and other principal sects. The proportion is easily ascertained.

Syud Ahmed, Khán Báhádur.

185. In calculating the *Hindus*, do you include the lowest castes?—I would exclude the outcaste or degraded classes in calculating Hindus, such, for instance, as the *Sansis* and others who are not included in the four *Barans*.

The *President.*

186. How far should appointments in each Province to Covenanted posts be restricted to Natives of the Province?—As many as gained them by competition, but not more than one-half.

187. How would the following scheme be regarded by the Native community:—(1) The Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of European officers, admission being by competition in England, confined to European candidates only. (2) The appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India,

The *President*—continued.

Natives only being eligible?—It would not be regarded favourably.

188. How would the Native community regard the following:—(1) The Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of appointments, to be filled by competition in England, to which Natives and Europeans alike would be admitted. (2) The appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointments in India, both Natives and Europeans being eligible?—The Native community would regard the scheme favourably, as it affords facilities to them.

189. How would you regard such a scheme?—I do not regard the scheme favourably.

190. If either of the above schemes were adopted, how would the Native community view a proposal to combine the higher appointments of the Uncovenanted Service with the appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service, so as to form an enlarged Civil Service to be recruited in India?—The general public are ignorant. The Uncovenanted officers will like the scheme on the understanding that the field of service for Natives may not be confined to a narrow limit.

191. How would you view such a proposal?—I do not like it.

192. How would the Native community regard the following scheme:—(1) A certain number of appointments in the Covenanted Civil Service to be reserved for Natives; (2) a certain proportion of that number to be filled by competition or by some other system in India; (3) the remainder to be filled by competition in England?—They would not like it.

193. How would you regard such a scheme?—I should not like it either.

194. Assuming a system of nomination, or of limited competition among nominated candidates, would Native opinion be in favour of giving a preference, as between candidates possessed of certain preliminary essential qualifications, and having on general grounds fairly equal claims, in the following or any other order to (*a*) members of families of tried loyalty and distinguished service; (*b*) persons of good social status and influence in the country; and (*c*) persons of superior educational attainments, such as persons who have taken the degree of M.A.?—The educated classes do not favour such a system, while the *Raises* and the general public would approve of it.

195. What is your opinion as to giving such preference?—Looking to the state of the Province, I am of opinion that there should be such a preference.

196. How would the Native community regard a system of nomination on the ground of merit and ability shown in the service of Government, or in the exercise of a profession, alternating with a system of selection by means of competition, whether entirely open or amongst nominated candidates?—The common people would like to have the former, the educated the latter, *i.e.* by means of competition.

197. How would you regard such a system?—I am in favour of the system.

198. If the Statutory system were maintained, and if a probationary period were required from nominees or selected candidates before final appointment, would it be necessary to insist upon such probationary period in all cases, *e.g.* in the case of a person who has done good service in the Uncovenanted ranks?—No.

199. In the case of persons nominated from the professional classes, is it desirable that a probationary period should be prescribed?—Yes.

200. If so, is it necessary that the incidents of such period, as to duration and pay, should be the same as those attached hitherto in the case of Statutory Civilians appointed on probation to the lowest grade of the Covenanted Service?—Yes, but the initial pay should be Rs. 250 instead of Rs. 200 per mensem.

201. On what principle should the promotion of Natives appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than by the channel of the competition in England be regulated?—On the principle adopted for other Covenanted officers.

202. Would you regulate such promotion only by considerations of fitness and approved personal merit?—Yes, with length of service in addition.

203. Should Natives appointed to Covenanted posts be required to pass the departmental examination?—Certainly.

204. Should they be required to pass the departmental examinations by both the lower and higher standards within their probationary period, subject to the penalty of forfeiture of appointment if they fail to pass within that time, unless the period is for special reasons extended?—By the lower standard only.

205. Should a period longer than the probationary period be allowed for passing the departmental examination by the higher standard?—Yes.

206. Should the present rule be maintained under which probationers may be confirmed in their appointments at the close of the probationary period of two years, provided that they pass within that period the departmental examination by the lower standard prescribed for Covenanted Civilians appointed in England; no obligatory period being fixed for passing the higher standard, but no promotion or increase of pay being attainable until the higher standard examination has been passed, and power being retained to the Government to dispense with the services of a Statutory Civilian who may fail to pass by the higher standard within a reasonable time?—This is all right.

207. What rule in regard to passing the departmental examinations should be

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Sardar Bahadur *Mahomed Hyat Khan*, C.S.I.

The *President*—continued.

applied in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts on the ground of merit and ability proved in the service of Government or in the exercise of a profession?—The same as for others.

208. Should subjects of Native States be eligible for appointment to Covenanted posts in British India?—Yes.

209. If so, should this be extended to all Native States in alliance with the Crown, or only to those in feudatory alliance?—To all Native States in India.

210. What system, if any, is at present adopted in your Province for bringing into the public Service persons who, from their position or otherwise, cannot be expected to enter the Service of Government in the lowest grades, and for giving them the necessary apprenticeship?—No system is at present adopted.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

211. What, then, do your proposals amount to?—In brief, for what are called Covenanted posts, admission to them should be obtained by examination in England only open to both Natives and Europeans. Only Natives should be given the benefit of passage-money. As regards the Uncovenanted Service, one-twentieth of those posts now held by the Covenanted Service should be kept for deserving members of the Uncovenanted Service, and also for those whom the Local Government, for political reasons, might think fit to include. The other $\frac{19}{20}$ths should be open to competition. One-half of these posts should be given to residents of the Province, and the rest should be selected from residents of other Provinces and others. But Europeans from other Provinces should not be entitled to get more than one-half of such appointments. In case there should not be that proportion of residents of the Province available, then the deficiency should be made up by Europeans or members of other Provinces. The one-twentieth I propose to reserve for deserving Uncovenanted servants would be kept entirely distinct. In my opinion no one should be classed as a Covenanted servant unless he has passed into the Service by the usual channel. These posts should be given to the Uncovenanted Service as prizes. Supposing, for instance, there are 100 Civil appointments, I would reduce that number to 95, and to those 95 appointments I would allow no admission except by competition in England, and the remaining 5 I would fill up as I have said, but they would not be Covenanted appointments in any sense. They should enjoy the same pay and allowances.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

212. With reference to appointments to the Uncovenanted Service, supposing you had an Uncovenanted Provincial Service, and supposing a European from Bombay presented himself, would you admit him?—If he is permanently resident in India, I do not think he could be excluded from the Service of his own Presidency, but a Bombay European should not be admitted into the service of the Punjab, because otherwise there would be no Provincial competition. I think the state of education varies in different Provinces. The Bengal Province, for instance, is more advanced than the Punjab. If you allow general competition for Uncovenanted posts, people from other Provinces might get posts in the Punjab and increase the dissatisfaction among the people of the Province.

213. Would you admit or exclude, say, a Canadian or Australian?—I would exclude a man from Canada or Australia altogether. I still advocate a perfectly open competition in England for all Her Majesty's natural-born subjects.

WITNESS III.—16th December 1886.

Examination of T. W. Smyth, Esq., of the Covenanted Civil Service, Barrister-at-law, Officiating Judge, Chief Court, Punjab.

The *President.*

214. I understand you entered the Civil Service in 1861, have risen through all the different grades, and are now a Judge of the Chief Court?—Yes. In the course of my service I have seen a good deal of both the Executive and Judicial Administration, and of the officers in the service of Government. I have held appointments in both the Judicial and Executive grades. I have had considerable experience of the Provincial Bar, which I have acquired both as Deputy Commissioner and as Judge of the Chief Court.

215. How do Statutory Civilians compare, in regard to their work as public servants, with Native Civilians who have passed in by the channel of the English competition?—There are no Natives in the Punjab who have passed the competitive examination, and therefore I cannot give an opinion.

216. Has the Statutory system had the effect of securing men who in point of education or natural ability are superior to the average of those appointed or promoted to the higher ranks of the Uncovenanted Service?—I think not.

217. Do young men among the landed aristocracy or of good family display unwillingness to accept employment under the Statutory Rules?—No, I think there have been five appointments in the Punjab.

Mr. *Stokes.*

218. How long have you had the Statutory Civilians under your observation?—I think the first appointment was made in 1880. They have only been working about four or five years and are in junior positions. I think the first appointment was made in 1880, and one in each subsequent year.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

219. How many have you known personally?—I had one Statutory Civilian under me at Delhi. He justified his appointment. I have had appeals from another Statutory Civilian—the man who was first appointed.

220. Have you had sufficient appeals in the Chief Court to be able to judge of their work?—Appeals from these officers do not, as a rule, come up to the Chief Court. The men have been only lately appointed, and their powers are very limited at first. I have not seen enough of their work before me to form a correct judgment of their bilities. I have seen the work of one, and the appellate work of one or two others. I was first Deputy Commissioner at Delhi, and have been Additional Commissioner at Jullundur. Lately I have been appointed to the Chief Court.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

T. W. Smyth, Esq.

The *President.*

221. Do young men among the landed aristocracy or of good family display unwillingness to accept posts in the Uncovenanted Service, and a willingness to accept employment under the Statutory Rules?—There are many men of good family in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service.

222. How would a system of limited competition amongst persons nominated for this purpose by the Local Governments, or by the Universities, or by those authorities concurrently or alternately, be regarded?—I think that would be preferable to the present system, where there is no test at all. A system of limited competition is better than no system.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

223. Do you think a sufficient number of competent persons could be found to make the competition of any value?—I suppose for each appointment you would get about eight or ten candidates, who would, I should think, be pretty closely matched as regards qualifications. But among the class of men you want for Statutory Civilians, *i.e.* men of good family, I do not think there would be much competition.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

224. But for the condition of good family you might have more than eight or ten candidates?—Yes.

225. Should there be one competition for all India, or separate competitions in each Province?—I think there ought to be a separate competition for each Province, because I think it desirable that men in the Punjab should be appointed to the Punjab. I think such men know the customs of the people better, and are better for the work in all respects. I think if outsiders are appointed very great dissatisfaction will be created. If you bring a man from Madras or Bombay to the Punjab, he would be looked upon as being quite as much a foreigner as a European, and I do not think he would have the same influence over the people as a European would.

The *President.*

226. Do you think it would be safe for the Government to have any large proportion of Natives of India from outside the Punjab serving in the Punjab?—No.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

227. Would they not regard a European equally as a foreigner?—Yes; I think, however, that Europeans inspire confidence among the Natives much more than Natives of other parts of India do so, and that the Natives of this Province would prefer a European to a Native of other parts of India.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

228. Would you admit Europeans from all parts of India and exclude Natives of other Provinces?—I would exclude Natives of the other Provinces of India from competition for service in the Punjab if a sufficient number of candidates from the Punjab could be got to fill the vacancies in the Punjab. I would also exclude Europeans residing in other Provinces. I would make selected list of candidates, and the candidates selected should be Punjabis or persons residing in the Punjab.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

229. Are there no Natives of other Provinces serving here?—I do not think we have got Natives of any other Province in our Statutory Service. In the Uncovenanted Executive and Judicial Services there may be some from the North-Western Provinces whose parents are residing in the Punjab; also one or two persons from Afghanistan, but they reside at Ludhiana or Peshâwar.

The *President.*

230. Are not some Political refugees employed?—There is only one Political refugee I know by name amongst the Extra Assistant Commissioners. There are also some Shahzadas.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

231. Have you no Bengali gentlemen in the Service?—I do not think there is any Bengali gentleman in the local Service. The people I referred to have really become Punjabis. They have settled here. I know of no instance of a Native from any other Province having been appointed in the Punjab.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

232. Are there no Parsis employed?—There was a Parsi gentleman in the Uncovenanted Service, but I believe he was dismissed. I am not quite sure why his services were dispensed with.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

233. You say Natives of other Provinces would be disliked?—I do not say a Native of another Province would be disliked, but he would be looked upon as an outsider.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

234. I understand you to say that for political reasons you consider it inexpedient in this Province to appoint foreigners, that is to say, Natives of other parts of India, in the Civil administration. Does your objection apply also to the European element?—Not so much to the European element.

The *President.*

235. Do you consider that after selection (whether by nomination or competition) there should be a period of probation?—Yes, I think there ought to be a qualification of that kind.

236. What probationary period would you propose?—Two or three years, which should be passed in England. That special training in England would rather be special study. My idea is to send them home for two or three years and make them pass the same final examination as Civilians at home.

Mr. *Stokes.*

237. I understand "probationary" to mean the testing of the actual work they do?—I do not understand it in that sense. If they pass the final examination, I would dispense with the further probationary period.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

238. When you insist on a special training in England being necessary, do you speak from experience?—These men fill very high appointments, and they ought to be well educated. I think it would be an advantage to have them educated in England and mix with Europeans. This is simply my opinion. I speak from no experience of my own.

Mr. *White.*

239. In regard to the Statutory Civil Service, do you consider that the best method of selection has been adopted? You are aware that by the Act of 1870 men who had proved their merit and ability in the Uncovenanted Service were to be promoted to the Covenanted system. In your opinion is that a better method of selection?—Well, that is one method. I advocate that method too; but it would not bring in the class of men which I think the Government of India want; that is to say, young men of high family. I think it would be a very good method of selecting some candidates, and I think it should still be adopted.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

240. I understand that you consider that the Statute which allows the promotion of men of "approved merit and ability" from the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service should be retained, but that you believe that the Government desire that, in selecting, young men should be chosen, who should enter at the bottom of the list, and that you also think that desirable?—Yes.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

241. In connection with the training in England, do you think it desirable that Native gentlemen appointed to the higher posts in the Civil Service should be thoroughly in touch with their own people and able to advise the European officers from a strictly Native point of view?—Yes, I think it desirable.

242. Do you think a training in England will destroy, or partially impair, their utility in that respect by destroying that touch?—No, I don't think so. If a Native of India were to go home at about the age of fourteen or fifteen, and to remain there six or eight years, it might possibly have that effect.

243. So far as you know, have the Native gentlemen who have gone from the Punjab to England for educational and other purposes, and since returned to the Punjab, retained contact and touch with the people or otherwise?—I do not know personally.

Mr. *White.*

244. You said just now you would like to see the Service recruited from young men of good family who have entered at the bottom of the Service. This means, apparently, that you would send them to England for a certain period of probation. That would entail, of course, a good deal of expense to the State. Then, in addition, the retaining of these young men at the foot of the list till they were able to fulfil their duties and acquire such ability as would fit them for responsible positions, that also would entail considerable expense to the State?—Yes, it would.

245. Then, don't you think it would be better to obtain men after a training at their own expense; for instance, at the Bar?—Of course, such men might be appointed, but I should think men at the Bar, and other professional men, would object to being placed at the bottom of the list, and I think a man ought to begin at the bottom of the list. I think it objectionable to put a man into a high appointment who has not gone through the lower grades. I think such appointment should be very exceptional indeed.

246. But in the case of a man better qualified?—He would have to show that he is better qualified than the men he supersedes.

Mr. *Peacock.*

247. Would that apply to judicial posts?—I think that objection would apply in the case of judicial appointments. I don't think you could appoint a Pleader to a high judicial appointment unless you could show that the men he supersedes are inferior to him.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

T. W. Smyth, Esq.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

248. Do you think that a compulsory training in England would exclude a large proportion of the Native community from entering the Service of this Province?—Of course; it is only an opinion I have gained from conversations with Natives, but I don't think that a Native whose expenses were paid would object to go to England to study.

Mr. *Ryland.*

249. Would you not consider service in the Uncovenanted ranks a sufficient probation?—It would be a sufficient probation when the candidate had passed through the Uncovenanted ranks, and of course he would only be selected on the ground of proved merit and ability. I should not require such a man to go through a period of probation.

250. The two or three years' probation in England, I understand you to mean, should precede the examination of candidates for the Covenanted Service?—The examination they would pass in England would be a final examination and come after two or three years' probation.

Mr. *Stewart.*

251. When would they begin their service?—Men are appointed now to the Statutory Service between the ages of 20 and 25; and, if they are to be required to go home, I would propose to lower the period and take them earlier, that is to say, between 19 and 22. They would begin to work out here when they were 25. I would not send home a man of proved ability in the service.

Syud Ahmed, Khán Báhádur.

252. Do not you think a rule which required that a man who after two or three years' service was considered unfit should be dismissed would cause dissatisfaction? I understand that members of the Covenanted Service are not so treated?—I do not know of any instance in which a European has failed to pass the departmental examinations within the prescribed period. Certainly if a European were kept on and a Native dismissed, under such circumstances, there would be dissatisfaction. I do not think any dissatisfaction would be created by dismissing a man who has proved himself unfit for the Service.

Mr. *Ryland.*

253. What is the reason for retaining the Statutory Service at all?—If you could get a

Mr. *Ryland*—continued.

sufficient number of Natives by open competition, of course there would be none. I should think you would get very few men holding good appointments in the Uncovenanted Service to enter at the bottom of the Covenanted ranks, and I think that they should do so is a *sine quâ non*, except in very special cases.

Mr. *Stewart*.

254. Do you approve of the Statutory system?—I do not approve of the Statutory system, but, if it is to be maintained, I recommend that candidates should be sent to England. I should think a sufficient number of candidates, members of good Punjab families, could be got to go to England—the sort of men, I mean, you would want for these appointments. I think that many who have accepted an appointment in the Statutory Civil Service, if they had been offered an opportunity of going to England with their expenses paid, would have gone to England.

The *President*.

255. Should additional facilities be given to Natives for proceeding to England and entering the Indian Civil Service by the channel of the English competition?—Yes, I should give scholarships and allowances tenable for one or two years to enable candidates to study in England. I am not aware of any other facilities than money facilities which could be given. I should think the great drawback now to candidates going to England is the cost and the risk of failure at the examination.

256. What is your opinion as to giving Statutory appointments, to Natives who, though they may have failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, have shown merit in the English competition?—I think this plan would secure better men than the present Statutory system. I think it would be a particularly good plan to encourage men to go home, so that if they failed in the examination they might obtain a Statutory appointment or something equivalent to it—I mean men who have received a sufficient number of marks to show their fitness.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter*.

257. In that case, do you think you would get a sufficient number of men to select from?—I think so, but it would depend on the number of scholarships or allowances you would give.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*.

258. How do you fit the proposal in with your previous suggestions?—If the men I propose to send home on probation failed to pass the examination, then this method of appointing men who failed at the open competition might come in.

The *President*.

259. Seeing that the Service of Government is open to all who choose to acquire the requisite qualifications, and that there is no restraint upon any of Her Majesty's subjects, except his own inability to acquire them, on what grounds can you defend a system which gives special encouragement to special classes of Her Majesty's subjects by sending them to England and accepting the risk of their failure?—I understand that it is the object of Government to give a larger number of those higher appointments to Natives of this country; and if Natives are left to themselves I think the supply of candidates to such appointments will be very limited, but by giving them allowances you encourage them to go to England and qualify themselves for these appointments.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*.

260. You mean you would give an appointment in the Statutory Civil Service to a man who has failed in England?—I would have one system or the other. Either a system of selecting men out here and sending them to England, or of selecting men who have failed in England, but only such men as have shown by their examination that they are fitted for such appointments. I would give the appointments to the best of those who failed; for instance, a man who failed by a few marks. I should say that Government having supplied the funds for those men who went home, might make its own selection and give those men the preference. But of course such men must show their fitness by their place on the list.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter*.

261. Is not a man who goes to England on his own account, at his own expense, more deserving than a man who is sent by the Government? To whom would you give the preference?—I should like to give the preference to the best man always.

The *President*.

262. Should they, on appointment to the Statutory Service in India, be subjected to the same incidents as apply to other persons appointed under the Statutory rules?—Yes, except that the probationary period might be dispensed with in the case of a man who has passed the final examination in England.

Mr. *Ryland*.

263. By "Natives" I suppose you mean Natives as the term is defined by Statute?—Yes.

264. What class or classes of Natives in your Province readily go to England?—Sons of Government officials, or Pleaders who have acquired the means by practising their profession.

The *President.*

265. Are there any special classes or families of Natives in this Province who entertain objections to going to England?—I do not know of any.

Mr. *Stokes.*

266. Would a Kashmiri Brahmin have no objection?—I do not know if any Kashmir Brahmins hold appointments in this Province. I should say such persons would go to England readily.

The *President.*

267. As to the Covenanted Service, should the examination for Natives in England be distinct in standards and conditions from that for English candidates, or should there be one and the same examination for all?—The same for all.

268. Assuming only one examination in England for both English and Native candidates, do you consider that the subjects and standards of examination, and the conditions as to age and other matters, in any respect place Native candidates at a disadvantage as compared with English candidates?—I think the subjects and standards of examination should be the same. Native candidates are not placed at a disadvantage as regards them, but as regards age I think they are. The present age is too low. I would raise it in the case of both Europeans and Natives to 19 as the minimum and 21 as the maximum.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

269. Is that the only disadvantage?—I think so.

270. Is not the journey to England a disadvantage?—I do not reckon the journey to England a disadvantage. Of course it places Native candidates under a disadvantage to this extent, that they have to compete in a tongue which is not their mother-tongue.

The *President.*

271. But as regards the journey itself:—Is it any greater disadvantage to Natives of this country than to any other class of Her Majesty's subjects who reside abroad—Canadians and Australians, for instance?—I should think that Natives of India would feel a repugnance to going to England which Natives of Canada and Australia would not have, but it is a repugnance they might overcome if they choose.

Syud Ahmed, Khán Báhádur.

272. Have Arabic and Sanskrit marks been reduced from what they formerly were, and should those languages be put on the footing of classical languages, *i.e.* with Latin and Greek?—I don't understand that they have been reduced. I think they are fixed at 500 each, the same as is fixed for French and German. I think that is quite sufficient. If they have not been reduced, I should not recommend their being so.

The *President.*

273. Do you advocate a competition in India for the Civil Service simultaneously with the competition in England, the same question papers being used at both examinations?—I prefer that there should be one system of competition open to all. If that system is not adopted, I should think the proposal contained in this question should receive consideration. I would only adopt the second proposal as an alternative. If there is to be a competitive examination in India, it would be preferable to have it for each Province separately. But in that case I think there would be a difficulty in getting a sufficient number of successful candidates in the present state of education. I should insist on the same standard of merit in the case of simultaneous examinations in India and England.

274. Practically, in that case, the Indian candidates would have no chance?—I should think very few would come forward at present.

275. Would an open competition in India be likely to give decided advantages to any particular class or classes of the Native community over others?—I think that in an open system of competition, Hindus would secure a larger share of appointments than Mahomedans. I should think the Hindus of Bengal would be successful in larger numbers than those of the Punjab and North-Western Provinces.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

276. Have you considered as to whether the same rate of pay is required to attract local intellect as to attract intellect from England?—I do not think that you require the same pay for men recruited in India.

277. And yet you say that if they pass the same examination you would give to both sets of candidates the same pay?—Yes.

278. Does not that rather conflict with your previous answer that you considered less pay would be necessary to attract local intellect?—I understood the question to refer to Statutory Civilians. I do not see how you could make any distinctions in pay if the candidates pass the same examination.

279. Then the system of recruiting in India would not be more economical than the system of recruiting in England for the competitive service?—I would simply give the Natives who pass £150 a year as an allowance and their passage backwards and forwards. I do not wish them to be paid at a higher rate than Europeans.

Mr. *Peacock.*

280. Do you think, as a matter of principle, that it is necessary to pay a man who is going to serve in his own country at the same rate as a man who is brought out from his own to another country?—I do not think it is. But if they pass the same tests I think they should get the same rate of pay.

The *President.*

281. Supposing that the Covenanted appointments were allotted in fixed proportions, a certain number to be obtained by competition in England, and a certain number by competition in India, the examinations in each case being open on fairly equal conditions to Native and English candidates alike, and the Statutory system being abolished, how would such a system be viewed?—I should think it would remove a great grievance of the Natives.

282. In that case would you consider it necessary to give the same pay?—No.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

283. Under the system embodied in the preceding question there would be practically two examinations?—Yes.

The *President.*

284. To what extent does the Uncovenanted Service in your Province include in its ranks persons eligible, on the grounds of proved merit and ability, for appointment to offices ordinarily reserved for members of the Covenanted Civil Service?—I think there are very few, perhaps two or three.

285. Could they be appointed to the lowest grade of the Covenanted Service without suffering in pay?—The men I have in view would suffer considerably.

286. Do you think they would be willing to forego pay for the sake of the advantages which admission to the Civil Service might afterwards bring?—Not if they were very high in the service. I think it is a difficult question how to promote them. I think if promotion is made, it should be early in their service, as soon as they have proved fitness. I know two or three such men. One is in the highest grade of the service; one is lower down. I think the latter would accept the appointment. I don't think any of them would enter at the bottom of the Covenanted Service.

287. What special provision, if any, do you think should be made for the appointments to Covenanted posts of deserving members of the Uncovenanted Service?—Power should be given to Government to promote to Covenanted posts members of the Uncovenanted Service of proved merit and ability, as a reward for exceptionally good service, as proposed in the answer to a previous question.

Mr. *Stokes.*

288. Would not that lead to difficulties?—It would no doubt lead to some considerable difficulties if such power were resorted to too largely, but I would only make such promotions in very exceptional cases; perhaps at the rate of one in three or four years. I would put Europeans and Eurasians on the same footing as Natives in this respect.

289. Would you throw open the Uncovenanted Service to all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty, or only to Natives as described in the Statute?—I would, *à priori*, open the Uncovenanted Service to all classes equally. However, I think that a Punjabi should be preferred for appointment to the Punjab, and so on. I would include pure Europeans and Eurasians also, if they lived in the Punjab.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

290. Supposing I were serving in the Punjab and I had a son. If I brought my son out to the Punjab would you give him an appointment?—Yes, if he were fit.

291. Would you throw open the Uncovenanted Service to all Europeans without any safeguards, such as competitive examinations?—Our Uncovenanted Service at present consists of two classes: one appointed by competition, and the other on account of approved service in subordinate grades.

292. So, when you say you would throw open the service, you mean under the conditions which now exist in this Province?—Yes, I think that is a sufficient safeguard.

293. In that case do you think that European lads brought out from England to compete would have an undue advantage over Natives of the Province?—I do not think so. I think the Native graduates here who compete are quite able to hold their own. Besides, the examinations here are partially Oriental. Candidates have to pass a test in the vernacular.

Mr. *Stokes.*

294. How would you provide for making these promotions from the Uncovenanted Service? Would you have them sanctioned by the Government of India, the Secretary of State, or whom?—I would have them sanctioned by the Secretary of State.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

295. At the present time I believe there are certain officers who are excepted from the operation of the rules in force in the rest of the service, as regards leave, &c., and are placed under more favourable ones?—I think there are.

296. Would you retain that system?—I am not sufficiently acquainted with the subject of the leave rules to give a precise opinion.

The *President.*

297. What has been your experience as to the general efficiency of educated Natives employed in administrative work?—As regards graduates in the Indian Universities, they have only recently been introduced into the Service, and I don't think they have had sufficient opportunity of showing their fitness.

298. Have you had experience of them in subdivisions, and have they done well?—No, I am not able to answer that question.

299. Are the Natives who go to England from your Province for purposes of education limited to the wealthier classes?—No, I think they belong to the middle class, and are chiefly the sons of officials and men who have made money in the practise of a profession.

300. If a thorough knowledge of English were made an essential qualification for appointment to Covenanted posts, would the field of selection, in the case of persons already in the Uncovenanted Service or engaged in the exercise of a profession, be unduly limited thereby?—I think it would. I mean you would not get a large number of men who would be qualified. I think a thorough knowledge of English is essential in all appointments to such posts in the Service of Government. I think they should be tested before appointment, because I do not think a man would improve very much in his knowledge of English after his appointment.

301. Do you think there should be a large proportion of Europeans in the Uncovenanted Service?—There should be a fair proportion, especially in the Punjab, where there are so many frontier districts.

302. And as regards Hindus and Mahomedans?—I think the proportion of Mahomedans and Hindus should be as nearly equal as possible. I would exclude only the lower castes and classes. I would class Sikhs as Hindus.

Mr. *Stokes.*

303. Have you in any single instance, in practice, really felt the want of a European in any particular emergency?—Yes, a Deputy Commissioner is often inconvenienced, when going out into camp, for want of a European to leave at head-quarters.

Mr. *Ryland.*

304. Do you think the number of European officials has been unduly reduced of recent years in this Province?—Yes.

Mr. *White.*

305. Do your remarks apply to Eurasians as well as Europeans?—Yes.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

306. Have you ever felt any practical inconvenience from the absence of Europeans

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar*—continued.

in any particular places?—Yes, in places where there are cantonments, hill stations, frontier districts, and districts where there are treasuries.

307. Excluding treasury districts?—The district I am best acquainted with is the Delhi district, where I have always had a European Assistant, and perhaps two; but I should think most Deputy Commissioners would feel inconvenienced by having no European Assistant.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

308. Is the want of European officers a special incident of the Punjab?—At present I think it is. Very few of our Uncovenanted men know English, and the inconvenience is partly caused by that, and partly by other circumstances. I think a European is much better able to deal with Europeans than a Native.

309. Are the relations of European and Native officers in the Uncovenanted Service cordial?—Yes, as a rule.

The *President.*

310. In your experience are there any towns or districts where the high feeling between various sects of the Native communities have made it imperative that there should be a proportion of European officers?—Yes, we have seen that lately at Delhi, Hoshiarpur, and Ludhiana.

311. Is this proportion necessary both for the Covenanted and Uncovenanted Services?—I think so.

312. Do you think difficulties have been felt in cases arising out of riots which have to be dealt with judicially?—Yes, I think so. I believe in all those cases that have recently occurred applications have been made to the Courts to have cases transferred from a Hindu or Mahomedan to a European.

313. Is there more confidence in Europeans?—Yes, generally speaking there is.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

314. You said something about general confidence in Europeans. Have you yourself had many applications for transfer of cases?—Yes.

315. From what tribunal to what tribunal as regards nationality?—I have often, as Deputy Commissioner, had applications from Native petitioners to have their cases tried by Europeans. I have never had an application to do the reverse.

Mr. *Stokes.*

316. Could the Chief Court furnish returns of such applications?—I am afraid it would be difficult.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

317. Was the objection to any particular Magistrate or to having any Native Magistrate try the case?—As far as I remember, the objection was that so-and-so was a Hindu or so-and-so a Mahomedan, and that he would be favourable to Hindus or Mahomedans, as the case might be. I am speaking with reference to those riots I have mentioned.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

318. Are such applications of frequent occurrence?—As Deputy Commissioner, I have received petitions for transfer occasionally, not very frequently. Sometimes with reference to a particular case, and sometimes on the ground that the Magistrate was a Hindu or a Mahomedan.

I am speaking of things which occurred four or five years ago. Recently we have had several applications to the Chief Court in connection with these riots at Delhi, Umballa, &c. We occasionally get applications on the ground that there is a Hindu or a Mahomedan who is not likely to be impartial. I did not get applications for transfer from one Native Judge to another.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

319. You are referring to cases between persons of different sects?—The cases I speak of are cases between Hindus and Mahomedans. In cases where both parties are Hindus, the objection would be personal to the Judge, as, for instance, that he is a relation of one of the parties. We also get applications for transfer from one European Magistrate to another European on the ground, for instance, that the Magistrate in whose court the case is has expressed an opinion at an early stage of the proceedings or had himself set on foot the prosecution.

Mr. *Stewart.*

320. Has there been any diminution of these applications with the spread of education and the increase in the number of educated Natives?—I cannot speak to that. I cannot say whether there were more in the days before the competitive system for Extra Assistants and Munsifs was introduced. In some districts they are more numerous than others. If freely granted, they are more numerous; otherwise they fall off very much.

The *President.*

321. Should Natives appointed to Covenanted posts be required to pass the departmental examinations? Should they be required to pass the departmental examinations by both the lower and higher standards within their probationary period, subject to the penalty of forfeiture of appointment if they fail to pass within that time, unless the period is, for special reasons, extended?—If they do not pass these departmental examinations within the probationary period, or

The *President*—continued.

should prove their unfitness, their services should be dispensed with.

322. Should a period longer than the probationary period be allowed for passing the departmental examination by the higher standard?—My answer is, no.

323. Should subjects of feudatory States be eligible for appointment to Covenanted posts in British India?—I should think so, on political grounds.

324. Of what Native States?—Patiala, Kashmir, and other feudatory States—not independent States. I would give the appointments to any man who makes himself a subject of Her Majesty by domicile.

325. Has the existing system the effect of securing for the Subordinate Executive and Judicial Services, respectively, persons who are found to be thoroughly qualified for the performance of their duties?—The system now in force, which recruits partly by competition and partly by nomination, has been found to give us properly qualified men.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

326. The men who pass now by competition are superior men?—Yes, they are nearly all graduates. They know English.

327. Do you find your subordinate Appellate Courts strong enough?—Not at present, but they are improving very much. They are chiefly officered by Native Judges. None of them, I think, were selected under the present system. There are hardly any European Judges now in the lower courts in the Punjab. There are none in the Munsifs' and Tahsíldárs' Courts. None have been recently appointed.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

328. Is the pay of the lower grades (Extra Assistants) sufficient to attract good Europeans?—It is more than sufficient to attract good local talent.

The *President.*

329. Do you think the Extra Assistant Commissioners are sufficiently well, or too highly paid?—I think sufficiently, but not too highly paid.

Mr. *Ryland.*

330. Would the pay attract men from England?—The rates paid to the Uncovenanted Service are not too high, but yet sufficiently high to attract young men who have failed in the competitive examination at home. Many of them take service in the Police Department, and some of these are superior to the men appointed in the Judicial Service. It is very necessary that a proportion of the Uncovenanted Service should be Europeans, and that we should get these men. I do not think they should be appointed in large numbers.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

331. Do you think Natives of this Province would be able to hold their own against the class of men you have just mentioned in a competitive examination?—I should think not. The men I refer to are men who have offered themselves at the examination for the Army chiefly and failed.

The *President.*

332. Are you satisfied with the present system in this Province by which the Subordinate Service is recruited?—Yes, I think the system is fairly satisfactory except in this, that Europeans are excluded.

Mr. *Stokes.*

333. Have you ever had any charges of corruption against members of the Subordinate Service—I mean against men appointed under the present system?—I cannot recall any.

Mr. *White.*

334. Don't you think it should be insisted upon that a European appointed to the Indian Uncovenanted Service should have an Indian domicile?—No, I would have it quite open for all.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

335. When you said that the pay of the Uncovenanted Service is sufficiently high to attract men of position, did you mean the pay of the lower posts?—Yes, beginning at the bottom of the list. The pay of Tahsíldár's appointments is quite sufficient to attract good men, though it is not sufficiently high to attract men from Europe.

336. You would appoint such men over the heads of Tahsíldárs at once?—Yes.

337. How would you select your Munsifs?—By competition and nomination.

338. You are a Judge of the Chief Court and have the opportunity of seeing the local Bar?—Yes.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter*—continued.

339. Do you ever appoint judicial officers from the local Bar?—Sometimes Pleaders have been appointed to Munsifships I believe.

The *President.*

340. Are the Munsifships sufficiently well paid to attract the Pleaders?—No, I do not think a successful Pleader would accept those appointments. The pay of the lowest class of Munsif begins at Rs. 150. We have none above Rs. 200. Then they pass into the Extra Assistant Commissioner grades and commence on Rs. 300.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

341. Do you never appoint a Pleader to a judicial office superior to that of a Munsif?—No. A Pleader has been appointed to an officiating appointment in the Chief Court. He was considered qualified. Also members of the Bar proper have been so appointed. The present Government Advocate is a case in point.

342. Do you not think it necessary for the efficiency of the judicial administration that Pleaders should be appointed to the Appellate Courts direct from the Bar?—No. I think under the present system of appointment to the Judicial Service you get men of higher qualifications than Pleaders—graduates for instance. There are two grades of Pleaders: Pleaders in the Chief Court and Pleaders in the Subordinate Courts. They have all to be graduates in future. At present a Pleader must have passed the First Arts or show that he possesses some other equivalent educational qualifications. We appoint members of the local Bar to Munsifships if they have been recommended by the District or Divisional Officers.

343. And officers of the Judges' Courts?—Yes, they are frequently appointed from readers and clerks.

WITNESS IV.—16th December 1886.

Examination of T. C. LEWIS, Esq., M.A., of the Uncovenanted Service, Principal, Government College, Lahore.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

T. C. Lewis, Esq., M.A.

The *President.*

344. Will you state your service and present position?—I am Principal of the Government College of Lahore. I have acted as Assistant Registrar to the Punjab University. I have been in the Educational Department five years and three months. I have had special means, from experience both in the College and University, of forming an opinion upon educational matters, and I have formed an opinion on these matters.

345. Do you approve of any system of appointment to the public Service of which competition does not form a part?—I think it is necessary that competition should form a part of the mode of selection, but I think that Government might reserve to itself the power of nominating some members of the Service otherwise than by competition.

346. Generally, or in special cases?—I would make such appointments exceptional. For the mass of appointments I would have an examination.

347. Would a system of nomination, with or without probation, be likely to secure well-qualified persons?—Nomination, founded on good intellectual and social qualifications, and followed by a period of special training, would be likely to secure an efficient Service; the period of probation should be that of special training.

348. Do you consider that nomination should be confined to persons of proved merit and ability?—Certainly.

349. If so, how do you consider that merit and ability should be held to have been proved for this purpose?—By success in University examinations.

350. How would a system of limited competition amongst persons nominated for this purpose by the local Governments, or by the Universities, or by those authorities concurrently or alternately, be regarded?—Nomination by Universities should be regulated chiefly, if not entirely, by the results of examinations.

351. If competition (whether limited or open) is preferred, should there be one competition for all India, or separate competitions in each Province?—If competition alone is preferred, it should be separate for each Province.

352. If there were only one general competition, how would you ensure a due proportion of appointments falling to the population of the several Provinces?—If

The *President*—continued.

there were one general competition, appointments vacant in each Province should be filled up from among candidates resident in that Province, otherwise Provinces with the greatest educational advantages would gain everything at the expense of other Provinces. The Natives of the Punjab would probably prefer that all the appointments should be filled by Englishmen rather than by Bengalis; and a system which produced the latter result would soon produce dissatisfaction in the Punjab.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

353. On what do you base that opinion?—My impression is that with regard to appointments other than those of the Covenanted Civil Service, dissatisfaction would be produced if any system of filling appointments were introduced which resulted in giving part of the appointments in Bengal to Punjabis. In the same way a system which would give part of the appointments in the Punjab to Bengalis would produce local dissatisfaction here, and I think that Natives of this Province would prefer that they should be held by Europeans rather than by Bengalis. I scarcely know how I came by that opinion, but I have that impression.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

354. Have you had experience in the other Provinces?—I have only been on short visits to other Provinces. I have been in this Province five years. I have been in the Government College all the time, which brings me in contact chiefly with the pupils and Native Professors in the College; and I also see a good deal of educated Natives in Lahore.

The *President.*

355. Is the opinion you hold the result of conversation with Natives?—I believe it is partly derived from conversation with Natives, but I do not wish to impute this opinion, in the form I have given it, to Natives. It is my own personal opinion, partly shaped in conversation with Natives.

356. Having regard to the varying educational standards reached in the several Provinces, and the varying conditions prevalent therein, is it possible to have any

The *President*—continued.

one system of selection for all India which would not result in the inhabitants of some Provinces being more or less excluded from a due share of appointments?—Competition might be restricted as already suggested, that is to say, the appointments should be filled up from successful candidates resident in the Province, so as to make it a Provincial Service.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

357. Supposing you have not got a sufficient number of successful candidates?—So far as the Statutory Service is concerned, at present there is only a small number of appointments, and certainly there would be a sufficient number of candidates.

358. Do you consider that after selection (whether by nomination or competition) there should be a period of probation?—Yes; by probationary period I mean a period of special study.

359. If so, should the special training be carried out in India or in England?—In India; but the option of going to England should be allowed.

360. If you do not consider special training in England essential, would you encourage nominees or selected candidates to visit England, with a view to add to their qualifications for the Service?—Yes, or at least allow them to do so.

Mr. *Stokes.*

361. You must have asked some of your pupils whether they would like to go to England?—Yes.

362. Have they ever said that their people would not permit them to go?—I have never heard them say so, but I have no doubt the difficulty does occur sometimes.

The *President.*

363. What form should such encouragement take?—They might have an allowance equal to the average cost of students who remain in India for their two years' probation and study. Those who have private means sufficient to enable them to go to England with this assistance will probably do so. I do not think that it is necessary for the Government to incur any extra expense in order to send selected candidates to England. The number of such candidates will be too large for Government to bear the expense of sending them all home to England free of expense.

364. Should it be offered before, or during, or after the probationary period, if any, through which nominees or selected candidates may be required to pass?—During the probationary period.

365. Should it be offered before or after the nominees or selected candidates enter on their duties?—Before.

The *President*—continued.

366. Are you in favour of the establishment of scholarships tenable by Natives in England for the purpose of enabling them to qualify for the Civil or Statutory Service?—Only as suggested above. There are, however, other Government scholarships held in England; and students who hold them may prepare for the Civil Service examination, but are not obliged to do so. Such scholarships might be increased with advantage.

367. If so, how would you connect such a scheme with the selection of Natives for employment in the higher administrative posts in India?—By competition at the Civil Service examination in England, except in the case of selected candidates, as I have already explained.

368. Do you think that any distinction should be made between the emoluments of nominees or selected candidates who have been trained in England to add to their qualifications and those who have not?—In the Statutory Service none, except that the best men should get the best appointments, whether they are educated in England or in India, and you might give some advantage to the former.

369. If the opportunity of residence in England at a University for two years, with a sufficient allowance, were offered to nominees or selected candidates, is it likely that it would be taken advantage of to any great extent?—Yes, if the candidates were selected from those who have done well at Indian Universities.

Mr. *Stokes.*

370. Would it not cause dissatisfaction supposing a nominee who had not taken his degree passed over several B.A.'s?—It would, no doubt.

The *President.*

371. What is your opinion as to giving Statutory appointments to Natives who, though they may have failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, have shown merit in the English competition?—This might be done, if the standard of merit required in their case were suitably fixed. It should not be lower than that required for an Indian B.A. degree, if the examination for the latter is that chosen for the selection of Statutory Civilians as proposed by me.

372. Assuming it to be advisable to appoint to the Statutory Service in India Natives who have failed in the English competition, should such persons receive the same training as successful candidates in England, and be subject to the same final examination?—Yes.

373. Should the examination for Natives in England be distinct in standards and conditions from that for English candidates, or should there be one and the same examination for all?—It should be the same for all, otherwise we should practically have without any necessity three Services with three sets

Vol. I. Sec II. Punjab.

T. C. Lewis, Esq., M.A.

The *President*—continued.

of rules of admission—namely (*a*) the English Civil Service, with high qualifications; (*b*) a Native Service deficient in those qualifications; (*c*) the Statutory Service. The second might well be merged in the Statutory Service, the required measure of success in the Civil Service examination being taken as equivalent to passing the B.A. examination in India.

374. If so, in what respects are Native candidates placed at a disadvantage, and what alterations would you recommend with a view to remove that disadvantage?—The standard is too high for Natives to compete with much chance of success; also too much weight is given to European classical and modern languages. I think you will find that the classical languages of India are accorded a much smaller number of marks than the classical languages of Europe.

375. Was not that done deliberately in 1854, on a recommendation of the Commissioners that the standard should be distinctly an English one?—I am not sufficiently acquainted with the circumstances of the case. I was under the impression that it was chiefly intended that the candidates should, or it was supposed would, be Englishmen. I have not read the papers on the subject.

The President read an extract from the report of 1854 *and asked*—

376. Does not that show that the standards fixed at the time were deliberately fixed, with a view to the promotion of a high English and not an Oriental standard?—I think that was meant at the time. It was supposed that the Native candidates would go to England and receive their schooling there. But I think that since all the subjects are optional in the Indian Civil Service, the Indian classical languages should be introduced and put on a better footing; in fact, on the footing of classical languages.

377. Does it make no difference, the fact that they are living languages?—I think it does make a difference.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

378. Do you think a knowledge of Arabic or Sanskrit on the part of a Native of India is equally a test of high qualifications with a knowledge of Latin and Greek in the case of a European?—No; I do not think so.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

379. Do you think that a knowledge of the literature of Asiatic countries is of the same value as a knowledge of the literature of Greece and Rome?—I think it is for a Native of this country.

The President read a further extract from the report of 1854.—At that time Arabic and Sanskrit were very little studied in England. Since then they have been studied a

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

great deal more at the English Universities, and provision has been made for their better study. I think they are of greater educational value now than they were at the time that Report was drawn up.

380. You would raise them to the same level as Latin and Greek?—I would certainly give them a higher value than modern European languages. At present I believe they are marked the same.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

381. Do you yourself know Arabic or Sanskrit?—I do not.

382. Are you then in a position to compare the relative educational value of Sanskrit or Arabic with Latin or Greek?—I know that Latin and Greek have been subjects of education in England for a long time, and that the modes of teaching these languages have been developed and improved. I doubt whether Arabic and Sanskrit, studied as they now are, are as good a means of education as Latin and Greek, but I think they are certainly superior in that respect to the modern European languages,—French and German for instance. Any one may go to France and Germany and pick up the language without getting any mental discipline from them. I have no experience of the mode in which Sanskrit and Arabic are taught in this country. I have not been through a course of Arabic and Sanskrit at the Oriental College, but I know how they are taught. I do not go so far as to assign the same classical value to Arabic and Sanskrit in this country as is attached to Latin and Greek in Europe, but I certainly reckon them higher than European modern languages, which I think are marked too high in comparison with them.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

383. Sanskrit and Arabic are marked too low?—A man who takes up Latin probably takes up Greek also, whereas it does not follow at all that a man who takes up Sanskrit takes up Arabic also. The man therefore who takes up Latin and Greek will have 1,400 marks to try for, whilst a man who takes up Sanskrit will most probably have a chance of getting only half that number at most.

The *President.*

384. What is the average age at which Natives at the Indian Universities pass the examinations for F.A., B.A., and M.A. respectively?—Statistics which I have obtained from the Lahore College show that candidates for the University generally pass the University Examinations at the following ages—Matriculation 17½ years; Intermediate (corresponding to the F.A. of the Calcutta Univesity) 19½ years; B.A. 21½; M.A. 23½ years.

The *President*—continued.

385. Do you advocate a competition in India for the Civil Service simultaneously with the competition in England, the same question papers being used at both examinations? - This is the right way of giving additional facility to Natives to compete in the Civil Service examination.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

386. Do you advocate simultaneous examination in both countries?—Yes.

387. Would you restrict the competition in India to Natives, and that in England to English candidates, or would you admit both classes freely to either examination?—I would admit both freely.

Mr. *Stokes.*

388. Is that the general opinion of the Native community?—I have not heard that opinion expressed by Natives of this Province. I have heard them express opinions against it. I know that the Natives of this country are in favour of having the examination held in this country.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

389. Does your experience extend to any other part of India than the Punjab?—No.

Mr. *Stokes.*

390. Have you had experience as examiner for the Calcutta University?—Oh! yes, I have examined for both the Calcutta and Bombay Universities. I have only examined in mathematics.

391. Is the mathematical teaching here as good as in England?—I think they teach mathematics rather better at home.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

392. Judging from the examination papers you have seen, both as regards the Calcutta and Bombay Universities, can you say that any sufficient number of Native candidates would compete at all on even terms with the men on the list of Wranglers at Cambridge?—No, I do not think so; but a substantial number would, I am certain, obtain a place in the *Tripos.* I speak of the best of those I have examined in this country.

Mr. *Stokes.*

393. Do not Natives take more kindly to mathematics than to other subjects?—I have not had any experience of the teaching of other subjects to Natives and therefore cannot say.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

394. Are there any men in the Lahore College equal to those of the Calcutta and Bombay Colleges?—There are certainly a few members of my own College whose papers would compare favourably with those I saw of students at the Calcutta and Bombay Universities. Special attention has recently been given to mathematics in the Lahore College.

The *President.*

395. Under such a system how would it be possible to provide against Natives of a Province in which education is comparatively backward being excluded from appointments in their own Province?—The Covenanted Civil Service should be one for the whole of India. The case of backward Provinces can be sufficiently met by making the Statutory Service Provincial.

396. Circumstances being different in the case of persons who enter through the examination in England and of persons who enter through the examination in India, is there any reason why the rules in regard to pay, leave, pension, &c., should not also be different?—If the circumstances differ solely in that some of the candidates are examined in India while others are examined in England, the competition among all being perfectly free and open, I do not regard this as a reason for differences in the rules relating to pay, leave, pension, &c. The conditions upon which a Native of India, for instance, is admitted to the Service ought not to depend upon his being able or unable to travel to England to be examined. On the other hand, it is admitted, perhaps universally, that there is something to be said in favour of giving more favourable rules to officers who serve in a country far away from their homes, where they are cut off from many of the social and educational advantages to which they have been accustomed in their earlier years,—advantages of which they are unwilling to deprive their own children, but which are to them specially costly to provide. Other arguments have also been adduced leading to the same conclusion.

397. Should successful candidates go through a period of special study in India like the English candidates, who spend two years in special preparation? or would it be preferable (*a*) to require them to go to England, or (*b*) to give them the option of going to England, suitable allowances being given to enable them to prosecute their studies there?—They should be subject to exactly the same rules as selected candidates in England, the subsequent examinations being held, like the first, in both countries simultaneously. They should be allowed to present themselves for any or all of these subsequent examinations in England if they choose; and the English candidates might similarly be permitted to come out to India to pass their final examination. Those who go to England should enjoy the same allowances as English candidates; those who stay in India might also be granted the same allowances, or possibly it might be

The *President*—continued.

considered that two-thirds of the amount would be sufficent in their case. All the prizes should be open on the same terms to all the candidates.

398. Should successful candidates at the Indian competition be required to pass through a probationary period before final appointment? If so, what should be the duration of the probationary period, and how should it be passed—in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service or otherwise?—They should not be treated differently from English candidates as regards probation. The Government must necessarily always reserve to itself the right to check the promotion of a bad servant or to get rid of him altogether if necessary.

399. To what extent does the Uncovenanted Service in your Province include in its ranks persons eligible on the ground of proved merit and ability for appointment to offices ordinarily reserved for members of the Covenanted Civil Service?—My opinion is that there are many members of the Uncovenanted Service in this Province whose merit and ability have been proved to be not less than those of many Covenanted Civilians. I suppose that the great majority of offices ordinarily reserved for members of the Covenanted Civil Service could be filled at least as creditably by Uncovenanted Civilians.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

400. What opportunity have you had of forming an opinion on this question?—I know several members of the Uncovenanted Service in these Provinces personally. I know that they do just the same work as is done by Covenanted officers, and I know also that they do it very creditably. I know that many members of the Commission in this Province have not entered by the competitive examination in England, and that they are supposed to be at least as worthy members as those who have.

401. In your capacity as Principal of the local College, have you had any real opportunity of judging of the service qualifications of gentlemen in either branch of the Provincial Service?—I have been resident in the Province for nearly five years. I have formed this opinion not by hearsay, but by means of the various opportunities that have been given me from time to time, on Committees and so forth, of seeing those gentlemen at their work. My acquaintance extends to both Covenanted and Uncovenanted (to Mr. *Peacock*). I am comparing members of the Uncovenanted Service with men who discharge similar duties in the Covenanted branch.

402. Can you give us any idea as to how many men of both Services are in Lahore with whom you have associated during the five years you have resided here?—I think perhaps I know more members of the Uncovenanted Service than of the other. I know Uncovenanted officers belonging to the Judicial and Revenue Services who are very good men and perform the work very well.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

The *President.*

403. Limiting the Uncovenanted Service to those engaged in the Judicial and Revenue Administrations, to what extent does the Uncovenanted Service include person seligible, on the ground of proved merit and ability, for appointment to the Covenanted Service?—My opinion is that there are members of that Service who would perform the work of the Covenanted Civil Service very creditably.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

404. You base your opinion of them from what you saw of them when you served with them on Committees?—I know, more or less, five Extra Judicial Assistants on the first page of the Civil List. I have met them in various ways, officially as well as privately.

405. Under existing rules as to pay, &c., how would appointments of such officers to the lowest Covenanted grades be regarded by Uncovenanted officers?—Uncovenanted officers, as well as impartial observers, would probably regard such a proposal as unreasonable and unfair; that is to say, that if these gentlemen are capable of doing the work of Covenanted Civilians as creditably as the latter, it would be unfair to cut down their pay to one-half in order to promote them to that Service.

406. Are you acquainted with the requirements of the higher Service?—I cannot profess to be acquainted with the duty qualifications required from those higher classes of the Civil Service to which the Statutory Civilians are appointed, but I think that in a general way I know the sort of men who are wanted to fill such appointments.

407. Do you think officers of the Uncovenanted Service would be willing to forego pay for the sake of the advantages which admission to the Civil Service might afterwards bring?—This would depend on the circumstances of each case.

The *President.*

408. What special provision, if any, do you think should be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of deserving members of the Uncovenanted Service?—The Government should have the right to make such appointments without restriction.

To Mr. *Stokes.*—I think the Government should be restrained only by its own sense of what is fit and proper.

409. If such appointments are made, should they be restricted to the holders of any particular classes of appointments in the Uncovenanted Service?—If Covenanted Civilians are appointed to any office understood to be reserved for the specially qualified members of any particular Department of

To Mr. *Stokes*—continued.

the Uncovenanted Service, it would seem but fair that members of that Department should be eligible for appointment to the posts ordinarily reserved for members of the Covenanted Civil Service, provided they are of sufficient merit and ability.

410. Should persons so appointed be appointed provisionally and be required to pass through a period of probation before final confirmation?—Their past service is, in their case, clearly all the probation that can be wanted.

411. Should provision be made for the appointment of qualified members of the Uncovenanted Service to the higher Covenanted offices without requiring them to pass through the lower grades?—I think such provision should be made.

412. Ought not the Uncovenanted Service, equally with the Covenanted Service, to be open to all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty who possess the qualifications that may be from time to time prescribed?—Apparently so.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

413. With reference to your proposal as to simultaneous examinations in England and India, do you think that a sufficient number of educated Natives of the sort required could be annually turned out from your Colleges in the Punjab, so as to make anything like a real competition possible for these appointments?—It depends upon the number of appointments available.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

414. How many pupils do you think are now annually turned out from the Colleges in this Province who would be of sufficient merit to compete for the higher Civil Service?—Very few indeed for the higher posts of the Civil Service, and it is very difficult to judge, because the development of their character and usefulness comes after they enter the Service. I advocate an open competition.

415. How many Natives educated by you in this Province would be likely to succeed in such a competition, supposing we had the Indian Civil Service examination held in India and in England?—I think that very few Natives of India would succeed; and, as regards Punjabis, still fewer. I think very few Natives of India would succeed in an open competition unless the examinations were modified.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

416. In a Provincial competition for the Statutory Service, how many would be found qualified?—I think we could supply as many men as would be wanted. There would certainly be enough to make it a real competition. Nearly all our students who go in for the M.A. examinations are aspirants

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

for public Service, and it seems to me a reasonable thing to select candidates for the public service after that examination.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

417. If a Provincial examination were held for the Statutory Service, would there be a sufficient number of candidates to secure competition?—Yes, I should say at least ten or twelve for each vacancy.

Mr. *Stewart.*

418. Supposing there were a system of competition both in England and India, open to both Europeans and Natives alike on fairly equal terms, and that the Covenanted appointments were allotted in fixed proportions—without reference to whether the Statutory system is retained or not,—how would such a system of competition be regarded?—I think the result would be a difference between the two Services; and as it is complained by the Natives of India that the Statutory Service is distinctly lower than the Covenanted Civil Service, it would be soon found out that the appointments given in India were considered to be on a lower footing as compared with those given in England.

419. Could not the standards be the same?—No, it would be impossible, unless you have one open competition.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

420. Can you give the number of graduates for your Province? We turn out about 12 to 20 graduates every year, and the number is increasing rapidly.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

421. Suppose that the appointments in the Uncovenanted Service were thrown open by competition to the sons of officers living in the country, do you think that the Natives of the country would hold their own?—I think they would largely, but it depends of course on the age limit. Many sons of officers who would naturally be able to succeed in a competition of that kind would be in England at the time at which the competition would be likely to take place. If you were to fix an age, say 21, I think it is extremely likely that the candidates would be chiefly Natives, and that Natives would win the appointments; but certainly, in any case, a large number of appointments would fall to Europeans.

Mr. *Stokes.*

422. Do you see any practical difficulty in the way of having the same examination papers both in India and in England?—No, but the papers would have to be printed at home about a month before and sent

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

T. C. Lewis, Esq., M.A.

Mr. *Stokes*—continued.

out. To minimise the difficulty as much as possible the examination might be held in Bombay. *Vivâ voce* examinations would be conducted by officers in India : I think there would be no practical difficulty in their case. I think there is no insuperable difficulty in the way of guarding the papers against fraud. The London University examination papers are sent out here from England; and from New Zealand they send papers home to be printed for the University examinations held in the Colonies.

423. Can you tell us in what respects the educational system out here is not fitted for training young men for the public Service?—The existing system of education was not devised expressly to train young men for the public Service.

The *President*.

424. Are there any other points upon which you wish to offer any remarks?—With reference to the question of higher education, I have one or two remarks to make.

425. How far is the existing system of education in the higher schools and colleges in India well adapted for training young men for the public Service? Can you suggest any improvements?—The existing system of education was not expressly devised to train young men for the public Service. Its immediate object has been to give them a general education, as a necessary preliminary to the special training which is naturally obtained by experience in the earlier years of Service. The recruits of the Service can scarcely be expected to be trained servants to begin with.

426. In 1854 Lord Macaulay's Committee were of opinion that the best, the most liberal, and the most finished education to be procured in England was a necessary qualification for admission to the Civil Service. Do Indian schools and colleges at present supply an education of so high a standard?—Certainly not. But it would be unreasonable (as it seems to me) to

The *President*—continued.

exclude Native students from the public Service on this account. It should be remembered that the high standard of education referred to has not uniformly been secured in the case of English members of the Covenanted Service. The conviction that there was room for improvement was the motive of recent endeavours to attract Civil Service students to the English Universities. The test of education has been too much confined to an examination, and regard has not been paid to the necessity of securing a high standard of preparation. When there was a Civil Service College at Haileybury, this evil at least was provided against.

427. Do you consider that Indian schools at present develop the force of character and other qualities required for English administration?—If it is admitted that educated Englishmen generally excel Natives of India in energy and force of character, yet we have in our Colleges students who in respect of these qualities are well fitted to take part in the administration of the country. The qualities in question depend more upon natural gifts than upon a course of study.

Syud Ahmed, Khán Báhádur.

428. Having fixed upon a University standard as the test of admission, would you confine it to the Punjab University or apply it to the Universities all over India?—I would have the B.A. examination of the University of a Province taken as the test for admission to a competitive examination for service in that Province.

Mr. *Stokes*.

429. Do many Mahomedan boys enter your College here at all freely?—We get some Mahomedan boys in the Lahore College. They do very well. They do not come in large numbers—not so freely as we would wish.

Syud Ahmed, Khán Báhádur.

430. If the University degree is sufficient, why have any nomination by the University?—There is no necessity to have it.

WITNESS V.—16th December 1886.

Examination of Sheikh NANAK BUKSH, Pleader of the Chief Court, Punjab; Fellow of the Punjab University; Municipal Commissioner, Lahore.

The *President.*

431. I understand, Sheikh Nanak Buksh, you are a Pleader of the Chief Court?—Yes, I have been in practice for about 19 years; my experience is chiefly confined to the Lahore district, but I occasionally visit other places in the exercise of my profession.

432. What is the prevalent feeling in your Province regarding the existing Statutory system? If the feeling is one of dissatisfaction, is the dissatisfaction general, or is it confined to certain sections of the community?—The prevalent feeling is one of dissatisfaction. It is not general, but confined to the enlightened portion of the people.

433. If the Statute itself is objected to, is it because its provisions admit persons to specific appointments only, and not to membership in an organised "Service"?—Yes, because its provisions admit persons to specific appointments only.

434. Are the objections based on other, and if so, what grounds?—The other grounds are:—(*a*) that the appointment of persons to the Statutory Civil Service is left by the Statute at the mere option of the Government of India; (*b*) that the rules framed under the Statute give only one-sixth of the total number of the appointments to the Statutory Civilians, which is too small a proportion.

435. If a desire is felt for enrolment in a general Service, what are the reasons for this desire?—The reason is that enrolment in a general Service gives them better prospects of promotion, enables them to hold important posts, and to show their merits and abilities in an extended sphere of action.

436. What amendments do you advocate in Section 6 of the Statute?—Section 6 of the Statute ought to be so modified as to make it obligatory upon the Government of India to allot each year a fixed number of appointments to the Statutory Civilians.

Mr. *Stokes.*

437. You say there are too few appointments; what would you propose as a fair proportion?—I would propose that the Statutory Service should have one-third of the appointments, and that it be made incumbent on Government to appoint that number.

The *President.*

438. Is there any objection to the definition of the term "Natives of India," and if so, can you suggest any more complete or more satisfactory definition?—In the definition of "Natives of India" the words "of parents habitually resident in India" should be replaced by the words "of parents permanently settled in India." By permanently settled I mean one who shows an intention of settling permanently in India, and who has acquired a domicile.

439. If the objections are directed against the rules framed under the Statute, do they relate to the mode or modes of selection actually adopted?—Yes, the objections against the rules relate to the mode of selection actually adopted.

440. Do they relate to the general conditions in regard to pay, promotion, and retiring annuity under which Statutory Civilians hold their offices?—Yes.

441. Assuming the Statutory system to be retained, what amendments would you suggest in the rules with a view to remove any reasonable objections which may be felt to them?—The amendments which I would suggest are:—(*a*) that at least one-third of the total number of appointments should be allotted to the Statutory Civilians; (*b*) that some preliminary test should be required to be passed before admission to the Statutory Civil Service.

442. Are Statutory Civilians regarded by the general public as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the Covenanted Service through the competitive channel?—Yes.

443. If such feeling exists, on what grounds is it based?—The grounds are:—(*a*) that the Statutory Civilians are generally not well qualified, for they have to pass no preliminary examination; (*b*) that their pay and other emoluments are lower than those of Covenanted Civilians; (*c*) that they are not enrolled in an organised Civil Service; and *d*) that they have fewer opportunities for promotion.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

444. I suppose these are the causes of dissatisfaction in the minds of the general public?—In the minds of the enlightened public; they disapprove of the creation of an inferior Service.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Sheikh *Nanak Baksh.*

The *President.*

445. Do the general public view with any difference the status of Statutory Civilians and that of Uncovenanted officers? —Yes.

446. If so, on what grounds?—Because the Uncovenanted officers, however able and well qualified, cannot rise to higher appointments in the organised Civil Service.

447. How would a system of nomination to be followed by a period of probation be regarded by the same classes? —They are not in favour of a system of nomination followed by a period of probation.

448. Would a system of nomination, with or without probation, be likely to secure well-qualified persons?—No; the object of the Statute, which is to secure persons of proved merit and ability, would be defeated.

449. Has experience actually shown such a system to secure well-qualified officers? —No.

450. Do you consider that nominations should be confined to persons of proved merit and ability?—Yes.

451. If so, how do you consider that merit and ability should be held to have been proved for this Service?—By providing a preliminary examination to test the general ability and intellectual capacity of the nominee.

452. How would a system of limited competition amongst persons nominated for this purpose by the Local Governments or by the Universities, or by those authorities concurrently or alternately, be regarded?—Favourably.

453 If competition (whether limited or open) is preferred, should there be one competition for all India, or separate competition in each Province?—Separate competition in each Province.

454. If there were only one general competition, how would you ensure a due proportion of appointments falling to the population of the several Provinces?—General competition is in my opinion objectionable. Supposing it were allowed, such proportion could only be insured by selecting for the Service those of the candidates from each Province who stand highest in the examination amongst the candidates of their own Province, without any regard to the order of merit, as shown in the general list of the successful candidates.

455. Having regard to the varying educational standards reached in the several Provinces, and the varying conditions prevalent therein, is it possible to have any one system of selection for all India, which would not result in the inhabitants of some Provinces being more or less excluded from a due share of appointments?—There can be no such system.

456. Under any of the three systems of nomination, limited competition, and open competition, would you prescribe

The *President*—continued.

any tests of preliminary qualifications on the part of nominees or candidates in regard to (1) age, (2) intellectual capacity, (3) moral, social, and physical fitness?—Yes.

457. If so, what should be the tests under each of the heads specified?—Under the system of nomination there should be no limit of age. For limited competition the maximum age should not exceed thirty, and for open competition it should not exceed twenty-two years: the other qualities are essential in each of the three systems.

458. What do you mean by a period of probation?—I mean that when a candidate has passed the examination, he should serve one year in a post. I do not mean an educational probation. I would have probation come before the special training.

459. Should the period of probation be passed in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service or of the Covenanted Service, or in what other manner?—In the ranks of the Service for which he is selected.

460. Do you consider that after selection, and before entering on probation (or on duty), the person selected should undergo special training?—Yes.

461. If so, should the special training be carried out in India or in England?—For the present in England.

462. If in India, would it be possible, and if possible advisable, to establish an Indian Civil Service College on the basis of the Haileybury College which formerly existed in England?—It is possible, but the present state of India is not ripe enough for such an institution.

463. If you do not consider special training in England essential, would you encourage nominees or selected candidates to visit England with a view to add to their qualifications for the Service?—I consider special training in England essential.

464. Should it be offered before, or during, or after the probationary period, if any, through which nominees or selected candidates may be required to pass?—After the probationary period.

Mr. *Stokes.*

465. Have you ever been to England? —No.

466. Why do you think a special training in England essential?—Because I think a candidate will acquire there the manners and high morality of the English people. He will also get the advantage of seeing English society and English life. I have friends who have been greatly improved by going to England. I refer to Hindu gentlemen.

The *President.*

467. Should it be offered before or after the nominees or selected candidates enter on their duties?—The question seems to be ambiguous, as it excludes the probationary,

The *President*—continued.

period from that of entering on duties. I consider the probationary period *de facto* a period of duty.

468. Are you in favour of the establishment of scholarships tenable by Natives in England for the purpose of enabling them to qualify for the Civil or Statutory Service? —Yes.

469. If so, how would you connect such a scheme with the selection of Natives for employment in the higher administrative posts in India?—Those who get scholarships and go to England to qualify themselves for the Civil and Statutory Services should, if selected, be exempted from further special training in England, and be directly admitted to the Service.

470. Do you think that any distinction should be made between the emoluments of nominees or selected candidates who have been trained in England, or have gone to England to add to their qualifications, and those who have not?—As in my opinion all should be required to undergo a special training in England for the present, no such distinction will be necessary.

471. If the opportunity of residence in England at a University for two years with a sufficient allowance were offered to nominees or selected candidates, is it likely that it would be taken advantage of to any great extent?—Yes, it is likely that they would take advantage of any such opportunity.

472. If the system of examination in England were revised with the result that Natives availed themselves of it in considerable numbers, would it still be necessary to retain the Statutory system?—Yes, it would still be necessary to retain the Statutory system.

473. If so, to what appointments or classes of appointments would you restrict the latter system, and what conditions over and above those already existing would you impose?—In my opinion the Statutory system should not be so restricted. The only distinction between the Statutory Civilians and those who pass in England must be in their remuneration, *i.e.* the latter should get some allowance not exceeding a certain maximum amount over and above the fixed pay of the office.

474. Is competition of Natives in the examination in England favourably looked upon by large and important classes in India?—No.

475. Should additional facilities be given to Natives for proceeding to England and entering the Indian Civil Service by the channel of the English competition?—Yes.

476. If so, what form or forms should such facilities take?—The limit of age should be raised to 22 years, and a number of scholarships should be awarded to deserving persons for this purpose.

477. What conditions, if any, should be attached to them?—Such facilities should be given to those candidates from India who have been trained in special classes for the Civil Service under some University, preference being given to members of high families or of those distinguished for loyalty.

The *President*—continued.

478 What is your opinion as to giving Statutory appointments to Natives who, though they may have failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, have shown merit in the English competition?—There can be no objection against giving Statutory appointments to such Natives, provided the number of successful Natives from India be too small in any year.

Mr. *Stokes.*

479. Would you not require them to pass some examination after they come back from England?—I would place them at the bottom of the list without requiring them to pass any examination.

The *President.*

480. Can you say what number of Natives belonging to your Province have presented themselves annually at the competitive examination in England, and what degree of success they attained?—Only one or two have presented themselves up to date, but with no success

481. What class or classes of Natives in your Province readily go to England?—In the Punjab there is no objection against going to England if one has means, with very few exceptions.

482. Are objections entertained to going to England; and if so, what are they, and by what classes in particular are they felt?—So far as I know, there are no such objections.

483. Should the examination for Natives in England be distinct in standards and conditions from that for English candidates, or should there be one and the same examination for all?—The standards and conditions of the examination should be as nearly as possible the same for English and Native candidates, with a few differences necessitated by the peculiarities of the two countries.

Mr. *Stokes.*

484. What are the exceptions you refer to in regard to persons going to England? —Some object to the cost, others that they lose their caste. Hindus, generally of the *Kshatri* caste, object to it on that account; *Pundits* and *Bunniahs* object for the same reason. Mahomedans do not object to go; nor do the Hindus object as a body.

The *President.*

485. If the standards and conditions were different, how would it be possible to

The *President*—continued.

compare the results in the two examinations so as to bring out one list in order of merit? —Of course it would be very difficult to bring out one list in order of merit.

486. Would it under such circumstances be desirable to allot a fixed proportion of appointments to each of the two examinations?—Assuming two distinct examinations, it would be desirable to do so.

487. If a fixed proportion of appointments were allotted for a Native examination in England, do you consider that in view of the objections against a voyage to England and life there, the cost thereof, and the chances of failure, a sufficient number of suitable candidates from your Province would be available to make the competition a real competition?—No; such a number of candidates would not be available at present.

488. If the examinations were distinct, what should be the limits of age for the Native examination?—If the examinations are held in England, the standard being the same as at present, the limit of age should not be less than twenty-two years.

489. What should be the conditions, nature, and subjects of the separate Native examination?—The same as for the present open competition, with the following modifications:—(*a*) age to be twenty-two years instead of nineteen years; (*b*) add to the subjects for the examination (1) History of India, including that of the Laws and constitution, carrying the same maximum marks as the History of England, &c.; (2) Arabic, Sanskrit, or Persian, carrying the same maximum marks as are assigned to the English classics.

490. Assuming only one examination in England for both English and Native candidates, do you consider that the subjects and standards of examination and the conditions as to age, and other matters, in any respect place Native candidates at a disadvantage as compared with English candidates?—Yes.

491. If so, in what respects are Native candidates placed at a disadvantage, and what alterations would you recommend with a view to remove that disadvantage?—The disadvantages under which the Natives suffer are:—(*a*) that the limit of age is too low to enable them to pass the examination; (*b*) that the Indian educational systems are not such as to suit the requirements of persons desiring to pass the Civil Service examination; (*c*) that Natives are put to the trouble of leaving their country for a distant foreign land and there incur large expenses; and (*d*) that the subjects of examination and the marks assigned to them give undue advantage to Europeans over Natives. These disadvantages can be removed (*a*) by making the limit of age higher, say twenty-two years; (*b*) by selecting such students as have passed the Entrance examination, and then putting them in a special class formed for the purpose of preparing youths for the Civil Service examination; (*c*) holding the Civil Service examination at the chief stations of each Province in India; and (*d*) by making modifications in the subjects of examination.

The *President*—continued.

492. If there should be only one examination for all candidates, should the limits of age for Natives be higher than those at present fixed for European candidates; and if so, what should the limits for Native candidates be?—Yes, the limit of age should be higher for Natives as well as for Europeans, say twenty-two years.

493. If higher limits of age were fixed for Native than for European candidates, might not the latter complain that they were placed at a disadvantage?—Of course they will, but I do not advocate different limits of age.

Mr. *Stokes.*

494. You would have a simultaneous examination in India?—Yes.

495. What is the average age at which Natives at the Indian Universities pass the examinations for F.A., B.A., and M.A. respectively?—21, 23, and 25 years respectively.

496. From what classes of Native society are the persons who graduate at the Indian Universities usually drawn in your Province?—Most from low classes, some from middle classes, and very few from high classes.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

497. What do you mean by low classes? —I mean all the lower classes:—shopkeepers, Marwarris, Bunniahs, and labourers. In the Punjab there are many B.A.'s who are sons of *dhobies.*

498. Do you advocate a competition in India for the Civil Service simultaneously with the competition in England, the same question papers being used at both examinations?—Yes, with this difference, that the questions be so modified as to suit the peculiar circumstances of both the countries.

499. How would this method of selection be regarded by the Native community generally?—Favourably.

500. If you advocate such a system, would you restrict the competition in India to Natives, and that in England to English candidates, or would you admit both classes freely to either examination?—I would admit both classes freely to both examinations.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

501. The subjects of the examination papers should be the same then, but with some modifications?—I am for open competition; the only changes I wish to see effected are that the limit of age should be raised, and History, including the Constitutional History of India, should receive the same

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

marks as the History and Constitutional History of England. I wish also that Arabic and Sanskrit should form subjects of examination in India.

Mr. *Stewart.*

502. You do not want identical examinations?—No.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

503. But suppose the Commission should ultimately adopt the view that there should not be any difference as regards the subjects of examination, which would give more satisfaction to the people of India—one competition in India, or a simultaneous competition in England and India?—A simultaneous competition in both places, and I would admit both classes freely to both examinations.

The *President.*

504. Would an open competition in India be likely to give decided advantages to any particular class or classes of the Native community over others?—Yes, to the Hindus.

505. Would it be likely to lead to the undue preponderance of any one class or caste in the public Service?—Yes.

506. Do you think there are any objections on political or administrative grounds to open competition in India?—Yes.

507. Would the introduction of an open competitive examination in India have the effect of deterring cadets of leading families from aspiring to enter the ranks of the Civil Service?—Yes.

508. Under such a system how would it be possible to provide against the Natives of a Province in which education is comparatively backward being excluded from appointments in their own Province?—Under the present state of India it is almost impossible It would give an advantage to certain parts of India which are further advanced in education, and lead to the predominance of one particular class in India, which is not advisable for political reasons.

509. Would a system of Provincial examinations be preferable to one examination for the whole of India?—Yes.

510. Under a system of open competition in India, would the successful candidates be regarded as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the Service through the channel of the open competition in England?—No.

511. Supposing that the Covenanted appointments were allotted in fixed proportions, a certain number to be obtained by competition in England and a certain number by competition in India, the examinations in each case being open on fairly equal conditions to Native

The *President*—continued.

and English candidates alike, and the Statutory system being abolished, how would such a system be viewed?—Favourably.

512. If an open competition were established in India, what should be the preliminary qualifications required on the part of candidates in regard to age?—Not under 18 years and not more than 21.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

513. When you say you would prefer Provincial examinations, are you referring to the whole Service as open to competition in England, or only to those posts which are given under the Statute?—To the whole. There should be two examinations: one to be held in India and one in England. I would divide the appointments and fill up one-half by Provincial examinations and the other half by competition in England.

Mr. *Stokes.*

514. If you hold a Provincial examination in this Province, do you think any particular class would have an advantage?—I do not think so, if the appointments were given proportionately.

515. What preliminary qualifications would you require as regards education?—The Entrance examination of a recognised University.

The *President.*

516. In regard to moral, social and physical fitness?—The same as at present for the Competitive Civil Service.

517. Should the subjects and conditions of the examination be the same as those prescribed for the competitive examination in England, or should they be different?—Different, as already pointed out.

518. What should they be?—Constitutional History of India and some vernacular languages ought to be added to the subjects of the examination to be held in India, and the classical languages, *i.e.* Latin and Greek, ought to be struck out from the subjects of the examination to be held in India, and all other subjects should be the same as at present in the Competitive Civil Service examination held in England.

519. Circumstances being different in the case of persons who enter through the examination in England and of persons who enter through the examination in India, is there any reason why the rules in regard to pay, leave, pension, &c., should not also be different?—There ought to be no distinction in the fixed pay of the posts, but a fixed allowance rising to a certain maximum amount might be allowed to those who pass in England.

520. Should successful candidates go through a period of special study in India like the English candidates who spend two years in special preparation?—Yes.

The *President*—continued.

521. Would it be preferable (*a*) to require them to go to England, or (*b*) to give them the option of going to England, suitable allowances being given to enable them to prosecute their studies there?—They should have the option of going.

522. Should successful candidates at the Indian competition be required to pass through a probationary period before final appointment?—Yes. I wish to say here that I would give to persons who are admitted in England a personal allowance, in order to encourage Natives to go to England.

523. What should be the duration of the probationary period?—One year.

524. How should it be passed—in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service, or otherwise?—In the ranks of the Covenanted Service.

525. What special provision, if any, do you think should be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of deserving members of the Uncovenanted Service? If such appointments are made, should they be restricted to the holders of any particular classes of appointments in the Uncovenanted Service; and if so, what classes?—A portion of the Covenanted Service should be reserved for this purpose. Such appointments should not be restricted to any particular posts.

526. Should persons so appointed be appointed provisionally and be required to pass through a period of probation before final confirmation?—No.

527. Should provision be made for the appointment of qualified members of the Uncovenanted Service to the higher Covenanted offices without requiring them to pass through the lower grades?—Yes.

528. If certain appointments in the Covenanted grades are set apart for the Statutory Service, should a fixed proportion of those appointments be expressly reserved for persons of proved merit and ability in the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes.

Mr. *Stokes.*

529. Should special provision be made for the promotion to Covenanted posts of European or Eurasian members of the Uncovenanted Service?—No.

530. Do you think a *Kshatri* or a *Brahman* would be a proper person to put in charge of a large district?—Not unless he were a man of high birth. I would not put a low-born B.A. into such a post.

The *President.*

531. How do you justify the omission of any provision for Europeans and Eurasians? Why should any class of Her Majesty's subjects be treated differently in that respect from any other class of Her Majesty's subjects?—I wish to modify my answer. I understood that Europeans and Eurasians were included in the Statutory definition of Natives of India, and I spoke with reference to that.

The *President*—continued.

532. Ought not the Uncovenanted Service, equally with the Covenanted Service, to be open to all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty who possess the qualifications that may be from time to time prescribed?—Yes.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

533. Would you give the same privileges to domiciled Europeans and to other Europeans?—I would give the preference to domiciled Europeans, but I would not exclude the others. I would treat all Her Majesty's natural-born subjects on the same footing. I am in favour of setting aside the Secretary of State's order respecting the appointment of Europeans to any posts in the Uncovenanted Service over Rs. 200 a month.

The *President.*

534. Whatever system of admission to the Uncovenanted Service the Government, Secretary of State or Parliament may prescribe—whether a system of nomination, limited competition, or of open competition—would you admit by that door equally, without favour or distinction, all classes of Her Majesty's subjects?—Yes. If the Government deliberately chooses to adopt a system of nomination, I would not have any distinction drawn between classes of Her Majesty's subjects.

Mr. *White.*

535. Might not that lead to abuse of patronage? Would you have no safeguard?—I do not anticipate any evil consequences from that, nor do I see that any safeguard is required.

536. Supposing it were proved to you that in a certain Province of India there were 100 appointments in the Uncovenanted Service over Rs. 200 a month, how would you guard against the whole of them being given to Europeans?—There would be no guarantee; but I do not suppose the Government would be so foolish as to do that.

537. If the Uncovenanted Service is closed to any natural-born subjects of Her Majesty, on what grounds, bearing in mind the terms of Acts of Parliament and Her Majesty's Proclamation of 1st November 1858, is this to be justified?—It should not be closed to any natural-born subjects of Her Majesty.

538. Is the rate of pay at present granted to Statutory Civilians during probation and on final appointment, respectively, sufficient?—Yes.

539. Would these rates of pay be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes.

Mr. *White*—continued.

540. Would they be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the professional classes?—Yes, but such persons should be at once appointed to suitable posts and not to the lowest grade.

541. How would you treat, in regard to pay, such persons if appointed to any of the *higher* Covenanted posts without being required to pass through the lower grades?—They ought to get the full pay.

542. Do you consider that a difference should be maintained between the rates of pay granted to Covenanted Civilians, who enter through the competitive channel in England, and to persons holding Covenanted posts who do not enter through that channel?—No, except a fixed allowance.

543. Would you approve of an arrangement by which the pay of appointments would be a fixed sum to be drawn by the holder whether he is a Covenanted or a Statutory Civilian, with an additional staff allowance to be drawn by those only who enter the Service through the examination in England?—Yes, this is what I have been advocating.

544. Can you suggest any other way of providing different rates of pay?—No.

545. If you consider there should be no difference of pay, how do you justify the application of the same rates of pay in the case of Natives who have satisfied the very high tests required by the examination in England and Natives who have not?—By granting a fixed allowance as above stated.

546. On the same assumption, what are your reasons for holding that the high rate of pay which is considered to be necessary to secure the services of persons of tested qualifications in a country far from their homes, and under various other unfavourable conditions, should be given to persons whose qualifications have not been so tested, and who serve in their native country?—The reasons are:—(*a*) that the allowance would fairly compensate them for the higher expenditure incurred in education in England and the trouble which one suffers by leaving his country; (*b*) giving higher pay means that one will get higher pay in any appointment to which he is appointed or promoted, but one's getting higher pay, on rising to higher posts, cannot be justified by saying that he left his own country and took the trouble of serving in another; because rising to higher grades in India will mostly depend on the accumulation of experience in India and the energy shown in the Service, &c., &c., and not on one's passing in England. Therefore giving higher pay to one who passes in England, and lower pay to the other who passes in India, cannot be justified on any ground.

The *President.*

547. Do I understand you to say that a man who decides upon a career and qualifies for it by an expensive education, leaves the country, and subjects himself to all the inconveniences of residence abroad, in a climate which is unsuited to him, ought to get no extra pay?—His career in this country entails no additional inconvenience upon him, and therefore the pay ought to be determined according to the office he holds, and not according to any consideration of inconvenience. At the same time, to compensate for the inconvenience, I would have a graduated staff allowance according to the number of years of service up to Rs 500. Natives who enter in England should also be entitled to the staff allowance.

548. At what age do you consider that Natives appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than through the competitive channel in England should be entitled to retire on pension?—At the age of 50 years.

549. After what length of service do you consider that such persons should be entitled to retire on pension?—Twenty years.

550. At what age should they be obliged to retire on pension?—At sixty.

551. After what length of service should they be obliged to retire on pension?—Thirty years.

552. What amount of pensions should in your opinion be granted to Natives so appointed if they serve the prescribed period for voluntary and compulsory retirement respectively?—The same as at present.

553. If, before having served the prescribed period for pension, they are compelled to retire on medical certificate, what gratuity, if any, would you give them?—One month for each year of service.

554. How far is the existing system of education in the higher schools and colleges in India well adapted for training young men to the public Service? Can you suggest any improvements?—The present system is insufficient. The improvements that I would suggest are:—(*a*) selecting students, as far as possible, of some high families and of families of tried loyalty, and of families of some social position; (*b*) putting the abovementioned students in the special classes established in higher schools and colleges for training youths for the Civil Service.

555. In 1854 Lord Macaulay's Committee were of opinion that the best, the most liberal, and the most finished education to be procured in England was a necessary qualification for admission to the Civil Service. Do Indian schools and colleges at present supply an education of so high a standard?—They do not.

556. Do you consider that Indian schools at present develop force of character and other qualities required for English administration?—Not yet. They do not send out students so highly educated as one wishes them to be.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

557. What do you understand by force of character?—I mean they do not possess such a high standard of morality as we find in Europeans. I mean firmness, decision, promptitude as well.

The *President.*

558. Do we now obtain for Government Service Natives of the classes who under Native rule carried on the civil administration of the country?—Generally we do not.

559. If not, where must we look for representatives of these classes, and how do you consider that their services could be best obtained?—We can look for such men in the ancient families which are well known to the public, and which have no profession but serving the Government for the time being from generation to generation, and therefore the best way to procure their services is to encourage them by giving them preference over the masses. There are certain families in the Punjab which are known throughout the Province, whose only profession is serving Government (mentions families). They have served under Native Governments, and now serve under the British Government.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

560. Do you include Natives of other parts of India; Bengalis, for instance?—Under Native rule there were Natives from other parts of India serving the Government here. There were men from outside the Punjab who served the Punjab State, men from the North-West. I cannot remember any Bengalis, but there were Frenchmen and other Europeans.

561. How far would any system of appointment which involves a journey to and residence in England be regarded by the Native community as open to objection on the ground that it requires Hindu candidates to abandon their caste as a condition of entering the Civil Service?—There is no such objection existing in the Province now-a-days, and it is almost disappearing if there is any.

562. How far would such a system be regarded as open to objection on the ground that it restricts the field of selection to those candidates who are wealthy enough to undertake the cost of a journey to and residence in England?—To some extent: I consider the disinclination to go to England is disappearing from amongst Natives, because they do not lose their caste by doing so. Gunga Ram went to England and did not lose caste, Balmukand also. The former is a *Kshatri.* Very few have gone to England from the Punjab, and not one has lost his caste. Suraj Bal might have lost caste, but that was for another reason. He, however, keeps up his relations with his family.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

563. Are the Natives who go to England from your Province for purposes of education limited to the wealthier classes?—Yes.

564. Are they limited to any particular section of the community, or to any particular creed?—No.

565. Does a voyage to or residence in England involve the loss of social position or other unfavourable consequences in the case of any section of the Native community?—Not as far as I am aware.

566. Does it result in a placing those Natives who undertake it more or less out of touch and sympathy with their fellow-countrymen on their return to India?—I cannot judge, as so few have been.

567. Would the requirement of a temporary residence in England as a condition precedent to, or following on, appointment to the Government service have the effect of excluding from such appointment any considerable or important section of the Native community?—Yes, it would. There are certain families residing in Lahore who would lose by it; that is to say, they will not send their sons to England. Generally there is no feeling entertained against going to England amongst the Hindus. The prejudiced section is not a large section. Those who belong to it object even to their sons learning English. My answer to the question must therefore be modified: it would not exclude any considerable or important section.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

568. Are those families not desirous of entering Government Service?—They are anxious to get into Government Service, but they would have Government alter the conditions of service to suit their prejudices.

Mr. *Stokes.*

569. I understand you to say that no important or large section of the Hindu community object to their sons going to England, but there are some families who do?—Yes.

570. If the Statutory system is discontinued, should special provision be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of Natives who, for religious or other sufficient reasons, are unable or unwilling to undertake a journey to and residence in England?—No.

571. If the Statutory system is discontinued, do you consider that special provision should be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of capable members of the professional classes?—Yes, I do.

572. What do you mean when you say professional classes?—By professional classes I mean legal practitioners, Barristers,—all

Mr. *Stokes*—continued.

professions, in fact, upon which the Statutory system has any bearing. I would reserve one-half of the appointments for them.

573. Whatever system or systems may be adopted, ought power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts candidates of high family subject to such antecedent guarantees of fitness as may be considered sufficient in each case?—One-fourth of the appointments should be reserved for the persons of such classes, and the Government should be empowered to select members of such classes and subject them to a preliminary test for their merit and ability.

574. Ought similar power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts persons who have proved their merit and ability in Government Service, or in the exercise of a profession, without preliminary examination or competition?—Yes.

575. If a thorough knowledge of English were made an essential qualification for appointment to Covenanted posts, would the field of selection, in the case of persons already in the Uncovenanted Service or engaged in the exercise of a profession, be unduly limited thereby?—Yes.

576. If such is likely to be the case, could the difficulty be obviated by requiring proficiency in the English language to be tested by periodical examinations after selection, but during a probationary period?—Yes.

577. Should provision be made for the occasional appointment, in very special and exceptional cases, to Covenanted posts of persons of known ability and local influence whom, although they may never have held office and may not possess special professional qualifications, and although their age may exceed the limit laid down for untried candidates, it might nevertheless be considered desirable to appoint to the higher grades for political or other reasons?—Yes.

578. Would it be desirable to rule that the proportion of persons, being Hindus and Mahomedans respectively, who are from time to time, or over a series of years, appointed to the Covenanted ranks in any Province should bear a certain relation to the number of the two classes composing the population of the Province concerned?—Yes.

579. What classes, ranks, or professions of the Native community should be included among Mahomedans and Hindus respectively for the purpose of ascertaining the proportion of the population of each of those classes in the several Provinces?—For this purpose the Mahomedans should be those who believe in Mahomed's mission, and Hindus should include Sikhs, Jains, Aryans, and other sects which are generally ranked among the Hindus.

Syud Ahmed, Khán Báhádur.

580. Do I understand that you include the Chamars and low castes among Hindus, and other low classes of Mahomedans among Mahomedans?—I would not exclude any Mahomedan, but would exclude *Chamars*, *Sansis*, *Baonrias*, &c., from Hindus.

Vol I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Sheikh *Nanak Buksh.*

The *President.*

581. How far should appointments in each Province to Covenanted posts be restricted to Natives of the Province concerned?—To the extent of one-half.

582. How would the following scheme be regarded by the Native community:—(1) The Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of European officers, admission being by competition in England, confined to European candidates only; (2) the appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointments in India, Natives only being eligible?—Favourably.

583. How would you regard such a scheme?—I am against such a scheme.

584. How would the Native community regard the following:—(1) The Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of appointments, to be filled by competition in England to which Natives and Europeans alike would be admitted; (2) the appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointments in India, both Natives and Europeans being eligible?—They would regard it favourably.

585. How would you regard such a scheme?—I am in favour of it.

586. If either of the above schemes were adopted, how would the Native community view a proposal to combine the higher appointments of the Uncovenanted Service with the appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service so as to form an enlarged Civil Service to be recruited in India?—Favourably.

587. How would you regard such a scheme?—Favourably.

588. Assuming a system of nomination or of limited competition among nominated candidates, would Native opinion be in favour of giving a preference, as between candidates possessed of certain preliminary essential qualifications, and having on general grounds fairly equal claims, in the following or any other order to—(*a*) members of families of tried loyalty and distinguished service; (*b*) persons of good social status and influence in the country; and (*c*) persons of superior educational attainments, such as persons who have taken the degree of M.A.?—Yes, in the order given.

589. What is your opinion as to giving such preference?—I am in favour of it.

590. How would the Native community regard a system of nomination on the ground of merit and ability shown in the service of Government, or in the exercise of

The *President*—continued.

a profession, alternating with a system of selection by means of competition, whether entirely open or amongst nominated candidates?—They would prefer the first scheme, *i.e.* nomination on the ground of merit and ability shown in the service of the Government or in the exercise of a profession.

591. How would you regard such a system?—Favourably.

Mr. *Stokes.*

592. You approve of several of these systems, but we wish to know which you yourself would prefer?—Personally I would prefer a system of nomination followed by examination to a system of open competition, and I think the educated Natives would also prefer such a system.

The *President.*

593. Of the schemes mentioned in questions 582, 584, 586, and 590, which do you prefer?—I prefer that in question 584.

594. If the Statutory system were maintained, and if a probationary period were required from nominees or selected candidates before final appointment, would it be necessary to insist upon such probationary period in all cases, *e.g.* in the case of a person who has done good service in the Uncovenanted ranks?—No, not in all cases, and especially not in the case of a person who has done good service in the Uncovenanted ranks.

595. In the case of persons nominated from the professional classes, is it desirable that a probationary period should be prescribed?—No.

596. On what principles should the promotion of Natives appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than by the channel of the competition in England be regulated?—In the same way as in the case of those who enter by the channel of competition.

597. Would you regulate such promotion only by considerations of fitness and approved personal merit?—Yes.

598. Should subjects of Native States be eligible for appointment to Covenanted posts in British India?—Yes.

599. If so, should this be extended to all Native States in alliance with the Crown, or only to those in subordinate alliance?—Only to the latter.

Mr. *Stokes.*

600. Is there any reason why subjects of Native States should be allowed to serve in these appointments?—They allow Europeans to serve in their own territories, and Natives of those States serving with us would learn something of the Government system in British territory. Mutual benefit would thus be derived.

The *President.*

601. What system, if any, is at present adopted in your Province for bringing into the public Service persons who, from their position or otherwise, cannot be expected to enter the Service of Government in the lowest grades, and for giving them the necessary apprenticeship?—By selecting persons of high families and high social status.

602. Does the system work well, and what improvements can you suggest?—It does not. The improvement I would suggest is, that the selection as at present should be retained, but the candidates should be required to pass a preliminary test to prove their merit and ability.

603. How is the present system of regulating appointments to the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, regarded by influential sections of the Native community?—Favourably.

604. To what sections of Native society do the persons belong who accept, under existing conditions, appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services respectively?—To all classes generally.

605. Do Natives who have been to England for purposes of study on their return to India willingly accept such appointments?—No.

606. Do you know of any cases in which such persons were unwilling to accept such employment?—I have known only one case: I do not know the nature of the appointment offered him.

607. How far are the professional classes represented in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, in your Province?—To a very limited extent.

608. Do members of the professional classes in your Province readily accept employment in those Services?—Yes.

609. Whatever system or systems may at present be adopted for the purpose of regulating appointments to the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, are any class or classes of persons expressly or practically excluded from such appointments?—No.

610. Is it the case that certain classes of Uncovenanted appointments are practically reserved for Natives of pure descent owing to the fact that conditions are imposed which have resulted in shutting out Eurasians and other Statutory Natives of mixed descent?—No.

611. Are you in favour of laying down a rule that high educational capacity should be regarded as an essential qualification for appointment to the Subordinate Executive and to the Subordinate Judicial Services as defined for the purposes of these questions?—No.

Mr. *Stokes.*

612. You say the professional classes readily accept employment. How much does a *Vakil* in good practice in the Chief Court here make in a month?—Perhaps Rs. 2,000.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

613. How many make Rs. 2,000?—One or two. About two make Rs. 1,000; many make Rs 500. They would not enter Government employment on less Chief Court Pleaders are not usually willing to take service.

614. Are you aware that in another Province *Vakils* making fair incomes have consented to take very much less in Government Service?—Yes; because they have better prospects in Government Service. The Pleaders here would accept such appointments. They appreciate Government Service, but they are never offered appointments. Some might be content to enter Government Service on less than the average emoluments they are making at the Bar.

Mr. *Stokes.*

615. Would professional men readily accept Government appointments?—One or two Pleaders in the subordinate courts might. The income of a successful Pleader in a subordinate court might come to Rs. 500 or Rs. 600 a month. A Pleader making that income would be ready and willing to enter Government Service on less than Rs. 500.

616. Generally, what system do you advocate for filling appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services as above defined?—Some by nomination and some by competition as in force at present.

617. What preliminary qualifications would you require on the part of candidates for those appointments in regard to age and in other respects?—When entering the appointments their age should not exceed thirty years, and they should have passed the Entrance examination of some recognised University; provided that in case of the men of high families and of families of tried loyalty, and of families of good social status, the Government may be empowered to exempt persons of such classes. But there ought to be a departmental examination, which all should be required to pass.

618. Is it possible to devise any one system which would be equally applicable to all Provinces, having regard to the varying educational standards reached in the several Provinces and the varying conditions prevalent therein?—No.

619. Do you advocate the requirement of a probationary period; and if so, what should be the incidents of such period as to duration, pay, and in other respects?—Its duration should be one year

620. Would you require a probationary period in all cases, or would you dispense with it in certain, and if so, in what cases?—I would dispense with it in no cases.

Mr. *Stokes*—continued.

621. If an open competitive examination were held in India for the Covenanted posts reserved for Natives, would persons who gained high marks in that examination and showed decided proficiency, but who failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, form suitable nominees for Subordinate Judicial and Executive appointments in the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

622. You have said that you would throw open one-third of the posts at present reserved to Covenanted Civilians to the Uncovenanted or Statutory Service. What posts would you throw open?—I would make no reservations; they should share one-third of all posts.

623. As a Pleader you have a considerable practice in the courts. Have you known of many applications for transfer of cases from one court to another; and if so, generally speaking, from what courts to what courts?—Such applications are sometimes made for transfer of cases from one court to another, generally from Native courts to European courts.

624. On what grounds?—Sometimes the complaint is that the Judge is personally acquainted with the other side, and generally, because the Europeans here are considered to occupy a higher status than the Natives. In some cases suitors suspect corruption, but they do not usually assert it as a reason in the application for transfer, for fear they might be punished. I refer to both civil and criminal cases. I have known of an application to transfer a case from the court of a European to that of a Native on the ground that the European Magistrate did not understand Native customs and the language, or was a new man, &c. Applications for transfer are not so frequent in civil as in criminal cases. Natives prefer civil cases to be heard by Natives and criminal cases to be tried by Europeans.

625. Have you found that Native Judges are very competent to try civil cases?—Some are competent to try all classes of cases, whether civil or criminal. I consider they are most competent to try civil cases.

Mr. *Stokes.*

626. They do, as a matter of fact, try more civil cases than criminal cases, do they not?—Yes.

Mr. *Stewart.*

627. Are these applications for transfer from Natives to Europeans increasing or decreasing since a better class of Natives has been coming into office?—My idea is that they are decreasing, but I have never thought about the matter before.

WITNESS VI.—16th December 1886.

Examination of Babu JADUNATH MOZAMDAR M.A., Editor, *Tribune* Newspaper, Lahore.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Babu *Jadunath Mozamdar*, M.A.

The *President.*

To Babu *Jadunath Mozamdar.*—You reside in Lahore and edit an Anglo-Vernacular newspaper?—Yes. I have been residing in Lahore for the last two years. I have only been that time in the Punjab. I have no special experience of the Punjab except such as I have gained during this period. I have occasionally paid visits to Amritsar and Delhi and other districts of the Province. I am a Native of Bengal. I am a graduate of Calcutta, and Editor of the *Tribune*, a newspaper published at Lahore.

628. What are the special points upon which you desire to give evidence?—I have prepared a scheme which I wish to lay before the Commission.

Note.—The witness read his scheme and explained certain points to the Commission. He then offered to print and circulate his paper to the Commission, and to come up on another date for examination. This was agreed to.

Examination resumed on the 23rd December.—Babu Jadunath Mozamdar, having printed and circulated his paper, came up for examination.

The *President.*

629. You say that the Statutory Civilians need not be compelled to go to England, but may be encouraged to pass their probationary period in prosecuting their studies at some University?—I mean that the option might be given them.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

630. In the third paragraph you say of the total number of appointments one-third should be reserved for members of the Uncovenanted Service of proved merit and ability and the professional classes. What do you mean by professional classes?—Members of the legal profession. I propose to have different Services with their different grades.

631. You have put forward a scheme of marks, and you have assigned by far the largest share to *Jurisprudence* and *Indian Law*; and you assign to *Sanskrit* and *Arabic* and to *Latin*, *Greek*, and *Persian* only 100 marks each; and only 100 marks to the *History of England*, *India*, and *General Geography*. Have you considered the relative difficulties in the study of these subjects?—

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

Yes, I have fixed marks in relation to the importance I attach to the subjects. I know a little Latin and Sanskrit, but no Greek or Arabic.

632. What text books do you propose in Latin?—My knowledge of that language does not enable me to say.

633. Where have you got your system of allotting marks from?—From the Calcutta University. They allot the same marks for Latin and Sanskrit.

634. Do you mark English composition and literature 300?—No; 100 only. I attach great importance to a knowledge of English and Jurisprudence.

635. By what calculation do you arrive at one-fourth as being the number of appointments at present reserved for the Civil Service that should be taken from that Service? Do you look at it only from the point of view that the time has arrived when this further concession should be made?—Yes.

636. Have you considered the necessities of local requirements?—Yes.

637. With regard to special circumstances?—Yes.

638. Take, for instance, Commissioners: would you have a Native Commissioner?—Not for the Statutory Service.

639. How old are you?—I am 27 years old.

640. Have you considered whether the different parts of the Province require special treatment?—Yes. Frontier districts would require special consideration.

641. Would you allow one-fourth in their case?—Yes.

642. Do you think that in a Province like the Punjab, which has an extended frontier, the same proportion of Covenanted officers is sufficient as in other parts of India?—I think so.

Mr. *Stokes.*

643. You have no administrative experience, I believe?—No.

Note.—The following scheme and answers to printed questions were read before the Commission by this witness:—

A Scheme for the Statutory Service.

1. It is advisable on administrative and political grounds to retain the Statutory

Service and to organise it as an altogether separate Service, to be reserved for (1) cadets of leading families, (2) members of proved merit and ability of the Uncovenanted Civil Service, and (3) professional classes.

2. At least one-fourth of the total number of appointments that are now reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service should be reserved for the Statutory Service to be organised, as said before, as an altogether separate Service,—inferior to the Covenanted Civil Service and superior to the Uncovenanted Civil Service, in pay, prospects, and position.

3. Of the total number of appointments of the Statutory Service, one-third should be reserved for the members of proved merit and ability of the Uncovenanted Civil Service and the professional classes, and should be filled by nomination by the Local Governments with the sanction of the Government of India.

4. The remaining two-thirds of the total number of appointments of the Statutory Service should be filled in the following manner:—

(*a*) Let the Local and Supreme Governments nominate cadets of leading families from British India and Native States in subordinate alliance with the British Government, and hold an examination for making selections from among them. Candidates will be required to secure a certain proportion of the maximum number of marks in each subject of the examination, as well as of the total number of marks, in order to be deemed as "qualified candidates."

(*b*) After the examination, which is to be one for all India, is over, let two lists be prepared of "qualified candidates"—one for each Province in order of merit, and one for all India, also in order of merit. Let vacancies in each Province be in the first instance filled by "qualified candidates" of the Provincial list in order of merit, and if there are still vacancies, by "qualified candidates" of the Indian or general list. If there are still vacancies, let them be filled by members of proved merit and ability of the Uncovenanted Civil Service and the professional classes.

(*c*) No cadet should be allowed to compete for the Statutory Service Examination if he fails to satisfy the Government—

1. That he is between 19 and 25.
2. That he has no disease, constitutional affection or bodily infirmity unfitting him, or likely to unfit him, for the service.
3. That he is of good moral character.

(*d*) The examination should take place in the following branches of knowledge:—

1. English composition and literature 300
2. History of England, India and General Geography 100
3. Any two of the following languages and classics; not more than one can be taken of each group:—
   (A) Sanskrit, Arabic, Latin, Greek, Persian 100
   (B) Hindi, Urdu, Bengali, Tamil, Telugu, Guzrati, Marathi, Uriya 100
4. Logic 100
5. Arithmetic, Algebra, Euclid, Surveying, and Mensuration ... 100
6. Jurisprudence and Indian Laws 500
7. Any one of the following subjects:—
   (*a*) Natural Science — Physical Geography, Chemistry, Heat, Light, Electricity and Magnetism 100

(There may be various groups under the head of Natural Science.)

   (*b*) Mental and Moral Philosophy ... 100

(*e*) The subjects are all obligatory. A candidate who has obtained one-sixth of the maximum number of marks for each subject, and one-fourth of the total number of marks, will be deemed "qualified."

5. Statutory Civilians need not be compelled to go to England, but they may be encouraged to pass their probationary period in prosecuting their studies in some English University.

6. The period of probation should not be less than two years, and should be passed in the ranks of the Statutory Service. The rate of pay should be Rs. 250 a month on first appointment as probationer, and Rs. 300 after having been confirmed in the appointment. There should be five grades of the Statutory Service, in the following manner:—

Fifth Grade, Rs. 300—500; yearly increment Rs. 50.

Fourth	"	"	500—700;	do	do.
Third	"	"	700—900;	do.	do.
Second	"	"	900—1,100;	do.	do.
First	"	"	1,100—1,300;	do.	do.

7. For members of the Uncovenanted Service and professional classes, judicial appointments are preferable; and for cadets of leading families, executive appointments. No higher appointments should be given to members of the Statutory Service than those that correspond to a Divisional Judgeship or Deputy Commissionership in the Punjab. No one who has not resided at least for one year in

England in the course of his service will be appointed to the highest posts.

8. Members of the Uncovenanted Civil Service and the professional classes need not enter the Service through the lowest grades.

9. Previous departmental examinations, and the concurrent testimony of the executive and judicial officers under whom they might have served, will be considered sufficient to prove merit and ability of the members of the Uncovenanted Civil Service. As regards the professional classes (lawyers), the testimony of judicial officers will be considered sufficient. A thorough knowledge of English will be required from both the classes.

A Scheme for the Covenanted Civil Service.

1. One-fourth of the total number of appointments that are now reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service should be reserved for Natives of India under the existing conditions of the said Service.

2. One half of the total number of Covenanted appointments should be reserved for Englishmen, to be competed for in England.

3. For the appointments that are to be reserved for Natives of India, one examination should be held in India for all India.

4. No candidate will be allowed to compete for the Civil Service Examination in India if he fails to satisfy the Government—

(*a*) That he is between 19 and 23.
(*b*) That he has no disease, &c.
(*c*) That he bears a good moral character.

5. The examination should take place in the following branches of knowledge :—

(*a*) English literature and composition 300
(*b*) History—England, India, Ancient Greece and Rome, and Modern Europe ... 200
(*c*) Any two of the following vernaculars and classics; not more than one can be taken of each group :—
(A) Latin, Greek, Arabic, and Persian 100
(B) Hindi, Urdu, Bengali, Uriya, Guzrati, Marathi, Tamil, Telugu... 100
(*d*) Jurisprudence and Indian Laws 500
(*e*) Logic 100
(*f*) Pure Mathematics 100
(*g*) Any two of the following subjects :—
(A) Mixed Mathematics .. 100
(B) Natural Science (may be divided into several groups) 100
(C) Mental and Moral Philosophy 100
(D) Political Economy ... 100

6. The subjects are all obligatory. No candidate will be deemed "qualified" who has not been able to obtain one-sixth of the maximum number of marks for each subject, and one-fourth of the total number of marks.

7. After the examination is over, let two lists be prepared of "qualified candidates"—one for each Province and one for all India, both in order of merit. Let vacancies in each Province be in the first instance filled by "qualified candidates" of the Provincial list, and if there are still vacancies, by qualified candidates of the Indian or general list. If there are still vacancies, let them be filled by English candidates who have failed to stand high enough to be selected in the English competition.

8. All Indian candidates will be required to spend at least one year of their probationary period of two years in England, and will forfeit their appointments if they fail to visit England within the first five years of their service.

9. The pay of the Indian candidates may be made ten per cent. less than that of the English candidates who enter the Service through the competitive examination in England.

N.B.—The above scheme supposes that there will be two different examinations for the Indian Civil Service with nearly the same subjects and of equal standards. Without reserving a certain proportion of appointments separately for England and India, it is impossible to ensure for each Province a due number of appointments. It is also impossible to ensure a due number of appointments for each Province without making the subjects of the Indian examination compulsory and prescribing certain "pass marks" to ensure a minimun standard of qualification for the candidates. If one competitive examination be held both for India and England, either India, and so the Provinces, or England will suffer. If a pure competition be held for all India, one or other Province may suffer. The subjects and their standards should under these circumstances be put on a level with those of the examination in England, and certain "pass marks" prescribed in order to ensure for the Indian candidate an almost equal qualification with that of the English candidate.

A Scheme for the Uncovenanted Civil Service.

1. The Uncovenanted Civil Service should be opened to all classes of Her Majesty's subjects, whether Indian or non-Indian.

2 One-fourth the total number of appointments of the Uncovenanted Civil

Service should be reserved for the aristocratic and professional classes.

3. The remaining three fourths of the total number of appointments of the Uncovenanted Civil Service should be thrown open to competition, which should be one for all India.

4. The tests of age, moral conduct, and physical capacity should be the same as in the Statutory or Civil Service.

5. The subjects of examination should be the same as prescribed for the Covenanted Civil Service, but of comparatively lower standards.

6 No candidate will be deemed "qualified" who has failed to obtain one-sixth of the maximum number of marks for each subject and one-fourth of the total number of marks.

7 After the examination is over, let three lists be prepared of "qualified candidates"—one for each Province, one for all natives of India, one for all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty,—all in order of merit, and let vacancies in each Province be filled by "qualified candidates" in order of merit in the order they have been mentioned.

8. Of the one-fourth of the total number of appointments of the Uncovenanted Civil Service, it is advisable to reserve one-half for the professional and the other half for the aristocratic classes.

9. The subjects of examination for the aristocratic class should be the same as prescribed for the Statutory Service, with lower standards. Then proceed as in the case of the Statutory Service. If there are still vacancies, after they have been filled by "qualified" candidates of the Provincial and the Indian list, let them be filled by professional classes—*vide* paragraph 4 (*a*), (*b*), (*c*), (*d*), and (*e*), of the "Scheme for the Statutory Service."

Written answers of Babu Jadunath Mozamdar read before the Commission.

1. What is the prevalent feeling in your Province regarding the existing Statutory system? If the feeling is one of dissatisfaction, is the dissatisfaction general, or is it confined to certain sections of the community?—The feeling is one of dissatisfaction, and is prevalent among the enlightened portion of the general public as well as litigating classes.

2. What are the grounds upon which any such feeling is based?—Arbitrary selection and incompetence of the nominees.

3. Is the feeling of dissatisfaction, if it exists, directed against the Statute itself (33 Vic., Chapter 3, Section 6), or is it directed against the rules framed thereunder?—Against both.

4. If the Statute itself is objected to, is it because its provisions admit persons to specific appointments only and not to membership in an organised "Service"?—Yes, that is one of the objections.

5. Are the objections based on other, and if so, what grounds?—The Statute does not make it incumbent upon the authorities to confer a (1) fixed and (2) sufficiently large number of appointments upon Natives of proved merit and ability.

6. If a desire is felt for enrolment in a general Service, what are the reasons for this desire?—Extended sphere for employment and promotion

7. What amendments do you advocate in Section 6 of the Statute?—Section 6 should be so amended as (1) will make it incumbent upon the authorities to organise the Statutory Service as an altogether separate service, superior to the Uncovenanted and inferior to the Covenanted Civil Service; (2) to reserve for it not less than one-fourth of the total number of appointments that are now reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service.

8. Do you consider that Section 6 of the Statute supplies such a definition of the words "Natives of India" as describes with sufficient clearness, fulness and accuracy the various classes of persons for whose appointment to Covenanted posts it is desirable to provide? If not, can you suggest any more complete or more satisfactory definition?—If the present definition does not apply to Natives of Native States in subordinate alliance with the British Government, it may be amended to include them.

9 If the objections are directed against the rules framed under the Statute, do they relate to the mode or modes of selection actually adopted?—Yes.

10. Do they relate to the general conditions in regard to pay, promotion, and retiring annuity under which Statutory Civilians hold their offices?—I don't think so

11. Are Statutory Civilians regarded by the general public as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the Covenanted Service through the competitive channel? If such a feeling exists, on what grounds is it based?—Yes; pay, prospects, position, and competence.

12. Do the general public view with any difference the status of Statutory Civilians and that of Uncovenanted officers? If so, on what grounds?—Yes; pay, prospects, and position.

13. On the assumption* that the Statutory system is retained, how would appointment to the Statutory Service by nomination be regarded by influential sections of the Native community in your Province?—Nomination, pure and simple, with dissatisfaction by all the influential section; a limited competition, with satisfaction by the aristocratic families, but with dissatisfaction by the influential middle classes, who want open competition

14. How would a system of nomination, to be followed by a period of probation, be regarded by the same classes?—With greater satisfaction than pure nomination.

* The questions which follow down to No. 39 inclusive are put subject to the same assumption.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Babu *Jadunath Mozumdar*, M.A.

15. Would a system of nomination, with or without probation, be likely to secure well-qualified persons? Has experience actually shown such a system to secure well-qualified officers?—Not generally.

16. Do you consider that nominations should be confined to persons of proved merit and ability?—Yes; see "Scheme for the Statutory Service."

17. How would a system of limited competition amongst persons nominated for this purpose by the Local Government or by the Universities, or by those authorities concurrently or alternately, be regarded?—What precedes will be regarded with greater satisfaction than what follows it:—(1) limited competition among the nominees of the University; (2) limited competition among the nominees of the University and Government, nominations being made separately; (3) limited competition among nominees of the University and Government, nominations being made concurrently; (4) limited competition among nominees of the Government.

18. If competition (whether limited or open) is preferred, should there be one competition for all India, or separate competitions in each Province?—One.

19. Under any of the three systems of nomination, limited competition, and open competition, would you prescribe any tests of preliminary qualifications on the part of nominees or candidates in regard to (1) age, (2) intellectual capacity, (3) moral, social, and physical fitness? If so, what should be the tests under each of the heads specified?—Yes, nomination should be confined to members of proved merit and ability of the Uncovenanted Civil Service and the professional classes; limited competition to the cadets of leading families; open competition is not at all advisable for the present, but it is the ideal that we should have before us. But if open competition is decided upon, only graduates of the Universities should be allowed to compete.

20. Do you consider that (after selection whether by nomination or competition) there should be a period of probation? If so, what should be the duration of the probationary period?—Yes, two years.

21. Should the period of probation be passed in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service or of the Covenanted Service, or in what other manner?—In the ranks of the Statutory Service.

22. Do your consider that after selection and before entering on probation (or on duty) the person selected should undergo special training?—No.

23. If so, should the special training be carried out in India or in England?—Candidates may be encouraged to spend the period of probation in England.

24. If in India, would it be possible, and if possible advisable, to establish an Indian Civil Service College on the basis of the Haileybury College which formerly existed in England?—No.

25. Should it be offered before, or during, or after the probationary period, if any, through which nominees or selected candidates may be required to pass?—During.

26. Should it be offered before or after the nominees or selected candidates enter on their duties?—Before.

27. Are you in favour of the establishment of scholarships tenable by Natives in England for the purpose of enabling them to qualify for the Civil or Statutory Service?—Yes, if no examination is to be held in India.

28. Do you think that any distinction should be made between the emoluments of nominees or selected candidates who have been trained in England or have gone to England to add to their qualifications and those who have not?—No.

29. If the opportunity of residence in England at a University for two years with a sufficient allowance were offered to nominees or selected candidates, is it likely that it would be taken advantage of to any great extent?—May be taken to some extent.

30. Is competition of Natives in the examination in England favourably looked upon by large and important classes in India?—No.

31. Should additional facilities be given to Natives for proceeding to England and entering the Indian Civil Service by the channel of the English competition?—Yes, if no examination is to be held in India.

32. If so, what form or forms should such facilities take?—Scholarships.

33. What conditions, if any, should be attached to them?—Scholarships may be awarded to successful candidates in order of merit after holding a preliminary competitive examination in India.

34. What is your opinion as to giving Statutory appointments to Natives who, though they may have failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, have shown merit in the English competition?—I reserve it for certain classes. See "Scheme for the Statutory Service."

35. Assuming it to be advisable to appoint to the Statutory Service in India Natives who have failed in the English competition, should such persons receive the same training as successful candidates in England, and be subject to the same final examination?—No.

36. Should they on appointment to the Statutory Service in India be subject to the same incidents as apply to other persons appointed under the Statutory Rules?—Yes.

37. Can you say what number of Natives belonging to your Province have presented themselves annually at the competitive examination in England, and what degree of success they attained?—I believe only two, and both failed.

38. What class or classes of Natives in your Province readily go to England?—Middle classes.

39. Are objections entertained to going to England; and if so, what are they, and by what classes in particular are they felt?—Not so much here. The objections relate to caste and are entertained by the orthodox classes.

40. If the standards and conditions were different, how would it be possible to compare the results in the two examinations so as to bring out one list in order of merit?—It is impossible.

41. Would it, under such circumstances, be desirable to allot a fixed proportion of appointments to each of the two examinations?—Yes.

42. If a fixed proportion of appointments were allotted for a Native examination in England, do you consider that in view of the objections against a voyage to England and a life there, the cost thereof, and the chance of failure, a sufficient number of suitable candidates from your Province would be available to make the competition a real competition?—I don't think so.

43. If the examinations were distinct, what should be the limits of age for the Native examination?—19 and 23 years.

44. Assuming only one examination in England for both English and Native candidates, do you consider that the subjects and standard of examination and the conditions as to age and other matters in any respect place Native candidates at a disadvantage as compared with English candidates?—Yes.

45. If so, in what respects are Native candidates placed at a disadvantage, and what alterations would you recommend with a view to remove that disadvantage?—(*a*) The limits of age are too low; (*b*) the examination is held in England and conducted in the English language; (*c*) most of the subjects, such as Greek, Latin, French, Italian, &c., cannot be taken by Native candidates (see "Scheme for the Covenanted Service"). The disadvantage would be to a certain extent removed if the vernaculars of India be added to the subjects of the examination and the marks allotted to Indian classics and vernaculars be placed on a level with those allotted to European classics and continental languages.

46. If there should be only one examination for all candidates, should the limits of age for Natives be higher than those at present fixed for European candidates; and if so, what should the limits for Native candidates be?—19 and 23 years.

47. If higher limits of age were fixed for Native than for European candidates, might not the latter complain that they were placed at a disadvantage?—No, as the examination will be held in England and conducted in their own mother-tongue.

48. What is the average age at which Natives at the Indian Universities pass the examinations for F.A., B.A., and M.A. respectively?—(19), (21) and (22).

49. From what classes of Native society are the persons who graduate at the Indian Universities usually drawn in your Province?—Generally from the middle classes.

50. Do you advocate a competition in India for the Civil Service simultaneous with the competition in England, the same question papers being used at both examinations?—The question papers on same subjects may be the same.

51. How would this method of selection be regarded by the Native community generally?—Perhaps with some satisfaction.

52. If you advocate such a system, would you restrict the competition in India to Natives, and that in England to English candidates, or would you admit both classes freely to either examination?—I would restrict Indian competition to Natives of India, and that in England to English candidates.

53. Do you consider that the educational institutions available in India are at present capable of giving the very high class education which it was the object of the competitive system as introduced in 1855 to secure?—The education of our graduates does not appear to be inferior to that of successful candidates of the competition in England.

54. Would an open competition in India be likely to give decided advantages to any particular class or classes of the Native community over others?—I do not advocate an open competition, pure and simple.

55. Do you think there are any objections on political or administrative grounds to open competition in India?—Yes, for the present.

56. Would the introduction of an open competitive examination in India have the effect of deterring cadets of leading families from aspiring to enter the ranks of the Civil Service?—Not from aspiring, but from entering, and so I reserve the Statutory Service for them.

57. Would a system of Provincial examination be preferable to one examination for the whole of India?—No; it is desirable to secure the minimum standard of qualification for the Service all over India.

58. Under a system of open competition in India, would the successful candidates be regarded as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the Service through the channel of the open competition in England?—No.

59. Supposing that the Covenanted appointments were allotted in fixed proportions, a certain number to be obtained by competition in England and a certain number by competition in India, the examinations in each case being open on fairly equal conditions to Native and English candidates alike, and the Statutory system being abolished, how would such a system be viewed?—Not with satisfaction; the aristocratic classes will be totally excluded from the public Service.

60. Circumstances being different in the case of persons who enter through the

Vol. I
Sec. II.
Punjab.

Babu *Judunath Mozamdar*, M.A.

examination in England and of persons who enter through the examination in India, is there any reason why the rules in regard to pay, leave, pension, &c., should not also be different?—No; as I ensure nearly the same qualification for Indian candidates, I advocate a difference on other grounds.

61. Would it be preferable (*a*) to require them to go to England, or (*b*) to give them the option of going to England, suitable allowances being given to enable them to prosecute their studies there?—They should be compelled to go to England.

62. Should successful candidates at the Indian competition be required to pass through a probationary period before final appointment? If so, what should be the duration of the probationary period?—Yes; two years.

63. How should it be passed—in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service, or otherwise?—In the ranks of the Covenanted Service.

64. What special provision, if any, do you think should be made for the appointments to Covenanted posts of deserving members of the Uncovenanted Service?—Certain proportion of the appointments of the Statutory Service should be reserved for them.

65. If such appointments are made, should they be restricted to the holders of any particular classes of appointments in the Uncovenanted Service; and if so, what classes?—Members of the Uncovenanted Civil Service.

66. Should persons so appointed be appointed provisionally and be required to pass through a period of probation before final confirmation?—No.

67. Should special provision be made for the promotion to Covenanted posts of European members of the Uncovenanted Service? Should special provision be made for the promotion to such posts of Eurasian or other members of the Uncovenanted Service who, though not Natives of pure descent, fall within the meaning attached in the Statute of 1870 to the term "Natives of India?"—No. Let the same provision be made for them as for Natives.

68. Ought not the Uncovenanted Service, equally with the Covenanted Service, to be open to all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty who possess the qualifications that may be from time to time prescribed?—Yes; preference, however, should be given in the following order:—(1) Natives of each Province, (2) Natives of India, and (3) all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty.

69. If the Uncovenanted Service is closed to any natural-born subjects of Her Majesty, on what grounds, bearing in mind the terms of Acts of Parliament and Her Majesty's Proclamation of 1st November 1858, is this to be justified?—I do not justify exclusion.

70. Is the rate of pay at present granted to Statutory Civilians during probation and on final appointment, respectively, sufficient?—Sufficient for the classes of men now appointed, but will be insufficient for a better class of men.

71. Would these rates of pay be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the Uncovenanted Service?—I think so.

72. Would they be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the professional classes?—I think so

73. How would you treat in regard to pay such persons if appointed to any of the *higher* Covenanted posts without being required to pass through the lower grades?—They would draw the pay of the grades to which they would be appointed.

74. Do you consider that a difference should be maintained between the rates of pay granted to Covenanted Civilians who enter through the competitive channel in England and to persons holding Covenanted posts who do not enter through that channel?—Yes.

75. If so, what would you consider the fair rate of reduction to be made in the case of persons holding Covenanted posts who do not enter through the competitive channel in England?—For members of the Uncovenanted Civil Service and professional classes, see the scheme for the Statutory Service.

76. Would you approve of an arrangement by which the pay of appointments would be a fixed sum to be drawn by the holder whether he is a Covenanted or a Statutory Civilian, with an additional staff allowance to be drawn by those only who enter the Service through the examination in England?—I advocate different rates of pay.

77. If you consider there should be no difference of pay, how do you justify the application of the same rates of pay in the case of Natives who have satisfied the very high tests required by the examination in England and Natives who have not?—I justify the difference of pay only on other grounds.

78. On the same assumption, what are your reasons for holding that the high rate of pay which is considered to be necessary to secure the services of persons of tested qualifications in a country far from their homes, and under various other unfavourable conditions, should be given to persons whose qualifications have not been so tested and who serve in their own native country?—Persons whose qualifications have been tested in a similar manner, and who occupy similar posts, should be equally remunerated. Distance of home should make no difference in pay; but some consideration may be shown in respect of leave. But I advocate a difference of pay only on other grounds.

79. Have you any remarks to make on the leave rules embodied in the Civil Leave Code which apply to Statutory Civilians?—No.

80. What amount of pension should in your opinion be granted to Natives so appointed if they serve the prescribed period for voluntary and compulsory retirement respectively?—Rs. 5,000 and Rs. 6,000 respectively.

81. How far is the existing system of education in the higher schools and colleges in India well adapted for training young men to the public Service? Can you suggest any improvements?—On the whole I think it is well adapted, but more attention should be paid to physical exercise, as well as to English literature and Natural Science.

82. In 1854 Lord Macaulay's Committee were of opinion that the best, the most liberal, and the most finished education to be procured in England was a necessary qualification for admission to the Civil Service. Do Indian schools and colleges at present supply an education of so high a standard?—I don't know what Lord Macaulay's ideal was, but the education that is procurable here does not appear to be in any way inferior to what is required for the English competition.

83. Do you consider that Indian schools at present develop the force of character and other qualities required for English administration?—I think they do.

84. Do we now obtain for Government service Natives of the classes who under Native rule carried on the Civil administration of the country?—I think we do to some extent.

85. If not, where must we look for representatives of these classes, and how do you consider that their services could be best obtained?—In members of the aristocratic classes, who are not properly represented in the public Service, and so I reserve the Statutory Service for them.

86. How far would any system of appointment which involves a journey to and residence in England be regarded by the Native community as open to objection on the ground that it requires Hindu candidates to abandon their caste as a condition of entering the Civil Service?—It will be regarded with objection only by the very orthodox and uneducated classes.

87. How far would such a system be regarded as open to objection on the ground that it restricts the field of selection to those candidates who are wealthy enough to undertake the cost of a journey to and residence in England?—I propose that the examination be held in India, and in this case poor candidates would not be put to any difficulty.

88. Are the Natives who go to England from your Province for purposes of education limited to the wealthier classes?—No; poor persons often manage to go to England by taking loans

89. Are they limited to any particular section of the community or to any particular creed?—No.

90. Does a voyage to or residence in England involve the loss of social postion or other unfavourable consequences in the case of any section of the Native community?—Not here.

91. Does it result in placing those Natives who undertake it more or less out of touch and sympathy with their fellow-countrymen on their return to India?—Not their going to England.

92. Would the requirement of a temporary residence in England as a condition precedent to, or following on, appointment to the Government Service have the effect of excluding from such appointment any considerable or important section of the Native community?—No; the aristocratic classes may be put to some difficulty, and so I reserve the Statutory Service for them.

93. If the Statutory system is discontinued, should special provision be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of Natives who, for religious or other sufficient reasons, are unable or unwilling to undertake a journey to and residence in England?—No.

94. If the Statutory system is discontinued, do you consider that special provision should be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of capable members of the professional classes?—No.

95. If a thorough knowledge of English were made an essential qualification for appointment to Covenanted posts, would the field of selection in the case of persons already in the Uncovenanted Service, or engaged in the exercise of a profession, be unduly limited thereby?—I don't think so.

96. If such is likely to be the case, could the difficulty be obviated by requiring proficiency in the English language to be tested by periodical examination *after* selection, but during a probationary period?—It is very undesirable to make any such provision.

97. Would it be desirable to rule that the proportion of persons, being Hindus and Mahomedans respectively, who are from time to time, or ever a series of years, appointed to the Covenanted ranks in any Province should bear a certain relation to the number of the two classes composing the population of the Province concerned?—It is not practicable to carry out any such provision without observing the most invidious distinctions and without employing either incompetent Hindus or Mahomedans. But I may propose, as a special concession to the Mahomedan community, that if no Mahomedan has stood high enough in the Provincial or General list to be selected, at least one "qualified" Mahomedan, *i.e.* who has been able to secure "pass marks," should be appointed to the Covenanted Service in each of the Provinces of Bombay, Madras, Bengal, United Provinces and the Punjab, provided that no Mahomedan has been appointed in the said

Provinces to the Statutory Service either from the Uncovenanted Service, the professional classes, or the cadets of leading families.

98. What classes, ranks, or professions of the Native community should be included among Mahomedans and Hindus, respectively, for the purpose of ascertaining the proportion of the population of each of those classes in the several Provinces?—Those who follow Hinduism should be considered as Hindus, and those who follow the Mahomedan religion, as Mahomedans.

99. How would the Native community regard the following scheme:—(1) A certain number of appointments in the Covenanted Civil Service to be reserved for Natives; (2) a certain proportion of that number to be filled by competition or by some other system in India; (3) the remainder to be filled by competition in England?—With greater satisfaction than any of the previous schemes.

100. How would you regard such a scheme?—I regard (1) with satisfaction; as regards (2) and (3), there should be competition in India for this purpose.

101. Assuming a system of nomination or of limited competition among nominated candidates, would Native opinion be in favour of giving a preference, as between candidates possessed of certain preliminary essential qualifications, and having on general grounds fairly equal claims, in the following or any other order to—(*a*) members of families of tried loyalty and distinguished service; (*b*) persons of good social status and influence in the country; and (*c*) persons of superior educational attainments, such as persons who have taken the degree of M.A.?—With greater satisfaction than mere nomination.

102. How would the Native community regard a system of nomination on the ground of merit and ability shown in the Service of Government, or in the exercise of a profession, alternating with a system of selection by means of competition, whether entirely open or amongst nominated candidates?—With greater satisfaction than pure nomination.

103. If the Statutory system were maintained, and if a probationary period were required from nominees or selected candidates before final appointment, would it be necessary to insist upon such probationary period in all cases, *e.g.* in the case of a person who has done good service in the Uncovenanted ranks?—No.

104. In the case of persons nominated from the professional classes, is it desirable that a probationary period should be prescribed?—No.

105. On what principles should the promotion of Natives appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than by the channel of the competition in England, be regulated?—Seniority, fitness, and approved personal merit.

106. Should subjects of Native States be eligible for appointment to Covenanted posts in British India?—Yes.

107. If so, should this be extended to all Native States in alliance with the Crown, or only to those in subordinate alliance?—Only to those in subordinate alliance.

108. What system, if any, is at present adopted in your Province for bringing into the public Service persons who, from their position or otherwise, cannot be expected to enter the Service of Government in the lowest grades, and for giving them the necessary apprenticeship?—I don't know if there is any.

109. How is the present system of regulating appointments to the Subordinate* Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, regarded by influential sections of the Native community?—Not with satisfaction.

110. To what sections of Native society do the persons belong who accept, under existing conditions, appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services respectively?—To all sections.

111. To what extent do Natives of good family and education in your Province offer themselves as candidates for Subordinate Judicial and Executive appointments?—I think to a great extent.

112. Do Natives who have been to England for purposes of study on their return to India willingly accept such appointments?—Not willingly.

113. How far are the professional classes represented in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services respectively in your Province?—They are not at all represented.

114. Do members of the professional classes in your Province readily accept employment in those Services?—They may, but they have not been yet offered it.

115. Whatever system or systems may at present be adopted for the purpose of regulating appointments to the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, are any class or classes of persons expressly or practically excluded from such appointments?—In this Province, educated and professional classes. The competitive examinations recently introduced here have led to the introduction of an educated element to a certain extent.

116. If so, how is such exclusion justified?—Not justifiable.

117. Is it the case that certain classes of Uncovenanted appointments are practically reserved for Natives of pure descent, owing

* For the purposes of these questions the terms "Subordinate Executive Service" and "Subordinate Judicial Service" may be held to include, respectively, all Subordinate Executive and Judicial offices down to and including the office of Tahsildár or Munsif, or other office corresponding to that of Tahsildár or Munsif, which are not reserved for, or not ordinarily held by, members of the Covenanted Civil Service.

to the fact that conditions are imposed which have resulted in shutting out Eurasians and other Statutory Natives of mixed descent ?—I don't think so.

118. If so, how is such reservation justified ?—There is no reservation. Ignorance of the vernaculars of the Province stands in their way as in the case of Natives of other Provinces.

119. Are you in favour of laying down a rule that high educational capacity should be regarded as an essential qualification for appointment to the Subordinate Executive and to the Subordinate Judicial Services as defined for the purpose of these questions ?—Yes.

120. Do you think that the test should vary according to the character of the office to be filled ?—No.

121. Do you advocate the requirement of a probationary period ; and if so, what should be the incidents of such period as to duration, pay, and in other respects ?—Yes, two years.

122. Would you require a probationary period in all cases, or would you dispense with it in certain, and if so, in what cases ?—In all cases.

123. If an open competitive examination were held in India for the Covenanted posts reserved for Natives, would persons who gained high marks in that examination and showed decided proficiency, but who failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, form suitable nominees for Subordinate Judicial and Executive appointments in the Uncovenanted Service ?—No.

WITNESS VII.—17th December 1886.

Examination of R. T. BURNEY, Esq., C.S., Barrister-at-law; of the Covenanted Civil Service; Judge, Chief Court, Punjab.

Vol. I Sec. II Punjab.

R. T. Burney, Esq., C.S.

The *President.*

644. Will you kindly tell the Commission the nature of your past services?—I am now a Judge of the Chief Court. I have been nearly 29 years in the public Service. I have filled all the regular posts in the various grades of the services. I have been Deputy Commissioner and Commissioner. I have been Judge of the Chief Court rather over four years.

645. How far is the existing system of education in the higher schools and colleges in India well adapted for training young men to the public Service? Can you suggest any improvements?—I do not think they are adapted for training candidates for appointments in the Covenanted Civil Service in the executive line.

646. What has been the actual experience in your Province as to the general efficiency of educated Natives—graduates of the Indian Universities—employed in administrative work?—Very few graduates were appointed when I was in the executive branch, and the very few I have known were not a success. I am speaking of four years ago.

Mr. *Stewart.*

647. You have, I suppose, had experience of Natives in charge of subdivisions. How did they answer?—Yes, they only did fairly well

648. Have you ever had any Statutory Civilians under you?—There arefour now whose work I see occasionally, but they are not in the administrative branch. I never had Statutory Civilians in the administrative branch under me.

649. Have you formed an opinion as to their competency in the administrative branch?—No, not in the administrative branch.

Mr. *White.*

650. When you use the term "Native," what do you mean?—I was referring to pure Natives only.

The *President.*

651. Do you think we get now the services of Natives who under Native rule would administer the country?—We get representatives of very good families.

Mr. *Stokes.*

652. Have you had any graduates serving under you?—I remember one or two graduates also.

653. Had you ever occasion to find serious fault with them?—Yes, I was not satisfied with them at all. There was one, a very prominent instance. He was found to be deficient in moral character.

654. Can you tell me about the others?—I cannot remember any others.

Mr. *Stewart.*

655. Have you had large experience of work in a judicial capacity?—Yes.

656. How many educated Natives have you particularly observed?—There are a good many Munsifs who are B.A.'s and M.A.'s.

The *President.*

657. But those have all been appointed of late years, when you had left the executive branch of the Service?—Yes, I think I should properly say that I have not much experience of educated Natives in the executive branch.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

658. How have Natives placed in charge of subdivisions, or in other *quasi*-independent positions, discharged their duties in your Province?—This question does not refer to educated Natives only, but to ordinary Natives.—Well, for myself I should always have preferred a European Extra Assistant Commissioner; but Natives have performed their duties fairly well.

659. Have you had much experience of them in such positions?—Yes, I was for a number of years in charge of districts as Deputy Commissioner and as Commissioner. I can fairly say that I have a wide experience of them. I think there was generally a suspicion of their integrity. I would not say they discharged their duties very well.

660. Did you ever find them fail in any particular circumstances, such as in emergencies?—They were often accused of partiality.

661. Did you ever have experience of such men in cases of emergency?—No.

Mr. *Stewart.*

662. In cases of famine?—No, I was never in a famine district.

Mr. *Stokes.*

663. Did you make any enquiries into those cases of partiality to which you referred just now?—In one case I remember a good deal of inquiry was made. The charge was not established judicially; there were, however, good reasons for believing it, and there was a removal in consequence.

664. That is only one out of how many?—It would be difficult to say in so many years' experience.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

665. Are subdivisions numerous in the Punjab?—No, there is one at Attock, one at Pind Dadan Khan, one at Kasur, one at Fazilka, and one at Kaithál. I was Deputy Commissioner at Rawalpindi; Attock is in that district. I don't think I was ever actually in charge of the Jhelum district; but counting Attock, Kasur, and Pind Dadan Khan. I can say that I have had personal experience of three subdivisions.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

666. Were Native officers in charge of those three?—Yes.

667. And were those three subdivisions held sufficiently long by Native officers for you to be able to test their capacities?—In the case of Kasur certainly.

668. Can you tell me what amount of responsibility is thrown on a Native officer in charge of a subdivision?—If he is a man of character he could establish a great deal of influence in a subdivision.

669. What I meant was, how far he was independent or *quasi*-independent of the Deputy Commissioner?—He has very much more power than a Tahsildár virtually.

The *President.*

670. Is he in the position of a Joint-Magistrate in charge of a subdivision?—Almost.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

671. Is he almost in the position of a district officer in regard to his subdivision, subject to the immediate control of the Deputy Commissioner?—I think he is almost.

672. To whom do appeals in criminal cases lie from the subdivisional officer in the Punjab?—Most of them would go to the Divisional Judge, but some would go to the District Magistrate.

Mr. *Peacock.*

673. That has been so only recently in the case of criminal appeals?—I think it has always been the case. No change has been made recently.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

674. You are personally acquainted with these subdivisions?—Yes, but in only one was there an officer long enough in charge for me to form a judgment of his qualifications, and from my experience of him I think I am justified in making the rather sweeping assertion I have made.

Mr. *Stokes.*

675. This man, whose work you had long experience of—had you any reason to find fault with him?—Yes, I think so.

The *President.*

676. Is he the officer you referred to before as having been transferred?—Yes.

Mr. *White.*

677. What was the nature of his case? I think he showed partiality founded a good deal on race distinction.

Mr. *Stewart.*

678. What was his caste?—He was a Mahomedan.

Mr. *Ryland.*

679. You had European officers also in charge of subdivisions?—Yes.

680. Did you prefer their work generally?—Very much so.

681. How many European officers had you in subdivisions?—A great many in the hill stations; a great many at Dalhousie. There were a great many English Assistant Commissioners. I do not think there were any Eurasians. I do not think I have ever known an Eurasian in charge of a subdivision.

682. Your experience of Native officers in charge of subdivisions really extends only to one instance?—My experience enables me to form a confident opinion. As a Deputy Commissioner and a Commissioner I heard a good deal of their partiality.

The *President.*

683. Do we now obtain for Government service Natives of the classes who under Native rule carried on the civil administration of the country?—I think we do.

684. Do they enter our Service freely?—Yes, I think so.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

685. Those to whom you refer are families, not classes, are they not?—Yes.

Mr. *Stewart.*

686. Is there any particular class who obtain more posts in the Punjab than others?—Formerly that was the case with the best families.

Mr. *Stewart*—continued.

687. But any particular class? Kashmiri Pandits for instance?—I do not think so. I do not think the Kashmiri Pandits get very high appointments. That class has arisen quite lately, within a hundred years or so.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

688. Were those officers you mentioned members of families holding hereditary office?—Yes, virtually hereditary.

689. Was hereditary office confined to the higher appointments, or did it apply to all the appointments in the public Service?—To the higher appointments I should say

The *President.*

690. Is not there a tendency in Native States generally for the higher appointments to become hereditary?—There is.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

691. Under Native Governments generally were not all classes, except of course the lower castes, admitted to the public Service?—That is not my impression. I only know the Punjab Native States. A man might rise by very conspicuous ability; but, as a rule, I should think such appointments were confined to families.

The *President.*

692. How far would any system of appointment which involves a journey to and residence in England be regarded by the Native community as open to objection on the ground that it requires Hindu candidates to abandon their caste as a condition of entering the Civil Service?—My opinion is that it would be rather open to objection.

693. How far would such a system be regarded as open to objection on the ground that it restricts the field of selection to those candidates who are wealthy enough to undertake the cost of a journey to and residence in England?—I do not think the poorer classes would like it, certainly.

694. Are the Natives who go to England from your Province for purposes of education limited to the wealthier classes?—Very few go. They belong to the wealthier classes. They are not limited to any particular section or creed.

695. Does a voyage to or residence in England involve the loss of social position or other unfavourable consequences in the case of any section of the Native community?—I do not think so.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

696. Is that an opinion, or have you inquired positively?—I did ask one or two Natives.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

697. Have you inquired as to actual instances of men who have returned?—There are a few people I know—Gunga Ram, for instance. He is an Executive Engineer. He has lost no position amongst Europeans nor, I think, amongst Natives. Of course that is merely my impression. I have not asked Gunga Ram and his family.

698. Did not Sardar Dyal Singh go home?—Yes.

699. Have you inquired into his case?—I have often had conversations with him. He is one of the highest Sirdars in this part of the Punjab. He has never told me that his going home had made any difference to him in that respect.

700. Have you ever asked him?—I used to see a good deal of him. I do not see much of him now, but he has certainly not lost any position. I cannot say that I have ascertained that, but it is my impression. Those are the two instances of which I have had personal experience.

Mr. *Stewart.*

701. There is the case of a man who went home and married an English wife?—I never met that man. I should not think he had lost in position. He is now in a high position in Kashmir.

702. Does it result in placing those Natives who undertake it more or less out of touch and sympathy with their fellow-countrymen on their return to India?—I should think it did.

703. Although it does not put them out of caste in any way, you think it puts them out of touch?—I think it does rather.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

704. And your grounds for saying so?—That is my personal impression, but I have no doubt that it is so.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

705. In what sense does it put them out of touch?—They think themselves superior to ordinary Natives.

706. Do they cease to respect their people or cease to sympathise with them?—I should think they lose sympathy with them; that is only my opinion and not a matter of experience.

The *President.*

707. Would the requirement of a temporary residence in England as a condition precedent to, or following on, appointment to the Government Service have the effect of excluding from such appointment any considerable or important section of the Native community?—I should like to withdraw my previous statement as to that. I cannot undertake to say.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

708. Would you say long residence abroad, and a short residence, had the same effect?—I cannot undertake to say.

Syud Ahmed, Khán Báhádur.

709. Would that loss of touch apply equally to Mahomedans, or is it confined to particular classes?—I have no personal experience to enable me to say.

The *President.*

710. If the Statutory system is discontinued, should special provision be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of Natives who, for religious or other sufficient reasons, are unable or unwilling to undertake a journey to and residence in England?—I do not see the necessity. I do not approve of that.

711. Would you appoint men of high family, subject to antecedent guarantees of fitness in that case?—No.

712. Ought similar power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts persons who have proved their merit and ability in Government Service or in the exercise of a profession without preliminary examination or competition?—Yes, I think it would be a good thing to examine those who have proved themselves deserving of nomination by good service to Government in five or six years' trial in the Uncovenanted Service.

Mr. *Stokes.*

713. An officer who had only served for five or six years would almost necessarily have been serving in a subordinate position?—Yes.

714. And his capacity would probably be known to one or two officers only, whose recommendation would have to be accepted by the Government?—I should think that in five or six years he would be known to more than one or two.

715. You would not appoint to any of the posts usually reserved for the Covenanted Service an officer who was unacquainted with English?—No.

716. If such is likely to be the case, could the difficulty be obviated by requiring proficiency in the English language to be tested by periodical examinations after selection, but during a probationary period?—I think not.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

717. How do you think they would perform their duties?—My idea is that it is very unlikely that they would get in for a long time and that only those who knew English would really come forward.

Mr. *Ryland.*

718. Perhaps you mean that you would not insist upon a very high standard?—I don't say that.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

719. If you wanted to promote men now from the Uncovenanted to Covenanted posts, would your choice be limited if a high standard of English were insisted upon?—I should have thought that there might be an open competition amongst those who had proved good service for four or five years.

720. Have you enough men with a thorough knowledge of English to choose from,—that is, if you were to insist upon a thorough knowledge of English, would your field of choice be limited?—It would at present.

The *President.*

721. Do you think a thorough knowledge of English could be acquired during the probationary period, after the man is appointed?—I have never considered that.

722. Should provision be made for the occasional appointment, in very special and exceptional cases, to Covenanted posts of persons of known ability and local influence whom, although they may never have held office and may not possess special professional qualifications, and although their age may exceed the limit laid down for untried candidates, it might nevertheless be considered desirable to appoint to the higher grades for political or other reasons?—No.

Mr. *Stokes.*

723. Do you not think it would be preferable to have a full-power Magistrate who posessed a thorough knowledge of English?—Infinitely preferable.

The *President.*

724. Assuming a fixed proportion to be maintained between Europeans and Natives in the Civil Service *cadre*, in what posts or classes of appointments do you consider that Europeans and Natives respectively might be employed with most advantage to the interests of the public Service?—Europeans in the Executive line, and Natives, in a limited degree, in the Judicial line.

Mr. *Stewart.*

725. To what appointments would you limit the Natives in the Judicial line?—I am not prepared yet to say that any Native whom I have seen in this Province should get anything higher than a District Judgeship. By Native I mean pure Asiatic.

The *President.*

726. Would you distribute your appointments rateably among Hindus and Mahomedans?—Altogether.

Mr. *Stokes.*

727. There is a Native of Bengal who has done very well in the Bombay Civil Service?—Yes, I daresay it is so.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

R. T. Burney, Esq., C.S.

Mr. *Stokes*—continued.

728. Do you think a Native of the North-West Provinces would be likely to succeed in the Punjab?—Some parts of the North-West Provinces are so close to the Punjab that perhaps there would not be so much difference But certainly as a rule I would keep men entirely to their Provinces.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

729. Would you exclude Natives of those Provinces from the Punjab?—As a rule I would. I have no doubt that people of this Province would rather be ruled over by a European than a Bengali or a Madrassi.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

730. Have you any actual experience of the existence of such a feeling?—That has been my impression ever since I came to the Punjab.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

731. Are Punjabis employed in other Provinces,—I do not speak of the Army or the Police?—I do not know.

The *President.*

732. How would the following scheme be regarded by the Native community?—(1) the Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of European officers, admission being by competition in England, confined to European candidates only; (2) the appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, Natives only being eligible?—Natives would get more appointments by it. I think certainly that those who were likely to get appointments would like it, but I do not think the ordinary class of Natives would. By ordinary class I mean the zemindars and the bulk of the population, *i.e.* the people to be governed; they would not like it. I do not regard the scheme with favour. I think the European is the best administrator.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

733. You dislike it because you believe it would not be satisfactory to the people, nor procure the most efficient machinery?—Yes.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

734. Do you think the Natives of the Province would prefer to be governed by Europeans rather than by Natives of the Province?—Certainly, the great bulk of the people to be governed would. I do not profess to know much about the opinion of the educated classes, but those are the opinions of the rural population.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

735. Have you asked any of them the question?—When I was Deputy Commissioner I had a great deal of intercourse with the mass of the people, and also in one Native State, and I think I must have asked the question.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

736. You think they would not be influenced in their answers by personal considerations? I mean do you think you got a candid answer?—I think so. My opinion, however, is more the result of observation than enquiry.

Mr. *Stewart.*

737. Do the people ever show, by applications for transfer made to you, that they would prefer cases to be tried by Europeans rather than by Natives?—I have had many such applications.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

738. Do you have any applications for transfer of cases from Europeans to Natives?—No. I never heard of such applications.

Mr. *White.*

739. You have never had any experience with regard to administration by a Native officer?—I was in charge of a Native State for two years and a half.

740. You say that Europeans are most fitted to govern; but has any Native been put in such a position as to enable you to draw that conclusion?—I do not mean govern in the sense of being a Tahsíldár or an Extra Assistant Commissioner. No, there are no Natives in the governing posts.

The *President.*

741. How would the Native community regard the following:—(1) the Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of appointments, to be filled by competition in England to which Natives and Europeans alike would be admitted; (2) the appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, both Natives and Europeans being eligible?—I think it is rather an intricate scheme: but I think that the Native community would prefer a greater proportion of Europeans; that is to say, the mass of the people would. I am not in favour of such a scheme.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

742. Would you have an open competition in India?—No.

The *President.*

743. Do. you think the Native community would disapprove of any system of competition in India?—No, I do not think they would.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

744. Do you think the Natives would like it?—Yes, I think they would. What I mean to say is, I do not think the governed classes would like a greater proportion of Natives to govern them; but the class which aspires to govern would like it.

Mr. *Stewart.*

745. If we wanted to get good Natives into high positions, would that be a good way to get them?—Natives who have served Government for five or six years and given proofs of unblemished service might be appointed after competition. I am against open competition in the country altogether as a way to get into the Covenanted Civil Service.

Mr. *White.*

746. Do you approve of the scheme suggested in the first part of the question?—Certainly not.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

747. When you speak of Native opinion, do you mean the opinion of the Native community generally, or only the opinion of the population of this Province?—I do not speak of Native opinion outside the Punjab.

The *President.*

748. Assuming a system of nomination or of limited competition among nominated candidates, would Native opinion be in favour of giving a preference, as between candidates possessed of certain preliminary essential qualifications and having on general grounds fairly equal claims, in the following or any other order to—(*a*) members of families of tried loyalty and distinguished service; (*b*) persons of good social status and influence in the country; and (*c*) persons of superior educational attainments, such as persons who have taken the degree of M.A.? What is your opinion as to giving such preference?—Native opinion would be very much divided. The educated classes would prefer (*c*), and others either (*a*) or (*b*). I would not give the preference to members of good families. My idea is that Natives ought to go to England and compete there; but, if you cannot secure that and do away with the Statutory system, Natives, after five or six years' service, should be allowed to get in by open competition. Open competition gives the best men in England; but English training and the training afforded in this country are very different things.

Mr. *Stokes.*

749. Do you think that the attempt of Government to give a preference to men of good family has been a failure?—Almost a failure.

Mr. *White.*

750. Then practically you would abide by the existing law, which says Natives of approved merit and ability are to be promoted?—I like that principle, but I do not like the Statutory system.

The *President.*

751. Your own opinion is that there should be no door of admission to the Covenanted Service but by competition in England, which should be open to all classes?—Yes; but if the Government decide to have another door, then it should be as I have said. I would give the Government wide discretion in excluding people whom they do not think fit, even if those people are able to pass the intellectual test.

Mr. *Ryland.*

752. Would you have a further competition by examination after the term of probation?—Yes.

Mr. *Peacock.*

753. Do you not think that that would press very hardly on the senior men of the Uncovenanted Service, for the reason that older men are not as a rule able to pass the standard?—No; because it should not be open to men of more than five years' service.

The *President.*

754. How would the Native community regard a system of nomination on the ground of merit and ability shown in the Service of Government or in the exercise of a profession alternating with a system of selection by means of competition, whether entirely open or amongst nominated candidates?—I am sure the Natives of the Punjab would not like it. I am against it too.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

755. You said you would not have open competition in this country, and your reason was that there is a difference between a training in England and in this country. Could you tell us the nature of the difference?—That is a very difficult question to answer. I think, as an Englishman, I am bound to say I prefer an English training.

756. Have you any experience of the training in this country?—I have seen a great number of men who have come out of the schools and colleges here. My observations are entirely confined to the Punjab.

The *President.*

757. Should subjects of Native States be eligible for appointment to Covenanted posts in British India?—Yes, I think so.

758. Would you confine it to what are called the feudatory States, or extend it to

The *President*—continued.

any Native State?—I would confine it to the feudatory States.

759. How is the present system of regulating appointments to the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, regarded by influential sections of the Native community?—That depends upon how you interpret the word influential.

760. Let us say Native leaders of society who are capable of influencing the Native community?—I think the new rules which you have introduced have been looked upon very favourably.

761. And those introduced by the Chief Court?—They have opened up appointments very much.

762. Has the existing system the effect of securing for the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, persons who are found to be thoroughly qualified for the performance of their duties?—There has been a great improvement in the work lately.

Mr. *Stokes.*

763. The element of competition enters largely into the recent rules, and the improvement is to be attributed to the introduction of that system?—I think so. I cannot say whether the tribunals are as popular as they used to be. The old Munshi class, from whom Munsifs were appointed, were all of a low class, sometimes they were of good family; but if they were, they did not succeed.

Mr. *Peacock.*

764. Has the Chief Court laid down any special qualifications for the appointment of Munsifs?—Yes; I think after 1887 it will be almost impossible for any one to obtain them who is not a B.A. There are two Registers: Register A, not for competition; and Register B, which is open to competition. But in all cases the candidate must be of good character and recommended by the Deputy Commissioner or Commissioner of the district to which he belongs. To that extent there is a nomination. It would be an improvement if there was none. It would make very little difference if those restrictions were removed: practically they are very slight and no bar at all. The recommendation is very easily obtained by persons of good family.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

765. You just now said that the present system of recruiting the Subordinate Executive and Judicial Services is an improvement on the late system?—I am speaking more of the Judicial Service.

766. In the Judicial Service the appointments are filled up by a system of competition among selected candidates or by nomination?—Yes.

The Hon'ble Justice *Mitter*—continued.

767. You also said that the competitive system in the country is not the means by which you get the best men: what is the reason why this is so in one case and not in another?—I was talking merely of the Subordinate Service. The first question I was asked had reference to the superior Service. I have only said that the class of men we get is very much improved: I have not said that we get the best men.

The *President.*

768. To what sections of Native society do the persons belong who accept, under existing conditions, appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services respectively?—I think they are much the same as before.

769. To what extent do Natives of good family and education in your Province offer themselves as candidates for Subordinate Judicial and Executive appointments?—I cannot say that they come up freely, but they do come up.

To Mr. *Stokes.*—They do not come up freely because they think they won't pass.

770. Do Natives who have been to England for purposes of study on their return to India willingly accept such appointments?—We have not seen those men yet.

771. How far are such appointments in your Province restricted to persons *bonâ fide* resident in and connected with the Province?—I think altogether. The old Munsifs used to come from the Delhi districts lying on the borders of the Punjab. I daresay their sons come forward, but they are principally naturalised Punjabis.

772. How far are professional classes represented in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, in your Province?—Meaning, I presume, by the professional classes the lawyers, I think a few have got into the Judicial line. I feel certain that no member of the Bar has got into the Executive.

773. Do you think they readily accept employment in the Judicial line?—It depends on whether they have been successful or not at the Bar. Not many of our Pleaders go up for the examination. Some have done so. I do not think any have gone up from the Chief Court. Some district Pleaders of the lower branch have been up. If successful they would begin on Rs. 150. A Pleader in ordinary practice in the Chief Court would make, I suppose, Rs. 500 or Rs. 600. Our Bar is a very small one comparatively.

774. Whatever system or systems may at present be adopted for the purpose of regulating appointments to the Subordinate Executive and Judicial Services, respectively, are any class or classes of persons expressly or practically excluded from such appointments?—I do not think so.

775. Is it the case that certain classes of Uncovenanted appointments are practically

To Mr. *Stokes*—continued.

reserved for Natives of pure descent owing to the fact that conditions are imposed which have resulted in shutting out Eurasians and other Statutory Natives of mixed descent?—No Statutory Natives or Eurasians have succeeded yet, but they are not expressly excluded.

776. What has been the effect on the efficiency of the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services in your Province of the orders of the Government of India dated 18th April 1879, which debar, unless with the previous sanction of the Governor-General in Council, (1) the appointment of any person, not being a Native of India within the Statutory meaning, to an office carrying a salary of Rs. 200 a month or upwards, and (2) the promotion to such an office of persons, not being Statutory Natives, who entered the Department concerned after the 1st January 1879?—I think it has had the effect of confining the Service entirely to Natives.

777. Is it, in your opinion, necessary that there should be a proportion of Europeans either in the Subordinate Executive Service or in the Subordinate Judicial Service, or in both of those Services?—It would be better to have some. Perhaps in the Judicial Service it does not make much difference, but it would, I consider, be better to have more Europeans in the Executive line. We must have men who know English to be in charge of Treasuries. That is one reason why I say we should have more Europeans.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

778. In other Provinces nearly all the Treasury officers are Natives?—Native officers have recently been put in charge of Treasuries here also. I think the administration of Treasuries is made more efficient by an admixture of Europeans.

Mr. *White.*

779. Is it open to a non-domiciled European to domicile his son and give him the privileges which attach to an Indian domicile?—It is a matter of choice.

780. What, in your opinion, is the requisite proportion to be maintained between Europeans and Natives in those Services?—I would not reduce the number of Europeans in the Executive more than has been already done. I should like to increase the number. I refer to Extra Assistant Commissioners, not to Tahsíldárs I think the reduction has gone too far already.

781 Has experience shown that Europeans serving in such capacities become dissatisfied with their position, and with the general conditions as to pay, promotion, and retiring annuity under which they hold their appointments, and that their efficiency as public servants is consequently impaired?—I think so.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

782. Dissatisfied in what respect?—With their pay.

783. Unless their pay is increased you do not think there is a chance of increasing the number of Europeans?—Oh yes, I do.

Mr. *Stokes.*

784. Then they would all be dissatisfied Europeans?—I do not think so. At present they are dissatisfied with their not getting the promotion they expected. Their prospects were better before the order of 1879, and I think that is a cause of dissatisfaction. They also feel aggrieved at the results of the recent reorganisation of the Service.

The *President.*

785. Do you think a European entering with his eyes open into the Service as it is now as regards pay, promotion, and leave rules would necessarily become dissatisfied?—In course of time he would.

Mr. *Stewart.*

786. You do not think you would get Englishmen of high attainments to take the post of Extra Assistant Commissioner and remain contented with it all through?—I think not.

787. Are you in favour of laying down a rule that high educational capacity should be regarded as an essential qualification for appointment to the Subordinate Executive and to the Subordinate Judicial Services as defined for the purposes of these questions?—You must, I think, abandon some of the higher educational tests, especially for officers you want to put in charge of Treasuries. As it stands you will never get Europeans to pass into these Extra Assistant Commissionerships. It is often desirable to promote such men to the charge of Treasuries, and you will get men very good for the purpose, but who would not be able to pass the test. I should like to see the men appointed to take charge of Treasuries by selection.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

788. Why not, if the tests are too high for Europeans, appoint Natives to the Treasuries?—I have said it would be better to appoint Europeans to take charge of the larger Treasuries.

The *President.*

789. Do you think Natives should be in charge of Treasuries in Cantonments for instance?—I should not like to see them there. I think for such Treasuries Europeans are better qualified than Natives. I certainly prefer to keep Europeans in charge of Treasuries.

790. What test would you apply in the case of Natives?—I would advocate a system

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

R. T. Burney, Esq., C.S.

The *President*—continued.

of competition with some limited form of nomination.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

791. Would you abolish the power of Government to reward approved merit in the Uncovenanted Service with reserved posts in the Covenanted Service?—I think the Government might retain that power, but it should be very sparingly exercised, and subjected to the control of the Secretary of State.

Syud Ahmed, Khán Báhádur.

792. You have said that the education imparted in India is not sufficient or proper as a training for the Covenanted Service. Would you improve it in such a way as to make it possible to supply that training?—I think it would be very difficult to do so.

The *President*.

793. What is the prevalent feeling in your Province regarding the existing Statutory system? If the feeling is one of dissatisfaction, is the dissatisfaction general or is it confined to certain sections of the community?—I am unable to say what is the prevalent feeling amongst the Native community regarding the Statutory Service, but the English officials with whom I have discussed the question pronounce it a failure.

794. What are the grounds upon which any such feeling is based?—Perhaps it is because the selection has not been always successful.

795. Is the feeling of dissatisfaction, if it exists, directed against the Statute itself (33 Vic., Chapter 3, section 6), or is it directed against the rules framed thereunder?—The feeling of dissatisfaction is directed against the whole system, and I would abolish it altogether and let Natives compete for the ordinary Civil Service.

796. If the objections are directed against the rules framed under the Statute, do they relate, to the mode or modes of selection actually adopted?—I am not acquainted with the objections raised by Natives to the rules, but the modes of selection actually adopted seem wrong.

797. Assuming the Statutory system to be retained, what amendments would you suggest in the rules with a view to remove any reasonable objection which may be felt to them?—I think that it is a pity to retain the Statutory system, but, on the assumption that it is to be retained, I would advocate that appointments should be given by a kind of limited competition among officials of proved good service and of five or six years' standing.

798. How do Statutory Civilians compare, in regard to their work as public servants, with Native Civilians who have passed in by the channel of the English competition?—We have no Native Civilians in the Punjab who have passed in by the channel of the English competition.

The *President*—continued.

799. How do Statutory Civilians nominated or selected by competition compare in regard to their work with Statutory Civilians selected on the ground of merit and ability previously proved in the Uncovenanted Service, or other branches of the Government Service, if any such selections have been made?—There are but five Native gentlemen in the Punjab who have been appointed by the Statutory system, and I believe that they were all nominated.

800. Are they so regarded by the general public? or by their *confrères* in the Service who have entered through the competitive channel?—As to how Statutory Civilians are regarded, I cannot answer for the Native public, but I think the English public and their *confrères* in the Service, who have entered through the competitive channel, are inclined to regard Statutory Civilians as inferior.

801. If such a feeling exists, on what grounds is it based?—The chief ground is because the Native gentlemen have not had the same training. There are probably plenty of other reasons also.

802. Do the general public view with any difference the status of Statutory Civilians and that of Uncovenanted Officers? If so, on what grounds?—I should think that the general English public were scarcely aware that there was a Statutory system.

803. Do competitive Civilians, English and Native, and members of the Uncovenanted Service, respectively, stand on a footing of cordiality with Statutory Civilians, or is there any friction between them?—I am not aware that there is any friction.

804. Has the Statutory system had the effect of securing men who, in point of education or natural ability, are superior to the average of those appointed or promoted to the higher ranks of the Uncovenanted Service?—No.

805. Has the result of the Statutory system been to secure the services of men of better social position and better family than those who usually accept posts in the Uncovenanted Service?—I believe that some at least of the Statutory Civilians come from some of the best families in the Punjab, but there are men in the Uncovenanted Service of equally good family.

806. Do young men among the landed aristocracy or of good family display unwillingness to accept employment under the Statutory Rules?—Judging from the eagerness with which appointments of all kinds are grasped at by young men, however good their family is, I should say that there was no unwillingness among the aristocracy to accept employment in the Statutory Service; but this is a question which can best be answered by the Government.

The *President*—continued.

807. Do young men among the landed aristocracy or of good family display unwillingness to accept posts in the Uncovenanted Service and a willingness to accept employment under the Statutory Rules? If so, on what grounds?—I doubt if the distinction between the Statutory and Uncovenanted Services is appreciated by the Native aristocracy.

808. Is there any marked difference in ability, social position, efficiency, or other respects between Natives who have been appointed under 24 and 25 Vic., Chapter 54, and Natives appointed under the Statutory Rules?—As far as I am aware experience has shown little or no difference between the work of the Statutory Civilians of aristocratic families and those selected from other classes.

809. Has the appointment of Natives under the Statutory rules or under 24 and 25 Vic., Chapter 54, produced uncertainty or uneasiness in the minds of Covenanted Civil Servants as to their promotion and prospects?—I have never heard that it did, but the system is new in the Punjab, and this question can better be answered by my juniors.

810 On the assumption that the Statutory system is retained, how would appointment to the Statutory Service by nomination be regarded by influential sections of the Native community in your Province?—Those of good family would of course prefer nomination, whilst the lower classes would naturally prefer competition. Each class, of course, will advocate the system under which they are most likely to get appointments

811. Would a system of nomination, with or without probation, be likely to secure well-qualified persons?—I do not think that simple nomination, with or without probation, would turn out well.

Mr. *Stewart*.

812. The present men are all nominated?—Yes.

Mr. *White*.

813. You condemn the present system under which the Statutory Service is recruited?—Yes.

814. Well, that is due, is it not, to men of approved merit and ability in the Uncovenanted Service not having been promoted to the Covenanted Service, in violation of the Act?—I suppose Government at the time thought they had got the best men. I think it is difficult to say there was any violation of the Act; but I think the men whom Government happened to appoint in this instance have not turned out so well as they expected.

The *President*.

815. Has experience actually shown such a system to secure well-qualified officers?—No.

The *President*—continued.

816 Do you consider that nominations should be confined to persons of proved merit and ability?—I am against the system of nomination altogether.

817. If so, how do you consider that merit and ability should be held to have been proved for this purpose?—By five or six years of service.

818. How would a system of limited competition amongst persons nominated for this purpose by the Local Governments, or by the Universities, or by those authorities concurrently or alternately, be regarded?—I think that there are least objections to a scheme of limited competition among officials of proved good service. No one should be allowed to compete who had not an unblemished record of at least five or six years' service, and I would, if possible, make the term longer still. Government would of course have the power of excluding from competition those whose work had not been satisfactory, but the University should have nothing to do with the selection. The members would, as a rule, know little or nothing about the candidates, and there might be favouritism if the candidate was known. There are objections of course to this scheme also, but it seems, on the whole, the least objectionable. If young men are appointed by competition and have to serve on probation afterwards, it would be next to impossible to get rid of them afterwards unless they turned out conspicuously unfit. It seems to me next to impossible to ascertain how far a man is fit for appointment in Government Service unless he has been thoroughly tried; and a year or two's service between the age of twenty and twenty-five is not sufficient. The probation should be longer, and only those who have served Government well for five or six years should be permitted to compete for admission into a Statutory Covenanted Service.

819. In preference to either of the above systems (nomination and limited competition), would a system of open competition, pure and simple, for the Statutory Service commend itself to the Native community?—The Native community generally would probably prefer open competition, but those of the best familes would naturally prefer nomination.

820. If competition (whether limited or open) is preferred, should there be one competition for all India or separate competitions in each Province?—If competition for appointments in the Punjab is to be opened to all India, the Punjabis would not have much chance.

821. If there were only one general competition, how would you ensure a due proportion of appointments falling to the population of the several Provinces?—A due proportion of appointments could not be ensured unless some special subjects were fixed for each Province, and then the competition would cease to be general.

The *President*—continued.

822. Under any of the three systems of nomination, limited competition, and open competition would you prescribe any tests of preliminary qualifications on the part of nominees or candidates in regard to (1) age, (2) intellectual capacity, (3) moral, social, and physical fitness?—If there was to be a limited competition I would allow all to compete who could show that they had served Government for five or six years to the entire satisfaction of their superiors, and had proved by their work that they were morally and physically fit. The maximum of age should be something between twenty-five and thirty. But Government should have a wide discretion in excluding from competition any one to whom objection of any kind could be taken, even though there might be a good chance of his passing the intellectual test.

823. Do you consider that (after selection, whether by nomination or competition) there should be a period of probation? If so, what should be the duration of the probationary period?—As I have already said I think that the probation should be for five or six years *previous* to competition.

824. Should the period of probation be passed in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service or of the Covenanted Service, or in what other manner?—It should be passed in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service.

825. Do you consider that after selection and before entering on probation (or on duty) the person selected should undergo special training? If so, should the special training be carried out in India or in England? If in India, would it be possible, and if possible advisable, to establish an Indian Civil Service College on the basis of the Haileybury College which formerly existed in England?—If there is any training it should be in Government Service, to which the candidate would not ordinarily have been admitted without some educational test.

826. Are you in favour of the establishment of scholarships tenable by Natives in England for the purpose of enabling them to qualify for the Civil or Statutory Service?—and

827. If so, how would you connect such a scheme with the selection of Natives for employment in the higher administrative posts in India?—Yes, but only to enter the Civil Service. I would not connect them with the Statutory Service.

828. If the opportunity of residence in England at a University for two years with a sufficient allowance were offered to nominees or selected candidates, is it likely that it would be taken advantage of to any great extent?—I think it would.

829. If the system of examination in England were revised with the result that Natives availed themselves of it in considerable numbers, would it still be necessary to retain the Statutory system?—I do not think it necessary to retain the Statutory system, whether the system of examination in England be revised or not.

830. What has been the experience, in your Province, in regard to their work as public servants, of Natives who have entered the Covenanted Civil Service through the competitive channel in England?—I never met any.

831. Should additional facilities be given to Natives for proceeding to England and entering the Indian Civil Service by the channel of the English competition?—I am not much in favour of giving additional facilities.

832. If so, what form or forms should such facilities take?—Supposing that it was found necessary to give additional facilities, scholarships by which the candidate's expenses to and from England could be paid, together with his maintenance while in England.

833. What conditions, if any, should be attached to them?—If such scholarships were given, they would of course be subject to forfeiture in case of misconduct or idleness.

834. What is your opinion as to giving Statutory appointments to Natives who, though they may have failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, have shown merit in the English competition?—I think that it would be hard to fix any such standard, and to say that a candidate who has failed for the competitive Civil Service is still entitled to a prize. An idea would probably spring up among Natives that the mere fact of a man going to England was sufficient to entitle him to a reward. It would be extremely difficult to refuse an appointment of any kind to a man who had only just fallen short of the second or lower standard imposed.

835. Assuming it to be advisable to appoint to the Statutory Service in India Natives who have failed in the English competition, should such persons receive the same training as successful candidates in England, and be subject to the same final examination?—Yes.

836. Can you say what number of Natives belonging to your Province have presented themselves annually at the competitive examination in England, and what degree of success they attained?—I believe none have.

837. Should the examination for Natives in England be distinct in standard and conditions from that for English candidates, or should there be one and the same examination for all?—They should certainly not be distinct. There should be one and the same examination.

838. If the standard and conditions were different, how would it be possible to compare the results in the two examinations so as to bring out one list in order of merit?—I should think it would be quite hopeless.

The *President*—continued.

839. Would it under such circumstances be desirable to allot a fixed proportion of appointments to each of the two examinations?—No.

840. If a fixed proportion of appointments were allowed for a Native examination in England, do you consider that, in view of the objections against a voyage to England and life there, the cost thereof, and the chances of failure, a sufficient number of suitable candidates from your Province would be available to make the competition a real competition?—Judging from the fact that no one has yet gone up, I should say no.

841. If the examination were distinct, what should be the limits of age for the Native examination?—I would not make any distinction.

842. Assuming only one examination in England for both English and Native candidates, do you consider that the subjects and standards of examination and the conditions as to age and other matters in any respect place Native candidates at a disadvantage as compared with English candidates?—Natives are of course at a disadvantage.

843. If so, in what respects are Native candidates placed at a disadvantage, and what alterations would you recommend with a view to remove that disadvantage?—The English candidate gets a far better training in an English school, and it seems impossible to remove the disadvantage unless the Native candidate submits to the same training.

844. If there should be only one examination for all candidates, should the limits of age for Natives be higher than those at present fixed for European candidates; and if so, what should the limits for Native candidates be?—I would make no difference in the limit of age between European and Native candidates.

845. From what classes of Native society are the persons who graduate at the Indian Universities usually drawn in your Province?—From all classes.

846. Do you advocate a competition in India for the Civil Service simultaneously with the competition in England, the same question papers being used at both examinations?—No.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter*.

847. Would you raise the age?—I would leave that to be decided at home; I should say there ought to be one age for the European and the Native, whatever it may be.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar*.

848. Why do you object to a competitive examination in India?—Because I do not think examinations are properly conducted in this country; the mode of examining in this country could not possibly be the same as at home, because part of the examination at home is *vivâ voce*. You could not possibly have the same *vivâ voce* examination for both countries.

Mr. *Stokes*.

849. The only objection you have is the practical one that the examinations could not be the same?—I have also no confidence in the way examinations in this country are conducted. They have been the subject of considerable talk in the Punjab lately, and the impression exists that it would be very difficult to get examinations fairly conducted. The examination papers are continually being tampered with. That has happened here quite recently.

Mr. *Stewart*.

850. Would you object even if proper precautions were taken?—Yes, I have not much faith in examinations held in this country. Of course my experience is confined to the Punjab.

The *President*.

851. How would this method of selection be regarded by the Native community generally?—It would probably be very popular.

852. If Native candidates were admitted to the competition in England, while English candidates were excluded from the competition in India, on what grounds could this distinction be justified?—It would be quite unjustifiable if the object was simply to get the best men.

853. Do you consider that the educational institutions available in India are at present capable of giving the very high class education which it was the object of the competitive system introduced in 1855 to secure?—Certainly not.

854. Would an open competition in India be likely to give decided advantages to any particular class or classes of the Native community over others?—The Punjabis would be at a disadvantage.

WITNESS VIII.—17th December 1886.

Examination of W. MACKWORTH YOUNG, Esq., of the Covenanted Civil Service, Secretary to Government, Punjab.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

W. Mackworth Young, Esq.

The *President*.

855. Kindly state to the Commission what your position in the Service is?—I am Secretary to the Punjab Government. I have been 23 years in the Service. I have also been Secretary to the Financial Commissioner. Before that I served as Assistant Commissioner and District Officer, also as Settlement Officer. I have had a good deal of experience of the working both of the Executive and Judicial Services. I have also been in charge of a Native State. I know most of the Statutory Civilians personally.

856. State generally your views regarding the working of 33 Victoria, Chapter III of 1870, and the rules framed under it?—I would abolish 33 Victoria. I think the Statute and the rules should be abolished as not affording the means of appointing the persons we want. The rules would go if the Statute went. I would abolish the system. I object to the Statute as well as the rules.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

857. You would not retain the Statute for a limited purpose?—I do not think the Statute and rules, as they are at present, are such as to produce what we want. In the first place the Statute only admits Natives of India.

Syud Ahmed, Khán Báhádur.

858. The Statute gives power to the Governor-General to do certain things. Would you abolish that?—I would abolish that power. My reason for wishing the Statute abolished is because it admits Natives of India to Covenanted posts, and I do not think Natives of India should be admitted, in this country, to the Civil Service *cadre*.

Mr. *White*.

859. Would you exclude also Eurasians and domiciled Europeans?—I would. I would not let them be appointed in India. I would exclude domiciled Europeans, Eurasians, and Natives alike. I mean that they should not be admitted to posts which it is decided to reserve for persons appointed in England.

The *President*.

860. What do you propose?—My scheme is as follows:—(1) the Civil Service cadre appointments only to be made by competitive examination in England, without restriction as to race, but without special encouragement of any kind, and that the same treatment should be meted out to all, after appointment, in regard to pay and promotion; (2) the Subordinate Executive and Judicial Services to be recruited Provincially, from all classes of permanent residents (*a*) by promotion from the inferior grades, (*b*) by a system of limited competition; (3) power to be reserved to appoint persons other than members of the Covenanted Civil Service to certain posts at present held by Covenanted Civilians, which posts should be held available for such persons. I mean it should be distinctly understood that Government could always put such persons into them. I mean specific posts, and I think they might be defined from time to time. Such appointments should be made both from the Subordinate Services, from professions, and occasionally from the highest classes of Natives on the ground of approved merit and ability.

861. At present there are one-sixth of the Covenanted appointments reserved for Statutory Civilians. You would abolish the Statutory system. What would you do with that one-sixth?—I cannot say whether I would immediately transfer that one-sixth and make it available for the classes I have mentioned. The fixed *cadre*, and the question how to provide a career for those classes, must necessarily be determined from time to time, and is a matter of detail upon which I am not prepared to offer an opinion.

862. What are your objections to a system of competition in India?—The objections stated generally is that men might get in by a competitive examination held in India who would not succeed at home. I mean that the class of men who might manage to pass the examination in India would not be men of the same *calibre* as those who would be successful at home.

Mr. *Stewart*.

863. Do you think you would get very bad men in India?—I do not think that.

864. Do you think you would get the best Natives in India?—I think a system of

Mr. *Stewart*—continued.

competition could be devised which would enable you to get the best Natives in India, but I do not think that the English system would be suitable for India.

865. Would you get better men than we get now to go to England and compete?—I should say not, because I think that the amount of enterprise which is shown by a man going in for an English training and examination is a characteristic which implies a very large amount of energy, courage, and abandonment of prejudice, which, *primâ facie*, speaks well for a man.

866. You refer chiefly to Hindus?—I admit that the system imposes very considerable obstacles on Natives of this country, and I think that the surmounting of those obstacles would be a very considerable guarantee that the man possesses qualities which should fit him for the higher posts.

Mr. *Stokes*.

867. But if he was ready to go to England after passing the examination here?—That would not require the same qualities of courage, because such a man would have a certainty in prospect. He would not go for the chance. I do not wish to open these appointments at present to Natives of India to a large extent.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*.

868. Supposing it were possible to have the same examination in England and India, do you think we should get more Natives of India into the Service than we do now with the examination in England only?—I do not feel competent to give an opinion on that point, because I do not know the educational condition of the Lower Provinces. In the Punjab, of course, we should have no one.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*.

869. You said you thought a competitive examination in India would secure the best men?—I think I gave my answer without considering that the question referred to an exactly similar examination. I do not think we should get the best men if it was an open competition. What I meant was that such a competitive examination might be devised as would give us the best men.

Mr. *White*.

870. You said just now you would like to see competitive examinations limited chiefly to Europeans?—I only wish for the standard which is obtained by the English examination. I do not wish to see admission limited. I would admit all classes. If the Natives possess this qualification, I do not object to their admission.

The *President*.

871. Are you prepared to give an opinion at all as to the class of appointments which should be reserved in the *cadre* of the Covenanted Service. Would you reserve these appointments for the Covenanted Service?—Certainly. All high executive appointments.

Mr. *Stewart*.

872. Could you indicate the positions at present held by Covenanted Civilians which might be held available for the purpose of giving encouragement to the Subordinate Service?—I think up to District Judgeships, which are really not the District Judgeships of the Regulation Provinces, but the higher Subordinate Judges up to those grades, at Rs. 1,200 and Rs. 1,500. I think there ought to be a career in the judicial line for the Subordinate Service.

Mr. *Ryland*.

873. And the Executive?—As regards the Executive, I have nothing to propose. None of our Subordinate Executive officers are debarred from anything in the executive line below the charge of a district. I have nothing further to propose for them. I would not give them charge of a district. I should not think it expedient to provide a career for the Uncovenanted Service recruited in India up to the post of Deputy Commissioner. That applies to all classes of appointments made in India. The reason is that I think the superior Service should be recruited in England.

874. If your object is to get the best men, why should you exclude men recruited in this country, who may be men of approved ability?—I admit there might be men who are unfortunate enough not to have gone through the English examination and who may yet be qualified for such posts.

The *President*.

875. Your scheme provides for that, as I understand it?—No; I should provide for it in the distant future, because the appointments of the *cadre* which would be available could be defined from time to time.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*.

876. Are there no persons whom you would consider qualified to fill such appointments?—Not at present. I only speak with reference to the Punjab.

The *President*.

877. Is there any member of the Uncovenanted Service whom you consider fit to have charge of a district?—There is one person, but I think there is only one, and his position there is an accident. He is a European. I mean it is an accident that he is in his present position.

The *President*—continued.

878. Do you think that but for the orders of 1879 he would have obtained a better position?—I am not quite sure whether it was those orders which exercised a prejudicial aspect on his career. I don't think it was.

Mr. *White.*

879. Do you know all the officers, Native and European, now serving in the Province?—Yes, I have a full acquaintance, I think, with the qualifications of every officer in the Civil Commission in this Province; I speak as to Native officers as well as Europeans.

The *President.*

880. You practically acquire that in the course of your Secretariat duties?—Yes.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

881. I do not see why you should wish the Statute repealed. Does it not give precisely the power which you wish to reserve?—The Statute limits the selection to Natives of India.

882. But it allows you to construe that term somewhat liberally?—Not quite liberally enough.

883. In what respect?—There are many persons, permanent residents of the Punjab, who could not fulfil the conditions. What you want really is to alter the Statute in respect of the persons eligible under it.

884. Is that your only objection to the Statute?—Yes, I think I have mentioned the only objection I have to the Statute except that I should be sorry if the Statute raised expectations beyond those I have indicated in my scheme.

The *President.*

885. Would you impose any restrictions on the appointments provided by the Statute such as are imposed by the Statute of 1861?—Yes, I should be quite satisfied with the sanction of the Secretary of State merely.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

886. Whom does the term Native exclude?—It excludes the children of European officers who are resident but not domiciled, and it excludes residents of feudatory Native States. I would include both; subjects of Patiala, for instance, should be included.

Mr. *White.*

887. Do you not think that the disqualification as regards some European officers not domiciled is entirely self-created?—No, because the Statute requires their being born in India.

Mr. *Ryland.*

888. Do you think that independent posts, such as are now held by Uncovenanted officers, are really inefficiently administered in this Province?—The only independent posts that are held by Uncovenanted officers are subdivisions, and on the whole I should say they were very well administered.

889. Do you not think that the administration of those posts calls for as high qualities on the part of Uncovenanted men as of Covenanted men?—Certainly.

890. Do you consider the Uncovenanted holders of such posts wanting in ability and competency, or do you merely wish for a safeguard?—I have said that I consider none of them, with perhaps one exception, qualified to hold charge of a district.

891. Have they not been systematically excluded?—Yes.

892. Then you have no means of judging whether they would efficiently administer a district?—Yes, I have observed the behaviour of officials in Native States; and one is also able to form an opinion as to whether a man holding any given post is capable of filling a higher post; and I do not think that any officer from among those of the Uncovenanted Service who in the Punjab have held charge of subdivisions would have been thought competent to hold charge of a district, with one exception. I include domiciled Europeans and Eurasians.

Mr. *White.*

893. You yourself think they would not be capable?—Yes.

Mr. *Ryland.*

894. But you admit that these subordinate posts are efficiently administered, and yet you think these men are not competent to administer higher posts in which they have never been tried?—I do. I think they have attained the end of their tether. I do not think that their education or their general *calibre* is sufficient for the higher posts.

Mr. *White.*

895. That is an opinion not founded on actual experience?—I should rather say I had formed it on experience of their qualities.

896. But you have never tried them in the posts you would exclude them from?—Certainly not.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

897. Has the appointment of Natives under the Statutory Rules, or under 24 and 25 Vic., Chapter 54, produced uncertainty or uneasiness in the minds of Covenanted Civil Servants as to their promotion and prospects?—We have two Natives appointed

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*—continued.

under 24 and 25 Victoria. We have five Natives who were appointed under the Statutory Rules (Statute 33 Vic., Cap. 3, 1870), and two who were appointed otherwise, to posts ordinarily held by the Punjab Commission—this being a Non-Regulation Province. The appointment of Natives under Statutory Rules has not occasioned any uncertainty or uneasiness. The men were all put in at the bottom of the list. I have never heard of its producing any subject of complaint. Of the other two (one Mahomed Hyat Khan) was appointed many years ago. I do not think that his appointment occasioned any uneasiness; and as for the remaining one, his appointment certainly occasioned a good deal, I think owing to the uncertainty as to what it meant.

The *President*.

898. That was an occasion on which a Native was appointed to a high post without going in at the bottom?—Yes, it was in regard to that circumstance that the uneasiness arose.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*.

899. He had been in the Uncovenanted Service previously, had he not?—Yes.

The *President*.

900. But the doubt which existed at the time lay in the uncertainty as to the powers of the Government to make such an appointment?—I don't think so at all. Persons who disapproved of the appointment had lost sight of that.

Mr. *Stewart*.

901. A similar appointment might be made under your scheme?—Yes, but it should be distinctly notified. I think if the man had been a man of marked merit, the objection would never have been felt.

The *President*.

902. Are you aware that he was the only Native of the Province whom the Chief Court reported as a fit person to hold an appointment in which he would have to supervise the work of inferior courts?—Yes.

903. Do you not think an opinion of that kind marked him out from his fellows?—I know the man, and I think his qualifications were not very marked, and that, to some extent, was, I think, the reason why there was dissatisfaction.

904. Has this feeling of uncertainty and uneasiness had an appreciably injurious effect either on the recruitment or on the efficiency of Civil Servants?—To this question my answer would be—no.

The *President*—continued.

905. What is your opinion as to the extent and mode in which Natives should for the future be appointed to Uncovenanted posts in the Punjab?—I think it is time that the element of competition should be brought into all appointments of which we are speaking. You introduced it yourself, Sir, in regard to the appointment of Extra Assistant Commissioners and Munsifs, and the only class which remains is that of Tahsíldár. I think it should be introduced, to a limited extent, in regard to such appointments. It has on the whole worked well and given satisfaction. The only thing that can be said against such an examination is that it has a tendency to secure only one class, and that tendency must be counteracted, therefore, by retaining a system of selection; and this should be done for political as well as administrative reasons.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

W. Mackworth Young, Esq.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

906. Have you an educational qualification for candidates for Tahsíldárships?—Yes, the educational qualification for Tahsíldárs appointed in the Executive Service is prescribed in the general resolution of Government which rules that no one is to be appointed to a post on a salary of Rs. 150 unless he has passed the middle school examination; and it has been proposed recently to raise the standard up to the Entrance examination. The subject is now under consideration.

The *President*.

907. What is the feeling which the different classes in the Punjab entertain regarding the existing mode of appointment to the Uncovenanted Service?—I think I can say generally that the competition which has been introduced is on the whole regarded favourably except by the old and upper and better middle classes, who have hitherto been accustomed to look upon Government Service as their perquisite, and are not particularly pleased with it. These remarks refer to the introduction of the competitive system into the Uncovenanted Service.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*.

908. Can you tell us what the people of the Punjab, dividing them into two classes, the educated class and others who seek Government Service, and those who do not seek Government Service but are materially affected by the qualifications of the officers employed, as to the method in which the Service should be recruited? I mean do the educated classes wish for open competition?—In regard to the superior appointments:—first, I believe that the mass of the people (class 2) would prefer to be governed by Europeans. As for the others (class 1), I believe that the poor families of the Punjab also feel that they had better

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

W. Mackworth Young, Esq.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

have European administrators in the higher posts. They have no wish for any change. The class whose aspirations have been raised of recent years—a small class so far as the Punjab is concerned—wish to see the higher appointments more opened out.

909. You mean their aspirations for employment in the Government Service?—For higher employment. It is a very limited class at present.

910. Will you tell us, as regards the lower appointments in the Service—I mean Subordinate Executive and Judicial appointments—whether you think the same feeling exists?—I think the feeling of most people is in favour of their being filled by Natives of the Province, and, if not, by Europeans.

Mr. *Stokes*.

911. What, the Tahsíldárships and Munsifships?—Yes, I mean they would prefer that a reasonable number of these posts should be held, in the first place, by Natives of the Province, and so far as it is impossible that they should be held by Europeans, they would prefer to see them held by Natives of the Province.

912. Do you refer to Munsifs when you say the mass of the people would like these appointments to be held by Europeans?—I think they would like to see a certain number held by Europeans. In fact I think they feel generally that the more Europeans, the better.

The *President*.

913. Do you think that different parts of the Punjab are differently situated in regard to the requirements of recruiting the Service? I mean, are there some parts of the Province where a higher proportion of Europeans is required for executive or judicial posts?—I am not sure that I should consider that a very much higher proportion is required in one place than in another. The qualifications of the officer have of course to be considered, and the requirements of the place taken into consideration, in making appointments; but I do not think it could be said that a larger proportion of appointments need be held by Europeans in one part rather than in another.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

914. In the frontier districts, for instance?—There are several districts where there is only one European executive officer and a treasury officer perhaps. I think that is sufficient. Very frequently there would be only one.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*.

915. And suppose he is called away, could he be readily replaced?

The *President*.—Take, for instance, the outpost of Thal. Has it been found desirable to have a European or Native officer there?—No doubt a European ought to be placed at Thal and several other frontier outposts which have them already. There are some places where the European staff ought to be strengthened.

The *President*.

916. Would you confine these places to which you refer to the frontier?—I would have European officers also at hill stations, where there is a large European community.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

917. Take the towns where religious feeling runs high: could you safely leave those without European officers?—Certainly not; but I understood the question was whether a larger proportion of Europeans should be appointed in some parts of the Province than in others.

The *President*.

918. Do you think the European element is sufficiently strong in the Uncovenanted staff?—I should like to see a larger admixture of Europeans. There has been a falling off, especially of late years, in the number of this class.

919. Has any inconvenience been found recently, in connection with the riots which took place in some of our towns, owing to the absence of European officers, either during the continuance of the riots or in connection with the trials arising out of them?—Yes, we have had several applications for European officers to try these riot cases.

Mr. *Stokes*.

920. Have you had riots at places where there are no European officers?—No; but we have had applications for Europeans in connection with the riots. I mean judicial aid: there was of course no time to apply for executive aid before the riots took place.

921. Was a paucity of European officers felt in dealing with the riots?—A paucity of European officers is felt in the Punjab generally, and especially when riots occur. My answer now is with reference to executive arrangements generally; but it is also a fact that in two cases we had demands for European officers to try a large number of cases. Those officers were sent. That did not cause any inconvenience elsewhere, because it happened to take place just at the beginning of the cold weather, when a large number of officers had returned from leave. But it might have caused considerable inconvenience had it occurred at another time. When I speak of the paucity of European officers, I refer to Eurasians and domiciled Europeans also. At Delhi a very large number of cases were

Mr. *Stokes*—continued.

waiting disposal—120 I think; and the number at Hoshiarpur was, I think, 37. These cases, in both places, arose immediately out of these riots.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

922. Could you make any reduction in the number of Covenanted Civilians, so as to give a larger opening to Uncovenanted Servants?—I should not advocate that arrangement to any considerable extent. I should be prepared to give up one-fifth, possibly, of the posts—those which are now held by Statutory Civilians.

923. Has the Covenanted European strength in the Punjab been reduced to the very lowest dimensions compatible with the public interests?—I think it has, and, with that reservation of one-fifth, I think it is extremely undesirable to reduce the number.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

924. Supposing arrangements were made which admitted Natives very freely to the Covenanted Service, do you think that the efficiency of the administration would be impaired?—Most certainly.

The *President.*

925. You are aware that when the reorganisation scheme was before Government there was a proposal made to reserve two or three Covenanted Judicial appointments for Natives of the Uncovenanted Service. Suppose that proposal had been sanctioned, do you think the efficiency of the administration would have been impaired?—No; but that is the limit to which I should have been prepared to go, and I should certainly include them within the one-sixth.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

926. Supposing a larger number of Natives to have received an English training, would you still think that the administration would suffer?—I should not be satisfied merely with an English training, and I think that, as we have the competitive examination as the means of selecting the best men, it would be better to adhere to it. I think the appointment of Natives who have received an English training would not be so objectionable as the appointment of Natives who have not. But I would not depart from the system of election by competition in England.

927. Have you many Native Christians in the Services here?—We have a very small Christian population in the Punjab, and we have two Native Christians among the Extra Assistant Commissioners: one is at present officiating as Junior Government Advocate, and the other has been specially selected for an appointment connected with canal administration.

Mr *Ramaswami Mudaliyar*—continued.

928. Have you any reason to be dissatisfied with their work?—They are two of the best men we have in the Uncovenanted Service. They are Natives of the Punjab.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

929. I understand that these opinions have been formed from your own personal experience?—Yes.

Mr. *Ryland.*

930. Mr. Eden, when he was Lieutenant-Governor of Bengal, made this remark: "Opportunity should be taken of doing away with the terms Covenanted and Uncovenanted Service, &c." Do you think it advisable to retain the distinction?—Not in the least. I should be very glad to see any titles abolished which caused any sort of dissatisfaction.

Mr. *Stokes.*

931. Does your only objection to the plan of holding simultaneous examinations in England and in India lie in the fact that there would not be the same guarantee of character in the case of a man examined in India?

Sir *Charles Turner.*—I understood Mr. Young to say that he considered that you might get candidates of an altogether lower class in this country because of the greater facilities of approaching and passing the examination.

Witness.—I meant to say simply this, that I did not think the mere guarantee of a pass in India a good one; that you would not, by merely getting them to pass the examination in India, get the same class of men as you would get by the English examination.

932. Because you would get men who have not the pluck to go to England? Was that the only reason?—No; I have many reasons why I think you would get inferior men. I think a great deal of pressure would be brought to bear upon those who ruled the examinations to conform them to an Indian standard. I think the result of allowing the double system to be put into force would be that in time we should have the standard conformed to the acquirements of Indian students, and that you would get a number of men who had passed in India who would not be as good as we can obtain by adhering to the English examination. I am not in favour of a double system of examination at all; but if such a system were adopted, I should say it would be quite impossible to conduct the examinations on different principles in regard to the eligibility of candidates, and to treat the selected candidates in exactly the same way in both cases. I would not have the examination in India at all for the higher posts.

Vol. I.
Sec. II.
Punjab.

W. Mackworth Young, Esq.

Mr. *Stewart.*

933. Your scheme contemplates the repeal of 33 Vic., 1870. Should you not think, then, that the old Act of 1862 would be sufficient to give that limit of posts you wish should be held available?—I think sufficient power exists, but not sufficient restrictions. The restriction in the old Act of seven years' residence in India would not be required. We should require new parliamentary legislation, I think; and in

Mr. *Stewart*—continued.

regard to the idea of determining from time to time the posts which might be thrown open, legislation would also be necessary.

Note.

Mr. *Mackworth Young*, C.S., Secretary to Government, Punjab, was recalled and examined on the 24th December 1886.

WITNESS IX.—17th December 1886.

Examination of J. BRIDGES-LEE, Esq., Barrister-at-Law, practising in the Chief Court of the Punjab.

The *President.*

934. You are a Barrister practising at Lahore?—Yes, I practise principally in Lahore, and also in other Courts. I have been practising since 1883. I previously practised in Calcutta for a time.

935. You are acquainted with the vernacular I suppose?—I am fairly acquainted with the vernacular, but I do not plead in the vernacular.

936. Kindly indicate to the Commission the points upon which you desire to tender evidence.—I am in the hands of the Commission with reference to the questions I have answered, for the purpose of amplifying any of them, and I may state that my experience has been acquired in the Courts of the country, and in educational matters, of which I have had considerable experience at home.

937. You would then perhaps like to give your views as to the best means of recruiting the Judicial Services, both superior and subordinate, in the country; and upon the educational qualifications which should be required for that Service, and the extent to which our Indian schools and colleges can supply them?—With reference to the recruiting of the Judicial Service, my views are that as far as possible it should be recruited from the Bar, both as regards the Subordinate and Superior Courts, when competent men can be found.

938. Is there a sufficiency of trained men at the Bar at present to supply all the Munsifships and Judicial Assistantships?—I should think certainly not, but if rewards were offered, the supply would, I believe, work up to the demand.

Mr. *Stokes.*

939. You mean by the Bar, the Native Bar as well as Barristers properly so called?—Yes.

The *President.*

940. So you consider that the prospects in the Subordinate Courts are sufficient to attract men who have been long enough at the Bar to show that they are persons of merit and ability sufficient to qualify them for these appointments?—I should say not, unless there are chances of rapid promotion by selection. I should propose always to offer such posts to the best men at the Bar who could be found willing to accept them. I cannot, however, suppose that any change

The *President*—continued.

of that kind can be introduced wholesale and at once. I can only believe that if once you adopt the principle the supply will gradually work up to the demand.

941. You say you would hold out special inducements?—Nothing further than that which would indicate that in future these appointments would be given to members of the Bar when competent men could be found to accept them.

942. And you think that in time members of the Bar would be found in sufficient numbers willing to give up a career in the junior Bar for subordinate appointments in the Government Service?—I think that for the subordinate appointments you would get men as good as you get at present.

943. Would you get better?—It is difficult for me to speak as to that. I have more knowledge of the superior appointments, and I should say, certainly, you would get better men for them.

944. Limiting your consideration to the subordinate appointments, if you did not get better men, what would be the reason for restricting the field of recruiting to the Bar?—I would not propose to do that immediately. I wish to open the Service to the Bar with the idea that in the end you would strengthen the Bar and also the Bench; but I do not for a moment imagine that these changes could be introduced wholesale, and that every appointment could immediately be filled.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

945. Supposing there are two men available for vacant posts, one of them already in the Service, the other at the Bar (including in that term Pleaders as well as Barristers), of equal qualifications; to whom would you give the appointment?—The case is of course a problematical one, and I should consider it difficult to decide where there were equal qualifications; but I should be disposed to think that the qualifications of the men at the Bar, although apparently only equal, would really be superior.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

946. You consider that training for a Judicial office is better secured by a training at the Bar than by service in the ministerial offices?—Yes.

The *President.*

947. Suppose an officer entered from the Bar into one of the lower appointments and served his time, rising gradually through the ordinary grades, would he practically differ, towards the end of his service (having had no practice at the Bar in the meantime) from an officer appointed into the service and rising up in the ordinary way?—I take it such a man would be in the same position, practically, after a good number of years, as a person appointed in the ordinary way. I do not approve of the idea of appointing persons simply in rotation; and my view is that whenever an appointment falls vacant, you should choose, from the whole of the candidates, the most promising and able man; and, I should say, it would not be any ground of hardship that a man is brought in straight to any Judicial appointment from the Bar. It is quite impossible to get the best men otherwise.

948. How many men at the Bar would be willing to forego their career at the Bar for a District Judgeship?—I do not know of any man who would, and I do not suppose that any man of mark would. I understand that the pay of a District Judgeship is not the pay of the post, but the pay of the officer who fills it, according as he is a Covenanted Civilian or otherwise. I understand that the pay varies.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

949. What pay do you think would induce an efficient man to exchange the Bar for the Bench?—I should think that a man who could succeed in his profession would under no circumstances accept the appointment. But there are in our profession, men of known ability in the profession, who can work well on paper though they lack facility of speech,—men having a good knowledge of the law, being good draughtsmen and of considerable experience, who have to compete, abler Advocates and who would therefore not be able to earn in the profession a large amount of money—these gentlemen would be willing to accept such appointments. In a large Bar, such as the Calcutta Bar and the Bombay Bar, I should say there would be no difficulty in obtaining a general opinion as to who were best fitted at that Bar for Judicial appointments, and, at the same time, willing to take them.

950. I suppose you would consider the Judges of the Presidency Small Cause Court in Calcutta efficient?—I consider that they are very efficient Judges, far better than the average of Judges we have in this Province.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

951. Do you include the Native pleaders as well as the Barristers in your remarks?—Yes. I do not think it would be fair to make any distinction. One or two of the

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

Native Pleaders in the High Court at Calcutta are unquestionably some of the ablest men we have. I wish to make my views distinctly understood that the leading advocates, with a career before them at the Bar, most unquestionably would not take these posts. I am speaking of the Indian Bar generally.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

952. When you say men at the Bar who have not got facility of speech, but have other qualifications which would qualify them to be made Judges, do you mean the Bar generally at Calcutta, Bombay, and Madras, &c., or the local Bar?—The Bar generally as I have said. I think the Bar in the Punjab is comparatively a weak Bar.

The *President.*

953. Do you think the educational arrangements of the Province give the means of training a Bar efficient enough to fit in with your scheme?—I think the Bar is not trained by the education its members have received in schools and colleges, but by open competition among themselves. That is the effective training. I believe there is not an advocate at the Bar who would not accept a Judgeship in the Chief Court if it were offered.

954. Would any member of the Bar here accept a District Judgeship?—Certainly, many of the Pleaders would.

955. A Divisional Judgeship?—There are many who would take Divisional Judgeships, but I do not know that such an appointment would be offered them. I know no leading member of the local Bar here at present who would accept a District Judgeship. The Bar here is very weak and does not afford the material we should require for our Judicial administration. It would immediately improve if the prospects were to improve.

956. Supposing appointments were rapidly made, are we within a measurable distance of having an efficient Bar from which such appointments could be supplied?—Certainly, and in the meanwhile they could be supplied from Calcutta. At the Calcutta Bar there are over 20 appointments open to the Bar; consequently there are men in the Calcutta Bar who stay on patiently in the hope and belief that they will get an appointment in time, and they do. I have known several members of the Calcutta Bar who have done fairly well in Judicial appointments within recent years, and others who, from time to time, have taken officiating appointments.

957. Do you think it advisable to have a large number of Judicial appointments filled by men who are not acquainted with the vernacular of a Province?—I think a knowledge of the vernacular is acquired, for the most part, in the Court by practice

The *President*—continued.

I should like to see, in this Province, the Judicial Branch of the service separated entirely from the Executive Branch. I have known many instances where the two classes of duties have seriously clashed and are working great injury.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

958. This Commission is appointed for the purpose of seeing how far the Government can satisfy the just claims of the Natives of India to higher and more extensive employment in the public Service. Are your answers given with a view to the Natives of India, or to the Englishmen who may come out? I want to know whether it is with reference to the Native Pleaders in the Punjab only that you advocate the selection of the Judges of the higher and lower appointments from the local Bar?—I should deprecate making any distinction between Natives, Eurasians, and Europeans. I think all should be precisely on the same footing with perfectly even chances.

959. Do you think, then, that the majority of the higher appointments would go to the Native Pleaders or to the European Barristers?—I cannot say. As an Englishman, I think we should win. That is my own opinion.

960. Do you think the arrangement would result in the Natives of India getting the appointments or in Englishmen getting them?—I cannot possibly tell. I think it would bring a number of Natives into the Service, because I have no doubt that a large number of Native Pleaders are exceedingly able men.

961. Are not those appointments which the Native Pleaders would fill now filled by Natives?—No, there are many which are not.

962. You think the result of throwing open these appointments to the Bar would be to put Native Pleaders into District Judgeships and even higher appointments?—I think that at the local Bar there are comparatively few Englishmen of any mark.

Mr. *Ryland.*

963. Would they not flock in from other parts?—I think they would, and I think we ought to leave the field open. I know at least of one instance where a Native gentleman practising at the Bar is a recognised leader of his profession, with probably the largest practice; and I know other Native Advocates and Pleaders who, when one has to contend with them in Court, are found to be exceedingly clever and subtle men, with perfectly trained judicial minds, and who can understand points as they arise.

Mr. *Ryland*—continued.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

964. You said something about separation of the Judicial from the Executive functions. Can you give any instance in which the combination has been found to be unsatisfactory?—Yes, in the recent riots I had myself to go to Ludhiana, Umballa, and Hoshiarpur in connection with those cases, and I could see instances at all those places of the bad effect of having Executive and Magisterial powers vested in the same officer. The people cannot and will not believe they will have a fair and impartial inquiry. The Deputy Commissioner rides out, disperses a crowd, has a man arrested, brings him up before himself, and refuses to listen to an application for transfer. My own deliberate opinion is that it is exceedingly inconvenient that a Deputy Commissioner should be the Magistrate of the district, that he should order the arrest, bring up the prisoners before himself, try them, convict them, and finally prosecute the Pleader who defends them, and so carry the whole proceedings through; and these are simple facts which occurred at Umballa the other day. At Hoshiarpur there was the same thing. The sole officials were the very same officials that had to try the accused. My own opinion is a very decided one, and is based on a large amount of experience, that the Judicial and Executive Services are better apart.

The *President.*

965. Should any, and if any what, change be made in the system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—My answer to that question is simply no; but I would desire to explain that I do think that Natives of India are in certain respects at a disadvantage in having to compete in England. But I do not think that the conditions of competition place them at a disadvantage. I think the disadvantage consists in their being at a distance from the scene of competition, and in the fact that facilities for education are smaller in this country than at home, and in various other circumstances. In the same way many persons are at a disadvantage because they are poor. But I do not think that the conditions place them at a disadvantage, and I would submit that they should be the same for all. The question to consider is what is wanted, and all persons who can come up to the standard should be allowed to compete, and no inequality of the conditions should be made. It is impossible to make special rules to meet all cases.

WITNESS X.—17th December 1866.

Examination of Sardar GURDIAL SINGH, of the Statutory Civil Service, Assistant Commissioner in the Punjab.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Sardar *Gurdial Singh.*

The *President.*

966. Kindly inform the Commission as to your standing in the Service. You were, I believe, the first Statutory Civilian appointed in the Punjab?—Yes, I am the first Statutory Civilian appointed in India. I was nominated in 1879, and I took charge in 1880. I have been doing work continuously since then, except when on leave. I have been in five different districts, viz. Hoshiarpur, Amritsar, Ludhiana, and Multan, and I am now at Dehra Ghazi Khan. I am by religion a *Sikh*, a *Jat Sikh*? My family is connected with the Rajah of Nabha, and I have some connection with the Rajah of Jhind.

967. You were appointed by nomination?—Yes.

968. Without any preliminary test?—Yes.

969. But you have passed the departmental examination?—Yes, in the first year in which I appeared.

970. What is the prevalent feeling in your Province regarding the existing Statutory system? If the feeling is one of dissatisfaction, is the dissatisfaction general or is it confined to certain sections of the community?—The feeling is one of great dissatisfaction, which is general to all intelligent classes.

971. What are the grounds upon which any such feeling is based—The object the Natives wish to attain is free admission to the public Services on an equal footing with their other fellow-subjects of the same Sovereign. They claim equal rights with European British subjects in other respects as well as employment in public Services of India, their own native country. The existing systems providing for admission to the Civil Service afford no sufficient facilities to Natives, whilst they do so to Europeans: hence the dissatisfaction. The Statutory system is not sufficient to satisfy the just ambition of the Natives of India for the following reasons:—

(1) It preserves the distinction between Natives and Europeans and widens the already existing gulf between the two societies, which is the object of the Natives as well as the Government to bridge over.

(2) The Natives employed under the system are looked upon as inferior. They draw less pay and are not treated like Covenanted Servants.

The *President*—continued.

(3) The system does not afford any sufficient guarantee to the fact that persons of proved merit and ability only would be selected.

972. Is the feeling of dissatisfaction, if it exists, directed against the Statute itself (33 Vic., Chapter 3, Section 6), or is it directed against the rules framed thereunder?—The feeling is directed rather against the principles on which the Statute has been construed and the rules that have been framed thereunder than the Statute itself.

973. If the Statute itself is objected to, is it because its provisions admit persons to specific appointments only, and not to membership in an organised "Service"?—Yes, partly for this reason, but enrolment in the service was provided for by public examination open to all, Natives and Europeans alike. Section 6 was meant to give the Government a special power to appoint any Natives to such appointments as the Government might like, without requiring them to pass the open competitive examination. It was not meant for the organisation of a special Service of Natives inferior to the Covenanted Civil Service.

974. Are the objections based on other, and if so what grounds?—The principal ground on which the adoption of the provisions of the Statute by the Government is objected to by the Natives is that, contrary to the object with which Section 6 of the Statute was framed, a special Service of Natives has been organised on a footing of inferiority to the Covenanted Civil Service.

975. If a desire is felt for enrolment in a general Service, what are the reasons for this desire?—The desire for enrolment in a general Service is not confined to Natives only; the European British subjects also desire to be enrolled as members of the general Civil Service organised for the administration of the country. The motives in both cases are the same, viz. the pecuniary advantages connected with a very respectable and honourable position to be gained thereby.

976. What amendments do you advocate in Section 6 of the Statute?—I think the section might be amended so as to provide for the enrolment of Natives into the Civil Service.

977. Do you consider that Section 6 of the Statute supplies such a definition of the

The *President*—continued.

words "Natives of India" as describes with sufficient clearness, fulness, and accuracy the various classes of persons for whose appointment to Covenanted posts it is desirable to provide?—I think not. But no amendment appears to me to be necessary, because it gives the Government of India power to "define and limit from time to time the qualification of Natives of India" expressed therein.

978. If not, can you suggest any more complete or more satisfactory definition?—I think the definition might stand.

979. If the objections are directed against the rules framed under the Statute, do they relate to the mode or modes of selection actually adopted?—Yes.

980. Do they relate to the general conditions in regard to pay, promotion, and retiring annuity under which Statutory Civilians hold their offices?—Yes.

981. Assuming the Statutory system to be retained, what amendment would you suggest in the rules with a view to remove any reasonable objections which may be felt by them?—The amendments I would propose are the following:—

(1) There should be a limited competition, *i.e.* a number of candidates should be selected and from them appointments should be given to those most successful in a competitive examination.

(2) Encouragement should be given for the period of probation being passed in training in England, or rather this should be made compulsory. The Government should pay the passage-money and sufficient allowance for their maintenance whilst they are in England and the money required for admission to the examination of Universities, &c.

(3) Their emoluments should be the same as those of other Covenanted Civilians, and they should fill exactly the same position—now they are badly paid. Rs. 320 per mensem is hardly sufficient for the bare maintenance of a Native gentleman of any good position. They have to begin on Rs. 200, whilst the Extra Assistant Commissioner of the lowest grade draws Rs. 250. A Covenanted Civilian begins at Rs. 400, or double the amount drawn by the Statutory Civilian; thus in the beginning he does not even get 64 per cent. An Uncovenanted Judicial Assistant can draw Rs. 1,100 per mensem, whilst a Statutory Civilian as a District Judge of the 1st grade would get Rs. 960 only, in place of Rs. 1,500 drawn by a Covenanted District Judge.

(4) There should be a limit as to the number of appointments that must be made. The Statutory Civilians should not be less than ¼th of the total number of Civilians serving in the Province.

982. Do Statutory Civilians regard themselves as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the Covenanted Service through the competitive channel?—Yes, because they are paid less and are not treated like European Civilians. In fact, they are treated not even like European Extra Assistant Commissioners, but simply as they treat Native Extra Assistant Commissioners. None of them have filled any appointment of trust, though a number of their juniors have been appointed temporarily or permanently to Executive charges of far more trust and importance. Some of the European or Eurasian Extra Assistant Commissioners have held the officiating appointment of Deputy Commissioner of important districts, whilst no Native has acted as Deputy Commissioner even for a single day.

983. Are they so regarded by the general public?—Yes, people in general, with very good reason, think that an officer drawing less pay must be inferior to one drawing a higher salary, and then they see the general treatment.

984. By their *confrères* in the Service who have entered through the competitive channel?—Yes.

985. If such a feeling exists, on what grounds is it based?—Because they think that these Natives are simply appointed for political reasons; that they are paid less and are their inferiors in education and ability, and that they cannot be trusted to the same extent; and because their fellow Europeans get more rapid promotion. They believe that a Native would never be appointed a Deputy Commissioner, whilst a European might act as such though he be even an Extra Assistant Commissioner.

986. Do the general public view with any difference the status of Statutory Civilians and that of Uncovenanted officers?—Yes.

987. On what grounds?—The only difference they can see is that the Statutory Civilians are called Assistant Commissioners and nominally belong to a higher Service, whilst the Uncovenanted officers are not so designated.

988. Do competitive Civilians, English and Native, and members of the Uncovenanted Service, respectively, stand on a footing of cordiality with Statutory Civilians, or is there any friction between them?—There has been no competitive Native Civilians serving in this Province, and the European Covenanted Civilians and European and Eurasian Uncovenanted Civilians do not stand on a footing of cordiality with Statutory Civilians with very few exceptions. Native Uncovenanted Servants do. Open friction has been avoided.

989. Do young men among the landed aristocracy or of good family display unwillingness to accept employment under the Statutory Rules?—Not much; for the present pecuniary condition of some of the Punjab gentry is bad and they have no other better opening. Those who are better

The *President*—continued.

off would not accept employment under the Statutory Rules.

990. What are the reasons for this unwillingness?—Because they have to work hard, away from their homes on an inadequate pay and position.

991. Do young men among the landed aristocracy or of good family display unwillingness to accept posts in the Uncovenanted Service and a willingness to accept employment under the Statutory Rules?—Yes.

992. On what grounds?—Because the Statutory Civilians nominally belong to a higher Service than the Uncovenanted.

993. On the assumption that the Statutory system is retained, how would appointment to the Statutory Service by nomination be regarded by influential sections of the Native community in your Province?—Not with any favour except by those who are not educated and entertain false hopes of getting employment by flattery.

994. How would a system of nomination to be followed by a period of probation be regarded by the same classes?—It would be preferred to a mere nomination without any probation, because the men of no ability will have less chance of success.

995. Would a system of nomination, with or without probation, be likely to secure well-qualified persons?—Yes, it is possible. Everything depends upon the ability of the selecting officers to appreciate the good qualities of the candidates.

996. Has experience actually shown such a system to secure well-qualified officers?—Some of those who have been nominated hitherto are men of qualification?—If they are failures, I think the fault lies at the doors of the officers responsible for selecting them.

997. Do you consider that nominations should be confined to persons of proved merit and ability?—Certainly.

998. If so, how do you consider that merit and ability should be held to have been proved for this purpose?—I think the safest way is to have recourse to a limited competition. The Government should select a number of candidates from good families of good social position and active habits and good moral character. A competitive examination amongst them, I think, would give the best man who could possibly be selected, having regard to other circumstances.

999. How would a system of limited competition amongst persons nominated for this purpose by the Local Governments or by the Universities, or by those authorities concurrently or alternately, be regarded?—It would, I think, be preferred to selection and nomination by any other means.

1000. In preference to either of the above systems (nomination and limited competition) would a system of open competition, pure and simple, for the Statutory Service, commend itself to the Native community? No, because the Statutory Service itself is regarded as insufficient. I think a limited competition would be preferred, because it insures the appointment of men of good social position and family.

1001. If competition (whether limited or open) is preferred, should there be one competition for all India or separate competitions in each Province?—There should be separate competitions for each Province.

1002. If there were only one general competition, how would you ensure a due proportion of appointments falling to the population of the several Provinces?—Impossible.

1003 Having regard to the varying educational standards reached in the several Provinces, and the varying conditions prevalent therein, is it possible to have any one system of selection for all India which would not result in the inhabitants of some Province being more or less excluded from a due share of appointments?—Impossible.

1004. Under any of the three systems of nomination, limited competition, and open competition would you prescribe any tests of preliminary qualifications on the part of nominees or candidates in regard to (1) age, (2) intellectual capacity, (3) moral, social, and physical fitness?—Yes.

1005. If so, what should be the tests under each of the heads specified?—In case of nomination pure, I would propose the following tests:—(1) must be between 18 and 25 in age; (2) must have passed at least the F A examination of any University or some other examinations equivalent to it; (3) must be of good and loyal family, and of good moral character, to be certified to by a responsible officer. He should be able to ride and accustomed to use firearms, and should be free from any constitutional disease. In case of limited competition I would have:—(1) age between 18 and 25; (2) must be able to read and write English, and should pass in English as one of the subjects in the examination; (3) must belong to some good and loyal family and bear good moral character, should be free from disease and able to ride. In case of open competition (1) and (2) as above; (3) must bear good moral character, must be free from any constitutional disease, and of active habits. In all three cases it is understood that the candidate must be a British subject and of pure Native descent.

1006. Do you consider that (after selection, whether by nomination or competition) there should be a period of probation?—Yes.

1007. If so, what should be the duration of the probationary period?—Two years.

1008. Should the period of probation be passed in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service or of the Covenanted Service, or in what other manner?—If in service it must

The *President*—continued.

be passed in the ranks of the Covenanted Service.

1009. Do you consider that after selection and before entering on probation (or on duty) the person selected should undergo special training?—Yes, before entering on duty he must undergo a special training.

1010. If so, should the special training be carried out in India or in England?—In England.

1011. If in India, would it be possible, and if possible advisable, to establish an Indian Civil Service College on the basis of the Haileybury College which formerly existed in England?—It is certainly possible, and it would be advisable too, but it would be far better to pass the probationary period in special training in England.

1012. If you do not consider special training in England essential, would you encourage nominees or selected candidates to visit England with a view to add to their qualifications for the Service?—I think it should be made obligatory for the selected candidates to pass a probationary period in special training in England; but in case it be decided not to make residence in England compulsory, every encouragement should be given for that period being spent in England.

1013. If so, what form should such encouragement take?—I think the Government should pay the passage-money and a handsome amount of allowance, besides the admission fees to public educational institutions.

1014. Should it be offered before, or during, or after the probationary period, if any, through which nominees or selected candidates may be required to pass?—It must be offered before or during the probationary period.

1015. Should it be offered before or after the nominees or selected candidates enter on their duties?—Before the nominees enter on their duties; but in case of those who have already been nominated, it may be offered now.

1016. Are you in favour of the establishment of scholarships tenable by Natives in England for the purpose of enabling them to qualify for the Civil or Statutory Service?—Yes, provided it be held to have no open examination in India.

1017. If so, how would you connect such a scheme with the selection of Natives for employment in the higher administrative posts in India?—Selected candidates appointed in India under Section 6 are quite distinct from those who enter Service after passing the open competitive examination, and I think this was the object of the Statute.

1018. Do you think that any distinction should be made between the emoluments of nominees or selected candidates who have been trained in England or have gone to England to add to their qualifications and those who have not?—I think the emoluments for the Civil Servants, whether Native or European, should be the same. Persons selected in India, or those who pass the examination in India, should be made to undergo a special training in England. If it be made optional for them to go to England or not, then a reduction of 15 per cent. may be made in the pay of those who elect to stay in India and do not go to England.

1019. If the opportunity of residence in England at a University for two years with a sufficient allowance were offered to nominees or selected candidates, is it likely that it would be taken advantage of to any great extent?—Yes, I think so. I would most gladly take advantage of it even now.

1020. If the system of examination in England were revised, with the result that Natives availed themselves of it in considerable numbers, would it still be necessary to retain the Statutory system?—I think it would be in case members of high families and good social position did not take advantage of the examination in England.

1021. If so, to what appointments or classes of appointments would you restrict the latter system, and what conditions over and above those already existing would you impose?—I am against putting restrictions in the way of Government appointing Natives of proved merit and ability to any posts in the Civil Service. I think the Government should have power to enrol them as members of the Civil Service.

1022. Is competition of Natives in the examination in England favourably looked upon by large and important classes in India?—Yes, but the present system throws serious obstacles in the way of Natives.

1023. Should additional facilities be given to Natives for proceeding to England and entering the Indian Civil Service by the channel of the English competition?—Decidedly these must be given.

1024. If so, what form or forms should such facilities take?—The limits of age should be raised to 25. Subjects commonly taught in India, and useful for service in India, should be added to the list of subjects for the Civil Service examination, and the maxima of marks assigned to each should also be revised, so as to place the Oriental languages on an equal footing with languages commonly taught in the English schools. If no examination be concurrently held in India, scholarships tenable by Natives of India in England should be granted. In my opinion it would be far more advisable to hold the examination in India and send the successful candidates only for special training in England.

1025. What conditions, if any, should be attached to them?—In case of scholarships the only condition that should be attached is that the candidate passes his time in *bond*

The *President*—continued.

fide study and appears in the competitive examination.

1026. What is your opinion as to giving Statutory appointments to Natives who, though they may have failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, have shown merit in the English competition?—I am strongly against it. We do not wish the creation of an inferior Service of Native Civil Servants. They may be appointed to the Uncovenanted Service.

1027. Assuming it to be advisable to appoint to the Statutory Service in India Natives who have failed in the English competition, should such persons receive the same training as successful candidates in England, and be subject to the same final examination?—Yes; and if they fail in the final examination, their names should be struck off.

1028. Should they, on appointment to the Statutory Service in India, be subject to the same incidents as apply to other persons appointed under the Statutory rules?—Yes, provided they have succeeded in passing the final examination.

1029. Can you say what number of Natives belonging to your Province have presented themselves annually at the competitive examination in England, and what degree of success they attained?—I think none went up for the Civil Service from the Punjab. I intended going, but my father withheld permission after seeing the disappointment caused to the late Pandit Manphul by the conduct of his son.

1030. What class or classes of Natives in your Province readily go to England?—Those who can afford sufficient money and are permitted by their relatives to go. Those few who have hitherto gone do not belong to any one particular class.

1031. Are objections entertained to going to England; and if so, what are they, and by what classes in particular are they felt?—No objections on the score of caste are entertained in the Punjab, but the only objection is the possibility of their spoiling their character by falling into the temptations due to the limited means of the persons pursuing their studies.

1032. Should the examination for Natives in England be distinct in standard and conditions from that for English candidates, or should there be one and the same examination for all?—There should be one and the same examination for all.

1033. If the standards and conditions were different, how would it be possible to compare the results in the two examinations so as to bring out one list in order of merit?—Impracticable.

1034. Would it, under such circumstances, be desirable to allot a fixed proportion of appointments to each of the two examinations?—It is scarcely fair to do so; it is really unfair both to Natives and Europeans. But if the examinations be made separate, however unfair it is, it must be done.

The *President*—continued

1035. If a fixed proportion of appointments were allotted for a Native examination in England, do you consider that, in view of the objections against a voyage to England and life there, the cost thereof, and the chances of failure, a sufficient number of suitable candidates from your Province would be available to make the competition a real competition?—I fear not.

1036. If the examinations were distinct, what should be the limits of age for the Native examination?—25 years, *i.e.*, 17 to 25.

1037. What should be the conditions, nature, and subjects of the separate Native examination?—Such subjects as are taught in Indian Universities.

1038. Assuming only one examination in England for both English and Native candidates, do you consider that the subjects and standards of examination and the conditions as to age and other matters in any respect place Native candidates at a disadvantage as compared with English candidates?—Yes, certainly they do.

1039. If so, in what respects are Native candidates placed at a disadvantage, and what alterations would you recommend with a view to remove that disadvantage?—*Firstly*, I would raise the limit of age to 25; *secondly*, I would raise the maxima of marks for Sanskrit and Arabic to 800, the same as for Latin at present; *thirdly*, I would add the Persian language and assign 600 marks to it, the same as for Greek now; *fourthly*, I would add all the vernacular languages of India in which members of the Civil Service and Commissioned Officers of the Army are examined in India, and assign 400 marks to each, viz. equal to those given for Italian now. The above I believe will give equal facility to Native students as compared with Europeans. *Fifthly*, I would add History of India and assign the same marks to it as for History of England, viz. 300

1040. If there should be only one examination for all candidates, should the limits of age for Natives be higher than those at present fixed for European candidates; and, if so, what should the limits for Native candidates be?—There should be only one examination, and the limit of age should be raised for all alike. Englishmen can go up at an earlier age if they like.

1041. If higher limits of age were fixed for Native than for European candidates, might not the latter complain that they were placed at a disadvantage?—Yes, they would complain. If the age were raised for all alike then they could not. If the age were raised specially for the Natives, even then they cannot justly complain, for the Natives have to prepare themselves for undergoing an examination through the medium of a difficult foreign language,

The *President*—continued.

namely English, and therefore require more time.

1042. What is the average age at which Natives at the Indian Universities pass the examinations for F.A., B.A., and M.A. respectively?—I cannot say exactly, but I think they pass the F.A. at about 23, and B.A. at 25, and M.A. at 26.

1043. From what classes of Native society are the persons who graduate at the Indian Universities usually drawn in your Province?—Mostly from mercantile classes, but some of landed classes also go up.

1044. Do you advocate a competition in India for the Civil Service simultaneously with the competition in England, the same question papers being used at both examinations?—Yes.

1045. How would this method of selection be regarded by the Native community generally?—I think they will like it very much.

1046. If you advocate such a system, would you restrict the competition in India to Natives, and that in England to English candidates, or would you admit both classes freely to either examination?—I would admit both classes freely to either of the examinations.

1047. If Native candidates were admitted to the competition in England, while English candidates were excluded from the competition in India, on what grounds could this distinction be justified?—I think it cannot be justified, and is certainly unfair.

1048. Do you consider that the educational institutions available in India are at present capable of giving the very high class education which it was the object of the competitive system as introduced in 1855 to secure?—I think some of them are, and they are every day improving.

1049. Would an open competition in India be likely to give decided advantages to any particular class or classes of the Native community over others?—Those classes who now go mostly to schools.

1050. Would it be likely to lead to the undue preponderance of any one class or caste in the public Service?—At first it would, but the great impetus given to education spreading the desire for it in all classes will eventually bring some representatives from all classes to the front.

1051. Do you think there are any objections on political or administrative grounds to open competition in India?—I think such objections that have been made on this score are really ill-founded. Open examination in India can only lead to a larger number of Natives getting employment, and this is very much desirable on political and administrative grounds. There is no fear that in open competition Englishmen would be altogether excluded. If it were found to be the case, I think the Government would be justified in making some such provision that so many Europeans must be appointed, say not less than one-fifth of the total number of Civilians serving in the Province.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Sardar *Gurdial Singh.*

1052. Would the introduction of an open competitive examination in India have the effect of deterring cadets of leading families from aspiring to enter the ranks of the Civil Service?—It would encourage the cadets of leading Native families, and I do not see why it should discourage the Englishman of good family.

1053. Under such a system how would it be possible to provide against the Natives of a Province in which education is comparatively backward being excluded from appointments in their own Province?—By making direct appointments under the Statutory rules in such Provinces by limited competition and after special training.

1054. Would a system of Provincial examinations be preferable to one examination for the whole of India?—No, because it does not make the competition free and open even though the same set of questions be set everywhere, unless the result is published in order of merit for the whole of the examination, in which case the advantage of separate examinations is lost.

1055. Under a system of open competition in India would the successful candidates be regarded as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the Service through the channel of the open competition in England?—They would not be so regarded if the questions set are the same in both cases.

1056. Supposing that the Covenanted appointments were alloted in fixed proportions, a certain number to be obtained by competition in England and a certain number by competition in India, the examinations in each case being open on fairly equal conditions to Native and English candidates alike, and the Statutory system being abolished, how would such a system be viewed?—This would not be satisfactory, for (*a*) the two Services are again separated, (*b*) it is unfair to fix such a proportion arbitrarily. Natives desire to secure complete equality with other British subjects, and equal facility with them for entering the public Services, and, above all, equal treatment after they have entered the Service. Until this is granted they cannot be satisfied. (*c*) The abolishing of the Statutory Service by giving appointments to Natives only by open competition would mean the exclusion of the leading Native families of the Province for some time at least; and I do not think anybody, whether European or Native, would advocate it.

1057. If an open competition were established in India, what should be the preliminary qualifications required on the part of candidates in regard to age? *and* in regard to minimum educational attainments? *and* in regard to moral, social, and physical fitness? *and* in other respects (if any)?—

The *President*—continued.

The answer to the first question is that the age limits should be between 19 and 25 in age. My answer to all three of the other questions is the same as in the case of candidates for examination in England.

1058. Should the subjects and conditions of the examination be the same as those prescribed for the competitive examination in England, or should they be different?—They should be the same in both cases.

1059. If different, what should they be?—There should be no difference in my opinion.

1060. Circumstances being different in the case of persons who enter through the examination in England and of persons who enter through the examination in India, is there any reason why the rules in regard to pay, leave, pension, &c., should not also be different?—There should be no difference in regard to pay, leave, pension, &c., because the Englishmen are examined in their own country, and if the Natives are also examined in theirs this should make no difference, when they have to perform the same duties and fill the same offices.

1061. Should successful candidates go through a period of special study in India like the English candidates, who spend two years in special preparation? *or* would it be preferable (*a*) to require them to go to England, or (*b*) to give them the option of going to England, suitable allowances being given to enable them to prosecute their studies there?—The period in special study should not be passed in India, but it should be passed in England, suitable allowances being given to enable them to do so.

1062. Should successful candidates at the Indian competition be required to pass through a probationary period before final appointment?—Why should they be so required, considering that those who pass the examination in England now are not required to do so.

1063. If so, what shall be the duration of the probationary period?—There should be no probationary period; and if it be found necessary to have it, it should be limited to two years.

1064. How should it be passed—in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service, or otherwise?—Must be passed in the ranks of the Covenanted Service.

1065. What special provision, if any, do you think should be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of deserving members of the Uncovenanted Service?—Certain number of appointments in the Covenanted Service may be made out of the deserving members of the Uncovenanted Service, both Native and European.

1066. If such appointments are made, should they be restricted to the holders of any particular classes of appointments in the Uncovenanted Service, and if so, what classes?—I think these appointments should be left apart for the Uncovenanted Servants who fill similar appointments to those ordinarily held by members of the Covenanted Service. Members of special Services should seek for promotion in their own lines.

1067. Should persons so appointed be appointed provisionally and be required to pass through a period of probation before final confirmation?—Not necessary.

1068. Should provision be made for the appointment of qualified members of the Uncovenanted Service to the *higher* Covenanted offices without requiring them to pass through the lower grades?—Yes, provided always they are not to supersede any members of the Covenanted Service holding similar office with them from a longer time.

1069. If certain appointments in the Covenanted grades are set apart for the Statutory Service, should a fixed proportion of those appointments be expressly reserved for persons of proved merit and ability in the Uncovenanted Service?—There should be no reservations. Statutory Civilians and Uncovenanted servants, when appointed to offices ordinarily held by Covenanted servants, must rank with the latter as if they all belonged to the same Service.

1070. Should special provision be made for the promotion to Covenanted posts of European members of the Uncovenanted Service?—Not necessary; there should be one provision alike for Europeans and Natives, and persons of each of these classes should be promoted in proportion to the number of Europeans (including Eurasians) and Natives respectively in such Uncovenanted Service from which they are promoted.

1071. Should special provision be made for the promotion to such posts of Eurasian or other members of the Uncovenanted Service who, though not Natives of pure descent, fall within the meaning attached in the Statute of 1870 to the term "Natives of India"?—Not necessary.

1072. Ought not the Uncovenanted Service, equally with the Covenanted Service, to be open to all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty who possess the qualifications that may be from time prescribed?—Yes, it must be so, equal facility being given to all.

1073. If the Uncovenanted Service is closed to any natural-born subjects of Her Majesty, on what grounds, bearing in mind the terms of the Acts of Parliament and Her Majesty's Proclamation of 1st November 1858, is this to be justified?—No, it should not be closed, and on these very grounds no appointments whatever in the Covenanted or any other Service should be specially reserved for Europeans, and the

The *President*—continued.

latter should not be paid specially high salaries and the Natives less when they fill the same appointment.

1074. Is the rate of pay at present granted to Statutory Civilians during probation and on final appointment, respectively sufficient?—Quite insufficient.

1075. If not, on what grounds do you consider it insufficient, and what rates of pay should in your opinion be granted to Statutory Civilians (*a*) while on probation, and (*b*) on final confirmation in their appointments?—It is hardly sufficient for their living as gentlemen. Officiating Extra Assistant Commissioners get Rs. 250 per mensem, whilst the Probationer Assistant Commissioner gets 200 to begin with. I think their pay should be the same as of other Assistant Commissioners, and they should have some English training If they fail to take advantage of proceeding to London to complete their training, then they may be paid on the following scale:—Rs. 300 to begin with, Rs. 350 after passing the examination, and afterwards 15 per cent. less than the pay of the grade to which they may be appointed.

1076. Would these rates of pay be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covennanted posts from the Uncovenanted Service?—The present rates of pay are not suitable for Uncovenanted officers appointed to the Covenanted Service. This is the reason why a junior Uncovenanted Civil Servant was selected lately to fill the appointment of a District Judge.

1077. Would they be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the professional classes?—No.

1078. If not, how would you treat in regard to pay persons selected from these two classes if appointed to the lowest grade of the Covenanted Service?—The pay of the Statutory Service should be raised, and then I think it would be sufficient.

1079. How would you treat in regard to pay such persons if appointed to any of the *higher* Covenanted posts without being required to pass through the lower grades?—They should be paid at the same rate as Statutory Civilians.

1080. Do you consider that a difference should be maintained between the rate of pay granted to Covenanted Civilians who enter through the competitive channel in England and to persons holding Covenanted posts who do not enter through that channel?—I am against maintaining such differences.

1081. If so, what would you consider the fair rate of reduction to be made in the case of persons holding Covenanted posts who do not enter through the competitive channel in England?—If a difference is to be maintained, I think a reduction of 15 per cent. would do.

1082. Would you approve of an arrangement by which the pay of appointments

The *President*—continued.

would be a fixed sum to be drawn by the holder, whether he is a Covenanted or a Statutory Civilian, with an additional staff allowance to be drawn by those only who enter the Service through the examination in England?—If a difference is to be maintained, this arrangement seems to be better; but the staff allowance should not exceed 15 per cent. on the pay of the appointments.

1083. Can you suggest any other way of providing different rates of pay?—No.

1084. If you consider there should be no difference of pay, how do you justify the application of the same rates of pay in the case of Natives who have satisfied the very high tests required by the examination in England and Natives who have not?—This is to be justified on the ground that the latter would belong to some of the distinguished Native families, or would be men who have shown special ability in Government Service or conspicuous merit in a learned profession. I think the mere fact of going to England cannot outweigh the importance of a person belonging to an aristocratic family of conspicuous loyalty to Government or professional distinction or conspicuous ability shown in Government Service, any of which qualifications coupled with the necessary amount of education would make a person better fitted for an administrative post of importance. If, as proposed by me, they are made to pass some time in England in special training, then the force of this objection would be almost destroyed

1085. On the same assumption, what are your reasons for holding that the high rate of pay which is considered to be necessary to secure the services of persons of tested qualifications in a country far from their homes, and under various other unfavourable conditions, should be given to persons whose qualifications have not been so tested and who serve in their own native country?—My reasons are:—(1) the Government has to pay for the work to be done and the merit shown, and not in proportion to the distance of its servants from their respective homes; (2) the pay should be so high as to give sufficient attraction for men of good independent means to enter the Service; (3) it should be higher and not less than what a man of equal ability could earn in the exercise of some profession; (4) it is not at all necessary they should serve in their own Province; (5) they have to acquire a very high education in a foreign language. The terms of the Acts of Parliament of 1858 do not justify any such distinctions being drawn.

1086. Have you any remarks to make on the leave rules embodied in the Civil Leave Code which apply to Statutory Civilians?—The only remark to be made is that a special provision should be made for granting them furlough to Europe should they desire

The *President*—continued.

to proceed to England to improve their education.

1087. At what age do you consider that Natives appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than through the competitive channel in England should be entitled to retire on pension?—At the age of 55.

1088. After what length of service do you consider that such persons should be entitled to retire on pension?—25 years' service.

1089. At what age should they be obliged to retire on pension?—55 years.

1090. After what length of service should they be obliged to retire on pension?—35 years.

1091. What amount of pension should, in your opinion be granted to Natives so appointed if they serve the prescribed period for voluntary and compulsory retirement respectively?—It should be calculated at the same rate as for other members of the Covenanted Service.

1092. If, before serving the prescribed period for pension, they are compelled to retire on medical certificate, what gratuity, if any, would you give them?—The same as to Covenanted Servants.

1093. How far is the existing system of education in the higher schools and colleges in India well adapted for training young men to the Public Service? Can you suggest any improvements?—It is not well adapted for training young men for the Civil Service examination. There should be at least one college in each Province a class opened in which the subjects prescribed for the Civil Service examination should be taught to such of the scholars as should express their willingness to join such a class.

1094. In 1854 Lord Macaulay's Committee were of opinion that the best, the most liberal, and the most finished education to be procured in England was a necessary qualification for admission to the Civil Service. Do Indian schools and colleges at present supply an education of so high a standard?—Great improvements have since been effected in every Province, and colleges would begin to supply the want if the competition be held in India.

1095. Do you consider that Indian schools at present develop the force of character and other qualities required for English administration?—I think they do, nearly as well as mere school education can do.

1096. Do we now obtain for Government Service Natives of the classes who under Native rule carried on the civil administration of the country?—Very seldom, because we do not put as much trust in them as Native rulers used to do. Our officers, not even Commissioners of Divisions, possess the smallest share of the powers exercised by them. It is an established fact in the history of the world that continuous subjection to tyranny takes away the independent spirit, and with it the force of character

The *President*—continued.

of a people. For the same reason independence or absence of tyranny develops the force of character. During the time of Native rule the independence of the people had a very marked effect in producing able men. The liberty enjoyed under the British rule and the justice of the law fosters the development of the force of character amongst the Natives now. Persons never in their life in any place of responsibility gradually lose the ability to rule, and *vice versâ* persons placed early in responsible positions develop that capacity. I am firmly of opinion that if the Government trusted Natives with more responsible duties men would be found able enough to exercise them in the land which produced good rulers till lately, notwithstanding the want of liberal education, which is supplied now.

1097. If not, where must we look for representatives of these classes, and how do you consider that their services could be best obtained?—The leading aristocratic families and the persons even now carrying on the administration of the various Native States all over India represent the class of persons who, before the advent of the English, carried on the administration of the country with great credit in many instances.

1098. How far would any system of appointment which involves a journey to and residence in England be regarded by the Native community as open to objection on the ground that it requires Hindu candidates to abandon their caste as a condition of entering the Civil Service?—I think the Punjab Hindus do not lose their caste by merely going to England.

1099. How far would such a system be regarded as open to objection on the ground that it restricts the field of selection to those candidates who are wealthy enough to undertake the cost of a journey to and residence in England?—This, of course, is to a great extent true; for this reason partly it is proposed to have an examination in India and send the successful candidates for training in England, sufficient allowance being provided for them.

1100. Are the Natives who go to England from your Province for purposes of education limited to the wealthier classes?—Yes. They belong to moderately rich classes.

1101. Are they limited to any particular section of the community, or to any particular creed?—Very few have gone from this Province, and it is not safe to generalise from them.

1102. Does a voyage to or residence in England involve the loss of social position or other unfavourable consequences in the case of any section of the Native community?—Not necessarily.

1103. Does it result in placing those Natives who undertake it more or less out

The *President*—continued.

of touch and sympathy with their fellow-countrymen on their return to India?—It depends entirely on their own conduct. If they return unchanged in their faith and manners, their influence considerably increases.

1104. Would the requirement of a temporary residence in England as a condition precedent to, or following on, appointment to the Government Service have the effect of excluding from such appointment any considerable or important section of the Native community?—I believe not, provided the Government does not reduce the pay so low as in the case of Statutory Civilians and holds out sufficient allowances to enable them to undergo a training in England.

1105. If the Statutory system is discontinued, should special provision be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of Natives who, for religious or other sufficient reasons, are unable or unwilling to undertake a journey to and residence in England?—I think there should be some such provision.

1106. If so, what provision should be made for this purpose?—I cannot suggest anything else than appointing them under Section 6. Therefore in my opinion the Statutory Service should for the present continue.

1107. If the Statutory system is discontinued, do you consider that special provision should be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of capable members of the professional classes?—Yes.

1108. If so, what provision should be made for this purpose?—The same reply as to answer No. 1106.

1109. Whatever system or systems may be adopted, ought power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts candidates of high family subject to such antecedent guarantees of fitness as may be considered sufficient in each case?—Yes, I think so.

1110. Ought similar power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts persons who have proved their merit and ability in Government Service, or in the exercise of a profession, without preliminary examination or competition?—There should be such provision, and at the same time some guarantee of fitness.

1111. If a thorough knowledge of English were made an essential qualification for appointment to Covenanted posts, would the field of selection in the case of persons already in the Uncovenanted Service, or engaged in the exercise of a profession, be unduly limited thereby?—Knowledge of English is very essential. I do not think the field of selection will be *unduly* limited, considering that English education is rapidly spreading.

1112. If such is likely to be the case, could the difficulty be obviated by requiring proficiency in the English language to be tested by periodical examinations *after* selection, but during a probationary period?—It is not a bad plan, provided the standard of the knowledge of English to be acquired be sufficiently high. In my opinion the plan is not a practicable one.

1113. Should provision be made for the occasional appointment, in very special and exceptional cases, to Covenanted posts of persons of known ability and local influence whom, although they may never have held office and may not possess special professional qualifications, and although their age may exceed the limit laid down for untried candidates, it might nevertheless be considered desirable to appoint to the higher grades for political or other reasons?—Yes, by all means.

1114. Would it be desirable to rule that the proportion of persons, being Mahomedans and Hindus respectively, who are from time to time, or over a series of years, appointed to the Covenanted ranks in any Province, should bear a certain relation to the number of the two classes composing the population of the Province concerned?—It is not desirable there should be a special provision for any creed. Provisions of this sort only end in breeding ill-feeling between Hindus and Mahomedans, of which we have seen the bad results recently in several places.

1115. What classes, ranks, or professions of the Native community should be included among Mahomedans and Hindus, respectively, for the purpose of ascertaining the proportion of the population of each of those classes in the several Provinces?—For the Punjab I think if such an unfortunate division be ever adopted I would wish the Sikhs to be kept separate from Hindus and Mahomedans, as they really are in religion, thought; &c. So all those who are neither Christians, Mahomedans, Sikhs, or Parsis, Jews, &c., are Hindus.

1116. How far should appointments in each Province to Covenanted posts be restricted to Natives of the Province concerned?—At least one-fourth I should think.

1117. How would the following scheme be regarded by the Native community:—(1) the Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of European officers, admission being by competition in England, confined to European candidates only; (2) the appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointments in India, Natives only being eligible?—The scheme would cause still more dissatisfaction than exists at present, for now by law the Civil Service examination is open to all, and such a scheme would close it entirely to Natives both in name as well as in reality.

1118. How would you regard such a scheme?—I also think the same.

The *President*—continued.

1119. How would the Native community regard the following:—(1) the Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of appointments, to be filled by competition in England to which Natives and Europeans alike would be admitted; (2) the appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, both Natives and Europeans being eligible?—This scheme also will be looked upon unfavourably, for it gives no guarantee that the appointments in India would not be given to Europeans in preference to Natives.

1120. How would you regard such a scheme?—I think such a scheme is defective, for it will not remove the general dissatisfaction felt by the Natives.

1121. If either of the above schemes were adopted, how would the Native community view a proposal to combine the higher appointments of the Uncovenanted Service with the appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service, so as to form an enlarged Civil Service to be recruited in India?—They would, I think, look upon it as adopted simply with the object of providing for promotion to such of the Uncovenanted Servants as could not get it otherwise.

1122. How would you view such a proposal?—I cannot recommend any scheme to the Government unless is has in it the element to remove the great dissatisfaction felt by the educated Natives—a dissatisfaction which is becoming rather general.

1123 How would the Native community regard the following scheme:—(1) a certain number of appointments in the Covenanted Civil Service to be reserved for Natives; (2) a certain proportion of that number to be filled by competition or by some other system in India; (3) the remainder to be filled by competition in England?—I think they will prefer this scheme to any of the above, though I fear it will not satisfy them completely, provided a fair share of both high and low Judicial and Executive appointments be reserved to Natives.

1124. How would you regard such a scheme?—I would not oppose it; yet I think the proposals made by me in answer to Government in the preceding parts are better.

1125. Assuming a system of nomination or of limited competition among nominated candidates, would Native opinion be in favour of giving a preference, as between candidates possessed of certain preliminary essential qualifications and having on general grounds fairly equal claims, in the following or any other order to—(*a*) members of familes of tried loyalty and distinguished service; (*b*) persons of good social status and influence in the country; and (*c*) persons of superior educational attainments, such as persons who have taken the degree of M.A.?—I think a scheme of this sort will not be looked upon by the educated Natives with much favour, though I do not think they will oppose it.

The *President*—continued.

1126. What is your opinion as to giving such preference?—I think it is not improper to give such a preference, so I would support it.

1127. How would the Native community regard a system of nomination on the ground of merit and ability shown in the service of Government, or in the exercise of a profession, alternating with a system of selection by means of competition, whether entirely open or amongst nomination candidates?—I do not think they will like it, for it is extremely difficult to judge of merit in service or of success in a profession.

1128. How would you regard such a system?—I think it is not necessary to restrict the free selection by any rule of this sort.

1129. If the Statutory system were maintained, and if a probationary period were required from nominees or selected candidates before final appointment, would it be necessary to insist upon such probationary period in all cases, *e.g.*, in the case of a person who has done good service in the Uncovenanted ranks?—I think not, provided the service has been *conspicuously* good.

1130. In the case of persons nominated from the professional classes, is it desirable that a probationary period should be prescribed?—Not in the case of exceptionally successful professional men.

1131. If so, is it necessary that the incidents of such period as to duration and pay should be the same as those attached thereto in the case of Statutory Civilians appointed on probation to the lowest grade of the Covenanted Service?—In all cases where probation is thought necessary, the duration, &c., should be the same.

1132. On what principles should the promotion of Natives appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than by the channel of the competition in England be regulated?—On the same principles as of other Civilians.

1133. Would you regulate such promotion only by considerations of fitness and approved personal merit?—If it be so in the case of the competitive Civilians.

1134. Should Natives appointed to Covenanted posts be required to pass the departmental examinations?—Yes, certainly.

1135. Should they be required to pass the departmental examinations by both the lower and higher standards within their probationary period, subject to the penalty of forfeiture of appoinment if they fail to pass within that time, unless the period is for special reasons extended? *or* should a period longer than the probationary period be allowed for passing the departmental examination by the higher standard? *or* should the present rule be maintained, under which probationers may be confirmed in their appointments at the close of the

The *President*—continued.

probationary period of two years, provided that they pass within that period the departmental examination by the lower standard prescribed for Covenanted Civilians appointed in England, no obligatory period being fixed for passing the higher standard, but no promotion or increase of pay being attainable until the higher standard examination has been passed, and power being retained to the Government to dispense with the services of a Statutory Civilian who may fail to pass by the higher standard within a reasonable time?—The period of probation, two years, I think, is too short for passing by both standards. Yes, this rule might stand.

1136. What rule in regard to passing the Departmental examinations should be applied in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts on the ground of merit and ability proved in the service of Government or in the exercise of a profession?—If the merit has been shown in Government service of a Judicial character, or if success has been attained in the exercise of the legal profession, then no departmental examination should be required to be passed. In other cases, I think it must be insisted upon.

1137. Should subjects of Native States be eligible for appointments to Covenanted posts in British India?—Yes, certainly.

1138. If so, should this be extended to all Native States in alliance with the Crown or only to those in subordinate alliance?—I believe all Native States within British India will fall in the latter category. I think the subjects of completely independent Asiatic States, such as Afghanistan, may be excluded.

1139. Regarding the desire for enrolment in a general Service, why do they wish to be enrolled as a separate Service?—In order to get the advantages which the Covenanted Service possesses in regard to promotion, rank, pay, and pension. My idea is that there should be no distinction between the two.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

1140. Have you expressed these views after consultation with any gentlemen who, like yourself, belong to very high families?—No, I give my personal opinion only. At present Government has simply power to appoint them to particular offices.

The *President.*

1141. For instance, if one of them was appointed to be Deputy Commissioner, he could not rise to be Commissioner; he would have to be appointed under the Act?—Yes.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

1142. Is that what you mean by difference of treatment?—I mean that they do not get the same promotion, and in fact are looked upon as inferior to other Civilians.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

1143. Socially or officially inferior?—Both.

Mr. *Stokes.*

1144. What you want is open competition at a simultaneous examination to be held in India and in England?—Yes; at the same time I desire the continuance of the Statutory system on the terms that there should be a limited competition, that candidates should have an English training and be paid at an equal rate with Civil who pass the same examination. In fact, they should be put into the Civil Service and not into posts.

1145. Why would you maintain the Statutory Service?—Because we want Natives of good social position to become members of the Civil Service; and in case Natives who go up for the competitive examinations and succeeding do not belong to certain classes whom the Government might assist, the Government in that case might appoint them under the Statutory system.

1146. Would you abolish the Statutory Service after a few years?—Not till we are satisfied that men of high families go up for examination and succeed in getting employment.

1147. Then you would abolish it eventually?—Personally I should have no objection; but some other circumstances might arise, which cannot be foreseen now, which would make it desirable to retain it.

Mr. *Peacock.*

1148. You said there was a want of cordiality between competitive Civilians, English and Natives, and members of the Uncovenanted Service; and as between these and Statutory Civilians, in what respect?—The relations are rather strained between the Natives and some members of the Covenanted Service.

1149. What causes the strain?—Because the former are looked upon as inferiors. There has been no official friction, owing, I think, to the Statutory Civilians having very often given way.

Mr. *Stokes.*

1150. I understood you to say that one examination for the whole of India was preferable to a system of Provincial examinations; but would the Punjabis come in for a fair share under such circumstances?—Not just at present, but I think the examination should be held, and that by-and-bye, as education increases, the Punjabis would succeed. My experience has been entirely confined to the Punjab.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Sardar *Gurdial Singh.*

Mr. *Stokes*—continued.

1151. I take it that in your answer to question 1060 you mean to compare Natives who enter the Service in England with Natives who enter the Service in India as regards the question of pay and pension?—Yes.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

1152. With reference to the want of cordiality you spoke of, you would imply that Statutory Civilians have some sort of complaint on the score of want of cordiality in social relations between themselves and the Civil Service officers?—With European officers of the Uncovenanted Service as well.

1153. Can you give me an instance to show in what way there is a want of cordiality in your social relations with these officers?—I know more about myself, and would wish to be excused from saying anything about myself or any officers under whom I have been serving.

1154. In what respect is this want of cordiality manifested? Is there any difference in the social relations of the officers you have in your mind as regards unofficial Native gentlemen and as regards yourself?—That is a difficult question to answer.

The *President.*

1155. Does your official superior treat you in a less respectful way than he treats Native unofficial gentlemen of the same social standing as yourself?—Of course his treatment of non-official Natives depends upon their respective rank. I think he treats all equally badly.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

1156. Then the objection is to his treatment of Natives generally, and not merely his treatment of Statutory Civilians?—Yes.

1157. You recommend open competition for the Covenanted posts, but that the Statutory system should be retained for the purpose of bringing in men of high family; and that, for the selection of these, there should be a limited competition in the Punjab. In your opinion are there enough men to make it a real competition year by year?—I think so, but I do not understand your idea of a real competition.

The *President.*

1158. Would there be half a dozen persons, for instance, to compete?—I think there would: I think that number could be found.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

1159. And I also mean of course enough candidates with nearly equal qualifications?—I don't think there would be any difficulty, and the Province is every day improving in education.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*—continued.

1160. In the year you were selected, have you any idea how many eligible candidates there were?—I think five or six names were sent up.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

1161. Are you aware of the existence of any feeling amongst people of this country which should lead you to suppose that they would prefer a European officer to a Native of a Province in British India other than the Punjab?—I don't think they would show any preference for one or the other. Of course they would prefer the man who treated them best, and was more just. There is no feeling against the Natives of any Province simply on the ground of race.

Mr. *Ryland.*

1162. They would prefer a Punjabi if he were a good man; but supposing they were both equally good, whom would they prefer?—They would prefer the Punjabi, but they have no feeling against Bengalis simply because they are Bengalis.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1163. Have they any preference amongst the other races?—In the Punjab there are several races, and they would always show a preference for men who belong to such families as have long been residing in the Province.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

1164. Do you think there would be any objection to making three or four Mahratta Pandits or three or four Bengalis, Deputy Commissioners in the Punjab, so far as you know the feeling of the people in the Punjab?—If a Mahratta gentleman were a really good man and treated the people properly, they would have no objection on the score of race.

1165. Do you know of any case in which applications have been made for the transfer of cases from Native officers to European Courts?—I have known cases where Native officers have been suspected of being corrupt, but, on the other hand, I know of instances where such and such a European officer has been objected to.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1166. Do you know any casein which an application has been made for the transfer of a case from the Court of a European to that of a Native?—The practice is, when a transfer is applied for, not to name the Court to which it is desired to transfer the case. Such applications have been made in the case of European Courts.

The *President.*

1167. You are a District Judge?—I have been a District Judge at Amritsar and Multan. I am now doing work as District Judge, with the powers of a Subordinate Judge of the 1st class and the appellate powers of a District Judge.

1168. Would a European Assistant Commissioner be subordinate to you in his Judicial capacity?—Yes.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1169. On what grounds were applications made for transfer of cases from the Courts of Europeans?—The truth is they never assign the real grounds, or some only say it is inconvenient because the Judge has got another case on that day, or because he is away from the district, or that he is hasty in his judgments and will not listen.

1170. But you have to satisfy yourself that there is a real reason?—If I think there is any risk of justice not being done I transfer the case.

1171. Did you ever remove a case?—I cannot say exactly. I recollect this much that applications of that kind were made, but I remember that very often when I was going to send a case to some officer I was asked not to send it to a European.

1172. Can you recollect any instance in which you transferred a case from the Court of a European to the Court of a Native?—I don't recollect an instance, but I think I have done so.

1173. How many times?—I cannot say exactly.

1174. Could you say five times?—No, I do not encourage the practice, and it is very rarely I would grant such applications.

1175. In how many instances have you removed a case from a Native Court?—I am not sure, probably some two or three times.

1176. You say hasty judgment was the reason assigned in the case of a European, or the refusal of a patient hearing. And in the case of applications for transfer from Natives, what was the reason assigned?—In these cases I was generally persuaded that there was some influence amongst the ministerial officials against the applicant, or that some relative of the other side was in ministerial office. In some cases I have heard complaints against the Native Magistrate that he was not above taking presents.

Mr. *Ryland.*

1177. Could you look up the records and inform the Commission of any instance in which you have transferred a case from a European to a Native?—It would be very difficult, and I think such applications are not entered in the register.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

1178. How long have you been a District Judge?—I have been District Judge at

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

Amritsar for about eight months, and at Ludhiana for about the same time, and at Multan for about four months. As a District Judge I would only deal with civil cases. As an Appellate Court I should not deal with criminal cases.

1179. What is the term allowed for passing both departmental examinations?—There is no promotion for a person until he passes the higher examination, and he does not get higher powers till he does so.

1180. How long does it take generally for Covenanted Civilians to pass these examinations?—I think they ordinarily take two years; some of them take three: I passed in the first year.

1181. The supersession you complain of was not because you did not pass the examination?—No.

1182. You said the Statutory pay is at the outset insufficient for a Native gentleman to live on. How much is it?—Rs. 200, and the Service is entered under the age of 25 years. I think it is insufficient because the members are always married and have families.

1183. Supposing you had entered a profession instead,—say the Bar; do you think that at 25 you would be earning an income of more than 200 rupees a month certain?—I think that if a man shows ability after about one year's practice he would get about Rs. 300 a month.

1184. Have you any idea what the average income of the professional class is?—I think something like Rs. 200 to Rs. 1,000 a month: I refer to Natives. Pleaders, as a rule, make about that. I think an able man would make a thousand after two years' practice, but not unless he was a really able man. I got Rs. 200 during my first year, Rs. 250 in my second year, in my third year Rs. 320, in my fourth year the same, and subsequently, while I was officiating in the second grade, I got Rs. 440; as officiating District Judge I got Rs. 618. At the same time I have been earning a pension.

1185. And you think yourself poorly paid in comparison with professional men who have no prospect of a pension, and whose income entirely depends upon their health. Is it not sufficient to live on like a gentleman?—Not altogether.

Mr. *Hudson.*

1186. Is it the initial amount you object to?—I think a Native gentleman would require something like Rs. 350 at the outset.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1187. Have you any relatives in the Army?—Yes.

1188. What is the pay of a Native Commissioned Officer?—Some receive Rs. 60. I don't know exactly what an officer gets when he first takes his commission. The

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

pay is small. About a fourth of what I get. He has to find his horse. There are very few men of really good family in the army. There are relatives of good families—I mean men who become poor, but at the same time belong to good families.

Mr. *Peacock.*

1189. You said just now that as District Judge your work was entirely confined to civil appeal cases?—Yes, but in some cases as an original Court, a District Judge tries criminal cases also.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

1190. Don't you think it would involve serious injury to the progress of the country if the European officials were reduced to one-fifth?—I think it would not if, at the same time, they had able Natives to assist them.

The *President.*

1191. To what do you attribute the rapid prosperity of the Punjab within the last few years?—To the justice of the British rule.

The *President*—continued.

1192. During that period the control has been entirely in the hands of British officers. Do you think that if that control were withdrawn, or materially reduced, the same amount of progress might reasonably be expected?—I think it would not, but there would still be European officers to direct and control, and almost all the higher appointments would be filled by Europeans.

1193. Then you consider it necessary for the progress of the country that Europeans should be in high appointments?—In very high appointments, yes, Lieutenant-Governorships, Secretaryships, for instance.

1193*a*. Would that secure sufficient European control?—Yes, if they had able Native officers to carry out their orders.

1194. By your answer to question 1096 (see page 86), do you mean to imply that there has been continuous tyranny in this Province, which has destroyed the force of character of the Natives?—I do not mean that.

WITNESS XI.—17th December 1886.

Examination of F. C. CHANNING, Esq., of the Covenanted Civil Service, Deputy Commissioner (in the grades), at present officiating as District Judge, Lahore.

The *President.*

1195. You belong to the Covenanted Civil Service, and are now at Lahore, will you tell the Commission what experience you have had in the Service?—Yes. I have had sixteen years' service. I have been in charge of a settlement and have had considerable experience in the Revenue Administration and of the General and Revenue Agencies. I was Secretary to the Financial Commissioner for eight years. I have held charge of a district, and have held the office of Divisional Judge.

1196. Will you state the points upon which you wish to express your views?—I have prepared a few short notes of the views which I have formed, in case they may be found useful in guiding the members of the Commission as to the points on which they may wish to examine me.

I. I hold that only those posts which cannot efficiently be filled by local appointment should be filled by appointment from England; and the first step to be taken, in my opinion, is to decide what posts must be reserved for men appointed from England, or, in other words, for the Covenanted or Imperial Civil Service.

II. Premising that I hold that any changes in the recruitment of the public Service will not affect the tenure of the higher appointments of the Service for a period of probably 15 years, I consider that the posts which must be so reserved are comparatively few in number. I think that in future it will be unnecessary to employ Civilians in the Judicial line, except perhaps in very limited numbers. I consider that it will be necessary to so reserve all the higher administrative appointments, *i.e.* from the post of district officer upwards; but I hold that by considerably enlarging the area of non-frontier districts and placing portions of such enlarged districts under subdivisional officers, it will be possible to reduce the number of these higher administrative appointments and to open out a very fair career to the Executive branch of the local Civil Service.

III. In this way the Covenanted Civil Service could be reduced to a very small body, merely sufficient to fill the reserved posts after undergoing the necessary apprenticeship in inferior posts. Its prospects would, I think, be better and its efficiency higher than at present. All Administrative and Judicial posts not held by Covenanted Civilians would be held by the local Civil Service.

The *President*—continued.

IV. I would discontinue the appointment of Statutory Civilians, and would, in the Punjab, include all the officers of the local Civil Service holding appointments ranging from the post of Extra Assistant Commissioner of the lower grade up to District Judge or Subdivisional Officer in what might be called the higher branch of the local Civil Service.

V. This should, I think, be organised separately for each Province; and in the Punjab I would recruit it partly, say to the extent of one-half, by Provincial competitive examination, and partly by promotion of Tahsíldárs and Munsifs and by direct nomination on the part of the local Government.

VI. Admission to the competitive examination should, I think, be open to all University graduates, being Natives of the Punjab; non-graduates should be admitted only on the nomination of the local Government or of officers to whom the power of nomination was delegated. The age up to which candidates should be admitted should be fairly late, say 24.

VII. All appointments by competition and nomination to the higher branch of the local Civil Service should be in the first instance probationary, and should continue so until the higher departmental examination had been passed.

VIII. In this higher branch of the local Civil Service promotion would ordinarily be by seniority; but no one should be held entitled by reason only of seniority to the posts of Subdivisional Officers or District Judge.

IX. By the time the new method of recruitment should affect the higher appointments, I think, that it will probably be possible to recruit the Divisional Judges and the Judges of the Chief Court mainly, if not entirely, from the Subordinate Service and the Bar. I may add that I doubt whether the present Punjab Judicial system will by that time be in existence unaltered.

X. I see no reason at present for altering the existing system of appointing Tahsíldárs and Munsifs.

XI. I consider that the officers now in the public Service are justified in requiring from Government that any changes made

The *President*—continued.

in the conditions of the Service shall be so introduced as not to unfavourably affect their reasonable expectations of advancement.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

1197. Would you reserve no posts in the Imperial Service for Natives?—If I were starting the system entirely *de novo*, I would not; but as things are at present, I would admit them, but I would not make the English examination at all favourable to them. I would adapt the Indian examination to the circumstances of education out here, and the English examination to the circumstances of education there.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

1198. Your proposals would as I understand them, involve the separation of the Criminal from the Civil Judicial work; I should like to hear your reasons for wishing to see Criminal and Civil Justice separately administered?—The reason is because it seems to me necessary politically to hold the administration of the country in the hands of Europeans, at any rate as regards the high appointments, and because the higher Criminal Judicial work is very intimately connected with the administration, especially in times of trouble. I think it would always be the safest plan to have the higher Criminal Jurisdiction in the hands of the Europeans. I am perfectly willing to make over the entire Civil Judicial Administration to Natives. But I desire to see the two jurisdictions kept perfectly separate down to the lowest grades of magisterial work.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

1199. Have you made any attempt to find out how much the European strength of the Covenanted Civil Service would be affected?—It would reduce it in the Punjab to quite a small body, probably not more than forty men. There are now 120.

1200. Are you prepared to administer the Punjab with forty officers?—I have not said that. The local Government should have the power, by direct nomination or by nomination after competition, to add to the Civil Service locally selected European officers.

1201. Then you think that you would have to put in enough Europeans in the local Civil Service to counterbalance the reduction of strength in the upper Service?—Of course there would be also a number of Imperial Civil Servants who would be undergoing their apprenticeship.

1202. So that excluding men on leave, men under training, &c., you would only leave a balance of forty?—Yes.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1203. Have you considered at all the circumstances of the Punjab as a frontier Province; whether, in the event of an expedition beyond the frontier, or in the event of an invasion, you would require a very large European staff at hand to assist in maintaining order and forwarding supplies?—In many districts of the Punjab at the present time there is only one European administrative officer. I propose that the District Officer, who is really one man managing thousands, should always be a European.

1204. Would you leave him without any European assistance?—I think stations like Delhi, Amritsar, and Lahore should form subdivisions, and should generally be in charge of European Subdivisional Officers.

1205. I am speaking of the frontier districts?—I expressly except the frontier districts. I believe those districts are working with only a very small staff of European officers. Some have only a Deputy Commissioner.

1206. Is that adequate?—I have never served on the frontier, but if I were there I should prefer to have a European Assistant. What I think the Government should do is, by nomination, to open up a sufficient career to locally-appointed Europeans and Eurasians.

1207. Would they have the same moral influence as Europeans?—I think some locally-appointed Europeans are extremely good officers, and as for the others the feeling is that they have not the education to fit them for the higher posts. I do not think that in subordinate posts intellectual qualifications count for very much. My idea is to reduce the English appointed Service and not to make any other distinctions than those of an English appointed Service and a local Service—an Imperial Service and a Provincial Service.

1208. I presume your system would be much more economical than the present one?—I think it would. In the western part of the Province there would be a tendency to concentrate the European subordinates. In the eastern portion the districts would be left entirely to Native Subdivisional Officers except in large towns, and I think that would be sufficient.

The *President.*

1209. You said that you would have open competition for graduates and nomination for non-graduates?—I meant nomination to a competition.

1210. You think a man so nominated would be able to hold his own against graduates?—That I cannot say, but that is not the only nomination there would be. Admission for competitive examinations should be open to all University graduates and non-graduates, to be nominated for competition; and besides that, those who

The *President*—continued.

come in by competition should be to the extent of one-half, and the other half would be appointed by nomination.

1211. Tahsíldárs, I believe, are appointed exclusively by patronage. Would you make any change in that?—No.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1212. You are now Judge of the District Civil Court here?—Yes, I have been Divisional Judge at Multan for three months and a half, and Divisional Judge at Delhi for three months.

1213. What is your opinion about the selection of Judges from the Bar?—When I first entered the Judicial Service my general impression of the Bar was that it was better than I had expected to find it. As regards the work I am at present engaged in, my impression is that it could be equally as well done by a Native drawing half my pay.

The Honble Mr. *Quinton.*

1214. You told us that no Native should ever be appointed a District Officer. How do you reconcile that with allowing Natives to compete for examination in England, if Natives are to be appointed to the Punjab?—As a matter of fact either they never pass high enough to come out here or high enough to go to the North-Western Provinces. Hitherto they have been sent to the Central Provinces or to Bengal. If they did come out here, I imagine they would be employed in the Eastern districts, where the position is similar to that of the old North-Western Provinces.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*—continued.

Mr. *White.*

1215. What system would you have for Tahsíldárs? Would you insist on educational qualifications in their case?—In the nomination and promotion of Tahsíldárs I would leave their choice to the local Government. I would not insist on high educational qualifications. I have found a promoted Tahsíldár, with no education at all, a very good man for Executive work. While for Judicial work intellectual qualifications are necessary, for Executive work the qualifications are of a different character; for instance, the capacity to manage men. I think that amount of patronage might certainly be left, and I think it necessary to leave it because, without it, it would not be possible to work the system entirely well, and it would not cover a very large area.

WITNESS XII.—December 1886.

Examination of G. R. ELSMIE, Esq., Barrister-at-Law, of the Covenanted Civil Service; Commissioner and Superintendent of the Lahore Division, Punjab.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

G. R Elsmie, Esq.

The *President.*

1216. I think you are one of the old Haileybury men? You have served in various capacities in both the Executive and Judicial lines, have you not?—Yes, I have been in the Punjab since 1858, and have served in all capacities, both Judicial and Executive. I have been Deputy Commissioner, Commissioner, Additional Commissioner, and Judge of the Chief Court, Punjab.

1217. You have had opportunities of observing the Bar in this Province?—Yes.

1218. With regard to the Statutory Service, is the existing system of appointment of Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved? If it is not, what are the grounds of disapprobation?—My knowledge under this head is limited. One Statutory Civilian has served in the Lahore Division for two or three years, and I have a slight personal knowledge of a second, and have seen some of his Judicial work. Both were appointed by nomination. I have no experience whatever of Native Civilians who have passed in England. The two Statutory Civilians of whom I have knowledge are very far from being superior to the average of men appointed to the higher ranks of the Uncovenanted Service. Both are gentlemen of good family, though not of higher family than men, who have served, or are serving, in the Uncovenanted ranks. So far as I know, the Statutory system has not attracted much attention in the Province generally, and it has caused no feeling of dissatisfaction worthy of mention amongst the bulk of the people or of the Services. The principle of appointment by selection is, however, distasteful to what may be called the new school of Native young men whom we are educating; and among members of the Services there is a feeling that the status of the Civil Service has not been improved, and there are uncomfortable speculations as to what might happen if some of the Statutory Civilians became District officers or were appointed to other important Executive posts. Results seem hardly to have justified the introduction of the Statutory system into the Province, and very few regrets from any part of the community would follow its abolition.

Mr. *White.*

1219. You object to the system of appointing Statutory Civilians; or rather you object to the men more than the system?—I am treating it from the point of view of the results. I am stating facts that I have observed myself.

The *President.*

1220. Your objections are confined to the system of selection by nomination?—I do not think that it has worked well.

Mr. *White.*

1221. Perhaps you would come to a different conclusion if officers who had shown approved merit and ability in the Uncovenanted Service had been transferred to the Statutory Service?—That is quite possible.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

1222. Don't you think that if the Statutory Service were abolished members of the Uncovenanted Civil Service would lose all chances of promotion to the Covenanted Service?—I do not think we have had an instance of an appointment from the Uncovenanted to the Statutory Service, and I was not aware that it was contemplated. Possibly the Statute, as it stands, does not debar such an appointment. I do not think that, generally, in the Punjab that kind of transfer is looked to among the Uncovenanted. I do not think they have ever expected promotion of that particular kind. There has always been a hope on the part of Uncovenanted men in this Province of being transferred to the regular line of the "Commission," and such transfers took place frequently in earlier times.

The *President.*

1223. What do you mean by *Commission*?—In a certain narrow sense the term "Commission" is only applied to the ordinary officers of the Civil Service.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1224. At what period do you say that men serving in the Uncovenanted line were formerly transferred freely to posts in the Covenanted Service?—I should hardly say "freely." There were occasional transfers during the first twenty-five years after the annexation of the Punjab.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

1225. Do you say that subsequently there have been no such transfers?—No, they have been stopped during the last ten years at least.

1226. In your opinion would it not be advisable that men of approved merit and ability should be occasionally transferred from the Uncovenanted Service to the Covenanted?—I think I had better read what I have written in answer to that question.

Mr. *Stokes.*

1227. You say that at an earlier period men looked for promotion from the Uncovenanted Service to the regular ranks. In cases of exceptional merit would you advocate a return to that system?—I should wish to read what I have written on that point. The Uncovenanted Service in the Punjab contains very few persons who in my opinion are eligible for appointments to offices ordinarily reserved for members of the Covenanted Civil Service. It must be understood, however, that this remark has no reference whatever to the gentlemen of the Uncovenanted Service who have already been selected for such offices. In very exceptional cases, as the reward of distinguished services, where it can be said that officers have been proved to be equal in efficiency, general merit, and social status to good specimens of Covenanted Civilians, I would be prepared, subject to the sanction of the Secretary of State, to appoint members of the Uncovenanted Service to the higher grades of the Covenanted offices without requiring them to pass through the lower grades. But no Uncovenanted officer should be so transferred unless he had been performing duties similar to those of his new office. On transfer, I would not require any period of probation. The previous service of the officer should be regarded as equivalent to the probationary period. I am altogether opposed to the transfer to higher Civil offices of Uncovenanted officers who have earned distinction in other lines of the Service. I believe there have been instances in former times of Customs officers having been made District Officers, and so on, Transfers of this nature brought the old practice into disrepute, and, with other things, led to the present unsatisfactory state of affairs in this Province, under which it is practically impossible to reward distinguished members of the Uncovenanted Service by promoting them to any higher appointments in the Covenanted line. I wish it to be distinctly understood, however, that I only advocate transfers of this kind in very exceptional cases, and that I am fully aware that if the present bar is removed it will, in practice, be found extremely difficult to guard against abuses.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1228. Then, in point of fact, you would preserve the power given by Statute 33 Victoria to local Administrations, in cases of approved merit and ability, to appoint Uncovenanted men to posts in the Covenanted Service subject to the sanction of the Secretary of State?—I would retain the power, but control the selection.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

G. R. Elsmie, Esq.

The *President.*

1229. In retaining that power would you in any way alter the definition of the term "Natives of India"?—I don't think so.

1230. Would you exclude a European officer of tried merit and ability in the Uncovenanted Service from such promotion, or would you give extra power to appoint European officers?—I think that power does exist in certain Provinces.

1231. In Non-Regulation Provinces?—I ought to explain that I am speaking merely from the Punjab point of view: I would not exclude European officers in the Punjab.

Mr. *Stewart.*

1232. If the Statutory power were abolished, would there be any hope of Natives of high families getting into the Service through the ordinary channels?—Yes, I think so. I doubt much whether a Statutory system can or should be retained. If it must be retained, I believe that a system of nomination, followed by competition and a period of probationary service, would meet with considerable favour in the Province generally, though it would not fully satisfy the new school. The competition should be Provincial, so far as the Punjab is concerned, for a long time to come. I would suggest three years for the probationary period. A special training in England, or in a college in India, would, no doubt, be advantageous. I would not insist on an English training, though I would have no objection to give facilities for a visit to England for purposes of study. In this view the probationary period might be four years, two of which would be passed in England or at a college in India, the remaining two at work. I may say generally that, so far as the vast bulk of the people in the Punjab is concerned—and in this I include a very large proportion of those who have received education—I much doubt whether the matters dealt with in this inquiry can be regarded as burning questions. I do not think that the present rule for competition in England, or the Statutory system, have given rise in this Province, to any dissatisfaction worthy of the name; or that there is any general desire to see them altered. No doubt members of influential classes find themselves being pushed aside by the new school of young men whom we are educating, and they—the old school—consider it very hard that low-grade appointments, such as Naib Tahsíldárships, cannot be obtained on family considerations and as rewards for the services of

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

G. R. Elsmie, Esq.

Mr. *Stewart*—continued.

fathers and grandfathers. There is, however, no burning desire to obtain Covenanted posts, and I believe that the increase and general improvement of the Uncovenanted Service would satisfy the wishes of the bulk of even the thinking part of the community for a long time to come. The lowest class of officers, who, amongst other work, have generally to perform Judicial or quasi-Judicial duties, are the Naib Tahsíldárs, the Deputy Sub-Collectors. So far as position is concerned, the post is a much coveted one. The pay, however, is miserably low—for the most part Rs. 50 a month. I believe that an increase in the numbers and in the pay of our Naib Tahsíldárs would cause much greater immediate satisfaction to the community generally than the adoption of any plan for increasing facilities for competition for the higher Civil Service or for entry into a Statutory Service, which at best could only benefit a very few individuals. The Punjab is still a very young Province, and its people have not as yet been surfeited with small prizes. The day of small things is not over, so far as the great majority of the aspirants for office is concerned.

Mr. *Peacock.*

1233. Can those two Statutory Civilians, whose work came immediately before you, be taken as fair specimens of the class from which Statutory Civilians are ordinarily recruited?—I should say so.

1234. You say they are very far from being superior to the general body of the Uncovenanted Service?—I mean the lower ranks of the Uncovenanted Service.

1235. You also say that the members of the Uncovenanted Service generally are not fit for promotion to the ordinary Covenanted Service?—Yes, but still I do not see how the Statutory system can be retained.

Mr. *Stewart.*

1236. Do you think we have got the best men who could have been selected for Statutory Civilians?—I am inclined to think that the two out of the five I have seen are not by any means the best of the five. They were all appointed by nomination. I think if there had been competition it might have been possible to get better men.

Mr. *White.*

1237. Amongst the Extra Assistant Commissioners whom you said you would not promote because they are not sufficiently qualified, and for other objections, do you include Europeans domiciled in India and Eurasians?—Of course: I am speaking of the Uncovenanted Service generally.

Mr. *Stokes.*

1238. You consider that domiciled Europeans and Eurasians, men of fair education, are unfit to be promoted to the Covenanted Service. Is that so?—I am only speaking of individuals in the Punjab, whose work I have had considerable opportunity of seeing. I am treating the matter from the Punjab point of view entirely.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1239. As to the Covenanted Civil Service, have you any notes on that?—Yes, I will read what I have written on this point. I think the limit of age both for Natives and Europeans should be raised to 21 years. The present age, 19, is in my opinion too low. It is almost prohibitory in the case of Natives, and is a standing and very natural cause of dissatisfaction. There appear to me to be good reasons for raising the age of both classes of candidates to at least 21 years, and I believe that such an alteration would very properly give much satisfaction to all concerned.

The *President.*

1240. Have you anything else to say on the English competition?—No; but I think I ought to read the first paragraph of what I have written, because it really explains what I have said, and makes my position clear to the Commission. As the subjects dealt with in the series of questions had not been specially studied by me, and as time was short and my ordinary work heavy, I felt diffident either of submitting written evidence or of offering myself for oral examination. I have now, however, been specially summoned to give evidence before the Commission, and in a letter received on my return from Camp the night before last I have been requested to draw up a brief memorandum of the specific points on which I desire to be examined. In reply to this invitation I think I ought to say at once that it would hardly be right for me to describe myself as a person desirous to give evidence; still less am I anxious to appear as a critic who considers himself competent, from his present personal knowledge, to deal exhaustively with all or any of the various schemes which appear to have been suggested. My position is rather that of a Government officer of long experience in the Punjab who is ready and willing to state any facts within his knowledge which may be likely to be of use to the Commission, and I should be glad to avoid attempting to reply to any of the speculative inquiries until, at all events, I have had an opportunity of reading the arguments which I presume have been put forward by the advocates of the various schemes of which we find indications in the set of questions.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

1241. You have only proposed to raise the age with regard to the competitive examination. Do you not think that some change as to the subjects, or the system of marking, ought to be introduced?—I think that certain subjects, designed specially to meet the Indian system of education, might well be added, and I should be inclined to give to Arabic and Sanskrit marks equal to those accorded to the English classics, Latin and Greek, and I would estimate Persian of equal value with French.

Mr. *Stewart.*

1242. You said you would raise the maximum limit of age of Europeans and Natives alike to 21, would you alter the minimum limit also?—Yes, I think it might be raised to, say, 18. I may explain that I said *at least* to 21 for the maximum limit: I did not give that as the final limit which I would fix. I am inclined to think it is enough, but do not feel competent to say so conclusively, in the absence of all the arguments and papers upon the subject. I believe 21 to be the lowest limit which we should fix.

Mr. *Stokes.*

1243. May I ask upon what grounds you consider Arabic and Sanskrit equivalent to Latin and Greek?—Generally on the ground of fairness, in order to facilitate the entrance of Natives, and not so much on account of my appreciation of the value of these languages.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

1244. Would you not give facilities to Indian students for going to England to pass the examination. I mean facilities in the way of scholarships, paying them passage-money?—No; I don't think I would.

1245. Do they not labour under a great disadvantage in having to go to England?—I think every candidate for the Civil Service labours under a great disadvantage, in that it costs him a great deal of money to prepare, and I do not see why additional pecuniary facilities should be given.

1246. The cost of preparing is equal in the case of both classes of candidates, but there is the special cost of the journey to England in the case of the Native?—I do not think I would give it on the part of Government. I would leave it to public benefactors to offer certain prizes to be competed for.

1247. But in that case if the examinations are held in England, is it not putting Statutory Natives to a great disadvantage?—I doubt whether the proportion of disappointed ones would be greater than the proportion of disappointed English candidates.

The *President.*

1248. Are they under greater disadvantages in that respect than Her Majesty's subjects in Australia and Canada?—I doubt it.

Mr. *Peacock.*

1249. You said you would have a probationary period passed at a college out here or in England, but you did not say which you thought best in the interests of the Statutory Service?—I have no special preference for either.

Mr. *Ryland.*

1250. Did I rightly understand you to say that if Uncovenanted men were once admitted into these reserved ranks they would, if competent, rise to any grade?—I did not contemplate any restriction; I would not exclude any Uncovenanted officer from the charge of a district, if I thought him more competent, merely because he was not a Covenanted man.

Mr. *Stokes.*

1251. To revert to the competitive examination. You say you would make a change in the marks for Indian classics on the principle of fair play. Then your desire is to facilitate the entrance of Natives to the Service. Do you think it would strengthen the Administration?—I am not prepared to go so far as to say it would, but I think that if competition is extended to the Natives it ought to be really open, and I do not think there should be anything like a pretence of opening it and then throwing difficulties in the way of Native candidates. If Natives are expected to go to England they should be fairly encouraged, not unduly encouraged; and it seems to me only right that the classical part of the Indian education should be recognised to the same extent as the classical part of the English education, without regard to its real educational value, because I do not fancy that in India there are really the same facilities for acquiring a classical education as there are at home. It is extremely difficult, I think, for an Indian to compete in Greek with an Englishman who has received a proper classical education.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

1252. Unless you consider the real intrinsic value of Arabic and Sanskrit equal to the real intrinsic value of Latin and Greek, do you not, by assigning them the same mark value, virtually abandon the principle of the competitive examination system?—Surely not, when there is a large range of subjects and the candidate is allowed to choose. But if it is a departure from the principle, as you suggest, it is so in a very minor degree.

Mr. *Stokes.*

1253. In your opinion is it a desirable thing to abandon the principle of competition

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

G.R. Elsmie, Esq.

Mr. *Stokes*—continued.

even to that extent?—I think it is a desirable thing to meet fair objections.

1254. Whatever the result may be?—I am not prepared to say that, but I do not anticipate any mischief from going that length.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

1255. I suppose you think the grievance is more sentimental than real at present?—

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

I think the result of the examination would be but little affected, but I distinctly think that the training which the candidate in India can get from the study of Arabic and Sanskrit is, if not equal, still similar to the training which is obtained at home by the study of Greek and Latin, and on that ground I should be inclined to put them on the same footing.

WITNESS XIII.—18th December 1886.

Examination of C. A. Roe, Esq., of the Covenanted Civil Service, Divisional Judge, Lahore, Punjab.

The *President.*

1256. You belong to the Covenanted Civil Service?—Yes.

1257. What is the length of your service and what offices have you filled? You have had considerable experience in the Settlement Department, as well as in the Executive and Judicial lines, have you not?—Yes, I entered the Service by competition in 1863, and have served for twenty-three years. I am now Divisional Judge, Lahore, and have acted as a Judge of the Chief Court for a time. I was four years a Deputy Commissioner, and was twelve years in the Settlement Department.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1258. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—The mass of the people are very indifferent to details, and it does not affect them paticularly. But there are two classes which are interested in it, and these may be described as the old and new schools: those who look to appointment on the ground of old family and family services, and who naturally prefer nomination; and those who are excluded by these rules, and naturally prefer the system of competition under which they might hope to get in.

1259. What are the grounds of disapproval put forward by the new school?—Naturally the ground is that they do not get the nominations under the present system.

1260. Are the difficulties of the existing system susceptible of remedy by the amendment of the rules?—I think the objection to the existing system of Statutory Civilians is that the appointments are only to certain specific posts; and my opinion is that, except as regards pay and pension and leave rules, the Statutory Civilians should be considered as members of the Covenanted Civil Service altogether.

1261. Would you amend the Statute so as to enable that to be done?—Yes.

1262. And with regard to the rules which restrict competition you are opposed to them also?—No, I am opposed to the system of competition and approve of nominations.

1263. Do you approve of competition after nomination or nomination simply?—I prefer nomination simply because, of course, the number of nominees must exceed

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

considerably the number of posts vacant, and it will often happen that a man qualified for a pass at the examination cannot succeed under a competition, however eminent may be his position or family services. He may come in third when there are only two vacancies.

1264. Because it secures men of influential families? Is that your reason?—Competition prevents the Government from giving an appointment to any man, however eminent may be the services of his family or his rank, and, often, if he is himself of fair average ability.

Mr. *White.*

1265. Would it not open the door to jobbery?—Well of course any system of appointment by patronage is open to jobbery, but I think it is a much more oriental idea that appointments in the Service are in the gift of the representatives of the Sovereign than that a man can demand entrance into it as of right. I deny that there is any general dissatisfaction with the Statutory system.

1266. What is your opinion of the position occupied by the Statutory Civilians in public estimation?—That they are not at present in the same position as Covenanted Civilians. They are regarded as occupying an inferior position.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1267. Have you observed any friction between them and the Covenanted Civil Service?—No.

1268. Or any unwillingness on the part of gentlemen of good family to accept posts in the Uncovenanted Civil Service?—No, of course I have seen members of the Extra Assistant Service who are of good family.

1269. Are they willing to accept employment in the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes, and have done so.

1270. Would you abolish the power of Government to appoint to posts in the Covenanted Service persons of approved merit and ability from the Uncovenanted Service?—I think the appointment to posts is always open to objection. When a man has once entered the Statutory Service he should look for promotion in the ordinary way.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

C. A. Roe, Esq.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

1271. If you retain the present system of appointing to the Statutory Service young men who begin at the bottom of the list, what do you say to the appointment of persons of approved merit and ability from the Uncovenanted Service to such posts?—I think that, as a general rule, the distinction between the two Services should be clearly recognised, and that anything like ordinary expectation of promotion from the Uncovenanted to the Covenanted should not be encouraged; but I would allow such promotion in exceptional cases, and to provide for the question how you could expect an Uncovenanted man to begin at the bottom of the list, I would allow Government to give him so many years' seniority in making him a Statutory Civilian. I should suggest not more than half the number of years' service as an Uncovenanted servant with a limit of ten years' seniority. He would then be on a par with a Civilian of ten years' standing, and in the ordinary course of things eligible for appointments ordinarily held by men of ten years' standing.

1272. You would set apart no special appointments to which Uncovenanted men could be appointed, but you would transfer them to a Service which you would substitute for the existing Statutory Service?—My view is to make the Statutory Service a regular part of the Civil Service except as regards pay and pensions.

1273. You would transfer an Extra Assistant Commissioner, let us say, to the Assistant Commissioner line, and, by giving him half his years of service, put him into the place where half his years' service would bring him?—The promotion might in some cases be a sufficient reward in the case of young Assistants, but I am alluding to the case of old servants, drawing salaries of Rs. 1,000, whom you could not expect to begin on lower pay, and I should leave it to the local Government to declare that his position amongst the Statutory Civilians was above or below men of a certain year's service, fixing the limit to which this could be done at ten years' service. My desire to make the Statutory Service part of the Civil Service goes a little beyond the Punjab Province. The difficulty would arise in the Regulation Provinces, where certain appointments are reserved by law to the Covenanted Civil Service.

The *President*.

1274. Assuming that there is no objection to such an appointment anywhere in the Service, let us take the case of a man of 14 years' service: how would you count that Uncovenanted officer's service with a view of grading him fairly among the Covenanted men?—I would grade him with Assistant Commissioners of about seven years' service, as maximum, supposing him to be a right good man; but to a man of less ability I would give four or five. Each case should be decided on its own merits.

The *President*—continued.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

1275. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment to the Covenanted Civil Service?—I have no personal knowledge of any.

1276. Would you recommend any changes in that system?—Bearing in mind what I have said about admitting those Statutory Civilians regularly to the Covenanted Service, the only alteration I would suggest is the raising of the limit of age for everybody.

1277. Would you add to the subjects in the examination or to the maximum marks in any subject?—I have not considered that point, but I have heard what Mr. Elsmie said upon it, and I do not quite agree with his view. So far as I can judge, I think they are sufficiently marked at present. Of course, it is quite true that Latin and Greek are almost excluded from the Indian candidates; on the other hand it must be remembered that Latin and Greek almost exclude other subjects from the ordinary English public schoolboy; and the Native candidate, as a rule, would be far better up in mathematics and natural science than an English schoolboy would be. Then there is the other consideration that Arabic and Sanskrit do not, I should say, take up nearly as much time in acquisition as Latin and Greek. Another point is where would you get the examiners from for Arabic and Sanskrit. To have a subject highly marked you should have a higher standard of examination, which you could obtain as regards Latin and Greek in England. But those who could conduct a really high standard examination in Arabic and Sanskrit are really a few specialists.

1278. In your opinion is it desirable to hold examinations in India as well as in England?—I think it is not, and I think it would be absolutely impossible to hold identical examinations. Apart from difficulty of sending out papers and the danger of papers being tampered with, I do not see how you could possibly conduct the *vivâ voce* examination.

1279. If it is decided to hold an examination in India, should the candidates be required, as an obligatory condition, to proceed to England to complete their training?—No, I do not think so.

1280. You would not impose, as a condition obligatory on any class of Civilians selected in India, the completion of their training in England?—No.

1281. Would you encourage it?—I do not think it desirable to do so, beyond that I think that to a certain extent, no doubt, residence in England would improve their minds; but as for actually making them

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

better officers when they have settled down to their work, I doubt if it would do so very much.

1282. Would you establish scholarships to induce men to go home and study for the Civil Service or for the liberal professions?—Yes, on the general ground that by going to a foreign country a man improves his mind, but not on the ground that his doing so would benefit the Service.

1283. Would you recruit for the Uncovenanted Executive and Judicial Services from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty or only from the Natives of India?—I should confine it to the Natives of India as defined by the Statute.

The *President*.

1284. Would that be consistent with existing Acts of Parliament? Is not there an Act of Parliament which says that no natural-born subject of Her Majesty, of whatever race, creed, or colour, shall be excluded from any post he is competent to hold? Would it be consistent with that Act of Parliament—No; I don't think it would. Perhaps I should say I would not exclude any natural-born subject of Her Majesty.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

1285. If you had to recruit for the Uncovenanted Service in the Punjab, would you recruit amongst all Her Majesty's subjects without exception, or only from those resident in this Province?—From the residents of the Province, whether Anglo-Indians, Eurasians, or Natives. When I gave my first answer about excluding Europeans, I was looking to the very subordinate posts, and I object to Europeans who do not come under the definition of Natives of India being appointed to those posts merely for the sake of immediately being promoted to some other post. But now that it is pointed out to me that it also includes Extra Assistant Commissionerships, I say no I would not exclude them.

1286. For Tahsildárs and Munsifs you would recruit only Natives of the Province?—Yes.

1287. And as regards recruiting for the Extra Assistant Commissionerships you would make your choice more extensive?—Yes.

1288. Would you recruit from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—Yes.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*.

1289. No matter where resident?—Mr. *Crosthwaite*.—For instance, a young Englishman who had come out here looking for employment?—Certainly; if there were competition he would take his chance.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*—continued.

1290. But if the competitive system did not exist—if it was pure patronage?—I should be sorry to see such a thing absolutely prohibited, but it is difficult to give a universal negative. It is impossible to say that, whatever the circumstances may be, such a thing cannot possibly be allowed. I would not prohibit it by legislation.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

C. A. Roe, Esq.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

1291. What system of recruitment do you recommend for this Province?—I would leave it to nomination.

1292. Your idea is that nomination is the better means of manning the Service?—I mean that under the nomination system it is possible to provide for all classes. Under competition it is not. Under nomination you can put in men of old families, or, if you prefer it, educated men. All classes, in fact, are open to you to select from.

1293. Should any distinction be made in salaries attached to posts in the Covenanted Civil Service held by officers of the Statutory or Uncovenanted Services?—Certainly.

1294. On what principle?—On two principles. You must assume that those Statutory Civilians are Natives of India in the ordinary sense; that is, that your pay and leave must be regulated on the assumption that they are intended to apply to Natives of India, and not to imported Europeans. The expenses of Natives of India are very much less than those of Europeans; and also there is the consideration that the position is a very much greater prize in the eyes of Natives of India than it is in those of Europeans. They are amongst their own countrymen here, to whom the position, say of a Deputy Commissioner, is of very high rank; indeed like the Lord Lieutenancy of a county at home. Whereas to people at home all that is known of a man who holds that position is that he is something in India.

1295. Would you make any distinction in the furlough rules applicable to the Uncovenanted branch according to nationality?—I think not. I would make no distinction in the privileges as to furlough or otherwise.

1296. You are aware what pay is given to the Statutory Civil Servants here on first appointment?—About Rs. 200 a month, which rises to Rs. 250 in the second year, Rs. 300 in the third, and so on.

1297. From your knowledge of the Punjab, do you consider that rate of pay is sufficient? Is the sum of Rs. 250, on passing the examination by the lower standard, enough to maintain a Native gentleman?—I should say it was amply enough, looking at the position of a Native gentleman and the ordinary standard of living amongst Native gentlemen.

1298. How much would a young Englishman require?—That would depend upon

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

his tastes., I believe an Assistant Police Officer gets Rs. 200 a month. He is generally a gentleman's son. He has to live as a gentleman, and associate with other English gentlemen on the same terms. Rs. 200 is not an insufficient pay for him. Of course if he were in a large station, he would have to be very careful and to deny himself a good deal; but as a matter of fact, most of them would go to smaller stations. I think, generally speaking, Rs. 200 would be sufficient to maintain him. It is found, in fact, to be enough to maintain them, and is more than he would probably make in a profession during the first year.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

1299. Would you not prefer that one-half of the appointments to the higher grades should be given by nomination and the other half by competition?—I should see no objection to that.

1300. All, then, that you want is that in some cases at least there should be the power of pure nomination?—Yes.

Mr. *White.*

1301. What if the man did not know how to read and write?—No sensible Government would appoint a man of that kind.

Syud Ahmed, Khán Báhádur.

1302. Are you acquainted with the manners and customs of Natives of high family and their ways of living?—As far as an ordinary European can be.

1303. On what ground do you base your opinion on the expenses of Natives. May not an Englishman spend in one direction and a Native in another? May not a Native have to maintain a large family?—I based my answer on what I might call an average family—what would be sufficient for a man with an average family to live on.

1304. Suppose the case of two Europeans of equal rank, Magistrates in different districts, say Lahore and Amritsar; one of them spends large sums, while the other is more economical: would you reduce the salary of the latter?—No.

1305. Why then in the case of the Native?—You must take the average standard of living for persons in that position; what persons in that position out of Service would live on.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

1306. What is the pay of an English Lieutenant in the army?—About Rs. 200.

1307. Are they not the sons of gentlemen?—Yes; but their fathers find money for them besides their pay.

Mr. *Stokes.*

1308. You object to an identical examination, because you said there was great danger of the papers being tampered with. Don't you think that could be avoided?—I said that was one objection, but the difficulty about the *vivâ voce* examination makes it absolutely impossible.

1309. Do you think the examiners at home could advocate certain heads to which the examiners here should confine themselves?—No.

1310. Why should you be anxious to nominate the upper classes? Is it because they cannot pass the examination?—The reason is that men may be quite up to a fair average, but in the case of nominees for, say, three appointments, he may invariably come out fourth, and without power to nominate you cannot give the post to such a man, however great his qualifications in other respects, because his marks are just below those of another man who may be his inferior in every other way.

The *President.*

1311. As a matter of fact, do you consider that the high families in this Province have reached the same standard of education as men of less social influence and position?—Certainly not; and one reason is that they have not had the same facilities. I consider it very important that social influence should be a qualification for appointment in the public Service.

1312. Are there any reasons why they do not avail themselves of the schools which are open to every class in this Province?—Exactly the same reasons that prevent the higher and middle classes in England from availing themselves of board-schools.

Mr. *Stokes.*

1313. Are there any schools to which the higher classes would willingly send their sons?—I do not know any.

The *President.*

1314. As a matter of fact you know that the existence of that feeling has led to the establishment of a special educational institution in this Province for sons of men of high family?—I do.

Mr. *Ryland.*

1315. Then you do not consider the educational test the best test of suitability for employment in this Province?—No.

Mr. *Peacock.*

1316. You would raise the minimum of age as well as the maximum?—It might possibly be raised to eighteen if necessary.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

1317. Have you had any Statutory Civilians working under you?—I have had one. I have no personal knowledge of any others. The one I knew worked satisfactorily.

1318. Was he better than the average of Extra Assistants?—If you mean Native Extra Assistants, he was a far better English scholar than most.

The *President.*

1319. Setting Englishmen aside, was he better than the average of Native Extra Assistants?—He was quite equal to them.

1320. Would you call him distinctly superior to the average of his class with the same experience?—To the average he was equal, and to those of the same experience he was decidedly superior.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

1321. Has the appointment of Natives under the Statutory Rules, or under 24 and 25 Vic., Chap. 54, produced any uncertainty or uneasiness in the minds of Covenanted Civil Servants as to their promotion and prospects?—The feeling does exist.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1322. Can you explain in what it consists?—The rising in the Statutory system is not by gradation. Men already in the Service are uneasy about others joining and being promoted over their heads. The scheme I propose would obviate that feeling to a certain extent.

The *President.*

1323. Considering that Acts of Parliament have for a long time contemplated such appointments, do you think that those officers who entered the Service since the passing of these Acts have any justification for their uneasiness?—I do not suppose they were aware of the law. These are details which are only known to candidates whose fathers are out here or have been in service here and can give them special information. I would say that the Service was in an uneasy state owing to these appointments.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

1324. You have said that if the Statutory system be retained you would prefer nomination to competition?—Yes; of course I speak with special reference to this Province.

1325. Don't you think that in ordinary cases, in other countries, the competition system is the best for securing the best men available for the service of the country?—Everything depends upon the special circumstances of the particular country and, also, who are the possible candidates.

1326. Is it the best system for England?—I have not been in England except for a month or two since the system was

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter*—continued.

introduced, and I have no absolute knowledge of the working of the system. As regards the Punjab, I say that as a matter of fact men of old family do hold a position and possess influence which makes it desirable that they should be in sympathy with the Government.

1327. On the ground, therefore, of political expediency you object to competition in India? Is that so?—That is the ground on which I base my present answer as regards the Punjab.

1328. You have said, with reference to the competitive examination in England, that you would not raise the marks assigned to Arabic and Sanskrit under the present rules, and you judge of the educational value of these two languages as compared with the classical languages of Europe?—I was simply looking to fairness to the Indian candidates.

1329. Do you know Arabic and Sanskrit?—I have some knowledge of Sanskrit.

1330. Are you able to compare the educational values of Arabic and Latin?—I give no opinion of their educational value. I simply look to the time spent in their acquisition.

1331. You advocate difference of pay, and one of the grounds you have assigned is that the expenses of Natives are much less. What are your opportunities for knowing that the expenses of living of a Native gentleman are less?—I have seen Native gentlemen readily take much smaller appointments, live on them for years, maintaining, to all outward appearance, the position of Native gentlemen and providing for their families as well as any one in that situation could be expected to do.

The *President.*

1332. Have you ever had the management of Wards' Estates?—Yes, but of course the Court of Wards only deals with minors, and the expenses of minors would be very much less.

1333. Taking all the expenses of marriage and for ceremonies, for charity to poorer relatives, &c., do you think the expenses incurred by Native gentlemen are considerably less than the expenses incurred by European gentlemen holding the same position in society?—Undoubtedly.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

1334. Have you ever had charge of a Native State?—I have not.

1335. Have you any knowledge of the pay which Native States in the Punjab give to their officers—Tahsíldár, for instance?—I only know by general hearsay.

1336. You think, as far as you know, that the pay offered to a Civilian under the Statute is as good as the pay generally given to the highest Judicial and Executive officers in Native States?—I could not say.

WITNESS XIV.—18th December 1886.

Examination of Colonel W. R. M. HOLROYD, Director of Public Instruction, Punjab.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Colonel *W. R. M. Holroyd.*

The *President.*

1337. You are Director of Public Instruction in the Punjab? What length of service have you?—I have occupied that post since 1867. Before that I was Inspector of Schools in the Punjab. I am also a Fellow of the Punjab University.

1338. Can you tell us what is the average age at which Natives in the Indian Universities pass the F.A. or Intermediate Examination and take the B.A. and M.A. degrees?—The return I have had prepared shows it to be 19½ for the Intermediate, 21½ for the B.A., and 22½ for the M.A.

The *President*—continued.

1339. From what class or classes of Native society are persons graduating in the University generally drawn?—From the middle class, and occasionally from the upper class. I have prepared a table showing this.

List showing the caste and the occupations of the fathers of students of the Lahore Government College who have passed the B.A. and M.A. examinations of the Punjab University.

Year.	Names of B.A.'s and M.A.'s.	Caste.	Occupation of the student's father.	REMARKS.
B.A., 1882.	Rám Prasáda ...	Káisth ...	Court Inspector.	
M.A., 1882.	Umráo Singh ...	Banyá ...	Shop-keeper.	
"	P. Harkishan Dás ...	Bráhmin ...	Teacher.	
"	Khwája Muhd. Shaffí	Sayyad ...	Service.	
B.A., 1883.	Máyá Rám ...	Khattrí ...	Petty Banker.	
"	Kesho Dás ...	Saprá ...	Teacher.	
"	Jiyá Rám ...	Jain ...	Shop-keeper.	
"	Sri Rám ...	Súd ...	Service	Private student, Calcutta, but was in the B.A. Class at the Government College.
"	Raushan Lál ...	Chaudhrí ...	Zamíndár.	
"	Muhammad Ashraf ...	Shaikh ...	Cultivator.	
M.A., 1883.	Chúní Lál ...	Banyá ...	Shop-keeper ...	Pleader, Gurdáspur, but passed High Proficiency from Government College.
"	Muhammad Husain ...	Sayyid ...	Service	McLeod Reader, but passed High Proficiency from Government College.
B.A., 1884.	Ruchí Rám ...	Khattrí ...	Private Service.	
"	Umr-ud-dín ...	Shaikh ...	Cultivator.	
"	Shiv Dyál ...	Khattrí ...	Clerk	Private student, Jullundur, but was educated up to B.A. at the College.
"	Sant Rám ...	Do. ...	Shop-keeper.	
"	Sevá Rám ...	Káisth. ...	Executive Engineer.	
"	Inám' Alí ...	Shaikh ...	Service.	
"	Sáwan Rám ...	Khattrí ...	Shop-keeper.	
"	Rám Chandra ...	Bráhmin ...	Pensioner.	
M.A., 1884.	Jiyá Rám ...	Jain ...	Shop-keeper ...	Private student, Amritsar, but passed his B.A. from College.
"	Rám Prásádá ...	Káisth ...	Court Inspector.	
B.A., 1885.	Gúrú Datt ...	Arorá ...	Pensioner.	
"	Narindra Náth ...	Kashmírí Pandit	Honorary Assistant Commissioner and Jágírdár.	

Year.	Names of B.A.'s and M.A.'s.	Caste.	Occupation of the student's father.	REMARKS.
B.A., 1885	Nihál Chand ...	Khattrí ...	Petition-writer ...	Oriental College, Lahore, but was educated at the Government College.
"	Chetánand ...	Arorá ...	Silk-seller.	
"	Hansráj ...	Khattrí ...	.....	
"	Dhrit Rám ...	Sikh ...	Jágírdár.	
"	J. B. Dales ...	Christian ...	Clergyman ...	Private student, but received his education up to B.A. at Government College, Lahore.
"	Sansár Chand ...	Khattrí ...	Tahsíldár.	
"	Srí Rám	.....	Head Master, Pattiálá College.	
"	Ganesh Dás ...	Sikh ...	Deputy Inspector, Police.	
"	Bhagat Rám ...	Khattrí ...	Railway Service.	
M.A., 1885.	Shiv Dayál ...	Do. ...	Clerk	Teacher, Amritsar, but read up to B.A. at College.
"	T. C. Chandú Lál ...	Christian ...	Head Master.	
"	Sant Rám ...	Khattrí ...	Shop-keeper.	
"	Umr-ud-dín ...	Shaikh ...	Cultivator.	
"	Ruchí Rám ...	Khattrí ...	Private Service.	
B.A., 1886.	Amír' Alí ...	Shaikh ...	Merchant.	
"	Harkishan Lál ...	Arorá ...	Náib Tahsíldár.	
"	Chúni Lál	Khattrí ...	Silk-seller.	
"	Rám Rattan ...	Banyá ...	Service.	
"	Kanhaiyá Singh ...	Sikh ...	Shop-keeper.	
"	Dayálí Rám ...	Khattrí ...	Service.	
"	Pohú Rám ...	Arorá ...	Shop-keeper.	
"	P. Hari Kishan ...	Kashmírí Pandit	Extra Assistant Commissioner.	
"	P. Parduman Kirshná	Ditto ...	Ditto.	
"	Tárá Chand ...	Arorá ...	Shop-keeper.	
"	Mádan Mohan Lál ...	.....	.....	
"	Nathú Rám ...	Khattrí ...	Money-lender.	
M.A., 1886.	Gúrú Datt	Arorá ...	Pensioner.	
"	Narindra Náth ...	Kashmírí Pandit	Honorary Assistant Commissioner and Jágírdár.	

The *President*—continued.

1340. Do you think that the existing system of education supplies young men who are well adapted for the subordinate public Service?—I think it does so fairly well.

1341. Do you think it would turn out in any numbers men who would be fitted by education to win posts in the Covenanted Service as the examination is now conducted?—No, certainly, with the present limit of age.

1342. Do we turn out from our colleges men, in any numbers, educated up to a point which should give them a reasonable expectation of passing such an examination?—Certainly not, unless the education they receive is supplemented by residence in England.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

1343. The educational institutions in the Punjab are not, you think, adapted for the training of candidates to compete for the Civil Service in England unless the training they receive is supplemented by training in England?—No.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

1344. Have you traced the careers of any of the graduates who have left the University?—Many of them have taken employment.

1345. Can you say of what kind and at what rates of pay?—The rates of pay vary very much indeed.

1346. At what rate of pay have you found graduates accept appointments?—I know of a man who only the other day took an appointment on Rs. 40: he had passed the B.A. That is lower than they usually accept.

1347. What is the average they receive?—I think a man now is generally willing to take about Rs. 50 or Rs. 60 to begin with. The average has been falling considerably. He will begin now on a smaller salary than he would formerly. The supply of educated men has become greater.

Mr. *Stokes*.

1348. What does a B.A. cost the State for his education?—I cannot tell at this moment, but I can easily find out. It has

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Colonel *W. R. M Holroyd.*

Mr. *Stokes*—continued.

fallen very much of late years, because the number of graduates has increased during the last three years from about 100 to about 300.

1349. Can you tell us what is the total amount of the fees a B.A. pays during his University career,—I mean up to the B.A. degree?—About Rs. 400, but the fees are to be increased for the next five years until they will be more than doubled. That is for his college education after he has passed the Entrance examination.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

1350. Among the men who take the B.A. degree are there many holders of scholarships?—Nearly half the total number of students attending the University hold scholarships paid by Government or the University.

The *President.*

1351. How many graduates have you turned out since the College was founded?—44 B.A.'s and 13 M.A.'s. The number of B.A.'s is increasing, and there has been a great increase in recent years in the lower classes of the Colleges; and I think there is every reason to suppose that a similar increase will take place in the upper classes, so that probably there will be four times the number of candidates for degree examinations in the course of three or four years. Out of the total number of 44 B.A.'s there are very few Mahomedans. I cannot give you the exact number of Oriental degree-holders. The number is small.

Mr. *Stewart.*

1352. Do any other class besides Punjabis graduate at the University here?—We have some Bengali residents, and there have been a few cases of men going up from other Provinces. I don't think any of them actually graduated. A very few Europeans or Eurasians have gone up. They enter very rarely indeed.

Syud Ahmed, Khán Báhádur.

1353. Have you any reason to suppose that the men you mentioned as having come up from other Provinces were men who failed in those Provinces?—No.

The *President.*

1354. I understand you wish to read a paper on the selection of candidates for the Public Service?—Yes, with your permission I will do so.

Memorandum on the selection of candidates for employment in the Indian Civil Service.

I assume, in the first place, that it is the desire of Government to afford a wider opening to Natives of this country by placing the higher appointments within their reach, so far as this can be done without impairing the efficiency of the administration.

It is quite certain that Punjab schools and colleges do not supply an education of as high a standard as the best, the most liberal, and the most finished education to be procured in England, and a very little consideration of the conditions of the case will show that it is quite impossible that they should do so for many years to come.*

The existing system can, no doubt, be greatly improved and much good may be effected by means of training colleges for masters of secondary schools. In Arts Colleges the most important point is to provide a strong staff of men of eminent attainments and high principles, who will raise the general tone of the students, improve the character of the instruction, and exercise a beneficial influence as members of the Universities on the general education of the country. Improvement must, however, be gradual, and the result of centuries of progress cannot be attained all at once.

It is very desirable that Natives of India should supplement their Indian education by attendance at an English University, but this will not compensate altogether for the deficiencies of their early training.

It is evidently desirable that both Natives and Europeans who are employed by Government should be selected under a system that will insure the appointment of the ablest and most efficient men of each class; and in order to secure this end it is in my opinion necessary, as the conditions of education in the two countries are essentially

* In England the best preparatory schools are taught by graduates, some of whom are highly distinguished men, and in the great public schools men of conspicuous ability are employed. In Universities are to be found the ablest professors, supplemented by tutors of high attainments.

All those masters and professors have themselves been taught from the earliest stages by men of high culture.

In the Punjab the lower classes of schools are taught English by men who have generally passed the Entrance examination. Those recently appointed have also received ten months' training.

The higher classes are taught by men who, if recently appointed, have attended college, and are generally trained; but this is not the case with most of the older teachers, and the proportion of graduates is small.

In future all appointments will be filled by trained men, and teachers of secondary schools must have attended an Arts College for two years, and teachers of primary schools will be required to have passed the Entrance, or, in the case of Vernacular teachers, the Middle School Examination. The number of graduates will increase rapidly, but a considerable time must elapse before passing the B A. Examination can be made an absolute condition for secondary teachers.

There can be no comparison between the staff in our colleges and that available in English Universities.

Amongst our schoolmasters there are some very able men, but even the few who have graduated have not enjoyed the same advantages as masters of English schools.

In England school and college education is supplemented by home education and associations and social influences, which have a large share in forming the character.

Those advantages are to a great extent wanting in India.

different, that there should be two distinct examinations—one conducted in England, the other in India.

To obtain in England the men who are likely to make the most efficient administrators, it is, I think, essential to attract the best scholars who have attended our great public schools and received a University education; but as I have been informed that the scope and character of the English examination is not a matter with which the Commission is prepared to deal, my remarks on this subject have been eliminated.

The English examination should be open to Natives, but the great majority of successful candidates would no doubt be Englishmen. Such Natives as passed would be men of very considerable enterprise and resolution, and of exceptional ability.

The English examination should, I think, be designed to keep up a sufficient supply of men to fill the higher executive appointments, where energy, self-reliance, promptitude, and ability to lead and to command are of vital importance. Whether any other appointments should be reserved for men who have passed the English examination is a question on which I do not presume to give a decided opinion, though I am inclined to think that this would be unnecessary. In any case, the appointments should be comparatively few in number, and should lead to rapid promotion, and they would therefore attract men of the highest ability.

The Indian examination also should be open to British-born subjects of whatever race or creed, but should be so framed as to secure the services of the best men educated in Indian Colleges.

I do not think that this would be difficult, if the principle were accepted; but the matter would require careful thought with reference to the actual course of study in Indian Colleges as regulated by the different Universities, and should be considered by a special committee.

The limit of age should be 23,* and all candidates should be nominated with the view of securing good social standing and moral character.

A certain percentage of appointments should be conferred on candidates at the head of the list, and be made tenable in any part of the country; and the remainder should be distributed at a fixed ratio amongst candidates from different Provinces, who come up to a minimum standard, a certain proportion being reserved for Hindus and Mahomedans, respectively, provided that they attain the requisite standard. If a sufficient number of Mahomedans fail to satisfy this condition, the appointment should go to Hindus of the same Province, and *vice versâ*. If the requisite number of candidates from any Province fail to qualify, the appointments might be conferred on outsiders, according to their standing on the list, if this were found to be absolutely necessary.

Candidates from each Province should be Natives of the Province, persons permanently domiciled in the Province, or sons of persons employed in the civil administration.

Probably some of the successful candidates would have supplemented their education in an Indian College by attendance at an English or Scottish University. When this is not the case, they should be required to attend a University in England or Scotland for two years, and should be supplied with a sufficient allowance for the purpose. This condition would give rise to no difficulty in the Punjab.

I think that one examination for the whole of India (or at least for the Bengal Presidency) would be preferable to provincial examinations; since it would be extremely difficult, if the latter were adopted, to maintain the same standard from year to year, as the experience of our local University has shown.

The allotment of a due number of appointments to each Province, and to Hindus and Mahomedans respectively in each Province, is, however, essential.

Success in the Indian examination should, I think, admit the candidates to an enlarged Civil Service to be recruited in India, in which (as suggested in question 155) the higher Uncovenanted appointments and those taken from the Covenanted Service would be combined.

I think it would be most desirable to award a limited number of appointments to men of high family without requiring them to pass the competitive examination; but, in the Punjab, attendance at the Aitchison College, and a fair standard of qualifications, to be raised hereafter, should be insisted on, say, the Intermediate, which is equivalent to the F.A. Examination, at present, and the B.A. and M.A. Examinations hereafter.

It may be found expedient to promote a certain number of men from subordinate appointments, or to transfer them from other departments. Some of the best men in the Educational Department have, from time to time, been employed as Extra Assistant Commissioners and in other appointments in the Civil Department. The system has its advantages and its disadvantages. It would be better for the Educational Department if men were transferred permanently at once, instead of being frequently employed to officiate in accordance with the existing practice.

A certain number of the higher judicial appointments would no doubt be conferred on members of the Bar as at present.

The rates of fees for the current year are as noted below:—1st and 2nd-year classes, Rs. 4 per mensem, or Rs. 40 for 10 months.

* It may be mentioned that the average age of students of this Province who have recently passed the Intermediate or F.A., the B.A., and the M.A. Examinations was 19½, 21½, and 22½ years respectively, and that graduates are supplied chiefly from the middle classes.

Colonel *W. R. M. Holroyd.*

3rd and 4th-year classes, Rs. 5 per mensem, or Rs. 50 for 10 months.

5th-year class, Rs. 6 per mensem, or Rs. 60 for 10 months.

There will be an annual increase of Rs. 20 beginning with the next financial year until these rates are doubled.

At present rates the amounts paid by a student from the Entrance to the B.A. standard would amount to Rs. 180, and to the M.A. standard Rs. 240.

At full rates, which will be reached in a little more than four years, the amount paid for education to the B.A. standard will be Rs. 360, and to the M.A. standard Rs. 480.

The annual cost of educating each college student during 1885-86 was Rs. 229-1-10, or say Rs. 230. This for four years up to the B.A. standard would amount to Rs. 920, and to the M.A. standard Rs. 1,150.

Owing, however, to the increase in the number of students, the cost of educating each student is falling rapidly.

WITNESS XV.—18th December 1886.

Examination of J. A. E. MILLER, Esq., of the Uncovenanted Service, District Judge, on special duty as Commissioner of Income Tax, Punjab.

The *President.*

1355. Would you kindly describe the character of your services? You are an Uncovenanted officer holding a Covenanted post, I believe, and were promoted from the list of Extra Assistant Commissioners to the superior Service?—Yes. I was appointed Extra Assistant Commissioner in January 1863. In 1865 I was Personal Assistant to the Financial Commissioner. In 1866 I became Secretary to the Financial Commissioner. In 1870 I was appointed Assistant Commissioner and, with the sanction of the Government of India and Secretary of State, transferred to the Covenanted list. In 1871 I was Officiating Registrar of the Chief Court; in 1872 Secretary to the Financial Commissioner; in 1879 Officiating Inspector-General of Registration and Superintendent of Stamps. In 1881 Officiating Deputy Commissioner. I have also officiated as Divisional Judge.

1356. You were educated, I believe, in England, and are a European British subject?—I am a European British subject. I was educated in Scotland. I came from Edinburgh in about the year 1860 to this country. I was then about the age of nineteen. I came to India in a private capacity. I did not join the Service till 1863.

1357. Is the existing system of appointing Native Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for Covenanted Civil Servants approved?—No.

1358. What are the grounds of disapprobation?—The results have not been successful. The men have not turned out very well. I know some of them myself; some of them work under me. I know two in particular, and of others I have heard opinions expressed by Government officers and Natives of independent classes. They all seemed to agree in a general disapproval of the Statutory Service, on the ground that it has not produced the best men.

1359. Are there any other grounds?—I think the Uncovenanted officers themselves, who see much of their work, think that quite as good results have been produced from the Service as it stands.

1360. Are the defects of the existing system susceptible of remedy either by amendment of the rules or by amendment of the Statutory provisions in that behalf?—I would rather see the whole system abolished. I think a better system could take its place.

The *President*—continued.

1361. If the provisions of 33 Victoria are not repealed nor substantially amended, so as to take away the power conferred on the local Administration, would you suggest that the definition of "Natives of India" under the Statute should be widened or restricted, and require the sanction of the Secretary of State instead of that of the Government of India for such appointments?—I do not think that raising the power of sanction would in any way affect the quality of the men. I think the Statute is unfortunate in entirely excluding Europeans, except those who came under the special technical definition of "Natives of India." So that taking the two things together, there is no room whatever for local Europeans, whom, in particular, I represent on this occasion.

1362. If the Statutory Service is retained, should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training?—Yes. I think that for the higher appointments Natives of India should be trained in England.

1363. Would you oblige them to go, or would you only encourage them?—I would do more than encourage them to go, but it would depend on the nature of the appointments.

1364. What do you mean by a "local European?"—I mean Europeans who do not come under the Statutory definition of "Natives of India"—non-domiciled Europeans.

1365. Do you think the Statute imposes a bar on the child of a European who settles in the country?—If he does not come under the technical definition, he cannot take the benefits conferred by the Statute.

1366. Is there anything in the Statute to debar him from securing any privilege which a Native of India can secure?—Yes, it would be contrary to law.

1367. The Statute excludes Europeans whose parents are not domiciled in this country. Cannot those parents secure the advantages of the Statute for their children by becoming domiciled?—Suppose the parents had died, in that case they could not. It is a much easier way out of it to provide some place for Europeans.

1368. Do you think that in order to acquire the privileges of the Statute the parents of Europeans should be required to give up any of the privileges they now possess?—No.

The *President*—continued.

1369. Would any class be prejudicially affected by the admission of Europeans as you suggest?—No; I propose to extend the advantages of the Statute to a certain class, but I do not propose to take away any from any other class. I propose to admit Europeans equally with Natives of India. I say that the Statutory system is a sort of half-and-half thing. It talks about Natives of India, but does not really mean them. There is a definition which, though purporting to talk of Natives of India, really means a good many Europeans and Eurasians. I should prefer to see a Statute and set of rules which made provision for pure Natives and a separate set of rules for pure Europeans and Eurasians, according to the circumstances of their respective cases; that is, some might be fit for one kind of employment and some for another. The Statute, in my opinion, ought to be confined to pure Asiatics, and separate rules could be made for those who are not Asiatics, whether Eurasians or pure Europeans.

Mr. *Ryland*.

1370. All you want to do is to remove a disability under which Europeans labour under the Statute, and also to make the Statute apply to those to whom it was originally intended to apply, viz. pure Natives?—Yes.

The *President*.

1371. You wish to give to non-domiciled Europeans the same facilities as are given by the Act to those for whom the Act was specially intended?—Yes.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar*.

1372. At present there is a system of pure nomination. Don't you think there would be a danger of an undue proportion of non-domiciled Europeans being appointed if that system should be retained?—I don't think the danger is great.

The *President*.

1373. Is any dissatisfaction felt in the Punjab, so far as you know, with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service through competitive examinations in England?—I believe not, except as to the limit of age: Natives think it should be raised. Of course the Natives would prefer to have the examination in India.

1374. Should any, and if any what, change be made in the system of examination in England?—No; it is an open examination. I would leave it very much as it is.

1375. Do natives of India labour under any, and if any what, disadvantages in competing for employment in this branch of the Service?—They do labour under some disadvantages, but they have excellent memories to make up for it. They are very good at passing examinations.

1376. Kindly specify the disadvantages?—Distance and cost.

1377. Are they under no educational disadvantages?—Yes; they cannot obtain an adequate preliminary education in this country to give them a fair start; but still, notwithstanding all that, we see that a good many have passed the examinations.

1378. By what changes might these disadvantages be minimised or removed? By the establishment of scholarships for instance?—I would not recommend that the Government should advance money or found scholarships.

1379. Would you alter the limit of age?—Yes. I think the Natives make a special point of that, and I agree with them; but if the age is raised, I think it should be the same for Europeans and Natives. I have no particular limit to suggest, because I cannot tell what would satisfy the Natives. I suppose nothing beyond a couple of years.

1380. Would you recommend that simultaneous and identical examinations in England and India should be held?—That scheme would, no doubt, be popular with the Natives, but whether it would be really successful and advisable I doubt. There are difficulties connected with the *vivâ voce* examination and the secrecy of the papers.

1381. If the examination was held in India, should it be identical, as far as possible, with that held in England?—I think it should, but I think it is impossible. I go further, and would not have any open competition in India at all.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar*.

1382. Would you reserve any posts especially for Indians?—Yes; I would reserve the proportion, say, of one-fourth to begin with. Suppose, for instance, there were forty vacancies in England, I would have ten available for Natives and not more; and if only five Natives passed, the other five posts should go to Europeans. That would be by examination in England. What I want to see is some safeguard against the entire Civil Service being monopolised by Natives. I am not particular about the proportion, so long as the European element is allowed to prevail.

1383. Supposing that proportion was fixed, what objection would there be to holding an examination in India?—There would not be the same degree of objection. The only objection there would be is that men who go to England show a certain amount of enterprise, which is a guarantee, to a certain extent, of the possession of qualities higher than mere intellectual success.

The *President.*

1384. In fact you prefer an examination in England only, but would not absolutely object to an examination in India also if the proportion of Natives was fixed?—Yes.

1385. But even in that case you would reserve some power of nomination, in the examination in India, so as to prevent the Native Civil Service being flooded by men of the lowest caste?—Yes.

Mr. *Peacock.*

1386. You said that you would reserve a proportion of appointments for Natives, and that for these Natives should compete in England. Suppose the number of appointments were five for Natives and only five Natives appeared, would you admit them all?—I have not worked out my scheme. All I want is a rule to safeguard the entire number of vacancies from falling into the hands of Natives.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

1387. Supposing the Government Service is swamped by Natives, what is the objection?—There is an objection on political grounds.

Mr. *White.*

1388. Is not what you propose at variance with the Queen's Proclamation and the Statute which provides that if a man is fit and competent, all posts are to be open to him, no matter what his race, creed, or colour?—Although the Proclamation does say no one is to be excluded, still in practice the thing is done: I don't profess to reconcile it.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

1389. Should the Uncovenanted Service (meaning Extra Assistants, Tahsíldárs, and Munsifs) be recruited only from Natives of India as defined in Statute 33 Vic., or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—From all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty.

1390. Should the recruitment be by competition or by nomination, or by both combined? and if by both combined, should the system be applied to all offices or to particular classes of offices?—I think the existing system of nomination for Tahsíldárs and Munsifs is quite sufficient. It acts very well. I am not so much in favour of competition, even for Extra Assistant Commissioners. I do not think it is likely to produce as good men as nomination. I have just conducted the last competitive examination for Extra Assistant Commissioners, and it has struck me that the kind of men we now have is not as good as I could have

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

picked out from among the Uncovenanted Service. I do not say that competition is not good in itself, but I think we get on quite well enough without it.

1391. Whatever system is adopted, would you make the recruitment provincial, *e.g.* confined to residents of the Province?—As a general rule, and only in exceptional cases I would admit outsiders. By residents of the Province, I understand Europeans, Eurasians, and Natives.

1392. If the existing Satutory Service is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that Service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service?—I don't think it is necessary to fix the exact number of offices to be given to the Uncovenanted Service. I think a man should be promoted as it is found necessary.

Mr. *Ryland.*

1393. Don't you think it would be better to fix the proportion of the appointments for the Uncovenanted men?—I do not think it is necessary provided some are appointed, because fixing a proportion might result in Government sometimes being in a difficulty and feeling obliged to appoint incompetent men.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

1394. Would you provide for the admission of distinguished officers of the Uncovenanted Service into the higher grades of the Covenanted Service?—I would. I would give a large power to meet exceptional cases. I don't think the hands of the Government should be tied.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1395. In fact you would retain 33 Victoria?—I would fall back on the Act of 1861. I would obtain power to make a larger number of appointments, whether under that Act or the Act of 1861. I would provide rules to regulate the fitness of non-domiciled Europeans and Eurasians. I would, in exceptional cases, promote Barristers from the Chief Court Bar to be Judges of the District Courts, but not Pleaders. Pleaders are good men at their work, but are not men of social standing.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

1396. Would you make any distinctions in the salaries attached to the posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service, accordingly as they are held by members of that branch of the Service or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches respectively?—Leave and pension rules should depend upon nationality rather than on anything else; but as regards Natives who pass at home, I do not propose any alterations. For any new class of Service, such

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

J. A. E. Miller, Esq.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

as I propose as a local Civil Service, I think the element of nationality ought to be considered as regards leave, pension, and travelling allowances.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

1397. There are, I understand, only five or six men of your class in the Punjab Commission?—Yes.

1398. Do you think that the fact of the prohibition of further appointments of that sort since 1869 has created discontent?—Yes.

1399. Has it prejudicially affected the efficiency of the Service to any appreciable extent?—Yes.

1400. How has it manifested itself?—In many ways. For instance, we do not get the same class of Europeans now for the Uncovenanted Service. The Civil List shows that the Europeans are few and far between. This is partly due to the disinclination of men to apply.

1401. Your system is one of nomination, and I understand you to say that you accompany that system with an examination to test qualifications?—Yes, so as to keep out the uneducated. As to promotion, I consider it should be regulated to some extent by departmental examinations, but to a much greater extent by reports made by immediate superior officers. As regards salary, I prefer the graded system. I am opposed to competition for the upper Service in India, because I think it would open too wide a door.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

1402. Have you any remarks to make as to pay or pension?—I consider that the class I represent is injuriously affected by the present pension system. Our pension is out of proportion to the pay we draw and the position we hold.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*.

1403. Do you know that officers in the Covenanted Service who get a thousand a year pension pay four per cent. of their salaries towards it from the time of entering the Service?—Yes.

1404. And if you get a thousand a year pension would you be prepared to pay up the four per cent. on your past salary in full?—I suppose we should have to do so.

WITNESS XVI.—18th December 1886.

Examination of Sardar DYAL SINGH, Majithia, landed proprietor of the Amritsar District, residing at Lahore, Punjab.

Note.—The *Majithia* family is one of the most distinguished families of the Punjab. It is divided into three great branches, Sardar Dyal Singh represents the senior branch. His grandfather, *Nodh Singh*, was a *Zemindar* of position in the *Shergil Jat* tribe. His father, *Lahna Singh*, was a prominent Sardar in the time of Maharaja Ranjit Singh. Sardar Dyal Singh is a man of considerable wealth, and has visited England. Three families of the Punjab—*Atariwala*, *Man*, and *Majithia*—are said to have possessed the greatest number of remarkable men.

The *President*.

1405. You belong to the *Majithia* family, which is, I think, one of the most influential families in the Province?—Yes.

1406. You have been to England?—Yes.

1407. With reference to the Statutory system of appointing Natives to Covenanted posts, is it approved by the people of this Province?—No, it is not.

1408. What are the grounds of disapprobation?—The selection is arbitrary, that is, it rests entirely with the Government. The incompetency of most of the members selected, and the inferiority of the Service as to pay, prospects, and position, are also grounds of dissatisfaction.

1409. Are the defects of the existing system susceptible of remedy either by the amendment of the rules or by the amendment of the Acts of Parliament, or should these provisions be altogether repealed?—I am not in favour of the Statutory Service, but if it is retained I would prefer certain amendments. A stated number of appointments should be made incumbent upon the Government, and appointment should be regulated by merit and ability. At present it is too much at the discretion of Government. I mean to say, instead of making it optional to appoint so many, I should make it incumbent on the Government to appoint a certain number. There must be specific posts for merit and ability.

1410. Would you enlarge in any sort of way the definition of the term "Natives of India" as contained in the Statute?—I would confine the term as it is at present, only extending it to the subjects of a few Native States, and I would exclude domiciled Europeans.

1411. Would you allow the appointments to be made by the Government of

The *President*—continued.

India, or require them to be made with the sanction of the Secretary of State?—By the Government of India.

1412. Supposing the Statutory system to be retained, ought the selected candidates to be required to proceed to England for training, or would you merely encourage them to proceed to England for training?—I would prefer that it should be made compulsory, but in any case it should be encouraged.

1413. You are a *Sikh*, I think?—Yes, I am a *Jat Sikh*.

1414. When you returned from England, were you received on cordial terms by your brethren?—Yes.

1415. They made no difficulties about it?—In religious matters, they did, but not in social relations; for instance, they would not let me go and worship in the temple; but some of them would eat meals in my house.

1416. Do you think these disabilities in regard to eating and other matters practically prevent many Natives from going to England?—Enlightened Natives would not care about these things, and, with the rising generation, these superstitious ideas are dying out. I speak for the Punjab. I am on friendly terms with all my people and relatives.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*.

1417. Why would you abolish the Statutory system?—For the reasons which make it unpopular.

Mr. *Stokes*.

1418. And one of these reasons is, you say, that the selection has been arbitrary?—Yes.

1419. What do you mean by that?—It rests only with the Government to make the appointments.

Mr. *Stewart*.

1420. Have you had anything to do, officially or otherwise, with Statutory Civilians in your district?—There is a Statutory Civilian in the district I reside in. I have had an opportunity of judging of his efficiency by hearing about him and seeing his work. I know three or four others. The people do not speak well of the majority of them.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Sardar *Dyal Singh*.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Sardar *Dyal Singh.*

Mr. *Stokes.*

1421. Would you prefer open competition to nomination?—Yes, I would open the competition to all classes in India and the Punjab.

1422. Have you any fear that if open competition in the Punjab were allowed, men of your own class, Sardars of the Province like yourself, would be excluded by men of a lower class, but better educated?—No.

The *President.*

1423. Do you think that the sons of the men of family are able to compete with the ordinary class of B A. and M.A.'s?—Not at present, but they are advancing in education, and in a short time the difficulty will be removed.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1424. You said that you yourself were ready to throw open competition to all India?—Yes.

The *President.*

1425. Do you think that the Natives of the Punjab at the present day would be able to hold their own with the more advanced Natives of other Provinces, as, for instance, Bombay, Bengal, or Madras?—Yes, my idea is that there should be one examination for the whole of India.

1426. For what Service?—For the Civil Service. Assuming that the Statutory Service is maintained, there should be one examination for all India.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

1427. Supposing that in the Punjab there are three posts to be filled up under the Statute, would you allow them to be competed for not only by the people of the Punjab, but also by all the people of British India?—By the entire people of British India. There should be one examination, and two lists should be made, one general and the other Provincial, and, of course, the Provincial section should first be given to the Natives of the Province; but if the number of successful candidates from the Punjab were not sufficient to fill all the available posts, they could be filled by candidates from all India. I would fix a minimum of marks for a pass.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1428. Is not dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruiting for the Covenanted Civil Service?—No.

1429. Would you propose any change in the system?—Yes, in the limit of age. I would raise it to 22, and I would also put the Indian classics (Sanskrit and Arabic) on the same footing as the English classics, viz. Latin and Greek.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

1430. Do the Natives of India labour under any, and if so what, disadvantages in competing for employment in this branch of the Service?—Yes, they have to pass the examination in a foreign language; that however cannot be helped.

1431. Would you establish scholarships and give allowances of passage-money to Native candidates as inducements to go to England to compete?—Yes.

1432. Would you raise the minimum limit of age?—Yes, to 19 years.

1433. Would you hold an examination in India as nearly as possible identical with the examination in England?—If it is rendered compulsory for the selected candidate to proceed to England to complete his training there, I should like an identical examination in India.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

1434. If there were no probation in England, you would not have a competitive examination in India?—I should, in that case, prefer one examination which should be held in England; but if an English training is compulsory, I should prefer to have two examinations, one held in India and both identical.

1435. Do you think it possible to hold an examination in India identical with the examination in England?—Yes.

1436. Assuming there are two examinations and the candidates in England and India have competed, should they be selected in the order of merit, or should a certain number of appointments be apportioned to the candidates of England and India respectively?—I would have only one list.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

1437. Some gentlemen who have been examined, mostly Europeans, have said that the people of the Province would prefer their affairs to be administered by Europeans rather than by Natives of the other Provinces. Is that the general feeling?—Such a feeling does not exist to any great extent.

The *President.*

1438. Do you think that if a *Mahratta Brahmin* from Bombay were to occupy the position which is now occupied in the Province by Europeans people would object?—The ability being equal, I do not think they would.

1439. To what do you attribute the prosperity of the Province?—Do you think it would have been attained, for instance, if the Province had been administered by, let us say, Natives from Bombay, Madras, or Bengal, instead of by Europeans?—When I said that there was no such feeling in the Province against Natives of other Provinces as that attributed to it, I did not mean that

The *President*—continued.

the people of the Punjab would as soon see Natives of other Provinces at the helm of affairs as Europeans. I would keep the helm of the Government in the hands of the Europeans.

1440. Do you think that Native control and supervision is as effectual as Europeans? —I do not think that Natives should be placed in very high posts in the administrative line; but in other cases, the ability being equal, I would give the preference to the Native of India.

1441. What do you mean by very high posts?—Such posts as Financial Commissionerships.

1442. And in the Judicial line?—I would promote them to the highest posts. I call all posts above Commissionerships higher posts.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

1443. Would the Natives of the Province prefer a Native as a Subdivisional or Divisional Officer to a European, the qualifications being the same in regard to honesty and efficiency?—They would prefer a Native of the Province—Punjabees would prefer Punjabees.

The *President.*

1444. Do you think, for instance, that during the recent riots at Delhi the people would have looked with as much confidence to a Native Deputy Commissioner as to a European?—I have never seen a Hindu or a Mahomedan Deputy Commissioner, and therefore I cannot say.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

1445. Are there people among the Natives of the Province who, even in such emergencies, would have been equal to the test?—I do not say that there are at present.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

1446. You have been to England, and you consider that having been to England has separated you in religious matters from your community. Is that so?—That was my case, but, lately, Natives belonging to very orthodox families have been to England and returned, and have been taken back without having to undergo any penitential rites. Before I went to England I did not observe caste, and therefore my going made no difference.

1447. But you have separated to some extent in religious matters from the rest of your relations?—Yes.

1448. And I presume also that as you have separated in religious belief, you have separated to some extent in politics and other matters. Do you think that in saying what you have said in your evidence,

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

you are expressing the opinions of the majority of the Punjab Sardars who have retained their ancient faith? When you say that you have no objection to see a Native of India of another Province, of Bengal or Madras or of Bombay, holding office as Deputy Commissioner or Commissioner over you, are you expressing the opinion of the majority of the Sikhs?—No; I express my own opinion and the opinion of several of them, but not of the majority.

1449. Do you happen to know Babu Jadu Nath Mozamdar, the editor of the *Tribune*?—Yes.

1450. Have you seen a scheme he has prepared?—No.

1451. Have you any connection with the *Tribune*?—I am its proprietor.

1452. How long were you in England?—I was only seven months in England. I was there in 1874.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1453. Do Natives who go to England from this Province on their return lose touch? Do they sympathise less with their countrymen?—No; and during the last two years nobody has objected to their return to caste. They are treated in fact exactly in the same way as if they had never been to England at all.

The *President.*

1454. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from the Natives of India as described in the Statute, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—From all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty, but preference should be given to Natives if possessed of equal qualifications.

1455. Should the recruiting be by competition or by nomination, or by both combined?—I am not in favour of pure nomination. I prefer open competition, and would have no patronage.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1456. Would you have competition for all classes of the Service, judicial as well as administrative, or would you appoint men tried at the Bar without competition?—Yes, professional men of tried and approved ability might be so appointed.

1457. Would you insist on competition in their case?—No.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

1458. Then how would you prove their ability?—The Courts where they practise would know whether they are fit men or not. They might be nominated. I mean members of the Bar and Pleaders.

The *President.*

1459. If the existing Statutory Service is abolished, would you assign to the Uncovenanted Service the appointments now reserved for the Statutory Civilians?—I would increase the number of reserved posts in the Statutory Service to one-fourth, and I would give them to the Uncovenanted Service if the Statutory system were abolished.

1460. Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to the posts reserved for the Covenanted Service according as these salaries are held by members of that

The *President*—continued.

branch of the Service or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches?—Yes.

1461. How would you make the distinction?—About one-third less, as it is now.

1462. Should any distinction be made in the furlough rules applicable to the Statutory and Uncovenanted Services?—Yes.

1463. On what grounds?—On the ground that the Covenanted Service rules are not the same as those of the Statutory Service.

WITNESS XVII.—20th December 1886.

Examination of Rai BUTA MAL, of the Uncovenanted Service, Punjab; Extra Judicial Assistant Commissioner (in the grades), Judge, Small Cause Court, Lahore.

The *President.*

1464. How many years have you served, and what offices have you held?—I have been twenty-four years in Government employ, and am now an Extra Judicial Assistant Commissioner. I began life in the Educational Department as second master in the Ferozepore Zillah School in 1863. In 1874 I was appointed to officiate as an Extra Assistant Commissioner and was subsequently confirmed.

1465. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians, to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—I don't think so. It is not so much the Statute which is objected to as the rules. Objection is taken to the Statute that it does not admit Natives of India to an organised Service, and also that the definition given in Section 6 of the words "Natives of India" is not sufficiently clear, so as to exclude persons who have not permanently settled in the country and are not thoroughly Natives of India, or rather whose parents were not permanently settled in India. And, as against the rules, our objection is that the ground of selection is not the well-defined basis of merit and ability, which would preclude the introduction of incompetent men; and secondly, that the conditions imposed on that Service as regards pay and promotion are such as to give it the appearance of occupying an inferior status as compared with the Covenanted Service.

1466. Would you abolish the Statute altogether?—No, at least not for some time to come. I would retain it as a supplementary and temporary system till such time as there are men available from all classes for an open competitive examination.

Mr. *Stokes.*

1467. You mean until education improves?—Yes. Until a sufficient number of men are made available for entering the public Service by pure competition.

1468. Do you think that competition can secure efficiency?—So far as the wants of the Province are concerned, it can.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

1469. You mean that you would retain the Statute in order to have a means of getting Native candidates into the Service until such time as Native candidates are sufficiently well educated to enable them to secure a fair proportion of appointments for themselves in open competition?—Quite so.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

1470. Do you think it necessary to retain the Statutory power as a means of rewarding approved ability and merit in the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1471. Would you retain it permanently?—Until such time as education has advanced to such a degree as will provide a sufficient number of Natives for open competition.

Mr. *Peacock.*

1472. And when that time comes you would exclude the selection of approved men of the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes, the same reservations being made in regard to the members of the Uncovenanted Service as now.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1473. Do we understand you to say that you would only temporarily retain the power of rewarding the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes.

1474. If the Statutory Service is retained, should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training?—I would not compel them to do so, but I think they should be encouraged to go. I do not think that any strong prejudice exists in the Punjab against it. What prejudice there is is not general, and is dying out. It does not exist to a great extent.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

1475. Does it involve loss of caste?—I do not think so. Those who have lately returned from England have not forfeited any of their caste privileges or social position, nor were they required to submit to purificatory rites.

1476. Have you any other recommendations to make?—Yes; if the Statutory Service is retained, I recommend that a fair, reasonable, and fixed proportion of appointments in the Covenanted Service should be reserved for Natives of India.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Rai *Buta Mal.*

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Rai *Buta Mal.*

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

1477. Do you consider the present proportion of one-fifth not a fair and reasonable one?—That depends on the conditions of the competition. If they are such as to allow of a sufficient number of Natives of India to appear and succeed, then I would reduce the number or I would retain it as it is. But if the conditions of competition are not improved, I would raise the proportion. The Statutory Service should be a service distinct from the Covenanted Service.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1478. If any alterations in the conditions of competition are carried out in favour of the Natives of India, would you increase the proportion or retain it as it is?—I would either retain it as it is or reduce it.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

1479. Have you anything else to recommend?—Yes; that for the purpose of selection, merit and ability should be held to be ascertained by competitive examination or by distinction attained in the service of Government or the practice of a profession.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1480. Do you think it necessary to have regard to family status?—Yes, certainly, if the candidates are fairly equal as regards educational attainments.

Mr. *Stokes.*

1481. Suppose one candidate had ten marks above the other, a man of family, would you call that being fairly equal?—I should not. These differences should not be greater than one or two marks; but it would depend upon circumstances.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

1482. Should the competitive examination be a Provincial one or open to the whole of India?—For the purpose of the Statutory Service it should be Provincial.

Mr. *Ryland.*

1483. You say that the definition of the words "Natives of India" is not sufficiently explicit so as to exclude persons not permanently settled in the country: has it not practically had the effect of excluding them in this Province?—I can mention no instances of men who were never intended to be included having been included. I only speak of the wording of the section. I think that instead of "habitually resident" the expression should be "permanently settled." A man may have resided here for a considerable period and yet he may return to his mother-country when his career in this country is at an end.

Mr. *White.*

1484. Would you require a Statutory Civilian to enter at the very bottom of the list?—No.

1485. You say you would give the preference to the man of family if, in competing at the examination, he were not much below the other candidates as regards marks. But do you not think such qualifications of rank should precede admission into the examination?—If it is to be a limited competition, then, of course, only such men should be admitted to the examination as would, in the opinion of the local Government, be fitted socially, intellectually, morally, and physically to hold such appointments; and in that case I do not think any distinction should be made after the examination. In the case of limited competition, I think it would be unnecessary to give any weight to the qualification of birth, the fact of previous selection being a sufficient guarantee of fitness.

Mr. *Stewart.*

1486. You wish to recruit the Statutory Service in three ways, I understand,—first, by competitive examination; secondly, from members of approved merit in the Uncovenanted Service of Government; and thirdly, from men distinguished in their professions. Would you assign any proportion to each of these heads?—I would assign a larger number to men in the Uncovenanted Service, and recruit from the professional classes only occasionally, as individual men are prominently brought to the notice of Government. Of the proportion reserved for Statutory Civilians, I would give two-thirds to men selected by competition and one-third to members of the Uncovenanted Service and the professional classes; and as regards the two last, I should give the preference to the Uncovenanted men. By professional classes I mean lawyers.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

1487. You would not admit Statutory Civilians into the ranks of the Covenanted Service?—They would not be considered as members of the Covenanted Service, but as belonging to a distinct Service, call it what you like. The privileges of promotion should be attached to it on the same footing as in the Covenanted Service; and in respect of pay, its members should receive 20 per cent. less than the members of the Covenanted Service selected by general competition.

1488. What makes you fix upon 20 per cent? What is your reason for reducing their pay?—My reason is that it cannot be supposed that they will possess the same qualifications, or have undergone the same labour, and have received the same education as those who enter through the channel of competition.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

1489. You said you would pay them 20 per cent. less, but in matters of promotion and so on they should be equal to the Covenanted Service?—I mean to say that they should not be appointed to posts only, but be members of an organised Service, and as such, should have no obstacles placed in their way in the regular course of promotion. Inferior men should not be appointed to such high posts as better men but when their turn for promotion came they should not be overlooked on the ground that they belong to the Statutory Service.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

1490. But if you make it a separate Service, would it not be necessary to assign certain specified posts for that purpose?—I am against the practice of admitting them only to certain specified posts.

1491. Supposing there is a vacancy, whom would you promote,—a man from the Covenanted Service or from the Statutory Service?—I have said that a proportion of appointments should be reserved for the Statutory Service. Selections might be made either concurrently, when more than one vacancy has to be filled, or alternately. When appointments are available for the Uncovenanted Service, these selections should be made from that Service. They would rank with members of the Covenanted Service in the same way as they do now, the only difference being that they will receive a certain percentage less than members of the other Service.

Mr. *Stewart.*

1492. When the question of promotion arose, I suppose the claim of each person would be tested on its own merits?—When it is a case of promotion by seniority they will be promoted in their turn, and when it is a case of promotion by merit they will be promoted according to the reports of their superior officers.

The *President.*

1493. And they would rise according to the ordinary incidents of the Service to which they were appointed?—Yes.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

1494. Suppose in a certain Province there are 20 District Judgeships, and all these are held, at the moment when a vacancy occurs, by Covenanted Civil Servants. According to your scheme there should be two organised Services, one a Statutory Service and the other the Covenanted Civil Service; from which Service do you think the vacancy should be filled?—That would depend upon whether the proportion allotted to the Statutory Service had been filled up or not. I would assign a certain proportion in all these offices to the Statutory Service: for instance, one-fourth of the District Judgeships, one-fourth of the Assistant Commissionerships, one-fourth of the Commissionerships, &c.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter*—continued.

Vol. I. Sec II. Punjab.

Rai *Buta Mal.*

Mr. *Charles Turner.*

1495. Or would you say one-fourth of the Service generally?—To start with, I would give a larger proportion in the Judicial branch of the Service.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

1496. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—Yes, and the dissatisfaction arises from the fact that the examination is held in England and under conditions which make the admission of Natives of India almost impossible. Actual experience has shown that for a good number of years no considerable number has entered the Service. The chief disadvantage is in respect to the limit of age. I would have the age raised to 23 years in the case of Natives of India.

1497. Can you suggest any other means of removing these disadvantages?—Would you found scholarships and make allowances of passage-money?—I would hold two simultaneous examinations of the same standard at two centres—one English and the other Indian. The English centre should be confined to English candidates and the Indian centre to Indian candidates. I would confine the examination held in England to the English candidates, and the examination held in India to the Indian candidates; and Natives who had received their training in England should have to come out to India for examination.

1498. Would you allot a certain number of appointments for the examination in India and a certain number for examination in England?—Certainly.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1499. Should the candidates be selected so many from one list and so many from the other, or would you take the highest men in both lists?—I would make one list for the English candidates and a separate list for the Indian candidates. If they have satisfied the requirements of the standard, they would be appointed in the proportion allotted to them with a qualifying minimum of marks

1500. Would you make any alteration in the subjects of the examination?—Generally such alterations should be made as are necessary to suit the capacity of the Natives of India. At present the subjects of examination and the way in which each subject is valued are more suited to the

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

capacities of English candidates than to those of Indian candidates. The subjects should include those which imply some knowledge of the history and geography of India. A larger proportion of marks in physical science should be assigned for the Natives of India, whose facilities for acquiring that science are less than is the case with the other subjects of the examination. The same value should be assigned to Arabic and Sanskrit as to Latin and Greek. I think, although I have no knowledge of Latin and Greek, that the classical languages of India should have the same value as the classical languages of Europe.

The *President.*

1501. But was it not the deliberate intention of the Commissioners in 1853 that the examination for the Covenanted Civil Service should be distinctly of an English type and not oriental?—Yes.

1502. And your proposal would to some extent alter that?—It must do so.

1503. If the examination is held in India, should the successful candidates be required, as a condition obligatory, to proceed to England to complete their training?—Yes. After the examination I would compel them to go.

1504. Are the young Natives obtained under the existing system of open competition in England the best as regards capacity and attainments?—I have had no means of judging that.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

1505. What is the reason why you would limit the English examination to English candidates and the Indian examination to Indian candidates only?—I think it would be a safeguard against the introduction of European candidates who have been brought up in India. I would require such candidates to compete in England.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1506. What proportion of appointments would you allot to the English examination and what proportion to the Indian examination?—I would allot one-half to each.

The *President.*

1507. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from the Natives of India as defined in the Statute, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—In the first instance it should be confined to the Natives of India; if the admission of Natives to the Covenanted Service should be extended, the recruitment for the Uncovenanted Service should also be extended to Indian natural-born subjects of Her Majesty.

The *President*—continued.

Europeans who have been born in India might be admitted, but not Europeans born out of India.

1508. Should the recruitment be by competition, or by nomination, or by both systems combined?—By competition.

1509. Should the recruitment be made by the several Administrations only from the persons resident in the territories of such Administrations, or with a preference for such persons only; that is to say, should the competition be limited Provincially, or should preference only be given to Provincial candidates?—Preference should be given to Provincial candidates. I would make out a Provincial list of the successful candidates and give them the preference.

1510. If the existing Statutory Service is abolished altogether, should the proportion of offices assigned to that Service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service?—Certainly.

Mr. *Ryland.*

1511. Why would you exclude subjects of Her Majesty who are born in other countries?—If they happen to have been located here for many years, would you exclude them simply on account of the accident of their birth?—I am against general importation, but I would admit the children of parents who have served in India.

1512. Would you open the Service to the children of those who have devoted their service and their lives to India, although they are not domiciled in India?—Yes.

1513. But not to persons whose parents had no connection with India?—No.

1514. Would you appoint your Extra Assistant Commissioners only from the ranks of approved Munsifs and approved Tahsildárs, for good service, or would you admit, directly, in whole or in part, to the Extra Assistant Commissioner grade, by direct appointment after passing the competitive examination?—I would do both.

1515. Should the recruitment for the Uncovenanted Service be by competition or by nomination, or by both systems combined; and if by both combined, should one system be applied to all offices or classes of offices, or should the system be varied with the class of offices?—By both systems combined, but the persons who would compete should previously have been nominated.

1516. Or do you mean that for certain appointments you would have open competition and for others nomination?—Graduates might be admitted to the examination as if it were an open examination.

1517. Would you fill up the higher ranks of the Uncovenanted Service partly by promotion or wholly by examination?—Partly by promotion.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1518. As to the Uncovenanted Judicial officers, how would you appoint them?—In the same way as other Uncovenanted officers, subject to a departmental examination after appointment. I have said that professional men should be appointed without examination. I would apply that also to the Uncovenanted Service.

1519. With regard to the system in force in this Province of appointing to posts in the Uncovenanted Service in the Extra Assistant Commissioners' grade, are you satisfied with that system?—I think it has been working satisfactorily.

1520. Do you think that any improvements could be made in the system in the present circumstances of the Province?—The system has not been sufficiently long in operation to justify my giving a decided opinion. It has worked satisfactorily.

1521. Do you know any Statutory Civilians?—Yes.

1522. Do you know their capabilities?—There are men in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service who, I think, are far superior in merit and ability to most of the Statutory Civilians who have been appointed in this Province.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

1523. Where were you born?—I was born in the Punjab, at Amritsar.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

1524. Supposing you wanted to find out the opinion of the general body of the Natives of the Punjab upon any point, would you go to men educated in the colleges and schools or would you go to the old-fashioned people?—That would depend upon the nature of my enquiry. If it were to ascertain the opinion on questions like these, admission to the Civil Service, &c., and I were to ask illiterate persons, they would know nothing about them. Questions which depend upon previous experience would be best answered by those who had a knowledge of actual life, whether they were educated or uneducated. But such questions as can only be answered by those who have a wide knowledge of the conditions of different countries in the world can be answered only by well-educated persons.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

1525. How long have you been in the Punjab?—I have spent all my life in it.

WITNESS XVIII.—20th December 1886.

Examination of Babu PROTUL CHANDER CHATTERJI, M.A., B.L., Pleader of the Chief Court, Punjab; Fellow of the Punjab University.

Vol. I. Sec II. Punjab.

Babu *Protul Chander Chatterji*, M.A.

The *President*.

1526. You practise at Lahore?—Yes, I have been seventeen years here. I have had experience of the District Courts. I commenced practice as a Pleader of the Chief Court. I have had no experience of administrative work, except only so far as it comes before me in connection with the practice of my profession I am a Native of Calcutta.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*.

1527. Speaking from your own experience, is the existing system of appointing Natives of the Statutory Civil Service to posts reserved for the Covenanted Service approved?—I think not. On the ground, in the first place, that the Statute only allows the appointment of Natives to specific posts and not to an organised Service, and I believe it is the ambition of the educated classes to enter the Covenanted Service; and, in the next place, the rules are so framed as to exclude competition and simply go upon nomination; thirdly, the appointments hitherto made have generally proved unfortunate; and fourthly, I believe the appointment itself is regarded as an inferior one by the Covenanted Service, and also by the general public.

1528. Do you consider these defects can be removed either by the amendment of the rules or by the amendment of the Statute, or should these provisions be repealed altogether?—I think if sufficient facilities are provided for Natives to enter the Covenanted Service the Statutory Service may be abolished altogether; but if that is not done, the Statute and rules must be amended. In the first place the Statute should be so amended as to make it incumbent on the Government of India to allot a certain share of the appointments now belonging to the Covenanted Service to the Statutory Service, and in the next place the rules should be so framed as to allow the very best and fittest men to enter the Service.

1529. If the Statutory Service be retained, should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for their training, or would you only encourage them to go?—For the present it would be better simply to encourage them to go.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

1530. Does any class entertain a repugnance to proceeding to England?—There is some aversion among the orthodox classes, but it is not very strong, and could easily be overcome. I believe it is decreasing as it is.

Mr. *White*.

1531. One of the grounds of dissatisfaction is that the Statutory Service has not produced the best men. If men of approved merit and ability had been appointed, would it have given more satisfaction?—Of course it would.

Mr. *Ryland*.

1532. You said if sufficient facilities should be given to enter the Covenanted Service, the Statutory Service would not be necessary You would prefer to have only one Service?—I would have a higher Service and a lower Service, the lower Service being an Uncovenanted Service.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar*.

1533. What proportion would you allot to the Statutory Civilians, supposing the Statutory Service is retained?—About two-fifths.

1534. Would there be any objection to Punjabees being compelled to go to England if they were selected?—I don't think so.

1535. How do you propose to get the best men for the Statutory Service, supposing it is retained?—By open competition and promotions from the Uncovenanted Service. The competition should be absolutely open and not necessarily Provincial, although a preference should be given to the Natives of the Province, whether they have got lower marks or not, with a qualifying minimum.

Mr. *Peacock*.

1536. In what respect do you consider the appointments made up to the present time to the Statutory Service have been found to be unfortunate?—I believe, as far as the Punjab is concerned, they have not been good men.

1537. Not such good men as have been obtained for the Uncovenanted Service?—In the Uncovenanted Service there are,

Mr. *Peacock*—continued.

unquestionably, very good men,—much better, in fact, than you would find in the Statutory Service. I have personal acquaintance with two Statutory Civilians One is a very good man, but he is not equal to the best Uncovenanted.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

1538. You say you would assign two-fifths of the appointments reserved to Covenanted Civilians to the Statutory Service if it is retained: on what basis have you arrived at that proportion? Have you considered the circumstances of the Province?—I have worked it out in this way. In my opinion the entire civil administration should be divided into two classes, the Judicial and the Executive. The Judicial should be entirely apart from the Executive. A large proportion of the Judicial Service should be thrown open to the Bar, and thereby you would get a number of good men. In the next place you should get a number of men from the Uncovenanted Service by promotion; and in the third place, by open competition. I have not based my estimate of two-fifths on the special requirements of the Punjab.

1539. Is it your opinion that there should be a larger appointment of Statutory men to the Judicial branch than to the Executive?—I incline to that opinion.

1540. You have been for some years acquainted with members of the Bar?—Yes.

1541. In your judgment are there any members of the Bar who are fit to fill Appellate Court appointments?—I should think so.

1542. Would they readily accept such appointments?—I think they would.

1543. What is the average earnings of a fairly good man at the Bar here?—I know that an ordinary man in the Chief Court makes not more than Rs. 1,000 or Rs. 1,200 per month; I mean a man of average abilities.

1544. How many men do you think make that?—About four or five, and about four or five make more. There are one or two men of good ability who do not make much I think a member of the Bar would be willing to take something less in Government Service than what he makes in his profession I think many good men could be obtained for a less salary than Rs. 1,200. They would be willing to take Rs. 700 perhaps. In the District Bar I think the average earnings are less than Rs. 500. The strength of the Chief Court Bar is about 20. I am speaking of Pleaders.

The *President*.

1545. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—There is a feeling that by the present rules Natives are practically excluded from competing. One cause of dissatisfaction is in consequence of having the centre of examination in England Many people cannot afford to go simply for the purpose of competition. The limit of age also is too low. Few students are able to attain educational proficiency by the time they reach the age fixed, and in many cases parents are not willing to allow their children to go at that age. I propose raising the limit of age to between 21 and 23. I think also that the examination should be modified so as to place the Indian and English candidates on an equal footing.

1546. Would you give any facilities for going to England?—I would have a centre of examination in India, and then perhaps it would not be necessary to give any educational facility. I would hold simultaneous examinations in England and India. They should be identical. They might be held in one centre in India or in more than one. Perhaps one centre would suffice; but I have no objection to several centres, provided the examination is one and the same.

1547. Would you allot a certain number of appointments for competition in England and another lot for competition in India, or would you have one comprehensive list for both?—I would have separate lists for Natives of India and Englishmen wherever they might compete. I would give two-fifths of the appointments to Natives of India, and I would give the preference to the Natives of the Province in which the appointments were to be held.

1548. If the examination is held in India, should the successful candidates be required to proceed to England to complete their training?—As the examination is a general one for all India, I should say they should not be compelled to do so.

Mr. *Stewart*.

1549. If this proportion of two-fifths were given to the Natives of India at both examinations, would that be quite sufficient?—Yes, I have prepared a scheme, and a part of that is to allow 10 per cent. of the Government appointments to be made by promotion of good men from the Uncovenanted Service. They would become part of the Civil Service after promotion, and in regard to the Judicial appointments at least half should be thrown open to the Bar.

1550. Would you have a competition among the members of the Bar?—No. I would leave it entirely to the decision of the Judicial authorities. My scheme provides for a very high standard as a qualifying minimum, and if any candidate failed to get 33 per cent. in any subject I would strike out all the marks obtained by him in that subject.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Babu *Protul Chander Chatterji*, M.A.

The *President*.

1551. In order to obtain two-fifths of the appointments for Natives, would you appoint less qualified Natives, rather more qualified than Europeans, to fill the appointments?—In every case I should demand a very high standard of fitness; and if Natives of the required standard of fitness were not forthcoming to fill those two-fifths, I should throw the appointments open to Europeans, and in addition to that two-fifths, I would assign 10 per cent. of the posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service as rewards for deserving men of the Uncovenanted Service. I propose the following modifications in the subjects of the examination. I would reduce the number of subjects to nine, and mark them as follows:—

1. I would fix the subjects thus—

	Marks.
English composition ...	300
English literature ...	300
History of any one of the following countries ...	300
England	
India	
Ancient Rome and Greece.	
The following classical languages:—	
Greek	500
Latin	500
Sanskrit	500
Arabic	500
The following modern languages:—	
(*a*) European—	
French	300
German	300
Italian	300
(*b*) Indian—	
Urdu	300
Hindi	300
Bengali	300
Marathi	300
Gujrati	300
Tamil	300
Telugu	300
(*c*) Asiatic—	
Persian	300
Mathematics—pure and mixed	1,000
Natural science—any one of the following branches:—	
Chemistry	300
Electricity and magnetism	300
Laws of heat and light	300
Mechanical Philosophy...	300
Astronomy ...	300
Logic	300
Political economy ...	300

2. Natives of India whose vernacular is not English should be compelled to pass in English literature.
3. Other subjects of Her Majesty should be made to pass in one of the Indian vernaculars.

The *President*—continued.

4. Candidates who failed to obtain 33 per cent. of the marks in any of the subjects named should not be entitled to have the marks in such subject counted.
5. Candidates who obtained 60 per cent. of the marks in the aggregate on the subjects they have taken up should be deemed to have passed, that is, to have qualified themselves for selection.
6. Among Natives of India, as well as among other than Natives of India, appointments should be allotted in order of merit.

[Sir *Charles Turner*.

1552. Would you allow a candidate to take up more than one of each branch of subjects?—I have no particular objection to his doing so except that it multiplies the number of his subjects. I have left marks almost untouched and reduced those for the other languages to 300 each.

1553. If I understand you rightly, your scheme is as follows:—*First*, you would exclude a certain number of Judicial appointments, whether held by Covenanted, Statutory, or Uncovenanted servants; you then take the rest of the posts reserved for the Covenanted Service and allot four-tenths to be competed for by the Natives of India either in England or India; one-tenth you allot as rewards to the Uncovenanted Service, and the balance you would leave open to all Her Majesty's subjects. Have you considered whether your scheme is applicable to the circumstances of the several Provinces, to the Punjab for instance?—I do not think there would be any difficulty in applying it, as far as I have been able to judge.

Mr. *Peacock*.

1554. Would you alter the definition of Natives of India?—I would keep the definition of Natives of India as it stands. I should have no objection to Natives in feudatory States being included.

The *President*.

1555. Do you see anything inconsistent between your proposals and the Acts of Parliament which throw open appointments in the public Service to all Her Majesty's natural-born subjects without reservation? The Statute says "so far as may be," and that, I think, leaves room for the exercise of a certain amount of discretion.

1556. Supposing the son of an officer serving in India is qualified by his education, ability, and integrity duly to discharge the duties of a particular appointment, do you think that to deliberately exclude him from an appointment is admitting him

The *President*—continued.

"as far as may be" to the public Service?—In the first place the Statutory Native of India must be protected.

1557. But if the law says they shall not be protected by the exclusion of other natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—My answer is that if all restrictions to the Covenanted Service are entirely taken away, so that the Natives of India are admitted to any kind of appointment in India, then the other restriction, which excludes Europeans from the Uncovenanted Service, may be taken away also; but inasmuch as, for political reasons, the restrictions have been retained in the one case, so, for political reasons also, the restrictions should be retained in the other.

1558. Is there any special order by which Natives are excluded from the Covenanted Service?—They are practically excluded.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

1559. Have you considered a difficulty that might arise under your system. As I understand you, the Englishman appointed would be appointed by pure competition, as you wish to get the ablest men amongst them; but in the case of Natives of India, under your system the Natives would not necessarily be the ablest men?—Nor in the case of Europeans either, because, supposing more than one-fifth qualified, the Natives would not get in. The rule would apply to both equally.

1560. You give a preference to Provincial candidates, so that you might practically exclude a number of the best Natives?—I do not mean to make any difference in favour of Provincial candidates so far as the result of the examination is concerned; but I wish, in allotting the appointments to the successful candidates, that regard should be had to the Province from which they are drawn.

1561. I understand you would alter the age limit in order to take away a disadvantage in the case of Natives of India, would you alter the subjects of the examination in their interests also?—I am not quite sure.

1562. Do you intend to give them money facilities for going to England?—I have said that is not necessary.

1563. But in these two points you would alter the examination to take away their disadvantages, and, having placed them on what you consider an equal basis, you would allot a fixed portion of the appointments to Natives of India?—Why, having removed the disadvantages, go further and allot a proportion of appointments to them?—The advantage is on both sides because, if free competition were allowed, Natives might swamp the whole Service. I consider that for administrative reasons a sufficient number of Natives ought to be brought into the Covenanted Service, and also a sufficient number of Englishmen.

Mr. *Stokes.*

1564. You would reserve half the appointments for the Bar and would not want an examination in their case?—Yes.

1565. Why should you not have an examination both for the Bar and for outsiders?—I consider that the members of the Bar ought to have all the Judicial appointments in every part of India.

1566. Should they not compete among themselves?—I think there is a better test of their fitness than mere competition. I mean practice and the opinions of their Judicial superiors.

Mr. *White.*

1567. You say you would reserve a certain proportion for Natives and a certain proportion for Europeans. In what class do you include Eurasians?—Among Natives.

The *President.*

1568. Presuming that in speaking of the Uncovenanted Service of this Province we are speaking of Extra Assistant Commissioners, Munsifs, and Tahsildárs only, should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India, as prescribed in the Statute, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—It should be recruited from all.

1569. And should the recruitment be by competition or by nomination, or by both systems combined?—By competition, but for special reasons nominations might be allowed to the extent of one-fourth, provided that the nominees shall have attained the standard of proficiency which I lay down.

1570. Would you have one competitive examination for all India, or would you hold the examination Provincially?—I am inclined to think it should be Provincial in the case of the Uncovenanted Service; but I say that the persons who should be admissible to the competition should be Natives of India domiciled in the Province, or Natives of India who have obtained permission, for special reasons, to go there and compete. A man who has, by habitual residence in a particular Province, acquired a wide acquaintance with the special circumstances of that Province should be admitted; such residence being deemed to be special reason for his admission.

1571. Supposing the existing Statutory system should be abolished. There is now a certain proportion of posts, one-fifth, assigned to that Service, would you assign that proportion to the Uncovenanted Service?—I have not considered that question, but I do not think it would be necessary to do so since the scheme I propose gives ten per cent. of the appointments to the Uncovenanted Service.

1572. So long as there are any restrictions upon the admission of Natives to the

The *President*—continued.

Covenanted Service you would exclude Europeans from the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes; if all Services are thrown open to all, I would make no restriction in the case of Europeans. I think a power to appoint Europeans might be abused if it existed. And, secondly, the class of Europeans you would get for low-paid posts would not be so good as the class of Natives you could get for the same salaries. I think, even if there were open competition, it would be liable to abuse.

1573. Are you satisfied with the present rules for the appointment of Extra Assistant Commissioners?—They have not been in existence long enough for me to say. I approve of the principle of them: they are unquestionably a great improvement on the previous system.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

1574. Do you think there are greater reasons for restricting the Uncovenanted Service to Natives resident in the Province than in the case of the Covenanted Service?—The objection I have mentioned on account of the pay would not exist, but there is a reason; that is to say, the Uncovenanted Service hold the lower appointments and are brought much more frequently into contact with the people than those who hold the higher posts and exercise general superintendence. A European, however long resident, would not be so well qualified to fill the lower posts as a Native.

1575. Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts held by the Uncovenanted Service and those attached to the Covenanted branch?—On general grounds I would make two-thirds of the pay allowed to Covenanted Civilians the substantive pay of the Uncovenanted posts, and would give Europeans an allowance.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1576. Would you give to Natives who pass the same examination as Europeans the same salaries as Europeans?—No, I think that one of the great advantages of allowing Natives to enter the Covenanted Service is that the Service would be cheapened. Natives, who serve in their own country, ought not to get the same amount of pay as Europeans who are serving in, to them, a foreign country. I would make extra allowances to Europeans in order to place them on an equality with Natives.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

1577. Looking to the rank and file of the Uncovenanted Service, do you think two-thirds of the pay of the posts, if held by a Covenanted Civilian, would be sufficient for Native gentlemen to live on?—Yes.

1578. And do you think it would be sufficient to secure the best men procurable?—Yes, except in the lowest ranks of the service, to whom I would allow Rs. 300 on passing, instead of Rs. 250 as now. For the highest posts the pay might be reduced. By the highest posts I mean such posts as High Court Judgeships and so forth. I would not interfere with Commissioners of Divisions, but I would reduce the pay of Chief Commissioners and Lieutenant-Governors.

1579. Should any distinction be made in the furlough rules according to the nationality of the officer?—Europeans should be in a slightly better position, seeing that they are foreigners in this country. They should be given certain facilities for visiting their native country.

Mr. *Stokes.*

1580. In the case of Judicial appointments you would give them to practitioners in the Chief Court by the patronage of the Court?—Not only to Pleaders in the Chief Court, but also those who practise in the District Courts; but the higher appointments should be filled by Pleaders practising in the Chief Court. I would make the rules of recommendation very strict. I do not think a system of competition would be satisfactory in their case.

WITNESS XIX.—20th December 1886.

Examination of Lala KUNHYA LAL, Pleader, Chief Court, Punjab; Secretary to the Indian Association, Lahore, and authorised to represent the Association.

The *President.*

1581. You are, I understand, a Pleader in practice here, and represent the Indian Association of Lahore before the Commission?—Yes. I have been nineteen years in practice as Pleader in the Subordinate Courts and now in the Chief Court. I am a Native of the Punjab. I have been deputed by the Indian Association of Lahore to represent their views.

1582. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—It is approved by the persons who are appointed under it. The system is approved subject to certain modifications. There are certainly defects in it.

1583. What are the grounds of disapprobation with reference to the Statute itself?—One ground is that it is optional with the Government to appoint; it is not incumbent upon them to do so; and, secondly, it gives room for the inclusion in the Service of a class of persons whom Natives would wish to exclude. As to the rules, the dissatisfaction lies only in the fact that they provide no test of merit, but leave it to the Government to appoint any body; so that persons have been appointed who are unfit.

1584. Do you think that these defects could be removed by amending the Statute or the rules?—I would amend both the Statute and the rules.

1585. If the provisions of the Statute 33 Victoria are not repealed, nor substantially amended so as to take away the power conferred on the local Administrations, should they be amended in respect of the description of persons on whose behalf such powers may be exercised, or in respect of the sanction required for appointments made thereunder?—It is not so much with reference to the sanction that we object, but with reference to the persons selected. We do not propose to amend the Statute to any great extent, only instead of the expression used in the definition of the term "Natives of India"—"persons habitually residing"—we would wish to substitute the words—"persons permanently residing, and who are amenable to the ordinary provisions of the Criminal Procedure Code applicable to Her Majesty's subjects in India." Those persons who wish to take the benefit of the special provisions of the criminal law for European British

The *President*—continued.

subjects should be excluded from the definition of "Natives of India." It is optional with themselves to retain the advantages given by those provisions, or to give up those advantages by calling themselves "Natives of India."

1586. Would you include the subjects of feudatory States in the definition?—The Association would not wish them to be included, because there is no binding provision in Native States for the admission of Her Majesty's subjects to office in those States.

1587. If the Statutory Service is retained, should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training, or should they be encouraged to do so?—It should not be made compulsory, but they might be encouraged to go there by giving them, during the probationary period, the pay which they would get here if they were in the Service.

Mr. *White.*

1588. Would you admit to the Statutory Civil Service members of the Uncovenanted branch, of approved merit and ablity, without requiring them to enter at the bottom of the list?—No, because persons who are raised to the higher posts in the Uncovenanted Service from the lowest posts in that Service do not entirely possess the confidence of the people, as those persons should whom we may hope to see filling posts in the Statutory and Covenanted Services.

1589. You apply that condemnation to the whole Service?—It would be fair to do so.

Mr. *Ryland.*

1590. Are there not in the Uncovenanted Service at present persons in whom you have every confidence?—Yes, there are men in whom we have every confidence.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

1591. Would you retain the power which merely allows Government to appoint to certain posts in the Covenanted Service, or would you make the men selected members of a regular Service?—I would like them to be members of the Service and capable of holding all posts.

1592. What other alterations would you suggest?—I would have a system of pure

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Lala *Kunhya Lal.*

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar*—continued.

competition for admission into the Statutory Service. I would prefer even limited competition to nomination.

1593. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—Yes.

1594. Should any, and if any what, change be made in that system?—Yes, there should be a change in the limit of age of candidates. There should also be two centres of examination—one in England and the other in India. There should be identical examinations.

1595. Do the Natives of India labour under any, and if any what, disadvantages in competing for employment in this branch of the Service?—They labour under many difficulties. The first is the limit of age; they would like to see the age-limit increased to 23. Then, with reference to the subjects of examination, they think the Indian vernaculars should be provided for and also Indian History and the Indian Classics, viz. Sanskrit, Persian, and Arabic. These should be placed on the same footing as the English Classics, Latin and Greek. I include Persian, because its position is the same in Indian education as that of Latin and Greek in the English schools. If the examination centre in India is not allowed, some money facilities should be allowed to Indian students to encourage them to go to England and pursue their studies there.

1596. Should the candidates in England and in India compete with one another, and be selected in order of merit, or should a certain number of appointments be apportioned for competition to the candidates at the respective examinations?—In the first place there should be a qualifying minimum fixed, and then there should be two lists of candidates, both in order of merit. There should be one general list for both the examinations in India and in England, and another list for the Provinces. Those candidates who have obtained pass marks should be placed in order of merit, and in the distribution of appointments preference should be given to the Provincial list, and if there are any posts which cannot be filled up from the lists of Provincial candidates resort should be had to the general list.

1597. If an examination is held in India, should the successful candidates be required, as a condition obligatory, to proceed to England to complete their training?—I would make it compulsory.

1598. Are the young Natives obtained under the existing system of the open competition in England the best, as regards character and capacity, who could be obtained under any system?—I offer no opinion.

1599. Does it cost a B.A. in India as much to take his degree as it costs to take it in England?—No.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar*—continued.

1600. How much, excluding his expenses of living, does it cost a B.A. in fees to take his degree?—Rs. 15 per month for four years certain.

1601. Have you ever considered whether the Native has an advantage in this respect which a European has not got?—It is an advantage certainly. I have not considered the disadvantages of Europeans.

1602. Who are the members of the Indian Association generally?—The majority of them are Pandits and Hindus of Lahore and Amritsar and other districts, and there are about fifteen or twenty Bengalis.

1603. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in Statute 33 Victoria, Chapter 3, Section 6, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—I would restrict it to "Natives of India," because otherwise Europeans, Australians, and Canadians would be included.

1604. Assuming that by the Uncovenanted Service is meant the lower grades of that Service only, such as Munsifs, Tahsíldárs, and Extra Assistant Commissioners, should the recruitment be by competition or by nomination, or by both systems combined?—We approve of the existing system, which combines competition and nomination. I approve of nomination in the case of Tahsíldárs, because the office of Tahsíldár calls for the exercise of capacities for which competition supplies no proper test.

1605. Whatever system be adopted, should the recruitment be made by the several Administrations only from persons resident in the territories under such Administrations respectively, or with a preference for such residents?—I would give the preference to residents of the Province, but I would not altogether exclude Natives of other Provinces.

1606. If the existing Statutory Service is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that Service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service?—On the assumption that the Statutory Service is to be abolished, I think they should.

Mr. *Ryland.*

1607. Do you think that the rules at present obtaining for the admission of officers into the Uncovenanted Service sufficiently guard against the admission of unfit persons?—Yes, they do. There are only two systems of admission, viz. one, the promotion of persons who have already served with credit and ability, and, the other, the nomination of graduates of the Universities and others to compete for appointments.

1608. Would not these same rules equally guard against the admission of unfit Europeans?—I would not admit Europeans under any circumstances, and my

Mr. *Ryland*—continued.

reason is that the Uncovenanted Service being a field specially intended for the Natives of the soil, we desire that the Natives of the soil should not be in danger of being excluded; and I have another reason, which is, that the admission of Europeans would be a drain on the wealth of the country.

1609. But with regard to Europeans who are already employed in the Uncovenanted Service, you have no objection, I suppose, on the score of merit and ability? —No.

Mr. *Stewart*.

1610. Has the Association you represent ever made a comparison between the amount of capital imported by Europeans into the country and the amount which is earned by European Civil Servants and exported from the country?—No; such statistics have never been compiled.

1611. Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service, according as these posts are held by members of that branch of the Service or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches?—We would make a distinction by giving the Covenanted Civilians an extra allowance during the time they are actually serving in India.

1612. Would you do that in the case of Europeans only?—In the case of all who have entered the Service by the channel of the open competition.

1613. So that Statutory Civil Servants and Uncovenanted men who have been promoted to the Service would get less than the others?—Yes.

1614. On what principle do you make this distinction?—Because in the one case the abilities of the officers have been tested by competition, and, in the case of Native Covenanted Servants, there is this additional

Mr. *Stewart*—continued.

reason that they have been put to the trouble of going to a foreign country to qualify themselves and have had to undergo other difficulties.

1615. Would you make any distinction in the furlough rules applicable to the Statutory and Uncovenanted branches of the Service according to the nationality of the officer or on any other ground?—Yes, on the same grounds that I would make a distinction in pay, we should have more advantageous rules for the Covenanted Service than for the Statutory Civilians and Uncovenanted men; because the Covenanted Service comprises persons who have come from England and have to serve in a climate which is unsuited to them, and also because they hold posts for which extraordinary energy and strength of character are required, and they would therefore require greater relaxation.

1616. Would you make any distinction in the case of Uncovenanted officers on account of the nationality of such persons? —No, because we start with the proposition that the Uncovenanted Service should be kept for Statutory Natives only, and in their case no such considerations exist.

Mr. *Ryland*.

1617. Suppose Europeans should be admitted to the Uncovenanted Service, would you grant them the same privileges as regards furlough as you would accord to the Covenanted Service?—Yes, because to some extent the same considerations would apply to them.

Mr. *Stewart*.

1618. Would you make the distinction in the pay applicable to all ranks?—Yes.

1619. Do you think that the pay at present given to Statutory Civilians on first joining the Service is sufficient?—Yes.

WITNESS XX.—20th December 1886.

Examination of S. LE P. T. CLIFFORD, Esq., of the Uncovenanted Service, Extra Judicial Assistant Commissioner, District Judge, Delhi.

Vol. I. Sec. II, Punjab.

S. Le P. T. Clifford, Esq.

The *President.*

1620. Kindly inform the Commission as to your service and position.—I am an Extra Judicial Assistant Commissioner in the Uncovenanted Service of this Province. I was promoted to the Deputy Registrarship of the Chief Court, and thence to the line of Extra Assistant Commissioners in 1880, and under the reorganisation was graded as Extra Judicial Assistant. I am a Statutory Native of India and a European British subject within the meaning of the Criminal Procedure Code.

1621. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved in this Province?—I only know that it is disapproved of by a particular section of the community, chiefly by the graduates of the Universities.

1622. Have you yourself any opinion on the subject?—I think it is the best system that could be devised, if we are to have a Statutory system at all.

1623. Do you see any grounds for dissatisfaction with it?—My only objection to it is that Uncovenanted men are not placed on the same footing as the Covenanted Service.

1624. Do you suggest any amendment in the Statute or in the rules?—No.

1625. Would you extend the definition of the term "Natives of India" so as to embrace persons in feudatory States?—I see no objection to that, and, as regards Europeans, I should like to see it extended so as to include the sons of officials who have served in this country, whether in a Military or Civil capacity.

1626. If the Statutory Service is retained, should the selected candidate be required to proceed to England for his training, or should he be merely encouraged to do so?—I would certainly not compel him to do so.

1627. At the present time the sanction required to the making of a Statutory appointment is the sanction of the Government of India: would you prefer that such sanction should be given by the Secretary of State instead?—No.

Mr. *White.*

1628. In proposing to extend the definition of the term "Natives of India" you would include the sons of Military officers who have served in India. Would you have any safeguard against abuses?—The safeguard I should propose is that they should enter the Uncovenanted Service, and that in no case should their promotion to the Statutory Service take place under seven years, if they went in at the bottom of the Covenanted list, and in case of promotion to the higher appointments, under twenty years' service.

Mr. *White*—continued.

1629. Would you have any examination?—They should come under the ordinary rule which are in force in the Punjab. They should join the Uncovenanted Service on the understanding that they might or might not be taken from that to serve in the Statutory grades. If an officer in the Uncovenanted Service was considered qualified to be promoted to a District Judgeship, he should have not less than 20 years' service, as that would be the time which it would take him in the ordinary course to get to the top of the list. I think a certain educational test should be insisted upon in the case of persons who had not served before, and should be somewhat similar to the present system for Extra Assistant Commissioners in this Province.

Mr. *Peacock.*

1630. You said you would not make it compulsory for Natives to go to England, but would you offer any inducement to them to do so? Do you attach importance to their going?—Not particularly.

1631. Have you formed any opinion about the method of recruitment to the Covenanted Civil Service?—I should say it ought to be recruited, as it is at present, by a competition in England open to all classes.

1632. Would you give any facilities to Natives for presenting themselves at the examination by way of scholarships or of passage-money?—I do not see why such concessions should be given to them in preference to any other natural-born subjects of Her Majesty.

1633. Do you know of any young Natives who have been deterred from proceeding to England for examination by any consideration of expense or caste prejudice?—I do not think it has occurred to many of them to go at all; and if they can get appointments and be brought into the

Mr. *Peacock*—continued.

Uncovenanted Service without it, I do not think they desire to go, except, perhaps, a few of the rising generation of M.A.'s and B.A.'s.

1634. Would you raise the limit of age for that examination?—Not in my opinion. I have not fully considered this question.

1635. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited from Natives of India as defined in the Statute, or from natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—From all Natives of India, with the inclusion of sons of Military and Civil officers who have served in this country, and also of persons born of parents domiciled in the country, and of subjects of Native feudatory States.

1636. Are you satisfied with the system of recruitment obtaining at present in this Province?—I should not like to see it altered in favour of competition only.

1637. Would you make any appointments from the Bar to the Judicial Service?—Very sparingly. My experience leads me to believe that the best qualified members of the Bar, who might be selected, would not find it worth their while to take the appointments.

1638. If the existing Statutory Service is abolished, should the proportion of appointments now assigned to that Service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service?—Certainly.

Mr. *Stokes*.

1639. Do you think you could get better men from the Bar than you get now for Judicial posts if you were to take second-rate men?—Certainly not. I am only stating my own experience in the Punjab. I say we have as good men in the Uncovenanted Service as we have at the Bar, with, perhaps, one or two exceptions at the head of the profession, and I maintain we have men good enough to equal even them.

1640. Is there any foundation for the suggestion that the lower Appellate Courts here are not so satisfactorily presided over as they might be?—I am inclined to think that is rather the continuation of an old complaint. I do not see their work, and so cannot form any judgment of their efficiency; but it is an old complaint, and, of course, certain members of the legal profession keep harping upon it. I think on that point the Chief Court is the best judge.

1641. Should any distinction be made in the salaries assigned to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service accordingly as those posts are held by members of that branch of the Service or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches?—I see no objection to it. I think it is fair to the Civil Service that such a distinction should be made. I should make a reduction of 15 per cent. in the case of members either of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches.

1642. Should any distinction be made in the furlough rules applicable to the Statutory and Uncovenanted branches of the Service according to the nationality of the officer?—I am of opinion that no such distinction should be made. I believe there are many others who think differently, but I consider that if you enter a Service which has certain rules, and you are aware of those rules at the time, you ought to be satisfied.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar*.

1643. Do you think the present scale of pay, prospects, and pension are such as would induce qualified Europeans to enter the Uncovenanted Service and remain in it?—Certainly, if they had the prospect of occasionally getting promoted into the Covenanted grade of appointments.

1644. You say you would extend the term "Natives of India" so as to include not only domiciled Europeans, but also the sons of Military and Civil officers who have served in this country, but do you think you would be able to secure qualified men of that class to do the work with the present prospects in regard to pay, promotion, and pension, &c.?—Yes, because the men you refer to are generally men who have failed for the Civil Service or for the Army by a few marks, and, considering that they have nothing else to look forward to, they have to remain content.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

1645. Would you allow gentlemen selected in this country for the public Service, who desire to complete their education by entering the legal profession or by taking up some other branch of study, furlough to enable them to go to England to make themselves more efficient?—Yes, provided you restricted the privilege to those Natives of India who have not already been educated in England.

WITNESS XXI.—20th December 1886.

Examination of Lala SAGAR CHAND, B.A., of the Uncovenanted Service, a member of the Educational Department, and Assistant Professor in the Government College, Lahore, Punjab.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Lala *Sagar Chand*, B.A.

The *President*.

1646. How long have you been in the service of Government, and what offices have you held?—I have been in the service of the Government for about twenty-three years. I began as a teacher at Agra, and about the year 1864 I joined the Delhi District School as an Assistant Master. I have acted as an Assistant Inspector of Schools since 1877, and am now attached to the Government College, Lahore, as an Assistant Professor.

1647. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved in the Punjab?—There is a feeling of dissatisfaction among the educated classes; the rest of the community seems to have no opinion on the subject. The feeling is directed both against the Statute and against the rules framed under the Statute. The Statute is found fault with because it leaves everything to the direction of the Indian Government. The rules are found fault with because the mode of selection is found to be unsatisfactory, and, according to some, because the pay is lower than that of Covenanted Civilians. I would make no change in the Statute. It is, to my mind, an advantage that a discretion is left to the Indian Government as to the rules framed under the Statute. The Statute cannot be altered without having recourse to Parliament, and I do not think it would be easy to get Parliament to change the law which it has once laid down. If the Statute were more fully to define conditions and to limit the discretion of the Indian Government, we should have to secure a majority in the House of Commons every time any change became desirable, and that would not be an easy matter. So I think it is an advantage that the Indian Government should retain the power. The dissatisfaction which is felt on account of this discretion being left to the Indian Government arises from the assumption that the Government is opposed to the advancement of Natives. This, I think, is a mistake. It should be remembered that although the Government has unlimited power under the rules to appoint whomsoever it pleases to the Statutory Service, subject only to the condition that the person appointed must be a Statutory Native, yet no European, domiciled or otherwise, has yet been appointed. This fact ought to assure the Native community that there is no likelihood that the Government will exercise its power to our disadvantage. It is always an advantage to have a tribunal to appeal to, and, in case the Indian authorities abused their powers under the Statute, we can now appeal to the Secretary of State. If the conditions were prescribed in the Statute itself, we could not appeal to any higher tribunal than the Parliament which passed it into law, and it would be very difficult to get Parliament to change it. Now we can appeal against the orders of the Government of India, and that is something. A sentence would seldom be changed by the Magistrate who himself passed it if he were at the same time the Court of Appeal. The rules framed under the Statute as to the mode of selection require to be altered, and my idea in this: I consider that the proportion of persons that may be selected for employment under the Statutory rules, to the total number of Civilians appointed by the Secretary of State for the whole of India, should be raised. At present the rule is that the Government may appoint a number not more than one-fifth of the number of Civilians appointed by the Secretary of State. I cannot say to what proportion it should be increased. It is difficult for a private person to suggest what the proportion should be, but it should be larger. The number of persons actually selected should, as far as possible, not fall below this proportion. I say 'actually selected' because in some cases it may be necessary to appoint a smaller number of persons. The proportion of men of family to men of no family (*Raises* to *non-Raises*) in the total of persons to be selected in the whole of India should be fixed.

The *President*—continued.

Mr. *Stewart*.

1648. Where would the distinction begin, and where would it end?—That the Government would have to decide. The Government of India should determine each year what number of persons should be selected by each Local Government, and how many of them should be men of family (*Raises*), if any. The selection of candidates should be made by examination, the list of merit for men of family being separate from that

Mr. *Stewart*—continued.

for candidates of the middle classes (for *non-Raises*), and I would have the examinations Provincial. If we have one examination for the whole of India, and a Provincial list, I do not see how it could work. Candidates who belong to the middle classes (*non-Raises*) should hold at least the B.A. degree. The standard of examination should at first be only moderately high, as the men of family are not sufficiently advanced from an eductional point of view, but their period of probation may be made longer than that of the other candidates. The examination should be conducted through the medium of the English language. The number of persons actually selected during the year should not fall below the proportion that may be fixed by Government. If there are not enough candidates, the deficiency must be made up from the competitive list of men who have failed in England, or a man may be promoted from the Uncovenanted Service. I make special provision for the *Raises* because I think Government should consider the interests of all classes.

1649. If the Statutory Service be retained, should the selected candidates be compelled to go to England?—No, I do not think so.

1650. Would you encourage them to go by pecuniary aid?—They might get probationary allowances while there.

1651. Would you retain the power of appointing men of approved merit and ability from the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes, and also men of the legal profession; but this should be done only in exceptional cases.

1652. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service? Should any, and if any what, change be made in that system?—Dissatisfaction is felt as regards the limit of age. The present limit is from the age of seventeen to nineteen. This is considered too low. I think it should be raised for all classes of candidates, but certainly for Native candidates, because they have to learn English. I would have twenty-one as the lowest limit, and twenty-three as the highest.

1653. Is there any other cause for dissatisfaction?—Yes, as regards the subjects of examination. Sanskrit and Arabic should, I think receive the same marks as are allotted to the European classical languages, namely, Latin and Greek; and Persian should be added to the list of subjects as a modern language, as English candidates derive a great advantage from the fact that Latin, French, and Italian are allied languages. I think, therefore, that the marks for Arabic and Sanskrit should be raised, and that Persian should be added to the list of subjects. I would hold only one examination, and that should be held in England. As aids to Native students to go to England and compete, a few scholarships might be established, but nothing more.

Mr. *Stewart*—continued.

1654. Do you know any young Natives who have been successful in the competition in England?—No.

1655. Are young Natives, otherwise competent, deterred from proceeding to England by considerations of caste?—Some are, but the prejudice is dying out, at least in the Punjab. It is very slight as it is, people who have returned have been re-admitted to their social status with, perhaps, one exception at Delhi. I believe in that case his exclusion was owing to party animosities rather than to religious considerations. He has some powerful enemies.

1656. Have you any objection to an examination being held in India concurrently with the one held in England?—Yes, I think people from other parts of India might preponderate in the Service, and dissatisfaction might arise in this Province if Natives of other Provinces should come to rule over us.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

1657. With regard to the Uncovenanted Service, would you recruit it from the Natives of India only, as defined by the Statute, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—I would admit children of European officers serving in this country, but not other Europeans. My reading of the Queen's Proclamation is that it never contemplated all people being admitted. It assumes that the preference would be given to Natives of the soil. Suppose there are two candidates for a post, one of them a European and another a Native, if the Native is competent to perform the duties of the post, I think it would be only right to give him the preference.

1658. How would you recruit for the Uncovenanted Service, by competition or by nomination, or by the two systems combined?—By the two combined. I am perfectly satisfied with the existing system of recruitment for the Uncovenanted Service in this Province. I mean the system for Tahsíldárs, Munsifs, and Extra Assistant Commissioners. The appointment of Tahsíldárs is by nomination, and I think the system answers well enough.

1659. Would you recruit for that Service Provincially or throughout India?—Provincially as far as possible.

1660. Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service, accordingly as the posts are held by members of that branch of the Service or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches?—Yes, I would give the members of the Statutory Services less pay. As to the proportion of the salaries, I am satisfied with the present arrangement of 64 per cent. My reason is that I do not want to make

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Lala *Sagar Chand*, B.A.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

the administration more expensive than it is.

1661. Should any distinction be made in the furlough rules applicable to the Statutory and Uncovenanted branches of the Service according to the nationality of the officer?—Yes, I think it is reasonable in the case of an officer whose home is in England.

1662. Would you afford facilities for persons selected for the Covenanted or Statutory Service or appointed to that Service to go to England to complete their training? Would you give special leave for that purpose?—Yes.

The *President*.

1663. Why do you attach this importance to an English training?—Because it enables a man to see the world and widen his views.

1664. Would you take the same view of a man who wanted to go to America, China, or Japan?—To America I would, but not to China or Japan.

1665. Do you know what the present pay of the Statutory Service is?—Sixty-four per cent. of what is given to Covenanted Civilians.

1666. Is that sufficient?—I think so.

1667. In the Educational Department, what is the pay on which a man commences?—There are teachers of different grades, some as low as Rs. 30.

1668. In a College?—No, but some professorships have lately been sanctioned on lower pay. The lowest paid man now gets Rs. 150, but formerly he got Rs. 350.

1669. What does an Assistant Inspector of Schools get?—An Assistant Inspector gets Rs. 225 to begin with, and Rs. 300 at the top of his grade. An Assistant Inspectorship is not attained until after some years of service. I got the post in 1877, after I had served 12 or 13 years.

1670. What is your pay as an Assistant Professor at the Lahore College?—Rs 350. I was appointed to this post in 1881.

Mr. *Stokes*.

1671. You have known a number of graduates take employment under Government and private persons: what is the lowest pay you have ever heard of a graduate accepting?—There have been men in the Educational Department serving on Rs. 70 or Rs. 60, that is the lowest figure.

1672. What do you think is a fair salary for a graduate of good ability?—Rs. 100 to 150 to commence with, which I think to be very good pay.

1673. Have you got any graduates of distinguished birth in your College?—One or two.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*.

1674. Is the education imparted in the Lahore College of a nature to qualify a man to succeed in the English competitive examination for the Civil Service?—Not at present. Perhaps not for a few years; but if these changes which I have suggested are made in the rules, I think we shall be able to hold our own.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

1675. Is sufficient foundation laid in the College of a training which might be completed in England?—Yes.

Mr. *Stokes*.

1676. When you say scholarships should be given to enable Indian students to go to England, have you considered the advantages that have been already given to students in this country?—Yes; but even with all these advantages, if there was not some inducement, no Natives would go to England.

1677. Should the Government not give them scholarships, would any Native gentlemen of liberality be likely to give them?—I don't know.

WITNESS XXII.—20th December 1886.

Examination of CARR STEPHEN, Esq., Barrister-at-Law, of the Uncovenanted Service Extra Judicial Assistant Commissioner, District Judge, Ludhiana.

The *President.*

1678. You are the senior officer of the Uncovenanted Service in this Province, are you not?—Yes, I have had 28 years' actual service in the Uncovenanted branch of the civil administration.

1679. Where were you born?—I was born at Dacca in Bengal, and am an Armenian.

1680. You are now District Judge at Ludhiana?—Yes.

1681. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—I do not think it is by the educated classes, but I think the mass of Natives of the Province have hardly any opinion on the subject. I think the only ground of disapprobation is the idea that too much is sacrificed to the supposed respectability of the families from which the members are chosen. I would retain the Statute for a limited purpose, namely: *firstly*, to allow of selection from the Uncovenanted Service; *secondly*, to allow of selection from the legal profession; *thirdly*, to allow Government the option of selecting from members of good family. The rules require amending, but I think the Statute is sufficient for its purpose.

1682. If the provisions of the Statute are not repealed, nor substantially amended, so as to take away the power conferred on the local Administrations, would you amend them in respect of the description of persons to whom they apply?—No; I do not think there is any other definition of Natives of India equally comprehensive. I am rather against introducing persons born in Native States. I would rather leave them alone. I don't think it necessary to alter the Statute in respect of the sanction required.

1683. Would you require candidates selected for the Statutory Service to go to England, or would you merely encourage them to go?—I would rather they worked here for a few years, and then, if they liked, they might go to England for a few years when they were older and steadier.

Mr. *Peacock.*

1684. With regard to Statutory Natives, would you extend the definition of "Natives of India" to the sons of European officers serving in India, *e.g.* would you allow those persons to enter the Statutory Service in common with other Natives?—No, I think I would leave the Statute as it is. If they entered the Statutory Service they should enter through the Uncovenanted branch.

Mr. *Peacock*—continued,

1685. Would you apportion a certain number of appointments to candidates selected from good families and a certain number for persons selected from the Uncovenanted class?—I am not prepared to say.

1686. And for those selected on the ground of good family, would you have any competition?—No; I would have a probationary period, say, for three years, and if by that time they were worth anything it would be found out.

The *President.*

1687. Have you any idea of the number of Statutory Civilians recruited from this Province?—I think there have been five since 1882. I think they were satisfactory appointments. I know one of them: he was under me for some time, and a very good man he was.

Mr. *Stewart.*

1688. Is there any jealousy of Statutory Civilians on the part of educated Natives?—No; they only think that they are not such good men as they are taken to be, and and that too much is made of their belonging to the families of Sardars. I have only known one man personally, but I have heard of others.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1689. Are they considered to be better than Uncovenanted men?—No, certainly not. I have had experience of both the classes of Uncovenanted men, namely, those who have entered by competition and those who were nominated. The former are very good men indeed, and superior to Statutory Civilians.

1690. Is there any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—Yes, on the ground that it practically excludes Natives of this country. I would have the system changed. I would reserve half the appointments for candidates in India, and in this half I would include Statutory Civilians, and I would raise the age. For the English

Vol. I Sec. II. Punjab.

Carr Stephen, Esq.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

examination I would allow the system to stand as it is now. I would allow Natives of India to go and compete in England if they liked. I would allow this for two reasons, namely, because if they succeeded in passing it would show they were competent men, and because the chances are they will go, if they go at all, when very young, and if they go very young and then pass and come out again they will, as a rule, have become cosmopolitan in their ideas and no longer Natives in sentiment, at least of any particular Province of India. Moreover, I would allow English young men to come out and compete with Natives in India. In the Indian examination I would divide the appointments into tenths; three-tenths for open competition, two-tenths for Provincial competition. For the Indian examination I would raise the age-limit to twenty three. I would not raise the age for the English examinations. I would put all the men selected by competition, whether in England or India, in the same list.

1691. Do not you think there would be a feeling that the men selected in England were superior to the men selected in India?—Yes, they would be superior; but I think we have too much splitting up into classes already.

Mr. *Stewart*.

1692. Do you think you would get enough candidates from the Punjab to make a real competition for the three-tenths?—Not at first, nor for some time to come.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

1693. You say you would have Provincial examinations, would you have any qualifying minimum?—I think it would be an advantage to have one. From my experience of the men I have met, I should say it would not be very difficult to get men above the qualifying minimum.

1694. If the examination is held in India should the successful candidates be required, as a condition obligatory, to proceed to England to complete their training?—I would compel the competition men to go because I think they would acquire a certain amount of force of character by doing so, but I would certainly not compel the Statutory men to go.

1695. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in the Statute, or from all natural born subjects of Her Majesty?—I think I would open it to everybody.

1696. Should the recruitment be by nomination or by competition, or by both combined?—I think the present system of recruitment in the Punjab works very well, and I should be inclined to retain it. I would hold on to nomination for Tahsíldárs; but whatever system was adopted for recruiting the Uncovenanted Service, I would recruit as much as possible from this Province, though I would not absolutely exclude Natives of other Provinces. I would also include, among Natives of the Province, Europeans who have taken up their residence in the Province; and I would limit the selection of other Englishmen to such men as have a sort of claim upon the country, owing to their fathers having served here. For the Subordinate Judicial Service I would have competition, and, to a certain extent selections, as the system is at present. The selections I would make would be from the Bar and the Pleaders.

Mr. *Stokes*.

1697. Have any Pleaders yet appeared for competition?—I know that some have applied to be allowed to compete. They were second-grade Pleaders. They were not allowed to compete. I think there is a prejudice against Pleaders being allowed to compete. I mean that the names of Pleaders have been sent up, but they have not been admitted to the list of persons who are permitted to compete. The list is, it is true, a limited one, and it is not possible for every one who may present himself as a candidate for competition to be admitted to it. If the list had not been limited as to numbers, they might, no doubt, have all been allowed to go up.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

1698. Do you think that any of these gentlemen who desired to present themselves for competition were excluded because they were Pleaders?—The opinion I formed was that this was so. I sent up two names, and was given to understand that the men recommended being Pleaders had better stick to their profession.

1699. Were the names officially sent up and rejected?—I don't think it got as far as that quite; I believe the names went astray at the Divisional Judge's office. The Deputy Commissioner and District Judge have the power to recommend persons for admission to the list of the candidates who are permitted to compete; but the final selection rests with the higher authorities. I sent up the names of the Pleaders demi-officially, and was given to understand that it would be no use to submit them officially, and that they would not be accepted.

1700. Were the men qualified?—It is to be presumed I thought so, as I sent up their names.

1701. Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to the posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service according as the posts are held by members of that branch of the Service or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches, or in the furlough rules applicable to the Statutory and Uncovenanted branches of the

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

Service, according to the nationality of the officer, or on any other, and what ground?—I would make a distinction certainly as regards furlough rules, and as regards pay I would also make a distinction, but not such a marked one as at present. I think a difference of four-fifths would be fairer.

1702. Would you make any distinction in regard to pay, promotion, and retiring annuity in the case of Natives obtaining office under the Statutory rules?—Yes.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*.

1703. Have you any acquaintance with the Bars of the lower Courts?—Yes.

1704. Did you mean the first class of Pleaders that practise in the Munsif's Courts when you spoke of Pleaders not being allowed to compete though otherwise qualified?—Yes.

1705. What were they earning do you suppose?—I know some Pleaders making Rs. 400 a month who would be glad to accept appointments as Munsifs.

WITNESS XXIII.—20th December 1886.

Examination of E. W. PARKER, Esq., of the Uncovenanted Service, Extra Judicial Assistant Commissioner, first grade, in charge of the subdivision of Dalhousie; Fellow of the Punjab University.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

E. W. Parker, Esq.

The *President*.

1706. What length of service have you put in?—I belong to the Uncovenanted Service. I have served for twenty-three years and began as an Extra Assistant Commissioner. I have passed through the various grades and now stand second on the Uncovenanted list in this Province as an Extra Judicial Assistant. I have acted as a Divisional Judge for a short time and as District Judge. I have for many years been connected with the Law School and University.

1707. With regard to Statute 33 Vic., Chap. 3, Sec. 6, what are your objections to it?—I object to the Statute on two grounds,—*first*, because I now understand it is held to mean that appointments made under it are to specific Covenanted posts, and not to the Service, or, in other words, to the Covenanted list for the Province. That has not been understood hitherto. Statutory Civilians have believed that they would run up the list in the usual way.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

1708. What is the advantage of being appointed to the Service and not to posts?—It is a great advantage to belong to a Service, in which one gets the benefit of the regular flow of promotion. The *second* objection I have to the Statute relates to the definition of the term "Natives of India." I would strike out the words "born and" from the definition, so as to include persons domiciled in India and whose parents were habitually resident in India. I speak as a person interested. I am an example of the hardship of this rule. My parents were domiciled in India, and my younger brother was born in India. He is within the definition; I am not. This state of things appears to me to be unfair and opposed to Her Majesty's Proclamation.

The *President*.

1709. Is that the only change you would make?—I have no others to suggest.

1710. If the objections are directed against the rules framed under the Statute, do they relate to the mode or modes of selection actually adopted, or to the general condition of the Statutory Civilians as to pay, promotion, and retiring annuity?—I have never heard a single objection made

The *President*—continued.

to the Statutory rules, or to the conditions of the Service, by any Native of India until within the last month. I myself do not think the rules unsuitable or wanting in clearness. They suit the requirements of this Province, but I desire to say that I think a great deal too much consideration is given to "family" in selecting men for the Service. I do not see any objection to the rules, and I think the principle of nomination is a good one for the Statutory Service. It is a very small Service, and is to be recruited only occasionally, and, provided a proper educational qualification is added to test the general knowledge of the candidates, I do not think it is at all open to objection.

1711. Has the Statutory system had the effect of securing men who in point of education or natural ability are superior to the average of those in the higher ranks of the Uncovenanted Service?—I do not think so. I happen to know several members of the Service. One is an exceedingly bad specimen. He comes from a high family in Delhi; another is an exceedingly good officer,—I should say, quite as good as any Native in the Uncovenanted Service. The bad one, I should think, is worse than any man in the Service, whether Extra Assistant Commissioner, Tahsíldár, or Munsif. There is another man I know who is also fairly good.

1712. How is the present Statutory Service regarded by members of the Uncovenanted Service?—With disfavour, but only because there have been no appointments to the Statutory Service from the Uncovenanted Service in this Province. We should like to see the Statute of 1862 occasionally acted upon. That Statute, so far as I know, has not been repealed, and under it certain men who do not come under the present Statute might be selected, on account of special merit and ability, for promotion to the Covenanted or Statutory grades. I think the Statute of 1862 should not be entirely ignored, and, if it were occasionally acted upon, any alteration of the present system would be unnecessary. That Statute does not confine promotion to Natives of India as defined by the Statute of 1870. I wish again to add here that I am of course an interested witness, and am personally affected by the cessation of appointments under the Statute of 1862 and by the passing of the Statute of 1870.

The *President*—continued.

1713. In the selection of Statutory Civilians do you consider that nominations should be confined to persons of approved merit and ability?—No; I think that it is impossible to have only men of approved merit and ability in the case of first appointments. When you select an untried man, I think all you should inquire into is his moral character, his social status, and his ordinary educational qualifications. After he is appointed, he should undergo through a period of probation. Of course, where a man is promoted from the Uncovenanted Service probation is unnecessary.

1714. Should additional facilities be given to Natives for proceeding to England and entering the Indian Civil Service by the channel of the English competition?—Yes, I would raise the age for both Natives and Europeans to 22 or 23 (I should prefer 23). I would raise the age both on the ground that the present limits bring out Civilians at much too early an age, and for the purpose of encouraging Natives to go and compete. With regard to subjects, I think Persian should be added to the list and placed on the same footing as French and German in the examination. I think sufficient prominence is already given to Sanskrit and Arabic. I have some slight knowledge of these questions as I have been Registrar of the local University for several years, and Professor of Law in the Law School of the Punjab University, first, and last, for eleven or twelve years.

1715. Do you advocate competition in India for the Indian Civil Service simultaneously with competition in England?—No; I would have no examination in India for the Civil Service.

1716. To what extent does the Uncovenanted Service in the Punjab include in its ranks persons eligible, on the ground of proved merit and ability, for appointment to offices ordinarily reserved for members of the Covenanted Civil Service?—I should say to a very considerable extent. I can personally testify to five or six men being eminently qualified for promotion either to the Statutory Service or to posts in the Punjab Commission. The men I refer to include a Hindu, a Mahomedan, and a Native Christian. The last is an eminently trustworthy and able man, and has taken his degree. I could name three or four others whom I know personally. I have worked here for twenty-three years and know something of almost every man in the Uncovenanted Service. It would hardly be fair to ask such men to enter the Covenanted Service at the bottom of the list; but I understand that the appointments are made to specific posts, and therefore have nothing to do with the ordinary list of the Commission, which includes Covenanted men, Military Civilians, and a few Uncovenanted men.

1717. Are those Natives you have mentioned fit to be appointed Deputy Commissioners in the frontier districts?—I would not recommend that on political grounds, but I think in the case of some of the smaller cis-Indus districts they might possibly fill such appointments in a few years' time; but I would not recommend such appointments. I think the Judicial line is more suited to Natives of India.

1718. What special provision, if any, do you think should be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of deserving members of the Uncovenanted Service?—I think the Act of 1862 is quite sufficient if it is acted on. My only complaint is that such appointments are not made frequently enough. In point of fact they are not made at all.

1719. If certain appointments in the Covenanted grades are set apart for the Statutory Service, should a fixed proportion of these be expressly reserved for persons of proved merit and ability in the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes, I should like to see this done, provided a proper proportion of appointments were so assigned.

1720. Should special provision be made for the promotion to Covenanted posts of European members of the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes, all should be treated alike. At present the European is excluded. Eurasians and Europeans entering the Statutory Service or appointed to Covenanted posts would come under the Statutory rules.

1721. Ought not the Uncovenanted Service equally with the Covenanted Service to be open to all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty who possess the qualifications that may from time to time be prescribed?—Yes, certainly.

1722. Supposing the existing Statutory Service is abolished, would you allot the proportion of Covenanted posts now assigned to that Service to the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes, I should like to see so many appointments in each grade of the Covenanted Service set apart as available for Statutory or Uncovenanted men, *i.e.*, so many District, Divisional, and Chief Court Judgeships.

1723. Is the rate of pay at present granted to Statutory Civilians during probation and on final appointment respectively sufficient?—Yes, quite.

1724. Have you any observation to offer on the leave rules applicable to Statutory Civilians?—No, I think they are satisfactory.

1725. How would you treat in regard to pay persons selected from the Uncovenanted Service or from the legal profession if appointed to any of the higher Covenanted posts without being required to pass through the lower grades?—I would treat them as Statutory Civilians.

1726. How far would any system of appointing which involves a journey to and residence in England be regarded by the Native community as open to objection on the ground that it requires Hindu candidates

The *President*—continued.

to abandon their caste as a condition of entering the Civil Service?—Not at all, unless the candidate himself adopts such habits or customs as are likely to offend his people.

1727. Ought power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts persons who have proved their merit and ability in Government Service or in the exercise of a profession without preliminary examination or competition?—Yes, I have a very strong feeling on the subject. I have special opportunities of knowing the Punjab Bar, as I suppose nine-tenths of the members of the Bar have passed through my hands in the Law School. A very considerable number of my pupils are in the Executive and Judicial Services also. As their teacher I have seen them throughout their course of study and their examinations, and many of them are now amongst my personal friends. I know many of them now both as Pleaders and as Judges. One of the students of the Law School has even been a Judge in the Chief Court for a short time; and with regard to these men I must say that they are most intelligent and trustworthy. The mere fact of their going through two or three years in the Law School and of their practising at the Bar guarantees their fitness. Those practising at the Bar get behind the scenes and obtain an experience invaluable to them when they come to be Judges. I think four or five years' experience at the Bar is a most valuable training for the Judicial Service. I would certainly make wide provision for selecting men from the legal profession. I am not prepared to say a certain specified number of such men should be appointed, but I should like to see men of the legal profession appointed Munsifs and Extra Assistant Commissioners in considerable numbers.

1728. Would you have a preliminary examination or competition?—Not in their case.

1729. How should the choice be made?—By the Judges of the Chief Court, who should consult the District Judges if necessary.

1730. How would you regard the following scheme:—(1) the Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of appointments, to be filled by competition in England to which Natives and Europeans alike would be admitted; (2) the appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, both Natives and Europeans being eligible?—I think that system is a very good one. I think the only justification for the Covenanted Indian Civil Service is that the necessities of British rule demand an English Service of high character, which must be imported, and must be expensive. But this Service should be confined to the narrowest limits compatible with the political requirements of the Administration. Then there should be a large locally-recruited Civil Service, forming a distinct and a cheaper Service. The standard of the Covenanted Service should be carefully maintained as it is now. For the superior locally-recruited Civil Service the Statutory rules as to pay, position, pension, and leave are very fairly good. I would, however, make the superior local Service include the Extra Assistant Commissioners and the Statutory Civilians.

1731. To what extent do Natives of good family and education in the Punjab offer themselves as candidates for Subordinate Judicial and Executive appointments?—Freely; they are only too anxious to get any appointment.

1732. Do members of the professional classes in the Punjab readily accept employment in such Service?—They would if they had the chance. They have, to some extent, been excluded by the fact that the rules have not provided for them; also there is a prejudice in this Province against legal practitioners. I think they compel an attention to procedure which is not appreciated by Judicial officers.

To Sir *Charles Turner*.—There is a feeling that the Bar ought to be kept down.

1733. Is there not a feeling that the employment of the Bar in the lower courts very unnecessarily raises the expenses of litigation?—There is that feeling, and also the feeling that the Bar hampers or delays business by insisting on the procedure prescribed by the law being observed. Most Judicial officers in the Punjab have more business to dispose of than can be disposed of, in accordance with the ordinary rules of pleading and procedure, in the time they have at their command. The result is that when a Pleader goes down to Court with his codes and authorities, he is regarded by some as delaying business. It is, however, the fact that the Bar is of great assistance to the Bench, and is also a check upon it; and to the Bar is due, in a very great measure, the improvement, which has undoubtedly taken place of late years, in the quality of the judicial work of the Province. This is also due to the admission to the Munsif and Extra Assistant grades of better qualified men.

1734. Is it, in your opinion, necessary that there should be a proportion of Europeans employed in the Subordinate Executive Service or into the Subordinate Judicial Service, or in both of those Services?—I certainly think that there should be some Europeans in the Subordinate Executive Service, and I should like to see them in the Judicial Service also; but they are necessary in the Executive.

1735. What steps would you take to remove from the Service incompetent men who have been actually appointed?—I believe half the difficulties of the Government arise from the fact that a man who once enters the Service of Government is always there, however incompetent he may be. This

The *President*—continued.

applies especially to Natives. If a Native is incompetent and he is not turned out, it influences the character of the work turned out by many other Natives. If, after being thoroughly satisfied of a man's incompetency, the Government could summarily get rid of him, it would have an excellent effect.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

1736. Do you not think that the power of summary dismissal would militate against the independence of the Service?—I don't think so. If the head of the Administration is satisfied that a man has not done well for a number of years, he ought to have some such power. You might introduce compassionate allowances, such as are given to incompetent men in the Army. I would not object to the devising of any means of getting rid of them as pleasantly as possible so long as they are got rid of.

Mr. *Stokes*.

1737. Do you know what it costs to start and run a Native newspaper?—Yes, as President of the Anjuman Society for some time I have run a Native paper myself. You can buy the material for the press for Rs. 100, and you would require a copyist on Rs. 15 and an Editor on Rs. 25 (of course I only refer to a vernacular paper), and you might put down establishment, paper, scissors, paste, and "miscellaneous" at Rs. 50 or Rs. 60; say Rs. 100 for plant and material and Rs. 100 a month, or even less, to keep it going.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

1738. You have been a Judge for some time?—Yes, for many years.

1739. During that time you have had many applications made to you for transfers of cases from one Court to another?—I have.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

1740. From what Courts to what Courts?—From Native Courts to European. They are unquestionably of frequent occurrence in the Province. But besides formal applications of this character, there are other ways in which the inclinations of Natives are shown in reference to this matter

1741. Have you had any applications to transfer cases from European to other Courts?—There have been such cases where the European Court has been concerned in a previous enquiry, but I do not think on personal grounds. There may have been an application on the ground that the European officer did not quickly dispose of his work. There is a general disinclination to go to certain Courts. Natives prefer European Courts, because European officers are more prompt in disposing of their work. There is another reason also, and that is that in certain cases where class questions are concerned they do not like to go to a Court which is likely, in their opinion, to be prejudiced. I think the Courts to which most objection is taken are the Courts presided over by men promoted from the Amla class. These men, having risen from a clerkship to a Judgeship, are naturally not very familiar with the Codes, and have passed through the mire in the lower grades of ministerial offices. Suitors do not, as a rule, specify in the application for transfer the real grounds upon which the application is based.

1742. Do you think that in the Courts presided over by men of the Amla class bribery is more common than in others?—Yes, certainly. The men whom we are now obtaining under the new rules in this Province are very superior in every way. They are men of education and are, for the most part, quite above taking bribes. The Courts are improving rapidly in this Province.

WITNESS XXIV.—21st December 1886.

Examination of Babu KALI PROSONO ROY, M.A., B.L., Pleader, High Court, Calcutta, now practising at Lahore, Punjab.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Babu *Kali Prosono Roy*, M.A., B.L.

The *President*.

1743. Are you a Native of Calcutta?—Yes.

1744. How long have you been in practice?—For nineteen years, of which ten years have been passed at the Chief Court Bar of this Province. I occasionally visit out stations in my professional capacity.

1745. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Service approved in this Province?—No.

1746. What are the grounds of disapprobation?—The Service is looked upon with disfavor because it is recruited by nomination and is not open to competition, and it unfortunately so happens that generally speaking the nominees are not good men, and also because their pay is inferior to that of the Covenanted Civilians, and they are not appointed to posts of trust. I would wish to see the Service abolished, but if it is not abolished I would have certain additions and alterations made in the rules so that it should be incumbent on the Government to appoint Natives. At the present time it is optional, and as a matter of fact the option has not been exercised for two years in this Province, and in the next place the nominees should come in by competition.

1747. If the Statutory Service is retained should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training, or should they be encouraged to do so?—I would encourage them to go, but would not compel them.

Mr. *White*.

1748. If the Statutory Service is abolished, would you retain the power to appoint men of proved merit and ability from posts in the Uncovenanted Service to the Covenanted branch?—I would retain the power, but restrict its exercise to exceptional cases.

Mr. *Ryland*.

1749. Would you extend the definition of "Natives of India" so as to include, for instance, the sons of European officers in the Service?—I would not.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar*.

1750. Under the Statute appointments can only be made to specific posts in the Covenanted Service would you alter the Statute so as to admit of the appointments being made to a regular Service?—Yes, to that extent I would do so.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar*—continued.

1751. Would you extend the definition of the term "Natives of India" so as to include subjects of feudatory States?—No, I would not, because we are not admitted into the service of Native States, and I don't see why we should admit their subjects into our service.

Mr. *Stokes*.

1752. You say nomination is objected to on the ground that the nominees are inferior what experience have you had of Statutory Civilians to enable you to form that opinion?—I have known three Statutory Civilians.

1753. Where did you acquire the knowledge of their inferiority?—In appearing before them in my professional capacity.

1754. About how often have you appeared before them?—Not many times, because my practice is chiefly confined to the Chief Court.

1755. Would you think they were inferior to what you had a right to expect of officers in their position?—Yes, with one honourable exception.

1756. And the other two were distinctly inferior to what you had a right to expect? That is my impression.

1757. They were perhaps quite young men and new to their work?—Yes.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar*.

1758. Does the distinction in the pay of Statutory and Covenanted Civilians create an invidious distinction between them in the public estimation?—So far as one is able to gauge public opinion, it does.

1759. You say that the nominees are not appointed to posts of trust, but, surely, if they are appointed to judicial posts they are appointed to posts of trust?—By posts of trust I mean executive posts of considerable importance and responsibility.

Mr. *Stokes*.

1760. Would you have a competition for the Statutory Service open to all India, or for the Provinces only?—To all India.

Mr. *Peacock.*

1761. When you say that these Statutory Civilians are not up to the mark, do you mean as compared with the ordinary run of Uncovenanted Servants in the Judicial branch, or inferior to what they ought to be under any circumstances?—I mean inferior in both respects. They are inferior in ability to the men before whom I am accustomed to appear, and they also fall short of one's expectations. Where a man is appointed to certain posts, as it were by the favour of the Government, one naturally has a right to expect that he should merit the selection.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

1762. You say one ground of dissatisfaction is that they are not appointed to the regular Service, but what advantages would they get by being so appointed?—It comes to this, that they are looked down upon by the Covenanted Service, who think that they are not in the same rank, and they are not looked up to with sympathy and favour by the Uncovenanted men.

1763. Have you any reason for supposing that that is actually the case?—That is the impression I have formed from what I have heard.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

1764. Do you think that the inferior character which the public imputes to the Service is due to the inferiority of the men, or to the difference in their position as compared with the Covenanted men?—I believe the two causes are combined.

1765. If they had turned out really superior men, do you think they would have won the good opinion of the public?—No doubt, but still the objection remains that they are selected by nomination. But of course if they had turned out successful men the objection would be mitigated.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

1766. Do not you think that a feeling prevails amongst the people of this Province, and other Provinces, that if the system of nomination is adopted, and, in consequence, inferior men are appointed to the Statutory Service, the latter will be regarded as having failed, and this failure may be adduced as an argument that Natives are not competent for the higher posts?—No doubt in certain quarters such an idea prevails.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1767. That inferiority which you speak of in the persons appointed would probably explain why these men are looked down upon by the superior, and not respected by the Subordinate Service?—That is one element no doubt, but not the sole element.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

1768. Do you consider it a greater advantage to belong to a service in which you have promotion in due course, or to a service in which you are appointed to particular posts?—I should prefer promotion in the regular course.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

1769. You have said that nomination does not secure the men you look upon as the best men: can you say positively whether this feeling is shared by the educated class?—Yes, by the educated class and by those persons who come in contact with these men.

The *President.*

1770. You said you would not amend the definition of "Natives of India" so as to include Europeans. Would you distinctly exclude them?—Yes.

1771. Is that in keeping with the earlier Statute of William IV. and the Queen's Proclamation?—As far as I can judge, it is not inconsistent with them

1772. You think it is not inconsistent with the Proclamation which admits all Her Majesty's natural-born subjects, as far as may be, to offices for which they are qualified?—It is not inconsistent with it.

1773. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—Yes, the standard of examination is such that Natives are at a disadvantage in competing with English candidates; and they are also at a disadvantage because the age is too low; and, thirdly, they have to undergo a journey from India to England in order to enable them to have a chance of competing. I am for open competition both in India and in England, to which Natives and Europeans should be freely admitted. The age should be raised from the maximum of nineteen to the maximum of twenty-three years. Indian History and Indian languages should be included in the subjects of examination; and the marks for Arabic and Sanscrit should be raised, so as to place these languages on a par with the European classics—Latin and Greek.

1774. Would you found scholarships, or make payments of passage-money to Indian students who desire to go to England to compete?—If a system of open competition in India and England is established, I would not, but if there is to be only one centre of examination, and that in England, I would.

1775. If the examination is held in India, should it, as far as possible, be identical with the one held in England?—Yes.

1776. Should the candidates in England and in India compete with one another and be selected in order of merit, or should a certain number of appointments be apportioned for competition to the candidates appearing at the examinations in India or

The *President*—continued.

in England, respectively?—In case there is an open competition in England and in India, I would have one general list.

1777. If an examination is held in India, should the successful candidates be required, as a condition obligatory, to proceed to England to complete their training?—Yes.

Mr. *White.*

1778. Would you raise the limit of age for European candidates as well?—Yes

1779. Do you think that candidates should be allowed to come to this country under 25 years of age?—What I have proposed as the limit would come to that. I propose 23 as the maximum limit of age, and the candidates will have two years' probation. No doubt it is desirable that young men should come to India at a sufficiently mature age, when their ideas are, to some extent, formed.

Mr. *Ryland.*

1780. Do you think that extending the age in both cases would place both classes on an equality?—Yes

1781. But do not Natives of this country arrive at maturity earlier than Europeans?—Yes, but then they have the disadvantage of having to compete in a tongue which is foreign to them.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

1782. Do you not think that Punjabis would be at a disadvantage in an open competition with people of other Provinces?—There might be a little backwardness shown by them at first, but not in so marked a degree as to make it felt. But even supposing it should be so, I am still in favour of one examination and for selection according to merit, because it will act as a stimulus to them to compete for better results; and, eventually, the inequality would be removed.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

1783. Do you think, from your knowledge of the Punjab administration, it would be desirable that the Punjabis should be excluded as they must be at first?—Yes, because I think their temporary loss in the first instance would result in an advantage in the future.

1784. But looking to the requirements of the Administration, do you think it desirable that the Local Executive should consist of Natives of other Provinces?—I mix very familiarly with Natives of this Province, and in their social and political movements, I do not find that they entertain any prejudice against Natives of other Provinces.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton*—continued.

I think the prejudice lies with the European officials.

1785. Do you think the Natives of other Provinces would be as efficient administrators in the Punjab as Natives of the Province?—I do not see that there would be any difference.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1786. You propose to have only one list for the candidates, whether examined in England or in India, do you mean one general list of merit. Would you take the highest man on the list?—Yes.

1787. You have been engaged in the practice of your profession for some years: were you engaged in any of those cases which have arisen out of religious riots?—Not in any case connected with the recent riots.

1788. In former instances?—Yes, but I do not think they were of such a violent character as those which have happened lately.

1789. As a member of the Bar do you consider it desirable to have, for the trial of such cases, Magistrates who might belong to either of the conflicting sects?—If the Magistrate is competent and honest, it does not matter to me whether he be a European or a Native

1790. But may not a man be influenced unconsciously in favour of his co-religionists?—I think, on the contrary, that if he is an honest conscientious man, he is more likely to lean to the other side.

The *President.*

1791. Is that the feeling of the Province?—At present the Uncovenanted Judicial Service is not recruited from competent men. They come either from the old *Amla* class, who were bred in corruption, or they enter by nomination from families ignorant and illiterate. Consequently when a question of race prejudice comes up, the Hindus naturally look with distrust on the Mahomedan Judicial Assistants, and the Mahomedans, on the other hand, entertain a similar feeling for the Hindu Judicial Assistants; but, if educated honest men be appointed, I do not think that the feeling will continue, and I doubt even now whether the feeling exists to a serious extent.

1792. What are your proposals for the Covenanted Service?—As regards the Covenanted Service I have to propose the following scheme. If the centre of examination be only in England, I would reserve a proportion of one-third of the appointments for Natives generally, as defined in the Statute, and would offer them scholarships and other encouragements to go to England and compete.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1793. Suppose there were nine appointments to be filled and, of the nine men, only the first on the list was a Native, would you take two men from the list of successful Europeans and substitute the two next highest Natives, in order to give the Natives a full third? Is that your meaning?—Yes.

1794. No matter how low they passed?—Yes.

1795. In that case would you have a qualifying minimum?—I have not thought of that. In case this reservation of one-third is not allowed, let there be an examination in England with scholarships and other things held out to Natives to induce them to go and compete, and let the Statutory Service be retained subject to the modifications I have suggested.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

1796. Would you make no change in the proportion of one-sixth now existing?—I would increase it to two-fifths. I cannot say why I fix upon that proportion. Of course it is rather arbitrary, and I have not worked it out.

1797. Is it intended to secure efficient administration or simply to give Natives a greater share of appointments?—My reasons are these—the Natives are the children of the soil, and are entitled, therefore, to the larger share of appointments, and, in the next place, for the same salary you will get better Natives than Europeans.

1798. The same salary that is now paid?—Yes.

1799. And therefore it would be a saving to the Government?—Yes, my meaning is that if the competition be in England and in India their pay should be the same, otherwise not.

1800. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in the Statute or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—From Natives of India.

1801. Should the recruitment be by competition, or by nomination, or by both systems combined?—I am for one open competition for the whole of India.

1802. If the Statutory Service is abolished, should the present proportion of offices assigned to the Statutory Service be transferred to the Covenanted Service?—Yes

Mr. *Ryland.*

1803. Would you not be creating an invidious distinction by excluding Europeans who do not happen to come within the definition of Natives of India, but who might have their lot cast in India?—If, for instance, they were born in England, but happened to come out to India to their parents here, although not domiciled exactly, supposing the parents were merchants?—I do not think so.

The *President.*

1804. Does the Act of Parliament in regard to appointments lay down that all Her Majesty's natural-born subjects shall be equally eligible for appointments so far as they are fit?—"So far as may be," the Act says.

1805. If the Covenanted Service be open to Europeans and Natives equally, and they are allowed to compete on equal terms, would it not be contrary to the spirit, as well as the provisions of the Statute and the Proclamation, to exclude Europeans from the Uncovenanted Service?—My impression is that the Statute and the Proclamation never came into operation to create any right in favour of anybody, but rather to take away disabilities.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

1806. Would it not be contrary to abstract justice?—The Act of Parliament has drawn no distinction; it has created no right. It has said that certain rights exist and that these rights shall be recognised. It takes away disabilities.

The *President.*

1807. And you would impose disabilities on Europeans by reason of their place of birth or descent (read section of the Act). You wish, instead of that, that Europeans should be excluded from holding posts in the Uncovenanted Service?—My answer is that at that time certain disabilities existed, and they had to be removed; and, therefore, in that section, we see a recognition of rights by the removal of disabilities. It is no creation of right at all It is for inclusion and to do away with the exclusion.

1808. You are perhaps aware that these same disabilities applied, at that time, to Europeans as well as Natives, and that, possibly, the removal of those disabilities was intended to encourage the admission of Europeans as well as Natives?—I believe there was a jealousy in the Company's time which had the effect of excluding Europeans.

Mr. *Peacock.*

1809. In your system of general competition for the whole of India, how would you supply the requirements of this Province?—By selection in order of merit. I do not see any difficulty in working out my scheme. The only possible objection might be that for a time the Punjab, being a somewhat backward Province, might suffer. That would be an objection to the principle, not to the working.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Babu *Kali Prosono Roy*, M.A., B.L.

The *President.*

1810. You propose to have one general open competition list for all India, and let the best man win, no matter what Province he belongs to?—Yes.

Mr. *Stewart.*

1811. Do you advocate an open competition for all posts in the Uncovenanted Service; for Tahsildars for instance?—I do.

1812. Do you think it desirable that Tahsildars, who are brought into contact with the people, should be persons of other Provinces—Bengalis or Madrassis for instance?—I see no practical objection to it. There are several Kashmiri Pandits and Hindustanis who fill those posts already, and they are working well with the people.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

1813. Do you object to a system of holding Provincial examinations to which all classes of Natives belonging to a Province can be admitted to compete?—I would not object to a Provincial examination to which all Natives are admitted, but I prefer open competition.

1814. You say you would have all appointments made by competition, Judicial appointments also?—I would have Judicial appointments thrown open to the Bar, and, in their case, I would not insist upon competition, as I think their merits would be known to the Judicial authorities; moreover, men of advanced years and experience might object to compete. I would not, however, confine such appointments to the Bar, but would throw them open to the extent of one-half.

1815. Are there men competent at the Bar here to hold Judicial appointments?—Yes, certainly.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar*—continued.

1816. Would they accept Munsiffships?—Pleaders from the Subordinate Courts would take them. I have a large acquaintance with such pleaders, and think they would supply good men for Munsiffships. The Munsiffs in this Province commence at Rs. 100 and rise to Rs 250. In other Provinces Munsiffships lead up to Subordinate Judgeships, but here that is not the case, but I believe Munsiffs can rise through nomination.

1817. Would a pleader of ability in the Chief Court accept a District Judgeship?—Yes.

The *President.*

1818. Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service, accordingly as the posts are held by members of that branch of the Service, or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches?—I don't think so. If men from the Uncovenanted Service are promoted to the Covenanted Service, they should not suffer by the promotion.

1819. Should any distinction be made in the furlough rules applicable to the Statutory and Uncovenanted Services, according to the nationality of the officer?—My general opinion is that there should be no distinction as regards pay and pension, but there might be as regards leave.

1820. Should the system providing two scales of pay, one for the Covenanted and the other for the Statutory Service, be continued?—Yes.

1821. In the case of a man nominated from the Bar?--In such a case perhaps some allowances might be granted in order to secure able men.

WITNESS XXV.—21st December 1886.

Examination of Lala Lal Chand, M. A., Pleader, Chief Court, Punjab; Assistant Law Lecturer, Law School, Lahore.

The *President.*

1822. You are a Punjabi and a graduate I believe?—Yes, I am a native of Amritsar. I have graduated M.A. in the Calcutta University. I practised for three years in the Allahabad High Court and then came to Lahore, where I have practised for the past five years.

1823. On what points do you desire to give evidence. You have volunteered to give evidence, I understand?—Yes. I wish to give evidence generally, and with special reference to the modes of making appointments.

The distinction between the Covenanted and Uncovenanted Services is mainly respecting higher posts which are exclusively given to the former. This distinction is justifiable only on the ground that these higher posts require, in addition to departmental or of technical experience. certain standards of merit and ability which are not ordinarily possessed by those who belong to the Uncovenanted, but, presumably, are possessed by those who belong to the Covenanted ranks.

This difference in merit and ability exists, because the Uncovenanted Service is generally recruited without any test, or by a low test, whereas the test for admission into the Covenanted Service is higher and severer.

Consequently the appointment of an Uncovenanted Servant to these higher posts can only be exceptional and cannot be the rule.

Hitherto these higher posts have been recruited very largely, if not entirely, by holding a competition in England: this is unfair and unjust, if candidates possessing the required standard of qualification for these posts can be found among the Natives of India and in India; for the Natives of a country have, on many grounds, the first right to share in the administration of the government of the country.

Admitting that it is necessary on political grounds, as well as on account of the comparatively less advanced state of general education in this country, that a certain number of these higher posts ought to be recruited by competition in England, there is no reason for holding that there is such entire absence of merit and ability among the Natives of India that none of those higher posts should be given to Indians.

Such a position is moreover disproved by the experiments made in the Judicial line,

The *President*—continued.

such as the appointment of Native Judges in the High Courts. Experience has shown that Natives cannot go and compete in England owing to considerations of expense, distance, &c. A system of holding simultaneous identical examinations both in England and India is neither practicable nor desirable.

It is therefore necessary to set apart a fixed proportion of the higher posts for Indians This proportion must be fixed arbitrarily at first, and I would say it should be one-third of all Executive and Judicial offices now reserved for the Covenanted Service.

Nomination is out of the question, as it fails to secure men of merit and ability. A system of competition is therefore to be preferred, open competition being preferable to limited competition.

On the same principle the proposal to fix proportions by reference to religions ought to be rejected.

Preference should be given to qualified candidates of a Province for employment in that Province.

In exceptional cases men of the Uncovenanted Service of proved merit and ability may be promoted to Covenanted posts. Similarly selections should be made from the Bar for the higher Judicial posts.

If a competition is held in India, it should be confined to Natives.

Residence in England for two years or so in order to gain experience and improve education is not undesirable.

Mr. *Stewart.*

1824 You would restrict the competition in India entirely to Natives?—Yes.

1825. Do you not think that that would reduce the status of those who passed in India?—I see no reason why it should do so.

1826. Would you not prefer that half the appointments should be given in India and half in England, and that appointments should be open to both Natives and Europeans alike?—My own view is that Natives should have the first right to compete for the appointments and get them. In present circumstances there are, of course, exceptional political circumstances which make it necessary to admit to the Indian Civil Service people who are not Natives of the country, and, on that account, it is

Mr. *Stewart*—continued.

necessary to have a competition in England. The principle which I advocate is that Natives should have the first right, exceptions being made on political and other grounds in favour of others. But I do not see any reason why an exception should be made in favour of Europeans generally.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

1827. You say that experience has shown that the best Natives are not secured under the present system of competition in England ?—I mean that people generally have not been able to go to England for the purpose of competing for the Service. We know that in going to England in order to come out again as a Barrister, a man has to incur great expense, and it cannot be said that those who are best, in point of ability, have the means to do this.

1828. Do you know that there are men who have remained in the country who are superior in ability to those who have gone and succeeded ?—I cannot say that I know any.

1829. You are a pleader in the Chief Court ?—Yes.

1830. What is your average income ?—About Rs. 700 per month.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

1831. Are there many pleaders who make less than that ?—There are some. It is a very small Bar so far as Natives are concerned, and the European members are not many.

1832. Do you know many members of the Chief Court Bar who have accepted appointments ?—No, there are some subordinate pleaders who have become Munsiffs. I know at least one instance.

Mr. *Stokes*.

1833. Is there any reason why the Bar of the Chief Court should be so small ?—One reason is that there is a special rule for admission of pleaders to the Chief Court. An examination is held, and those who pass are made second greade pleaders, and must have practised for five years before they can be considered eligible for the Chief Court. It happens, then, that if a pleader has taken up a practice in a District Court and practised there for five years and made a name for himself, he seldom finds it expedient to leave his practice to go to the Chief Court at Lahore.

1834. How long has the Chief Court been established ?—About twenty years.

WITNESS XXVI.—21st December 1886.

Examination of J. SIME, Esq., M. A., of the Educational Department, Punjab; Uncovenanted Service; Tutor to His Highness the MAHARAJA OF PATIALA.

The *President.*

1835. Kindly inform the Commission as to your service and present position? —I belong to the Educational Department. I am now holding a special appointment as Tutor to the Maharaja of Patiala. I have been in Government employ for nearly 18 years, during which time I have held appointments in the Educational Department only, and chiefly at Lahore.

1836. Is the existing system of appointing Natives, as Statutory Civlians, to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved in this Province?—No, it is not approved mainly on the ground of the mode of filling the appointments; but also because what is desird is an entire equality with the Civil Service.

1837. Would you amend the Statute which empowers the Government to make appointments to the Statutory Service?—I should be inclined to repeal the Statute, and introduce other measures. I believe the only measure that would satisfy the intelligent Native community would be the opening of the general Civil Service, either to a limited extent (and I believe a limited extent would satisfy them), or to open it wholly to the Natives of India.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1838. What is the case at present?—They object that it is nominally open, but that practically it is closed, because it necessitates the going to England for examination.

1839. If it is resolved to retain the Statute, would you suggest any alterations in the rules?—If it were considered desirable to retain the Statute, I would include a rule that admission to the Statutory Civil Service should be mainly by competition.

1840. Would you at all amend the Statute in respect of the definition of "Natives of India"?—I have not considered point.

1841. If the Statutory Service is retained, would you require the selected candidates to proceed to England for training? —I think it is very desiriable.

1842. But would you compel them or merely encourage them to do so?—I would make it compulsory on them, as I believe that if the selected candidates have the means of meeting the expenses of a journey to and residence there, they would accept it as a great boon to them; and I believe also that it would be of public use by

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

enlarging the sympathies of the Native selected candidates.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

1843. How have you satisfied yourself that this feeling, which you attribute to the community, is generally fet?—From close communion with the population in the Punjab, in various parts of it, for very many years.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

1844. If the Statute is to be retained, would you not amend it, so as to make admission to the Covenanted Service an admission to the regular Service, and not merely to posts in it?—That would, to a certain extent, remove dissatisfication. I would suggest that as a means of removing, partially, objections to the Statute as it stands at present.

Mr. *Ryland.*

1845. You say you are not prepared to recommend any alteration in the definition of "Natives of India"?—I have not considered the point, and it is a very difficult one. The definition includes Chinamen in Calcutta, and I do not suppose it was meant to include them, but rather to include the Anglo-Indian population, and I am not prepared to recommend any alteration.

The *President.*

1846. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—Yes, that Natives of India should be compelled to proceed to England to compete for that examination is felt to be a great hardship. Then the present limit of age and the subjects of examination are decidedly objected to.

1847. What is your opinion upon that point?—Would you advocate any change, in the first place, of the place of examination?—I see a great danger in opening to all comers in India the examination for the Indian Civil Service, on the ground that, with the large numbers that would come forward as candidates in very many places, a large number of places would be secured by Native candidates. For administrative reasons, I am not prepared to say that this is desirable. On the contrary, it seems to

The *President*—continued.

me that, beyond a certain limit, it would be dangerous to open the appointments I would have the examination open to all comers, but would limit the number of posts available to Native candidates. Even should the examinations be absolutely identical there would be danger of having a preponderance of Native successful competitors. I would assign a proportion of the appointments to Natives and a proportion to Europeans. The proportions should be decided upon political and administrative grounds.

1848. Do you use the term "Natives of India" in the Statutory sense or limit it to persons of Asiatic origin?—In the Statutory sense, because, as a matter of fact, the larger number would be actually Natives of India.

1849. Do you recommend any change in the subjects of the examination?—The examination at present is upon such subjects only as a young man well trained in England is able to profess. But it does not include all the subjects which a young man trained in India is naturally able to profess, such as Indian History and Geography and Persian. All of these subjects are very useful for service in this country. I would include both Indian History and Persian, and I would increase the number of marks for Sanscrit at any rate. In the English examination 600 marks are allotted to Greek and 800 to Latin. Of course there are strong reasons for that, and the probability is that Sanscrit would not merit more than Greek, so that I am not prepared to advocate more than 600 marks being given to Sanscrit so long as Greek remains at 600. And as to Arabic, I should like to propose the same marks, but as a matter of fact, we have found in this country that we are not able to do much in the instruction of Arabic, from the absence of books fit for examining by the same standards in Arabic as in Sanscrit. I should like to see them both at 600, but should not object to seeing only 500 for Arabic.

1850. Would you apportion the appointments you reserve for Natives of India according to creed?—No.

1851. Or according to the Provinces from which they might present themselves?—I think the selection should, to a great extent, be by Provinces, but, although generally provincial appointments should be filled from that particular Province, I should be disinclined to say that the appointments should be closed to Native candidates, merely because a particular class was not forthcoming. I should be inclined to say that they should go to the next on the list of Native candidates in order of merit.

1852. Would you require persons who succeed at the Indian competition which you advocate to proceed to England for the completion of their training?—I would, and I believe it would be hailed with satisfaction by the candidates themselves

1853 You have some experience of Natives here?—Yes.

1854. Do you consider that there is any strong objection against proceeding to England?—I think, in the Punjab, there are very slight objections on account of caste.

Mr. *Ryland.*

1855. Then on what grounds do you assert that the journey to England is felt to be a hardship?—More on account of the expense. Those who consider themselves entitled to the appointments they would get by competing in England are, to a great extent, not those who have the means of proceeding to England.

The *President.*

1856. If the system of one centre of examination in England is retained, would you advocate the foundation of scholarships to meet the difficulty?—Yes.

Mr. *Ryland.*

1857. Have you any personal experience of the young men who have obtained appointments in India under the competitive system?—Yes, one was a pupil of my own.

1858. Do you think better Natives could be obtained under any other system than are now obtainable?—The choice might be wider, and I should not anticipate any inferiority.

1859. But you think the present system does not give as good men as might be got?—It does not give the best men, that is to say, the best men have not proceeded to England. I have, for many years, examined in the Calcutta University, and I know that very few of the most distinguished students have gone to England. It is only here and there that they have done so, depending entirely on their own pecuniary means.

1860. In what subjects were you examiner?—I have examined in English literature, metaphysics, and mathematics.

1861. Do you think the best men would go into the Civil Service if the examinations were held in England and their expenses were provided for?—Yes, I think they would.

Mr. *White.*

1862. You said that if an examination is held in India for the competitive service, you would introduce Arabic and Sanscrit to a certain extent; but you would not, I suppose, deter an Indian candidate from taking up Latin and Greek if he preferred it?—No, all the subjects would be open. At

Mr. *White*—continued.

present Sanscrit and Arabic are open, but the objection is to the number of marks.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

1863. Although you do not belong to the Executive, does your knowledge of the Province, the people, and the administrative wants, enable you to form any idea of what should be the proportion, as between Natives and Europeans, in the Covenanted Service?—That includes the question of the defects of our educational system in India. We have got very remarkable powers of acquiring knowledge, but there are other qualities which are not forthcoming. Of course I speak generally, there are exceptions to what I am going to say, but, as a rule, even the brightest of our students are wanting in the power of weighing the different sides, the pros and the cons of the different problems or theories that come before them. With very extraordinary acquirements you find this the case. These extraordinary acquirements would give a very high place in an examination, yet would not combine the other qualities that are essential for administrative purposes. Then I have also observed a want of freedom from sectarian prejudices. We have not been able to shake that. A certain apathy, and a want of perseverance in carrying a difficult thing to an end are qualities also apparent: qualities which are very essential in administration are not always accompanied by those which would give a very high place in a written examination. I should therefore be inclined, for the present, to strike a very low limit as to the number of appointments that would be open in this public manner. I would have it distinctly understood that so many appointments were open to Native candidates and that they were free to win them by public competition.

Mr. *Stewart.*

1864. And you advocate that that competition should be in India?—Yes.

1865. Could it not be arranged for in England?—Nothing will satisfy the Native community in the way of competition, unless they are placed on an identical footing with Englishmen, even should you limit the number of appointments open to them. I object to a system which gives the Natives special chances.

Mr. *Stokes.*

1866. But you would have the examination in India and limit the number of appointments open to Natives?—Yes.

1867. But in that case the men who passed in India would not be absolutely on a footing of equality with the men who competed in England. They might take lower marks?—And they might be at the top of the list. It is their aspiration to compete on fair and absolutely equal terms with the English competitors.

Mr. *Stokes*—continued.

Mr. *Peacock.*

1868. May I ask what you would raise the limit of age to?—I would be inclined to raise it to twenty-three. It would not be satisfactory at present at twenty-two, but I would bring it down to that ultimately. The minimum age should be as it is now.

Mr. *Stokes.*

1869. Do you know any Native students in this Province whom you would recommend to go to England and take their chance?—I have met two or three, but it is the want of money that has always stood in their way.

Mr. *Peacock.*

1870. Do I understand that you would offer facilities to Natives for getting over this difficulty?—Should the examinations not be held in India, I would offer facilities in the way of scholarships, but only to men who have highly distinguished themselves in their University career or by a successful place in a public competition.

The Hon'ble Mr. *Quinton.*

1871. You said you would have the examinations identical. Do you not see any practical difficulty in that, both as regards papers and as regards the *vivâ voce* examination?—There is a slight difficulty in the difference of examiners that I think is not insuperable. The *vivâ voce* examiners would require to communicate with each other.

Mr. *Peacock.*

1872. If the *vivâ voce* questions were set in England and afterwards sent out here, do you think the *vivâ voce* examinations would be conducted on pretty nearly the same lines?—Yes.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

1873. Would not the number of marks in the *vivâ voce* examination depend a good deal upon the examiner?—No doubt they would have to communicate with each other.

Mr. *Ryland.*

1874. You say that certain essential qualities are lacking in the case of Native candidates. Among what class of Her Majesty's subjects would you expect to find them? I was speaking really of the students who have passed through my own hands, either as teacher or examiner, when I spoke of a want of ability to estimate, to that degree which you would expect from

Mr. *Ryland*—continued.

the extraordinary memory faculties shown, the two or more sides of a question.

1875. Would you find those qualities in any other class of candidates?—My own recollection of youth leads me to the conclusion that English boys can grapple with the different sides of a problem better.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1876. Would you have one list for both examinations or would you have a list for each?—One list for both. I mean that a certain number of posts should be open to the Indian candidates, but they must win them in an open competition. Suppose for instance there were forty appointments altogether, and five of them for Natives of India, but among the forty candidates six Indian candidates appeared; the last of these would disappear from the list altogether, the first five would win their appointments.

Mr. *Stewart.*

1877. Would not that raise a grievance on the part of those who had to make way for the Native candidates whom the examinations had proved to be inferior to them?—It would be a grievance to a certain extent, but advantageous for administrative reasons.

Mr. *White.*

1878. Supposing a domiciled European or a Eurasian went to England on his own account to compete, how would you treat him?—He would still compete as a Native of India.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

1879. When you spoke of Native opinion, you spoke of your close communion with many classes of the Punjab. Do you speak the vernaculars of the Province?—I do not speak Punjabi well. I can speak Hindustani and make myself thoroughly intelligible to the villager. Hindustani is spoken largely in the Province. I have been Inspector of Schools for a number of years, and have been able to conduct all the examinations in the vernacular.

1880. When you spoke of your "close communion" I understand you meant close communion with all classes; and you said you thought the hardship felt in the present system of recruiting for the Covenanted Service by competition in England related rather to the expense of going to England than to any caste prejudices, and that, owing to that, the best men were prevented from competing?—Yes.

1881. Do you think that if you had this open examination in India for a certain number of apppointments the successful competitors would come chiefly from the poorer classes?—They would chiefly come

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

from the lower middle class, and we should still draw from that class.

1882. Knowing, as you do, the feelings of the Natives of the Punjab, do you think that the officers we should get in that way would be such as could be given charge of districts and high administrative posts?—Yes, to the extent I have described. Of course, it would not be a large percentage. The appointments might, without danger to the Administration, be open to all those of the representatives of the Native community who had won their places in this way.

1883. You are now employed in a Native State I believe?—I am now employed in the Patiala State, and have been there one year and nine months.

1884. Do you know anything about the salaries of officers of that State?—Yes.

1885 Having regard to those salaries, do you think that the present pay of the Statutory Civilians, that is to say, two-thirds of the Covenanted scale, is sufficient?—I think it is quite sufficient

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1886. You say that you consider that if there was an open examination in India, the English competitors would be swamped by Native competitors?—Yes.

1887. Are you a University man?—Yes, of St. Andrew's University.

1888. Have you ever seen the papers of young men who succeeded in the English examination at home?—No, but I can form a very vivid idea of the attainments of a boy of eighteen years of age at home, going from a public school, and, so far as the knowledge required is concerned, I am perfectly sure that a large number in this country would stand on a par with them, and, I fear a good deal higher, in any public competition.

1889. Are you comparing boys who have just left school at home with boys who are passing their Entrance examination out here?—I am comparing those who enter the Civil Service with those in India who wish to enter the service.

1890. Are you making a comparison between English boys when they leave school. and prior to their entrance to the University, and Natives after they leave the middle schools, and prior to their entrance to the University Colleges?—I am.

1891. And do you think that when the Natives of India pass the Entrance examination, many of them would, at that stage, be superior to boys who leave public schools in England?—No, they are inferior.

1892. When would the superiority commence?—At the close of their University career.

1893. Do you think that at the close of his University career the Native of this country would be superior in education to

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

the young Englishmen who would be successful in competition at the close of his University career?—I should still have a doubt whether, both being 22 years of age, the competition would not be hard on the English candidate.

1894. Do you recollect the gentlemen who came out to India to join the Service when the limit of age was twenty-two years?—Yes.

1895. Bearing in mind who those gentlemen were, and comparing them with the flower of any of the Indian Universities, do you not think that the Englishmen would have held their own in India, in point of intellectual ability and attainments? Do you recollect who came out during the first two or three years? Do you think the Natives of this country would have a very great advantage in competition with such men?—They would not have an advantage, but they would run them very close.

1896. Do you think Natives of India of this *calibre* are in such numbers as to be a subject of apprehension? In other words, do you think that the number of highly educated men in England is less than the number of highly educated men in India?—No.

1897. And of the middle classes, educated for examination, do you think that the number of highly educated men is less?—With an open competition in India I think the number of boys wishing to compete would be larger.

1898. Do you know how many B.A.s are turned out in all the Universities of India in the course of a year?—The Calcutta University turned out 950 last year.

1899. Do you know the number of B. A.'s turned out in our English Universities alone? Do they not vastly outnumber those turned out in India in one year?—Yes, but still I don't consider that they represent candidates intended for the Indian Civil Service.

1900. Do you know the standards of examination at Cambridge?—I know the standards of all the higher honor examinations.

1901. How many men in India would take a first class at Oxford?—Large numbers.

1902. Take the Cambridge mathematical Tripos?—Yes, in fact there is no inaptitude in India for mathematics anywhere; and supposing Indian youths were to go to England and devote themselves exclusively to mathematics, I am perfectly sure that many a Native of India would stand very high amongst the Wranglers. I have no hesitation in saying that many men I have come across would take a high place amongst the Wranglers as well as in all other subjects.

1903. With regard to this particular Province, do you know whether there are many Natives of this Province at present sufficiently educated to fill the higher posts in the Civil Service, who would be successful in the competition you suggest?—Not a very large number, but still there are a few men in the Punjab.

1904. Do you consider the educational institutions of the Punjab afford a sufficient training for men to succeed in the competition you suggest in a purely intellectual competition?—Yes, I do not think the Colleges are what they might be as to culture and fitness for administration, but the amount of knowledge acquired in the Colleges is sufficiently extensive to warrant the conclusion that in an open competition the Punjab would provide a place or two annually.

1905. Do you think the educational staff of the several Colleges in the Punjab is equal to that of a first rate school in England?—Yes, I think so. Of course the Colleges are not so well manned as they might be, but still they are sufficiently manned and competent to give instructon of a high type, up to the M. A. examination.

The *President*.

1906. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from the Natives of India, as described in the Statute, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—Without any restriction.

1907. Should the recruitment be by competition or by nomination or by both systems combined?—By both combined.

1908. Are you aware of the present system obtaining in the Punjab for filling the smaller posts of the administrative service, for selecting Extra Assistant Commissioners, which is partly by nomination and partly by competition?—Yes, and I approve of it.

1909. Would you have examinations held provincially or for all India? You have remained a great deal among the people; do you think it expedient or not that the class of the Executive which is brought into closer contact with the people should be of their own race? Take, for instance, Tahsildars?—Yes, their sympathy with, and knowledge of, the manners and customs of the people are greater.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

1910. You entertain no apprehension that any social influences would disturb the judgment of such men?—No, I do not anticipate anything of the kind.

1911. You would select Tahsildars by competition?—Yes.

1912. As regards the Munsiffs?—The system of selection by competition has given great satisfaction.

1913. Is it by open or limited competition?—Limited competition amongst candidates who are nominated.

The *President.*

1914. Would you wish the power given by the Statute to the Local Government, to appoint men of approved merit and ability in the Uncovenanted Service to posts in the Covenanted branch, to be retained?—Yes, but to be used very sparingly.

1915. Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service according as the posts are held by members of that branch of the Service, or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches?—I think the present limit of two-thirds is entirely adequate. Native gentlemen whose opinion I have consulted have told me that the feeling of dissatisfaction at the present rate of pay is really not very strong, and is founded more upon a supposed invidious distinction than upon any substantial reasons.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1916. Do you think the present rates of pay are sufficient to attract men of undoubted ability?—Yes.

1917. Would you pay the Native Covenanted Civilian the same as a man who has succeeded by competition in England?—No.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

1918. Are you aware that the salaries of the present Covenanted Service were raised, not so much on considerations of nationality, as to provide against any temptation to corruption?—I am aware of that.

1919. Do you think the salaries which are allowed to the Statutory Civil Service are sufficient to keep men honest?—Entirely adequate.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1920. You have had experience of the salaries paid in the Patiala State?—Yes.

1921. Are they above or below the present pay of the Statutory Service?—They are very much smaller.

1922. All things considered are they smaller?—Yes.

1923. Do you find that as efficient men are obtained for the administration of the Patiala State as the Statutory Service?—They are efficient men, but of a different type.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

1924. Are they above corruption?—I am not prepared to say: I have no opportunities of knowing.

WITNESS XXVII.—21st December 1886.

Examination of Kazi MAHOMED ASLAM, of the Statutory Civil Service, Assistant Commissioner, Rawalpindi, Punjab.

The *President.*

1925. You are a Native of the Peshawar frontier, are you not, and have been appointed to a Covenanted post in the Punjab Commission?—Yes, I entered the service in 1882 and am serving at Rawalpindi.

1926. Have you passed your Departmental examination?—I have passed by the lower standard.

1927. Is the existing system of appointing Natives, as Statutory Civilians, to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—It is not approved by the educated class, but, to some extent, it is approved by people of high family. It is not approved by the educated class, because they want a separate service, and they also object to the appointments being made by nomination. They say, if the Statutory system is retained, there should be open competition. The older families think, on the other hand, that the system of nomination is a good one for administrative purposes.

1928. Are these defects susceptible of remedy?—Yes, in this respect, that the selection should be by open competition. I am for abolishing the Statutory system, but I would leave to Government the power to make exceptional appointments in the case of very distinguished men.

1929. Supposing the system is not abolished, would you compel the Statutory men to go to England for their training?—I would not compel them, but I would encourage them to go.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

1930. What are your objections to the Statutory system?—The people in general, and the educated class especially, believe that better men could be obtained by open competition, and I am of the same opinion. I consider also that Statutory Civilians should be considered members of the Service, and should not be appointed to posts merely.

The *President.*

1931. Would you make the competition open for all India or merely provincial?—I would have provincial competition.

1932. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—Yes, in the first place, the candidates are required to go to England and pass the examination there. There are several objections to this. They have to incur a large expenditure, and there are religious objections also among some Hindu families. Some changes should also be made in the subjects of the examination. There is also an objection on the score of age.

The *President*—continued.

1933. What changes would you suggest?—I would raise the age-limit to twenty-two. At present the languages in which the candidates are required to pass are—English, Greek, Latin, German, French, Arabic, and Sanscrit. I think Persian, Hindi, Pushtoo, Urdu, and Bhasha should be added to the list, because the English candidates have facilities for learning the European languages which Natives do not possess. By the addition of the languages I have mentioned they would be placed on a more equal footing. I am in favour of additional facilities being given to Native candidates to go to England and compete in case there should be only one examination, and that in England; but I am in favour of holding an examination in India. As far as practicable the examination should be the same as that held in England

1934. If you had identical examinations in England and India, would you put all the successful candidates in one general list in order of merit, or would you apportion a certain number of all appointments to be competed for in India and a certain number to be competed for in England?—There should be two lists made.

1935. If you had two lists you would apportion a certain number of appointments for Indian candidates, and a certain number for English candidates?—Yes, and I would reserve one-third for India.

1936. And of that one-third would you allot any proportion to the various Provinces, or to the different classes of the inhabitants, such as Hindus and Mahomedans?—Personally I should like to see that done.

1937. If the examination is held in India, would you compel the successful candidates to go to England to complete their training?—No, I would leave it optional.

1938. You said you would have an examination in England and one in India, would you exclude Natives from the English examination?—Yes.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Kazi *Mahomed Aslam.*

The *President*—continued.

1939. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in the Statute, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—From all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty

1940. You said you would have one examination in England for the English, and one examination in India for the Natives. Do you use the term Natives in the Statutory sense?—Yes, I mean all persons resident and domiciled in India.

1941. Should the recruitment be by competition, or by nomination, or by both systems combined?—By both systems combined.

1942. Should one system be applied to all offices or classes of offices, or should the system be varied with the class of office, bearing in mind that the offices alluded to here are the Extra Assistant Commissionerships, Munsiffships, and Tahsildarships?—I think one system should be applied for Extra Assistant Commissioners and Munsiffs. I would have a system of part nomination and part competition for them. Tahsildars, I think, should be appointed only by nomination, because the duties of Tahsildars call for men of practical experience.

1943. You are acquainted with the present system of appointment to Uncovenanted posts?—Yes.

1944. Do you think it is a good system?—Yes.

1945. Whatever system be adopted, should the recruitment be made by the several Administrations only from persons resident in the territories under such Administrations respectively, or with a preference for such residents?—I think the recruitment should be made from the people of the particular Province.

1946. If the existing Statutory system is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service?—I think it should.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

1947. You say you would recruit the Uncovenanted Service from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty, which would include undomiciled Europeans. Do you wish to include or exclude undomiciled Europeans?—I would exclude those Europeans who have not settled here and have no intention of settling here.

1948. Would you exclude sons of Civil and Military officers serving in India?—I should not object to anybody who settles in this country.

1949. Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service accordingly as the posts are held by the members of that branch of the service, or by members of the Statutory and Uncovenanted branches?—Yes, a distinction should be made, the salaries and appointments of all classes should be fixed at a lower rate than at present; but those who belonged to the Covenanted Service should get an allowance in addition to their salary.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar*—continued.

1950. Have you formed any idea as to the rate that should be fixed?—At two-thirds of the present amount; as to the allowance I am not prepared to say.

1951. Should any distinction be made in the furlough rules applicable to the Statutory and Uncovenanted branches of the Service according to the nationality of the officer or on any other grounds?—I would retain the existing rules as they are.

1952. You say that a lower pay should be fixed for all appointments and that allowances should be given to members of the Covenanted Service? Would you include in that allowance Natives who passed in England?—All persons who passed in England should get the allowance plus the pay.

1953. Would you give the Statutory Natives the same pay and promotion and retiring annuities as are given now to the Covenanted Civilians?—I would promote them in the same way.

1954. Do you think the present system of retiring annuities is suited to the Statutory Civilians?—No, it is not.

Mr. *Peacock.*

1955. Supposing a European obtained a Statutory appointment, would you make any difference as regards the furlough rules applicable to him and the furlough rules applicable to Natives in the Statutory Service?—A European who obtains a Statutory appointment ought to be considered as a Native.

Mr. *Ryland.*

1956. If the open competition you advocate had been in force when you joined the Service, would you have been willing to compete, or been in any way debarred from doing so?—I should have been willing to compete.

The *President.*

1957. You are a Native of a frontier district, and the frontier force is distributed in small bodies along the frontier, is it not?—Yes.

1958. How are these militia posts recruited?—Through the Deputy Commissioner, by political influence with the Chiefs on the frontier.

1959. And the Military and Civil administrations are more closely connected than in other parts of the Province?—Yes.

1960 Have any frontier raids occurred within your memory (Mentioning some)? Are these within your recollection?—Yes.

1961. And, with reference to the close connection between the Military and Civil administrations, and the possibility of raids occurring, do you think it desirable to have a large proportion of European officers on the frontier?—Yes.

WITNESS XXVIII.—21st December 1886.

Examination of SYAD MAHOMED LATIF KHAN, of the Uncovenanted Service, Extra Assistant Commissioner, Bannu, Punjab.

The *President.*

1962. Will you tell the Commission what position you hold and to what part of the country you belong, &c.?—I am an Extra Assistant Commissioner. I was appointed in 1879 Before that I was a Translator in the Chief Court office, and before that I was Editor of a Vernacular newspaper. I was taken direct from the Press to the Chief Court and, after ten years' service, I was made an Extra Assistant Commissioner. My native place is Delhi. I received my English education at Lahore. I am serving in the Bannu district.

1963. Is the existing system of appointing Natives, as Statutory Civilians, to posts in the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—It is not approved by the educated classes, but by the aristocracy I think it is approved. The grounds of disapproval are that the words of section 6 say that persons of proved "merit and ability" are to be appointed. These provisions are not regarded as they ought to be.

1964. Would you amend the Statute or the rules, or both?—As regards the Statute, I think the words "Natives of India" should be more clearly and fully defined. In other respects I think the Statute may stand as it is.

1965. How would you define Natives of India?—I think it should be made to exclude persons who have not completely severed their connection with countries other than India. Persons who hold property in India and not elsewhere, and who, in criminal matters, are subject to the same law and jurisdiction as Natives of India alone should be regarded as Natives of India; and in order to insist on this I would omit the words "habitually resident" and would substitute the words "permanently settled," because I think the present description is too indefinite.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1966. You say you would alter the definition of "Natives of India" so as to exclude persons who have not completely severed their connection with other countries, or who hold property there. Are there not many Natives of purely Asiatic parentage who hold property in England, Native merchants, for instance, who send goods to England for sale?—By property I mean landed property.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

1967. Suppose an Indian goes to England and buys a house there, would you disqualify him?—I think I would.

1968. Would you amend the rules in any way?—The rules at present empower the Local Government to select?—I think the selection should be made by competition whether open or limited.

1969. Should any change be made in the sanction required?—No, I would leave it as at present

1970. If the Statutory system is retained, should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training or should they be encouraged to do so?—I think it should not be compulsory but optional only. Because for service in India, Indian experience is required and European experience has no value.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

1971. Would you not amend the Statute so as to provide for appointments being made to a regular Service and not merely to posts?—Yes.

1972. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruiting for the Covenanted Civil Service?—Yes.

1973. Do Natives of India labour under any and what disadvantages in competing for employment in this branch of the Service?—Yes, they are compelled to go to England and have not the same advantages as regards age and the subjects of examination.

The *President.*

1974. Would you hold examinations simultaneously in England and in India?—Yes, and the examinations should be identical. The Indian examination should be held at one centre only. There should be one general list of candidates for the whole of India and England, but a proportion of appointments to the extent of one-third should be reserved for India, and as regards the Indian list there should be separate lists for the Provinces

1975. Should there be any apportionment between the different members of religious sects?—Yes, I think the appointments should be equally divided between Hindus and Mahomedans.

1976. If an examination is held in India, should the successful candidates be required

The *President*—continued.

as a condition obligatory, to proceed to England to complete their training ?—It should not be made compulsory.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

1977. Is there any objection entertained amongst your acquaintances to proceed to England on religious grounds ?—Not among the educated people, but among orthodox Hindus and Mahomedans there is.

1978. What objections have the orthodox Mahomedans against it ?—My experience is that the orthodox Mahomedans are averse to mixing in European society.

1979. Are they averse to going to foreign countries ?—There is no religious prohibition against their doing so, but some old Indian Mahomedans have retained Hindu customs in some respects.

1980. Is the objection respecting age that in the present educational condition of India students cannot qualify for the competitive examination at an early age ?—I would raise the age from nineteen to twenty-three years.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

1981. You say the people of the country are at a disadvantage as regards the subjects of examination. What alterations do you propose ?—I would raise the marks for Arabic to the same number as those at present allotted to Latin and Greek, and I would include Persian among the living languages.

Mr. *Peacock.*

1982. Are you a member of the Indian Association ?—Yes.

The *President.*

1983. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in the Statute or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty ? Take the Extra Assistant Commissioners, Tahsildars, and Munsiffs, would you have them Natives of India only or would you throw these posts open to all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty ?—I would keep them for Natives only.

1984. Should the recruitment be by competition, or by nomination, or by both systems combined ?—By both combined.

1985. And if by both systems combined, should one system be applied to all offices or classes of offices or should the system be varied with the class of offices ?—I think in the case of Tahsildars and Extra Assistant Commissioners there should be a system of nomination.

1986. Whatever system is adopted, should the recruitment be made by the several Administrations only from persons resident in the territories under such Administrations respectively, or with a preference for such residents ?—It should be made provincially.

1987. Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service according as the posts are held by members of that branch of the service, or by members of the Statutory, or Uncovenanted branches ?—There should be a distinction made of twenty per cent.

1988. On what principle would you give the Statutory men 20 per cent. less ? Would you give an Uncovenanted man doing the same duties as a Covenanted Civilian the same pay ?—I would give him 15 or 10 per cent. less than the Statutory Civilian. I would make no distinction as regards furlough.

WITNESS XXIX.—21st December 1886.

Examination of Maulvi INAM ALI, B. A., Nominee of the *Anjuman-i-Islamia* Society, Lahore, Punjab.

Maulvi *Inam Ali* stated:—I represent the *Anjuman-i-Islamia* Society of Lahore. I was made a member of the *Indian Association* three or four days ago, but do not represent the views of that Society.

The *President.*

1989. Do the views which you are going to represent materially differ from those of the Indian Association?—They do.

1990. Are there any special points upon which you have been deputed to give evidence?—(The witness handed in the Society's answers to the printed questions. They will be found in *Vol.* I., *Sec.* 3, *Sub-section A.*)

1991. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civilians approved?—It is not generally approved. The grounds of disapprobation are that only sons of the influential classes are taken; that these men are generally speaking not competent for the discharge of their duties; and that they are placed in a disadvantageous position as regards their pay, privileges, and sphere of action.

1992. What amendments do you suggest in the Statute?—To the Statute there are three points of objection:—(1) That the appointments are only to specific posts and not to a regular service; (2) that the appointments are at the mere discretion of the Government; and (3) that the definition of "Natives of India" is not the best that could be given.

1993. How would you amend the definition? I would substitute for the words "habitually resident" the words "permanently settled"; as regards the rules the objection is that the proportion of appointments which is available in India to those made through competition in England is one-fifth. It should be raised to one-half. The nominees should be persons of experience and ability, and, if possible, of good birth.

1994. How would you secure this by nomination?—Their ability should be tested by the way in which they perform their duties during a certain probationary period.

1995. If the provisions of the Statute are not repealed, should they, in your opinion, be amended in respect of the sanction required for appointments made thereunder?—I have no objection to the sanction being left as it is.

The *President*—continued.

1996. If the Statutory Service is retained, should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training, or should they be encouraged to do so?—I would leave it to their option.

1997. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—Yes.

1998. Do Natives of India labour under any and what disadvantages in competing for employment in this branch of the service; and, if so, by what changes may these disadvantages be minimised or removed?—The main objection is that the limit of age is too low. I would raise it to at least twenty-three years. I would allow scholarships and give passage-money to Native candidates who desire to compete in England. The marks assigned to Arabic and Sanscrit should be made equal to those assigned to Greek and Latin, and Persian should be included in the list of subjects. Some other changes might also be made which are necessitated by the peculiarities of this country.

1999. Would you hold simultaneous examinations in England and India?—Yes, and they should, as far as possible, be identical. The modifications I have suggested would apply alike to both examinations. The Indian examinations should be held in more than one centre. I should prefer it to be held Provincially.

2000. Would you allot a certain proportion of appointments to the different Provinces? That is, should there be an apportionment between residents in the territories of the several Administrations respectively?—Yes.

2001. If an examination is held in India, should the successful candidates be required, as a condition obligatory, to proceed to England to complete their training?—They should only be encouraged to go.

2002. Should the Uncovenanted Service [meaning Extra Assistant Commissioners, Munsiffs, and Tahsildars] be recruited only from Natives of India as defined in the Statute, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—The Anjuman would admit all, without distinction of nationality, but the Anjuman thinks it would be better to select only those men who are permanently settled in the country. This would exclude only those who come here for temporary purposes, that is, only to earn money and go away.

The *President*—continued.

2003. Would you recruit by nomination, or by competition, or by both systems combined?—By both combined

2004. Would you apply that system to all classes of appointments, Assistant Commissioners, Munsiffs, and Tahsildars?—Yes.

2005. Would you recruit provincially or merely give the preference to the residents of Provinces in making the appointments?—I would give a preference to the Natives of the Province.

2006. If the existing Statutory Service is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

2007. You say that you would recruit the Uncovenanted Service from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty, provided they were permanently settled here. What do you understand by permanently settled?—I have already explained. Those who wish to live here and spend the whole of their lives here, and those who come to settle here.

2008. How would you ascertain for certain that a man intended to settle here?—He should make a declaration to that effect. He should enter himself upon a list as a person who intends to settle here.

The *President*.

2009. Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service accordingly as the posts are held by members of that branch of the Service or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted Services?—I would give to those who had passed in England 20 per cent more than the others.

2010. And as regards furlough?—I would make a distinction also as regards furlough.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar*.

2011. How many members have you in the *Anjuman-i-Islamia*?—About one-hundred Nawab Nawazish Ali, C.I.E., is the President. He was not present when this Association framed its answers.

2012. How many members were present on that occasion?—About ten. They were unanimous.

2013. You put the matter to the vote?—Yes.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter*.

2014. Was notice given to all the members of your Association of the intended meeting?—Notice was given only to those who form the Executive Committee.

2015. How many form the Executive Committee?—About thirty.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*.

2016. How long before the meeting was held was notice given?—About two days before.

The *President*.

2017. Would you make any difference in pay between the Statutory and the Uncovenanted men?—Yes, the Statutory men should be more highly paid.

2018. Do I understand you to say you would give the Statutory Civilians 20 per cent. less than the Covenanted men?—Yes.

2019. Then what would you give the Uncovenanted?—A little less, so as to make a distinction, about 5 per cent. less.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

2020. I suppose you would give the better pay to the better men?—Yes; it is our opinion that the Statutory Service is no better than the Uncovenanted. If you improve the pay of the Service you will get better men.

2021. Do you consider that in an improved Statutory Service, such as you suggest, you would get better men than you get at present in the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes

2022. What class of men?—Men who possess good abilities.

2023. Do you not get them in the Uncovenanted Service now?—Yes.

2024. And do you not get as good men now as you would get in your improved Statutory Service?—I can not say.

2025. The Society you represent is of opinion that the Covenanted Service should be open to all classes of men of Her Majesty's subjects?—Yes, provided that they are fit persons, acquainted with the peculiarities of the country, and are able enough, in their knowledge of the vernaculars, to communicate with the people; and that they are willing to accept the ordinary pay of these posts.

The *President*.

2026. Would it be desirable to rule that the proportion of persons being Hindus and Mahomedans respectively, who are from time to time appointed in any Province, should bear a certain relation to the members of the two classes composing the population of the Province concerned?—Yes, it would be desirable to rule so because it would prevent an undue preference of one class over the other. It would be easy to secure equal treatment should a system of nomination be resorted to, but if a purely competitive system is adopted, this will be impossible. The *Anjuman-i-Islamia* does not support this scheme, as it does not see how it could be carried into effect with advantage.

WITNESS XXX.—21st December 1886.

Examination of MUNSHI NIZAM-UD-DIN, President of the *Zemindari Reforming Society*, Lahore, Punjab.

The *President.*

2027. You are a Native of Lahore, I think?—I was born at Bagwanpura in the Lahore District. I am President of the *Zemindari Reforming Society*. I represent that Society here The Society is compesed of about 160 members of various castes—Hindus, Mahomedans and Sikhs—all of whom are landowners in the Lahore District. The Association contains men of distinguished families (names some).

2028. Are you a member of any other Society here?—Yes, I am a member of the *Anjuman-i-Islamia* Society also. I was present at one meeting when they prepared their answers, but only fifteen or twenty questions were then answered while I was present.

2029. Were the answers of the *Zemindari Reforming Society* framed at a general meeting of your Society?—About forty members met and discussed the subject, and the answers were adopted unanimously. I am distinctly authorised to speak in the Society's name.

2030. Is the existing system of appointment of Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved in this Province?—It is highly approved, but they would propose a few amendments. *First*, they desire that the number of appointments should be enlarged, the number now available being too small; also the salary of Rs. 200 paid during the probationary period is too small, as the position is a very high one, and necessitates much expenditure; Rs 300 should be the lowest salary paid. The Statutory Civilians should get at least Rs. 50 more than an Extra Assistant. Upon passing the period of probation the salary should be equal to that of the Covenanted Civilians, if the Government desires to place the two Services on an equal footing; but, if it should not be considered expedient to do this, there should not be more than 20 per cent. difference between the two rates of pay. It is by reason of this disparity in salary that the Statutory Civilians are not regarded with the respect which is due to them, either by the public or by the members of the Civil Service. There is also a feeling that Government should, in making future nominations, consider the classes of the population, namely, Hindu and Mahomedan, and should distribute the appointments accordingly. The system of recruitment of Statutory Civilians, which was introduced by our present Lieutenant-Governor, is very much

The *President*—continued.

favoured and should be continued. It is necessary that Government should have the power to nominate to these posts, because in making selections, both moral and intellectual qualifications ought to be considered. On the other hand, should a system of competition be introduced, it would only test one class of qualifications, namely, the intellectual attainments, and character and social position would not receive their fair share of consideration. In the case of selection, the Society thinks that it would be as well to supplement it with an educational test up to the Entrance or B.A. standard. As regards the definition of "Natives of India" the Society would prefer the words "*permanently settled*" to "*habitually resident.*" By "permanently settled" the Society understands a person who has no intention of leaving this country or who may have acquired property herein, or in any other way shown his intention to remain.

2031. What are the classes which should be proportionately represented: will you tell us how you divide the population?—In the Punjab, at any rate, the two great classes are Mahomedans and Hindus. Among Hindus we include *Sikhs*.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

2032. In what class would you put Native Christians?—They should be considered separately, in accordance with the proportion they bear to the population; and provision should be made for them accordingly. Members of the *Brahmo Somaj* would be included amongst Hindus, and *Jains* and *Khatris* also.

2033. Regarding leave, pay, and pension of the Statutory Civilians, it is the opinion of the Society that it would be better to put them on the same footing as Covenanted Civilians?—If it is decided to make any distinction, then a difference of 20 per cent. should be the utmost limit. Pensions should be fixed in the same proportion.

2034. What disadvantages, if any, do Natives labour under, as regards competition in England for the Civil Service?—The first objection is that the age-limit is too low. Twenty-three would be the preferable maximum, but it should not be lower than twenty-two. The same marks should be allotted to Arabic and Sanscrit as to Latin and Greek.

2035. What does your Society think with regard to the claim of Statutory Civilians for admission to the Covenanted Civil

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

Service?—They think that at least one-half of the appointments should be reserved for the Statutory Civilians, and the other half for Covenanted Civilians.

2036. Does the present system of holding the examination for the Civil Service in England meet the Society's views?—We prefer to have the examination in England only, but yet, if it should be decided to hold it also in India, we think that it should be held provincially, seeing that every Province has not reached the same degree of advancement, and they could not compete on equal terms. With regard to the Punjab, the appointments should be competed for between Hindus and Mahomedans separately, because otherwise Mahomedans would not have a chance. Hindus are so much more advanced in the matter of education. There are a great many respectable Mahomedan families in the Province, and formerly, the posts of Extra Assistant Commissioners were recruited from them, but of late years, owing to the system of competition, the supply of members of these families for those posts has fallen off. If, however, the competition could be so arranged as to be held separately amongst Hindus and Mahomedans, this grievance would be removed.

Sir *Charles Turner*.—continued.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter*.

2037. At the meeting of your Society, at which these answers were settled, were any Hindu members present?—There were four Hindus present. They raised no objection. There were no educated Hindus at the meeting. The agricultural classes are the back-bone of the British Government, and the Society thinks that it would be as well if, in making appointments, a preference be given to the members of Zemindari families. There are some young men of these families at Bagwanpura who might be selected. Two are just entering the B. A. examination, and two are less advanced.

WITNESS XXXI.—21st December 1886.

Examination of Pandit GOPI NATH, one of the Editors of the *Akhbar-i-Am*, a vernacular newspaper published at Lahore.

The *President.*

2038. You edit a vernacular paper, I believe?—I am one of the Editors of the *Akhbar-i-Am*, which has been established for sixteen years. Its circulation is 3,000 copies, and is increasing rapidly amongst every class of the community. It is printed in Urdu. I am a Kashmiri Pandit. My family has been long resident in the Punjab. I was born in the Punjab, and am twenty-five years of age.

2039. On what points do you desire to give evidence?—I should like to say a few words on the working of the Statutory system, and the mode of selection for that Service, and also upon the competition in England for the Indian Civil Service.

2040. Let us hear you first then as to the working of the Statutory system?—The general feeling as regards the Statutory system is not that of satisfaction, and the dissatisfaction exists particularly among those who understand the subject.

There are several grounds of dissatisfaction—first, the selection of persons without due regard to their competence. People are anxious to enter the service of Government, because it is remunerative and respectable, and Natives think themselves well qualified for it. Second, the definition of "Natives of India" should be so framed as not to allow any one to be considered as such and as a European British subject at one and the same time.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

2041. Are you a member of the Indian Association?—I am, but not a regular member. I was not present when the Association framed the answers to the printed questions. The third ground of objection is that the mode of selection does not include competition. Competition ought to be observed rather than patronage. The higher posts ought to be thrown open to the selected men, and the proportion of posts allotted to the Statutory Service should be increased to at least one-third.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

2042. Why are you fixing one-third?—Of course we should prefer more than one-third; we should like the whole of the posts, but as we think that is perhaps more than we shall be likely to get at present, we ask for what we may reasonably expect to get.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

2043. You fix one-third without regard to the efficiency of the Service?—We think the Natives are qualified for the posts, and ought to be encouraged; and we think that the Commission is sitting for the encouragement of the Natives. After due consideration of the question, we therefore ask all that we can reasonably expect to get.

2044. Have you ever considered how many European officers it might be necessary to keep in a certain Province and how many Natives you might have who would do the work equally well?—I think there are very few posts in which Natives cannot do pretty well. In almost every post Natives work with as much credit as Europeans.

The *President.*

2045. When two thousand Akazais came over the edge of the Black Mountain the Assistant Commissioner of Oghi charged them at the head of fifty men of the Guides; do you think that if there had been a Native Assistant Commissioner at Oghi, the same result would have followed?—Oh yes! if he had been filling the same responsible position, with the same independence as Europeans have. All European Assistant Commissioners are not alike, and so all Native Assistant Commissioners cannot be alike.

(Reverting to the Statutory Civilians.) Owing to their not getting posts of higher responsibility and higher pay, they were in many cases of inferior education. They are considered inferior in many respects by the general public. As regards *nomination*, I have to say that if the head of the Government is always like our present benevolent Governor, nominations will be regarded with perfect confidence by the Native community of the Province; but otherwise they would be inclined to think that the higher officials wish to secure unlimited powers of patronage and would not always consider a man's qualifications. Nomination has this disadvantage also—the richer classes will always wish to seek the good-will of those whom they know to have the power of patronage.

2046. How would you test a candidate's merit?—Merit and ability can be best proved by a preliminary examination of general intelligence; moral character should also be ascertained by every possible means. The examination ought to be

The *President*—continued.

separate for each Province as the vernaculars differ.

2047. What are your views as to the limit of age?—The limit of age should be raised; this is most necessary.

2048. Would you have a college for Indian candidates?—It is not necessary to have any Indian Civil Service College here for the Statutory Civil Service.

2049. Is the competitive system for the Covenanted Service favourably regarded by the Natives?—No, competition in England for the Indian Civil Service is not favourably looked upon. It should not be necessary to proceed to England. The examination being for the Indian Civil Service, it should be held only in India. Facilities may be given to the candidates in England who may desire to compete in India for the Indian Civil Service; there should be no examination in England at all; or, if that cannot be, I would have one examination in England and one examination for all India.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

2050. Amongst the Kashmiri Pandit class, is there any objection to go to England?—No; but an examination in England is not required; if it is held, the Natives of India are certainly at a great disadvantage. If the examination is held in India, the limit of age should be higher for those who come from England to compete If the age of the Indian candidate is fixed at twenty years, I would give one year more to the candidate from England. If, on the other hand, the examination is held in England, the Native of India should get a year more than those who are in England.

2051. Do Indian colleges provide the necessary training?—Yes, they give sufficiently high education. I speak of colleges throughout India generally, and in the Punjab.

2052. Are there no political or other objections to holding the competitive examinations entirely in India?—There can be no objection on any political or other ground against the examination being held in India. No Province will be found backward; the aspiration being a high one, even the most backward Province will come to the front in a very short time. Moreover, the vernacular of the Province being retained as a subject, free scope will thus be given to the aspirants.

2053. In the Madras Presidency there are half a dozen vernaculars in use, would you examine in all of them?—I would confine the examination to the language used in the Courts. Unless the examination is held in India, the idea will always prevail that it is being held in England for the benefit of the English students. There is no need to fix a preliminary standard of education; and as for moral character, a special certificate, on oath, from the head of the institution where the candidate has been brought up will be necessary. The only consideration to be observed is that the candidate does not belong to a disloyal family.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

2054. As to the subjects of the examination, what would you suggest?—Indian Vernaculars, Indian History, &c., should be included, and the Indian classics should have the same marks as the European classics.

2055. Would you require a training in England?—I see no reason why going to England should be made compulsory. There is no reason why one cannot be considered fit for the Indian Civil Service unless one goes to England. In the schools political education should be imparted by means of high class English periodicals such as the *Nineteenth Century*, and other Reviews, &c. If more attention is paid to the higher education in Indian schools and colleges, they can very well supply a higher educational standard.

2056. Do representatives of the class who, under Native rulers, carried on the administration of the country enter the public Service?—Yes.

2057. Is there any religious or other objection in the Punjab to a journey to England?—The journey is objected to only on the ground of expense, want of suitable company, and the uncertainty of success. By want of suitable company I mean want of suitable social introductions when the candidate arrives in England. It does not involve any loss of social position. The Native is excluded from the public Service if the examination is held in England unless the Government comes forward to bear expense.

2058. Would you make any special provision for the professional classes, in order that they might be selected for employment when they displayed merit and ability?—There is no need of any special provision for the professional classes, they can appear at the examination.

2059. What would you do to fill up judicial appointments. Would you fill them from the Bar?—Yes, but they would have to compete for them.

2060. Do you consider a thorough knowledge of English would be essential in candidates?—No, as the candidates can be tested by periodical examinations after selection.

2061. Would you include subjects of Native States in persons eligible for selection?—The subjects of all Native States in alliance with the Crown ought to be eligible for appointments in the Punjab. I approve of a system of nomination for Extra Assistant Commissioners, Tahsildars and Munsiffs.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

2062. Do you know how many Civil Service appointments are vacant every year?—I think not more than five.

WITNESS XXXII.—22nd December 1886.

Examination of Nawab ABDUL MAJID KHAN, MULTANI, Honorary Magistrate and Municipal Commissioner, Lahore; Fellow of the Punjab University.

Note.—Nawab Abdul Majid Khan belongs to the Suddozai tribe of Afghans. The history of the family goes back to about the year 1600 A. D., and its leaders were for many years rulers of the Multan territory, under the Emperors of Delhi, and the Durani invaders from Afghanistan (1747). In 1771 they came into collision with the Sikhs, and in 1816 the Sikhs conquered their country and nearly exterminated the family. Nawab Surfaraz Khan, uncle of the present Nawab, used his influence in favour of the British Government in 1848. Nawab Abdul Majid Khan is a scholar and learned in the Yunani system of medicine. He is a man much respected in Lahore, and has proved a useful Honorary Magistrate and Municipal Commissioner. He is a most loyal subject of Her Majesty. He was born in 1817.

The *President.*

2063. Nawab Sahib, you belong to the family of the Multani Nawabs, do you not?—Yes, sir, for eight generations my family held the Nawabship of that part of the country. We came to Lahore about sixty years ago. I was born at Multan and came to Lahore when I was young, some sixty years ago.

2064. Do you remember the days of Sikh rule?—Certainly I do.

2065. What was the condition of things then in regard to the security of life and property and the development of the country?—There was no protection for life and property. Murdered men were continually found lying outside the gates. Within and without the city there was no security for life, and they call that state of things the *Sikha Shahi* to this day.

2066. Were there any good roads?—Certainly not.

2067. Were there any schools?—There were some schools at the Musjids, but no State or Government schools.

2068. Were there any dispensaries or hospitals for the sick?—No

2069. Were there any schools of medicine?—There was a class of schools for the Hakims.

2070. Is there much difference between the present state of things and the state of things then existing? If so, to what would you attribute it?—Yes, a great difference, and I attribute it to the change in the ruling power.

The *President*—continued.

2071. Is that ruling power now conducted upon Oriental principles or upon English principles?—Upon English principles.

2072. Would you like to see the influence and control and supervision of the English Government, as at present maintained, in any way diminished or transferred to other hands?—No, the present administration is all that can be desired.

2073. Do you consider that if Natives of the Province were put in the position of, for instance, Deputy Commissioners or Commissioners, to any great extent, the same efficiency of supervision and control would probably be maintained for any length of time?—It would have very unsatisfactory results, as race feeling as between Hindus and Mahomedans is always to be feared. Executive offices should not be given to Natives.

2074. What class of offices do you think might properly be filled by Natives?—Assistant and Extra Assistant Commissionerships.

The *Witness* (addressing the President)—My friend Fakir Syad Kamarruddin Sahib, who is here present also, and myself have prepared a short answer to the questions sent to us. The following statement was read:—

There is no feeling of dissatisfaction regarding the existing Statutory system among the people of good and high families in our Province. The system is exceedingly acceptable, especially to the Mahomedans. There is no objection whatever to the Statute itself nor to the rules framed thereunder.

In my opinion the existing mode of recruiting Statutory Civilians is very proper, because the selection rests with the Local Government. In case of there being an open competition or some other similar examination, most of those who would be successful and would be admitted into the Service, would be persons who could learn books by rote like partots, but who might, in practical administration, prove entirely inefficient. A system of competition would admit persons whose character might be very defective as regards morality, respectability, and honesty. It would also admit persons whose social position might be of such a character as would degrade, in the opinion of the public, the offices to which they are appointed; on the contrary, if the

The *President*—continued.

nominations are made by the Local Government, the latter would, from their local knowledge and experience, most certainly select people whom they personally know to be in every way fitted for such offices or posts. The selections heretofore made by Government,—take, for instance, those of Gurdial Singh, Kazi Mahomed Aslam Khan, Sardar Mahomed Afzal Khan and others,—have proved to be very good ones. It is possible that Government might make an occasional mistake in a selection; but as the people have implicit confidence in the Local Government, they feel sure that this would rarely happen, and the selections generally made are a source of great satisfaction. I would not therefore recommend either a limited or an open competition, but would prefer the system of nomination by the Government, subject to the provisions and tests heretofore in force. It would, of course, be better if the people so selected were sent to England for training, before the period of probation. It is, however, necessary for me to add that if the Statutory Service were subjected to any such conditions as the imposition of a competitive examination, the practical result would be the almost entire exclusion of Mahomedans from a share of Government appointments. At the present moment the Mahomedans are, as compared with other classes of their fellow-country men, in great poverty and in a pitiable condition. If select and respectable Mahomedans were to lose the support given to them by the Government in the way of appointments, the entire class of Mahomedans would be reduced to a deplorable condition. The steady improvement and rise of the one class, and the steady degradation and fall of the other, might, on political grounds, appear, perhaps, to be undesirable. The Local Government will make their selections according to the classes of the population and the wants of their respective Provinces, and in this way a proper proportion of Hindus and Mahomedans will be maintained.

The competitive examination in England should remain as it is. The Government might, if it thought proper, raise the limit of age to twenty-four years, making no difference whatever in the competitive examination between the English and the Native candidates, and fixing the same limit of age for all classes alike.

I would not desire to have a competitive examination in India for the Indian Civil Service. To institute such a competitive examination would be a sad mistake on administrative and political grounds; for, speaking generally, members of those high families who have for generations held offices under the Government for the time being, and who have an earnest desire to enter the service of the British Government, would be deprived of all chance of such office under a system such as that referred to. If an open competition were instituted, all offices would be filled by Bengalis; and if an examination were instituted in each Province, the Hindus alone would be found to hold all the high offices. Considering all existing circumstances, it is desirable that Government appointments in each Province should be shared by Hindus and Mahomedans in proportion to their respective provincial population. The most important point which commends itself for consideration is that the system of education, as it now exists in India, does not produce as competent men, to fill high posts, as the system of education in England does.

In my opinion, deserving members of the Uncovenanted Service should certainly be promoted to appointments in the Covenanted Service without any kind of distinction of Europeans, Eurasians and other members.

I strongly protest against the opinion that the Executive appointments should be given to the Natives. The number of such appointments heretofore opened to the Natives is sufficient.

If Executive appointments be bestowed upon Natives, the recent and daily increasing animosity between the Hindus and the Mahomedans will give rise to unpleasant difficulties, and the weaker class will generally go to the wall.

2075. What do you understand by the Subordinate Executive appointments?—I mean subordinate as compared with the highest posts Natives ought not to be appointed Commissioners and Deputy Commissioners. The door of employment is wide enough for them already.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

2076 If a Native distinguished himself for his honesty and ability as an Assistant Commissioner, would you not appoint him to be a Deputy Commissioner?—It was proved at Umballa, Hoshiarpore, Delhi and all those places that Natives are not fit to control a district in a case of emergency. I do not desire that either Hundus or Mahomedans shall fill such posts.

2077. What is your experience of Tahsildars as a class? Are they honest and trustworthy men?—They are fairly good men. I have never heard of dishonesty on their part. I have no personal experience of the dishonesty of such officials and Extra Assistant Commissioners.

2078. You say men of good family should be appointed to posts by nomination, but how would you guarantee their efficiency?—The Government would Satisfy itself as to that before nominating them.

Mr. *Peacock.*

2079. You said that the Subordinate Uncovenanted Service, that is to say, Munsiffs, Tahsildars and Extra Assistant

Mr. *Peacock*—continued.

Commissioners, ought to be recruited from all classes. Did you mean to include Europeans?—I would have no exclusion of any kind. I would leave the choice to the experience of the Government; they would decide.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

2080. Under the Sikh rule were Mahomedans employed in the Government Service?—Certainly

2081. In high offices?—Yes.

2082. And Hindus from other parts of Hindustan also?—Occasionally.

WITNESS XXXIII.—22nd December 1886.

Examination of Fakir SYAD KAMAR-UD-DIN, Honorary Magistrate and Municipal Commissioner, Lahore; Fellow of the Punjab University.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Fakir *Syad Kamar-ud-din.*

Note.—The Fakir family of Lahore is one of the historic families of the Punjab. It is traced back to one Julal-ud-din, who lived in the seventh century of the Mahomedan era. The family claims descent from the Bukhariat Syads. Aziz-ud-din, uncle of Kamar-ud-din, rose to distinction under Sikh rule. Aziz-ud-din and his father before him practised medicine, and Aziz-ud-din became physician to Maharaja Ranjit Singh Aziz-ud-din soon became a trusted adviser, and he always counselled the Maharaja to avoid a collision with the British power. Aziz-ud-din was often employed on Military Service, and his influence at the Lahore Court continued until after the death of Maharaja Ranjit Singh. The family has always been renowned for honesty, scholarship and courtly bearing. Kamar-ud-din is the son of Nur-ud-din, a brother of Aziz-ud-din's. Nur-ud-din was closely associated with Aziz-ud-din, in the conduct of negotiations with the British Government. There are several other distinguished members of the family, many of whom either have served or are serving the British Government. Fakir Syad Kamar-ud-din has led a somewhat retired life, though he has always shown an interest in local affairs and found a pleasure in being of use to Government officers.

The *President.*

2083. Your father was the brother of the great Fakir Aziz-ud-din of Sikh fame?—Yes, my father was Fakir Nur-ud-din. Aziz-ud-din was Maharaja Ranjit Singh's trusted adviser and distinguished physician.

2084. He was largely employed by Maharaja Ranjit Singh in his negotiations with the British?—Yes, and after his death my father Nur-ud-din was largely employed in the same way. I was born in 1827 during the reign of Maharaja Ranjit Singh, and am now about 59 years of age.

2085. Do you remember the state of things during the Maharaja Ranjit Singh's rule?—Yes, certainly. I have heard what the last witness (Nawab Abdul Majid Khan) said of the condition of things under Sikh rule, and I entirely agree with him.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

2086. If Native gentlemen, whether Hindus or Mahomedans, have distinguished themselves by their integrity and ability, and are well qualified for the posts, should they not be appointed Commissioners and Deputy Commissioners?—In my opinion, no.

2087. Your uncle was a Mahomedan?—Yes.

2088. And Ranjit Singh was a Sikh Hindu?—Yes.

2089. And yet he placed complete confidence in a Mahomedan?—Yes.

2090. Had he any reason to repent of doing so?—No.

2091. Why then do you say that Hindus and Mahomedans are unfit to have the same confidence placed in them by the British Government?—Between the state things to-day and the state of things in those days there is a vast difference. At the present time the virtue of honesty is not much valued by the people.

2092. From your experience of Native officials do you say that they are not so honest as they were in Ranjit Singh's day?—I cannot give a decided opinion as to honesty, but what I really mean is this, that in those days Hindus and Mahomedans were more friendly than they are now. But at the present day there is a great deal of friction between them.

2093. To what do you ascribe that friction?—To many considerations which I do not care to dilate upon.

The *President.*

2094. Our methods of administration are different now to what they were then?—Yes, qualifications which were then necessary are not the same as those now required.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

2095. Would you not feel pleased if high families, such as yours, were placed in positions of trust under the British Raj, like that your uncle held under Ranjit Singh?—I should not approve of it. There is a vast difference in the two administrations.

WITNESS XXXIV.—22nd December 1886.

Examination of NARAIN DAS, M. A., of the Uncovenanted Service, Extra Assistant Commissioner, Punjab.

The *President.*

2096. You are a graduate and entered the service by competition, did you not?—Yes, I am M.A. of the Calcutta University. I have passed the high proficiency standard of the Punjab University as well. I am an Extra Assistant Commissioner, and was appointed by competition in 1882. I was one of the first who passed. I have been in the service nearly four years. I am serving now at Shahpur. My pay is Rs. 300, and my powers are those of a first class Magistrate and of a first class Munsiff.

2097. Is the existing system of appointing Natives, as Statutory Civilians, to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service, approved in this Province?—It is not; the grounds of disapprobation are:—(1) against the Statute because of its limited character; (2) against the rules because they do not seem to contemplate the crucial test of fitness according to which the appointments to high posts in the service of Her Majesty should alone be made; also, because the defects in the present rules are capable of being used as arguments against the fitness of Natives to fill the higher posts in the public Service. The system further professes to place the nominees in a position which, in practice, they do not enjoy; they are in a false position in fact.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

2098. What do you mean by that?—I mean that they are called Civil Servants, but are not actually in the position of Civil Servants; that is to say, they do not belong to any regular organized Service. I propose, as a test of fitness, that the nominees should possess the highest education that can be had in the country. The reason for the adoption of an educational test is the peculiar condition of the country. I mean to say, then, in country governed by Europeans, and where we, as the governed classes, are placed in competition with Europeans, who belong to a state of society which is far above the state of society to which we belong, it is necessary that those of us who are selected for the higher posts, should be in a position to compare favourably with those who have received their education in England. Whatever be the system of recruitment, the men who are chosen for posts in the public service, should have this as a necessary qualification, in addition to

Sir *Chirles Turner*—continued.

any other which may be proposed. The rules should be amended (1) in the direction of regulating the mode of appointments; (2) by fixing the proper proportion of appointments; (3) by regulating the pay. The Statute should also be so amended as to include Natives of feudatory States under the definition "Natives of India." Should it not be thought expedient to amend the present rules under which the competitive examination is held, the appointments should be made by a system of competition and nomination combined; the nominees being in a proportion of one to three, and being selected from deserving members of the Uncovenanted Service, and members of the Bar of not less than five years' standing. The competition should be open to all M.A's. under twenty-five years of age; and also to Extra Assistant Commissioners of five years' standing, who choose to go in at the bottom of the list; and all others, being under twenty-five years of age, who for special reasons may be allowed by the Local Government to compete. Instead of the completion of the training in England being made obligatory, inducements might be held out to candidates. Should a change be made in the regulations governing the recruitment for the Services, so as to enable Natives to proceed to England, I would not have any competition for the Statutory Service, but would reserve the Service for the nominees of the Local Government only, but to be taken from members of the Bar and the Uncovenanted Service.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Narain Das, M. A.

Mr. *Ryland.*

2099. Would you admit domiciled Europeans?—If they come under the definition of Natives of India, I would; but not otherwise. I would leave the definition as it stands, except that I would include Natives of feudatory States in it. I would include also the sons of officers serving in this country, provided they were born in this country and permanently settled in it.

2100. Would you amend the Statute so as to make persons appointed under it members of a regular Service, and not merely holders of posts in it?—I would leave the Statute the limited character which it at present possesses. I would not admit Natives of India to the Covenanted Civil Service except by competition in England. The

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Narain Das, M. A.

Mr. *Ryland*—continued.

Statutory Service should be left open for Uncovenanted servants and members of the Bar. Those Europeans and those Eurasians who have permanently settled in India should possess equal rights with Natives of the country.

Mr. *Peacock*.

2101. You said you would open the service to all M.A.'s, you mean by competition?—You should have three classes of persons to compete; M.A.'s, Extra Assistant Commissioners of five years' standing, and nominees of Government from other classes; and they should all compete together.

2102. From your experience of this Province, do not the educated classes pay considerable respect to a man of good family?—Respect, so far as age is concerned, but not unless he possesses guarantees, other than of mere family, that he is fit for his post.

2103. You heard the last witness say that in any system of competition at present the Mahomedans would fare badly; is that your opinion?—If Mahomedans are not fit for the posts in which a high standard of education and ability is required, let them be appointed to other posts which do not require so much ability and intelligence.

The *President*.

2104. You would give men of good family an opportunity of competing by nomination of the Local Government, but should they be beaten by better men, you would let the better men have the appointments?—Yes.

2105. To what class is the feeling of dissatisfaction against the Statutory system limited?—To those who can make a distinction between the Covenanted and Uncovenanted Services.

2106. Is the feeling limited to the educated class, or common to the population?—To the educated class; the others do not, I think, possess any opinion on the subject.

2107. Are you a member of the *Indian Association*?—Yes, but have never had opportunities of being present at its meetings.

2108. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the present system of recruitment for the Covenanted Service?—The present regulations are not satisfactory, and the following changes are necessary if Natives are to be placed on a footing of equality with Europeans. The limit of age should be raised to twenty-three; Indian History and Indian Vernaculars (such as Hindi, Urdu, Bengali, Tamil and others) should be included in the subjects of examination. Sanscrit, Arabic and Persian should be substituted for French, German and Italian, and marks allotted according as the language is Indian or not; those languages which belong to India being given the preference, seeing that the Government of the country is conducted in India

The *President*—continued.

2109. Do Natives labour under any, and, if any, what disadvantages in competing for employment in this branch of the Service?—Yes, (1) on account of age; (2) distance and heavy expense of the voyage to England to appear in a competition where success is problematical.

2110. Would you establish scholarships and allow passage-money to Native candidates desiring to proceed to England to compete?—Yes; but only in case it is decided to hold the examination in England only.

2111. Would you have an examination in India held simultaneously with that held in England?—Yes, I would have simultaneous examinations in India and England; and, as far as possible, identical examinations. The appointments should be given according to the merits of the candidates.

2112. Would you apportion the appointments to the various Provinces, or according to race or otherwise?—I am against fixing proportions of appointments for Provinces, (1) because it is contrary to the Queen's Proclamation; (2) because it is against the principle of selection according to fitness, as I have laid it down; (3) because of the difficulty of defining the Natives of a Province, several races being found in every Province; for instance, Bengalis and others are found in the Punjab. Some distribution of appointments should therefore be made on the grounds of public convenience and not according to race. I object strongly to any apportionment being made among religious sects. It is opposed to the Queen's Proclamation, to the principle of selection according to fitness; and because it would create invidious distinctions and sectarian jealousy; and also because it would be setting a premium on incompetence, and throwing, thereby, a slur on the Native character. Moreover, it would be likely to lead to conversions not on religious grounds, but with a view to secure worldly advantage. I do not object to conscientious change of belief, but I do object to Government being a party to a scheme which might lead to a result such as I have indicated. I have heard of men who sent their wives to England, simply for the purpose of securing for their sons the privileges of British-born subjects. In the existing state of society in India the higher appointments should be regulated, not according to the proportion of inhabitants, but in proportion to the instructed portion of the inhabitants. The effect of such a system is also demoralizing, inasmuch as it does not encourage self-help, and rewards incompetence with unmerited gifts.

The *President*—continued.

2113. If the examination is held in England, should the successful candidates be required, as a condition obligatory, to proceed to England to complete their training?—I would make the visit to England compulsory for aspirants for the higher offices, as I think that a man who entertains religious objections to going to a foreign country is a person unfit to fill a position of responsibility.

Mr. *Stokes*.

2114. Do you really consider a knowledge of *Tamil* as useful to a young man as a knowledge of German?—I say that officers who have to administer the part of the country where *Tamil* prevails, ought to be acquainted with the language of the people.

2115. Should the Uncovenanted Service [meaning only Extra Assistant Commissioners, Munsiffs and Tahsildars] be recruited only from Natives of India as described in the Statute, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—Only from Natives as defined in the Statute, otherwise emigration to this country would be encouraged. There is a large class of Europeans already included in the definition, and I see no reason why it should be extended further than I have already said.

2116. And as regards the Europeans who are included in the definition, ought provision to be made for them, if it is not already made?—Yes.

2117. Should the recruitment be by competition or by nomination, or by both combined?—By both combined. I would divide the Services into the *higher* and the *lower* Services; the higher grade, *i.e.*, Extra Assistant Commissioners, should be selected by competition and nomination in the proportion of three to one. The competition should be open (1) to all graduates under twenty-five years of age; (2) to members of the Bar of five years' standing without limit as to age; (3) to Munsiffs and Tahsildars without limit as to age; (4) to such other officials as the Local Government may nominate; and (5) to such non-officials whom the Local Government, for special reasons, may think fit to nominate, they being under twenty-five years of age: this would include members of the aristocracy. Of course they would compete for their appointments. The nominees from Tahsildars and Munsiffs should have served for five years at least in their respective grades. Munsiffs should be admitted by competition only, which would be open (1) to graduates under twenty-five; (2) Naib Tahsildars; (3) members of the Bar after at least three years' practice at the profession, or such other officials as the Chief Court might nominate without limit as to age; (4) nominees of the Financial Commissioner under twenty-five years of age for special reasons.

Mr. *Stokes*—continued.

Tahsildars should be admitted by competition and nomination, in the proportion of one to competition to two to nomination. The competition to be the same as that for Munsiffs, provided the persons appointed served a period of probation of two years on full pay. Promotion from Naib Tahsildars and other financial appointments should be made by the Financial Commissioner. The above scheme is intended to be applied provincially.

2118. Whatever system be adopted, should the recruitment be made by the several Administrations only from persons resident in the territories under such Administrations respectively?—Yes, including residents of Native States under their respective Administrations.

2119. If the existing Statutory system is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes.

Mr. *Ryland*.

2120. Would you exclude Europeans from the Uncovenanted Service only because it is necessary to make provision for the Natives of other classes, whom you consider have a better right?—Yes, I have already given my reasons.

The *President*.

2121. Would not that be opposed to the Statute of William IV.?—It would be.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar*.

2122. Would you entirely exclude Natives of other Provinces from competing for posts in the Punjab? I would not exclude them entirely, but I would give the preference to Natives of the Province.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

2123. With regard to the higher appointments to the Judicial bench, would you have competition for them among the Bar, or allow appointment by nomination?—I should have no objection to a member of the Bar being admitted without competition, provided he was recommended by the Chief Court and recognized as fit by the Local Government.

The *President*.

2124. How is the present system of recruiting for the Subordinate Service (Extra Assistant Commissioners Munsiffs and Tahsildars) regarded in the Province?—I think it is looked upon as satisfactory; more satisfactory than the former system.

2125. Do you think it gives us better men?—Yes.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

2126. Are you satisfied with the present class of Tahsildars?—No.

2127. On what grounds?—First, because of their dishonesty. I think they are corrupt as a body, with a few exceptions.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

2128. Have you had any personal experience of them? Do you speak from your own knowledge?—I speak partly according to my experience, and partly from information obtained from reliable sources. I know of several instances.

The *President.*

2129. You have made a sweeping statement affecting a large body of Her Majesty's servants; how many cases of corruption have come to your personal knowledge?—Including in my personal knowledge, knowledge derived from reliable sources, about a dozen I think. There are a hundred and twenty Tahsildars in the Province. The majority have risen from the *Amla* class. I mean the majority of those to whom I specially refer. I am not in a position to make a comparison between Munsiffs and Tahsildars, but I think there are some Munsiffs who are corrupt. I mean by corrupt not only willing to take bribes, but also susceptible to influence; not strictly impartial, in fact.

2130. Should any distinction be made in the salaries allowed to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service, according as the posts are held by members of that branch of the service, or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches?—The salaries should be the same for all, but I would give special allowances to Civilians—(1) a personal allowance to those who enter through the English competition and whose pay is under Rs 700; (2) family allowances to married officers whose salaries range between Rs. 700 and Rs. 1,500. I would not give allowances to unmarried men with salaries above Rs. 700, and the allowance should cease in all cases when a salary of Rs. 1,500 is reached.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

2131. Under your scheme the pay of the posts would not vary accordingly as they were held by Europeans or Natives?—Oh! yes, except in the case of a Native gentleman who has succeeded in the competition in England; such men should have special allowances.

2132. Would you make any distinction as regards furlough rules?—Yes, but in favour of those persons only, whether Europeans or Natives, who desire to proceed to Europe or America

2133. You know the pay now received by Statutory Civilians?—Yes.

2134. Do you think it adequate?—I think it is too low; that is to say, the pay of the first appointment, Rs. 200, is too low.

2135. Are you aware that in Madras Native Judicial officers commence with a salary of Rs. 200 or less?—Yes.

2136. And that in other Provinces there are Judicial officers commencing on that salary?—In this Province Officiating Extra Assistant Commissioners of the lowest grade get Rs. 250; Munsiffs get Rs. 125.

2137. Does that attract good men?—Yes.

2138. Are there many Munsiffs who have taken the degree of B.A.?—There are some; since the recent change in the rules, B.A.'s have been getting into the service.

2139. You are an M.A. of Calcutta?—Yes.

2140. And you were glad to compete for an Extra Assistant Commissionership on Rs 250?—Yes.

2141. Am I to understand that if the Statutory Service had been open to competition, as you propose, you would not have competed for it?—No, I only say that the salary is considered too low by the generality of the people.

2142. But it is enough to induce B.A.'s and M.A.'s to come forward. Is it sufficient for their needs, or does it place them under temptation?—It is sufficient to live respectably on, and with freedom from temptation.

WITNESS XXXV.—22nd December 1886.

Examination of Pandit CHANDAR BAL, of the Uncovenanted Service; Extra Assistant Commissioner, Gurgaon, Punjab.

Pandit Chandar Bal said:—I am an Extra Assistant Commissioner. I was appointed in 1867 as clerk in the Peshawar Small Cause Court. I was appointed Extra Assistant Commissioner in 1876. My present salary is Rs. 300 per mensem. I am in the second class. I am a Native of Delhi. I am a member of the Indian Association, but I have never attended its meetings. I have no direct interest in any vernacular newspaper.

2143. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—No, on the grounds (1) of the general incompetency of the persons selected; (2) the arbitrary mode of selection.

2144. Are the defects of the existing system susceptible of remedy?—I would recruit by open competition from amongst persons of good education. The appointments should be to a regular service and not to specific posts.

2145. If the provisions of the Statute are not repealed, nor substantially amended so as to take away the powers conferred on the Local Administrations, should they be amended in respect of the description of persons on whose behalf such powers may be exercised, or in respect of the sanction required for appointments thereunder?—No, such amendments would be useless.

2146. If the Statutory Service is retained, should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training or should they be encouraged to do so?—I would compel them to do so, because I think the higher appointments should be made by open competition from amongst persons of good education. My own opinion is that the Statutory system should be abolished.

2147. Would you reserve power to the Local Government to appoint persons of proved merit and ability in the Uncovenanted Service to posts reserved for Covenanted Civilians?—Yes, if the Statute is retained.

Mr. *White.*

2148. Supposing that Europeans who have not yet domiciled themselves in this country were to domicile themselves under the Statute, do you think it would promote a like feeling between Europeans and Natives?—Yes, there would be a like feeling between them.

2149. So that a great many administrative difficulties would cease to exist?—Yes.

Mr. *Ryland.*

2150. But is there any objection on the part of the people to Europeans?—There is a feeling that the children of the soil have prior rights to the Native portion of the service. They entertain no prejudice or objection to Europeans.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Pandit *Chandar Bal.*

The *President.*

2151. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—Yes, the competitive examination should be held in India as well as in England. The number of marks allotted to the Indian classics should be raised to an equality with the European classics. Indian subjects and vernaculars should also be made subjects of examination, and the age of the Indian candidates should be raised to twenty-three.

2152. Would you also raise the age in the case of Europeans?—I have no objection to its being done. The amendments suggested in my former answer indicate the disadvantages under which Indian candidates labour at present. If the preliminary examination is not to be held in India, then scholarships and passage-money should be given to such deserving candidates, selected by competition, as cannot afford the journey at their own expense. I would have the examination in India and in England, and the Indian examinations should be held at more than one centre. The examinations should be identical Candidates should compete with one another and be selected in order of merit.

2153. Would you make any apportionment of appointments between residents of the territories of the several Administrations or among the members of the different religious sects?—No.

2154. If an examination is held in India, should the successful candidates be required, as a condition obligatory, to proceed to England to complete their training?—Yes, in order that this may make the Natives more efficient for the discharge of their duties.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

2155. What is your caste?—I am a Brahmin.

2156. Your brother went to England?—Yes, my younger brother went to England.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

2157. Is there any objection entertained by the members of your sect to going to England ?—Yes, there are objections, but not amongst the enlightened members.

2158. Is there anything in your religion, as you understand it, to prevent a man leaving India and going abroad ?—According to the doctrines of religion there are such objections, but, as I have already said, these doctrines have now no force amongst the enlightened.

2159. Is your brother an out-caste ?—No, he lives apart from us from choice. He married an English lady. We wanted him to join us again, but he would not mix with us, that is to say, he would not return to his caste. I wished him to return and we used considerable persuasion.

2160. Under what circumstances was he married ?—The ceremony took place in Bombay before a Magistrate.

2161. Would you have received him back ?—For my own part, yes, but the Pandits would have compelled him to perform certain purificatory ceremonies ; but, having performed these ceremonies, there would have been no distinction between him and me.

Mr. *Stokes.*

2162. You spoke of the Natives of this country having a prior right ?—I meant a prior right as Natives of the soil to share in the administration of the country.

2163. But is it not the employer who has a right to choose his servants ? What do you mean by a prior right ?—I mean a right to a greater share in the administration of the country.

2164. Why ?—It is only natural that they should have it.

2165. Have you ever thought the question out at all ?—(No answer).

The *President.*

2166. You say it is natural that the children of the soil should be employed to govern the country in preference to others ?—Yes, I say they have a right to a greater share in this employment.

2167. You object to the admission of Europeans, but is it not mainly due to the presence of Europeans and their administration of the country that India has progressed as much as it has ?—Yes.

2168. And does not that constitute a claim to consideration in regard to the government of this country ?—Yes, but the time has arrived when the children of the soil have come to know and understand their rights.

2169. Would it not be rather ungrateful to exclude those who have been of so much benefit to you ?—I do not mean that they should be excluded altogether. I would only give Natives the preference.

The *President*—continued.

2170. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in the Statute or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty ?—From Natives of India only.

2171. Should the recruitment be by competition or by nomination, or by both systems combined ?—By competition only, as I have already said.

2172. Are you satisfied with the system obtaining in these Provinces for the appointment of Extra Assistant Commissioners ?—The people have lately improved in education, and competition will greatly benefit the country.

2173. Are you in favor of the present system, that is to say, partly promotion and partly competition after nomination ?—Yes.

2174. Would you recruit from the Province or from the whole of India ?—No, the selection should be made by open competition in order of merit. There should be a general examination for India, and, as far as possible, the selected candidates should be appointed to their own Provinces, but I would have only one general list.

2175. If the existing Statutory Service is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service ?—Yes.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

2176. Would you like to see a system of competition introduced for the Tahsildars ?—Yes, the same as for Munsiffs.

2177. What do you think of the present class of Tahsildars; are they honest ?—Of those who are enlisted from among the officials I do not entertain any very good opinion. I refer to those who have been taken from the lower class. But, as regards those of the present incumbents who have been appointed after receiving a good education and passing an examination, I think they are an improvement.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

2178. Do you think that if you have a system of open competition in all India for the Uncovenanted Service many Punjabis would get in ?—Yes, I think so.

2179. But would the Uncovenanted Service in this Province remain in their hands ?—Yes.

2180. Do you think that Natives of other parts of India or Europeans who had no experience of the Punjab would make quite as efficient Tahsildars as members of this Province ?—They would not be as useful.

2181. Then why would you have open competition for all India ?—If Natives of other Provinces passed the examination with equal acquaintance with the customs, manners, and language of the Province, they would be as beneficial to the Province as others.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

2182. You could hardly test their knowledge of the manners of the Punjab by examination?—I should only appoint them to Judicial posts.

2183. Do you know what a Tahsildar's duties are?—They are executive duties.

2184. And bearing that in mind, do you still think you should select Tahsildars by open competition from all India?—Yes.

2185. Would you appoint members of the Bar by nomination to Judicial posts?—Yes, after they had gained some experience by practising for a certain number of years.

2186. To all Judicial offices or only to some?—To all. My own opinion is that every person should be selected by competition He should be well educated and equal to the discharge of his duties.

2187. But there are some people who are very well educated, but are unable to express themselves well in English. Would not such persons fall behind in a competition?—I would not require a knowledge of English in the case of Tahsildars.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

The *President.*

2188 Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service accordingly as the posts are held by members of that branch of the Service, or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches?—No, pay and pension should be the same for all classes of persons; but as regards persons who have successfully competed in England, they should get an extra personal allowance whilst serving in India As regards the Statutory Civilians and the position they were intended to occupy, I think the pay they at present get is too small.

2189. Is it adequate to attract sufficiently well-educated men into the Service?—Yes, it is sufficient.

WITNESS XXXVI.—22nd December 1886.

Examination of Lala AMOLAK RAM, of the Uncovenanted Service; Munsiff of Lahore.

Vol. I. Sec II. Punjab.

Lala *Amolak Ram*

Lala Amolak Ram stated: I am a Munsiff of the 3rd grade. I have been Munsiff since 1879. Before that I was clerk of the Sessions Court of Peshawar.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

2190. Do you belong to the Indian Association?—Yes, I am a member of the Indian Association. I was at the meeting when they adopted their replies to the questions. Generally I agree with them, but there are points of difference. I will now state my views.

Abolish the Statutory Service altogether. In lieu of it grant the following facilities to the Indians for entering the Covenanted Service through the competitive examination at present held in England:—(*a*) Hold the examination at some place in India simultaneously with the examination in England; (*b*) add to the subjects of the preliminary competitive examination the Indian Vernaculars, *e.g.*, Hindi, Bengali, Urdu, Gujrati, Tamil, &c., as against the Continental European languages, and Indian History as against the English History; (*c*) raise the maximum marks allotted to the Indian classics to an equality with those allotted to the European classics; (*d*) raise the limit of age for the Indian candidates to twenty-two.

There should be only one examination for all the Indian Provinces and peoples, and graduates alone ought to be admitted to the competition.

Provision should be made in the Indian colleges and schools for a more extended study of English and the Physical Sciences. Physical exercises should be included as an optional subject in the academical courses of the Indian Universities.

Chairs of European classics and Continental languages should also be created at some at least of the Indian colleges.

The successful candidates of the Indian centre should receive a two years' training in England.

If the carrying out of the above suggestions in their entirety be impracticable, then retain the Statutory Service, but amended as suggested below, along with the Indians' right to compete in England.

The Statute and rules should be amended so as to admit the Indians to the General Service (Covenanted), and not to specific appointments only. The proof of ability and merit should be specified, and not left

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

to the discretion of the Government of India, and its test should be an open competition among all graduates under twenty-three years of age, who can produce a certificate of good character and physical fitness. The examination should be one for the whole of India. The proportion of admissions under the Statute should be raised from one-third to one-half. The definition of Natives should be so amended as to include only the persons who are permanently settled in India, and are not European British subjects, for the purposes of the criminal law.

The selected candidates should undergo a two years' probation. They should have the option of passing the probationary period in England, and should be encouraged to avail themselves of this option by the providing of special recognitions and rewards similar to those that are granted to the Civilians for qualifying themselves in the Indian classics and vernaculars, especially the frontier languages. The Statutory servants should be trusted and employed in all respects equally with the Covenanted servants.

The pay of the posts should be the same for both. An allowance like the frontier allowance might be granted to persons entering the service through the competition in England.

The result of the candidate's probation should be reported upon by a committee, which may include the officers under whom the candidate has been serving.

The *President.*

2191. When you say that the proof of ability and merit should be specified, what do you mean us to understand?—I meant by distinct definition of the words "merit and ability."

2192. What do you mean by the words "for the purposes of the criminal law"?—I mean that the definition should be so amended as to include only those persons who are not entitled to take advantage of the criminal law relating to European British subjects.

2193. You mean that if a European, who is not at present a Native of India, chooses to give up the privileges he can claim under the Criminal Procedure Code, he may be included within the definition of Natives of India?—Yes, in order that

The *President*—continued.

such persons may be more in sympathy with us.

Mr. *White.*

2194. You do not object to the European as an individual?—Certainly not.

2195. And if he should fulfil the condition, you would surely be glad to welcome him?—Yes, most glad to welcome him.

2196. Would you merely compel or encourage men of the Statutory Service to go to England?—I would encourage them only.

2197. And the men who would pass the competitive examination for the Civil Service?—I would compel them to go.

Mr. *Peacock.*

2198. Do you approve of the age-limit being raised in the case of Europeans also?—I have recommended it in order to give the Natives a fairer chance; I know the Europeans do not want the age raised, but I believe we shall get better men if they enter the Service at a later age.

2199. But if you riase the age-limit for Europeans, will not your chance be smaller than it is now?—I don't think it would make any great difference.

2200. You say that selected candidates should have the option of passing the probationary period in England, on conditions similar to those that are granted to Civilians for qualifying themselves in the Indian classics and vernaculars, especially the frontier languages. I suppose you would not have rewards given to them for passing high standards in Indian languages?—I mean that Statutory Civilians should be encouraged to go to England and qualify themselves there in some way or other,

Mr. *Peacock*—continued.

and if thay do that they may be given a reward.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

2201. If you have two examinations, one in England and the other in India, should they be identical?—Yes.

2202. Would you make any apportionment between the residents in the territories of the several Administrations respectively, or between the members of the several religious sects?—No.

2203. Would you get men by competition in India as good as you get by competition in England?—I think so.

2204. Would you have the examination for the Uncovenanted Service conducted provincially?—I myself would prefer one for all India. It is possible that under such a system we might be excluded for some time, but that is no reason why we should have incompetent men.

2205. Would you make your appointments of members of the legal profession for the Judicial Service by nomination or competition?—When senior men are required I would have nomination, but when selection is made from the junior members, competition. We could not expect men of advanced years to compete

2206. Up to what age do you think men would be willing to compete?—Up to thirty at the utmost.

2207. Have you any experience of the local Bar? Yes.

2208. Are there many men in it competent to fill Judicial appointments?—I do not know if they possess so high a competence as I would wish, but even in the present state of the Bar it contains better men than some of those at present in the Subordinate Judicial Service.

WITNESS XXXVII.—22nd December 1886.

Examination of MAHOMED SHAH, Nominee of the *Anjuman-i-Islamia* Society of Amritsar, Punjab.

Vol. I. Sec II. Punjab.

Mahomed Shah.

Mahomed Shah said:—I am a Native of Amritsar and a Pleader. I am a member of the *Anjuman-i-Islamia* Society of Amritsar, and am deputed to represent the views of that Society. The Society consists of about fifty members, and its President is Khan Mahomed Shah, a man of influence. The *Anjuman-i-Islamia* Society have formally adopted answers to the printed list of questions sent to them. These answers* were adopted at a full meeting of the Society, and no one entered a dissentient voice. Briefly they are as follows:—

The upper and lower classes of Native society appreciate the spirit in which the system is conceived, but the rising middle classes are dissatisfied with it.

A fair stage and no favour policy is naturally commendable to the middle classes: they strongly dislike those who enter the service by the back door of favouritism, and not by the open door of competition. With a desire inherent in human nature they endeavour to ameliorate their condition. Their ambitious minds supply them a motive power to push up.

The feeling of dissatisfaction is directed against both the Statute and the rules framed thereunder.

The Statute is objected to on the ground that the persons appointed by virtue thereof cannot claim as of right all the appointments within the reach of the Civilians.

According to the terms of Section 6 of the Statute the discretion of appointing Statutory Civilians resides in the Government of India, this method does not find favour with the middle classes. Moreover the limit of one-fifth, as prescribed by the rules, is too low.

We understand that Section 6 of the Statute is primarily intended for the children of the soil, and it contemplates opening the hitherto closed door of the Covenanted Civil Service to Natives of India as defined in the criminal law of the land. In our opinion those who are anxious to derive benefits from the Statute must submit to all the disadvantages and disabilities to which the Indians are liable. We therefore desire the amendment of the definition of the words "Natives of India."

Education has taken gigantic strides and has permeated the various strata of Native society. The Indians, in the words of Robert Cust, are notoriously fitted for high posts. Their increased knowledge has naturally inspired them with a legitimate desire to secure lucrative appointments. The members of ancient families, whose ancestors were the administrators and conspicuous statesmen of the country, desire to follow the footsteps of their forefathers and to satisfy their aspirations. Besides these reasons there are hundreds of others, such as want of technical education, &c., that actually oblige educated men to seek Government employments.

We suggest the following amendment:—"Natives of India" shall include any person born and domiciled within the dominions of Her Majesty in India, of parents who are amenable to the same criminal law and procedure in force in India as the Native Indian subjects, and who are habitually resident in India.

Mr. *Ryland.*

2209. You say "preference should be given to Natives" in one of your answers, and in another place you accept the very just and reasonable proposition that there should be a "fair stage," and you have also been liberal enough to admit Europeans into the Uncovenanted Service; is this not a little inconsistent?—I do not think there is any inconsistency. We say that the middle classes are generally against nomination, and we have represented their views. It is not the sentiment of the *Anjuman* which is represented, but only the general feeling prevailing among the middle classes; and the *Anjuman* is of opinion that if all the natural-born subjects of Her Majesty be allowed to enter the Uncovenanted Service that Service will be swamped by Europeans, and even Canadians, Australians, and Americans, would claim the benefit of that section and come here to compete for service or ask the Government to give them posts. For these two reasons the *Anjuman* is of opinion that the Uncovenanted Service should be reserved exclusively for Natives of India of pure descent.

Mr. *White.*

2210. What do you mean by Natives of pure descent?—I mean the children of the soil.

2211. As defined in the Statute?—No, we do not mean Statutory Natives, but the real Natives—Natives of pure Indian origin.

2212. Do you exclude Eurasians?—Yes.

* The written answers of the Society will be printed in full in Section III, Sub-section A, of Volume I.

Mr. *White*—continued.

2213. Are you aware that there are some Eurasians whose families have been here for considerably over a century?—They cannot be looked upon as pure Natives, as their traditions are such that they do not wish to mix with Natives, and are therefore out of touch and sympathy with the Natives.

2214. Then how would you define pure Natives so as to exclude such persons?—With reference to the definition in the Criminal Procedure Code, I believe that all persons whose grandfathers or fathers were Europeans have certain privileges, but if a man's family is so old and has been living in India for such a length of time as to have lost all trace of their origin, then I think the *Anjuman* would have no objection to his being appointed to any post which is exclusively set apart for Natives of India.

2215. Is a Mahomedan, whose grandfather came from Persia, a Native?—Yes, because he is subject to the same criminal law. The test is subjection to the same criminal law and procedure as Natives of pure descent.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

2216. If the Ilbert Bill had been passed in its original form, would you then have had any objection to throw open the whole Service to Europeans?—I do not think there would have been any objection; our objection is not on the score of nationality, but of difference of law and privileges.

Mr. *Peacock.*

2217. Your Society were asked if objections were entertained to going to England, and they reply, "By the majority of Hindus and Mahomedans, excepting the educated classes of the community." Again your Society say that "Our own personal experience has convinced us that the journey to and residence in England does not entail such hardships upon Hindu gentlemen." In one place you say that the majority of the Hindu and Mahomedan community object to go to England, and in another you say that, according to your own personal experience, they do not labour under any disability. How do you reconcile these two statements?—By the majority of Hindus and Mahomedans we mean only such as are not well educated and whose prejudices are deep-rooted. But if any one goes to England, he is not on his return regarded as an out-caste.

2218. Then I understand the meaning to be that in the opinion of your Society, though there may be some objection amongst the old-fashioned class, yet, as a matter of fact, if either a Hindu or a Mahomedan does go, he is received back into society on his return?—Yes.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

2219. You say there are fifty members in your Society?—Yes.

2220. Are they all residents of Amritsar?—Yes.

2221. To what class do they chiefly belong?—Some belong to the land-owning class, some are merchants. Khan Mahomed Shah is a great Central Asian merchant.

2222. Do they represent the old-fashioned Mahomedans, or what you might call the highest educated Mahomedans?—The Society is supposed to represent every shade of opinion.

2223. And every shade of opinion has now concurred in that answer?—Yes, by every shade of opinion I mean Mahomedan opinion generally in Amritsar.

2224. Does your Society represent young and advanced ideas chiefly, or does it represent old-fashioned and conservative opinion?—They are a mixture of both.

2225. Does your President know English?—No, he does not.

2226. How do you understand the word favoritism?—We do not mean to convey any objectionable meaning. Patronage, rather, is what is meant.

WITNESS XXXVIII.—22nd December 1886.

Examination of GOLAK NATH CHATTERJI, Esq., B. A., of the Uncovenanted Service; Assistant Professor, Government College, Lahore.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Golak Nath Chatterji, Esq., B.A.

Mr. Chatterji stated:—I was born in this Province. I am a Christian. I have been in England and studied at Cambridge. Since my return I have been employed in the College.

The *President*.

2227. Are you a member of any Literary or Social Society?—I am a member of the Indian Association. I have been present at two meetings of the Association at which answers to the written questions were adopted.

2228. Do you concur in those answers?—In all but one or two points. As regards the Statutory Civil Service my opinion does not differ from that expressed by the Society. I differ, however, with them as regards the Covenanted branch of the Service.

2229. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—Yes, and the ground of disapprobation is that the Indian candidates are placed at a great disadvantage compared with the English candidates, and that the competition is not fair. The competition is in England, and only people who are able to spend a great deal of money at the risk of not getting an appointment can go there and compete. The next objection is that the limit of age is very low; the educational institutions of India are not as yet so advanced as to produce men at that age fit to compete for the Service. Then the arrangement of the subjects and the allotment of marks are much to the disadvantage of the Indian candidates. In the first place, the medium of examination is English. Indian candidates have to spend about half their time in acquiring that. More marks should be given for the Indian classics than for Greek and Latin. French, German, and Italian are beyond the power of the Indian student to take up; and the Indian student might be allowed to take up a subject which has an equivalent number of marks, and which he can acquire in this country. There should be two centres of examination—one in England and one in India, and the maximum limit of age should be raised to twenty-three. Arabic and Sanscrit should have an equal number of marks with Latin and Greek, provided the present standard of examination in Arabic and Sanscrit is increased, because the standard, as it exists at present, does not form as good a test of mental training as the standard of Latin and Greek. One of the Indian vernaculars should be the subject of examination, and have the same number of marks allotted to it as are assigned to English literature.

The *President*—continued.

2230. And should all these subjects be prescribed alike in England and India?—Yes, and Indian History should be introduced, and Persian.

2231. Should the candidates in England and India compete with one another and be selected in order of merit, or should a certain number of appointments be apportioned for competition to the candidates at the respective examinations?—They should compete with one another in one general list.

2232. Should there be an apportionment between the residents in the territories of the several Administrations respectively, or between the members of the principal religious sects?—Neither.

2233. If the examination is held in India, should the successful candidates be required to proceed to England and complete their training?—It should not be made compulsory, but, at the same time if they go there, they should be placed on the same footing, as regards age, as the English candidates.

2234. Do they teach Arabic and Sanscrit in the Universities here?—Yes.

2235. Who teaches it?—Maulvies and Pandits.

2236. How many students take it up?—Nearly all the Hindu students take up Sanscrit and some Mahomedans take up Arabic, and a good many Persian.

2237. Do the Pandits and Maulvies teach in accordance with European methods, because the examiners would probably be Europeans?—Yes, they would.

2238. And would there not be some difficulty arising from the fact that students here are taught Sanscrit by Pandits, whereas the examiners would be men who had learned Sanscrit according to the system of modern European scholars?—You can get teachers of Sanscrit for the place who are English scholars too. We have a few men who teach Sanscrit in the University, and at the same time are English scholars.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar*.

2239. You say you would not compel candidates to go to England, why?—Because some people object to going on the score of caste.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar*—contd.

2240. Is there any strong objection here on that score?—No, I have never met anybody in the Province who would have any objection to go if the money were forthcoming.

Mr. *Peacock.*

2241. Do you advocate a simultaneous identical examination in England and India?—Yes.

2242. Would you have more than one examination in India?—Only one.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

2243. You appeared in the competitive examination in England and were not successful I believe?—No.

2244. Do you know in what subject you failed?—I failed in Sanscrit and the physical sciences.

2245. To what do you attribute your failure in Sanscrit?—To not knowing it sufficiently. I know French better than Sanscrit.

2246. So that in your own case it would have been no advantage had there been a higher standard of marks?—No.

2247. Did you take any degree at Cambridge?—Yes, I took my B. A. degree in the Mathematical Tripos. I was third junior optime.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

2248. Do you know any Native students in this country who are better than those who have been successful in the examination in England, but who have been deterred from going to England by reason of the expense or caste prejudice?—Not by reason of caste prejudice, but on account of pecuniary difficulty. Yes, there are a good many I know who are far superior to the average Wranglers at Cambridge—I mean to say better mathematical men.

2249. Do you consider that men can be trained in these Colleges sufficiently to offer themselves in an English competition with any chance of success?—Not under the existing conditions.

2250. What would be necessary then?—If the age were raised to twenty-three then their College training would fit them to appear at the competitive examination, but with the present maximum of nineteen years they could hardly pass their First Arts.

2251. And as regards the gentlemen you have mentioned as being in your opinion better than those who have been to England and succeeded, do you speak of their acquirements at the age of eighteen or nineteen or at the age of twenty-three?—At the age of eighteen or nineteen.

2252. Would these same gentlemen have succeeded if they had proceeded to England at the age of eighteen or nineteen?—Yes, I think so.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

2253. At what schools did they receive their education?—In the ordinary Government schools of the Province, but I am speaking only with reference to one subject, mathematics; and with reference to men who appeared at the Cambridge mathematical examination. I think they generally possess a superior knowledge of mathematics to the ordinary Indian students who present themselves at Cambridge. I make no comparison with the English students.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Golak Nath Chatterji, Esq., B. A.

The *President.*

2254. You say there are a great many Indian students who would go home if they had the means; to what class of society do these men belong?—To the middle class. I don't know any who belong to the upper class.

2255. Are there many boys belonging to good families now reading in the University at Lahore?—A good many.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

2256. Are they among the men whom you think would be likely to succeed in the examination?—The men from the middle class are the best.

2257. And you think we should be likely to get men of the middle class chiefly?—Yes.

Mr. *Stokes.*

2258. Do you think that if there were simultaneous examinations in England and India a very large proportion of the posts would be taken by Native candidates?—Not at the commencement, because even then they would be at a great disadvantage. The climate of England is such that students can work there better than men in India. Here the social conditions of the Indian students are such that they cannot do so very much work.

The *President.*

2259. I suppose in the case of an Indian and an English examination being held simultaneously, you would leave it to the Native students to choose at which examination they would present themselves?—Yes.

2260. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives as described in the Statute or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—From Natives of India as described in the Statute.

2261. Should the recruitment of Extra Assistant Commissioners, Munsiffs, and Tahsildars be by competition or by nomination, or by both combined?—By competition only.

2262. Would you recruit only from persons resident in the different territories

The *President*—continued.

of each Administration or simply give a preference to such residents?—For the present I would limit it to the persons resident in the Punjab only.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

2263. Would you exclude Natives residing in territories adjoining the Punjab from presenting themselves at these examinations?—No, I should prefer that the competition should be limited to the Province for the lower Service, because the people are in different stages of advancement in this Province, and if all these appointments are thrown open to general competition there will be too many Bengalis.

2264. But in regard to the adjoining territories?—They might be regarded as one with the Punjab, but I should prefer to restrict recruitment to this Province, because, otherwise, a feeling of dissatisfaction might be created among the people of the Province.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

2265. Has the present system of appointing Extra Assistant Commissioners secured a better stamp of officers?—Certainly, I think they are far superior men than those recruited under the old system.

2266. Do you mean to say that the people of this Province generally would prefer an inferior Punjabi to a superior man from Bombay or Madras?—I think the people as a rule would hold that view.

2267 Is your opinion about pay and furlough rules the same as that of the Indian Association?—Yes.

WITNESS XXXIX.—22nd December 1886.

Examination of Bhai JAWAHIR SINGH, Nominee of *Guru Singh Sabha* Society, Lahore, Punjab.

Bhai Jawahir Singh said:—I am Secretary of a Society called the *Guru Singh Sabha* of Lahore. The Society is composed of Hindus, including Sikhs. It consists of 300 members. I am a Sikh myself. I represent that Society.

The *President.*

2268. Did your Society form its opinions at a general meeting?—Yes.

2269. And they have come to conclusions which they have authorized you to state to the Commission?—Yes.

2270. How many of your Society were present at the meeting?—The question was considered by the Executive Committee only which consists of nineteen members.

2271. Is the existing system of appointing Natives, as Statutory Civilians, to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved? Generally.

2272. Are there grounds of dissatisfaction?—Yes; at present, instead of merit, patronage is rather considered; this is the principal and in fact the only ground of dissatisfaction.

2273. Can that defect be removed either by amending the Statute or the rules?—By amending the rules or rather the method adopted in carrying them out

2274. What alterations do you propose?—I propose a system of limited competition among selected candidates nominated by the University or the Local Government. Our Society prefers provincial competition for Statutory Civilians.

2275. Would you compel the successful candidates to proceed to England, or would you encourage them to go?—I would simply encourage them to go by the grant of scholarships.

Mr. *White.*

2276. Would you admit men from the Uncovenanted branch of approved merit and ability?—Yes, I would reserve one-third of the appointments for tried professional men as well as for men of the Uncovenanted Service of proved merit and ability.

2277. Should any, and, if any, what change be made in the system?—*First*, as to the examination, there should be two centres, one in India and the other in England, with free admission of both Natives and Europeans to either examination The examination should be identical. *Second.*

Mr. *White*—continued.

Natives are under the disadvantage of having to compete in a foreign language. Latin and Greek are more easily acquired by English students, and Sanscrit and Arabic are more easily acquired by Indian than by English students; accordingly the marks allotted to those languages should be made equal. Persian also should be included among the classical languages. *Third.* The present age limit is too low; I would raise it from nineteen to twenty-three, on the ground that Natives cannot at the earlier age go to England to compete.

2278. Would you have only one general list or two lists of appointments?—The Society would have only one list in order of merit.

2279. Would they send the successful candidates to England?—They would not compel them to go, but they would encourage them to do so.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

2280. Do you yourself entertain any objection to a member of your caste proceeding to England?—Not personally.

2281. Has any man of your caste gone to England?—No, Sirdar Dyal Singh went, but he had changed his religion before he went. His change of religion had nothing to do with his going to England. A Sikh can resume his religion although he may have abandoned it.

The *President.*

2282. You said you would have an examination in India and in England, and would alter the subjects so as to make them more Oriental and give the students a better chance of succeeding: are you aware of the reason why the examination in England was pitched at so high an English standard, and also made exclusively English?—No.

2283. Then your proposal to have an identical examination in India and to orientalize the subjects is made without reference to those reasons?—I have never considered this question.

2284. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—For the present it should be recruited only from Natives, because Natives have but few chances.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Bhai *Jawahir Singh.*

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

2285. Would you not amend the Statute so as to provide for the admission of its members to a regular Service instead of to posts in the Service as at present?—I would.

Mr. *Stokes.*

2286. Why would you encourage men to go to England?—Because by doing so they would enlarge their experience and sympathies. But I would not compel them to go in the face of objections held by the orthodox community.

2287. Are those objections so strong as to be worthy of consideration?—At present it is so, but the feeling is dying out.

2288. Is the Society satisfied with the present proportion assigned to the Statutory Service?—They consider one-fourth of the Covenanted posts should be reserved to the Statutory Service instead of one-fifth as at present.

2289. Would they admit the subjects of feudatory States within the definition of Natives of India?—Yes.

2290. Why not have an open competition instead of a limited one?—Our Society does not think that the educational test should be the sole test of the fitness of a candidate for the Statutory Service. He should be a man of some position in society.

2291. Would they exclude men of low caste?—Yes.

2292. Would they exclude them altogether?—Not altogether. They would leave it to the Government to decide. By men of low caste I mean men of the lower middle class, and below that I mean the people whose manners and habits might not be suitable. A man of low social status might be able to pass a purely intellectual test, but might not be desirable otherwise; while in a system of patronage you can secure men of almost equal ability and education and also men of influence.

Mr. *Peacock.*

2293. You said that the appointments should be made by the Local Government and by the University? Would you propose to give the Local Government a right of veto upon the choice of the University?—Yes.

2294. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Uncovenanted Civil Service? Should the recruitment be by competition, or by nomination, or by both systems combined? I mean for the higher grades the Extra Assistant Commissioners, Munsiffs, and Tahsildars?—I am well satisfied with the system as it is at present, viz., by promotions and limited competition.

Mr. *Peacock*—continued.

2295. Should the recruitment be made by the several Administrations only from the persons resident in the territories under such Administrations respectively, or with a preference for such residents?—I would give the preference to the people of my own Province, but would not exclude others

2296. Would you admit them to the examination freely?—I would place no restriction on the power of nomination, but competition should be limited to the Punjab.

2297. If the existing Statutory Service is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that Service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service?—I have not considered the question. My Society wishes to retain the system.

Mr. *Ryland.*

2298. If the chances of the Natives were improved, would you have any objection to the admission of Europeans into the Uncovenanted Service?—If my proposal should be carried out, the advantages they would give to the Natives would not justify the admission of Europeans for some years to come.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

2299. Are you satisfied with the efficiency and honesty of the present class of Tahsildars?—I am not instructed by my Society to give an opinion.

2300. Would you make any change in the present system of appointing Tahsildars?—No, the present system of nomination is quite satisfactory.

2301. Would you make a distinction in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Service accordingly, as the posts are held by the members of that branch of the Service, or by the members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches?—There should be one pay for the post, but the Covenanted European should get an allowance. Covenanted Natives should not get an allowance.

2302. Would you make any distinction between the two classes as regards furlough?—Yes, Europeans should have more favourable furlough rules than Natives

2303. Is the pay of the Uncovenanted Service sufficient?—The pay, viz., Rs. 250, on first entering is too small.

Mr. *Stokes.*

2304. Why would you give allowances to Europeans and not to Natives?—Because they belong to a foreign country and their expenses are greater.

WITNESS XL.—23rd December 1886.

Examination of Munshi DIWAN CHAND, Proprietor and Editor of the *Rafai-i-Am* Newspaper, Sialkot, Punjab.

Munshi *Diwan Chand* said :—I am Editor of the *Rafai-i-Am* Newspaper, published in the Sialkot District of the Punjab. I am also Vice-President of the Municipal Committee of Sialkot. The circulation of the paper is 1,000 daily. It is printed in Urdu.

2305. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—It is not. The general principle is approved, but there should be one Service for all, no distinction being made between Natives and others, and accordingly the Statute should be abolished.

2306. What are the grounds of disapprobation?— In the first place the powers and functions exercised by the Uncovenanted, Covenanted and Statutory Civil Services are the same, and the result of these functions is felt equally by the public. Accordingly it is absolutely necessary that there should be no distinction between them, or any difference of pay or in position. The words "Natives of India" should be struck out of the Statute altogether, because all subjects of Her Majesty are Natives, and the same standard of education should be required from all, and, in that view, I think it would be better to have a Civil Service College opened in India.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

2307. Do you mean that if the functions of the services are equal, the pay and position should be equal?—Yes, the only difference should be that the executive offices should be reserved for Englishmen.

2308. Do Natives of India labour under any, and, if any, what disadvantages in competing for employment in the Covenanted Service?—There are disadvantages and especially to Hindus who are debarred by a religious scruple from going to England. Moreover the circumstances of the Natives of this country as to wealth and position will not admit of their going. Another disadvantage to Hindus is that when they go home they adopt altogether different modes of living, habits and customs; and on their return they regard with dissatisfaction the people of India, and, in the same way, their people regard them with disapproval and disfavor. They come to regard their own countrymen even as a European regards them; in fact Europeans regard Natives with more favor and indulgence than the Native does who has returned from England. These disadvantages can only be removed by the establishment of a college for the Civil Service, and by having the examination for that Service in India. But, for those who prefer it, there might be an examination in England as well. There should be one standard of examination, and just as in England a high standard of English literature is required from the candidates, so in the Indian college should a high standard of proficiency in the vernacular dialects be required from the Indian candidates. The examination would be the same in principle, only that in India the same Status would be accorded to Indian languages as in England is allotted to English literature. With this object in view standard English work might be translated into the vernacular, and as English is the medium of examination in England, so the vernacular should be the medium of examination in India.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Munshi *Diwan Chand*.

2309. Would you give scholarships and passage-money to Native candidates who desired to compete in England?—Yes.

2310. Would you alter the limit of age within which candidates may present themselves for examination?—Yes, I would fix the age-limit at twenty-three years.

2311. Should the Indian examination be held at more centres than one?—At only one centre.

2312. Should the candidates in England and India compete with one another and be selected in the order of merit from one general list?—Yes, I would have one general list for all classes of candidates.

2213. If the examination is held in India, should the successful candidates be required to proceed to England to complete their training?—They should have the option of doing so if they chose.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar*.

2314. Do you personally know any Native gentleman who has been to England?—I am acquainted with several.

2315. How would you arrange the provincial lists?—The successful candidates would be drafted to their respective Provinces according to their residence.

2316. Do you approve of the present system of recruiting Extra Assistant Commissioners, Munsiffs, and Tahsildars?—By the present system we do not get them sufficiently good, and those who possess ability do not get their deserts. This grievance will only be removed when we have

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Munshi *Diwan Chand.*

Mr. *Ramasuami Mudaliyar*—contd.

an Indian Training College, and have abolished the distinction between the services. My remarks have reference to Extra Assistant Commissionerships and all posts above that rank. Officers below that rank should not be looked upon as belonging to the service, but treated as Revenue officers only. I would put into those offices men who have passed the B.A. Standard, or, preferentially, men of family. I would recruit them by a system of nomination and competitive examination. I would have limited competition, and family and educational qualifications should be indispensable. I would have one scale of pay for all, but those who had passed the English examination should receive an allowance of 20 per cent. of their salaries in addition, and they would be called the foreign Civil Service.

Note.—The witness then read a vernacular paper, and it was ordered to be translated, the witness agreeing to come up on a future date with reference to it.

24th December 1886. *Witness resumed.*

Translation of Paper read by Munshi Diwan Chand.

If the Government of India approve of a Civil Service College being opened in India, and get assistance from the Municipal and District Boards, and other Societies and Anjumans, then the whole cost of it will not fall on Government and the Ruling Chiefs will certainly contribute to the same, and the College can be established.

Posts in the Civil Service should not be given on any caste distinction, but on merit, ability, and honesty.

The time has not yet arrived when Natives of India should be appointed to Executive posts: my opinion is that they should be given to Europeans as usual. But in the Judicial line, Natives of India should be promoted according to merit, ability, and good family. Honesty and good conduct should be insisted on for such promotion, and men of good family should also acquire educational attainments to get to those posts

As horses of good breed only are selected for Cavalry Regiments, so preference should be given to men of good families, provided they are educated and well conducted.

The limit of twenty-five years of age for admission to the Service should be done away with. The Government of India has established a rule to the effect that men of more than twenty-five years of age should get no employment. This excludes many men otherwise fit for employment. Men of proved loyalty are excluded from appointments for the whole of their life, if their age exceeds twenty-five years, even by one month. This exclusion is owing to no fault of theirs. I humbly request that as Government has conferred unlimited benefits on Natives, they might also remove the limit of twenty-five years of age for admission into the service; I think they should issue an order to the effect that every person should remain in the service of Government so long as he is not incapacitated from old age, and has not been convicted of any crime. Government employment should be given to such men on a vacancy occurring, and on their candidature being certified to.

The limit of fifty-five years of age should not be taken into consideration unless the man loses his faculties, or is incapacitated from defect or weakness of body. The services of experienced officers are lost to Government by observing the fifty-five year rule, and the pension charges to the State are increased.

Some provision should be made for the maintenance of the wife and children of a man who dies after faithfully completing his period of service for pension. If he leaves any children, they should have some allowance given for their maintenance, and if he leaves a widow only, and no children, she should be allowed half the amount of the pension for the life, which her husband would have got had he remained alive.

Uncovenanted officers of merit and ability should be admitted to the Covenanted Service, without further examination. Their experience and honesty should be considered sufficient for their admission to the Covenanted Service. I know a great many Uncovenanted officers (both Europeans and Eurasians), who owing to age or inability to answer one or two of the questions in the examination for the Civil Service in England, have not been admitted into that service, but have got into the Uncovenanted Service, and have performed their duties satisfactorily.

Further, they get no promotion, being Uncovenanted officers, notwithstanding their high qualifications. If Government would accede to my humble request, a large body of officers will benefit by it, who are ready to shed their blood for Government, and are always engaged in dispensing justice to the public Government should take into consideration that when an Uncovenanted Extra Assistant Commissioner works equal to an Assistant Commissioner, and exercises the same powers, and does good work, why should the word "Extra" be attached to his post and why should he get low pay: why should not Government consider the following saying that "a well paid labourer does more work?"

In the new Judicial Scheme, the respected President of this Commission justly promoted two Europeans from the Uncovenanted body of officers. As such promotions have not been given again, it follows that so long as the word "Uncovenanted" is not struck out, and only one Civil Service not established, men of proved merit and ability will get no promotion. I most submissively and respectfully beg that this distinction should be done away with.

I don't want any alterations made in the definition of the word "Natives"; I only wish that one Civil Service may be established.

WITNESS XLI.—23rd December 1886.

Examination of Lala HARSUKH RAI, Proprietor of the *Koh-i-nur* Newspaper, Lahore, Punjab.

Lala Harsukh Rai said:—I am proprietor of the *Koh-i-nur* press, and I am Secretary to the *Anjuman* Society, Lahore, but I do not represent that Society here. I am a Native of Secunderabad. I came to Lahore in 1848, and since that time I have been the editor and proprietor of the *Koh-i-nur*. I am by caste a Kayesth.

2317. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—No, in making the appointments under the Statute, education and capacity are overlooked, and those who have been appointed have been generally deficient in intellectual capacity. These disadvantages might be removed by amending the Statute. I do not advocate its abolition, but it should be incumbent on the authorities to select persons of capacity and ability. The educational qualifications should not differ from what is necessary in order to pass the First Arts examination. The Statutory Service should be considered as a special service standing alone, below the Covenanted, but above the Uncovenanted. Not less than one-fifth of the Covenanted appointments should be reserved for Statutory Civilians Three classes of persons should be admitted to the Statutory Service —(1) men of family; (2) persons who have shown merit and ability in the Uncovenanted Service for a certain period; (3) persons belonging to the legal profession who have a reputation for ability Persons appointed to the service, if selected for first appointments, should compete among themselves. Members of the legal profession and Uncovenanted Servants of proved merit and ability need not be required to compete. Should it be considered necessary that the members of the Statutory Service should proceed to England for training, which I do not think is necessary, they should not be compelled to do so, but those who desire to do so, should receive scholarships or other pecuniary aid. Candidates who have been to England and shown their qualifications should be appointed to the Statutory Service.

2318. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—The preliminary competitive examination should be held in India, and the age-limit should be extended. Natives are under great disadvantages, in that they have to compete through the medium of a tongue which is foreign to them. Another great disadvantage is that they are examined in the classical languages of Europe which are not taught in the Indian Universities, and to which higher marks are allotted than are given to Arabic and Sanscrit, while the languages which are commonly spoken in India have no place among the subjects of examination. I would raise the limit of age from seventeen—nineteen as at present to twenty-one—twenty-three. I would include the Indian vernacular languages in the subjects of examination, and every candidate should be required to take up at least one. As regards the marking of the various subjects, the marks allotted to Law should be increased to 500. Latin, Greek, Sanscrit, and Arabic should have 100 marks each assigned to them, and the students should be at liberty to take up any one, but it should be compulsory to take up one. The Histories of India, Greece, Rome or Europe should have 200 marks assigned to each, and to all other subjects 100 marks. I would hold simultaneous and identical examinations in England and India; and the Indian examination should be confined to one centre. I would apportion the appointments thus: of four appointments I would give half, *i.e.*, two to the English candidates, and would divide the remainder equally between Natives who competed in England and the Statutory Service. Candidates should not be required to go to England to complete their training, but they might be encouraged to do so.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

2319. Do you know either Greek or Latin?—No, I know a little Sanscrit, and am acquainted with Arabic and Persian.

2320. Then how do you deem yourself competent to deal with those subjects of examination?—I have formed my opinion after consulting others.

2321. What is the circulation of your paper?—Six hundred copies.

2322. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as defined in the Statute, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—From residents of India of whatever religion or sect.

2323. Should the recruitment be by competition or by nomination, or by both combined?—By competition only.

2324. Whatever system be adopted should the recruitment be made by the Administrations only, from persons resident in the territories under such Administrations respectively, or with a preference only for such residents?—The recruitment should be made provincially.

2325. If the exisiting Statutory Service is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that Service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes.

WITNESS XLII.—23rd December 1886.

Examination of Colonel GORDON YOUNG, Commissioner and Superintendent of the Jullundur Division, Punjab.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Colonel *Gordon Young.*

Colonel Young said:—I am Commissioner of the Jullundur Division. I have been rather more than 30 years in the service. I began in the Punjab and subsequently went to Oudh, and was nearly eight years there, and then returned to the Punjab. I have been Settlement Officer, Assistant Commissioner, Deputy Commissioner, Sessions Judge, and Commissioner. I have had experience of all branches of the administration both Executive and Judicial. I am acquainted with the Statutory Civilian system so far as it has been applied to the Punjab.

2326. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved in this Province?—I should have supposed, till I saw the evidence given here, that it was eminently approved by the men themselves, but apparently it is not. I do not think the public have any opinion on the question: the uneducated public are not in a position to say.

2327. What is your opinion?—Not altogether I disapprove of it, because it does not seem to satisfy the men themselves, and it has been shown lately, I think, that calling a man a Statutory Civilian has given him aspirations and hopes which we are not perhaps prepared to satisfy.

2328. Do you think the system produces good men?—I do not know that it gives us the best that could be procured. We have got one or two good men: of the rest I can hardly speak.

2329. Do you think that any improvements could be made in the system either by amending the Act itself, or the rules, or would you repeal the Statute altogether?—I should be disposed to repeal it altogether.

2330. And supposing it is not repealed, would you alter the Statute or the rules?—I have not considered that sufficiently to venture to give an opinion.

2331. Supposing the Statutory system maintained, would you send the men to England to complete their training, or only encourage them to go?—The Statutory system lets men in up to the age of twenty-five or beyond twenty-five in special cases I think if it is to be maintained, and men are appointed at the mature age, comparatively speaking, of twenty-four and twenty-five, they might with advantage be sent to England. I think it might be made a condition of the Service. I am not at all sure that sending very young men to England does not do them more harm than good.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

2332. Do you speak from your experience of men who have gone to England?—I can hardly say that, but I say it as being what I conceive to be the intelligent Native opinion. I do not think that two years in England does much good to a boy of eighteen or twenty. It is more likely to send him to the bad.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

2333. The Statute gives Government the power to promote men of proved merit and ability in the Uncovenanted Service to posts reserved for the Covenanted Service. Do you think it desirable to retain that power?—Yes, to a limited degree.

2334. Then you would not repeal the Statute?—I should always allow the Government to select the best men, and, to that extent, I should certainly wish the Government to retain that power.

The *President.*

2335. What you mean is that you would repeal the provisions which permit the Government of India, under certain rules to be approved by the Secretary of State, to appoint Natives of India, as defined in the Statute, of proved merit and ability to particular posts in the Covenanted Service; but would retain, either in an amended Statute, or in a new Statute, the power to appoint Uncovenanted men to posts in the Civil Service?—Yes.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

2336. Would you exclude men of ability and merit in their professions from being appointed to high posts?—In very exceptional cases I would not wish to exclude such men from the Chief Court Bench, for instance.

Mr. *Stokes.*

2337. You say that you have observed from the evidence before us that those men who have been given the benefits of admission to the Statutory Service are discontented. Do you think they will be contented as long as their privileges are in any degree less than those of the Covenanted Service?—Judging from the evidence that I have in my mind, apparently not. They seem to claim everything.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

2338. You say that one of the grounds upon which you are not in favour of retaining the Statutory system is that it raises hopes and expectations which it might not be desirable to satisfy. Is it because Natives are unfit that those hopes cannot be satisfied, or why?—What the country requires, as it appears to me, is a strong, just, and impartial rule, and rulers, whose strength, justice, and impartiality shall be believed in by the varying races and religions of which the country is composed. These characteristics are found, we think, in Europeans and not, as yet, in any Native races; and what is true of the country in general is true of the districts in particular; and it is on these grounds that I would say that at present I do not think that the Natives generally in the service are fitted to be trusted with the charge of a district.

2339. When you say that these characteristics are to be found in Europeans and not in Natives, do you limit your opinions to the Province or extend them to any other?—I speak only of this Province. I have no acquaintance with the Lower Provinces.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

2340. Do you understand that the Statute gives the Government power to appoint to posts and not to the regular service?—Yes.

2341. Do you see any reason for maintaining that distinction?—If the Statutory Service is to be retained at all, I would be disposed to have it upon a Service footing.

Mr. *White.*

2342. Do you apply that unfitness you have mentioned to domiciled Europeans and Eurasians?—No, I do not say absolute unfitness. I mean that Natives would not command, among their own countrymen, the credit for absolute justice, strength, and impartiality which I think the people generally give Europeans credit for.

2343. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—Apparently, yes. The educated opinion appears to be that there should be a competition in India—a feeling I have no sympathy with.

2344. Would you make a change in the present system?—Not at all, I would give no special facilities except in one respect. I would certainly grant the indulgence of one, and perhaps two years, in the age-limit; as no doubt Natives stand, educationally, at a disadvantage with young Englishmen.

2345. Are there any other disadvantages under which you think the Natives of India labour with regard to the Civil Service?—No.

2346. And you would not hold an examination simultaneously in India?—No.

Mr. *White*—continued.

2347. On what grounds?—To begin with, I think we should be flooded with candidates, and I think that a large proportion would very likely succeed; especially if, as has been suggested, Sanscrit and Arabic are made test subjects. We are not prepared to admit so large an influx of Natives. I do not think, in this Province at least, we can reduce our European staff by a man.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

2348. Are there not in this Province a certain number of Military Civilians?—Yes.

2349. Can you tell us whether there is any order of Government requiring that a certain proportion of Military Civilians should be maintained?—I do not think there is any order, but they should be maintained to a certain strength.

The *President*—Yes, there is such an order.

Witness.—I would maintain that field of selection certainly.

2350. Are you acquainted with the Frontier Districts?—Not beyond Attock.

2351. Would you recruit the Uncovenanted Service from Natives of India as described in the Statute, or open it freely to all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty (by the Uncovenanted Service please understand Extra Assistant Commissioners, Munsiffs, and Tahsildars only)?—Those very subordinate appointments would not be acceptable, of course, as a rule, to Europeans. Yes, I would admit all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty, but under certain conditions.

2352. How would you recruit for that Service?—It is eminently desirable to associate the best Natives of the Province with us in the administration, by which I do not mean only the best educated. The highly educated men who are now entering the subordinate ranks have shown themselves very efficient, but more especially I say it of the Judicial line. Such men should be passed into a separate Service to be recruited partly from the present Uncovenanted Service, and partly by the nomination of young men to be trained at what has been called an Indian Haileybury; and, partly, by limited competition among men who have taken University honours. In such a service Natives would rise to District Judgeships, and, here and there perhaps, to the position of Sessions Judges. But the whole judicial appointments, even in the lower grades, must not be absorbed by Natives; as even if it be possible for the them to rise superior to all feelings of class or religious animosities and prejudices, their own fellow-countrymen will not give them credit for this unprejudiced state of mind, and they will themselves admit this. Hence, even in the subordinate grades, a proportion of

Sir *Charles Turner* – continued.

Europeans should certainly be enlisted. This Service would supply men for the ordinary administrative line, as well as the Judicial, up to a certain point. But it is not advisable to dangle before their eyes the prospect of being put in charge of a district as Deputy Commissioner. As to the nominees for such a Service they should be taken from families of good social standing, the best that can be procured, subject to an educational test; and care should be taken to have Hindus and Mahomedans both fairly represented; otherwise I fear that Mahomedans will be left behind in the race. The age might be raised to twenty years. They could be trained for at least two years in the special College spoken of, and on passing out they would be appointed to the Provincial Civil Service, or whatever you might call it. They would serve two years as probationers, and during this time there should be no scruple in removing all bad bargains. Such a College need not be provincial, in fact one for the whole of India would be preferable. Such an institution, if under the management of the right men,—men with the enthusiasm to conduct it—would gradually secure a very efficient Service, animated with a very desirable *esprit de corps.* I feel very doubtful as to the advantage of a training in England unless in the case of boys who are sent to England really early, and kept for a long time under school discipline.

2353. Although you prefer one College for the whole of India would your recruitment be provincial?—I would employ provincial men in the Provinces. I would like to see men of the North-West and Punjab associated in such a College, but, afterwards, I think they should be drafted to their Provinces.

2354. Should they go to College before or after selection?—After they have passed a satisfactory educational test.

2355. That is those that you proposed to send to the College should be nominated?—Yes, subject to a pass test, but I would not make them compete on leaving. I would pass them out on a satisfactory examination, but I would keep them on probation for two years, at least until they have passed the Departmental test.

2356. Do you know at present the proportion of appointments allotted to the Statutory Service?—Yes, one-sixth.

2357. Supposing the Statute were abolished, would you allot that one-sixth to the Uncovenanted Service?—I would allot it to the Service which I contemplate.

Mr. *Peacock.*

2358. With reference to the examination here—I am speaking of a qualiying examination—you said you would like to see the Mahomedans enjoy a fair proportion of appointments as well as the Hindus. Do you anticipate any danger of having to bring the standard of education down to a low level to suit the Mahomedans?—No, the Mahomedans would satisfy a fair standard, but they cannot succeed in an open competition at present.

Mr. *Peacock*— continued.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

2359. You are aware perhaps that under the rules of the Service Europeans are not now appointed to posts to which a salary of Rs. 200 and upwards is attached, and I suppose you are also aware that one of the principal grounds upon which that rule is based was the apprehension that the patronage of the Administration might be abused. Do you not think the objections would equally apply, if you allowed Europeans to be appointed, to the Subordinate Executive Service?—No, I do not think there is the smallest risk of that. I think the Local Government may be always trusted in that respect. To begin with I do not think we have sufficient Europeans domiciled in India to take up those appointments on a large scale—men we should wish to recommend.

2360. I mean if it were open to Europeans coming out from England?—I have not given that question any consideration. If there is any risk of that, of course it should be provided against.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

2361. I understand you to say that you would give the one-sixth of all the Covenanted posts, now given away under the Statute, to this lower Service which you would establish?—Yes.

2362. And, if I understood you aright, you said at the beginning of your evidence that you thought in no case ought the idea of promotion to the executive charge of a district to be dangled before the eyes of the Natives. If you gave this one-sixth of all the Covenanted posts to the lower Service which you would constitute, do you mean to prevent the promotion of these men to districts?—In the case of Natives of India I do. I contemplated that for the reasons I gave.

2363. Do you not think that in that case you have dangled it before their eyes?—I should let it be distinctly understood that we do not contemplate making over districts at present to Natives of this country. It should be possible, but by no means a matter of course or of right.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

2364. The Uncovenanted Service, as I understand it, embraces all classes from Tahsildars upwards?—I was thinking of appointments above Tahsildars.

2365. Then you would not require Tahsildars to go to the training College?—No.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

2366. At what age do you propose Native students should go to the training College?—Up to the age of twenty.

2367. Would not that interfere with our obtaining men who had received a good education at the Universities?—It would be necessary to provide for that, because one of the things I have suggested is that men who have attained University honours might be nominated to these appointments, and in the case of such men, it would not be necessary to send them to the training College, though they should go through a probation of course.

Mr. *Ryland.*

2368. Do you not think that the qualifying tests you have provided would be a sufficient safeguard against an undue influx of Europeans?—The qualifying test would not exclude them.

2369. But would it not require a high Oriental standard?—No, the Entrance examination would, I think, very soon be passed by Europeans who had come from England in the hope of entering the Service. They would come out very young, buckle to their work, and I think very soon satisfy the test I propose.

2370. You said the abuse of patronage in the direction of an undue influx of Europeans might be provided against. How?—I meant to say it would be provided against by the general sense of what is right that animates the Government of India; but it could be very easily regulated by simply saying that the Natives of India shall have a just proportion of posts. I would certainly safeguard it against the smallest risk of abuse. My primary objection is to enlist the best Natives in the Service though I do not want to exclude Europeans.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

2371. Are you satisfied with the present set of Tahsildars as a class?—Yes, Tahsildars in the present day are, speaking generally, very satisfactory; of course we have got some of the old school. Still, as a rule, Tahsildars are a fairly capable body of men.

The *President.*

2372. How would you appoint Tahsildars, by patronage as at present, or by limited competition?—I am not prepared to advocate competition for Tahsildars.

2373. With regard to the Service which you proposed to constitute, you say you would have a qualifying test. Would not that reduce the educational qualifications to a dead level?—No, I should encourage men during their training by all means to go in for University honours, and they would, of course, carry those distinctions through their service to the great advantage of themselves.

The *President*—continued.

2374. Among Tahsildars are there any men of good family?—Oh yes, and there is no hesitation among men of that class in seeking posts which are lower than that of Tahsildars; Naib Tahsildars for instance. The pay of a Naib Tahsildar is Rs. 50.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

2375. You say you would have a low educational test?—Yes, so as to keep out dunces.

2376. Would it not lead to your getting a mediocre service?—At present I would be satisfied with average qualifications, and the standard might gradually be raised.

2377. Your objection to a competitive examination is that it might exclude Mahomedans?—It would exclude Mahomedans very generally and also, at present, scions of good family whom I should like to see employed. I approve of the present system of appointing Native Extra Assistant Commissioners.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

2378. Looking to the circumstances of the Province and, for the matter of that, of all India, generally, are there any grounds for giving the Government of a Province power to make appointments, without any reference to competition or otherwise, in the case of men who have done good service to the Government?—I think Government should have power to employ such men, always having regard to the vested interests of the men below.

Mr. *Stokes.*

2379. Would you continue to appoint Naib Tahsildars to Tahsildarships?—Certainly, it is only in that way we can hope to get a good class of men.

2380. Would you appoint Tahsildars to Extra Assistant Commissionerships?—Under the system I contemplate that would not be possible, but, until the Service I propose was sufficiently established, and a sufficient supply brought in from the College, it would be necessary to fill up the ranks of the service in that way.

2381. And then you would stop the promotion of Tahsildars?—No, here and there there would be the kind of men Government would be able and would wish to avail themselves of.

2382. But suppose you could obtain a strong Service from the training College would it disappoint the hopes of the Tahsildars?—To that extent it might. Perhaps we ought to say that up to a certain point in what is now called the Uncovenanted Service, the Tahsildars should have a right for distinguished service to expect promotion. But my ideas are very crude at present.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Colonel *Gordon. Young.*

Sir *Charles Turner.*

2383. Your institution might be collateral to the system of promotion?—Yes.

Mr. *Stokes.*

2384. Don't you, as an executive officer, think you would like to have a large number of those offices open to Tahsildars?—There is no doubt that we are bringing in an educated class of men as Tahsildars now, who will not be satisfied unless we give them some such prize to look forward to; and it is very desirable that we should be able to put them in such a position. It is a most important thing to keep the Tahsildars in good heart.

2385. Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Uncovenanted Civil Service, accordingly as the posts are held by members of that branch of the service, or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches?—Yes.

2386. On what principle would you make the distinction?—For men who are locally appointed and locally educated, and, of course, in the case of nine-tenths, Natives of the country, I think the present pay is quite sufficient. They should certainly be paid lower than men who have gone through the educational competition in England.

2387. And would you give the same pay to Natives and Europeans who have been educated in England?—Yes, I think so It argues a force of character and in many cases an expenditure of capital.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

2388. In the case of officers appointed to the Chief Court would you make any distinction in the pay of Natives and Europeans?—Certainly, I would not pay a Native Chief Court Judge the same salary as I would pay a European.

Mr. *Stokes.*

2389. Although it is such an exceptional appointment?—Well, if it is not a sacrifice of the principle. But what is a mere adequate salary to a European is a very liberal salary to a Native. No, on further consideration, I should make no exception. I would pay them at a lower rate.

2390. Should any distinction be made in the furlough rules applicable to the Statutory and Uncovenanted branches of the Service according to the nationality of the officer, or on any other, and what ground?—I think the present furlough rules are very suitable.

2391. Are the privileges in regard to promotion and retiring annuity, and the general conditions of office, belonging to the Covenanted Civil Service, suitable to Natives obtaining office under the Statutory rules?—I am not prepared to speak upon that. I have not considered it.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

2392. Leaving out of consideration the pay of the lower grades of the Covenanted Service, do you think the pay of the higher grades was fixed because those grades were intended to be filled by Europeans, or in order that the holders might be free from even a suspicion of corruption?—Both considerations were taken into account, and it was also intended to induce the best class of men we could get at home to accept appointments out here.

2393. Do you not think that the same considerations would apply to Natives also?—Certainly, they should be placed beyond temptation by handsome salaries. But what I mean to say is, that what is a mere adequate salary to a European is handsome pay to a Native with his ways of living.

2394. But have Natives no claims on them on marriage occasions, or for providing for poorer relatives for instance?—If you mean out of all proportion to what Europeans have, I do not think so. If Natives choose to throw away money on weddings, that is their fault. I am not at all prepared to say that they have greater claims upon them than Europeans, but I am prepared to say that the Natives of India set the world at large an example in their regard for the claims of poor relatives. But of how many Europeans can you say that you know that they are disregarding the claims of poor relations in England? I look upon expenditure on marriage as optional expenditure which Natives are learning to limit.

2395. Suppose the pay of Europeans were reduced by twenty per cent., could they live upon it?—I suppose they would, but the class of men would deteriorate. A European, if he wishes to keep up his sons' and daughters' education properly must send them to England, and that is an expense which no Native has to contract; but it is obligatory on the European, and it is enormous in proportion to his pay.

2396. Do you not know as a matter of fact that a Native gentleman is looked down upon if he does not spend a certain sum on a marriage or occasion of that kind?—I am aware of that, but I hope and think that the feeling is dying out.

2397. There is a social pressure upon him which necessitates expenditure?—I admit that, but I say that as a matter of fact a Native's expenditure is absolutely much less than a European's.

The Hon'ble Mr Justice *Mitter.*

2398. You say that what is a fairly adequate salary to a European is a liberal salary to a Native, and you also think that even as regards very high posts you would make no distinction; but have you considered whether you can get a really good man for a High Court Judgeship when what he can make at the Bar is much more than the

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter*—contd.

salary of that office?—I am quite prepared to admit that the best Natives at the Bar make incomes largely in excess of anything they will get in the Chief Court Bench, but they are prepared probably to renounce part of that for the dignity of the Bench.

2399. Do you speak from experience?—Not from general experience.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

2400. Having regard to the average incomes of professional men in India, would you require to offer a higher salary to Europeans in order to get men of ability?—Certainly.

Mr. *White*.

2401. Is is not right that salaries should be adjusted in regard to the work rather than in regard to the individual who does the work?—Yes, as a general principle, wages should be adjusted according to work.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*.

2402. Have you had any religious riots in your division lately?—Yes, in two places—Hoshiarpur and Ludhiana.

2403. Did you find that the European staff was sufficient to deal executively with the riots, and also to deal judicially with them afterwards?—Certainly not. We were obliged to send for extraneous aid in one place, and in the other did not send for it, because the Deputy Commissioner seemed to think he could dispose of the cases himself. Native agency was tried, but it produced such a clamour that I was obliged to forward a special application to have European agency sent. Native agency was tried on a very large scale and a great many persons were punished. It produced a clamour in this way, that each Hindu Magistrate who dealt with a case was loudly charged by the Mahomedans with the grossest partiality, and *per contra* the Mahomedan Magistrate was just as loudly assailed by the Hindus.

2404. When you say they loudly assailed them, do you mean that they petitioned you loudly to that effect?—Yes.

2405. Both sides?—Yes.

2406. Do you think that the riots you had this year were peculiar or very special cases, or might they occur in the future?—They may occur at any time, and are always to be feared when these particular occasions come together, the *Eed* and the *Mohurrum*.

2407. And probably such accusations would be as loudly made?—Yes, I have myself no special reason for believing that there was partiality on one side or the other, but there was no public confidence in the Native Magistrates at the time.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar*.

2408. How often in your experience have these riots taken place?—They have occurred several times within my recollection. They have occurred at Multan, Hoshiarpur, Shahabad. I cannot call them very frequent, but we all know that they are liable to occur, and do occur perhaps once in five or six years.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*.

2409. From what you know of the feelings of the Punjabi, do you see any objection to putting Natives of other, and especially dissimilar, Provinces into posts in the Government service, or into the lower Subordinate Judical or Executive Services?—I see objections to putting men of other Provinces into this Province.

2410. Your desire to keep the provincial service for the Natives of the Province is not merely from an idea or sentiment that the Natives of the Province have a right to such service, but is based upon administrative grounds?—Partly upon administrative grounds and partly upon other grounds. I distinctly think that a Punjabi has a claim to such appointments. Also I think the men of the Province are more likely to be acceptable to the Natives of the Province at large.

2411. And if the sentimental ground were overruled, would there be strong administrative reasons for it?—Yes.

2412. Have any witnesses been called before us from the districts of your division?—Yes, Rai Buta Mall and Mr. Carr Stephen.

2413. I mean non-official witnesses?—No non-officials. I have not seen the list of non-official witnesses examined or to be examined here. (Shown list of witnesses.)

2414. Do you think any of those Natives can speak as representing opinions prevailing among any class of the community in your division? Among the educated classes for instance?—Among the educated class I think I would rather have seen one or two more Punjabis. I only see Sardar Dial Singh, a man of peculiar views. Sardar Gurdial Singh is quite a representative man.

2415. Do you think the non-official witnesses on that list are calculated to give us a fair idea of the opinions prevalent among the districts of your division? (*The President.*) Is there any witness in your division whom you would advise the Commission to summon with a view to supplementing the evidence before the Commission?—Yes, Sardar Bikrama Singh of Jullundur.

2416. Any one else?—I am quite content with the man I have named. I think his evidence will be valuable.

Mr. *Stokes*.

2417. Do you know the population of your division?—I cannot give you information of that sort. The division consists

Mr. *Stokes*—continued.

of five districts. I suppose there are about four million inhabitants. The majority of the population is agricultural. There is a considerable mercantile class, and there are some European capitalists in the Kangra Valley. There is a considerable investment of European capital there in tea.

2418. Have we any representative of that class on the list ?—No, then there is the Raís class and the Rajahs and also the official class.

The *President.*

2419. Was not a notice issued in the *Punjab Gazette* inviting members in the Punjab generally of any class who might wish to give evidence before the Commission to tender such evidence ?—Yes.

The *President*—continued.

2420. Was not that notice also published in the local newspapers, English and Vernacular ?—It was.

2421. So that every opportunity has been given by public notice (the notice being issued on the 30th November) to allow all classes an opportunity to come forward to offer evidence on any points they might be willing to bring before the Commission ?—No doubt about it.

2422. Therefore there is no reason to believe that any particular class of the population has not had full opportunity of tendering any evidence it might wish to adduce ?—Not the smallest.

WITNESS XLIII.—23rd December 1886.

Examination of Honorary Surgeon RAHIM KHAN, Khan Bahadur; Superintendent, Vernacular Department, Medical School, Lahore, Punjab.

Rahim Khan said:—I am a native of Cawnpore. I studied in Calcutta. I took my medical degree in Calcutta and I have been in the Punjab twenty-one years, and have resided chiefly at Lahore. I am an Honorary Surgeon. I was appointed to that grade in 1877. I am Superintendent of the Hindustani Class and Lecturer of Midwifery in the Hindustani Class of the Medical School, Lahore.

The *President.*

2423. Have you formed any opinion on the questions with which the Commission have to deal?—Yes.

2424. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved in the Province?—It is not approved chiefly by the educated class. The objections have reference to the rules of the Statutory Civil Service, which service is not, they say, equal to the Covenanted Civil Service in regard to pay, promotion and pension rules.

2425. Would you amend the Statute or the rules in order to remedy this?—I am no advocate for the Statutory Civil Service. I would do away with it.

2426. If the service is retained, would you make the selected candidates go to England?—I would. I would compel them as a condition of the service.

2427. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—There is.

2428. What change would you make?—I would raise the limit of age to twenty-one or to twenty-two, and I would place Arabic and Sanscrit on the same footing as Latin and Greek in the competitive examination, and Persian should be on the same footing as French and German. I would hold the examination in London only.

2429. Would you found scholarships and give passage-money to candidates wishing to go to London?—I would not.

Mr. *Ryland.*

2430. Would you make any provision for promotion into the Covenanted Service of men who have distinguished themselves by their ability in the Uncovenanted Service?—No, I would not like to contaminate the Civil Service by introducing inferior blood into it.

Mr. *Stokes.*

2431. You say there is dissatisfaction felt with the Covenanted Service; by whom is it felt?—By the educated Natives only.

2432. What are your objections to having the examination in India?—The functions of the Service are very important, and I would not allow inferior men to enter the Service. I think the visit to England has a tendency to widen a man's views.

Mr. *Peacock.*

2433. You would have one examination in England at which any Native might be free to present himself?—Yes, if he requires Government aid, he must be a pauper, and I do not think a pauper should be allowed to enter the Service. Under such a system I do not think there would be any difficulty in getting a sufficient number of educated Natives into the Service.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

2434. You think that unless a man goes to England he has no opportunity of forming his character so as to fit him for a post in the Civil Service. If the successful candidates in an examination held in India are compelled to go to England to complete their training, would not the same object be attained?—No, the educational institutions in India cannot form a man's character. I think a man must receive his education in England entirely and reside there for four or five years.

The *President.*

2435. By his entire education you probably mean his higher education?—Yes.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

2436. Does your Univerisity find any difficulty in obtaining examiners in the higher subjects?—No.

2437. Where do you obtain them from?—Generally from other College Professors.

2438. Is objection taken in the local University to appointing teachers as examiners?—Teachers should not be appointed examiners in their own subjects

2439. Yet their own subjects they are likely to know best?—Yes.

2440. Do you resort to the Civil Service for examiners in the higher subjects?—Yes, occasionally.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Surgeon *Rahim Khan*, Khan Bahadur.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Surgeon *Rahim Khan*, Khan Bahadur.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

2441. If the Indian candidates had an examination conducted by members, European and Native, of the Service to which they aspired, do you think there would be the same confidence in the examiners as if the examination were held in England?—The reason for holding the examination in England is that you have perfectly independent examiners.

2442. Would there be perfect confidence in the minds of the public if members of the Civil Service were examiners? Have you ever heard of any objection being taken in India to the examiners for Pleaderships, on the ground that the examiners belonged to the profession and were interested in excluding men?—It is always the case where a candidate does not succeed that he abuses his examiners.

Mr. *White*.

2443. When you speak of Natives do you include domiciled Europeans and Eurasians?—I do.

2444. Would you recruit the Uncovenanted Service from Natives of India as described in the Statute, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—If by natural-born subjects is meant inhabitants of Australia, Canada or New Zealand, I would not; but if you mean only inhabitants of England, Ireland, and Scotland, my opinion is that you had better admit them. They must, however, be thoroughly acquainted with the language of the country and the manners and customs of Natives.

2445. Should the recruitment be by competition or by nomination, or by both systems combined?— I would retain the present system as applicable to Extra Assistant Commissioners and Munsiffs in the Punjab, namely, partly competition among selected candidates and partly nomination.

Mr. *White*—continued.

2446. And for Tahsildars, nomination only?—Yes.

2447. Whatever system be adopted, would you recruit men for the Uncovenanted Service only from the Natives of the Province?—Yes.

2448. If the Statutory Service is abolished, would you reserve those posts in the Uncovenanted Service which are now given under the Statute for the Uncovenanted Service?—I would not for the reason I gave before.

Mr. *White*.

2449. When you said Englishmen, do you mean Englishmen of pure English descent?—Yes.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar*.

2450. Are you satisfied with the present set of Tahsildars?—Yes, as a class they are honest and upright men. I have had opportunites of forming an opinion on the subject being a landed proprietor, and having had to do with them frequently, and I never found them to be otherwise than prefectly upright and honest.

2451. Should any distinction be made in the furlough rules applicable to the Statutory and Uncovenanted branches according to the nationality of the officer?—Yes, Europeans ought to have different furlough rules from those applicable to Natives.

Mr. *White*.

2452. On what ground would you make that distinction?—On the ground of nationality.

WITNESS XLIV.—23rd December 1886.

Examination of Sardar CHARAT SINGH, of the Uncovenanted Service, Extra Assistant Commissioner, Gurdaspur, Punjab.

Note.—Sardar Charat Singh is the son of Sardar Nihal Singh Chachi. The family is of the Sani Khatri caste, and belongs to the Rawalpindi district. His grandfather was a trader. Sardar Nihal Singh got his title as Sardar in 1846, and was deputed to attend on the Governor-General as an Aide-de-Camp. He rendered good service, and his jagirs were continued to him under British rule. He attended on the Chief Commissioner of the Punjab during the critical times of 1857 and helped to raise a regiment. Sir John Lawrence entertained a great regard for him. He had the order of the K.C.S.I. conferred on him and received also a cash pension. Sardar Charat Singh has received a good education.

Sardar *Charat Singh* said:—I am an Extra Assistant Commissioner. I was appointed in 1882. I entered by nomination, being promoted from the rank of Munsiff I was born at Lahore. I am the son of Sardar Nihal Singh Chachi, K.C.S.I., a great friend of Sir Henry and Sir John Lawrence.

The *President.*

2453. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—It is not, because Natives are not freely admitted into the Covenanted Service. That is to say, a sufficient proportion of Covenanted appointments is not given to the Natives. That is the only ground of dissatisfaction.

2454. What proportion would you assign them?—I think half would be very just.

2455. Then the only change you suggest in the existing system is by amending the rules?—Yes.

2456. And giving to the Statutory Natives one-half of the appointments?—Yes.

2457. Have you any objection to the provisions of the Statute under which appointments are made?—I have not.

2458. Do you think that section 6 of the Statute is sufficiently explicit as to the definition of Natives of India?—I have no objection to the present definition.

2459. Would you compel the Native candidates to proceed to England for training?—No, after they have been appointed and confirmed in their posts, I would encourage them to go.

The *President*—continued.

2460. What sort of encouragement?—I think their expenses should be borne by the Government, because the masses are not able to bear the cost.

Vol. I. Sec II. Punjab. — Sardar *Charat Singh.*

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

2461. According to the present system appointments are made for the Statutory Service to particular posts in the Covenanted Service and not to the regular Service. Do you approve of that or do you suggest that Statutory Civilians should be admitted to the ranks of the Covenanted Service?—They should be admitted to the ranks of the Covenanted Service.

Mr. *Stokes.*

2462. When you said the masses were unable to bear the expenses of going to England, did you mean the majority of the candidates confirmed?—Yes.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

2463. How do you arrive at the proportion of one-half?—The posts should be distributed equally between Natives and Europeans.

2464. Have you considered the subject with reference to the requirements of the public Service?—I have not arrived at it by considering what specific posts should be allotted to Europeans. I simply say that if they are divided equally between Europeans and Natives, it will be a fair and just division, without reference to administrative necessities. But for political and administrative reasons, posts of Deputy Commissioners and Commissioners should never be given to Natives, unless they have proved their fitness for them. I would have a system of open provincial competition. But free admission to the competition should be allowed to men of high family and to graduates. I simply allow them to compete, and appointments should be made according to merit without reference to family.

Mr. *Stokes.*

2465. How do you propose to ascertain who are men of high family?—I would leave that to the Government to decide. Men of high family should be defined to include only those who hold grants of land from Government on account of their

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Sardar *Charat Singh.*

Mr. *Stokes*—continued.

services; only sons and very near relatives of such men should be eligible.

2466. You are aware that it is only by competition in England that the inhabitants of this country are admitted into the Covenanted Service. Is any dissatisfaction felt with reference to this system?—There is. The inhabitants of this country should pass the examination for the Covenanted Service held in India for a portion (that is to say, the half I have mentioned) allotted to the Natives. I think the Statutory Service should be abolished and the vacancies in the Civil Service divided equally between Natives and Europeans, and for the portion of the appointments allotted to Natives the examination should be held in India.

2467. Would you have identical examinations?—No.

2468. Would you raise the limit of age?—Yes, it should be raised to twenty-three.

2469. Would you hold the Indian examination in one place or more than one?—I prefer that it should be held provincially.

2470. Would you apportion the half you have allotted to Natives of this country among Natives of different creeds?—No, I think the Hindus and Mahomedans should be equally admitted to the competition, but no further preference should be given.

2471. Would you require the candidates who were successful in India to proceed to England to complete their training?—I would not make it compulsory.

2472. Are you acquainted with any Natives of India who have entered the Covenanted Service by examination in England?—No.

2473. Would you admit Europeans and Natives equally to either examination?—No, I think it is unnecessary that Europeans should come to India to compete. I would have the competition in England for English only, and the Indian examination for Indians only.

2474. Do you think the opinions you are expressing are the opinions of the class to which you belong?—Yes, generally speaking.

2475. Whether educated Sardars or not?—The sons of Sardars are now all being educated and they all wish that such a system should be adopted.

2476. You regard yourself as fairly representing that opinion?—Yes.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

2477. Do you desire to see *Raises* holding these appointments?—I do.

2478. You say the competition should be between graduates of every class and Sardars nominated by Government, whether graduates or not. Do you think *Raises* who are not graduates, who might now be nominated by the Government, will get any appointments when competing with graduates of the other class?—A very few would, but whether they would or not I would have competition.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

2479. Would you have Extra Assistant Commissioners, Munsiffs, and Tahsildars recruited from Natives of India as described in the Statute or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—I think the time is come when it might be recruited from any class. I would not restrict the appointments to Natives, and in case a European had sufficient knowledge of Persian so as to be able to understand the people, I should not see any harm in his being appointed.

2480. And before admitting him to competition would you submit him to a preliminary test as to his knowledge of that language?—Yes, and no one should be admitted who had not passed the Entrance Examination of a University in English or Persian.

2481. Should the recruitments for the Uncovenanted Service be by nomination or by competition, or by both?—By open competition.

2482. Even in the case of Sardars?—I think so.

2483. Would you confine the competition to the Provinces or open it to the whole of India?—I would have provincial competition.

2484. Then how would you apply it to Europeans?—Europeans of course might be admitted in any Province.

Mr. *White.*

2485. What do you mean by natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—Those born in the dominions of Her Majesty.

2486. Would you shut out all hope of promotion to the Covenanted ranks from the Uncovenanted men who had shown proved merit and ability?—That power should be reserved to Government. I have no objection to their being promoted without further competition.

2487. Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service accordingly as the posts are held by members of that branch of the Service, or by members of the Statutory and Uncovenanted branches?—I would make a distinction of one fifth or one-fourth in favour of Europeans, quite irrespective of the Service to which such Europeans belonged.

2488. Would you also make a distinction in the furlough rules on the ground of nationality?—I approve of the present rules.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

2489. Do you think that the entrance pay of the Statutory Civilian (Rs. 200 a month) and Rs. 250 a month on passing the Departmental Examination by the lower standard, is sufficient for him as a beginning?—I would give him the same pay before as after the examination.

WITNESS XLV.—23rd December 1886.

Examination of Lala MULRAJ, M. A., of the Uncovenanted Service; Extra Assistant Commissioner, Jhang, Punjab.

Lala Mulraj said:—I am a Graduate of Calcutta University. I entered the Service in 1880. I was educated in Lahore Government College. I am a *Sudh* by caste. I am now Extra Assistant Commissioner, performing the duties of a Subordinate Judge. I get Rs. 300 a month.

The *President*.

2490. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—It is not, because men are not appointed by competition. They do not belong to a graded system, and have no prospect of rising to very high posts. I think these defects can be remedied by an amendment of the rules; but if an organized Service cannot be created under the Statute at present, the Statute should be amended. I do not think it is necessary to amend it with reference to the sanction required for the appoinments, but I think that subjects of Native States should be admitted to the Statutory Service.

2491. If the Statutory Service is retained, should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training, or should they be encouraged to do so?—I think they should be encouraged to go, but I would not make it compulsory.

2492. How would you amend the rules as to admission to the Statutory Service?—The rules are very defective as they are at present. No provision is made for appointing people by competition. I would introduce a system in which half the appointments should be given by open competition and half by nomination. It would be open competition in so far as graduates would be admitted to it who had taken their M.A. degree, and B.A.'s should only be admitted if specially recommended, and others who should satisfy the Government that they were fit persons should be allowed to compete. I would maintain a register, as is done now for Extra Assistant Commissioners, and the selected candidates might compete. Nomination should only be made from the Uncovenanted Service and the professional classes, and members of the aristocratic classes also, if considered qualified.

2493. The first two classes of nominees would be men of approved merit and ability, but the third class need not be so?—Yes.

The *President*—continued.

2494. Might not that give rise to a sort of feeling of inferiority and jealousy between the men of family and the competitive men?—There might be such a feeling, but it would not affect the efficiency of the Service. I think it desirable to admit some members of the aristocratic class even if they are not very able.

2495. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Service?—Yes, the examination should be held in India as well as England; the maximum limit of age should be raised: Sanscrit and Arabic should be placed on an equal footing with Latin and Greek, and the Indian vernaculars should be added to the subjects of examination. These modifications should apply to both examinations which should be held simultaneously. I would have only one centre of examination in India. I would raise the present limit of age to twenty-five, but if that cannot be done, then to twenty-three. If the examination is not held in India simultaneously with the English examination, the Government might establish scholarships for people who may desire to compete in England. I would have only one general list and the candidates for appointment should be selected in order of merit; and if the examination is held in India, I would compel the successful candidates to proceed to England to complete their training.

2496. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives as described in the Statute, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—Only from Natives of India. The recruitment should be by competition and nomination combined; that is of the appointments given,—as to one-half by competition, and as to the other by nomination—as is done now in the case of Extra Assistant Commissionerships, and this system should be extended to Tahsildars too. A preference should be given to candidates according to the Provinces in which they are resident, but cases might arise in which it might be advisable to appoint residents of other Provinces, provided they have become domiciled or have been already in service in that Province. For selecting Natives of India I would not go beyond the Statutory definition of that class. If the Statutory Service is

The *President*—continued.

abolished, the proportion of offices assigned to that Service should be given to the Uncovenanted Service.

There ought to be a distinction made in the salaries allotted to posts, if such posts are held by Natives of the Statutory Service; that is, they should receive two-thirds of the pay which the Covenanted Service receive; and for the Uncovenanted Service there should be an entirely new gradation, as there is now in the Punjab. No distinction as to furlough should be made according to nationality, but I think that facilities should be given to those who desired to proceed to England whether English or Native officers. As regards promotion, I think the present rules should be extended to the Statutory Service.

WITNESS XLVI.—23rd December 1886.

Examination of Munshi MUHARRAM ALI, Chisti, Editor of the *Rafiq-i-Hind* Newspaper, Lahore.

The *President.*

M. *Muharram Ali* said:—I am Mahomed Ali, Chishti's brother. I am twenty-four years of age. I am editor of the *Rafiq-i-Hind*, the circulation of which is about 700 copies. I was partly educated privately, and partly at the Aligarh College. I hold no degree; my birthplace is Lahore.

2497. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Service approved in this Province?—Generally speaking, Mahomedans and Hindus approve of it, the exception being some few Hindus who are concerned in political agitation. In my opinion both the Statute and the rules are excellent and the definition of Natives of India is sufficient. It should only be for Government to satisfy itself that those Europeans and Eurasians as have settled in the Province have permanently taken up their abode in it.

2498. If the Statutory Service is retained should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training or should they be encouraged to do so? - If it is made compulsory it will be a very good thing. As regards the Statutory Service. the mode of selection adopted is excellent. One ground of excellence is that the Local Government can satisfy itself as to the family qualifications, morality, and so forth of the candidates, and in such matters entire confidence should be placed in it. It is not only necessary that a man should have read a certain number of books, but he must also possess other qualifications. If a system of open competition should exclude all other modes of recruitment, it is possible that men of low caste and manners will gain admission and the result will be that persons of good manners and high family, by whose families power has been exercised for generations, will be thrust aside. To compete with such men even successfully will be as disgraceful as failure, and whether there is an open or a limited competition the result will be the same, that Mahomedans will be generally excluded.

2499. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—It would be a great relief, in that it will make it easier for the Native candidates, if the limit of age be raised to at least twenty-two years. The advantage of this will be that instead of getting very young men on whose temper and tact no reliance can be placed, men of

The *President*—continued.

matured character will be obtained. Also a knowledge of Urdu should be made compulsory in order that those persons who come out here may, through its means, become acquainted with the manners and customs of the country. If any special favour should be shown to the Indian candidates in the matter of testing their qualifications, it will deteriorate from the value of the examination; therefore the same age and standard of fitness should be maintained for Natives and Europeans alike. All other existing conditions leave nothing to be desired. I would certainly not have an examination in India, because it would give rise to considerable difficulties. The result of an open competition would be to admit all persons such as graduates in Universities. Although there are a few honourable exceptions, the educational institutions are such that men become egotistical and opinionated like those who express their views in Bengali newspapers. Such persons think it a privilege to be constantly attacking the Government, and think that the advantages of education are simply to exercise license. Everything that relates to Englishmen they abuse, and labour in this way to give credit to some past dynasty in preference to the existing rules. And they are always aspiring to equal rank with the ruling class, which of course no Native in the country at any time has reached. In this manner the gulf between the rulers and the ruled has widened, and to place such persons in a position of trust is as dangerous for the governed as for the governors. Educated Hindus have stirred up a good deal of sectarian jealousy, and for this reason Mahomedans place little confidence in them. In an open competition the Province which is more advanced in education will obtain an advantage, and that is why the Bengali agitation of the press advocate this system. If, on the other hand, provincial examinations were held, there is still a danger that Mahomedans may be utterly excluded from the public service. The condition of the Mahomedans is at present such that they are excluded on account of their poverty from making large incomes in trade and all respectable professions, notwithstanding that the Government of India has to some extent kept them from being absolutely ruined by giving them special appointments, and should this support be removed the Mahomedans will be entirely ruined. Political considerations

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Munshi *Muharram Ali.*

The *President*—continued.

favour the Mahomedan view of the question. They consider that the great advance of the Hindus has placed the Government also in considerable difficulty? Cow-killing was in former days an every-day occurrence and attracted no comment on the part of the Hindus; but now, in consequence of the increased strength acquired by them through the education they have received, they directly oppose the Mahomedans and indirectly use cow-killing as a pretext for opposing Government, which recognises cow-killing as harmless. This and similar instances are sufficient evidence that there is no limit to Hindu arrogance. Open competition would not only increase their power by giving them more appointments, but the Mahomedan element will become still more reduced. This will hereafter become a serious political danger, for which there will be no remedy. Therefore, in my opinion, there should be no competitive examination, whether limited or open, for any Service. It is necessary that the examination should be held in England, because those who go there will have shown, by so doing, a certain amount of courage. Those of the Uncovenanted Service, who show merit and ability, should certainly be promoted to the Covenanted Service, and no distinction of any sort should be made between Eurasians and other classes and sects. Just as the Covenanted Service is thrown open to all subjects of Her Majesty, so the Uncovenated Service should be open also, and no natural-born subject of Her Majesty should be excluded, because that would be unjust. Serious difficulties would be occasioned by making Natives either Deputy Commissioners or Commissioners, whether they be Hindus or Mahomedans. There are many different sects in India between whom there can be no sympathy and who have no confidence in each other. To say that India is one nation or that Hindus and Mahomedans agree is a great mistake. I regard it as a special interposition of Providence that a race from beyond the seas, having no connection with either of these sects, should have come here to govern and should regard all with the even eyes of justice, and this is the race which alone is fitted for executive office. If these offices be given to Natives it will be just like putting a knife into the hands of a child to play with. At the present time the relations between the Hindus and Mahomedans are such that they would cut one another's throats. Thousands of cases of religious rioting occur, and then the question whether the vernacular should be Hindi or Urdu is brought forward as a knotty question. Religious books written in a controversial spirit are quite common. Quite recently, in a certain town, the Hindus held a meeting and passed a resolution not to do any of the following four things:—(1) hire a Mahomedan's carriage, or (2) purchase green grocery from any Mahomedan, or (3) call in any Mahomedan doctor, or (4) employ a Mahomedan Pleader, Vakil or Mukhtar. In some towns trade dealings between the two classes have actually ceased; and generally high feelings among even educated persons have reached such a state that they do not like to see a man of the opposite sect in office, however able he may be, nor do they put any confidence in him. If in such small matters as these the feeling was so high, it is perfectly obvious that when the question of appointments arises the feeling will be even higher. I feel confident that if at Hoshiarpur or Umballa there had been a Hindu or a Mahomedan Deputy Commissioner, serious consequences would have resulted, nor would it have been surprising if there had been a most serious breach of the peace. The Government has already opened sufficiently wide the door of employment for Hindus and Mahomedans, and as for Hindus they can attain to the Chief Court Bench, and one has already held office in the Chief Court. This is sufficient. If the Government admits Hindustanis to executive offices, then the population of all Hindustan will be deprived of those benefits which they now enjoy under British rule.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

2500. You say the Mahomedan population of this Province has been excluded by reason of its poverty from profession and trade?—Yes.

2501. Have they not rather been excluded from professions by their own unwillingness to learn English?—That period is passed. When Mahomedans looked upon an English education with disfavor, it was possibly one reason, but there are many others.

WITNESS XLVII.—23rd December 1886.

Examination of Maulvi MAHOMED ISMAIL of Peshwar.

Maulvi Mahomed Ismail stated:—I reside at Abbottabad, but I was born in Swat. I have served in the army and held the rank of Havildar, and sixteen years ago retired from the service. I am a zemindar, and also teach Europeans Pashtoo. I know the frontier well, Banu, Dera Ismail Khan and Mardan. I served at the last-named place a long time. There was a European officer in charge.

The *President.*

2502. Would you care to see a Native officer in charge at Mardan in place of a European. Would it be good for the administration of the frontier?—Yes, and the work would be done satisfactorily.

2503 Would you prefer a Punjabi for the post?—I would like a Native of my own country.

The *President*—continued.

2504. Supposing the service which is now filled by European officers were to be filled by Natives, would you prefer to see a Native appointed to a frontier district or a European?—There should be a man who knows the use of the sword as well as of the pen, who knows the customs of the country and who possesses a courageous disposition.

2505. Do you notice any improvement in the condition of the country under British rule?—There has been some improvement.

2506. To what do you attribute it?—I think to education and to peace and prosperity. In former times life and property were not secure, and hence there was no prosperity. If peace is secured, life and property are secured also. Peace and prosperity are increasing day by day under the British rule.

WITNESS XLVIII.—23rd December 1886.

Examination of GEORGE LEWIS, ESQ., B. A., of the Uncovenanted Service; Officiating Junior Government Advocate, Punjab; Extra Judicial Assistant Commissioner.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

George Lewis, Esq.

Mr. George Lewis said:—I am Officiating Junior Government Advocate. I am a Native of the Province. I have been in the service of the Government about eighteen years. I am an Extra Judicial Assistant Commissioner. I was first appointed to the Service in the Educational Department in which I served for a year and four months, and was then appointed Extra Judicial Assistant Commissioner by nomination.

The *President.*

2507. Have you formed any opinion on the Statutory system?—Yes.

2508. Have you had an opportunity of knowing what the public opinion on the question is?—The opinion of the educated classes is that of disapproval, because (1) there is no stated number of appointments guaranteed to be made in the year; (2) the appointments made under it do not amount to enrolment in an organized service; and (3) the selection is arbitrary and, in many cases in this Province, has resulted in the appointment of men who are decidedly inferior men to the Uncovenanted Service. As regards the Statute itself, the amendment I would make would be that a certain number of appointments should be guaranteed to be made annually. I would prescribe preliminary tests to ascertain who are deserving of a nomination and are likely to be possessed of sufficient merit and ability to hold the appointment to which they may be appointed, or to which they may be promoted in the course of service. I would constitute the service an organized Service, because it improves the status, and the prospects are better. I would also promote Uncovenanted men of proved merit and ability to those appointments and men from the professional classes also.

2509. Would you amend the definition of "Natives of India"?—No, I think the definition as it is may be allowed to stand.

2510. Whom would you make the sanctioning authority?—I think the Governor-General in Council.

2511. And if the Statutory Service is retained, would you send the selected candidates to England?—I would encourage them to go, and if they did go, it would certainly be beneficial, but as it will be in a way an inferior Service, perhaps it might not be advisable to compel them to go; because now if men of approved merit and ability are selected who have probably been six or seven years in the service, they may

The *President*—continued.

possibly have families to look after, and it might be otherwise inconvenient for them to go to England. For these reasons I think the rule should not be made compulsory, though every encouragement should be given. I would also recruit the Service by competition. My own preference is for open competition, but seeing the way the system of limited competition, in recruiting for Uncovenanted appointments, has succeeded, I am inclined to think it would succeed in this case also.

2512. Do you know that at the present time a proportion of one-fifth of the appointments reserved for the Covenanted Service is allotted to the Statutory Service with the result of giving the Punjab the opportunity of appointing only ·78 per cent. per annum?—That is too small.

2513. Has the Government hitherto always availed itself of its power under the Statute of appointing men to the Statutory Service?—I do not think an appointment has been made now for one or two years. I would raise the proportion to one-third and have more appointments.

Mr. *Stokes.*

2514. You say the present arrangements of the Statutory Service are disapproved. By whom?—I speak more of the educated and intelligent classes.

2515. Is the feeling confined to them?—I have not particularly consulted the zemindars and others, because they would not be able to appreciate the distinction. They can just distinguish between a good officer and a bad one.

2516. There are about thirteen millions of people in this Province. How many do you think have formed such an opinion?—You cannot expect the uneducated villagers to form any opinion on such matters.

2517. Would you say there were one hundred?—Far more than that.

2518. Have you been brought up in England?—No, entirely in the Punjab.

Mr. *Peacock.*

2519. You say one of the objections to the Statutory system is that worse men have been appointed under it than there are in the Uncovenanted Service. Is that your own or the general opinion? Have you had any opportunity of judging of their work?—There are five Statutory Civilians; of these I know four. With the exception

Mr. *Peacock*—continued.

of one, who is certainly quite equal to any Uncovenanted man, the others are very inferior. I have been an examiner in the Departmental tests for Extra Assistant and Assistant Commissioners, and I have seen the result of the examinations of these men, which show that they are very inferior men.

Mr. *Stokes.*

2520. They are quite young men, are they not?—One of them I have never seen. Another is about, I should think, thirty-eight or forty years of age, and the others are comparatively young men.

The *President.*

2521. You said you would alter the definition of Natives of India given in the Statute: do you know that that definition excludes the subjects of Native States?—Yes.

2522. Would you continue that exclusion?—I have not been able to give much thought to that subject. One advantage there might possibly be, and that is, that subjects of Native States working under the British Government would improve themselves a good deal, and possibly the administration of their own States, but that advantage cannot be given under the Statute.

2523. Do you think that the definition of Natives of India in the Statute is consistent with previous Parliamentary legislation; for instance, 3 and 4 William IV., Chapter 85, and the Queen's Proclamation, which say that no Native of the said country (meaning British India) nor any natural-born subject of Her Majesty resident therein shall by reason only of descent, colour or place of birth, be excluded from the public Service? Does not the Statute of 1870 exclude by reason of place of birth qualified subjects of Her Majesty?—It does.

2524. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—There is.

2525. What change would you propose?—Would you have the competition both in India and in England simultaneously and, as far as possible, identical?—I would raise the limit of age from nineteen to twenty-two. I say twenty-two, for this reason that I have noticed that some witnesses have mentioned twenty-three as the desirable maximum age, but I prefer twenty-two because a candidate who goes in at twenty-two and fails, at twenty-four would still have time to prepare for some other career. I would make a change in the subjects by introducing Indian History and the Vernaculars, and giving higher marks for Oriental classics, that is, Arabic and Sanscrit, so as to place them on a par with Latin and Greek, and by adding Persian to the list of subjects. These changes would place all classes of candidates on equal terms.

The *President*—continued.

2526. Would you have Government establish scholarships or allow passage-money to those who wished to proceed to England, supposing there to be only one examination?—If it be found impossible to hold the competitive examination in India also, then I would say let a few scholarships be established and awarded by open competition to enable young men to go to England to study, but not otherwise.

2527. If the examination is held in India, would you hold it at more than one centre?—No, at only one centre.

2528. Should the candidates in England and in India compete with one another and be selected in order of merit, or should a certain number of appointments be apportioned for competition to the candidates at the respective examinations?—They should compete with one another in one list, and be selected in order of merit.

2529. Should there be an apportionment between the residents in the territories of the several Administrations respectively, or between the members of the principal religious sects?—There should be one general Service.

2530. If competition is held in India, should the successful candidates be required, as a condition obligatory, to proceed to England to complete their training?—Yes, in the case of the Covenanted Civil Service I would insist on their going.

2531. Would not the introduction of Oriental subjects decidedly alter the present character of the examination?—Yes.

2532. Are you aware of the reasons why the standard fixed upon was an exclusively English one?—I am not.

2533. Then your opinion is formed without reference to the reasons which led to the conclusions of the Committee of 1855?—Yes.

2534. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in the Statute or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—Personally I am against race distinctions. Those who possess sufficient merit and ability ought to be admissible to any Service. But having regard to special circumstances, I think some restrictions should be imposed in their case, because at the present time all the highly-paid appointments are held by Europeans. Most of the higher services under Government are practically reserved for Europeans. Then, again, non-domiciled Europeans, not Natives of India in the Statutory Service, have the whole extent of the British empire open to them, nor is it likely that Natives of India would compete with them for posts in other parts of the empire, nor that they would be accepted if they did. For these reasons to deprive the Natives of India of any portion of the Uncovenanted Service without compensating them in some way would be unfair. But should all other departments of Government Service be

Vol. I. Sec. II Punjab.

George Lewis, Esq.

The *President*—continued.

thrown open to Natives of India, then I would say let this department also be thrown open to all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty. At present the departments of Public Works, Accounts, Opium, Police, Forests, &c., are practically reserved for Europeans; unless we proceed on the footing of perfect equality in the other branches of the administration there is no reason for doing so as regards this.

2535. Limiting your answer to the case of Extra Assistant Commissioners, Munsiffs, and Tahsildars should the recruitment be by competition or by nomination, or by both systems combined?—By limited competition, though personally I prefer open competition. Sometimes for administrative reasons it might be expedient for Government to nominate a man, and I would leave to it that discretion.

2536. There are at present three departments in the Uncovenanted Service—viz., Extra Assistant Commissioners recruited by limited competition, Munsiffs also who are recruited by limited competition, and Tahsildars appointed entirely by patronage: would you have your system of open competition or limited competition applied to all three classes equally, or make a distinction according to each?—I think I would have limited competition for Tashildars as well as for the others.

2537. And if open competition should be applied to the other classes, would you have it for Tahsildars also?—I would not object.

2538. Whatever system be adopted, should the recruitment be made by the several Administrations only from persons resident in the territories under such Administrations respectively, or with a preference, for such residents?—I would confine it to the residents of the Province, that is, people *bonâ fide* residents in the Province or by long service connected with it.

2539. If the existing Statutory system is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that Service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes.

Mr. *Ryland*.

2540. Have not Uncovenanted men, non-domiciled Europeans, been found worthy and been appointed to posts in the Service?—Yes.

2541. And have they worked satisfactorily?—Yes.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

2542. You said the special departments of the service were so worked as to exclude Natives. What do you mean? The Forest Department requires a particular training, does it not?—Natives are now undergoing training, but my impression is that the training is acquired after appointment.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

2543. What department do you refer to particularly?—There is the Accountant-General's Department. It is a large department, but I do not think there are many Natives in it holding an officer's rank. In the Public Accounts Department there is only one Native Examiner of Accounts in the whole of the service.

2544. And as regards the higher grades of the Public Works Department?—I do not know details, but I do not think there are any Natives in it.

2545. Are you aware that these departments are taken out of the ordinary course under special orders of the Secretary of State?—I was not aware of that.

2546. Are you aware that the Opium, Salt, Customs, and Police Departments, for instance, are so treated?—I was not aware that such was the case, but if they are and the practical working of this order is that they are reserved for Europeans, then I say it would be unfair to open the Uncovenanted ranks to Europeans.

2547. Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service accordingly as the posts are held by members of that branch of the Service, or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches?—I would say that members of the Statutory Service should have two rates of pay; such of them as availed themselves of the option given them of going to England should get 75 per cent. and those who do not avail themselves of the opportunity of going to England should get 70 per cent. of the pay of the Covenanted Service.

2548. Should any distinction be made in the furlough rules applicable to the Statutory and Uncovenanted members of the Service according to the nationality of the officer or on any other ground? I would give Europeans more furlough. As regards the Covenanted Service I think the furlough now allowed is enough. Under the present rules all the furlough a Statutory Civilian, whether selected by competition or taken from the Uncovenanted ranks, is entitled to is two years' furlough in the whole of his service. That is not enough. European officers as a rule work better in proportion as they are able to take more leave.

2549. Are the privileges in regard to promotion and retiring annuity and the general conditions of office belonging to the Covenanted Civil Service suitable to members obtaining office under the Statutory rules?—I think the pension is sufficient. In the case of Covenanted Civilians a portion of their furlough counts towards pension, in the case of others it does not. I say a little more furlough should be allowed to them, and it should count towards pension. I don't think the present entrance pay of an Extra Assistant Commissioner Sufficient. I think they should get Rs. 300.

WITNESS No. VIII. Recalled—24th December 1886.

Further examination of W. MACKWORTH YOUNG, Esq., of the Covenanted Civil Service, Secretary to Government, Punjab.

The *President.*

2550. You said it would not be advisable in some sub-divisions of the Frontier to have any but European agency?—I have served on the Frontier. I should not wish to be understood as having said that I should wish other than Europeans in the higher executive posts in any of the districts.

2551. I was speaking of Frontier sub-divisions and districts; I think you said they should have European officers?—There should not only be European officers at the head of all districts, but there *must* be Europeans in charge of the Frontier districts and sub-divisions.

2552. There is a special force kept up for the Frontier?—There are fifty-six Military and Militia posts or joint posts, but out of the fifty-six about forty are solely Militia, and out of the sixteen remaining some are joint and some are solely Military posts.

2553. And they alternate a good deal, I believe?—Very much so.

2554. And they must work in close communication?—Yes.

2555. How are the Militia enlisted?—The Militia are appointed in every case from Natives of influence in the neighbourhood by the District Officer, but in the Derajat the Military officers have the power to veto a dismissal.

2556. The Military and Civil officers work in close connection with each other?—Yes.

2557. The Military officers in the regiments of the Frontier Force are mostly European officers?—They are all officered by Europeans in the same way as line regiments are, except that the number is much smaller.

2558. Will you name the Frontier districts?—Hazara, Peshawar, Kohat in the Peshawar Division; Bannu, Dera Ismail Khan and Dera Ghazi Khan in the Derajat Division. When I talk about Frontier districts these are the North-West Frontier districts, but of the thirty-one districts in the Punjab all except five either adjoin independent territory or important Native States in political relationship with the Punjab or Rajputana States.

2559. Taking the independent North-West Frontier, can you tell the number of fighting men among the Afghan and Biloch tribes respectively. I mean the number of men who, if a levy were made of the tribes, would join arms against us?—The number is supposed to be 213,400. I should say roughly about half extend along the Northern Frontier down to Kohat, and the other half in places adjoining the Derajat Division.

The *President*—continued.

2560. Within your recollection has the peace of the frontier been disturbed by these tribes within recent years?—Yes, a great many times. Here is a long list of expeditions since the annexation; forty-four sets of Military operations or expeditions since 1849. A great many of course may have been necessary immediately after the annexation.

2561. But within the last ten years?—The important operations since 1877 are eight in number. Our relations with all these tribes at present are satisfactory and friendly, except that we have very serious trouble with the Bonér tribe on the Peshawar border.

2562. Have we any near Oghee?—Yes, the Akazais and coming further south the Sheoranis with whom we are at feud. Our relations with the Bilochis at present are friendly.

2563. But within your own recollection have we had any quarrels with them?—We have had quarrels with the Marrees since 1880.

2564. Can you say whether, for instance, in times of possible difficulty, such as the Kabul War or any disturbances on the Frontier, special demands are made on the Civil Staff?—Very large demands indeed, not only in the Frontier districts, but all over the Punjab. I have not any actual statistics of the supplies furnished, but during the Abyssinian Expedition in 1868, the Afghanistan Campaign in 1878 to 1880 and during recent military preparations in 1885 the duties which fell upon District officers in connection with furnishing supplies and transport were extremely arduous; and in the Egyptian Campaign also in the collection of transport. In fact this is both the recruiting ground and the commissariat ground for all Military expeditions in the East of late years. The five other districts not adjoining any Frontier or Native State are Lahore, Shahpur, Gujranwala, Jhang and Delhi.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

2565. Have you had religious riots in any of these districts?—Yes, in Delhi and

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

Lahore notably so. While Shahpur, Jhung and Gujranwala are all three districts which require a firm hand, because of the nature of the population, which is largely Mahomedan. Cattle-lifting is an extremely common offence in these districts and as regards crime generally, of that character, the districts are very backward.

The *President*.

2566. Do these districts lie on the commercial highway of the Punjab?—Not the Jhang or the Shahpur districts, although a railway has now been completed to the Shahpur district; the others do.

2567. In the large towns of the Punjab have you a large mixed population of travellers from Central Asia and other parts?—Yes. Peshawar and Lahore are the large centres. Peshawar, Rawalpindi and Lahore contain a number of such people. Not many Frontier people go to Delhi; of course there is a mixed population at Delhi of every kind.

2568. Do you from time to time have travelling caravans of persons who require special supervision?—Certainly, the Powindahs in the Derajat are large carriers and come down in large numbers with their camels.

2569. I am speaking rather of the wandering tribes?—Yes, numbers of them pass through the Punjab, but I do not think we are more troubled with them actually with regard to crime than the other Provinces of India. They mostly go through the Punjab.

2570. What is the present strength of European officers in the Punjab?—The total strength of the Commission is 133, of which 97 appointments are what were regarded as *cadre* appointments during the recent correspondence about the reorganization.

2571. Have you many Military Civilians in the Commission?—We have still a good number in the higher ranks, a very much larger number of course than we shall have ultimately when the due proportions have been reached.

2572. Are there at present any orders as to the number of Staff officers we must retain in Civil employ?—Yes, we get two Military men in every three years.

2573. Do you consider it necessary that you should have Military officers in the Commission?—No, I do not think it is in the least necessary. I do not think there is any difference practically except that we have no guarantee as to qualifications in regard to young Military officers. Practically the Military officers of the Commission cease to be Military men. I see no reason why any distinction should be made.

2574. Can you give us the date of the despatch of the Government Financial Department No. 2229?—29th December 1881.

The *President*—continued.

2575. Are these Military men generally stationed on the Frontier?—No, not by any means exclusively so. In fact, we generally make no difference in posting.

2576. Have you any record which shows the number of disputes on religious grounds. I mean complaints in Criminal Courts arising out of party feeling?—I believe 87 arose out of the Hoshiarpur riots the other day.

2577. I am speaking of cases where complaints were made of offending religious prejudices, cow-killing for instance?—I am able to say there have been disturbances or threatened disturbances not unfrequently of late years. They have become more frequent of late years.

2578. To what cause do you attribute that?—Of course I hold an opinion about such things, and I am not quite sure whether I ought to give the reasons I have formed, but such disturbances have become more frequent. There is no doubt that there is a revival of religious feeling stimulated by societies, and there has been a tendency to excess of demonstration in regard to both Hindus and Mahomedans, which demonstration has operated eventually to incense the other party.

2579. Possibly that is a consequence of the toleration of the Government?—No doubt. Then I think one thing which has contributed very much to it has been the gradual uplifting of the heads of the Hindus. There is no doubt that the Hindus have of late years, owing also to the fact of British rule, come to realise that they hold an equal position with Mahomedans, which they certainly did not hold in former times, and they have come to lift up their heads and assert their rights, and that has been one cause. Then I think the general tendencies of our rule, and specially the tendency of recent measures have been to remove many of the obstacles to a free expression of opinion which formerly existed, and that our Local Self-Government system and other measures, such as the introduction of competition, have unavoidably been the means of eliciting a very much stronger self assertion in the different races. I mean the general drift of our administration which is to make all officers free to all classes and award posts to those who show merit.

Mr. *Stokes*.

2580. If one class thought it was certain to fail in competition, it would be discontented?—Quite so, and that has no doubt been the case with Mahomedans. May I mention with regard to the cadre that I have examined the lists for the last three years and find that in each of those three years, at a time of the year when most men are away on leave, when our staff is weakest, there have been only two men who have

Mr. *Stokes*—continued.

passed their examinations, that is, men not in training, available for emergencies, all the other members of the Commission having been employed in superior appointments, that is to say, in appointments generally considered cadre appointments, including of course members absent under the Government of India, and also men on leave.

2581. Has the Punjab Government availed itself to the full extent of the powers permitted it by the Statutory rules to appoint men to the Statutory Service?—No, for the last two years there have been no appointments.

2582. How is that?—Simply because of the difficulty felt in recommending men—the difficulty felt in making a selection.

2583. How many appointments might have been made in those two years?—One appointment a year is what has generally been allotted to the Punjab. We have always had one a year.

2584. As a matter of fact one Native was appointed to high office in lieu of a Statutory appointment, on the ground that the Local Government had no Native whom they could recommend as possessed of the qualifications required by the Statute?—Yes.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

2585. Even if one more Statutory Native had been appointed, would that have removed the difficulties which you say were experienced by Government during the leave season of the year?—No, certainly not.

2586. I understand you to say that with the present cadre of the Government service there was a scarcity of qualified Civilians at certain periods of the year?—Yes.

2587. And even if this one Statutory Civilian had been appointed it would not have made any difference?—I have not reckoned Statutory Civilians as available for these appointments: I have excluded them from the computation.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

2588. How long after English candidates join the Commission are they entrusted with the full powers of a Magistrate?—From one to three years. The men, who pass their examinations quickly, and I think 50 per cent. do so, get full powers after one year, of the remainder I think half pass in two years and half in three.

2589. Do you know any instance of an officer being appointed to exercise magisterial powers in less than six months?—No, certainly not. It is against the rules. I think that before a man can exercise full powers he must have exercised special

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

powers, that is second-class powers for six months.

The *President.*

2590. The servants of Government have been invited to give evidence before the Commission, and a notification has been published inviting any one who wished to give evidence to appear. Do you consider from what you know of the manner in which notice was issued and invitations given that sufficient opportunity has been given to all classes resident in the Punjab to represent their opinions before the Commission?—Certainly.

2591. Have the phases of important opinion in the Province so far as you know been fairly represented before the Commission so far as the enquiry has gone?—The phases of opinion in the Province have been by no means proportionately represented by the witnesses.

2592. Have any important phases of opinion been excluded from representation?—Certainly.

2593. Which?—I should say that one very important phase has happened not to present itself, and that is the Native official class; men who have no sort of grievance or object in connection with the present inquiry.

2594. What class do you refer to?—I allude to the whole of the Native service. I think that of the Native officials who have been examined, I should say all the persons of the Uncovenanted Service are persons who have special objects in view, special grievances in connection with the subject of the inquiry.

2595. Rai Buta Mall for instance?—Yes, I think so. I would not use the word grievance exactly, but they are all men who have, so to speak, a personal interest.

2596. Lala Sagar Chand?—I believe him to be a man who might compete in a competitive examination.

Mr. *Ryland.*

2597. Do you consider the prospects of the Civil Service to be injuriously affected or reasonable ground of complaint given by the introduction of the Statutory Service, and the proportion of appointments made over to that service by the existing rules?—No, certainly not.

2598. Do you not also think that they would be less affected by the elimination or rather omission in the future of the Military class?—Certainly to that extent.

Mr. *Ramsawami Mudaliyar.*

2599. Are there any Natives in the Frontier Districts as Sub-divisional Officers?—No.

WITNESS XLIX.—24th December 1886.

Examination of Sodhi MAN SINGH, Honorary Magistrate of the Ferozepore District.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Sodhi *Man Singh.*

NOTE.—Sodhi Man Singh is a member of the Sodhi family. The Sikh religion was established by Guru Nanak, whose descendants are known as *Bedis*; the successors to the office of *Guru* were ten in number, and their descendants are known as *Sodhis*. They are much venerated by the Sikhs. Sodhi Man Singh belongs to the family of the fourth Guru *Ramdas*. He is a man of influence and a large landed proprietor and jagirdar.

Sodhi Man Singh said:—I belong to the Ferozepore District and to the Sodhi family; we are a considerable family, descendants of Guru Ramdas, who was one of the Sikh Gurus. He was the fourth Guru and the founder of the Darbar Saheb. I am sixty years old. I remember the Sikh rule.

The *President.*

2600. What was the state of things then, was life and property secure?—No.

2601. Are they secure now?—There is a great difference now.

2602. Were there any schools, hospitals and dispensaries for the sick then?—There were no Government schools.

2603. Is there any difference in that respect now?—There is a great difference.

The *President*—continued.

2604. To what do you attribute it?—To the favour of Government.

2605. Do you think that the control and supervision of European officers has in any way contributed to that difference?—Yes.

2606 Do you think that progress and improvement would be in any way impaired if there were less European supervision?—In my opinion it is very desirable that English officers should maintain that supervision.

2607. Do you think there is any district in this Province in which Native agency could with advantage be substituted for European?—No, not altogether.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

2608. I suppose you have large landed property in this Province?—Yes, I hold property of my own and also jagir lands.

2609. In what part of the country?—In all three tahsils of the Ferozepore District.

2610. In any other district?—Not personally, but my relations have.

WITNESS L.—24th December 1886.

Examination of Risaldar Bahadur Sardar MAN SINGH, C.I.E., President of the Committee of Management of the Sikh Temple (known as *Darbar Saheb*), Amritsar.

Risaldar Bahadur Sardar Man Singh, C. I. E., said:—I am President of the Managing Committee of the Sikh Temple at Amritsar. I am seventy-five years of age. I belong to a family of landholders and possess estates in Gujranwala.

I was originally in the service of Maharaja Ranjit Singh, and was in the ranks of the army which fought against the British during the Sikh Campaign. After the introduction of British rule I joined their army. I was in Hodson's Horse and served all through the Mutiny. I have the Order of Merit of the 1st Class and the Order of British India of the 1st Class, and also the C. I. E.

The *President.*

2611. Do you notice any change in the country since the British administration was introduced?—There are many and great improvements as compared with those days.

2612. Do you consider that that improvement has been closely associated with employment of European agency in the Province?—Yes.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

2613. Was it not the case in the time of Maharaja Ranjit Singh that Mahomedans and Hindus and Sikhs served under him in very high offices?—Yes, and French also.

2614. Were they not all treated equally?—Yes, the Maharaja regarded them alike.

2615. And if he found them worthy did he not promote them to high offices of State?—Yes.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyr*—continued.

2616. Had he any reason to repent of having employed Mahomedans and Hindus in those higher posts?—No.

2617. Were not many Mahomedans also employed by him in high offices in the army?—Yes, in the artillery, but he had more Sikh Sardars in his service than Mahomedans.

2618. You know something of the men of the last generation?—Yes.

2619. Do you not think there are many Natives employed by our British Government who discharge their duties faithfully and honestly?—Certainly, men of family would show honesty and ability.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

2620. Are you in favour of competitive examinations for admission to the Government service?—High qualifications are certainly necessary, but men of high family do not generally succeed in passing the examinations

2621 Which do you prefer. competition or nomination?—It would be hard for men of my family or of my class to pass examinations A man of high family should be required to pass the middle school test and the Entrance examination, not more. The reason for this being that men of high family have only life grants of land, and their sons must seek employment. If they do not get it their families will come to poverty; the door of the public service should therefore be open to them.

2622. Have you had any riots at Amritsar?—No.

WITNESS LI.—24th December 1886.

Examination of W. E. PURSER, Esq., of the Covenanted Civil Service; Deputy Commissioner, Rohtak, Punjab.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

W. E. Purser, Esq.

Mr. Purser said:—I am Deputy Comissioner of Rohtak. I have been fifteen years in the settlement. I am a competition Civilian.

2623. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—I know nothing about the Statutory Service. I have never met any Statutory Civilians. I have not discussed the matter with Native gentlemen.

2624. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—Yes, on the grounds that it is impossible for Natives to pass under the present system; at least it is exceedingly difficult for them, because of the disadvantages under which they labour as regards the examination being conducted in a foreign language, and that educational advantages in India are not as great as they are in England. They say the age-limit is too low. I do not think any of these objections are well founded.

2625. Would you make any changes to obviate them?—I would not, because I think the appointments which should be held by Covenanted Civilians should be held by very superior Natives. I do not think an average Native is at all fitted for the appointments. I think the Natives who obtain really high positions, such as Deputy Commissionerships and Commissionerships, should be not only able to pass the examinations, but should show other qualifications, such as enterprise and freedom from prejudice. They would show these qualities if they went to England; in other words, by overcoming these difficulties. Moreover, I think that half these difficulties, if the Natives had any enterprise, could really be overcome. I see no reason why Natives should not establish a Native school in England and send their children there for training.

2626. Do you think the present system gives us the best Natives we are likely to get under any system for the higher posts of the Covenanted Service?—I am unable to express any opinion on that point.

2627. When were you appointed?—I was appointed in 1865.

2628. Then you are unaffected by any changes that have been made?—Quite.

2629. You have never worked with Statutory Civilians?—No.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

2630. Have you held district posts?—Yes, I am Deputy Commissioner at present.

2631. Would you admit Europeans not habitually resident in India to compete with Natives for the Uncovenanted Service, meaning by that Extra Assistant Commissioners, Munsiffs, and Tahsildars, or allow them to be nominated for these posts?—I would not, but I would allow the sons of Europeans domiciled in India to compete

2632. Would you admit the sons of European officers serving in India?—If they come to India to settle, yes.

2633. Do you prefer competition or nomination, or a combination of both for the Uncovenanted Service?—I prefer nomination followed by competition.

2634. Are you satisfied with the systems which are obtaining in this Province?—Yes.

2635. Would you appoint Tahsildars by the same system as Extra Assistant Commissioners or not?—I think Tahsildars should either be appointed by promotion from deserving Naib Tahsildars or else by nomination followed by competition.

2636. Would you impose any educational qualifications upon persons seeking to enter the Tahsildar class, persons who have not been Naibs?—I think it would be unnecessary to impose any further test than a competition after nomination.

2637. Would you recruit for the Uncovenanted Service provincially or from the whole of India?—I should prefer to do so provincially, because I think it would be fairer to the Provinces, especially the backward ones, and I think a Punjabi would be more likely to be in sympathy with the people than an outsider.

Mr. *Ryland.*

2638. You have said that you would not have mere education as a test for the public Service, but you think other qualifications are also necessary?—Yes, for the higher posts.

2639. Do you think these qualifications are to be found in domiciled Europeans and Eurasians in this country in a higher degree than in Natives?—I have met too few of the classes to which you refer to be able to form any opinion. I have never had anythink to do with Eurasians officially.

Mr. *Ryland*—continued.

2640. Are Natives belonging to other Provinces in any way excluded from serving here or from competing for the Government service in this Province?—There is a general tendency to appoint men of the Province, and I would leave things as they are.

Mr. *Peacock*.

2641. Do you think Natives are under any disability in regard to age in competing with Europeans in England?—I think they are so far under disability that I do not think the educational institutions of this country are equal to the English. In fact I doubt if a man can get as good an education here by the age of seventeen as he can at home. I do not propose to put them on terms of equality in that respect. I would have Natives sent to England at an early age to be educated there in order that they may become in thorough sympathy with the policy of Government, and at present I think that is the only way in which they will acquire that sympathy.

Mr. *Peacock*—continued.

2642. But would they not thereby lose touch with the Natives of this country?—I do not think so.

WITNESS LII.—23rd December 1886.

Examination of D. C. J. IBBETSON, Esq., of the Covenanted Civil Service; Deputy Commissioner, Delhi, Punjab.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

D. C. J. Ibbetson, Esq.

Mr. Ibbetson said:—I have been sixteen years in the service.

The *President.*

2643. And in that time you have not only risen from the ranks to be Deputy Commissioner, but have served in the Settlement Department, been Director of Public Instruction and Superintendent of a Native State, so that your experience has been varied?—Yes.

2644. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—It certainly is not approved by most.

2645. With regard to Native society?—I do not think the masses know anything about it. They look at results not at methods. The educated class does disapprove of it. I have, however, very little experence of them

2646. Why do you disapprove of it?—In the first place it admits Natives to the higher administrative appointments which I do not think advisable, and I think if they are not to be admitted to those posts it is wiser to put them in a separate Service and say at once that that Service is not to enjoy those appointments. In the Judicial line I would have no bar whatever.

2647. Have you any other objection to the system?—Yes, I think it practically confines our choice to the highly educated men, and among the natural leaders of the people those men are few. I would select them first and educate them afterwards.

2648. Any other objections?—Yes, it leaves the working of the system absolutely dependent on the policy of the day, and by doing so deprives the Covenanted staff of all certainty of prospects and gives rise to reasonable dissatisfaction.

2649. How would you amend the Statute?—I would alter the system, that is to say, the rules.

2650. Would you alter the definition of Natives of India?—Yes, by moving the word "born" to after the word "domiciled" instead of before. At present a man, a pure Asiatic, who happens to be born on a voyage or outside the limits of India, would not be a Native or India. I would create a Local Civil Service with a clearly defined number of appointments awarded to it, and all appointments made outside of it should require the sanction of the Secretary of State.

The *President*—continued.

2651. Would you send men selected for your local Service to England for training or only encourage them to go?—I certainly should not require them to go, though I should encourage them to go after they had grown up and become men. I only know one Statutory Civilian. His work was very good in all respects, except that he was exceedingly rude and discourteous to Natives.

2652. You said just now that the Statutory system gave rise to certain uneasiness in the minds of the Covenanted Service: will you kindly explain?—With reference to that I would like to put in a note. I speak with absolute disinterestedness myself, as I am in an exceptionally good position. It seems to me as a matter of policy and equity that the claims grounded on reasonable expectations must be respected. The Civil Service Commissioners brought the prospects of the Service to public notice by a paper circulated some years ago. The alterations in those prospects which are rendered possible were not so brought to notice. I think a much stronger point than that is the expectations founded on the existing practice. We come out here and find a system working; we work under it for sixteen or nineteen years, and then we are to be told that it is to be altered with retrospective effect, because a mere enabling Statute was passed in 1870 under which rules were not framed till 1879 and not acted upon till 1884. The Statute certainly applied to all appointments, but it is agreed that that was only done in order to obviate the necessity of getting fresh sanction for each promotion; and as a fact, it was so worked until quite lately; all appointments were made to the bottom of the Commission, and that was the system under which the men at present in the Service have worked for so many years.

2653. Has this uneasiness injuriously affected the Service to any appreciable extent?—I cannot say that. They are English gentlemen who have undertaken work and they do it, but I do think they feel that they have been hardly treated. There is a feeling of injury which, if carried to a certain pitch, must injure the Service, and must certainly injure the prospects of recruitment. I think the whole of the difficulty is that they feel they have no certainty whatever as to how many men will not be put in over their heads. If the number of appointments were limited, it might be another thing, but

The *President*—continued.

so long as it is left perfectly open they feel there is a possibility of their being injured.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

2654. Are you aware that a Bill with the same objects as the Act 33 Victoria was more than once introduced before that Bill was passed?—I did not know that.

2655. Do you know that it formed the subject of public discussion in Parliament?—No.

2656. And that it related to the question as to the employment of Natives in the higher Civil Service?—No, I know nothing about it. That is why I laid so little stress on the point, because I knew nothing about the history of the measure.

2657. In 1870 the Bill was passed after discussion?—Yes.

2658. Any gentleman who was at that time interested in sending his son to India would have had an opportunity of being informed of his son's prospects?—Yes.

2659. The Act contemplates apparently the appointment to certain posts. You think it undesirable, because it interferes with the reasonable expectations of the gentlemen already in the Service?—Unless the number of posts are prescribed.

2660. You object to the Statute because it does not prescribe the quota which should be given?—It would not obviate my objection if the posts were reserved, so that the men put in to fill them were put in over the heads of the existing Civilians.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

2661. The reserve at present is as regards the number of posts in the whole Service. You would like it to be so modified that the number of posts reserved in the several grades of the Service should be stated?—Yes.

2662 But that these grades should not be reserved until the men at present in the Service have passed that point?—Yes.

Mr. *Ryland.*

2663. Up to what standing do you consider these prospects are affected. You say you yourself are not affected by it?—I am affected by it in this way that if a Divisional Judge were appointed to-morrow he would come in over my head

2664. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—I have never discussed the question with Natives

2665. Do Natives of India labour under any and what disadvantages in competing for employment in this branch of the Service?—They have an advantage in one way and a great disadvantage in another. They must be at great disadvantage in any examination carried on in English. The advantage is that their intellectual powers

Mr. *Ryland*—continued.

are greater, say at seventeen and eighteen, in comparison with those of Englishmen.

2666. Would you make any changes in order to minimise or remove these disadvantages?—I would raise the age to remove the disadvantage, but in the case of both classes of candidates, I would not alter the subjects of examination, nor would I have a simultaneous examination for India.

Mr. *Stokes.*

2667. If you have a system of nomination for the public Service in India, I suppose you would have it as wide as possible?—If a sufficient number of really competent candidates could be found, I would allow them to compete among themselves after nomination I would select the men that are most desirable, but it is very often very difficult to judge between the claims of men who are equally qualified so far as influence and family go; and in that case if there were a sufficient number of them, competition among them would not be objectionable; but I think that is the only form in which it would be unobjectionable in India.

2668. Do you consider the men obtained by competition in England as good as any who could be obtained under any system?—No, I think the lowering of the age has very seriously lowered the level, but with that exception I know no better means of selecting them

2669. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in the Statute, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—Only from Natives of India as defined in the Statute.

2670 Should the recruitment be by competition or by nomination, or by both systems combined?—I think by nomination, and, in case of a sufficient number of qualified candidates, by competition among themselves

2671. Would you apply that system to all classes of the Uncovenanted Service, that is to say, Extra Assistant Commissioners, Munsiffs, and Tahsildars, or would you make a distinction?—I would have the same system for all the Punjab. I would have it absolutely Provincial.

2672. If the existing Statutory Service is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that Service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes, I think so. I would make a local Service with a District Judgeship at the top and the present Extra Assistant Commissioners in it

2673. Do you think it desirable that there should be a proportion of Europeans in the Uncovenanted Service?—Europeans domiciled here, but not Europeans who come to India merely in search of employment. I mean only Natives as defined in the Statute as I would amend it.

Mr. *Peacock.*

2674. Are you in favour of recruiting for the Subordinate Judicial Service from among members of the High Court or local Bar?—I think power might be taken to make such appointments, provided the number and grade were fixed carefully so as not to injure vested interests. I would not subject them to any competitive examination.

2675. I thought you said you would subject to competition all Uncovenanted candidates if there were enough to secure a competition?—No, I think every Service should be recruited in the first place by the promotion from the next lower Service of the most deserving men without any competition whatever. Ordinarily the method of recruitment would be by nomination of men who would begin at the bottom and be trained for service and in the Service, and then if there were a sufficient number of candidates they might compete among themselves. But when you come to select men from the Bar on the ground of distinct merit and ability, then the difficulty of judging does not arise at all.

2676. Supposing you do not take members of the local Bar to fill the offices of Munsiffs, could you promote upwards from the Tahsildars? I mean have they that kind of training which would be the best?—Tahsildars have a training which is not very necessary for a Judicial officer. They have not a complete legal training.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

2677. Why do you wish for absolutely provincial recruitment for the Uncovenanted Service?—I think the Punjabis are more manly and independent than the Natives of other Provinces. I do not think they would submit to be ruled by Natives of other Provinces.

2678. Does that objection apply to the Covenanted posts?—I think so, certainly.

2679. Do you consider that there is any foundation for the opinion expressed here that the class of Tahsildars who are recruited from the Amla class are more liable to corrupt influences than those appointed by the educational test and placed at once to Tahsildarships?—I have never had Tahsildars under me. I can only say this, that the Amla are a distinctly corrupt class.

2680. You have been brought into close contact with the people?—Yes.

2681. Have you ever heard complaints of the corruption of the Tahsildars?—I have had no experience of them since the educated class began to come into the Service.

2682. Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service accordingly as the posts are held by members of that branch of the Service, or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches?—

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued

Yes, I think so. I would base the distinction upon nationality in the Covenanted Service In the Uncovenanted Service I do not think I would make any difference. I would give the European higher pay in the Statutory and Covenanted, but not in the Uncovenanted Service.

2683. Would you pay Natives who go to England and succeed in the competition equally with Englishmen in the Covenanted Service?—I do not think I should be prepared to pay them less.

2684. Should any distinction be made in the furlough rules applicable to the Statutory and Uncovenanted branches of the Service according to the nationality of the officer, or on any other and what ground?—I think the question is purely one of domicile. A man whose family is in England requires different furlough rules.

2685. As regards promotion, do you think Statutory Natives once appointed should be appointed thereafter in the same way as Europeans?—I would put the Extra Assistants in a separate list.

2686. Would you approve of any arrangements by which the pay of appointments should be a fixed sum and the men from England should get staff allowances?—I would approve of it very strongly on grounds connected with the Covenanted Service only. But I have not fully considered the matter.

Mr. *Stokes.*

2687. Do you not think that the discontent of the Covenanted Service out here would be more likely than anything else to affect recruitment at home?—Yes, I think it would distinctly.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

2688. Are you acquainted with the educational institutions of the Punjab?—I was Director of Public Instruction for eighteen months.

2689. Have you any colleges affiliated to the University?—No, the University is merely an examining body. We have colleges, the Delhi and Lahore Colleges, teaching up to the B. A. standard

2690. In your judgment do these colleges at present give a sufficient training to enable their students to go to England with a fair hope of success at the competitive examination?—I do not think they do.

2691. How many boys a year do you think are educated in this Province who would be likely to be successful, if the competition were held in England and India with the same papers and one general list?—I should doubt if there would be any.

2692. Are the middle schools and colleges of the Province efficient?—The education so far as it goes is sound.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

2693. Where were you educated?—I was educated in Australia so far as school work goes, and took my degree at Cambridge.

2694. Comparing the men who go up to the English Universities at eighteen or nineteen are they better or worse educated than the men who present themselves at our Indian Universities, I mean in respect of general intellectual attainments?—If you compare the Indian under-graduates with the reading men at the Home Universities—and in India everybody who comes up to the University means to be a reading man—I should say the Indian would be decidedly behind hand.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

2695. You said you thought the Indian boys of seventeen were more precocious than the English boys of seventeen. Comparing the two at the ages of from seventeen to nineteen would you say the studious English boy is far better trained than the studious Indian boy?—Yes, because the studious English boy enjoys more advantages.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

2696. Suppose it was decided to have a competition in India limited to Natives alone, do you think the Natives of the Punjab are in a position to succeed?—I should think not.

WITNESS —LIII 24th December 1886

Examination of LACHMAN DAS POPLAI, of the Uncovenanted Service; Extra Assistant Commissioner, Delhi, Punjab.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Lachman Das Poplai.

Lachman Das said:—I am a Native of Bareilly. I am an Extra Assistant Commissioner of two and a half years' standing. I entered the service as a Munsiff by nomination. I am a Rora by caste.

The *President.*

2697. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—It is not approved by the educated class. The sphere from which the selection is made is limited, and the rules do not say what degree of ability is required. I would amend the rules by reserving half the Statutory appointments to the Uncovenanted Service and making the appointments by nomination. One third of the total number of appointments I would reserve for the Covenanted Service, and for the remaining two-thirds I would have limited competition from persons domiciled in the Province. I would also insist that persons who competed for Statutory appointments should possess a certain degree of educational qualification, a thorough knowledge of English, and that they should not be above twenty-three years of age. They must also be men of good family.

2698. Would you amend the Statute in respect of the description of persons on whose behalf such powers may be exercised?—No.

2699. Or in respect of the sanction required?—No.

2700. If the Statutory Service is retained, should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England to complete their training or should they be encouraged to do so?—I would rather encourage them to go.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

2701. You say the present system is not approved of by the educated classes; is it approved by other classes?—I think the general public have no opinion on the subject.

Mr. *Peacock.*

2702. Is it your idea that the Uncovenanted Service are excluded altogether from the Statutory Service?—That is my impression. I mean I would make it compulsory on the nominating authority to give one appointment in every three Statutory appointments to members of the Uncovenanted Service.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

2703. Would you amend the provisions of the Statute so as to enable the nominees to be members of a regular Service, and not merely appointed to posts?—I think it is necessary. I would not appoint Natives at all to executive appointments above or even below the post of Deputy Commissioner, but all judicial appointments should be open to them.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

2704. What are your reasons for that?—I do not think Natives would like to be governed by Natives.

2705. Why?—The general public don't like it, and Natives would not do in executive capacities so well as Europeans.

2706. By whom have you heard that opinion expressed?—It is my own opinion and the opinion of those Natives who have not been trained in colleges.

2707. Do you think that the feeling is generally prevalent?—I think so.

2708. Have you heard it expressed in many instances?—I have asked some persons and they agreed with me.

2709. Where were those persons residing?—In the Delhi district; in the town.

2710. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—Yes, Natives have very little chance now.

2711. What change do you advocate?—I would raise the age for Natives, but on the condition that they never claimed executive appointments, and I would add some Indian vernaculars to the subjects of examination, and I would allow scholarships and passage-money to those who go to England to compete for judicial appointments. Those who compete in England according to all the conditions now fixed for the examination might be given any executive post without restriction whether they were Natives or Europeans. I would not encourage Natives to go to England and compete for executive appointments, but would encourage them to go and compete for judicial appointments.

2712. Would you alter the marks for any of the subjects?—No, but I would introduce the vernaculars.

2713. Would you hold simultaneous examinations in England and India?—No.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

2714. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited from Natives of India as described in the Statute, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—From Natives who come under the Statute.

2715. Should the recruitment be by competition or by nomination or by both systems combined?—By both combined, that is to say, for Munsiffs and Extra Assistant Commissioners and Tahsildars the subjects of examination should be different, but of course the system itself, that is nomination and competition, should be the same for all grades. I would select a limited number of candidates of good family who possess certain other qualifications and let them compete among themselves, and I think those who are domiciled in the Province should have the preference.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

2716. If the existing Statutory system is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that Service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes.

2717. Were you at Delhi at the time of the riots?—Yes.

2718. Is the opinion which you say you share with other Natives with whom you have talked, the opinion formed after or before those riots?—The riots made no difference.

To Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*—My functions are both judicial and executive.

Mr. *Stokes.*

2719. If you had a number of Mahomedans brought up before you accused of rioting in a time of excitement, would not you feel very much inclined to ask your superior court to transfer the case?—I would.

WITNESS LIV.—24th December 1886.

Examination of CHUNI LAL, M.A., of the Uncovenanted Service; Extra Assistant Commissioner, Ludhiana, Punjab.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Chuni Lal, M.A.

Chuni Lal said:—I have graduated M. A. I am an Extra Assistant Commissioner. I entered the service two years ago. Before that I practised as a Pleader for four years. I am a Native of the Gurdaspur District in the Lahore Division. I entered by competition.

The *President*.

2720. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—It is not. The grounds of disapproval are various—(1) no competition is allowed in its working; (2) men of approved merit in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service and the legal profession have not been nominated; (3) although there was a provision for doing so in the rules themselves the Statutory Civilians are not admitted to high posts of responsibility as members of the organized Service.

2721. Are the defects of the existing system susceptible of remedy?—Yes. By amending both the Statute and the rules. I propose, as regards the Statute, that they should be made members of an organized Service, so as to develop their force of character and more confidence in their own abilities; and, as regards the rules, I would introduce nomination and competition, nomination from among the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service and the legal profession, and limited competition amongst nominated candidates for a certain proportion.

2722. Would you in any way alter the definition of Natives of India in Statute 33 Vic., Cap. III. Section 6?—I would exclude European British subjects as defined in the Criminal Procedure Code and include residents of Native States in subordinate alliance with the British Government.

2723. If the Statutory Service is retained, should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training, or should they be encouraged to do so?—They should be encouraged to do so merely.

Mr. *White*.

2724. You said you would exclude European British subjects as defined in the Criminal Procedure Code from the provisions of the Statute. Do you mean that if they gave up their privileges under the Criminal Procedure Code, and so accepted the position of Natives, you would include them?—Yes, I think it is a little unfair that a man should be able to claim an appointment as a Native of India, and, at the same time, when he is being tried for an offence before a court of law he should be able to claim the privileges of a European British-born subject.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

2725. You would abolish all invidious race distinctions between fellow-subjects of the Queen?—Yes.

2726. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—Yes, (1) as regards the age-limit; in my opinion it should be raised to twenty-three, and (2) there should be two centres of examination, one in India and one in England. I would (3) assign to Sanscrit, Arabic, and the vernacular languages of India (in which term I include Persian) as many marks as are now assigned to the European classics. If an examination is held in India, it should be identical with that held in England. If the Statutory Service is to be retained and appointments which are at present reserved for the Covenanted Service be assigned to it to the amount at least one-fourth. I would hold the examination under identical circumstances and conditions, but otherwise I would recommend the apportionment of appointments in the proportion of one Native to every two Europeans.

2727. Would you apportion them between the different Provinces of the Administration?—I would not make any distinction between the Provinces.

2728. Or between creeds?—No.

2729. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in the Statute, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—From Natives of India as defined in the Statute only, except that I would admit the subjects of Native States in subordinate alliance with British India.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

2730.—Should the recruitment be by competition, or by nomination, or both by systems combined ; and if by both combined should one system be applied to all offices or classes of offices, or should the system be varied with the class of offices ?—I would keep the present system as it is, but I would extend it to the Tahsildars also.

2731. Whatever system be adopted, should the recruitment be made by the several Administrations only from persons resident in the territories under such Administrations respectively, or with a preference for such residents ?—With a preference for such residents, not exclusive of others,

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

2732. Do you think the pay on which Statutory Civilians commence is sufficient ? —No, I think it should be raised to Rs. 250 a month for the initial pay.

2733. Why ?—Because the Rs. 200 now allowed is even lower than what is allowed to Extra Assistant Commissioners.

WITNESS LV.—24th December 1886.

Examination of Munshi GYAN CHAND, Editor of the Victoria Newspaper, Sialkot, Punjab.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Munshi *Gyan Chand.*

The *President.*

You are Editor of the *Victoria* Newspaper which is published in Urdu ?—Yes.

2734. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved ?—It is not for this reason Native Civilians are very deficient in education, and they are paid at a very low rate and are, moreover, very inexperienced young men with one exception. It is not the Statute I object to, inasmuch as it admits Natives to the Civil Service, but the rules might be amended so as to provide that every candidate should have educational qualifications equal to those of a B. A. I would alter the definition of Natives of India so as to include Eurasians and Europeans resident in India. No European resident in India should be disqualified by any law, by reason of his place of birth, if otherwise qualified. They should not, however, be allowed to take advantage of any British law giving them previleges denied to other Natives of India. The candidates should be appointed by limited competition and nomination. Without competition I would appoint (1) all Uncovenanted officers who are experienced in that Service; (2) members of the Bar with regard to whose qualifications the Chief Court has made favourable representations; (3) such persons as have failed high up in the regular competition for the Civil Service; and (4) members of high family whose educational qualifications are equal to that of a B. A. All persons appointed to the Statutory Service, except members of the Uncovenanted Service, should go through a two years' period of probation; such period to be employed in executing commissions in civil cases and in giving opinions in police enquiries. They should not at once be given the powers of Magistrates and Civil officers.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

2735. Do you know that the execution of commissions affords a great opportunity for corruption in this country ?—Certainly.

2736. And that you should employ for that purpose the best trained and qualified men ?—Such men as would be appointed for this Service will not take bribes.

2737. If the Statutory Service is retained. should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training, or should they be encouraged to do so ?—I would not compel them to go, but if necessary they might be encouraged to do so.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued

2738. Is any dissatisfaction felt in the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service ?—The only objection is that some of the members of the Service are not well acquainted with the vernacular languages.

2739. How would you remedy that objection ?—When they come to this country they should mix more with the people and study the vernacular languages so as to become acquainted with them. They should undergo a period of one year's probation in India.

2740. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in the Statute or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty ?—From all natural-born subjects, whether Europeans, Eurasians or others.

2741. With no limitation ?—They must have become permanent residents.

2742. How would you recruit the Uncovenanted Service ?—By competition and nomination.

2743. That is to say, as the system exists already with regard to Extra Assistant Commissioners and Munsiffs: would you extend it to Tahsildars also ?—I would, and Extra Assistant Commissioners and Munsiffs should also undergo a period of probation.

2744. Would you make your appointments from people resident in the Province only, or would you admit residents of other Provinces subject to certain reservations ?—In the Punjab I would include those Natives who live in the North-West Provinces and Europeans resident in whatever Province, and nobody else.

2745. If the existing Statutory Service is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that Service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service ?—Yes.

2746. You would altogether abolish the system of nomination ?—The Local Government should possess the power of nomination, and that power should be carefully exercised. Should the system of nomination be abolished, there would be no means of promoting Uncovenanted men, and men of

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

family and position would be excluded. For the present, high executive posts should be withheld from Natives, but in the judicial line they may be promoted just as in the past a District Judge has been appointed. Natives have not hitherto held high administrative posts, and on political grounds it is not desirable that they should do so. I would have colleges established both in England and India, and the English should

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

not be allowed to resort to the Indian College. Hindus have religious, objections and all Europeans and Natives resident here are disabled from going to England on pecuniary grounds. (To *President.*) The Victoria Paper has a circulation of 400 daily; it is printed in Urdu. There are three papers in our family. I am a Hindu, by caste a Puri, a species of Khatri.

WITNESS LVI.—24th December 1886.

Examination of Munshi BRIJ LAL, Editor of the *Khair-Khwah-i-Punjab* Newspaper, Sialkot.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Munshi *Brij Lal*

Brij Lal said:—I am brother of the last witness, and am proprietor and Editor of "The Well-wisher of the Punjab," the circulation of which is 500 copies. I agree with my brother in all but the following points, regarding the Statutory and Uncovenanted Services and the system of nomination to those Services. No special standard is at present fixed by Government by which to judge before nomination whether a candidate is capable of discharging the duties for which he is selected. I would therefore propose that enquiries should be made of (1) Sessions Judges who should be required to report fully every six months on the character of those assessors who have given satisfactory and impartial opinions at trials held before such Sessions Judge, and who are fit for selection; (2) similar reports should be called for from Sessions Judges concerning Uncovenanted officers, stating which of them does his work in such a way as to merit recommendation for the Statutory Service; (3) District Magistrates should similarly report upon Honorary Magistrates; (4) Commissioners should similarly report upon such of the *Rais* class whom they consider so qualified, and (5) the Chief Court should similarly report on Pleaders, but no one of more than thirty years of age should be nominated; and as regards Pleaders, no Pleader should be nominated who has not practised in the Chief or High Court for at least three years, and in regard to whom it should be further ascertained that he had never appeared in a false case in the whole course of his practice at the Bar, nor had ever charged a fee higher than the ordinary rate.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

2747. For what reason do you recommend that Judges should report upon assessors?—So that those who had shown judicial capacity might be selected.

WITNESS LVII.—24th December 1886.

Examination of *Rai Bahádur* KUNHYA LAL, M.I.C.E., a retired Executive Engineer of the Public Works Department; Vice President of the Municipal Committee of Lahore; Fellow of the Punjab University.

Kunhya Lal Bahádur said:—I am in the Public Works Department. I was born at Agra. I have been in the Punjab about thirty-five years. I have retired from Government Service, and am now Acting President of the Lahore Municipality.

2748. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—I have not heard of any dissatisfaction.

2749. Are there any defects in the existing system?—I think the rules should remain as they are, but the pay of Statutory Civilians ought to be increased.

2750. If the Statutory Service is retained, should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training, or should they be encouraged to go?—It should not be compulsory. They should be encouraged to go.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

2751. Is it not a ground of complaint that those appointed to the Statutory Service are appointed only to posts and not as member of an organized Service?— Yes, I think that is a reasonable ground of complaint.

Mr. *Stokes.*

2752. Why would you not insist on their going to England?—Because Hindus object to go on caste grounds, and Mahomedans cannot afford the expense involved in it. My son went to England. The objection as regards the Hindus is diminishing daily, but it exists yet to some extent.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*

2753. Do you know of any Hindu in this Province who went, and on coming back was received back into caste?—I know of two.

2754. And of any Hindu that has been out-casted?—I do not know of any

2755. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—Yes, the examination is now held only in England, and they wish to have it in India. I should prefer to see the examination held in India.

2756. By what changes may this disadvantage be diminished or removed?—By establishing a centre of examination in India for Natives of India.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter*—contd.

2757. Would you found scholarships to enable Natives of India to compete in England if they choose to do so?—Yes, and I would allow them their passage-money also. The age-limit should be increased to twenty-two.

2758. Would you make any alteration in the subjects of examination?—Yes, I would substitute Arabic, Sanscrit and Persian for Greek and Latin and French, but otherwise the examination should be identical, and the Indian examination should be held at only one centre.

2759. Should the candidates in England and in India compete with one another and be selected in order of merit, or should a certain number of appointments be apportioned for competition to the candidates at the separate examinations?—A certain number of appointments should be apportioned. The proportion for Natives should be about one-fifth of the whole to be competed for in India, and four-fifths to be competed for in England.

2760. And of the one-fifth reserved would you allot any portion to Hindus and any portion to Mahomedans, or should they both compete equally for the whole?—The appointments should be allotted to the Province according to the population.

2761. If the examination is held in India should the successful candidates be required, as a condition obligatory, to proceed to England to complete their training?—They should be encouraged to do so only.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

2762. You say the appointments should be allotted to the Province according to the population: what do you mean by that?—I mean that the Province having a greater population than the other should have more appointments. In other respects I would give the appointments according to merit irrespective of Province.

The *President.*

2763. Supposing for instance two were allotted to the Punjab and two to Bengal, and four Punjabis obtained the four highest places on the list and a Bengali the fifth, would you give the four appointments to the Punjabis?—No, I would give the two appointments in the Punjab and one of the Bengal appointments to the first three

Vol. I.
Sec. II.
Punjab.

Kunhya Lal, Rai Bahadur M.I C.E.

The *President*—continued.

Punjabis and the other Bengal appointment to the Bengali candidate.

2764. Supposing there were ten appointments, two in the Punjab, and the first Punjab candidate stood twelfth on the list, would you give him one of the appointments?—No.

2765. Do you think Natives generally will be permanently content with the proportion, one-fifth, you assign to them?—Yes.

Mr. *Peacock*.

2766. Supposing the present system of examination is continued, will Native candidates be under any disadvantage in respect of age?—Yes, the age-limit should be increased to twenty-two, and the examination held both in England and in India.

2767. Would you allow Natives to compete in England and Englishmen to compete out here?—Yes.

2768. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India, as described in the Statute, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—From all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty, including Europeans.

2769. Should the recruitment be by competition, or by nomination, or by both

Mr. *Peacock*—continued.

systems combined?—Partly, to the extent of one-half, by competition among educated Natives, and the remainder by nomination in the case of men of good family.

2770. If by both combined, should one system be applied to all offices or classes of offices, or should the system be varied with the class of offices?—It should be varied with the class of offices.

2771. Whatever system be adopted, should the recruitment be made by the several administrations only from persons resident in the territories under such administrations respectively, or with a preference for such residents?—From the residents in each different Province.

2772. Would you examine candidates in each Province or have one examination for the whole of India?—I would have only one examination for all India.

2773. If the existing Statutory Service is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that Service be allotted to the Uncovenantad Service?—Yes.

2774. You said the pay of a Statutory Civilian, Rs. 200 on first appointment, was too small: what do you think it ought to be?—Eighty per cent. on final appointment and seventy per cent during probation, instead of the present 64 per cent. rule.

WITNESS LVIII.—24th December 1886.

Examination of SHEIKH UMAR BUKSH, Barrister-at-Law, Multan, Punjab.

Sheikh Umar Buksh said.—I belong to Multan and am a Barrister-at-law. I was born at Kasur in the Lahore District. I was educated in the Lahore Government school, and was called to the Bar in England. I am now thirty-six years of age.

2775. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—No.

2776. Do you disapprove of it?—Yes.

2777. On what grounds?—In the first place there is no test of ability and fitness in the case of candidates selected, and in the next place they are considered of inferior rank to the Covenanted Service, and except in theory they have not the same prospects as the latter.

2778. What amendments would you make either in the Statute or the rules?—I would abolish the system altogether. The Statute was given us in answer to our prayers for facilities, but in practice we have gained nothing by it.

2779. If it is retained, would you insist on the selected candidates proceeding to England for training?—I would insist upon their going. I have been to England myself.

2780. And on your return were you received on the same footing by your co-religionists?—Yes, if anything more kindly than before.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

2781. Would you, if the Statute is abolished, retain power in the Local Government to appoint Uncovenanted men of merit and ability to the regular service?—Yes.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

2782. Why would you compel the selected candidates to go to England?—Because being men intended to be in some kind or other eligible for the higher posts, they should receive the training which alone can fit them for those posts, that is to say, they should be trained and mix with European society and observe the method of administration in foreign countries.

2783. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—Yes, on the ground that Natives have not the facilities

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

which would place them on equal terms in competing with Europeans. Next the limit of age is too low; considering the backwardness of education in India, it ought to be at least twenty-three. The next and chief objection is the cost of the voyage to England and residence there. Then some alteration should be made in the subjects of examination by the introduction of vernacular languages among the optional subjects. As to Arabic and Sanscrit I do not think they can be considered as a means of mental training on a par with Latin and Greek.

2784. Do you know Latin and Greek?—A little Latin, but no Greek at all. I know Arabic

2785. Would you hold simultaneous examinations in England and India?—I would have the examination only in England, provided liberal allowances were given to candidates to enable them to go.

2786. In what form?—In the shape of passage-money and scholarships, and if possible providing for residence in England; but if for financial and other reasons that cannot be done then I would hold simultaneous examinations at both centres.

2787. You think the poverty of the Hindus is the main obstacle to their going? Yes.

2788. If you had the examination in India, would you have it at more than one centre?—At one centre only

2789. How would you select the candidates? Would you have one list or two?—I think there should be only one list.

2790 Have you had personal experience of any of the young Natives who have gone home?—I have not met any of them. (To Mr. *Stokes*) I am practising at present at Multan.

2791. When you said you would give allowances to candidates you did not mean you would give them to any man who liked to go to England?—Some sort of preliminary examination here would be necessary.

2792 Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in the Statute, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—From all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty.

2793. By competition or by nomination?—Mostly by competition and a small proportion by nomination, because in this Province it might be necessary for political reasons to give a certain number of appointments to members of the higher families,

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Sheikh Umar Buksh.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

or it might be necessary to promote persons already in service, but who might not be considered likely or fit to compete.

2794. Would you recruit provincially or from the whole of India?—Provincially.

2795. If the existing Statutory Service is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that Service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes.

Mr. *White.*

2796. You say you would recruit for the Uncovenanted Service from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty; but of course you mean with proper safeguards against the undue exercise of patronage in favor of one class?—I think competition would be a sufficient safeguard, and I have said they should be recruited principally by competition

Sir *Charles Turner.*

2797. Do you know what is the existing system in this Province of appointing Extra Assistant Commissioners?—Yes, partly by competition and partly by promotion.

2798. Do you approve of that system?—Yes, but I think there should be a larger proportion assigned to competition.

The *President.*

2799. You are yourself a Mahomedan and you advocate competition for the great majority of appointments; but do you think the state of education among your community is such that they could hold their own with any other class of the population in competition?—Not for sometime, but it would give them an impetus.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

2800. Would you open the judicial appointments to the Bar and Pleaders?—Yes, to a large extent.

2801 Do you think good men would be found to take the pay of Munsiffs?—Yes; I think the Subordinate Court Pleaders would,

2802. Competent men?—Better than we have now.

2803. Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service, according as the posts are held by members of that branch of the Service or by members of the Statutory or Uncovenanted branches?—There should be no distinction made with respect to the persons who pass the examination in England whether Natives or Europeans, but those not appointed under that system should, I think, get less, say by 25 per cent.

The *President.*

2804. Is there any other point on which you would like to express your views to the Commission?—Yes, if practicable there should be for some time to come apportionment of posts between Hindus and Mahomedans in this Province.

WITNESS LIX.—24th December 1886.

Examination of R. G. THOMPSON, Esq., of the Covenanted Civil Service; Senior Secretary to the Financial Commissioner, Punjab.

Mr. *Thompson* said:—I am a Civil Servant of twelve years' standing and at present Secretary to the Financial Commissioner, but am on special duty.

The *President.*

2805. What are the points upon which you wish to give evidence?—Partly the points affecting me individually and partly the whole question as interesting to me as a Covenanted Civilian. I will state my views.

In dealing with a question such as the reorganization of the administrative services in India it is absolutely necessary to lay down certain preliminary conditions or postulates. Otherwise the discussion will be endless and unprofitable.

In the *first* place it seems clear that no reform or change can be admissible which does not secure a really good administration in accordance with English ideas, together with such essential guarantees as may be required by English policy.

In the *second* place all existing interests, whether legal or equitable, must be respected.

In the *third* place the scheme adopted must have about it a real character of permanence. I do not mean by this that hard and fast lines should be drawn and dogmatically declared unalterable On the contrary the circumstances of India are altering rapidly year by year, and no administrative scheme will be permanent which does not possess the capacity to adapt itself to the altered circumstances. But what is required is a scheme which will carry out these various adaptations organically by a mere natural process without being hacked to pieces, cast into a Medea's cauldron and born again at seven-year intervals.

Fourthly, and lastly, any scheme that is adopted should be such as can grow out of the present order of things without any breach of continuity

These premises being laid down, I proceed to apply them to the actual case of the Punjab.

And first as to the Statutory Service. This should I think undoubtedly be abolished. Public opinion is not indeed opposed to it; for ninety-five out of every hundred persons in the Punjab neither know nor care anything about it. Among the old families of the Province it is a popular system. On the other hand, it is regarded with jealousy by the Native Uncovenanted Service, and the younger educated men who have received a collegiate education are opposed to it. They think that if it were abolished, it would be replaced by something different which would give more weight to intellectual talent and scholastic knowledge and less weight to social position and political influence. In other words, the educated class, which is as a rule not of very high social position, would to a greater or less extent replace the old families in the Government of the country. This is the selfish side of their position. But I have no doubt also that they honestly look upon themselves as more fit and capable than those whom they desire to supplant, and in some respects they undoubtedly are so. Their marketable knowledge is sometimes considerable. Their talents for writing and discussion, though not great and generally absolutely wanting in breadth of view, are often keen and forcible. These advantages they are not only conscious of but inclined to overrate: while they are generally ignorant of their deficiencies in other directions.

But the feeling of these educated classes is no sufficient reason in itself for abolishing the Statutory Service. My own reasons for desiring the abolition are, *first*, that it has failed to secure suitable men, and *second* that it is intrinsically unfair to appoint men under what is practically no test at all to a position which gives them a claim to rise to some of the most considerable posts in the Service. Such a system would lead to an undue number of unfortunate mistakes in any country. In the Punjab the mistakes are likely to be more numerous than the successes.

If it be asked what I propose to put in place of the Statutory Service, I reply that in the first place the door of open competition in England is always open. I do not however attach much importance to this at present; for the number of candidates from the Punjab who are likely to succeed at that competition will be infinitesimal for many years to come. But, in the second place, I consider that entrance into the Punjab Commission should be granted as a reward for proved merit and ability shown in the Uncovenanted Service under the conditions explained below.

This leads us to consider the second branch of the subject, viz., the Uncovenanted Service. By this phrase I mean all officers

The *President*—continued.

outside the regular Punjab Commission from Extra Judicial Assistant down to Naib Tahsildars. Thus defined, the Uncovenanted Service should be divided into two branches—a lower and an upper branch. The lower branch would comprise Naib Tahsildars, Tahsildars and Munsiffs. The upper branch would comprise all the rest. In regard to the lower branch Government would retain the power to make a certain number of direct appointments to Tahsildarships—a reservation which is absolutely necessary in the present circumstances of the Province. All others would enter the branch as Naib Tahsildars. The Naib Tahsildarships would be filled up partly by direct appointment from certain classes of officials and partly by a regulated competitive examination. These competitions should be absolutely localised by divisions so as to secure a supply of officers from all parts of the Punjab and to prevent the undue predominance of any particular party or caste This is, I think, a better plan than that of special reservations for Hindus or Mahomedans as such. It is certainly less invidious, and it would secure very much the same result For the mass of the Mahomedan population is concentrated in the west of the Province, and the mass of the Hindus in the east. The political advantages of localization would, too, I think be considerable; but I need not dwell upon these.

Any man who had served more than five and not more than fifteen years in the lower branch would be eligible for promotion to the upper branch.

This upper branch would be partly recruited by these promotions and partly by direct appointments; for the rest it should be filled by competitive examination which should at present be limited. but which would probably in the course of ten or twelve years become open. It would probably be better to localize this competition also at either two or three centres.

This upper branch would, for some years to come, be, in general, the limit of Native ambition, and its pay and prospects should be improved. Retaining the system of payment by grades, I think the highest grade should receive at least Rs. 1,200 per mensem, and the rest in proportion. Moreover all persons who had served more than five and not more than fifteen years in the branch would be eligible for appointment in the regular Punjab Commission with a seniority equivalent to half their length of service in the branch. Thus the highest

The *President*—continued.

seniority with which a man would enter would be seven-and-a-half years. In other words, Assistant Commissioners would be liable to be superseded during the first eight years of their service, but not afterwards. I would not make residence in England compulsory for any member of the Uncovenanted Service, but for any one entering the upper branch of it by competition or nomination I would reserve a right to proceed to England for one year for study on two-thirds of his Indian pay with permission to count the year as service. I would add that residence in India would be one of the points considered in making promotions to the regular commission. These inducements would probably be sufficient in a majority of cases.

Lastly to the regular commission. This would be recruited from three sources, viz.:—

(*a*) Covenanted Civilians.
(*b*) Military Civilians.
(*c*) Uncovenanted Civilians.

In order to preserve the proper strength of the *cadre*, it would be necessary whenever an Uncovenanted man joined to omit one of the usual Covenanted or Military appointments. The Military appointments would probably be gradually eliminated.

The whole system upon which the regular commission is organized could probably be improved; but this is a matter outside the present discussion. The age however for the Covenanted examination at home should certainly be increased. Natives in the regular commission should be under the two-thirds pay rule in all posts not lower than that of District Judge, but not in inferior posts.

Appointments from the Bar to the Bench should not I think be made. The Punjab has always been organized on the French system of separate services for Judges and Advocates. The English plan works well when there is a strong practising Bar which practically controls the Judge; but there is nothing intrinsically which makes a Barrister or a Pleader a better Judge than one who has been trying cases all his life.

Mr. *Ryland*.

2806. Do you see any necessity for retaining any large proportion of Europeans in the Uncovenanted Service of this Province? —Yes, I think so; a certain proportion is required, and I think my scheme would secure that. That proportion would be appointed by nomination and also by competition.

WITNESS LX.—27th December 1886.

Examination of R. MACONACHIE, ESQ., of the Covenanted Civil Service; Deputy Commissioner, Gurgaon.

The President.

2807. Will you please state your position in the service?—I am a Covenanted Civil Servant. I joined the Punjab Commission in 1871. I have served in twelve districts. I am a first class Assistant Commissioner in officiating charge of the district of Gurgaon.

2808. Have you given any study to the question of the admission of Natives to the posts reserved for the Civil Service?—Yes.

2809. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—So far as I am aware there is no Native opinion or feeling either distinct or widely spread enough in the Punjab to deserve the name prevalent. At Lahore and one or two centres there may be ideas on the part of a few persons connected with the Native Press or the Bar, but the great mass of Native opinion is, I believe, entirely ignorant on the subject. Two or three intelligent English-speaking Native officials in my own district have not even heard the name Statutory Civilian, and when the term was explained one man had heard of such appointments in connection with the bare fact of their having been made; the other had not. I have occasionally heard complaints expressed by Europeans against the definition of Natives of India which excludes them. My idea is that the masses of the people in these Provinces have not the slightest idea about the subject. Their minds are a complete blank in regard to it, and if you could poll them they would be strongly against any admission of Natives.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

2810. What makes you think that?—I mix with the people very freely, and I think I have their confidence. I have always paid attention to this point, because I have very strong opinions about it myself, and the whole bent of their behaviour and demeanour leads me to think that. There is the stock evidence on which I do not rely much, about the transfer of cases from Courts of Native to Courts of European officers, but it is more the way in which they behave to a European officer that indicates their preference.

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

R. Maconachie, Esq.

2811. Are the defects of the existing system, if any, susceptible of remedy?—It appears to me that the words "proved merit and ability" do not include all the men whom it is very desirable to obtain for public employment in India. I refer to others than those to be obtained by competitive examination. Nor do they seem applicable to the qualifications of certain recently appointed officers. I understand the words "proved merit and ability" to refer to persons who have proved their merit and ability in the usual thoroughfares of the world, and if such proof is meant, considerable time would be necessary for obtaining it. Those persons, therefore, would ordinarily be of some standing as regards age and career, and it seems to me a stretch of words to apply the term to young men of immature character and really undeveloped capacity. It rather points to men who, for some cause or other, have failed to pass or had no opportunity of passing through the gate of competition, but who have afterwards distinguished themselves and shown their special value, and have merited and obtained general and public approval. For such men it seems evident as a corrective or supplement to the somewhat narrow character of the competitive mode of appointment (at least as regards Natives), that an entrance or even a re-entrance should be afforded to that career which, from circumstances of a special character, they have once missed. Such men bring credit to the service they enter, and the only stipulation necessary in their appointment is that justice should, as far as possible, be done in awarding them their particular places among the graded officers of the Covenanted Competition Service. Those places need not always be the best in the Service, and at any rate a new nominee entering without competition should not, under any circumstances, obtain a better place than he would have obtained had he entered the Service by competition. No rules, however, can avoid leaving a wide discretion to the immediate authority making the appointments. Nor do I think it wise to fetter that discretion too tightly. Besides these men of approved merit and ability there is another class, the best specimens of whom think it desirable to secure for

Sir *Charles Turner*—continued.

the public service, namely, young men of distinguished and influential family. The desire of Government, so constantly shown, to enlist in its service those families which, at least in the past, have been leaders in social and political action in India, I regard as statesmanlike and wise, and I should deprecate any change in the main direction of this policy. To say that such families give no worthy cadets or scions for such posts is to pronounce a strong condemnation upon our system of administration or the mode in which we look after the education of such families, or both. We have certain unhappy specimens of high family in our Uncovenanted Service, but others of the same class are good, and however we may affect to disregard the fact, high family has considerable importance in giving a Native official influence with his countrymen. Some of the appointments of Statutory Civilians in the Punjab must, I think, have been made on these grounds of distinguished and influential family, and I would insert, in qualification of section 6 of the Act, after the words "proved merit and ability" the words "or of distinguished and influential family." A family should be both distinguished and influential

As to the mode of getting them, I would reform and, as above indicated, enlarge the working of the Statutory system. I notice that some witnesses would abolish it, but I think my modification would to some extent come in with their views. Rules would be required dealing with cadets of distinguished families. These should be selected at an early age. I think that is the rock on which we split at present. We take young men without giving them a moderate training beforehand and carefully educating them under Government superintendence. If they could at some period of their training be sent to England under wise guidance, so much the better. Selection should be at first provisional, conditional on good behaviour and conduct under training. Men of proved ability ought not, I think, to be limited to any particular class. I think Government ought to have the power of selecting men of proved merit and ability from whatever quarter, whether Native or European. My own idea about this is that the whole system of appointment ought not to be framed for the benefit of any class whatever, but simply with regard to the good administration of the country. It seems to me that there is too much talk about class and forgetfulness of the benefit of the masses who are to be ruled.

2812. Do you consider that the country can be as well ruled without consideration of class? Suppose, for instance, the result of any system adopted was that the whole of the appointments went to Mahomedans? Can you exclude altogether the question of class?—I do not mean to exclude the idea of class. I was merely directing attention to a consideration which I thought had not received enough weight

2813. Do you propose that we should have two classes of men selected for the Statutory Civil Service, one composed of men of proved merit and ability in another Service or in a profession, the other composed of cadets of good family? If so, do you propose to create a separate Service for these men in which there would be regular gradation and promotion, or merely to appoint the men selected to posts as the Statute requires?—I have not thought the matter out, but my inclination would be to appoint them into the Service.

2814. Is there not this difficulty here? So far as proved merit and ability are concerned you are taking men of mature age, you know their fitness for a particular post, but you may consider that the post you give them is the measure of their possible development, and that it is not likely they will become fit for any higher appointment?—I should be inclined to say that you must take the bad with the good. Take the Covenanted Service, you cannot pretend that all the Covenanted men are fit for every post, but they get their promotion all the same. There must be some bad bargains up to a certain point.

2815. And these men of influential families, are they men you would not submit to a competitive examination?—There should be a limited competition among themselves.

2816. Why would you not induce them to enter into a general competition?—I say I want to get a certain class of men.

2817. And you do not think they would be successful in a general competition?—Some of them might, probably they would not.

2818. Would it not be undesirable to appoint such men to a Service in which there might be promotion in excess of their capacities?—No, because those men ought to have qualifications which you cannot get by competition.

2819. They may be well qualified for certain posts, for instance the charge of subdivisions, where, owing to their influence, they might be able to serve effectively under an experienced officer?—No, because I think that the men you would get of distinguished family would be the first to come to the front for independent authority.

2820. Are you personally acquainted with any Statutory Civilians?—I have known two out of the five. I liked them very much, and I have heard them well spoken of by Englishmen.

2821. What is your reason for objecting to those two men?—I could never understand why they had been brought in so young; they could have had no experience.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

2822. Are they such men as could be promoted to the regular ranks of the

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

Covenanted Service?—How can you tell whether a man will do until he has had experience.

2823. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—In the first place no opinion can be complete without a definition of the conditions of the problem, and this, if given on the part of any one practically and immediately concerned in the administration, must, I think, require the emphatic declaration, made with a full sense of its responsibility and importance, that the great mass of the Native community either know nothing or care nothing about the questions in hand, or if they care at all, they wish that no further extension of power may be given to Natives. Practically there is no dissatisfaction as regards the Province with which I am acquainted. I wish to speak with all respect, but it seems to me that many of the questions propunded by the Commission would be appropriate only in such countries as England or Australia. If the many millions of India are considered, what do they know about the system of Government. They live and die in a state of intellectual ignorance which is incredible save to those who habitually move among them. The great majority of them never come into our Courts. They are agriculturists, whose chief intimation of our Government, or indeed any Government, is the regularly recurring demand for land revenue, and it must be so for many years to come. Leaving these mute masses alone, but never forgetting their importance, we come to the next class, those who have dealings with our courts, and with them may be put the considerable population in our cities who perhaps begin to have some ideas in the matter. As regards suitors in our courts, the majority or perhaps all prefer English Magistrates and Judges. This is not mere national pride or conceit, if an opinion can be fairly formed by one who has earnestly desired to disabuse himself of all party or class prejudice. There remains a very small proportion of the population, the men whom Government has educated. These men are naturally desirous of being equal with Englishmen and seem likely to be misled by prejudice. It would be conflicting with all evidence to suppose that the opinion held of their own merits by these men is not higher than those merits deserve. If it were not so the educated Natives of India would be superior to all classes of men who have been placed in these circumstances in other times and places. The popular opinion therefore which the Commission seeks to ascertain is merely the prejudiced opinion of a certain very respectable class which, considered in proportion to the interests of our Indian population, may without any disrespect be termed very very small.

2824. Should any and, if any, what change be made in the existing system of

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

recruiting for the Covenanted Civil Service?—Yes, I would give encouragement to Natives to go to England and compete. I think a scholarship or an exhibition might be given to the nominee of the Punjab University, the best man they could get might be sent to England with £150 a year.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

R. Maconachie, Esq.

2825. Is there any particular prejudice amongst Natives against going to England?—Money is the great difficulty. It is a very important one, and the others will die out. The caste difficulty, I think, is dying out of the class of men we shall hope to get.

2826. Should any changes be made in the nature and standards of examination?—I would not have a competitive examination in India.

2827. Why?—Because of the practical difficulty in the oral examination. I have not heard any solution of that yet. Any increase in competitive examination in India is itself an evil, and unless some greater good than the evil is to be secured, any such increase is, it seems to me, to be deprecated. The point is that you appoint a few and disappoint many. The result of any competitive examination is to give the few a success and the many a disappointment. The disappointment is all the more acute because almost every man who seriously enters an examination room thinks he has some chance of success, and when success is not his he is apt to attribute it to mistake or unfairness on the part of the examiners and to become a discontented man. I think if the literature of discontent and sedition which so often disfigures the Native Press could be traced to its source, a very large proportion of it would be found to originate with men actuated by private pique or disappointment in the way mentioned. There is another point. The man who enters the Government Service by competition is apt to think himself in possession of a right. He has given Government a *quid pro quo* in the examination. His feeling of gratitude is not likely to be as real as in the case of a man who enters by nomination. He strikes as it were a bargain, he does not receive, as he is apt to think, any gift. It may be urged in reply to what is said above that the objection applies equally to the competitive examination in England—that Natives who fail there become discontented. There is no doubt something in this, but not much, because the competitors are few in comparison, and also because unsuccessful competitors in such a high examination are good enough to find other professions and occupations without much trouble. With competitive examinations in India we find now a number of men all over the country who, demoralized by failure at various examinations, are not able, or think themselves unable, to find anything to do. These men sit at home half-starved, or find a precarious

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

living by selling their half-completed education to those still more ignorant, in the shape of writing letters or petitions to officers or rendering miscellaneous services and sometimes even criminal ones. These men have been drawn off from the regular non-official employment by our forced system of examination, and with every additional examination their number must apparently increase. We have no education I believe in India that could be trusted to supply even the mere intellectual requirements requisite for "competition-wallahs."

The *President*.

2828. You mean by "competition-wallahs" men who would have a reasonable chance of success in the examination in England?—My idea is that you get certain qualifications through competition which you do not get in any other way, and certain other qualifications by nomination which probably you would not get by competition. I have taken an interest in the effect of education on our young men of the Province, and in the Government schools and colleges, and the effect of the education given in them. I have had considerable opportunities of gauging these in connection with Government and University examinations. The subjects in which I have examined are revenue law, history, political economy, logic, and mental philosophy. I found the students as a rule well taught scholastically speaking, that is to say, they learn the contents of certain text-books with minute and copious industry, but when questions are put which require an acquaintance with the spirit of the books, the essential ideas in them intended to fructify and ramify in the minds of the students, then something seems conspicuously wanting. What is necessary is the out-of-school teaching by social life and institutions, which will work on the young and learning mind, supplying correctives, elucidations, and explanations of school lessons. I think this something must be the English life which the students can see only sufficiently well in England. It has been put to me by a Native of great intelligence that there is a feeling on the part of many that, until they have been to England to understand better than they possibly can out here, the way in which Englishmen live among themselves, they do not feel themselves "free" (that was the word he used); they do not know how they should act, and this is only one out of many things. As to improvements practicable in India, there is the manly development of gymnastics, more especially games, most of all cricket, and further off, but steadily to be looked to and insisted on constantly, the abolition or rather the disuse of institution of child marriage. The effect of this on the whole constitution

The *President*—continued.

of the student is bad; the effect of it on the man too is enervating.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

2829. Would you raise the limit of age for candidates competing in England?—My idea is, that it ought to be raised, but so it ought to be also for Englishmen. It seems to me there might be a compromise in the examination at home for Natives who go there. There might be certain subjects which would require to be carefully considered, in which the marks allotted to Natives for doing the same paper should be higher than those given to Englishmen and *vice versâ*. I mean taking the subject which perhaps tells a man's mental calibre more than any other, the essay. I think a Native who goes to England and writes a good essay ought to have higher marks than an Englishman, for this reason, that competitive examination is not really one of performance, but one of promise, and a Native who can write a good essay at that age, under such disadvantages as he has, promises a great deal.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar*.

2830. To whom do you refer when you say "a prejudiced class and a small class?"—I mean small in comparison with the immense masses. I mean no disrespect to the educated class.

2831. As regards the great mass you said they would prefer English Magistrates and Judges. Assuming that to be the fact; can you not explain it by another, *viz.*, that they daily come in contact with the lower class of Native officials either as Judges or Magistrates, and they form their opinion from their knowledge of them?—Yes, I think considerable weight ought to be attached to that.

2832. And therefore it would not be fair to assume that they would not like a higher class of Native officials?—I thought the question was what *do* they like, not what *would* they like?

2833. As regards the educated class, do you think that they could influence the opinions of the great mass which at present has no opinion on any of these subjects?—In the cities perhaps they would.

2834. Supposing it is worth their while to do it, cannot they influence the minds of the masses to an extent which it is impossible for Europeans to do?—I should doubt it very much.

2835. Do you not think that their knowledge of the habits and customs of the masses gives them an enormous power as it were, which they can use as they like by working on the ignorance of the masses?—Not in the Punjab. For instance, an educated man, unless he is quite a Punjabi when probably his education is not very

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar*—continued.

high, would most likely not understand the language of the village populations, except perhaps in his own district.

2836. Is it not possible for the educated class to leaven the whole mass as it were, whether for good or for evil?—I do not see how they could at present. Of course I speak only of the Punjab.

2837. You say that the men who write these seditious articles in the papers are disappointed men. Do you know of your own personal knowledge whether that is the case?—I have not the pleasure of the acquaintance of the men themselves, but I have heard so on good authority.

2838. I suppose you are aware that in this Province graduates think Rs. 50 a low salary to start on?—I should doubt it. I think some of them would be glad to get it. Less than that might be considered small.

2839. Are you aware of any graduate who has not been able to secure an appointment and who has any reason to be discontented?—I think the graduates are probably above that.

2840. Take under-graduates then, First Arts men, are you aware of any that have failed to obtain employment?—No.

2841. Or of any men in that condition who passed the examination for matriculation?—Yes, some.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter*.

2842. You said that suitors in this Province preferred English Magistrates and Judges. What is the source of your knowledge? Do you know it from personal observation?—I said, I think, that I had had experience of the applications of Natives for transfer of cases from Native Courts to European Courts. That may be taken as personal evidence.

2843. Is that the only ground?—No, I said also that I judge from the demeanour of the people.

2844. Will you kindly explain? I would explain if you could go with me into the country and see the way the people come to meet European officers, and the way they talk to them. They appear to show more confidence in Europeans. I infer it from their demeanour, and I can give you explicit testimony. Only the other day a very intelligent Native said to me. "What are you going to Lahore for?" I said, "I am going to give evidence." "What about?" I said "The Sirkar is thinking about giving new facilities to Natives to become high officers." He deprecated that in very forcible terms. That might have been as you say, showing deference to me, but he seemed honest in saying it. My general impression is made up of hundreds of these instances during my service.

2845. Do you refer to an opinion which has been expressed to you by a Native of

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter*—contd.

this Province to the effect that unless a Native goes to England he is not free, whatever that means. Did that man go to England?—No.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

R. Maconachie, Esq.

Sir *Charles Turner*.

2846. Of what class was the man who made that observation to you deprecating the introduction of Natives into high offices?—One of the most intelligent zemindars.

2847. Could you give us his exact words?—He said: "Are Natives going to be Commissioners, then there will be a mutiny to-morrow."

2848. Was he a Hindu or Mahomedan?—A Hindu of the Bania class.

2849. Has that gentleman been examined as a witness?—No.

2850. Did you tell him that it was open to him to be so?—Yes, but he would not understand it.

2851. Was he a man of education?—I won't say anything about his education, but he is one of the most loyal and sharpest zemindars in the district.

Mr. *Stokes*.

2852. Has any witness come up from your district?—Yes, a Native.

2853. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in the Statute, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—My idea is that Government ought to take good men wherever it can find them. I would not confine it to one class or to one creed.

2854. Do you prefer recruitment by competition, nomination, or by both systems combined?—I would have competition to a certain extent.

2855. Are you satisfied with the present rules in the Punjab?—Yes, they are very fair.

2856. Would you apply them to Tahsildars?—No, I would not apply the education test so far to Tahsildars or to Munsiffs, but I think they ought to pass the matriculation examination. I would have educational qualifications, but not a competitive examination. I would appoint the Tahsildars from Naib Tahsildars, and would make the Naib Tahsildars pass the matriculation examination.

2857. Would you make the recruitment provincially or from the whole of India generally?—Provincially.

2858. If the existing Statutory Service be abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that Service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service?—I would not take away anything that the Natives have now.

Mr. *Peacock.*

2859. Are you in favour of recruiting the subordinate judicial appointments from members of the Bar especially?—I have no objection to seeing Pleaders becoming Judges provided they are the best of their class. You would not get a man with good prospects as a Pleader to accept a Munsiffship. The pay is too low.

2860. Do you get good men now for Munsiffships?—Yes, I think they are improving very much.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

2861. Your University has only been established for a very few years?—Yes.

2862. You have not many graduates here?—No.

2863. Might not that account for the fact that graduates here are discontented with less than Rs. 50 to commence with?—It might.

2864. The Bar is made up largely in other presidencies from graduates?—So I have heard.

2865. Would they not be content with a Munsiff's pay at Rs. 150?—You are talking about graduates taking service, I refer to Pleaders.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

2866. You said you would recruit for the Uncovenanted Service provincially?—Yes, because I think that for the charges Uncovenanted men have, you require men with local experience. If you were to get men from Bombay as Tahsildars here they would be really more strange than a European in the Subordinate Service.

2867. Have you any other point which you would wish to bring before the Commission?—Yes, about the expansion of employment for Natives. I am not prepared to place a bar before any ordinary appointment in the Civil Service. I should insist on a reasonable prospect in each case of obtaining the suitable qualifications, but I deprecate finality in making appointments, caution being observed in making the actual selections. The only importance to me in pressing that point is to give effect and value to the evidence I have given before this Commission. What I have stated is fact: my own feeling in the matter is that we ought to have no bar at all, but in making selection and appointments we ought to remember the facts to which I have given prominence.

WITNESS LXI.—27th December 1886.

Examination of Nawab IMAM BUKSH KHAN, C. I. E., Chief of the Mazari Tribe, one of the Frontier Tribes of the Derajat, Rajanpur, Punjab.

The *President.*

2868. You are Chief of the Mazari Tribe?—Yes.

2869. The Mazaris live on the Rajanpur Frontier?—Yes.

2870. What is the strength of the tribe?—According to the last census 24,000.

2871. You have lived all your life on the Frontier?—Yes.

2872. Is the Frontier quieter now than it was in your younger days?—Yes.

2873. Is the sub-division of Rajanpur one in which there is usually a European officer?—Yes.

2874. There is also a detachment of the Frontier Force?—Yes.

2875. What do you think is the cause of the increased peace and prosperity in that part of the country?—The favour of Government and the support received by the people, and the interest shown by Government.

The *President*—continued.

2876. Would you like to see a Native Punjabi substituted for the European officer in charge of Rajanpur?—I would not.

Mr. *Ryland.*

2877. Do you think that resorting to Native agency would result in a relapse?—Certainly.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

2878. From your personal experience do you say that there is less disturbance on the Frontier now than in the time, for instance, of Ranjit Singh?—I recollect the time of Ranjit's rule. In his time the administration was not such as to secure peace to the extent to which it is now secured. There was murder then, and constant fighting, which does not exist now.

WITNESS LXII.—27th December 1886.

Examination of Sardar BIKRAMA SINGH, Bahadur, C.I.E., Ahluwalia, of Kapurthala and Jullundur.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Sardar *Bikrama Singh*, Bahadur, C.I.E.

NOTE.—Sardar Bikrama Singh, C. I. E., is the son of Raja Nihal Singh, Ahluwalia, of Kapurthala, by his second wife His brother was Raja Randhir Singh, grandfather of the present Chief Bikrama Singh co-operated loyally with his brother Raja Randhir Singh. in assisting the British during the troubles of 1857; their troops protected Jullundur and they offered to take a force to Delhi. In 1858 the Sardar accompanied his brother, at the head of a contingent, to Oudh. Sardar Bikrama Singh is an educated gentleman of much influence and high position. He lives at Jullundur.

Sardar *Bikrama Singh*, C.I.E., said:—I am grand-uncle of the present Raja of Kapurthala and the son of Raja Nihal Singh of that place. I have lived for many years at Jullundur I am Vice-President of the District Board and President of the Municipal Committee of that place.

The *President*.

2879. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved? It is not.

2880. On what grounds?—There is no arrangement by which men in the Service can be regularly promoted. They are only appointed by patronage. The pension and leave rules differ from those of the Covenanted Service. I am not prepared to say that the difference in pay is a matter of objection, because, in my opinion, the present rate of Statutory pay is sufficient, and Natives ought to be paid less than Europeans.

2881. Do you share the first two objections?—Yes.

2882. Would you extend the definition of the term "Natives of India?"—I am not prepared to answer that.

2883. Would you for instance include in it persons resident in Native States in alliance with the British Government?—Yes, they are all British subjects and ought therefore to be included.

2884. If the Statutory Service is retained, should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training, or should they be encouraged to go?—They should be encouraged to go.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar*.

2885. Do you think that the initial pay of the Statutory Service is sufficient?—

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar*—contd

It is not: I think it should be fixed with reference to what a European Assistant Commissioner gets.

2886. The pay of a European Assistant Commissioner is Rs. 400?—In that case the initial pay of a Statutory Civilian should be Rs. 300. It should be 25 per cent. less than the present pay of a European Civil Servant.

The Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter*.

2887. Supposing the Statutory system retained and the objection to which you refer removed, would you select the candidates by nomination, limited competition or open competition?—Partly by competition and partly by nomination by the Local Government. At least one-fourth of the appointments should be left in the hands of Government.

2888. I suppose you are aware that under the Statute it is simply left to the option of the Government to appoint or not?—It should be made incumbent on them.

Mr. *Peacock*.

2889. Would you include among those eligible for the Statutory Service the sons of officers serving in India, although not Natives within the Statutory definition?—I should have no objection.

Mr. *White*.

2890. But in introducing them in the definition would you not be taking away a certain number of appointments from the proportion at present assigned to the Statutory Civil Service?—It is wrong to exclude them from the definition, and they ought to have the same right to share in the appointments, but I think in that case the number of appointments now reserved for Statutory Civilians should be increased.

2891. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—I am not acquainted with the system, nor aware of any dissatisfaction.

The *President*.

2892. Do you know before what age people are required to enter for competition?—Yes, I have read in the papers that it is nineteen.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

2893. Do you know whether Covenanted Civil Servants are appointed by nomination or competition?—I know that they are admitted by examination.

2894. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in the Statute or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—From all subjects of Her Majesty. I would combine both nomination and competition in recruiting them, and would fix the same proportion—one-fourth for nomination as I do in the case of the Statutory Service. The recruitment should be provincial; and if the existing Statutory system is abolished, I would re-absorb the proportion of offices assigned to that Service in the Covenanted ranks. As regards the candidates nominated, there should be some test of fitness applied.

Mr. *Ryland.*

2895. Would you make no provision for the advancement of members of the Uncovenanted Service?—There would be the one-fourth left in the hands of Government for them, if the Government thought fit to appoint them. (To Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*) I would recruit provincially, because Natives of the Province are more acquainted with the customs and habits of the people of the Province.

Mr. *Ryland*—continued.

2896. Are Natives of other Provinces excluded now?—There are very few of them.

2897. Have you any reason to be dissatisfied with them?—I have no objection to them personally. I would not exclude Natives of other Provinces, but would give the preference to people of my own Province.

2898. Would it not be rather hard upon the people of the Province that they should have no career elsewhere?—It would be the same for all.

2899. Have you ever served under Government?—No.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

2900. Have you considered the question of pay?—I have already stated what I think.

2901. You said you would make a distinction in the pay of Europeans and Natives appointed to the same office?—Yes, of 25 per cent.

2902. On what ground?—That the Europeans serve at a distance from their homes.

WITNESS LXIII.—27th December 1886.

Examination of W. COLDSTREAM, Esq., of the Covenanted Civil Service; Deputy Commissioner, Gurdaspur, Punjab.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

W. Coldstream, Esq.

Mr. Coldstream said:—I am a Covenanted Civilian. I entered the service by competition. I have had twenty-five years' service and am now Deputy Commissioner of Gurdaspur.

The *President.*

2903. Have you studied the question of the admission of Natives to the Statutory Civil Service?—To some extent.

2904. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—I think it is probable there is some dissatisfaction among a limited class, the advanced educated class, generally on the ground of want of equality with the Covenanted Service.

2905. Have you heard any objections taken to the Statute?—Not previously to this enquiry.

2906. Have you considered the Statute? Would you make any alteration in the definition of "Natives of India" for instance?—No, I think not, except that I should leave it with the Government to appoint Europeans of pure descent occasionally.

2907. Do we get good men for the Statutory Service at present?—I have had experience of one. He served his term of probation under me as Assistant Commissioner, and I was well satisfied with him.

2908. Is any dissatisfaction felt with reference to the fact that the Statute makes it necessary to appoint to a particular post and not to an organized Service?—I have only heard that point raised since the Commission commenced to sit.

2909. Have you any means of knowing the general feeling with regard to the mode of appointment to the Statutory Civil Service?—A question of that kind is discussed by a very limited section of the community, and the persons with whom we, as District Officers, are brought in contact from day to day, do not as a rule belong to that particular class.

2910. What is your own opinion?—I think on the whole it is a good system.

2911. If the Statutory Service is retained, should the selected candidates be required to go to England to complete their training, or should they be encouraged to do so?—I should not require them to go. I think it would very likely improve them to go to England after appointment. I should

The *President*—continued.

send a certain percentage to England until that plan was fairly tried.

2912. Compulsorily?—Yes, in order to have the system of home education fairly tried, which it has not been at present. I have seen something of Natives of India in England, that is in Edinburgh, and on the whole I think it is beneficial to them to go to England. The advantages and disadvantages are somewhat equally balanced, but on the whole it ought to be encouraged.

2913. Did you find in England that young men from India were apt to lose their Indian ways and habits?—Yes, most of them dressed as Europeans, and there was a great tendency to adopt European ways.

2914. Have you known any of them since their return to India?—I have known a few of those who have recently returned.

2915. Did you consider that they had been put out of touch with their fellows by residence in England?—I had no opportunity of judging that I have heard it said that Natives who go to England are put out of touch with their fellows. I heard a Native say, of whom I asked the question the other day, that some were lost to their relations and some lost to themselves, and I think it has a tendency to put them out of touch. I have known, however, a case in which I think it did not, and I think it is not a necessary consequence. I do not think that this Commission can devote its attention to a more important point than that Natives sent home are properly supervised. I think they are under great temptations, and are very much as fish out of water at first, and they may fall and, do so occasionally no doubt. It is very important therefore that a cordial *rapprochement* with the Universities should be entered into with a view to their being really well looked after and befriended on their arrival, and throughout their education there.

Mr. *White.*

2916. If, as you say, you would open the Statutory Service to Europeans of pure English descent, would it not be proper to increase the proportion of appointments allotted under the Statute?—I think not.

2917. The Statutory system is a cause of expense to the State, because all the time the young men are under probation the State is put to expense on their account,

Mr. *White*—continued.

Would it not be better therefore for the Government to select men of approved merit and ability who have been already trained at their own expense in the Uncovenanted Service?—I think it is already open to Government to appoint such men under the Statute, and on the whole I do not think the system you suggest would work.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

2918. Are there not already a number of Europeans admitted by the door of competition into the Covenanted Service? Why then would you open the door for the admission of Europeans into the Statutory Service also?—Because I think you occasionally come across young Europeans of exceptional ability and merit, who would make good servants of Government.

2919. But do not you think by opening the door for admission by nomination it might be abused?—I should place a certain restriction on the power. I should limit it to a fixed proportion of appointments. (To Mr. *White.*) I would promote the Uncovenanted men in certain cases.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

2920. You said you approved of the present system of appointment under the Statute. Is there any minimum standard of educational qualification required?—I understand not under the present system. I think it desirable there should be, and so far I would qualify my answer.

2921. Would you make that standard a University standard or ascertain it by special examination?—I think it ought to be a standard equal to the First Arts in the Calcutta University. I also think the Government should possess the power, especially with reference to the requirements of this Province, to appoint any one it chooses apart from any educational qualification.

2922. As a District Officer it is often your province to ascertain what the people are thinking on any point, and in such a case would you go to a man who had been educated or trained in England for an opinion as to what the people were thinking?—I think I would go to the intelligent Natives of my district who were likely to have some intelligent opinions on the subject and would call them up and ask them.

2923. Do you think a man who had been for a long time in England would be qualified to advise you?—I think he probably would, because he would most likely be a man of exceptional education and intelligence, and would know what the people were thinking as well as a good many others in the district.

2924. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—Among the people of the Punjab generally, I am not aware of any dissatisfaction, but I think the advanced educated class would prefer open competition.

Mr. *Crosthwaite*—continued.

2925. Do Natives of India labour under any, and what, disadvantages, in competing for employment in this branch of the Service?—I have heard no complaints as it were *proprio motu.* I have heard complaints since this Commission sat. I have talked to people on the subject, and I believe a certain section of the community have complaints.

2926. What do they complain of?—The expense of residence in a foreign country.

2927. And as to the standard of examination?—I think it is felt that the age ought to be raised.

2928. How do you think these disadvantages could be removed?—I think as regards the age it could be removed by raising the age from by one or two years for Natives of India, say from nineteen to twenty-one.

2929. Would you alter the subjects of examination?—I am not fully qualified to speak as regards the standard of marks.

2930. Would you give scholarships and facilities for Natives to go to England?—I would give ten scholarships or so for Natives.

2931. Would you have the examination in India as well?—I should have a limited competition in India for a certain number. It is not so necessary that the standard should be the same for both examinations, but they ought to be made so high as to show that you get the best men. If the Statutory system is maintained, I would have the examination provincial, and if a limited competition is adopted for India, I think I should have it localised to a certain extent. I would have an examination up-country as well as in the Presidency.

2932. If an examination is held in India, should the successful candidates be required, as a condition obligatory, to proceed to England to complete their training?—I would not compel them to go, but, as I said before, I think the system of sending young Natives to England should be fairly tried.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

2933. If the Statutory system is retained, you say you would have examinations in different parts of India?—Yes, provincial examinations.

2934. You would not have a limited competition for the whole of India?—Either one for the whole of India or one for each of the Presidency towns for either Service.

2935. And if the Statutory Service is abolished?—I would have a limited competition provincially.

Mr. *Ryland.*

2936. But if you have competition in India, where is the reason for retaining the the Statutory Service at all?—I think it desirable that the Local Government should retain in its hands the power of appointing provincially. I think also that the members of the Statutory Service would not look forward, perhaps, to such high administrative posts as those appointed by limited competition to the Civil Service.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

2937. You say the examination would not be the same. Then you would reserve a certain number of appointments for those who competed in India?—That would be necessary. (To the Hon'ble Mr. Justice *Mitter.*) I do not think an identical examination would be necessary. I do not think the country is ripe for open competition.

2938. But supposing the majority of people in India desire it?—I should still say that Government in the exercise of its discretion would be wise not to listen to that wish.

2939. Why?—Because I do not think that an education in India on the whole gives a man such character and general qualifications for administration as an education in England does.

Sir *Charles Turner.*

2940. Your system would result in the establishment of no less than four classes of the Civil Service:—(1) a Covenanted Civil Service recruited in England; (2) a Civil Service recruited in India to fill a proportion of the Covenanted posts; (3) a Statutory Service; and (4) an Uncovenanted Service?—I think it would be possible to amalgamate them a little more, but I think each of these four doors of entrance has its particular advantage; and unless it inconveniences the Government very much, they might be retained.

2941. Would it not be found extremely difficult to adjust the claims of the several classes to promotion?—I think the Civilians appointed by competition in India and those appointed by competition in England should be available for a great many of the same posts up to a certain extent, for instance, the post of Asistant Commissioner.

2942. And when you came to the higher appointments?—That would depend upon how high you went. I do not think we are in a position to lay down any general rule.

Mr. *Ryland.*

2943. Then the men appointed in India would not be equally eligible for the higher posts with the men appointed in England?—To any post under Chief Commissionerships they would. Of course I do not mean to say that I consider the Natives in the the Service, as they are at present situated, are fitted for these higher posts, but I would not exclude them by any law or condition of Government, but would leave it to the development of time.

2944. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in the Statute, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty? Would you admit Englishmen to be Extra Assistant Commissioners for instance?—Yes, with proper safeguards against abuse of patronage.

2945. And should the recruitment be by nomination, competition, or both combined?—By limited competition, by nomination, and by open competition with men of a certain qualification.

2946. What qualification?—I think I should allow men who had reached a certain educational standard, say the B. A. Standard, to compete.

2947. Would you recruit provincially or from the whole of India?—Provincially: I would exclude outsiders.

2948. If the existing Statutory Service is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that Service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service?—No, I would re-absorb them into the Covenanted Service.

2949. Would you then leave the Uncovenanted Service nothing to hope for but the chance of being nominated?—I should certainly be in favour of retaining the Statutory provisions so far as to allow the Government in its discretion to make appointments from the Uncovenanted Service to posts in the Covenanted Service.

Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar.*

2950. Do you mean that certain proportion of posts should be filled by nomination, a certain proportion by limited competition, and a certain proportion by open competition?—I think the proportion of nominations would require to be fixed, say one-third or one-fourth.

WITNESS LXIV —27th December 1886.

Examination of BHAWANI DASS, M. A., of the Uncovenanted Service; Extra Assistant Commissioner, Multan, Punjab.

Bhawani Dass said:—I am an M.A., and an Extra Assistant Commissioner. I entered the service by competition in 1883. I am drawing Rs. 300 and have the powers of a first class Magistrate and Munsiff. I am serving in the Multan District, having previously served in other districts in the same neighbourhood.

2951. Is the existing system of appointing Natives, as Statutory Civilians, to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—No, (1) because the Natives get less pay; (2) it is not incumbent on Government to appoint to the Service; (3) they are not appointed to an organized Service. The masses in the Punjab do not know much about the matter, but the educated classes do not appreciate either the Statute or (more especially) the rules. I also do not approve of them on these grounds. I would alter the Statute to a certain extent and the rules to a great extent, so as to make it incumbent on the Government to appoint a certain fair proportion. The definition of "Natives of India" should also be altered by substituting "habitually" for "permanently," and by adding the words "liable to the criminal laws of India" after "habitually resident in India." I would alter the rules also. The examination should be competitive and members be selected by limited competition as in the case of Extra Assistant Commissioners. I would not compel the selected candidates to go to England, but would encourage them to go.

2952. Is there any objection in the Punjab to going to England?—A little, on account of caste, but it is dying out. The two men who went have not been put out of caste.

2953. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—Yes, on account of the age limit being too low, no Native can go to England for examination, and the subjects of examination are such that Natives are at a great disadvantage. I would suggest that certain subjects should be made compulsory and others optional. English and one of the Indian vernaculars should be compulsory, and Sanscrit and Arabic should be allotted equal marks with Greek and Latin, and Persian with French. I would have simultaneous and identical examinations in India and England, the Indian examination being held at one centre, and one general list being made for both examinations, but the names sent up by the various Governments should be in proportion to the requirements of the service in each Province. I would make no apportionment in respect of creed and religions, and I would encourage the successful candidates to go to England by giving them the same privileges as are given to those who pass in England. I would raise the age limit to twenty-three. (To Mr. *Ramaswami Mudaliyar*.) For the present I would have only one general list and leave the choice to Government. But in case of appointments of persons residing out of the Province I would give the preference to residents of neighbouring Provinces.

2954. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India, as described in the Statute, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—From Natives of India only.

2955. Should the recruitment be by competition, or by nomination, or by both systems combined?—By both combined. As regards Tahsildarships I would have a competitve examination among the Naib Tahsildars to the extent of one-third of the whole, the remainder being nominated from the Subordinate Revenue establishment. I would recruit provincially, because Natives of the Province must know the manners and customs of the people better than any other persons. If the examination is held in India, I would retain the Statutory Service; and, in case it is abolished, I would re-absorb the proportion of offices now assigned to it in the Covenanted Service.

2956. Do you mean that although the Statutory system as a system was abolished, you would still retain power to the Government in exceptional cases to promote Uncovenanted men of proved merit and ability?—Yes.

2957. Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service, accordingly as the posts are held by members of that branch of the Service, or by members of the Statutory and Uncovenanted branches?—I would make no distinction below the posts of Assistant Commissioner beyond that members of the Covenanted Service who have passed their examination in England should get 15 or 20 per cent. more as staff or foreign service allowance

2958. Should any distinction be made in the furlough rules applicable to the Statutory and Uncovenanted branches of the Service according to the nationality of the officer or on any other ground?—Yes, in the furlough rules of those who have to go to Europe, whether Natives or Europeans.

WITNESS LXV.—27th December 1886.

Examination of Lala HAKUMAT RAI, Nominee of the *Indarparast Sabha* Society, established at Delhi.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Lala *Hakumat Rai.*

Lala Hakumat Rai said:—I came from Delhi on behalf of the *Indarparast Sabha*, whose object is the promotion of trade and of loyalty, and the discussion of subjects of public and local interest. The members are all Hindu residents of Delhi and elsewhere, and there are some twenty-four members. Lala Srikishen Dass is the President. I have been deputed to represent the Society.

2959. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—No, because learned men are not appointed, and members are appointed without undergoing proper tests. In the old days precautions were taken to test the qualifications of candidates. Character and capacity were alone considered. Under the present system such candidates are excluded.

2960. How would you remove these defects?—First of all graduates should be selected after competition, and it should be incumbent on the Government to appoint a certain number of them, at least half. It would not be necessary to send the selected candidates to England.

Mr. *Peacock.*

2961. What do you mean by Government being compelled to appoint at least half?—If there are ten Civil Service appointments, five should be given by competition and five by nomination.

2962. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—Yes.

2963. What changes could you make?—The age-limit should be increased to at least twenty-three if not twenty-five. Indian languages should be substituted for others. The examination should be held in India only if possible, otherwise in both places and identically. I would have only one list to be selected from according to merit.

Mr. *Peacock*—continued.

2964. Would you appoint provincially—No, according to merit.

2965. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India, as described in the Statute, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—From those subjects only who are subject to the Indian Criminal Law; the recruitment should be by competition only for all classes of appointments including Tahsildars.

2966. Would you have the competition provincial or open to the whole of India?—Open to the whole of India.

2967. If the existing Statutory Service is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that Service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes.

2968. You come from Delhi, and have had serious religious disturbances there, have you not?—I don't consider they were religious disturbances: whenever a large crowd collects it gives opportunities to budmashes not only to pick pockets, but also to create disturbances. If it had been a religious disturbance, the religious processions outside the Ajmere Gate would have been attacked.

The *President.*

2969. But as a fact it was a disturbance in which, as a rule, Hindus were on one side and Mahomedans on the other?—Not generally; it was only the lowest classes of budmashes—the roughs who were hungry.

2970. Were there not on one side Hindus and on the other side Mahomedans?—Not altogether, because there were cases in which Mahomedans were beaten by Mahomedans and Hindus by Hindus.

2971. But principally were they Hindus on one side and Mahomedans on the other?—The lower classes were.

WITNESS LXVI.—27th December 1886.

Examination of MAHOMED UMAR KHAN, of the Uncovenanted Service; Extra Assistant Commissioner, Peshawar, Punjab.

Mahomed Umar Khan said :—I have been an Extra Assistant Commissioner since 1869. I have served in the Peshawar district, also in Jullundur, and, for a short time, in Kohat. I was ten years in Jullundur. I have been forty years on the Frontier altogether.

The *President.*

2972. Would you like to see a Native of the Punjab made Deputy Commissioner of Peshawar?—No.

2973. Why?—Such an appointment should not be made at Peshawar.

2974. Have you been to England?—I have been as far as Constantinople. I know a little English.

2975. Are you acquainted with the system of appointing Statutory Natives?—Yes, it is not generally approved, because the appointments are the result of patronage. If the examination for the Covenanted Service were held in India and provincially, there would be no necessity to retain the Statute. Otherwise I would retain the Statutory Service just as it is. Should it be retained, the distribution of appointments may be made by nomination only as follows:—half the appointments to be given to members of the Uncovenanted Service of proved merit and ability, one-fourth to members of good family not already in Government employ, and the remaining one-fourth to members of the Bar.

2976. Do you know how many appointments there are to be given away?—I do not. (On its being explained that there are only two in every three years) Then I would increase the number.

2977. Would you make the selected candidates go to England?—I would leave it optional. Those who have money to go will go, and those who have not, will not go.

2978. Do you think it would be expedient to appoint a Native of this or any other Province to be Deputy Commissioner of a Frontier district?—Not at the present day. Districts not on the Frontier might be so held.

2979. Are you dissatisfied with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—Yes.

The *President*—continued.

2980. What alterations would you make?—I would raise the age from nineteen to twenty-five. I would make no alterations in the subjects. I would hold simultaneous examinations both in England and India. Arabic and Sanscrit should have the same mark value as Latin and Greek, and Persian and Hindi should be placed on a par with French and German. The examination in India should be held at one centre only.

2981. Would you have only one list, or would you apportion the appointments between England and India?—I would have one list.

2982. Would you apportion the appointments between the residents of different Provinces or in order of merit?—In order of merit.

2983. If the examination is held in India, should the successful candidates be required, as a condition obligatory, to proceed to England to complete their training?—No.

2984. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India or from all natural born subjects of Her Majesty?—From all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty.

2985. Would you recruit by nomination or competition, or by both combined?—For Tahsildarships I would have nomination only, for Munsiffs half by competition and half by nomination, and for Extra Assistant Commissioners the same system as is now in force. The recruitment should be provincial.

2986. If the existing Statutory Service is abolished, what would you do with the proportion of offices now assigned to that service?—I would give them back to the Covenanted Service.

2987. Would your promote tried men from the Uncovenanted Service to any post in Covenanted Service?—Yes.

Mr. *Crosthwaite.*

2988. What are your reasons for wishing to have the recruitment for the Uncovenanted Service provincial?—Because other Provinces are more advanced in education.

WITNESS LXVII.—27th December 1886.

Examination of Lala GUNGA RAM, B. A., Executive Engineer, Public Works Department, Punjab.

Vol. I. Sec. II. Punjab.

Lala *Gunga Ram*, B. A.

Lala Gunga Ram said:—I am an Executive Engineer in the Public Works Department.

The *President.*

2989. You have been in England?—Yes, I went in 1882. I stayed there fifteen months and returned to India about two years ago

2990. Did you find any difficulties with respect to your family or your caste?—None whatsoever.

2991. Did you find any difficulties in respect of the people generally?—None whatsoever.

2992. You are now in the same position as regards family and caste you would have been if you had never gone?—Yes, even in the most minute particulars. I am a *Waishi* by caste.

The *President*—continued.

Mr. *White.*

2993. Don't you think that when a Native who has gone to England and returned back proves himself by his conduct to have benefited by the change, he is treated with respect by his countrymen?—Certainly, and I think he is looked upon as an authority in many things.

2994. What occupation do men of your caste usually follow?—Trade.

WITNESS LXVIII.—27th December 1886.

Examination of Sodhi HUKM SINGH, of the Uncovenanted Service; Extra Assistant Commissioner, and *Mir Munshi* in the Punjab Secretariat.

Sodhi Hukm Singh said:—I belong to the Sodhi caste. I am a relation of Sodhi Man Singh. I possess landed property in Ferozepore, and am now Mir Munshi in the Punjab Secretariat. I am descended from Guru Ram Dass.

2995. Is the existing system of appointing Natives, as Statutory Civilians, to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—No, it is not on the ground that the privileges of the Statutory Service are very inferior to those of the Civil Service as regards position, pay, promotion, &c. The selection of its members has hitherto been made on a defective basis, and generally raw youths of little or no experience have been recruited for the Service.

2996. Would you alter the definition of "Natives of India" in the Statute?—Yes, I would include the subjects of Native Feudatory States.

2997. Would you include sons of officers serving in India?—Yes.

2998. How would you appoint to the Statutory Service?—In certain cases by nomination from the Uncovenanted Service, and by limited competition for members of good families and open competition for all others.

2999. Would you require the selected candidates to go to England?—It should not be compulsory, though every encouragement should be given in the shape of passage-money and allowances.

3000. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Service?—Yes, as the rules now stand no Native can be admitted to that service. There ought to be one Covenanted Service for the Natives and the Europeans. There should be different centres of examination, one in England and the other in India, and also examinations at the seat of every Local Government in India. There should be only one general list in order of merit, but there ought to be certain proportions reserved for Christians, Mahomedans, and Hindus: Christians, including Europeans, Eurasians, and Natives should compete among themselves: Hindus among Hindus, and Mahomedans among Mahomedans: appointments should be filled from persons resident in the Provinces to which they belong who had passed the examination.

3001. Your examination then would not be a competitive examination, but a pass examination?—Quite so, but in each Province it should be considered as competitive. I would fix twenty-two as the maximum age for all classes. I think Indian History might be added to the subjects and one of the Indian vernaculars should be a compulsory subject; of course where modifications were necessary they might be made, but the examinations should be as nearly as possible identical.

3002. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—From all subjects of Her Majesty without distinction, but observing the same proportion as in the case of the Covenanted Service.

3003. How would you recruit for that Service?—By competition, nomination, and limited competition in the same way as the Covenanted Service.

3004. Would you have limited competition and nomination for the Tahsildars?—Perhaps for the Munsiffs and Tahsildars the rules which now exist are quite sufficient, but for Extra Assistant Commissioners, as they are, somewhat better; and at the bottom of the Covenanted Service, there ought to be more mature and open competition confined strictly to the Punjab.

3005. If the existing Statutory Service is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service?—I think Government should have power to promote those Uncovenanted Officers who at present can derive no benefit from a competitive Civil Service examination.

3006. Would you reserve any portion of appointments for this purpose?—If it is the case that only two men can be recruited for the Statutory Service in the Punjab in three years, I would give the appointments to the Uncovenanted Service.

3007. Should any distinction be made in the salaries attached to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service accordingly as the posts are held by members of that branch of the Service, or by members of the Uncovenanted Service?—I would give the same pay to all the Services, but as Englishmen come from a foreign country and experience certain inconvenience on account

of climate, &c., they should receive a foreign service allowance according to their standing in the Service, beginning at Rs. 50 up to Rs. 500. I would give Rs. 500 to all above the ranks of Commissioner and Divisional Judge.

3008. Would you make any distinction as regards furlough rules?—Those who desired to visit Europe, whether Native or English, should have the same furlough rules. As regards the Statutory Service, I would add that the pay of that Service, one-third of the pay of the Covenanted officers, is too low. The pay of the Service should not be less than Rs. 300 to begin with, and Government should have power to promote its members to any post in the regular Service.

PROCEEDINGS

OF THE

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION.

VOLUME I.—PROCEEDINGS RELATING TO THE PUNJAB.

SECTION III.—WRITTEN ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS PUT BY THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION.

SUB-SECTION A.

	PAGE.
Sub-Section A.—Answers sent in by Societies and Associations in the Punjab:—	
I.—The *Anjaman-i-Islamia*, Lahore ...	2
II.—The *Anjaman-i-Islamia*, Gujrat ...	12
III.—The *Anjaman-i-Punjab*, Lahore ...	13
IV.—The *Anjaman-i-Faizan-i-Am*, Gujranwalla ..	14
V.—The *Anjaman-i-Islamia*, Jullunder ...	24
VI.—The *Anjaman-i-Islamia*, Amritsar ...	32
VII.—The *Indian Association*, Lahore ...	41
VIII.—The *Kayastha Sabha*, Lahore ...	49

No. I.

Answers of the Anjaman-i-Islamia Society of Lahore.

I.—Working of the existing Statutory System.

Vol. I, Sec. III, Sub-Sec. A.

Anjaman-i-Islamia, Lahore.

What is the prevalent feeling in your Province regarding the existing Statutory system? If the feeling is one of dissatisfaction, is the dissatisfaction general or is it confined to certain sections of the community?—The feeling is one of dissatisfaction. It is not general, but is confined to educated men, especially those not of high birth.

2. What are the grounds upon which any such feeling is based?—The grounds are—(*a*) that the sons of influential persons only are enrolled in the service; (*b*) that these men are generally not competent; (*c*) that the Statutory Civilians are placed in a disadvantageous position as regards pay, promotion, and other privileges.

3. Is the feeling of dissatisfaction, if it exists, directed against the Statute itself (33 Vic., Chapter 3, Section 6), or is it directed against the rules framed thereunder?—Against both.

4. If the Statute itself is objected to, is it because its provisions admit persons to specific appointments only and not to membership in an organised "Service"?—Yes.

5. Are the objections based on other, and, if so, what, grounds?—(*a*) The appointment of Statutory Civilians is left to the mere discretion of the Government of India; (*b*) the definition of "Natives of India" is not clear.

6. If a desire is felt for enrolment in a general service, what are the reasons for this desire?—The people desire to serve the Government with all their heart; they wish to civilise the masses by administering their affairs themselves in high posts; they wish to co-operate with the English in all their noble aims; and they wish to mix with the English by getting some influence in Government affairs.

7. What amendments do you advocate in Section 6 of the Statute?—Section 6 of the Statute ought to be modified so as to make it obligatory upon the Government of India to allot a certain fixed proportion of appointments to Statutory Civilians.

8. Do you consider that Section 6 of the Statute supplies such a definition of the words "Natives of India" as describes with sufficient clearness, fulness, and accuracy the various classes of persons for whose appointment to covenanted posts it is desirable to provide?—No.

9. If not, can you suggest any more complete or more satisfactory definition?—The words "permanently settled" ought to be inserted in place of the words "habitually resident."

10. If the objections are directed against the rules framed under the Statute, do they relate to the mode or modes of selection actually adopted?—Yes.

11. Do they relate to the general conditions, in regard to pay, promotion, and retiring annuity under which Statutory Civilians hold their offices?—Yes.

12. Assuming the Statutory system to be retained, what amendments would you suggest in the rules with a view to remove any reasonable objections which may be felt to them?—(*a*) That the proportion of appointments conferrable in India to those made by competition in England be raised from one-fifth to half; (*b*) that the nomination system be keptup; (*c*) that nominees be persons of good ability and experience, and, if possible, of good birth; (*d*) their merit and ability should be tested by the way in which they perform their duties during the propationary period.

13. Are Statutory Civilians regarded by the general public as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the Covenanted Service through the competitive channel?—Yes.

14. If such a feeling exists, on what grounds is it based?—Because they are generally not so able, and because they do not possess such good prospects as regards pay, promotion, and sphere of action as those who enter through the competitive channel.

15. Do the general public view with any difference the status of Statutory Civilians and that of Uncovenanted Officers?—Yes.

16. If so, on what grounds?—The Statutory Civilians have comparatively better prospects and higher pay.

II.—Mode of Selection of Statutory Civilians.

17. On the assumption* that the Statutory system is retained, how would appointment to the Statutory Service by nomination be regarded by influential sections of the Native community in your Province?—Favourably.

18. How would a system of nomination to be followed by a period of probation be regarded by the same classes?—Not favourably.

19. Would a system of nomination, with or without probation, be likely to

* The questions which follow, down to No. 39 inclusive, are put subject to the same assumption.

secure well-qualified persons?—Yes, if the persons are carefully selected.

20. Has experience actually shown such a system to secure well-qualified officers?—No.

21. Do you consider that nominations should be confined to persons of proved merit and ability?—Yes, but the present University Examinations are not the only tests of merit and ability.

22. If so, how do you consider that merit and ability should be held to have been proved for this purpose?—By providing certain qualifications, such as general ability, experience, educational attainments, &c., and especially by taking the nominee on trial and seeing how he performs his duties.

23. How would a system of limited competition amongst persons nominated for this purpose by the local Governments or by the Universities, or by those authorities concurrently or alternately, be regarded?—More favourably than open competition.

24. In preference to either of the above systems (nomination and limited competition), would a system of open competition pure and simple for the Statutory Service commend itself to the Native community?—No.

25. If competition (whether limited or open) is preferred, should there be one competition for all India or separate competitions in each Province?—Separate competitions in each Provinces.

26. If there were only one general competition, how would you ensure a due proportion of appointments falling to the population of the several Provinces?—It would be very difficult to do so.

27. Having regard to the varying educational standards reached in the several Provinces, and the varying conditions prevalent therein, is it possible to have any one system of selection for all India which would not result in the inhabitants of some Provinces being more or less excluded from a due share of appointments?—Under present circumstances no such system is possible, unless the Government of India appoint persons upon recommendations made by the local Governments.

28. Under any of the three systems of nomination, limited competition, and open competition, would you prescribe any tests of preliminary qualifications on the part of nominees or candidates in regard to (1) age, (2) intellectual capacity, (3) moral, social, and physical fitness?—Yes.

29. If so, what should be the tests under each of the heads specified?—Under a system of nomination no limit of age is necessary. Under a system of limited competition the limit of age should be 30 years, and for open competition the limit should be 25 years. Under the first system only general ability and experience would do, but social status must be high; under the second system the matriculation standard would suffice, and the candidate's respectability of family should be proved; under the third system no preliminary standard of intellectual capacity is necessary. Moral, and physical fitness are necessary under all the systems.

30. Do you consider that (after selection, whether by nomination, or competition,) there should be a period of probation?—Yes.

31. If so, what should be the duration of the probationary period?—One year.

32. Should the period of probation be passed in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service or of the Covenanted Service, or in what other manner?—In the ranks of the Service for which the person has been selected.

33. Do you consider that after selection and before entering on probation (or on duty) the person selected should undergo special training?—Yes.

34. If so, should the special training be carried out in India or in England?—In England at present.

35. If in India, would it be possible, and, if possible, advisable, to establish an Indian Civil Service College on the basis of the Haileybury College which formerly existed in England?—It would be possible, but not advisable.

36 to 39. If you do not consider special training in England essential, would you encourage nominees or selected candidates to visit England with a view to add to their qualifications for the Service? If so, what form should such encouragement take? Should it be offered before, or during, or after the probationary period, if any, through which nominees or selected candidates may be required to pass? Should it be offered before or after the nominees or selected candidates enter on their duties?—Special training in England should be essential, and it should be undergone either before, or during, or after the probationary period, at the option of the nominee, but in all cases Government should provide the expenses.

40. Are you in favour of the establishment of scholarships tenable by Natives in England for the purpose of enabling them to qualify for the Civil or Statutory Service?—Yes.

41. If so, how would you connect such a scheme with the selection of Natives for employment in the higher administrative posts in India?—Such scholarship-holders should, after they have qualified, be selected for such posts.

42. Do you think that any distinction should be made between the emoluments of nominees or selected candidates who have been trained in England or have gone to England to add to their qualifications and those who have not?—Yes.

43. If the opportunity of residence in England at a University for two years with a sufficient allowance were offered to nominees or selected candidates, is it likely that it would be taken advantage of to any great extent?—Yes.

44. If the system of examination in England were revised with the result that Natives availed themselves of it in considerable numbers, would it still be necessary to retain the Statutory system?—Yes.

45. If so, to what appointments or classes of appointments would you restrict the latter system, and what conditions over and above those already existing would you impose?—The latter system should not be restricted to any specific appointments, but the incumbents should receive smaller salaries, except when the work shows them fit and efficient, so that no distinction can fairly be made between them and the other Civilians, in which case they should be entitled to the same privileges which their brother Civilians enjoy.

III.—Competition in England for the Indian Civil Service.

46. Is the competition of Natives in the examination in England favourably looked upon by large and important classes in India?—Under the present circumstances it is not favourably looked upon.

47. Should additional facilities be given to Natives for proceeding to England and entering the Indian Civil Service by the channel of the English competition?—Yes.

48. If so, what form or forms should such facilities take?—The limit of age should be raised; scholarships should be granted by Government to enable Natives, and especially those of good birth, to proceed to England; Persian, Indian History, and Political Economy should be added to the subjects of examination; the marks of the Indian classics should be made equal to the marks of the European classics; suitable arrangements should be made to secure good society and comfortable boarding in England for the candidates.

49. What conditions, if any, should be attached to them?—The scholarship-holders should be men of good ability, and, if possible, of high family also. They should be nominated and not selected by competition.

50. What is your opinion as to giving Statutory appointments to Natives who, though they may have failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, have shown merit in the English competition?—They might be granted Statutory appointments if they have shown special merit, or if they belong to some distinguished family, or if the number of successful candidates from India be very small in that year.

51. Assuming it to be advisable to appoint to the Statutory Service in India Natives who have failed in the English competition, should such persons receive the same training as successful candidates in England, and be subject to the same final examination?—Yes.

52. Should they on appointment to the Statutory Service in India be subject to the same incidents as apply to other persons appointed under the Statutory Rules?—Yes. For an exception, see answer 45.

53. Can you say what number of Natives belonging to your Province have presented themselves annually at the competitive examination in England, and what degree of success they attained?—Only one or two, but with no success.

54. What class or classes of Natives in your Province readily go to England?—Nearly all, if they can afford to do so.

55. Are objections entertained to going to England; and, if so, what are they, and by what classes in particular are they felt?—No such objections are entertained now except by a few ignorant persons.

56. Should the examination for Natives in England be distinct in standards and conditions from that for English candidates, or should there be one and the same examination for all?—One and the same examination for all, but changes in subjects should be made as suggested in answer 48.

57. If the standards and conditions were different, how would it be possible to compare the results in the two examinations so as to bring out one list in order of merit?—It would be almost impossible.

58. Would it, under such circumstances, be desirable to allot a fixed proportion of appointments to each of the two examinations?—Yes, but the Anjaman considers the system of holding two examinations objectionable.

59. If a fixed proportion of appointments were allotted for a Native examination in England, do you consider that, in view of the objections against a voyage to England and life there, the cost thereof, and the chances of failure, a sufficient number of suitable candidates from your Province would be available to make the competition a real competition?—Under the present circumstances a sufficient number of candidates will not be available; but if encouragement be given by Government, a sufficient number will be available in future.

*60. If the examinations were distinct, what should be the limit of age for the Native examination?—Twenty-two years.

*61. What should be the conditions, nature, and subjects of the separate Native examination?—The same as for the present competitive examination in England with the following modifications:—(*a*) Marks assigned to Arabic or Sanskrit should be equal to those assigned to Greek, Latin, &c.; (*b*) Persian should also be added as one of the subjects carrying 500 marks; (*c*) Political Economy should also be added with a maximum of 500 marks; (*d*) such other changes may be made as are necessitated by the peculiarities of India.

* NOTE.—But the Anjaman does not advocate a distinct examination for Natives.

62. Assuming only one examination in England for both English and Native candidates, do you consider that the subjects and standards of examination and the conditions as to age and other matters in any respect place Native candidates at a disadvantage as compared with English candidates?—Yes.

63. If so, in what respects are Native candidates placed at a disadvantage, and what alterations would you recommend with a view to remove that disadvantage?—The limit of age is too low, and it should be raised at least to 22 years. The subjects are so chosen as to give an undue advantage to Europeans over Natives. For changes in subjects, *vide* answer 48.

64. If there should be only one examination for all candidates, should the limits of age for Natives be higher than those at present fixed for European candidates; and, if so, what should the limits for Native candidates be?—The limit of age for both Europeans and Natives should be at least 22 years.

65. If higher limits of age were fixed for Native than for European candidates, might not the latter complain that they were placed at a disadvantage?—They might complain.

66. What is the average age at which Natives at the Indian Universities pass the examinations for F.A., B.A., and M.A. respectively?—In the Punjab the average age at which students pass the F.A. is 22 years, B.A. 24 years, and M.A. 26 years.

67. From what classes of Native society are the persons who graduate at the Indian Universities usually drawn in your Province?—Mostly from low classes, some from the middle classes, and very few from the high classes.

IV.—Competition in India for the Indian Civil Service.

68. Do you advocate a competition in India for the Civil Service simultaneously with the competition in England, the same question papers being used at both examinations?—Yes.

69. How would this method of selection be regarded by the Native community generally?—Favorably.

70. If you advocate such a system, would you restrict the competition in India to Natives and that in England to English candidates, or would you admit both classes freely to either examination?—The Anjaman would admit both classes freely to either examination.

71. If Native candidates were admitted to the competition in England, while English candidates were excluded from the competition in India, on what grounds could this distinction be justified?—The Anjaman makes no such distinction.

72. Do you consider that the educational institutions available in India are at present capable of giving the very high class education which it was the object of the competitive system as introduced in 1855 to secure?—No.

73. Would an open competition in India be likely to give decided advantages to any particular class or classes of the Native community over others?—Yes.

74. Would it be likely to lead to the undue preponderance of any one class or caste in the public service?—Yes.

75. Do you think there are any objections on political or administrative grounds to open competition in India?—Yes.

76. Would the introduction of an open competitive examination in India have the effect of deterring cadets of leading families from aspiring to enter the ranks of the Civil Service?—Yes.

77. Under such a system how would it be possible to provide against the Natives of a Province in which education is comparatively backward being excluded from appointments in their own Province?—We advocate a limited provincial competition.

78. Would a system of provincial examinations be preferable to one examination for the whole of India?—Yes.

79. Under a system of open competition in India, would the successful candidates be regarded as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the Service through the channel of the open competition in England?—If the examination is the same, the question papers used at both places are the same, and the examiners are the same, there would be no such distinction.

80. Supposing that the Covenanted appointments were alloted in fixed proportions, a certain number to be obtained by competition in England and a certain number by competition in India, the examinations in each case being open on fairly equal conditions to Native and English candidates alike, and the Statutory system being abolished, how would such a system be viewed?—Favourably by the people in general, but not by the high or influential classes.

*81. If an open competition were established in India, what should be the preliminary qualifications required on the part of candidates in regard to age?—The age should not exceed 24 years.

*82. In regard to minimum educational attainments?—The matriculation standard at least.

*83. In regard to moral, social and physical fitness and in other respects (if any)?—The same as for the competitive examination of Extra Assistant Commissioners in regard to moral and physical fitness.

85. Should the subjects and conditions of the examination be the same as those prescribed for the competitive examination in England, or should they be different?—

* NOTE.—But the Anjaman is against open competition.
NOTE.—Question No. 84 is included in No. 83.

A little different, *i.e.*, the same with the modifications proposed in answer 56.

86. If different, what should they be?—See answer 61.

87. Circumstances being different in the case of persons who enter through the examination in England and of persons who enter through the examination in India, is there any reason why the rules in regard to pay, leave, pension, &c., should not also be different?—The rules as regards pecuniary emoluments and leave may be different, but not as regards other privileges. For instance, it may be ruled that those who enter through the examination in England may get some allowance, not exceeding a certain fixed amount for each appointment, over and above the fixed pay of the post.

88. Should successful candidates go through a period of special study in India like the English candidates, who spend two years in special preparation? *or*

89. Would it be preferable (*a*) to require them to go to England, or (*b*) to give them the option of going to England, suitable allowances being given to enable them to prosecute their studies there?—It would be better to give them the option of going to England, suitable allowance being given to enable them to prosecute their studies there.

90. Should successful candidates at the Indian competition be required to pass through a probationary period before final appointment?—Yes.

91. If so, what should be the duration of the probationary period?—One year.

92. How should it be passed—in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service, or otherwise?—In the ranks of the Service for which they have qualified themselves.

V.—Promotion from the Uncovenanted Service.

93. What special provision, if any, do you think should be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of deserving members of the Uncovenanted Service?—Those who by their work show themselves so able as to attract special attention should be appointed to Covenanted posts.

94. If such appointments are made, should they be restricted to the holders of any particular classes of appointments in the Uncovenanted Service, and if so, what classes?—No.

95. Should persons so appointed be appointed provisionally and be required to pass through a period of probation before final confirmation?—Yes.

96. Should provision be made for the appointment of qualified members of the Uncovenanted Service to the higher Covenanted offices without requiring them to pass through the lower grades?—Yes.

97. If certain appointments in the Covenanted grades are set apart for the Statutory Service, should a fixed proportion of those appointments be expressly reserved for persons of proved merit and ability in the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes.

98. Should special provision be made for the promotion to Covenanted posts of European members of the Uncovenanted Service?—No special provision is necessary. They will be subject to the rules for the time being in force for members of the Uncovenanted Service, whether Europeans or Natives.

99. Should special provision be made for the promotion to such posts of Eurasians or other members of the Uncovenanted Service who, though not Natives of pure descent, fall within the meaning attached in the Statute of 1870 to the term "Natives of India?"—No.

100. Ought not the Uncovenanted Service, equally with the Covenanted Service, to be open to all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty who possess the qualifications that may be from time to time prescribed? *or*

101. If the Uncovenanted Service is closed to any natural-born subjects of Her Majesty, on what grounds, bearing in mind the terms of Acts of Parliament and Her Majesty's Proclamation of 1st November 1858, is this to be justified?—It ought to be so, provided they are fit persons, acquainted with the peculiarities of the country, and can easily communicate with the people and are willing to accept the ordinary pay of the Uncovenanted Service.

VI.—Pay, Leave, and Pension for Natives of India appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than through the channel of competition in England.

102. Is the rate* of pay at present granted to Statutory Civilians during probation and on final appointment respectively sufficient?—No.

* Two hundred rupees a month on first appointment as probationers. Two hundred and fifty rupees a month after passing the Departmental Examination by the lower standard. After passing the Departmental Examination by the higher standard (unless specially exempted), and after having been confirmed in their appointments, 64 per cent. of what would be the gross pay or salary of the office if it were held by a Covenanted Civil Servant appointed after competitive examination in England.

103. If not, on what grounds do you consider it insufficient, and what rates of pay should in your opinion be granted to Statutory Civilians (*a*) while on probation, and (*b*) on final confirmation in their appoints?—(*a*) It does not enable them to keep up their position; (*b*) it makes the public think them not so respectable as the other Civilians. In the opinion of the Anjaman they should draw three hundred rupees during probation, and, ordinarily, 80 per cent. of the pay drawn by the Civilians

who pass the competitive examination in England.

104. Would these rates of pay be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes, provided appointment to a Covenanted post does not entail any loss of pay to the person.

105. Would they be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the professional classes?—Yes.

106. If not, how would you treat in regard to pay persons selected from these two classes if appointed to the lowest grade of the Covenanted Service?—They should receive the full pay of the posts, but not any allowance. See answer 87.

107. How would you treat in regard to pay such persons if appointed to any of the higher Covenanted posts without being required to pass through the lower grades?—They should receive the full pay of the higher post, but not any allowance. See answer 87.

108. Do you consider that a difference should be maintained between the rates of pay granted to Covenanted Civilians, who enter through the competitive channel in England, and to persons holding Covenanted posts who do not enter through that channel?—No such difference should be maintained.

109. If so, what would you consider the fair rate of reduction to be made in the case of persons holding Covenanted posts who do not enter through the competitive channel in England?—See answer 87.

110. Would you approve of an arrangement by which the pay of appointments would be a fixed sum to be drawn by the holder whether he is a Covenanted or a Statutory Civilian, with an additional staff allowance to be drawn by those only who enter the Service through the examination in England?—The Anjaman approves of such an arrangement.

111. Can you suggest any other way of providing different rates of pay?—See answer 103.

112. If you consider there should be no difference of pay, how do you justify the application of the same rates of pay in the case of Natives who have satisfied the very high tests required by the examination in England and Natives who have not?—By providing a special allowance over and above the fixed pay.

113. On the same assumption, what are your reasons for holding that the high rate of pay which is considered to be necessary to secure the services of persons of tested qualifications in a country far from their homes, and under various other unfavourable conditions, should be given to persons whose qualifications have not been so tested and who serve in their own native country?—The Anjaman is not of opinion that the same pecuniary emoluments should be enjoyed by both classes of Civilians (*vide* answer 103).

114. Have you any remarks to make on the leave rules embodied in the Civil Leave Code which apply to Statutory Civilians?—No.

115. At what age do you consider that Natives appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than through the competitive channel in England should be entitled to retire on pension?—At the age of 37 years.

116. After what length of service do you consider that such persons should be entitled to retire on pension?—After 15 years' service.

117. At what age should they be obliged to retire on pension?—At the age of 57 years.

118. After what length of service should they be obliged to retire on pension?—After 35 years' service.

119. What amount of pension should in your opinion be granted to Natives so appointed if they serve the prescribed period for voluntary and compulsory retirement respectively?—According to the existing rules.

120. If, before serving the prescribed period for pension, they are compelled to retire on medical certificate, what gratuity, if any, would you give them?—A reward or gratuity of ten per cent. upon what he has drawn as his pay since he entered the Service.

VII.—General.

121. How far is the existing system of education in the higher schools and colleges in India well adapted for training young men to the public Service? Can you suggest any improvements?—It is not as well adapted as might be desired. Special classes should be formed in Indian schools and colleges for training young men for the public Service, and such subjects should be taught therein as may be of practical advantage in the public Service.

122. In 1854 Lord Macaulay's Committee were of opinion that the best, the most liberal, and the most finished education to be procured in England was a necessary qualification for admission to the Civil Service. Do Indian schools and colleges at present supply an education of so high a standard?—No.

123. Do you consider that Indian schools at present develop the force of character and other qualities required for English administration?—They do, but only to a small extent.

124. Do we now obtain for Government Service Natives of the classes who under Native rule carried on the civil administration of the country?—No.

125. If not, where must we look for representatives of these classes; and how do you consider that their services could be best obtained?—The representatives of these classes can be found among the gentry, and their services can be secured by doing away with competition, by giving them inducements and encouragement to go to England under the care and at the expense of Government.

126. How far would any system of appointment which involves a journey to and residence in England be regarded by the Native community as open to objection on the ground that it requires Hindu candidates to abandon their caste as a condition of entering the Civil Service?—It is now no longer considered objectionable.

127. How far would such a system be regarded as open to objection on the ground that it restricts the field of selection to those candidates who are wealthy enough to undertake the cost of a journey to and residence in England?—It would be considered objectionable on this ground, but the objection may easily be removed by giving scholarships to promising lads from among the Native gentry to enable them to go to England.

128. Are the Natives who go to England from your Province for purposes of education limited to the wealthier classes?—Yes.

129. Are they limited to any particular section of the community or to any particular creed?—No.

130. Does a voyage to or residence in England involve the loss of social position or other unfavourable consequences in the case of any section of the Native community?—Such is no longer the case now.

131. Does it result in placing those Natives who undertake it more or less out of touch and sympathy with their fellow-countrymen on their return to India?—No.

132. Would the requirement of a temporary residence in England as a condition precedent to or following on appointment to the Government Service have the effect of excluding from such appointment any considerable or important section of the Native community?—No.

133. If the Statutory system is discontinued, should special provision be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of Natives who, for religious or other sufficient reasons, are unable or unwilling to undertake a journey to and residence in England?—No such special provision is necessary; but the Statutory Service should not be discontinued, but improved.

134. If so, what provision should be made for this purpose?—See answer 133.

135. If the Statutory system is discontinued, do you consider that special provision should be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of capable members of the professional classes?—Yes, such a special provision should be made.

136. If so, what provision should be made for this purpose?—At least one-fourth of the total number of appointments conferrable in India should be allotted to deserving and senior members of the professional classes.

137. Whatever system or systems may be adopted, ought power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts candidates of high family subject to such antecedent guarantees of fitness as may be considered sufficient in each case?—Yes, such a power should be reserved to Government.

138. Ought similar power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts persons who have proved their merit and ability in Government Service, or in the exercise of a profession, without preliminary examination or competition?—Yes.

139. If a thorough knowledge of English were made an essential qualification for appointment to Covenanted posts, would the field of selection in the case of persons already in the Uncovenanted Service, or engaged in the exercise of a profession, be unduly limited thereby?—Yes, under the present circumstances.

140. If such is likely to be the case, could the difficulty be obviated by requiring proficiency in the English language to be tested by periodical examinations after selection, but during a probationary period?—Yes.

141. Should provision be made for the occasional appointment, in very special and exceptional cases, to Covenanted posts of persons of known ability and local influence whom, although they may never have held office and may not possess special professional qualifications, and although their age may exceed the limit laid down for untried candidates, it might nevertheless be considered desirable to appoint to the higher grades for political or other reasons?—Yes.

142. Would it be desirable to rule that the proportion of persons being Mahomedans and Hindus respectively, who are from time to time, or over a series of years, appointed to the Covenanted ranks in any Province, should bear a certain relation to the number of the two classes composing the population of the Province concerned?—Yes, it would be desirable to rule so, because such a scheme would prevent the undue preponderance of one class over the other class; and it would be easy to do so, if the nomination system is adhered to. But if the competitive system be introduced, which the Anjaman does not support, in that case also this scheme can be made workable and capable of securing the services of able men.

143. What classes, ranks, or professions of the Native community should be included among Mahomedans and Hindus, respectively, for the purpose of ascertaining the proportion of the population of each of those classes in the several Provinces?—In each Province the distinction between the Hnidus and Musalmans is self-evident.

144. How far should appointments in each Province to Covenanted posts be restricted to Natives of the Province concerned?—Except the posts filled up by competition in England, all other Covenanted posts should be restricted to Natives of the Province concerned.

145. How would the following scheme be regarded by the Native community?—

(1) The Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of European officers, admission being by competition in England confined to European candidates only.

(2) The appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, Natives only being eligible.—

Not favourably, because this scheme tends to keep up the distinction of colour.

146. How would you regard such a scheme?—Unfavourably.

147. How would the Native community regard the following?—

(1) The Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of appointments to be filled by competition in England to which Natives and Europeans alike would be admitted.

(2) The appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, both Natives and Europeans being eligible.—Favourably.

148. How would you regard such a scheme?—Favourably.

149. If either of the above schemes were adopted, how would the Native community view a proposal to combine the higher appointments of the Uncovenanted Service with the appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service, so as to form an enlarged Civil Service to be recruited in India?—If the scheme laid down in question 147 were adopted, such a proposal would be viewed favourably.

150. How would you view such a proposal?—Favourably.

151. How would the Native community regard the following scheme?—

(1) a certain number of appointments in the Covenanted Civil Service to be reserved for Natives;

(2) a certain proportion of that number to be filled by competition or by some other system in India;

(3) the remainder to be filled by competition in England.—Favourably as compared with the present system.

152. How would you regard such a scheme?—Favourably, but the number reserved should be large enough.

153. Assuming a system of nomination or of limited competition among nominated candidates, would Native opinion be in favour of giving a preference, as between candidates possessed of certain preliminary essential qualifications and having on general grounds fairly equal claims, in the following or any other order, to—

(*a*) member of families of tried loyalty and distinguished service;

(*b*) persons of good social status and influence in the country; and

(*c*) persons of superior educational attainments, such as persons who have taken the degree of M.A.?—Yes, but in clause (*c*) the words "such as persons who have taken the degree of M.A." should be omitted.

154. What is your opinion as to giving such preference?—Preference might be given.

155. How would the Native community regard a system of nomination on the ground of merit and ability shown in the service of Government, or in the exercise of a profession, alternating with a system of selection by means of competition, whether entirely open or amongst nominated candidates?—Favourably.

156. How would you regard such a system?—Favourably.

157. If the Statutory system were maintained, and if a probationary period were required from nominees or selected candidates before final appointment, would it be necessary to insist upon such probationary period in all cases, *e.g.*, in the case of a person who has done good service in the Uncovenanted ranks?—No.

158. In the cases of persons nominated from the professional classes, is it desirable that a probationary period should be prescribed?—Yes.

159. If so, is it necessary that the incidents of such period, as to duration and pay, should be the same as those attached thereto in the case of Statutory Civilians appointed on probation to the lowest grade of the Covenanted Service?—No.

160. On what principles should the promotion of Natives appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than by the channel of the competition in England be regulated?—No restriction should be placed upon their promotion if they show ability in the service of Government, or if they distinguish themselves in any special duty entrusted to them.

161. Would you regulate such promotion only by considerations of fitness and approved personal merit?—Yes, except when such promotion is given on political grounds.

162. Should subjects of Native States be eligible for appointment to Covenanted posts in British India?—Yes, if they fulfil other essential conditions.

163. If so, should this be extended to all Native States in alliance with the Crown, or only to those in subordinate alliance?—To all.

164. What system, if any, is at present adopted in your Province for bringing into the public Service persons who, from their

position or otherwise, cannot be expected to enter the Service of Government in the lowest grades, and for giving them the necessary apprenticeship?—None, except the Statutory system.

165. Does the system work well, and what improvements can you suggest?—Not well. Members of high families should be induced to take to education, and also to visit England.

VIII.—Composition, Recruitment, &c., of the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services.

166. How is the present system of regulating appointments to the Subordinate* Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, regarded by influential sections of the Native community?—These sections are against competition. In other respects they regard it favourably.

167. To what sections of Native society do the persons belong who accept, under existing conditions, appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services respectively?—They belong to the influential sections, except those appointed after competition.

168. To what extent do Natives of good family and education in your Province offer themselves as candidates for Subordinate Judicial and Executive appointments?—To a large extent.

169. Do Natives who have been to England for purposes of study on their return to India willingly accept such appointments?—Very few Natives have been to England for purposes of study from our Province. If more go in future, they would accept such appointments if higher appointments are not available.

170. How far are the professional classes represented in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, in your Province?—To a very small extent.

171. Do members of the professional classes in your Province readily accept employment in those Services?—Yes, if they are offered suitable posts.

172. Whatever system or systems may at present be adopted for the purpose of regulating appointments to the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, are any class or classes of persons expressly or practically excluded from such appointments?—The influential classes have been excluded by the competitive system.

173. If so, how is such exclusion justified?—Such exclusion is unjustifiable, unless it be said that they do not possess sufficient ability to pass at the top of the list. But the Anjaman is of opinion that those who stand highest are not necessarily the ablest and fittest of those who appear at an examination.

174. Is it the case that certain classes of Uncovenanted appointments are practically reserved for Natives of pure descent owing to the fact that conditions are imposed which have resulted in shutting out Eurasians and other Statutory Natives of mixed decent?—These conditions are not imposed to show favour to Natives, but are necessitated by the circumstances of the appointments.

175. If so, how is such reservation justified?—The reservation, if any, is necessitated by the circumstances.

176. Are you in favour of laying down a rule that high educational capacity should be regarded as an essential qualification for appointment to the Subordinate Executive and to the Subordinate Judicial Services as defined for the purposes of these questions?—or

177. If so, what test would you apply?—No, the Anjaman thinks that much regard should be paid to general ability; educational capacity as measured by University tests alone being insufficient. But among candidates otherwise possessing equal qualifications, the Anjaman would prefer him who had received the best education.

178. Do you think that the test should vary according to the character of the office to be filled?—Yes.

179. Generally, what system do you advocate for filling appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services as above defined?—The nomination system.

180. What preliminary qualifications would you require on the part of candidates for those appointments in regard to age and in other respects?—The qualifications should be—(1) distinguished service; (2) general ability, if the nominee is already employed or belongs to the professional class; (3) influence in the country; (4) high birth, and (5) educational attainments, if not employed. No limit of age need be prescribed for persons already in the Service of Government as well as for those exercising a learned profession, such as law. For others the limit of age should be 30 years.

181. Is it possible to devise any one system which would be equally applicable to all Provinces, having regard to the varying educational standards reached in the several Provinces and the varying conditions prevalent therein?—No.

182. Do you advocate the requirement of a probationary period; and if so, what should be the incidents of such period as

NOTE.—For the purposes of these questions the terms "Subordinate Executive Service" and "Subordinate Judicial Service" may be held to include respectively all Subordinate Executive and Judicial offices down to and including the office of Tahsildár or Munsif, or other office corresponding to that of Tahsildár or Munsif, which are not reserved for or not ordinarily held by members of the Covenanted Civil Service.

to duration, pay, and in other respects?—Yes. The duration of the period of probation should not exceed one year. The salary to be drawn during probation should be two-thirds of the pay of the post. A departmental test should be required to be passed, unless the probationer is specially exempted.

183. Would you require a probationary period in all cases, or would you dispense with it in certain, and if so in what, cases?—A probationary period should be required in all cases, unless the Government of the place considers there are special grounds for dispensing with it.

184. If an open competitive examination were held in India for the Covenanted posts reserved for Natives, would persons who gained high marks in that examination and showed decided proficiency, but who failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, form suitable nominees for Subordinate Judicial and Executive appointments in the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes.

No. II.

Answers of the Anjaman-i-Islamia Society of Gujrat.

(Translation).

Vol. I, Sec. III, Sub-Sec. A.

Anjaman-i-Islamia, Gujrat.

1. The Anjaman has no objections to urge against the Statute under which Natives of India are admitted to the Civil Service.

2. Those Natives of India who proceed to England for the purpose of appearing at the examination for the Civil Service should be allowed to enter up to the age of twenty-three years instead of twenty-one (*sic*) as at present.

3. Such persons as have been accepted should receive, besides the expenses of the journey to England and back, Rs. 3,000 for expenses in England.

4. Persons appointed by nomination in India as candidates for the Covenanted Civil Service should not be under twenty-one years of age.

5. Such persons should reside for at least two years in England, at their own expense, to study law, and should be considered entitled to admission to the Civil Service only after passing some examination before their return to India.

6. The salary of the Covenanted Civilian, whether a Native of India or an Englishman, should be the same, and all rights and privileges as to pay, promotion, and retirement should be identical.

7. There should be separate competitive examinations in each Province, and candidates should be selected in proportion to the classes of the population. Mahomedans should compete with Mahomedans, and other castes with other castes.

8. All persons selected or nominated for the Covenanted Civil Service should possess educational qualifications up to the Entrance standard of a University, and should give satisfactory evidence of physical fitness.

9. Fifty per cent. of the candidates for the Indian Civil Service should be residents of India.

10. The competitive examination for the Civil Service should be held in England.

11. The rules for appointing Uncovenanted officers to the Covenanted Service should remain as they formerly existed.

12. Every Uncovenanted officer who has served for five years in a higher office than a Munsif or Tashildárship at the commencement of his service should be considered entitled (meaning qualified) for appointment to the Covenanted Civil Service.

13. For the subordinate offices, namely, Munsifs and Tahsildárs, the Entrance examination at least should have been passed, or qualifications equivalent to that standard should be required. Officers so qualified should also be deemed qualified for Extra Assistant Commissionerships.

14. For subordinate offices persons should be appointed who are not over thirty years of age; but in appointing them Mahomedans should be selected in proportion to the population.

No. III.

Answers of the Anjaman-i-Punjab Society of Lahore.

I.—Statutory Civil Service.

1. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved? If it is not, what are the grounds of disapprobation?—With reference to the Statutory system, the Anjaman are of opinion that the system has not been sufficiently long in practice to justify any definite opinion, favourable or unfavourable, being formed on the subject. The Anjaman are on the whole of opinion that the men appointed under this system are fairly good, and any alteration in the present system seems undesirable at present.

2. If the provisions of the Statute 33 Vic., section 6, are not repealed, nor substantially amended so as to take away the power conferred on the Local Administrations, should they be amended in respect of the description of persons on whose behalf such powers may be exercised or in respect of the sanction required for appointments made thereunder?—The Society think that the power now vested in the Local Governments of nominating candidates under Statute 33, Section 6, should continue to be exercised by the Local Governments.

3. If the Statutory Service is retained, should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training, or should they be encouraged to do so?—The Anjaman think that encouragement in the shape of scholarships and free passages might be given, but that candidates should not be compelled to go to England.

II.—Covenanted Civil Service.

4. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service? The Society think that the present system is universally unpopular.

5. Should any, and if any what, change be made in that system?—The age for candidates should be raised.

6. Do Natives of India labour under any, and if any what, disadvantages in competing for employment in this branch of the Service?—In the first place they have to pass the examination in a foreign language; secondly, the European classics, which are not taught in India, form subjects of examination, and a larger number of marks is assigned to them than for Arabic and Sanskrit.

7. By what changes may those disadvantages be minimised or removed, *e.g.* (*a*) by the establishment of scholarships and allowance of passage-money to Native candidates; (*b*) by altering the limit of age; (*c*) by adding to the subjects of examination, or by altering the maximum marks obtainable in certain subjects; (*d*) by holding simultaneously examinations in England and in India?—(*a*) yes; (*b*) by raising the age to 23; (*c*) by including the Urdu language and assigning equal marks to Arabic, Sanskrit, Latin, and Greek; (*d*) No.

8. Are the young Natives obtained under the existing system of the open competition in England the best as regards character and capacity who could be obtained under any system?—Yes; they are well qualified in every way.

III.—Uncovenanted Service.

9. Should the Uncovenated Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in Statute 33 Vic., Cap. 3, Section 6, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—This service should be confined to those who are subject to the same laws as the Natives of India. Appointments should be made only by nomination.

No. IV.

Answers of the Anjaman-i-Faizan-i-Am Society, Gujranwalla.

I.—Working of the existing Statutory System.

Vol. I, Sec. III, Sub-Sec. A.

Anjaman, Gujranwalla.

What is the prevalent feeling in your Province regarding the existing Statutory system? If the feeling is one of dissatisfaction, is the dissatisfaction general or is it confined to certain sections of the community?—The prevalent feeling in our Province regarding the existing Statutory system is one of general dissatisfaction.

2. What are the grounds upon which any such feeling is based?—The grounds on which such feeling is based are mainly these:—(*a*) The existing system does not apparently satisfy the legitimate aspirations of the enlightened Indian public who desire to be admitted into the regular Covenanted Civil Service; (*b*) and inasmuch as the chief condition, namely, proved merit and ability, is practically disregarded in the nomination of persons to the Service, even the ignorant public appear to be dissatisfied when undeserving persons are appointed to the Judicial branch of the Service.

3. Is the feeling of dissatisfaction, if it exists, directed against the Statute itself (33 Vic, Chapter 3, Section 6), or is it directed against the rules framed thereunder?—The dissatisfaction is directed against the Statute as well as the rules.

4. If the Statute itself is objected to, is it because its provisions admit persons to specific appointments only and not to membership in an organised Service?—Yes, this is one of the main objections.

5. Are the objections based on other, and if so what, grounds?—Because (*a*) practically the Statutory system is the only facility that has hitherto been allowed to the Natives of India for admission into the Civil Service, and is therefore looked upon by the people as a substitute of an inferior type devised by Government to deter the people of this country from aspiring to membership in the organised Service; and also because (*b*) there is nothing in the Statute which would make it obligatory on the Government to confer on Natives of proved merit a reasonable proportion of appointments.

6. If a desire is felt for enrolment in a general Service, what are the reasons for this desire?—Simply because many of the ancestors of the present generation held high executive offices of trust, even under the foreign Government of the Mogal dynasty, and because even at this day there are men amongst ourselves who under the Sikh rule held very high administrative offices and were governors over large tracts of the country. The desire is thus general and inherent, and its non-fulfilment under the most civilised Christian rule is felt as a hardship and an unjust slur on the capabilities of the present generation and their loyal attachment to the British Raj.

7. What amendments do you advocate in Section 6 of the Statute?—In Section 6 of the Statute, before commencing the definition of 'Native of India,' the following clause or something to that effect should be inserted:—"And it is hereby ruled that at least one-fifth the number of appointments in the Civil Service shall be reserved for cadets of Indian high families, members of the Uncovenanted Civil Service, and of the legal profession of proved merit and ability."

8. Do you consider that Section 6 of the Statute supplies such a definition of the words "Natives of India" as describes with sufficient clearness, fulness, and accuracy the various classes of persons for whose appointment to Covenanted posts it is desirable to provide?—Yes, but it would be desirable to have the definition so modified as to be confined to Natives of India of pure Asiatic descent.

9. If not, can you suggest any more complete or more satisfactory definition?—The definition should be modified as below:—The words "Natives of India" shall include any person of pure Asiatic descent born and domiciled, &c., &c. (the remainder of the Statute to remain as at present).

10. If the objections are directed against the rules framed under the Statute, do they relate to the mode or modes of selection actually adopted?—Yes.

11. Do they relate to the general conditions in regard to pay, promotion, and retiring annuity under which Statutory Civilians hold their offices?—Yes, they relate also to the pay, &c., of Statutory Civilians.

12. Assuming the Statutory system to be retained, what amendments would you suggest in the rules with a view to remove any reasonable objections which may be felt to them?—The Society is in favour of Provincial competitive examinations being held in India for the Covenanted Civil Service, and of retaining the Statutory system as an additional facility for members of high families and others whom the Government may deem fit to appoint or promote to the Service for political or special reasons. The advantages of pay, &c., enjoyed by the Covenanted Civilians might be extended to Statutory Civilians.

13. Are Statutory Civilians regarded by the general public as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the Covenanted Service through the competitive channel?—Yes

14. If such a feeling exists, on what grounds is it based?—Because Statutory

Civilians do not possess advantages regarding pay, &c., similar to those enjoyed by the regular members of the Covenanted Service.

15. Do the general public view with any difference the status of Statutory Civilians and that of Uncovenanted officers?—Yes, with a very slight difference.

16. If so, on what grounds?—On account of their being classed with Covenanted Civil Servants.

II.—Mode of Selection of Statutory Civilians.

17. On the assumption* that the Statutory system is retained, how would appointment to the Statutory Service by nomination be regarded by influential sections of the Native community in your Province?—Appointment to the Service by nomination, based on proved merit and ability, will be regarded as satisfactory by influential classes, provided ability is tested by limited competition among the nominees.

18. How would a system of nomination, to be followed by a period of probation be regarded by the same classes?—With satisfaction, except in cases of promotions from the Uncovenanted Service.

19. Would a system of nomination, with or without probation, be likely to secure well-qualified persons?—Not generally.

20. Has experience actually shown such a system to secure well-qualified officers?—If able men have not been secured for the Statutory Service, it is not owing to the absence of any rule enjoining a probationary period; but the fact is chiefly due to the essential condition of proved merit and ability having been disregarded in making nominations.

21. Do you consider that nominations should be confined to persons of proved merit and ability?—Yes.

22. If so, how do you consider that merit and ability should be held to have been proved for this purpose?—The fact should be proved (*a*) in the case of promotions from the Uncovenanted Service by official reports on at least five years' service preceding nomination that the nominee has distinguished himself in the Uncovenanted Service; (*b*) in the case of professional men, by reports of the Courts in which they may have practised for five years; and (*c*) in case of cadets of high families, by limited competition among them.

23. How would a system of limited competition amongst persons nominated for this purpose by the local Governments or by the Universities, or by those authorities concurrently or alternately, be regarded?—Limited competition should be confined to cadets of high families.

24. In preference to either of the above systems (nomination and limited competition), would a system of open competition, pure and simple, for the Statutory Service commend itself to the Native community?—No.

25. If competition (whether limited or open) is preferred, should there be one competition for all India or separate competitions in each Province?—Separate competitions in each Province.

26. If there were only one general competition, how would you ensure a due proportion of appointments falling to the population of the several Provinces?—*Vide* No. 25.

27. Having regard to the varying educational standards reached in the several Provinces, and the varying conditions prevalent therein, is it possible to have any one system of selection for all India which would not result in the inhabitants of some Provinces being more or less excluded from a due share of appointments?—*Vide* Nos. 25 and 26.

28. Under any of the three systems of nomination, limited competition, and open competition, would you prescribe any tests of preliminary qualifications on the part of nominees or candidates in regard to (1) age, (2) intellectual capacity, (3) moral, social, and physical fitness?—Yes.

29. If so, what should be the tests under each of the heads specified?—(*a*) For promotions from the Uncovenanted Service, there should be only one condition, viz. the nominee must have exercised first-class powers for at least five years with satisfaction to his official superiors; (*b*) for men of the Legal profession, the condition should be approved practice for five years; and (*c*) for admission to limited competitive examinations the conditions should be: (1) the nominee must belong to a leading Indian family; (2) must be between 18 and 25 years of age; (3) must have passed at least the matriculation examination of a recognised University, or an examination equivalent thereto; (4) must produce a health certificate signed by a Civil Surgeon; and (5) must produce a certificate of good moral character signed by two respectable inhabitants of the district, known to the nominee and to the head of the district, who should countersign.

30. Do you consider that (after selection, whether by nomination or competition) there should be a period of probation?—Yes, in case of selection by competition there should be a period of probation.

31. If so, what should be the duration of the probationary period?—One year.

32. Should the perid of probation be passed in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service or of the Covenanted Service, or in what other manner?—In the ranks of the Statutory Service.

33. Do you consider that after selection and before entering on probation (or on duty) the person selected should undergo special training?—No.

* The questions which follow, down to No. 39 inclusive, are put subject to the same assumption.

Vol. I, Sec. III, Sub-Sec. A.

Anjuman, Gujranwalla.

34. If so, should the special training be carried out in India or in England?—This Society is not in favour of a special training.

35. If in India, would it be possible, and, if possible, desirable to establish an Indian Civil Service College on the basis of the Haileybury College which formerly existed in England?—See Nos. 33 and 34.

36. If you do not consider special training in England essential, would you encourage nominees or selected candidates to visit England with a view to add to their qualifications for the Service?—Yes, with a view to add to their qualifications for higher administrative work.

37. If so, what form should such encouragement take?—*Bonâ fide* travelling expenses with full pay for the whole period of their stay in England may be desirable, and *cœteris paribus* they should be allowed, on return to India, preferential claims to promotion to those who may not have visited England.

38. Should it be offered before, or during, or after the probationary period, if any, through which nominees or selected candidates may be required to pass?—After the probationary period.

39. Should it be offered before or after nominees or selected candidates enter on their duties?—After.

40. Are you in favour of the establishment of scholarships tenable by Natives in England for the purpose of enabling them to qualify for the Civil or Statutory Service?—For the Statutory Service no such scholarships will be necessary, but they should be established if the competitive examination for the Covenanted Service is not to be held in India.

41. If so, how would you connect such a scheme with the selection of Natives for employment in the higher administrative posts in India?—When in all other respects the claims of any two candidates for higher administrative work are equal, preference should be given to one who has been trained in England.

42. Do you think that any distinction should be made between the emoluments of nominees or selected candidates who have been trained in England or have gone to England to add to their qualifications and those who have not?—No, because preferential claim to promotion will be a sufficient recompense for English training.

43. If the opportunity of residence in England at a University for two years with a sufficient allowance were offered to nominees or selected candidates, is it likely that it would be taken advantage of to any great extent?—No.

44. If the system of examination in England were revised with the result that Natives availed themselves of it in considerable numbers, would it still be necessary to retain the Statutory system?—Yes.

45. If so, to what appointments or classes of appointments would you restrict the latter system, and what conditions over and above those already existing would you impose?—There should be no restriction. Statutory Civilians should be allowed to rise as high as their capabilities admit.

III.—Competition in England for the Indian Civil Service

46. Is the competition of Natives in the examination in England favourably looked upon by large and important classes in India?—No.

47. Should additional facilities be given to Natives for proceeding to England and entering the Indian Civil Service by the channel of the English competition?—Yes, if no examination is to be held in India.

48. If so, what form or forms should such facilities take?—Special scholarships; increase of the limit of age of candidates to 25 years; and Persian, Arabic, and Sanskrit should have the same position in the list of subjects of examination as Latin, Greek, French, &c

49. What conditions, if any, should be attached to them?—The scholarships should be awarded according to the results of a preliminary competitive examination in India, preference being given to members of leading families in case of equal merit, and a due proportion of scholarships being assigned to each Province. Age should be ascertained from horoscopes or similar reliable records. The competitors should be required to produce a certificate of having passed the Entrance Examination of a recognised University, but the standard of their competition in all subjects should be as high as is at present the case for the Civil Service Examination, except in the Oriental Classics and languages, which should be equal to the B.A. standard of the Punjab University. The candidates should also produce a certificate of good health and physical fitness and a certificate of good moral character.

50. What is your opinion as to giving Statutory appointments to Natives who, though they may have failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, have shown merit in the English competition?—The Statutory Service should be reserved for members of high families, members of the Uncovenanted Service and of the Legal profession.

51. Assuming it to be advisable to appoint to the Statutory Service in India Natives who have failed in the English competition, should such persons receive the same training as successful candidates in England, and be subject to the same final examination?—No.

52. Should they on appointment to the Statutory Service in India be subject to the same incidents as apply to other persons appointed under the Statutory rules?—Yes.

53. Can you say what number of Natives belonging to your Province have presented themselves annually at the competitive examination in England, and what degree of success they attained?—Not known.

54. What class or classes of Natives in your Province readily go to England?—All enlightened classes.

55. Are objections entertained to going to England; and if so what are they, and by what classes in particular are they felt?—Yes, religious objections, and they are particularly felt by Brahmins and Baniahs.

56. Should the examination for Natives in England be distinct in standards and conditions from that for English candidates, or should there be one and the same examination for all?—One and the same, with the modifications regarding subjects of examination and age of candidates mentioned in answer No. 48.

57. If the standards and conditions were different, how would it be possible to compare the results in the two examinations so as to bring out one list in order of merit?—It would not be possible, but we are not advocates of different standards.

58. Would it under such circumstances be desirable to allot a fixed proportion of appointments to each of the two examinations?—We are not advocates of two examinations.

59. If a fixed proportion of appointments were allotted for Natives in the examination in England, do you consider that in view of the objections against a voyage to England and life there, the cost thereof, and the chances of failure, a sufficient number of suitable candidates from your Province would be available to make the competition a real competition?—No.

60. If the examinations were distinct, what should be the limits of age for the Native examination?—18 to 25 years.

61. What should be the conditions, nature, and subjects of the separate examination for Natives?—No separate examination is necessary.

62. Assuming only one examination in England for both English and Native candidates, do you consider that the subjects and standards of examination and the conditions as to age and other matters in any respect place Native candidates at a disadvantage as compared with English candidates?—Yes.

63. If so, in what respects are Native candidates placed at a disadvantage, and what alterations would you recommend with a view to remove that disadvantage?—The limits of age are too low; the examination is conducted in English. The disadvantages would be removed to a certain extent if the age-limit were raised to 25 and the position of Indian classics and Vernaculars were recognised and placed on a par with the European classics and Continental languages.

64. If there should be only one examination for all candidates, should the limits of age for Natives be higher than those at present fixed for European candidates; and if so, what should the limits for Native candidates be?—Yes, 18 to 25 years.

65. If higher limits of age were fixed for Native than for European candidates, might not the latter complain that they were placed at a disadvantage?—No, they cannot reasonably do so, as the examination will still be held in English and conducted in their mother-tongue.

66. What is the average age at which Natives at the Indian Universities pass the examinations for F.A., B.A., and M.A. respectively?—20, 23, and 25.

67. From what classes of Native society are the persons who graduate at the Indian Universities usually drawn in your Province?—Generally from the middle classes.

IV.—Competition in India for the Indian Civil Service.

68. Do you advocate a competition in India for the Civil Service simultaneously with the competition in England, the same question papers being used at both examinations?—Yes, with the modifications mentioned in answer 48.

69. How would this method of selection be regarded by the Native community generally?—With some satisfaction.

70. If you advocate such a system, would you restrict the competitionin India to Natives, and that in England to English candidates, or would you admit both classes freely to either examination?—Both classes freely to either examination.

71. If Native candidates were admitted to the competition in England, while English candidates were excluded from the competition in India, on what grounds could this distinction be justified?—We make no such distinction.

72. Do you consider that the educational institutions available in India are at present capable of giving the very high class education which it was the object of the competitive system as introduced in 1855 to secure?—Yes, but if not, they should be improved.

73. Would an open competition in India be likely to give decided advantages to any particular class or classes of the Native community over others?—Yes, to some extent; but we are not advocates of one open competition for the whole of India, but for competition in each Province.

74. Would it be likely to lead to the undue preponderance of any one class or caste in the public Service?—Yes, *vide* answer 73.

75. Do you think there are any objections on political or administrative grounds to open competition in India?—Yes, at present.

76. Would the introduction of an open competition in India have the effect of deterring cadets of leading families from aspiring to enter the ranks of the Civil

Service?—Yes, and therefore the Statutory system should be retained for them.

77. Under such a system how would it be possible to provide against the Natives of a Province in which education is comparatively backward being excluded from appointments in their own Province?—By establishing Provincial Competitive examinations.

78. Would a system of Provincial examinations be preferable to one examination for the whole of India?—Yes.

79. Under a system of open competition in India, would the successful candidates be regarded as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the Service through the channel of the open competition in England?—No.

80. Supposing that the Covenanted appointments were allotted in fixed proportions, a certain number to be obtained by competition in England and a certain number by competition in India, the examinations in each case being open on fairly equal conditions to Native and English candidates alike, and the Statutory system being abolished, how would such a system be viewed?—It will not satisfy the aristocracy, who will practically be excluded from the Service.

81. If an open competition were established in India, what should be the preliminary qualifications required on the part of candidates in regard to age?—Age 18 to 25.

82. In regard to minimum educational attainments?—Entrance certificate of a recognised University.

83. In regard to moral, social, and physical fitness?—Usual certificates of health, moral character and physical fitness, &c.

84. In other respects (if any)?—Should be a fairly good rider, and should belong to a respectable family.

85. Should the subjects and conditions of the examination be the same as those prescribed for the competitive examination in England, or should they be different?—The same, with modifications regarding foreign languages and age.

86. If different, what should they be?—The same standard and subjects as at present prescribed for the Civil Service with the exception of modifications regarding foreign languages and age.

87. Circumstances being different in the case of persons who enter through the examination in England and of persons who enter through the examination in India, is there any reason why the rules in regard to pay, leave, pension, &c., should not also be different?—There should be no difference in the rate of pay. The question of pay should invariably be determined according to the requirements of the Service and not personal requirements. As there is no lack of able men in the country for the recruiting of the Civil Service, it is not easy to see why higher rates of pay should be allowed to any particular people from circumstantial considerations. Higher rates of pay, &c., should be strictly restricted only to those cases where it may be necessary in the interests of the Service to import men from distant countries.

88. Should successful candidates go through a period of special study in India like the English candidates, who spend two years in special preparation?—We would give them the option of going to England.

89. Would it be preferable (*a*) to require them to go to England, or (*b*) to give them the option of going to England, suitable allowances being given to enable them to prosecute their studies there?—We would give them the option of going to England.

90. Should successful candidates at the Indian competition be required to pass through a probationary period before final appointment?—Yes.

91. If so, what should be the duration of the probationary period?—One year.

92. How should it be passed—in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service, or otherwise?—In the ranks of the Covenanted Service.

V.—Promotion from the Uncovenanted Service.

93. What special provision, if any, do you think should be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of deserving members of the Uncovenanted Service?—Out of the number of appointments recommended to be reserved for the Statutory Service, one-third should be reserved for promotions from the Uncovenanted grades.

94. If such appointments are made, should they be restricted to the holders of any particular classes of appointments in the Uncovenanted Service; and if so, what classes?—Yes, to those who may have exercised first-class powers for at least five years with satisfaction.

95. Should persons so appointed be appointed provisionally and be required to pass through a period of probation before final confirmation?—Not necessary unless there be a marked change in their duties.

96 Should provision be made for the appointment of qualified members of the Uncovenanted Service to the higher Covenanted offices without requiring them to pass through the lower grades?—Yes.

97. If certain appointments in the Covenanted grades are set apart for the Statutory Service, should a fixed proportion of those appointments be expressly reserved for persons of proved merit and ability in the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes, one-third.

98. Should special provision be made for the promotion to Covenanted posts of European members of the Uncovenanted Service?—The same provision will do for Europeans as well as Natives.

99. Should special provision be made for the promotion to such posts of Eurasian or other members of the Uncovenanted Service who, though not Natives of pure descent, fall within the meaning attached in the Statute of 1870 to the term "Natives of India?"—The same provision will do for Europeans as well as Natives.

100. Ought not the Uncovenanted Service, equally with the Covenanted Service, to be open to all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty who possess the qualifications that may be from time to time prescribed?—Yes, preference being given to Natives of the Province and members of respectable families.

101. If the Uncovenanted Service is closed to any natural-born subjects of Her Majesty, on what grounds, bearing in mind the terms of the Acts of Parliament and Her Majesty's Proclamation of 1st November 1858, is this to be justified?—We are not for closing the doors against any class of Her Majesty's subjects.

VI.—Pay, Leave, and Pension for Natives of India appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than through the channel of competition in England.

102. Is the rate* of pay at present granted to Statutory Civilians during probation and on final appointment respectively sufficient?—The rate for cadets of high families, selected by limited competition, should be Rs. 250 per month on first appointment as probationers; Rs. 300 after passing the departmental examination by the lower standard, and after having been confirmed they should receive the full rates allowable to a regular Covenanted Civil Servant.

* Two hundred rupees a month on first appointment as probationers. Two hundred and fifty rupees a month after passing the departmental examination by the lower standard. After passing the departmental examination by the higher standard (unless especially exempted) and after having been confirmed in their appointments, 64 per cent. of what would be the gross pay or salary of the office if it were held by a Covenanted Civil Servant appointed after competitive examination in England.

103. If not, on what grounds do you consider it insufficient, and what rates of pay should, in your opinion, be granted to Statutory Civilians (*a*) while on probation, and (*b*) on final confirmation in their appointments?—The grounds are simply that the salary of an appointment should be fixed only with regard to its requirements and not with reference to circumstances of the persons holding it. Men doing the same amount of work and discharging duties of a similar nature should receive equal rates of pay.

104. Would these rates of pay be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the Uncovenanted Service?—No. Our recommendations are that members of the Uncovenanted Service who may have shown distinguished merit in the exercise of first-class powers for at least five years should be promoted to such higher grades of Judicial and Administrative appointments as should give them higher pay than before such promotion.

105. Would they be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the professional classes?—Not generally.

106. If not, how would you treat, in regard to pay, persons selected from these two classes if appointed to the lowest grade of the Covenanted Service?—We do not propose that they should be appointed to the lowest grades. They should receive the full salary the appointment may carry.

107. How would you treat in regard to pay such persons if appointed to any of the higher Covenanted posts without being required to pass through the lower grades?—They should be allowed the full pay of the post to which they may be appointed.

108. Do you consider that a difference should be maintained between the rates of pay granted to Covenanted Civilians who enter through the competitive channel in England and to persons holding Covenanted posts who do not enter through that channel?—No.

109. If so, what would you consider the fair rate of reduction to be made in the case of persons holding Covenanted posts who do not enter through the competitive channel in England?—No difference should be made in the pay of Covenanted Civilians.

110. Would you approve of an arrangement by which the pay of appointments would be a fixed sum to be drawn by the holder, whether he is a Covenanted or a Statutory Civilian, with an additional staff allowance to be drawn by those only who enter the Service through the examination in England?—If any difference is to be made, this would perhaps be a better form; but in no case should such allowance exceed 10 per cent. of the pay.

111. Can you suggest any other way of providing different rates of pay?—We are not advocates of different rates.

112. If you consider there should be no difference of pay, how do you justify the application of the same rates of pay in the case of Natives who have satisfied the very high tests required by the examination in England and Natives who have not?—Those who have satisfied the very high tests will, in virtue of their superior qualifications, have an unrestricted field for promotion before them, to which the others will not have any chance of being advanced. This will be a reasonable difference in their rewards.

113. On the same assumption, what are your reasons for holding that the high rate of pay which is considered to be necessary to secure the services of persons of tested qualifications in a country far from their

Vol I, Sec. III, Sub-Sec. A.

Anjaman, Gujranwalla.

homes, and under various other unfavourable conditions, should be given to persons whose qualifications have not been so tested and who serve in their own native country?—In our opinion there are very few appointments for which it may be absolutely necessary to import men from a distant country, and only for such appointments can there be any justification for allowing special salaries. These are Governorships, Lieutenant-Governorships, and Chief Commissionerships. The pay of all other appointments should be so reduced as to bring them to the amounts that may be considered reasonable for the service required from a public officer. Such a scheme will further prove to be very economical. But on no account should different rates be allowed to persons holding the same posts and discharging the same duties.

114. Have you any remarks to make on the leave rules embodied in the Civil Leave Code which apply to Statutory Civilians?—No.

115. At what age do you consider that Natives appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than through the competitive channel in England should be entitled to retire on pension?—50 years.

116. After what length of service do you consider that such persons should be entitled to retire on pension?—25 years.

117. At what age should they be obliged to retire on pension?—No public servant should be compelled to retire on pension unless a Board composed of three medical officers (of whom one at least should be a Native) declare him to be unfit for further service.

118. After what length of service should they be obliged to retire on pension?—No public servant should be compelled to retire on pension unless a Board composed of three medical officers (of whom one at least should be a Native) declare him to be unfit for further service.

119. What amount of pension should in your opinion be granted to Natives so appointed if they serve the prescribed period for voluntary and compulsory retirement respectively?—The maximum pension should be Rs. 6,000 per annum.

120. If, before serving the prescribed period for pension, they are compelled to retire on medical certificate, what gratuity, if any, would you give them?—Pay of as many months as the number of years the officer may have served.

VII.—General.

121. How far is the existing system of education in the higher schools and colleges in India well adapted for training young men for the public Service? Can you suggest any improvements?—It is on the whole well adapted. Physical activity and study of experimental sciences should receive greater stress.

122. In 1854 Lord Macaulay's Committee were of opinion that the best, the most liberal, and the most finished education to be procured in England was a necessary qualification for admission to the Civil Service. Do Indian schools and colleges at present supply an education of so high a standard?—We are of opinion that the education which is imparted here is not inferior to what is required for the English competition; but if not, the institutions can be improved.

123. Do you consider that Indian schools at present develop the force of character and other qualities required for English administration?—Yes.

124. Do we now obtain for Government Service Natives of the classes who under Native rule carried on the civil administration of the country?—Yes, to a certain extent.

125. If not, where must we look for representatives of these classes, and how do you consider that their services could be best obtained?—In cadets of high families, who should be appointed to the Statutory Service.

126. How far would any system of appointment which involves a journey to and residence in England be regarded by the Native community as open to objection on the ground that it requires Hindu candidates to abandon their caste as a condition of entering the Civil Service?—It will not be liked by orthodox communities on the score of caste.

127. How far would such a system be regarded as open to objection on the ground that it restricts the field of selection to those candidates who are wealthy enough to undertake the cost of a journey to and residence in England?—For this reason the system will be disliked by the poor classes generally. We therefore propose that the examination be held in India.

128. Are the Natives who go to England from your Province for purposes of education limited to the wealthier classes?—Generally.

129. Are they limited to any particular section of the community, or to any particular creed?—No.

130. Does a voyage to or residence in England involve the loss of social position or other unfavourable consequences in the case of any section of the Native community?—Not in our Province.

131. Does it result in placing those Natives who undertake it more or less out of touch and sympathy with their fellow-countrymen on their return to India?—No.

132. Would the requirement of a temporary residence in England as a condition precedent to or following on appointment to the Government Service have the effect of excluding from such appointment any

considerable or important section of the Native community?—Yes.

133. If the Statutory system is discontinued, should special provision be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of Natives who, for religious or other sufficient reasons, are unable or unwilling to undertake a journey to and residence in England?—No.

134. If so, what provision should be made for this purpose?—None.

135. If the Statutory system is discontinued, do you consider that special provision should be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of capable members of the professional classes?—Yes.

136. If so, what provision should be made for this purpose?—By enacting that a reasonable number of appointments shall be reserved for men of distinguished merit in the profession.

137. Whatever system or systems may be adopted, ought power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts candidates of high family subject to such antecedent guarantees of fitness as may be considered sufficient in each case?—Yes, in the Statutory Service.

138. Ought similar power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts persons who have proved their merit and ability in Government Service, or in exercise of a profession, without preliminary examination or competition?—No, but such provision may be made in the Statutory Service.

139. If a thorough knowledge of English were made an essential qualification for appointment to Covenanted posts, would the field of selection in the case of persons already in the Uncovenanted Service, or engaged in the exercise of a profession, be unduly limited thereby?—No.

140. If such is likely to be the case, could the difficulty be obviated by requiring proficiency in the English language to be tested by periodical examinations after selection, but during a probationary period?—Such provision should not be made.

141. Should provision be made for the occasional appointment in very special and exceptional cases to Covenanted posts of persons of known ability and local influence whom, although they may never have held office and may not possess special professional qualifications, and although their age may exceed the limit laid down for untried candidates, it might nevertheless be considered desirable to appoint to the higher grades for political or other reasons?—Yes, as proposed in connection with the Statutory system.

142. Would it be desirable to rule that the proportion of persons being Mahomedans and Hindus respectively, who are from time to time or over a series of years appointed to the Covenanted ranks in any Province, should bear a certain relation to the number of the two classes composing the population of the Province concerned?—No, it will not be politic to make any such distinctions.

143. What classes, ranks, or professions of the Native community should be included among Mahomedans and Hindus, respectively, for the purpose of ascertaining the proportion of the population of each of those classes in the several Provinces?—Classes, ranks, and professions cannot be defined.

144. How far should appointments in each Province to Covenanted posts be restricted to Natives of the Province concerned?—They should primarily be offered to Natives of the Province, but failing to secure a sufficient number of qualified persons of any Province, men of other Provinces may be employed therein.

145. How would the following scheme be regarded by the Native community:—(1) the Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of European officers, admission being by competition in England, confined to European candidates only; (2) the appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, Natives only being eligible?—Not with satisfaction.

146. How would you regard such a scheme?—Not with satisfaction.

147. How would the Native community regard the following:—(1) the Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of appointments, to be filled by competition in England to which natives and Europeans alike would be admitted; (2) the appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, both Natives and Europeans being eligible?—Not with satisfaction.

148. How would you regard such a scheme?—Not with satisfaction.

149. If either of the above schemes were adopted, how would the Native community view a proposal to combine the higher appointments of the Uncovenanted Service with the appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service so as to form an enlarged Civil Service to be recruited in India?—It would not be much liked.

150. How would you view such a proposal?—With some satisfaction, provided the proposal is taken along with the scheme detailed in question 145.

151. How would the Native community regard the following scheme:—(1) a certain number of appointments in the Covenanted Civil Service to be reserved for Natives; (2) a certain proportion of that number to be filled by competition or by some other system in India; (3) the remainder to be filled by competition in England?—This will be regarded as more satisfactory than any of the foregoing schemes.

152. How would you regard such a scheme?—With satisfaction, provided the remaining number to be filled by competition in England is so fixed as not to exceed

Vol. I, Sec. III, Sub-Sec. A.

Anjaman, Gujranwalla.

one-tenth of the total number of Covenanted appointments reserved for Natives.

153. Assuming a system of nomination or of limited competition among nominated candidates, would Native opinion be in favour of giving a preference, as between candidates possessed of certain preliminary essential qualifications and having on general grounds fairly equal claims, in the following or any other order, to—(*a*) members of families of tried loyalty and distinguished service; (*b*) persons of good social status and influence in the country; and (*c*) persons of superior educational attainments, such as persons who have taken the degree of M.A.?—Yes.

154. What is your opinion as to giving such preference?—In case of nomination, degree-holders should be allowed preference; but in case of limited competition, such preference will not be necessary. The other two cases, viz. (*a*) and (*b*) of question 153, have our recommendation for the Statutory scheme.

155. How would the Native community regard a system of nomination on the ground of merit and ability shown in the service of Government, or in the exercise of a profession, alternating with a system of selection by means of competition, whether entirely open or amongst nominated candidates?—With satisfaction, if applied to the Statutory Service.

156. How would you regard such a system?—We would reserve Statutory appointments for persons of distinguished merit belonging to the Uncovenanted Service and to the Legal profession.

157. If the Statutory system were maintained, and if a probationary period were required from nominees or selected candidates before final appointment, would it be necessary to insist upon such probationary period in all cases, *e.g.* in the case of a person who has done good service in the Uncovenanted ranks?—No.

158. In the case of persons nominated from the professional classes, is it desirable that a probationary period should be prescribed?—Yes.

159. If so, is it necessary that the incidents of such period as to duration and pay should be the same as those attached thereto in the case of Statutory Civilians appointed on probation to the lowest grade of the Covenanted Service?—No, they should be allowed the full pay of the rank to which they may be appointed.

160. On what principles should the promotion of Natives appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than by the channel of the competition in England be regulated?—On the principle of ability and merit shown in the lower ranks, coupled with the rule of seniority.

161. Would you regulate such promotion only by considerations of fitness and approved personal merit—Yes, but seniority should also be taken into consideration.

162. Should subjects of Native States be eligible for appointment to Covenanted posts in British India?—Yes.

163. If so, should this be extended to all Native States in alliance with the Crown, or only to those in subordinate alliance?—Only to those in subordinate alliance.

164. What system, if any, is at present adopted in your Province for bringing into the public Service persons who, from their position or otherwise, cannot be expected to enter the service of Government in the lowest grades, and for giving the necessary apprenticeship?—Not known.

165. Does the system work well, and what improvements can you suggest?—Not known.

VIII.—Composition, Recruitment, &c., of the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services.

166. How is the present system of regulating appointments to the Subordinate* Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, regarded by influential sections of the Native community?—Not with satisfaction.

167. To what sections of Native society do the persons belong who accept under existing conditions appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services respectively?—All classes.

168. To what extent do Natives of good family and education in your Province offer themselves as candidates for Subordinate Judicial and Executive appointments?—To a great extent.

169. Do Natives who have been to England for purposes of study on their return to India willingly accept such appointments?—Not willingly.

170. How far are the professional classes represented in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, in your Province?—Not known.

171. Do members of the professional classes in your Province readily accept employment in those Services?—The experiment has not been tried.

172. Whatever system may at present be adopted for the purpose of regulating appointments to the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, are any class or classes of persons expressly or particularly excluded from such appointments?—Men of the Legal profession chiefly, the competitive

* NOTE.—For the purposes of these questions the terms "Subordinate Executive Service" and "Subordinate Judicial Service" may be held to include, respectively, all Subordinate Executive and Judicial offices down to and including the office of Tahsildár or Munsif, or other office corresponding to that of Tahsildár or Munsif, which are not reserved for or not ordinarily held by members of the Covenanted Civil Service.

and nomination system lately introduced having admitted a proportion of men of high English education—a class formerly scrupulously excluded.

173. If so, how is such exclusion justified?—It is not justifiable.

174. Is it the case that certain classes of Uncovenanted appointments are practically reserved for Natives of pure descent owing to the fact that conditions are imposed which have resulted in shutting out Eurasians and other Statutory Natives of mixed descent?—We don't think such is the case.

175. If so, how is such reservation justified?—There is no reservation. Ignorance of the vernaculars, we believe, stands in their way.

176. Are you in favour of laying down a rule that high educational capacity should be regarded as an essential qualification for appointment to the Subordinate Executive and to the Subordinate Judicial Services as defined for the purposes of these questions?—Yes.

177. If so, what test would you apply?—A special entrance examination in Languages, Mathematics, Logic, General Knowledge, and Law.

178. Do you think that the test should vary according to the character of the office to be filled?—No.

179. Generally, what system do you advocate for filling appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services as above defined?—One-half the total number of appointments should be filled up by open provincial competition, one-fourth should be reserved for promotions from lower offices, one-eighth to be reserved for members of high families, and one-eighth to be recruited from the legal profession.

180. What preliminary qualifications would you require on the part of candidates for those appointments in regard to age and in other respects?—Similar to those mentioned for the Covenanted and Statutory Services in the foregoing answers.

181. Is it possible to devise any one system which would be equally applicable to all Provinces, having regard to the varying educational standards reached in the several Provinces and the varying conditions prevalent therein?—We are not advocates of one system for the whole of India, although such is not impracticable.

182. Do you advocate the requirement of a probationary period, and if so, what should be the incidents of such period as to duration, pay, and in other respects?—Yes, one year, two-thirds pay during the probationary period and full pay after passing departmental examination.

183. Would you require a probationary period in all cases, or would you dispense with it in certain, and if so in what, cases?—No, we would require it in all cases.

184. If an open competitive examination were held in India for the Covenanted posts reserved for Natives, would persons who gained high marks in that examination and showed decided proficiency, but who failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, form suitable nominees for Subordinate Judicial and Executive appointments in the Uncovenanted Service?—No, unless they should pass the special entrance examination and stand high enough to be selected.

No. V.

Answers of the Anjaman-i-Islamia Society of Jullunder.

I.—Working of the existing Statutory System.

Vol. I. Sec. III, Sub-Sec. A.

Anjaman-i-Islamia, Jullunder.

What is the prevalent feeling in your province regarding the existing Statutory system? If the feeling is one of dissatisfaction, is the dissatisfaction general, or is it confined to certain sections of the community?—The general feeling in the Province regarding the Statutory system is one of dissatisfaction, and the dissatisfaction is general.

2. What are the grounds upon which any such feeling is based?—(1) Very few persons are admitted; (2) there is no provision in the Statute which makes it obligatory on the part of Indian authorities to admit Natives of India in the Civil Service. The Statute authorises them to admit Natives, but it leaves it to their discretion.

3. Is the feeling of dissatisfaction, if it exists, directed against the Statute itself (33 Vic., Chapter 3, Section 6), or is it directed against the rules framed thereunder?—The persons admitted are not considered to be on an equal footing with the Civilians, and are not allowed to hold high posts in the Service.

4. If the Statute itself is objected to, is it because its provisions admit persons to specific appointments only, and not to membership in an organised "Service?"—Yes, the objections are against the Statute as well as against the rules.

6. If a desire is felt for enrolment in a general Service, what are the reasons for this desire?—The ability to perform duties in an efficient manner and their loyalty to Government, and the fact of their ancestors occupying high administrative and executive posts in the country, and the want of technical education, with many other reasons, produce a desire in the minds of the Natives for enrolment in a general Service.

7. What amendments do you advocate in section 6 of the Statute?—As the section now stands, the power given to the authorities is discretionary: it should make it compulsory to admit Natives to the Service by adding the words "and they must appoint" after "from appointing any Native of India to such offices, place, or employment," and before the word "although."

8. Do you consider that section 6 of the Statute supplies such a definition of the words "Natives of India" as describes with sufficient clearness, fulness, and accuracy the various classes of persons for whose appointment to Covenanted posts it is desirable to provide?—Yes.

9. If not, can you suggest any more complete or more satisfactory definition?—The present definition is sufficient, and no other is required.

10. If the objections are directed against the rules framed under the Statute, do they relate to the mode or modes of selection actually adopted?—Yes.

11. Do they relate to the general conditions in regard to pay, promotion, and retiring annuity under which Statutory Civilians hold their offices?—Yes.

12. Assuming the Statutory system to be retained, what amendments would you suggest in the rules with a view to remove any reasonable objections which may be felt to them?—One-fifth part of the number of posts is very small: in future one-third part of the number of posts should be allowed for Statutory Civilians; (2) two-thirds of the number allowed for the Statutory Civil Service should be reserved for members of the Uncovenanted Service and the Bar, and one-third for young men; (3) the Mahomedans, who are well-fitted for executive capacity, should get a larger share than the Hindus; (4) the young men only who enter should go through a probationary period, and should pass departmental examinations within the probationary period; (5) a visit to England should be compulsory for young men who are not members of the Bar or in the Uncovenanted Service; (6) the pay should be raised.

13. Are Statutory Civilians regarded by the general public as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the Covenanted Service through the competitive channel?—Yes.

14. If such a feeling exists, on what grounds is it based?—Because they are deprived of the privileges enjoyed by the Civilians.

15. Do the general public view with any difference the status of Statutory Civilians and that of Uncovenanted officers?—Yes.

16. If so, on what grounds?—On the grounds that the Statutory Civilians secure more privileges and higher posts than the Uncovenanted.

II.—Mode of Selection of Statutory Civilians.

17. On the assumption* that the Statutory system is retained, how would appointment to the Statutory Service by nomination be regarded by influential sections of the Native community in your Province?—With satisfaction.

18. How would a system of nomination to be followed by a period of probation be

* The questions which follow, down to No. 39 inclusive, are put subject to the same assumption.

regarded by the same classes?—With satisfaction in the case of nominees not being members of the Uncovenanted Service or the Bar.

19. Would a system of nomination, with or without probation, be likely to secure well-qualified persons?—In case of members of the Bar and of persons in the Uncovenanted Service without, and in other cases with, probation.

20. Has experience actually shown such a system to secure well-qualified officers?—Yes.

21. Do you consider that nominations should be confined to persons of proved merit and ability?—Yes.

22. If so, how do you consider that merit and ability sholud be held to have been proved for this purpose?—In case of members of the Uncovenanted Service and the Bar, the report of superior authorities, and in other cases the probationary periods, will prove their merit and ability.

23. How would a system of limited competition amongst persons nominated for this purpose by the Local Governments or by the Universities, or by those authorities concurrently or alternately, be regarded?—With dissatisfaction.

24. In preference to either of the above systems (nomination and limited competition), would a system of open competition pure and simple for the Statutory Service commend itself to the Native community?—No.

25. If competition (whether limited or open) is preferred, should there be one competition for all India, or separate competitions in each Province?—We do not advocate competition, but if it is introduced it should be separate for each Province.

26. If there were only one general competition, how would you ensure a due proportion of appointments falling to the population of the several Provinces?—It is not possible.

27. Having regard to the varying educational standards reached in the several Provinces, and the varying conditions prevalent therein, is it possible to have any one system of selection for all India which would not result in the inhabitants of some Provinces being more or less excluded from a due share of appointments?—No.

28. Under any of the three systems of nomination, limited competition, and open competition, would you prescribe any tests of preliminary qualifications on the part of nominees or candidates in regard to (1) age, (2) intellectual capacity, (3) moral, social, and physical fitness?—Yes, but preliminary qualifications as to age in case of members of the Bar or the Uncovenanted Service is not required.

29. If so, what should be the tests under each of the heads specified?—The age limits should be not less than 20 nor over than 26.

30. Do you consider that (after selection, whether by nomination or competition,) there should be a period of probation?—In the case of members of the Bar and of the Uncovenanted Service, the report of the superiors for qualifications 2 and 3, and for physical fitness, a medical certificate. In other cases, for qualification 1, fair knowledge of English; 2, report of local officers; 3, medical certificate.

Probation would not be required in the case of members of the Bar or of the Uncovenanted Service, but only in the case of first appointments.

31. If so, what should be the duration of the probationary period?—Two years.

32. Should the period of probation be passed in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service or of the Covenanted Service, or in what other manner?—In the Uncovenanted Service.

33. Do you consider that after selection and before entering on probation (or on duty) the persons selected should undergo special training?—Before entering on probation and before entering on duty.

34. If so, should the special training be carried out in India or in England?—In England.

35. If in India, would it be possible, and if possible, advisable, to establish an Indian Civil Service College on the basis of the Haileybury College which formerly existed in England?—May be possible, but is not advisable.

36. If you do not consider special training in England essential, would you encourage nominees or selected candidates to visit England with a view to add to their qualifications for the Service?—We consider it essential for young men.

37. If so, what form should such encouragement take?—Travelling expenses and scholarships.

38. Should it be offered before, or during, or after, the probationary period, if any, through which nominees or selected candidates may be required to pass?—Before.

39. Should it be offered before or after the nominees or selected candidates enter on their duties?—Before.

40. Are you in favour of the establishment of scholarships tenable by Natives in England for the purpose of enabling them to qualify for the Civil or Statutory Service?—Yes.

41. If so, how would you connect such a scheme with the selection of Natives for employment in the higher administrative posts in India?—The persons admitted to the Service can be appointed if their merits and ability are proved.

42. Do you think that any distinction should be made between the emoluments of nominees or selected candidates who have been trained in England or have gone to England to add to their qualifications and those who have not?—Yes.

43. If the opportunity of residence in England at a University for two years with a sufficient allowance were offered to

Vol. I, Sec. III, Sub-Sec. A.

Anjaman-i-Islamia, Jullunder.

nominees or selected candidates, is it likely that it would be taken advantage of to any great extent?—Yes.

44. If the system of examination in England were revised with the result that Natives availed themselves of it in considerable numbers, would it still be necessary to retain the Statutory system?—Yes.

45. If so, to what appointments or classes of appointments would you restrict the latter system, and what conditions over and above those already existing would you impose?—Yes (*sic.*)

III.—Competition in England for the Indian Civil Service.

46. Is the competition of Natives in the examination in England favourably looked upon by large and important classes in India?—Yes, under the present circumstances.

47. Should additional facilities be given to Natives for proceeding to England and entering the Indian Civil Service by the channel of the English competition?—Yes.

48. If so, what form or forms should such facilities take?—Scholarships and travelling expenses should be allowed; the age should be raised; vernacular languages should be included, and the same marks should be allowed to Arabic and Sanskrit as are given to Latin and Greek.

49. What conditions, if any, should be attached to them?—If a candidate returns without sufficient cause without appearing in the examination, he should refund the money received.

50. What is your opinion as to giving Statutory appointments to Natives who, though they may have failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, have shown merit in the English competition?—They should be provided for.

51. Assuming it to be advisable to appoint to the Statutory Service in India Natives who have failed in the English competition, should such persons receive the same training as successful candidates in England, and be subject to the same final examination?—Yes.

52. Should they on appointment to the Statutory Service in India be subject to the same incidents as apply to other persons appointed under the Statutory rules?—Yes.

53. Can you say what number of Natives belonging to your Province have presented themselves annually at the competitive examination in England, and what degree of success they attained?—To our knowledge only one, but without success.

54. What class or classes of Natives in your Province readily go to England?—No class especially.

55. Are objections entertained to going to England; and if so, what are they, and by what classes in particular are they felt?—The old-fashioned Hindus of the uneducated class entertain objections relating to the loss of their religion and caste.

56. Should the examination for Natives in England be distinct in standards and conditions from that for English candidates, or should there be one and the same examination for all?—One examination.

57. If the standards and conditions were different, how would it be possible to compare the results in the two examinations so as to bring out one list in order of merit?—We do not advocate different standards.

58. Would it, under such circumstances, be desirable to allot a fixed proportion of appointments to each of the two examinations?—We do not advocate two examinations.

59. If a fixed proportion of appointments were allotted for a Native examination in England, do you consider that, in view of the objections against a voyage to England and life there, the cost thereof, and the chances of failure, a sufficient number of suitable candidates from your Province would be available to make the competition a real competition?—We do not advocate such a scheme.

60. If the examinations were distinct, what should be the limits of age for the Native examination?—We do not advocate distinct examinations.

61. What should be the conditions, nature, and subjects of the separate Native examination?—We do not advocate a separate examination.

62. Assuming only one examination in England for both English and Native candidates, do you consider that the subjects and standards of examination, and the conditions as to age and other matters, in any respect place Native candidates at a disadvantage as compared with English candidates?—Yes.

63. If so, in what respects are Native candidates placed at a disadvantage, and what alterations would you recommend with a view to remove that disadvantage?—The limit of age should be raised to 24; (2) vernacular languages should be included; (3) Arabic, Sanskrit, and the vernacular should be allotted the same marks as Greek and Latin.

64. If there should be only one examination for all candidates, should the limits of age for Natives be higher than those at present fixed for European candidates; and if so, what should the limits for Native candidates be?—The age should be raised to 24.

65. If higher limits of age were fixed for Native than for European candidates, might not the latter complain that they were placed at a disadvantage?—Their complaints would not be reasonable.

66. What is the average age at which Natives at the Indian Universities pass the examinations for F.A., B.A., and M.A. respectively?—F.A., 21; B.A., 23; M.A., 24.

67. From what classes of Native society are the persons who graduate at the Indian Universities usually drawn in your Province?—No special classes.

IV.—Competition in India for the Indian Civil Service.

68. Do you advocate a competition in India for the Civil Service simultaneously with the competition in England, the same question-papers being used at both examinations?—No.

69. How would this method of selection be regarded by the Native community generally?—As not satisfactory.

70. If you advocate such a system, would you restrict the competition in India to Natives, and that in England to English candidates, or would you admit both classes freely to either examination?—We do not advocate it.

71. If Native candidates were admitted to the competition in England while English candidates were excluded from the competition in India, on what grounds could this distinction be justified?—We do not advocate a competitive examination in India: it is therefore unnecessary for us to answer this question.

72. Do you consider that the educational institutions available in India are at present capable of giving the very high class education which it was the object of the competitive system as introduced in 1855 to secure?—No.

73. Would an open competition in India be likely to give decided advantages to any particular class or classes of the Native community over others?—Yes.

74. Would it be likely to lead to the undue preponderance of any one class or caste in the public Service?—Yes.

75. Do you think there are any objections on political or administrative grounds to open competition in India?—There are.

76. Would the introduction of an open competitive examination in India have the effect of deterring cadets of leading families from aspiring to enter the ranks of the Civil Service?—Yes.

77. Under such a system how would it be possible to provide against the Natives of a Province in which education is comparatively backward being excluded from appointments in their own Province?—It would not be possible.

78. Would a system of Provincial examinations be preferable to one examination for the whole of India?—If the system of examination in India be introduced, Provincial examinations would be preferred.

79. Under a system of open competition in India, would the successful candidates be regarded as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the Service through the channel of the open competition in England?—Yes.

80. Supposing that the Covenanted appointments were allotted in fixed proportions, a certain number to be obtained by competition in England and a certain number by competition in India, the examinations in each case being open on fairly equal conditions to Native and English candidates alike, and the Statutory system being abolished, how would such a system be viewed?—Not favourably.

81. If an open competition were established in India, what should be the preliminary qualifications required on the part of candidates in regard to age?—If it were established, the preliminary qualification as to age should be not above 25.

82. In regard to minimum educational attainments?—Entrance examination.

83. In regard to moral, social, and physical fitness?—Good moral character, respectability, good health.

84. In other respects (if any)?—Respectable and influential family.

85. Should the subjects and conditions of the examination be the same as those prescribed for the competitive examination in England, or should they be different?—The same with some little difference.

86. If different, what should they be?—(1) The limit of age should be raised; (2) the vernacular language should be included in the subjects, and as many marks should be allotted to Sanskrit and Arabic as to Latin and Greek.

87. Circumstances being different in the case of persons who enter through the examination in England and of persons who enter through the examination in India, is there any reason why the rules in regard to pay, leave, pension, &c., should not also be different?—There should be a difference.

88. Should successful candidates go through a period of special study in India like the English candidates who spend two years in special preparation?—They should go to England for special training.

89. Would it be preferable (*a*) to require them to go to England, or (*b*) to give them the option of going to England, suitable allowances being given to enable them to prosecute their studies there?—They should be required to go to England, and suitable allowances should be given.

90. Should successful candidates at the Indian competition be required to pass through a probationary period before final appointment?—They should pass through a probationary period.

91. If so, what should be the duration of the probationary period?—Two years.

92. How should it be passed—in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service or otherwise?—In the Uncovenanted Service.

V.—Promotion from the Uncovenanted Service.

Vol. I, Sec. III, Sub-Sec. A.

Anjaman-i-Islamia, Jullunder.

93. What special provision, if any, do you think should be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of deserving members of the Uncovenanted Service?—Persons who proved their merit and ability in the Service, and who have a good moral character, might be admitted on the recommendation of their superior authorities, without any restriction as to age, special training, or probation.

94. If such appointments are made, should they be restricted to the holders of any particular classes of appointments in the Uncovenanted Service; and if so, what classes?—Extra Assistant Commissioners.

95. Should persons so appointed be appointed provisionally and be required to pass through a period of probation before final confirmation?—No period of probation is needed.

96. Should provision be made for the appointment of qualified members of the Uncovenanted Service to the higher Covenanted offices without requiring them to pass through the lower grades?—Yes.

97. If certain appointments in the Covenanted grades are set apart for the Statutory Service, should a fixed proportion of those appointments be expressly reserved for persons of proved merit and ability in the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes.

98. Should special provision be made for the promotion to Covenanted posts of European members of the Uncovenanted Service?—No special provision is required: general provisions on the point would be sufficient.

99. Should special provision be made for the promotion to such posts of Eurasian or other members of the Uncovenanted Service who, though not Natives of pure descent, fall within the meaning attached in the Statute of 1870 to the term "Natives of India?"—No special provision is required.

100. Ought not the Uncovenanted Service, equally with the Covenanted Service, to be open to all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty who possess the qualifications that may be from time to time prescribed?—Yes, but Natives of India should be preferred.

101. If the Uncovenanted Service is closed to any natural-born subjects of Her Majesty, on what grounds, bearing in mind the terms of the Acts of Parliament and Her Majesty's Proclamation of 1st November 1858, is this to be justified?—We do not advocate the exclusion of any natural-born subjects of Her Majesty.

VII.—General.

121. How far is the existing system of education in the higher schools and colleges in India well adapted for training young men to the public Service?—To a very small extent.

122. In 1854 Lord Macaulay's Committee were of opinion that the best, the most liberal, and the most finished education to be procured in England was a necessary qualification for admission to the Civil Service. Do Indian schools and colleges at present supply an education of so high a standard?—No.

123. Do you consider that Indian schools at present develop the force of character and other qualities required for English administration?—No.

124. Do we now obtain for Government Service Natives of the classes who under Native rule carried on the civil administration of the country?—Very few.

126. How far would any system of appointment which involves a journey to and residence in England be regarded by the Native community as open to objection on the ground that it requires Hindu candidates to abandon their caste as a condition of entering the Civil Service?—To a very small degree.

127. How far would such a system be regarded as open to objection on the ground that it restricts the field of selection to those candidates who are wealthy enough to undertake the cost of a journey to and residence in England?—To some extent, but such objections can be removed by the aid of the Government.

128. Are the Natives who go to England from your Province for purposes of education limited to the wealthier classes?—They are well-to-do men.

129. Are they limited to any particular section of the community, or to any particular creed?—No.

130. Does a voyage to or residence in England involve the loss of social position or other unfavourable consequences in the case of any section of the Native community?—Now-a-days it does not.

131. Does it result in placing those Natives who undertake it more or less out of touch and sympathy with their fellow-countrymen on their return to India?—Not now-a-days.

132. Would the requirement of a temporary residence in England as a condition precedent to or following on appointment to the Government Service have the effect of excluding from such appointment any considerable or important section of the Native community?—No.

133. If the Statutory system is discontinued, should special provision be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of Natives who, for religious or other sufficient reasons, are unable or unwilling to undertake a journey to and residence in England?—No.

134. If so, what provision should be made for this purpose?—None.

135. If the Statutory system is discontinued, do you consider that special provision should be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of capable members of the professional classes?—Yes.

136. If so, what provision should be made for this purpose?—Capable persons of no less than five years' standing may be selected by the local Government on the recommendation of the local authorities.

137. Whatever system or systems may be adopted, ought power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts candidates of high family subject to such antecedent guarantees of fitness as may be considered sufficient in each case?—Yes, but such persons should be appointed rarely.

138. Ought similar power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts persons who have proved their merit and ability in Government Service, or in the exercise of a profession, without preliminary examination or competition?—Yes.

139. If a thorough knowledge of English were made an essential qualification for appointment to Covenanted posts, would the field of selection in the case of persons already in the Uncovenanted Service, or engaged in the exercise of a profession, be unduly limited thereby?—Yes.

140. If such is likely to be the case, could the difficulty be obviated by requiring proficiency in the English language to be tested by periodical examinations after selection, but during a probationary period?—No.

141. Should provision be made for the occasional appointment in very special and exceptional cases to Covenanted posts of persons of known ability and local influence whom, although they may never have held office and may not possess special professional qualifications, and although their age may exceed the limit laid down for untried candidates, it might nevertheless be considered desirable to appoint to the higher grades for political or other reasons?—Yes.

142. Would it be desirable to rule that the proportion of persons being Mahomedans and Hindus respectively, who are from time to time or over a series of years appointed to the Covenanted ranks in any Province, should bear a certain relation to the number of the two classes composing the population of the Province concerned?—No.

143. What classes, ranks, or professions of the Native community should be included among Mahomedans and Hindus respectively for the purpose of ascertaining the proportion of the population of each of those classes in the several Provinces?—Persons who come within the general acceptation of the term Hindu or Mahomedan.

144. How far should appointments in each Province to Covenanted posts be restricted to Natives of the Province concerned?—To the extent of one-half.

145. How would the following scheme be regarded by the Native community?—

(1) The Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of European officers, admission being by competition in England, confined to European candidates only.

(2) The appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, Natives only being eligible.

—The Native community would not approve of the scheme.

146. How would you regard such a scheme?—We also do not approve of it.

147. How would the Native community regard the following?—

(1) The Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of appointments, to be filled by competition in England to which Natives and Europeans alike would be admitted.

(2) The appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, both Natives and Europeans being eligible.

The Native community would disapprove of it.

148. How would you regard such a scheme?—We also do not approve of it.

149. If either of the above schemes were adopted, how would the Native community view a proposal to combine the higher appointments of the Uncovenanted Service with the appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service so as to form an enlarged Civil Service to be recruited in India?—The Native community would view it with dissatisfaction.

150. How would you view such a proposal?—We do not accept it.

151. How would the Native community regard the following scheme?—

(1) a certain number of appointments in the Covenanted Civil Service to be reserved for Natives;

(2) a certain proportion of that number to be filled by competition or by some other system in India;

(3) the remainder to be filled by competition in England.

—The Native community will not regard such a system favourably.

152. How would you regard such a scheme?—We are against such a system.

153. Assuming a system of nomination or of limited competition among nominated candidates, would Native opinion be in favour of giving a preference, as between candidates possessed of certain preliminary essential qualifications and having on general grounds fairly equal claims, in the following or any other order to—

(*a*) members of families of tried loyalty and distinguished service;

(*b*) persons of good social status and influence in the country; and

(*c*) persons of superior educational attainments, such as persons who have taken the degree of M.A. ?—Yes.

154. What is your opinion as to giving such preference ?—We are in favour of it.

155. How would the Native community regard a system of nomination on the ground of merit and ability shown in the service of Government or in the exercise of a profession, alternating with a system of selection by means of competition, whether entirely open or amongst nominated candidates ?—The Native community would regard the system of nomination with satisfaction, but that of competition with dissatisfaction.

156. How would you regard such a system ?—We would accept the scheme of nomination with satisfaction, but that of competition we regard with dissatisfaction.

157. If the Statutory system were maintained, and if a probationary period were required from nominees or selected candidates before final appointment, would it be necessary to insist upon such probationary period in all cases, *e.g.* in the case of a person who has done good service in the Uncovenanted ranks ?—The probationary period should not be insisted on in the case of one who has done good service in the Uncovenanted ranks.

158. In the case of persons nominated from the professional classes, is it desirable that a probationary period should be prescribed ?—No.

159. If so, is it necessary that the incidents of such period as to duration and pay should be the same as those attached thereto in the case of Statutory Civilians appointed on probation to the lowest grade of the Covenanted Service ?—No.

160. On what principles should the promotion of Natives appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than by the channel of the competition in England be regulated ?—By the rule of seniority.

161. Would you regulate such promotion only by considerations of fitness and approved personal merit ?—No, by the rule of seniority.

162. Should subjects of Native States be eligible for appointment to Covenanted posts in British India ?—No.

163. If so, should this be extended to all Native States in alliance with the Crown, or only to those in subordinate alliance ?—Neither.

164. What system, if any, is at present adopted in your Province for bringing into the public Service persons who, from their position or otherwise, cannot be expected to enter the service of Government in the lowest grades, and for giving them the necessary apprenticeship ?—We do not know of any such system.

165. Does the system work well, and what improvements can you suggest ?—We do not know of it.

VIII.—Composition, Recruitment, &c., of the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services.

166. How is the present system of regulating appointments to the Subordinate* Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, regarded by influential sections of the Native community ?—With dissatisfaction.

167. To what sections of Native society do the persons belong who accept, under existing conditions, appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services respectively ?—No special section.

168. To what extent do Natives of good family and education in your Province offer themselves as candidates for Subordinate Judicial and Executive appointments ?—Almost all.

169. Do Natives who have been to England for purposes of study on their return to India willingly accept such appointments ?—Yes.

170. How far are the professional classes represented in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, in your Province ?—Very rarely.

171. Do members of the professional classes in your Province readily accept employment in those Services ?—No such post shave been offered to them, but they would accept suitable posts.

172. Whatever system or systems may at present be adopted for the purpose of regulating appointments to the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judical Services, respectively, are any class or classes of persons expressly or practically excluded from such appointments ?—As far as the Anjaman is aware, no class or classes are expressly or practically excluded.

176. Are you in favour of laying down a rule that high educational capacity should be regarded as an essential qualification for appointment to the Subordinate Executive and to the Subordinate Judicial Services as defined for the purposes of these questions ?—No.

179. Generally, what system do you advocate for filling appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services as above defined ?—The system of nomination.

* NOTE.—For the purposes of these questions the terms "Subordinate Executive Service" and "Subordinate Judicial Service" may be held to include, respectively, all Subordinate Executive and Judicial offices down to and including the office of Tahsildár or Munsif or other office corresponding to that of Tahsildár or Munsif which are not reserved for or not ordinarily held by members of the Covenanted Civil Service.

180. What preliminary qualifications would you require on the part of candidates for those appointments in regard to age and in other respects?—The age should not be under 21 or above 27.

181. Is it possible to devise any one system which would be equally applicable to all Provinces, having regard to the varying educational standards reached in the several Provinces and the varying conditions prevalent therein?—Yes, the system of nomination.

182. Do you advocate the requirement of a probationary period, and if so, what should be the incidents of such period as to duration, pay, and in other respects?—The probationary period is required, and it should be two years; the pay during the probationary period should be 80 per cent. of the pay of the post.

183. Would you require a probationary period in all cases, or would you dispense with it in certain, and if so in what, cases?—The probationary period is not required in the case of the nominee who is a Government servant or a member of the Bar.

184. I an open competitive examination were held in India for the Covenanted posts reserved for Natives, would persons who gained high marks in that examination, and showed decided proficiency, but who failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, form suitable nominees for Subordinate Judicial and Executive appointments in the Uncovenanted Service?—The Anjaman is against a competitive system. If it be maintained, a person who has shown merit should be provided for.

No. VI.

Answers by the Anjaman-i-Islamia Society of Amritsar.

I.—Working of the existing Statutory System.

Vol. I, Sec. III, Sub-Sec. A.

Anjaman-i-Islamia, Amritsar.

What is the prevalent feeling in your Province regarding the existing Statutory system? If the feeling is one of dissatisfaction, is the dissatisfaction general, or is it confined to certain sections of the community?—The upper and lower classes of Native society appreciate the spirit in which the system is conceived, but the rising middle classes are dissatisfied with it.

2. What are the grounds upon which any such feeling is based?—A fair-stage-and-no-favour policy is naturally commendable to the middle classes: they strongly dislike those who enter the Service by the back door of favouritism and not by the open door of competition. With a desire inherent in human nature they endeavour to ameliorate their condition. Their ambitious minds supply them with a motive power to push up.

3. Is the feeling of dissatisfaction, if it exists, directed against the Statute itself (33 Vic., Chapter 3, Section 6), or is it directed against the rules framed thereunder?—The feeling of dissatisfaction is directed against both the Statute and the rules framed thereunder.

4. If the Statute itself is objected to, is it because its provisions admit persons to specific appointments only and not to membership in an organised "Service"?—The Statute is objected to on the ground that the persons appointed by virtue thereof cannot claim as of right all the appointments within the reach of the Civilians.

5. Are the objections based on other, and if so what, grounds?—According to the terms of Section 6 of the Statute, the discretion of appointing Statutory Civilians resides in the Government of India. This method, as we have already remarked, does not find favour with the middle classes. Moreover, the limit of one-fifth prescribed by the rules is too low. We understand that Section 6 of the Statute is primarily intended for the children of the soil, and it contemplates opening the hitherto closed door of the Covenanted Civil Service to Natives of India as defined in the criminal law of the land. In our opinion those who are anxious to derive benefits from the Statute must submit to all the disadvantages and disabilities to which the Indians are liable. We therefore desire the amendment of the definition of the words "Natives of India."

6. If a desire is felt for enrolment in a general Service, what are the reasons for this desire?—Education has taken gigantic strides, and has permeated the various strata of Native society. The Indians, in the words of Robert Cust, are notoriously fitted for high posts. Their increased knowledge has naturally inspired them with a legitimate desire to secure lucrative appointments. The members of ancient families, whose ancestors were the administrators and conspicuous statesmen of the country, are desirous to follow the footsteps of their forefathers and to satisfy their aspirations. Besides these reasons, there are hundreds of others, such as want of technical education, &c., that actually oblige educated men to seek Government employments.

7. What amendments do you advocate in section 6 of the Statute?—For reasons set forth in our answer No. 5, we humbly suggest the following amendment:—"Natives of India" shall include any person born and domiciled within the dominions of Her Majesty in India of parents who are amenable to the same criminal law and procedure in force in India as the Native Indian subjects and who are habitually resident in India.

8. Do you consider that section 6 of the Statute supplies such a definition of the words "Natives of India" as describes with sufficient clearness, fulness, and accuracy the various classes of persons for whose appointment to Covenanted posts it is desirable to provide?—Yes, but the exigencies of the time require the curtailment of the definition.

9. If not, can you suggest any more complete or more satisfactory definition?—The most satisfactory definition is suggested in our answer No. 7.

10. If the objections are directed against the rules framed under the Statute, do they relate to the mode or modes of selection actually adopted?—In our answer No. 1 we have remarked that, except the middle classes, the upper and lower sections of the Native community do not object to the mode or modes of selection actually adopted.

11. Do they relate to the general conditions in regard to pay, promotion, and retiring annuity under which Statutory Civilians hold their offices?—Yes, they relate to all of these, more especially with regard to executive appointments.

12. Assuming the Statutory system to be retained, what amendments would you suggest in the rules with a view to remove any reasonable objections which may be felt to them?—The rate of pay should be raised and the rule of one-fifth should be amended The rules should be so framed as to ensure all the high judicial and executive appointments being open to the Statutory Civil Service.

13. Are Statutory Civilians regarded by the general public as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the

Covenanted Service through the competitive channel?—Yes, for obvious reasons.

14. If such a feeling exists, on what grounds is it based?—By the general public they are regarded as occupying an inferior position on the ground of their being deprived of all the privileges and emoluments appertaining to the Covenanted Civil Service and of their getting small pay. The middle classes, besides the above reasons, consider a nominee who happens to be destitute of a substantial education as inferior to those who enter the Covenanted Service through the competitive channel.

15. Do the general public view with any difference the status of Statutory Civilians and that of Uncovenanted officers?—Yes.

16. If so, on what grounds?—They get larger pay. The addition to their names also distinguishes them from the Uncovenanted officers.

II.—Mode of Selection of Statutory Civilians.

17. On the assumption* that the Statutory system is retained, how would appointment to the Statutory Service by nomination be regarded by influential sections of the Native community in your Province?—*Vide* answer No. 1.

18. How would a system of nomination to be followed by a period of probation be regarded by the same classes?—Favourably, but the period of probation should be extended from two to three years.

19. Would a system of nomination, with or without probation, be likely to secure well-qualified persons?—Yes, with probation.

20. Has experience actually shown such a system to secure well-qualified officers?—Yes, but the selection should in future be made more judiciously.

21. Do you consider that nominations should be confined to persons of proved merit and ability?—Yes.

22. If so, how do you consider that merit and ability should be held to have been proved for this purpose?—Before nomination no examination need be held. The nominee's merit and ability will be proved if he, within the probationary period, acquits himself successfully in the prescribed examination.

23. How would a system of limited competition amongst persons nominated for this purpose by the local Governments or by the Universities, or by those authorities concurrently or alternately, be regarded?—Favourably by the middle classes, but with dissatisfaction by the upper classes.

24. In preference to either of the above systems (nomination and limited competition), would a system of open competition, pure and simple, for the Statutory Service, commend itself to the Native community?—It would commend itself to the middle classes, but not to the upper classes.

25. If competition (whether limited or open) is preferred, should there be one competition for all India or separate competitions in each Province?—Separate competitions in each Province.

26. If there were only one general competition, how would you ensure a due proportion of appointments falling to the population of the several Provinces?—If there were one general competition we would propose preparing two separate lists of the successful candidates who secure a certain number of marks, for instance one-third of the maximum number. The general list will contain the names of the successful candidates in order of merit, and the Provincial list the names of those who pass from their respective Provinces. The appointments of each Province should in the first instance be secured to its own successful candidates in order of merit, and then, in case of need, to the successful candidates of other Provinces whose names appear in the general list in order of merit.

27. Having regard to the varying educational standards reached in the several Provinces, and the varying conditions prevalent therein, is it possible to have any one system of selection for all India which would not result in the inhabitants of some Provinces being more or less excluded from a due share of appointments?—Impossible, unless the scheme proposed in No. 26 is adopted.

28. Under any of the three systems of nomination, limited competition, and open competition, would you prescribe any tests of preliminary qualifications on the part of nominees or candidates in regard to (1) age, (2) intellectual capacity, (3) moral, social, and physical fitness?—Yes.

29. If so, what should be the tests under each of the heads specified?—A fair knowledge of English should be required. The nominee to be not less than 20 years of age and not more than 24. He should be of good character and of respectable family. The test of physical fitness to be evidenced by a medical certificate, while the test of respectability should be left to the discretion of the local Government.

30. Do you consider that (after selection, whether by nomination or competition,) there should be a period of probation?—Yes, there should be a period of probation in the case of nomination, but not when the selection is made after competition.

31. If so, what should be the duration of the probationary period?—The period of probation should be three years.

32. Should the period of probation be passed in the ranks of the Uncovenanted

* The questions which follow, down to No. 39 inclusive, are put subject to the same assumption.

Service or of the Covenanted Service, or in what other manner?—In the ranks of the Covenanted Service.

33. Do you consider that after selection and before entering on probation (or on duty) the person selected should undergo special training?—No special training is required before entering on probation.

34. If so, should the special training be carried out in India or in England?—The person selected should, after being confirmed in his post, proceed to England to add to his qualifications for the Service.

35. If in India, would it be possible, and if possible, advisable, to establish an Indian Civil Service College on the basis of the Haileybury College which formerly existed in England?—*Vide* No. 34.

36. If you do not consider special training in England essential, would you encourage nominees or selected candidates to visit England with a view to add to their qualifications for the Service?—The nominees or selected candidates should, after they have been trained in India and confirmed in their appointments, proceed to England with a view to add to their qualifications for the Service.

37. If so, what form should such encouragement take?—The nominees should be given a first-class passage and £20 a month, and besides these encouragements they should be required to work in the India Office.

38. Should it be offered before, or during, or after the probationary period, if any, through which nominees or selected candidates may be required to pass?—In the case of nominees, after they have completed their probationary period; and in the case of selected candidates by competitive examination in India, they should at once proceed to England.

39. Should it be offered before or after the nominees or selected candidates enter on their duties?—The same answer is applicable to this.

40. Are you in favour of the establishment of scholarships tenable by Natives in England for the purpose of enabling them to qualify for the Civil or Statutory Service?—No examination for the Statutory Civil Service should be held in England, but scholarships tenable by Natives in England to enable them to qualify themselves for the Civil Service should be established.

42. Do you think that any distinction should be made between the emoluments of nominees or selected candidates who have been trained in England or have gone to England to add to their qualifications and those who have not?—Yes.

43. If the opportunity of residence in England at a University for two years, with a sufficient allowance, were offered to nominees or selected candidates, is it likely that it would be taken advantage of to any great extent?—Yes, if the nominees or selected candidates are sent to England after they have been confirmed.

44. If the system of examination in England were revised with the result that Natives availed themselves of it in considerable numbers, would it still be necessary to retain the Statutory system?—Yes.

45. If so, to what appointments or classes of appointments would you restrict the latter system, and what conditions over and above those already existing would you impose?—If the Statutory system is to be retained as we have proposed there should be no restriction whatever, but it should be left to the discretion of local Governments.

III.—Competition in England for the Indian Civil Service.

46. Is competition of Natives in the examination in England favourably looked upon by large and important classes in India?—Not at all under the present system.

47. Should additional facilities be given to Natives for proceeding to England and entering the Indian Civil Service by the channel of the English competition?—Yes, if the examination is not held in India.

48. If so, what form or forms should such facilities take?—(*a*) The present limit of age should be raised to 24; (*b*) the vernacular languages of India should be included in the subjects of examination, and (*c*) the same number of marks should be allotted to Arabic and Sanskrit, including the vernacular languages of India, as is allotted to Greek, Latin, French, German, and Italian; (*d*) encouragement to proceed to England may be given by awarding suitable scholarships.

49. What conditions, if any, should be attached to them?—They should be required to obtain a certificate from the local Government as to moral character, respectability, and merit.

50. What is your opinion as to giving Statutory appointments to Natives who, though they may have failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, have shown merit in the English competition?—Under such circumstances the unsuccessful candidates should be provided for.

51. Assuming it to be advisable to appoint to the Statutory Service in India Natives who have failed in the English competition, should such persons receive the same training as successful candidates in England and be subject to the same final examination?—No, but subject to the ordinary departmental examination.

52. Should they on appointment to the Statutory Service in India be subject to the same incidents as apply to other persons appointed under the Statutory rules?—Yes, excepting that they should not be obliged to remain in England for further training.

53. Can you say what number of Natives belonging to your Province have presented themselves annually at the competitive examination in England, and what degree of success they attained?—So far as we

know only one candidate belonging to our Province, and that, too, a Bengalee gentleman, appeared in the competitive examination, but unfortunately he was not successful.

54. What class or classes of Natives in your Province readily go to England?—No class can be named especially.

55. Are objections entertained to going to England; and if so, what are they, and by what classes in particular are they felt?—By the majority of Hindus and Mahomedans, excepting the educated classes of the community. The objections are based on religious and social prejudices.

56. Should the examination for Natives in England be distinct in standards and conditions from that for English candidates, or should there be one and the same examination for all?—Please see our answer No. 48.

57. If the standards and conditions were different, how would it be possible to compare the results in the two examinations so as to bring out one list in order of merit?—Please see our answer No. 48.

58. Would it under such circumstances be desirable to allot a fixed proportion of appointments to each of the two examinations?—Please see our answer No. 48.

59. If a fixed proportion of appointments were allotted for a Native examination in England, do you consider that in view of the objections against a voyage to England and life there, the cost thereof, and the chances of failure, a sufficient number of suitable candidates from your Province would be available to make the competition a real competition?—Not under present circumstances, but possibly in a few years if reasonable facilities are given to Natives. We are against holding a separate examination called a Native examination.

60. If the examinations were distinct, what should be the limits of age for the Native examination?—We need not answer this question, as we are against holding separate examinations, otherwise age 24.

61. What should be the conditions, nature, and subjects of the separate Native examination?—Please see No. 48.

62. Assuming only one examination in England for both English and Native candidates, do you consider that the subjects and standards of examination, and the conditions as to age and other matters, in any respect place Native candidates at a disadvantage as compared with English candidates?—Yes, certainly.

63. If so, in what respects are Native candidates placed at a disadvantage, and what alterations would you recommend with a view to remove that disadvantage?—See No. 48.

64. If there should be only one examination for all candidates, should the limits of age for Natives be higher than those at present fixed for European candidates; and if so, what should the limits for Native candidates be?—The limit of age should be raised to 24 for both.

65. If higher limits of age were fixed for Native than for European candidates, might not the latter complain that they were placed at a disadvantage?—The limit of age should be raised to 24 without distinction.

66. What is the average age at which Natives at the Indian Universities pass the examinations for F.A., B.A., and M.A. respectively?—F.A., 22; B.A., 24; M.A., 25.

67. From what classes of native society are the persons who graduate at the Indian Universities usually drawn in your Province?—Generally from the middle classes.

IV.—Competition in India for the Indian Civil Service.

68. Do you advocate a competition in India for the Civil Service simultaneously with the competition in England, the same question-papers being used at both examinations?—Yes, but subject to Nos. 48 and 49.

69. How would this method of selection be regarded by the Native community generally?—Favourably.

70. If you advocate such a system, would you restrict the competition in India to Natives, and that in England to English candidates, or would you admit both classes freely to either examination?—Both classes freely.

71. If Native candidates were admitted to the competition in England, while English candidates were excluded from the competition in India, on what grounds could this distinction be justified?—This distinction could not be justified.

72. Do you consider that the educational institutions available in India are at present capable of giving the very high class education which it was the object of the competitive system as introduced in 1855 to secure?—Not under the existing system.

73. Would an open competition in India be likely to give decided advantages to any particular class or classes of the Native community over others?—Yes, to our Bengali brethren especially, and to our Hindu brethren generally.

74. Would it be likely to lead to the undue preponderance of any one class or caste in the public Service?—Yes.

75. Do you think there are any objections on political or administrative grounds to open competition in India?—No, provided the proposals suggested by us in our answers Nos. 26 and 142 are adopted.

76. Would the introduction of an open competitive examination in India have the effect of deterring cadets of leading families from aspiring to enter the ranks of the Civil Service?—Yes.

77. Under such a system how would it be possible to provide against the Natives of a Province in which education is

Vol I, Sec. III, Sub-Sec. A.

Anjaman-i-Islamia, Amritsar

comparatively backward being excluded from appointments in their own Province?—See our answer Nos. 26 and 142.

78. Would a system of Provincial examinations be preferable to one examination for the whole of India?—No.

79. Under a system of open competition in India, would the successful candidates be regarded as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the Service through the channel of the open competition in England?—Not if the same questions were set and the same authorities publish the result in one general list. But the questions should be so framed as to satisfy the requirements of our answer No. 48.

80. Supposing that the Covenanted appointments were allotted in fixed proportions, a certain number to be obtained by competition in England and a certain number by competition in India, the examinations in each case being open on fairly equal conditions to Native and English candidates alike, and the Statutory system being abolished, how would such a system be viewed?—It would not be looked upon favourably. The Statutory Civil Service should still be maintained.

81. If an open competition were established in India, what should be the preliminary qualifications required on the part of candidates in regard to age?—The age should be between 20 and 24.

82. In regard to minimum educational attainments?—The F.A. or an equivalent standard.

83. In regard to moral, social, and physical fitness?—Good health, respectability, and good moral character.

84. In other respects (if any)?—Respectable and influential family.

85. Should the subjects and conditions of the examination be the same as those prescribed for the competitive examination in England, or should they be different?—Please see No. 48.

86. If different, what should they be?—Please see No. 48.

87. Circumstances being different in the case of persons who enter through the examination in England and of persons who enter through the examination in India, is there any reason why the rules in regard to pay, leave, pension, &c., should not also be different?—There should be no difference in pay, &c., to indicate inferiority, but special allowances may be awarded to those who have entered through the examination in England, whether Europeans or Natives.

88. Should successful candidates go through a period of special study in India like the English candidates, who spend two years in special preparation? *or*

89. Would it be preferable (*a*) to require them to go to England, or (*b*) to give them the option of going to England, suitable allowances being given to enable them to prosecute their studies there?—Successful candidates should proceed to England and suitable allowances should be given to enable them to prosecute their studies and enlarge their minds.

90. Should successful candidates at the Indian competition be required to pass through a probationary period before final appointment?—No; they should be sent to England after being confirmed in their appointments.

92. How should it be passed—in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service or otherwise?—In the ranks of the Covenanted Service.

V.—Promotion from the Uncovenanted Service.

93. What special provision, if any, do you think should be made for the appointments to Covenanted posts of deserving members of the Uncovenanted Service?—Deserving men should be appointed.

94. If such appointments are made, should they be restricted to the holders of any particular classes of appointments in the Uncovenanted Service; and if so, what classes?—As a rule selections should be made from among Extra Assistant Commissioners.

95. Should persons so appointed be appointed provisionally and be required to pass through a period of probation before final confirmation?—They should not pass through a period of probation.

96. Should provision be made for the appointment of qualified members of the Uncovenanted Service to the higher Covenanted offices without requiring them to pass through the lower grades?—They should not necessarily enter the Service through the lowest grade.

97. If certain appointments in the Covenanted grades are set apart for the Statutory Service, should a fixed proportion of those appointments be expressly reserved for persons of proved merit and ability in the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes, but not more than 20 per cent. of the appointments reserved for the Statutory Civil Service should be so set apart.

98 Should special provision be made for the promotion to Covenanted posts of European members of the Uncovenanted Service?—No.

99. Should special provision be made for the promotion to such posts of Eurasian or other members of the Uncovenanted Service who, though not Natives of pure descent, fall within the meaning attached in the Statute of 1870 to the term "Natives of India?"—No.

100. Ought not the Uncovenanted Service, equally with the Covenanted Service, to be open to all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty who possess the qualifications that may be from time to time prescribed?—Yes, but preference should be given to the Natives of India.

VI.—Pay, Leave, and Pension for Natives of India appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than through the channel of competition in England.

102. Is the rate* of pay at present granted to Statutory Civilians during probation and on final appointment respectively sufficient?—It is insufficient.

* Two hundred rupees a month on first appointment as probationers. Two hundred and fifty rupees a month after passing the departmental examination by the lower standard. After passing the departmental examination by the higher standard (unless specially exempted), and after having been confirmed in their appointments, 64 per cent. of what would be the gross pay or salary of the office if it were held by a Covenanted Civil Servant appointed after competitive examination in England.

103. If not, on what grounds do you consider it insufficient, and what rates of pay should in your opinion be granted to Statutory Civilians (*a*) while on probation and (*b*) on final confirmation in their appointments?—The Native mode of living is daily becoming more expensive. On probation they should get Rs. 250 a month, and after having been confirmed in their appointments they should get 75 per cent. of what would be the gross pay or salary of the office if it were held by a Covenanted Civilian appointed after competitive examination in England.

104 Would these rates of pay be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the Uncovenanted Service?—The rate as above specified would be suitable in their case too, provided that the Uncovenanted servants who already get higher pay should not suffer by their appointment to Covenanted posts.

105. Would they be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the professional classes?—It would be very difficult to secure the services of competent men at the Bar, as most probably they would refuse to suffer the pecuniary loss occasioned by the operation of the rule.

106. If not, how would you treat in regard to pay persons selected from these two classes if appointed to the lowest grade of the Covenanted Service?—Persons from the professional classes may be left to exercise their discretion in accepting or refusing the appointments.

107. How would you treat in regard to pay such persons if appointed to any of the higher Covenanted posts without being required to pass through the lower grades?—The same rule would apply in their case also.

108. Do you consider that a difference should be maintained between the rates of pay granted to Covenanted Civilians who enter through the competitive channel in England and to persons holding Covenanted posts who do not enter through that channel?—Yes.

109. If so, what would you consider the fair rate of reduction to be made in the case of persons holding Covenanted posts who do not enter through the competitive channel in England?—A reduction of 25 per cent.

110. Would you approve of an arrangement by which the pay of appointments would be a fixed sum to be drawn by the holder whether he is a Covenanted or a Statutory Civilian, with an additional staff allowance to be drawn by those only who enter the Service through the examination in England?—We have all along recommended this.

111. Can you suggest any other way of providing different rates of pay?—No.

112. If you consider there should be no difference of pay, how do you justify the application of the same rates of pay in the case of Natives who have satisfied the very high tests required by the examination in England and Natives who have not?—Difference of pay is necessary.

113. On the same assumption, what are your reasons for holding that the high rate of pay which is considered to be necessary to secure the services of persons of tested qualifications in a country far from their homes, and under various other unfavourable conditions, should be given to persons whose qualifications have not been so tested and who serve in their own native country?—See our answer No. 112.

126. How far would any system of appointment which involves a journey to and residence in England be regarded by the Native community as open to objection on the ground that it requires Hindu candidates to abandon their caste as a condition of entering the Civil Service?—Our own personal experience has convinced us that a journey to and residence in England does not entail such hardships upon Hindu gentlemen.

127. How far would such a system be regarded as open to objection on the ground that it restricts the field of selection to those candidates who are wealthy enough to undertake the cost of a journey to and residence in England?—Such a system would not be objectionable if the candidates are sent to England at the cost of the Government.

128. Are the Natives who go to England from your Province for purposes of education limited to the wealther classes?—They are limited to the wealthier classes from among all sections of the Native community.

129. Are they limited to any particular section of the community, or to any particular creed?—See the last answer.

130. Does a voyage to or residence in England involve the loss of social position or other unfavourable consequences in the case of any section of the Native community?—No.

131. Does it result in placing those Natives who undertake it more or less out of touch and sympathy with their fellow-countrymen on their return to India?—Their going to England does not necessarily result in want

Vol. I. Sec. III, Sub-Sec. A.

Anjaman-i-Islamia, Amritsar.

Vol. I, Sec. III, Sub-Sec. A.

Anjaman-i-Islamia, Amritsar.

of touch and sympathy with their fellow-countrymen.

132. Would the requirement of a temporary residence in England as a condition precedent to or following on appointment to the Government Service have the effect of excluding from such appointments any considerable or important section of the Native community?—None, provided the candidates are required to reside in England after they are appointed.

133. If the Statutory system is discontinued, should special provision be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of Natives who, for religious or other sufficient reasons, are unable or unwilling to undertake a journey to and residence in England?—No.

134. If so, what provision should be made for this purpose?—None.

135. If the Statutory system is discontinued, do you consider that special provision should be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of capable members of the professional classes?—Yes.

136. If so, what provision should be made for this purpose?—Capable persons of five years' standing may be selected by the local Government.

137. Whatever system or systems may be adopted, ought power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts candidates of high family subject to such antecedent guarantees of fitness as may be considered sufficient in each case?—Such powers ought to be reserved to Government.

138. Ought similar power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts persons who have proved their merit and ability in Government Service, or in the exercise of a profession, without preliminary examination or competition?—Yes.

139. If a thorough knowledge of English were made an essential qualification for appointment to Covenanted posts, would the field of selection in the case of persons already in the Uncovenanted Service or engaged in the exercise of a profession be unduly limited thereby?—Yes.

140. If such is likely to be the case, could the difficulty be obviated by requiring proficiency in the English language to be tested by periodical examinations after selection, but during a probationary period?—Yes, to some extent.

141. Should provision be made for the occasional appointment, in very special and exceptional cases, to Covenanted posts of persons of known ability and local influence whom, although they may never have held office and may not possess special professional qualifications, and although their age may exceed the limit laid down for untried candidates, it might nevertheless be considered desirable to appoint to the higher grades for political or other reasons?—Yes.

142. Would it be desirable to rule that the proportion of persons being Mahomedans and Hindus, respectively, who are from time to time or over a series of years appointed to the Covenanted ranks in any Province should bear a certain relation to the number of the two classes composing the population of the Province concerned?—The appointments should be distributed among Hindus and Mahomedans in equal shares on political grounds, and should not bear a certain relation to the number of the two classes. The difficulty of securing an equal number of appointments to Hindus and Mahomedans in the event of the introduction of a competitive examination in India will become great. To meet this we propose that a certain number of marks should be fixed as indicating passing marks, and the names of all the candidates who reach the standard should appear in the general list, and then, in order of merit, the Hindus and Mahomedans should be chosen to fill the vacancies in equal numbers. The political balance will thus be fairly maintained.

145 & 146. How would the following scheme be regarded by the Native community?—(1) The Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of European officers, admission being by competition in England confined to European candidates only. (2) The appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, Natives only being eligible. How would you regard such a scheme? The Native community will approve of this scheme, provided that one-half of the appointments are reserved for Natives of pure descent, and the successful candidates are sent to England to acquire additional qualifications after appointment.

147 & 148. How would the Native community regard the following?—(1) The Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of appointments, to be filled by competition in England to which Natives and Europeans alike would be admitted. (2) The appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, both Natives and Europeans being eligible. How would you regard such a scheme?—We disapprove of this scheme.

149 & 150. If either of the above schemes were adopted, how would the Native community view a proposal to combine the higher appointments of the Uncovenanted Service with the appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service so as to form an enlarged Civil Service to be recruited in India? How would you view such a proposal?—The two should not be combined. Higher posts of the Uncovenanted Service should be secured to Subordinate Judicial and Executive officers.

151 & 152. How would the Native community regard the following scheme?—(1) a certain number of appointments in the Covenanted Civil Service to be reserved for Natives; (2) a certain proportion of that number to be filled by competition or by some

other system in India; (3) the remainder to be filled by competition in England. How would you regard such a scheme?—We regard the scheme with satisfaction, provided the examination is held in India and a certain number of appointments in each grade are reserved for Natives.

153. Assuming a system of nomination or of limited competition among nominated candidates, would Native opinion be in favour of giving a preference, as between candidates possessed of certain preliminary essential qualifications and having on general grounds fairly equal claims, in the following or any other order to—(*a*) members of families of tried loyalty and distinguished service; (*b*) persons of good social status and influence in the country; and (*c*) persons of superior educational attainments, such as persons who have taken the degree of M.A.?—Yes.

154. What is your opinion as to giving such preference?—We fully appreciate the order as given in question No. 153.

155 & 156. How would the Native community regard a system of nomination on the ground of merit and ability shown in the service of Government, or in the exercise of a profession, alternating with a system of selection by means of competition, whether entirely open or amongst nominated candidates? How would you regard such a system?—We regard this scheme with the greatest satisfaction.

157. If the Statutory system were maintained, and if a probationary period were required from nominees or selected candidates before final appointment, would it be necessary to insist upon such probationary period in all cases, *e.g.* in the case of a person who has done good service in the Uncovenanted ranks?—In the case of a person who has done good service in the Uncovenanted ranks no such probationary period should be insisted upon.

158. In the case of persons nominated from the professional classes, is it desirable that a probationary period should be prescribed?—No.

159. If so, is it necessary that the incidents of such period as to duration and pay should be the same as those attached thereto in the case of Statutory Civilians appointed on probation to the lowest grade of the Covenanted Service?—No.

160. On what principles should the promotion of Natives appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than by the channel of the competition in England be regulated?—According to the rules of seniority.

161. Would you regulate such promotion only by considerations of fitness and approved personal merit?—According to the rules of seniority.

162. Should subjects of Native States be eligible for appointment to Covenanted posts in British India?—No.

163. If so, should this be extended to all Native States in alliance with the Crown, or only to those in subordinate alliance?—Neither.

164. What system, if any, is at present adopted in your Province for bringing into the public Service persons who, from their position or otherwise, cannot be expected to enter the service of Government in the lowest grades, and for giving them the necessary apprenticeship?—We do not know of any such system, but if it is adopted it will attract many persons of respectable families, who on account of their position will not enter in the lowest grades.

165. Does the system work well, and what improvements can you suggest?—We do not know of any such system; but if it is adopted it will attract many persons of respectable families, who on account of their position will not enter in the lowest grades.

VIII.—Composition, Recruitment, &c., of the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services.

166. How is the present system of regulating appointments to the Subordinate* Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, regarded by influential sections of the Native community?—With dissatisfaction.

167. To what sections of Native society do the persons belong who accept under existing conditions appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services respectively?—Generally to the middle classes.

168. To what extent do Natives of good family and education in your Province offer themselves as candidates for Subordinate Judicial and Executive appointments?—To some extent.

169. Do Natives who have been to England for purposes of study on their return to India willingly accept such appointments?—No.

170. How far are the professional classes represented in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, in your Province?—Very rarely.

171. Do members of the professional classes in your Province readily accept employment in those Services?—No such instances exist as far as we know, but

* NOTE.—For the purposes of these questions the terms "Subordinate Executive Service" and "Subordinate Judicial Service" may be held to include, respectively, all Subordinate Executive and Judicial offices down to and including the office of Tahsildár or Munsif, or other office corresponding to that of Tahsildár or Munsif, which are not reserved for or not ordinarily held by members of the Covenanted Civil Service.

Vol. I, Sec. III, Sub-Sec. A.

Anjaman-i-Islamia, Amritsar.

they might accept employment in those Services.

174. Is it the case that certain classes of Uncovenanted appointments are practically reserved for Natives of pure descent owing to the fact that conditions are imposed which have resulted in shutting out Eurasians and other Statutory Natives of mixed descent?—As far as the Anjaman is aware the posts of Tahsíldár and Munsif are practically reserved for Natives of pure descent only.

175. If so, how is such reservation justified?—This reservation is owing to the ignorance of the vernaculars of the Province and of the manners and habits of the Natives on the part of Eurasians and others who are not Natives of pure descent.

No. VII.

Answers by the Indian Association, Lahore.

I.—Working of the existing Statutory System.

What is the prevalent feeling in your Province regarding the existing Statutory system? If the feeling is one of dissatisfaction, is the dissatisfaction general or is it confined to certain sections of the community?—The prevalent feeling in the Punjab regarding the existing Statutory system is one of dissatisfaction. The dissatisfaction is more prevalent amongst the educated and the intelligent classes.

2. What are the grounds upon which any such feeling is based?—Arbitrary selection, the incompetence of the generality of the nominees, and the observance of an invidious distinction in pay and privileges between the persons appointed by competition in England and those appointed under the Statute, giving to the latter an appearance of inferiority, are the chief grounds for this feeling of dissatisfaction.

3. Is the feeling of dissatisfaction, if it exists, directed against the Statute itself (33 Vic., Chapter 3, Section 6), or is it directed against the rules framed thereunder?—The feeling of dissatisfaction is directed both against the Statute and the rules framed thereunder.

4. If the Statute itself is objected to, is it because its provisions admit persons to specific appointments only and not to membership in an organised "Service"?—Yes.

5. Are the objections based on other, and if so what, grounds?—Also because it leaves too much to the discretion of the Government of India. It does not make it compulsory for them to appoint to the Service a stated number of persons every year; nor does it specify the requisite proof of ability and merit.

6. If a desire is felt for enrolment in a general Service, what are the reasons for this desire?—The reasons are that we desire to take a larger and more responsible share in the administration of our country, and are anxious to make it less alien in character. The granting of our desire in these respects will also give us a more extended sphere for employment and promotion, and will considerably improve our status. The admission of Natives to specific posts and not to a general Service implies a reflection upon their position and character, and shows a want of confidence which they do not deserve.

7. What amendments do you advocate in Section 6 of the Statute?—If the Statutory system is to be retained, which we do not at all wish, the section may be so amended as to make it incumbent on the Governor-General in Council to admit to the Civil Service a stated proportion of Natives of this country after proof of their ability and merit by an open and public competition.

8. Do you consider that Section 6 of the Statute supplies such a definition of the words "Natives of India" as describes with sufficient clearness, fulness, and accuracy the various classes of persons for whose appointment to Covenanted posts it is desirable to provide?—No.

9. If not, can you suggest any more complete or more satisfactory definition?—Instead of "parents habitually resident in India," the words "of parents permanently settled in India" should be substituted. After the words "temporary purposes only," it should be added "provided they are not European British subjects within the meaning of Section 4, Clause (*u*) of the Criminal Procedure Code."

10. If the objections are directed against the rules framed under the Statute, do they relate to the mode or modes of selection actually adopted?—Yes.

11. Do they relate to the general conditions in regard to pay, promotion, and retiring annuity under which Statutory Civilians hold their offices?—No, if the Service remains as it is.

12. Assuming the Statutory system to be retained, what amendments would you suggest in the rules with a view to remove any reasonable objections which may be felt to them?—(*a*) That the proportion of appointments conferrable in India to those made by competition in England be raised from one-fifth to one-half; (*b*) that the selection be made by competition alone; and (*c*) that every one having the prescribed physical, moral, and intellectual qualifications should have the right to compete.

13. Are Statutory Civilians regarded by the general public as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the Covenanted Service through the competitive channel?—Yes.

14. If such a feeling exists, on what grounds is it based?—The Statutory Civilians are never appointed to posts of trust or responsibility which are not granted to the ordinary Subordinate Judicial and Executive Servants. They receive less pay than do the Covenanted Civilians. They are generally persons of inferior education and qualifications, owing their appointments more to favour than to merit.

15. Do the general public view with any difference the status of Statutory Civilians and that of Uncovenanted Officers?—Yes, with some slight difference.

16. If so, on what grounds?—Comparatively better prospects and higher pay.

II.— Mode of Selection of Statutory Civilians.

Vol. I, Sec. III, Sub-Sec. A.

Indian Association, Lahore.

17. On the assumption* that the Statutory system is retained, how would appointment to the Statutory Service by nomination be regarded by influential sections of the Native community in your Province?—It will be regarded with perfect dissatisfaction by the educated portion of the influential sections of the Indian community and with satisfaction by a small minority, who wish that they or their children should enter the public Service without adequate qualifications for the purpose.

18. How would a system of nomination to be followed by a period of probation be regarded by the same classes?—The former will regard it as alleviating the evil, but the latter with dissatisfaction.

19. Would a system of nomination, with or without probation, be likely to secure well-qualified persons?—Decidedly not.

20. Has experience actually shown such a system to secure well-qualified officers?—Not at all.

21. Do you consider that nominations should be confined to persons of proved merit and ability ?—Yes, if nomination is to be retained at all.

22. If so, how do you consider that merit and ability should be held to have been proved for this purpose?—By University examinations.

23. How would a system of limited competition amongst persons nominated for this purpose by the local Governments or by the Universities, or by those authorities concurrently or alternately, be regarded?—A limited competition among the nominees, if nomination is to be retained at all, is preferable. It will be still more preferable that nominations for this purpose be made by Universities alone.

24. In preference to either of the above systems (nomination and limited competition), would a system of open competition, pure and simple, for the Statutory Service commend itself to the Native community?—Yes.

25. If competition (whether limited or open) is preferred, should there be one competition for all India or separate competitions in each Province?—Yes, one for all India.

26. If there were only one general competition, how would you ensure a due proportion of appointments falling to the population of the several Provinces?—It should be provided that when the examination is over the candidates must gain "pass" marks in order to become eligible for the Service. Two lists of the "passed" candidates should be prepared,—one general, in which the names of all the "passed" candidates should be shown in order of merit, and another provincial, in which the names of the "passed" candidates from each Province should be shown in the same order. The appointments in each Province should be first allotted in order of merit to the "passed" candidates of the Province. In case their number be not sufficient to fill up all the available appointments, the residue should be given to the unprovided "passed" candidates on the general list in order of merit.

27. Having regard to the varying educational standards reached in the several Provinces, and the varying conditions prevalent therein, is it possible to have any one system of selection for all India which would not result in the inhabitants of some Provinces being more or less excluded from a due share of appointments?—The suggestion contained in the answer to question 26 will avoid the difficulty pointed out in this question.

28. Under any of the three systems of nomination, limited competition, and open competition, would you prescribe any tests of preliminary qualifications on the part of nominees or candidates in regard to (1) age, (2) intellectual capacity, (3) moral, social, and physical fitness?—Yes.

29. If so, what should be the tests under each of the heads specified?—A.—For purely nominated candidates, (*a*) maximum age 25 years; (*b*) intellectual test the B. A. degree; (*c*)[1] a certificate from the head of the institution in which the student has been brought up or from two respectable gentlemen, whether official or non-official; (*c*)[2] the education test is a sufficient test of social fitness ordinarily; (*c*)[3] a medical examination and certificate. B.—For limited competition, the same as for purely nominated. C.—For open competition, maximum age 23; the rest as above.

30. Do you consider that (after selection, whether by nomination or competition,) there should be a period of probation?—Yes.

31. If so, what should be the duration of the probationary period?—Two years.

32. Should the period of probation be passed in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service or of the Covenanted Service, or in what other manner?—In the ranks of the Civil Service or in training in England. When the probationer works in the ranks of the Civil Service, the result of his probation should be tested, not by the report of his immediate superior only, but by that of a Committee, who should examine the work done by the candidate, or by departmental examinations.

33. Do you consider that after selection and before entering on probation (or on duty) the person selected should undergo special training?—None excepting that during probation.

35. If in India, would it be possible, and if possible, advisable, to establish an

* The questions which follow, down to No. 39 inclusive, are put subject to the same assumption

Indian Civil Service College on the basis of the Haileybury College which formerly existed in England?—No.

36. If you do not consider special training in England essential, would you encourage nominees or selected candidates to visit England with a view to add to their qualifications for the Service?—Such visits may be encouraged.

37. If so, what form should such encouragement take?—The encouragement should be given to both the persons nominated by Government and those selected by competition, by allowing them to spend their period of probation in England and granting them the same allowances there as they would have got had they spent their probationary period in India.

38. Should it be offered before, or during, or after the probationary period, if any, through which nominees or selected candidates may be required to pass?—During the probationary period.

39. Should it be offered before or after the nominees or selected candidates enter on their duties?—Before they enter on their duties.

40. Are you in favour of the establishment of scholarships tenable by Natives in England for the purpose of enabling them to qualify for the Civil or Statutory Service?—Not in case it be possible to admit Indians to the Civil Service by a competition held in India on terms equal in every way to those allowed to men who enter it by competition in England, that is, by holding the English examination at an Indian centre. But if that be not possible, then certainly grant scholarships to a limited number of persons for competing in England. The persons eligible to such scholarships should be selected by a preliminary open competition in India.

42. Do you think that any distinction should be made between the emoluments of nominees or selected candidates who have been trained in England or have gone to England to add to their qualifications and those who have not?—No distinction should be made between the two classes of Statutory Civilians.

43. If the opportunity of residence in England at a University for two years with a sufficient allowance were offered to nominees or selected candidates, is it likely that it would be taken advantage of to any great extent?—Yes.

44. If the system of examination in England were revised, with the result that Natives availed themselves of it in considerable numbers, would it still be necessary to retain the Statutory system?—Yes, but in an improved form.

45. If so, to what appointments or classes of appointments would you restrict the latter system, and what conditions over and above those already existing would you impose?—All appointments now conferred on the Covenanted Civilians should be granted to the Statutory Civilians. Only graduates should be nominated, and they should earn their appointments by competition among themselves, in case free competition be not allowed.

III.—Competition in England for the Indian Civil Service.

46. Is competition of Natives in the examination in England favourably looked upon by large and important classes in India?—Not very favourably by a large majority of them.

47. Should additional facilities be given to Natives for proceeding to England and entering the Indian Civil Service by the channel of the English competition?—Yes.

48. If so, what form or forms should such facilities take?—By raising the limits of age for competition, providing suitable scholarships, adding the Indian vernaculars and Indian history to the subjects of examination, and allowing to the Indian classics and languages the same number of marks as is allotted to the European classics and European continental languages.

49. What conditions, if any, should be attached to them?—None, excepting that the scholarships be awarded by an open competition in India.

50. What is your opinion as to giving Statutory appointments to Natives who, though they may have failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, have shown merit in the English competition?—No appointments should be given to them.

51. Assuming it to be advisable to appoint to the Statutory Service in India Natives who have failed in the English competition, should such persons receive the same training as successful candidates in England, and be subject to the same final examination?—It will be better if they do.

52. Should they on appointment to the Statutory Service in India be subject to the same incidents as apply to other persons appointed under the Statutory rules?—Yes.

53. Can you say what number of Natives belonging to your Province have presented themselves annually at the competitive examination in England, and what degree of success they attained?—Only one up to date.

54. What class or classes of Natives in your Province readily go to England?—Those among the educated classes who can afford to do so.

55. Are objections entertained to going to England; and if so, what are they, and by what classes in particular are they felt?—None, excepting by uneducated or orthodox people, and by those on superstitious grounds.

56. Should the examination for Natives in England be distinct in standards and conditions from that for English candidates,

or should there be one and the same examination for all?—The examination should not be distinct, but the subjects should be added to and the numbers raised as suggested in answer to question 48.

58. Would it under such circumstances be desirable to allot a fixed proportion of appointments to each of the two examinations?—No.

59. If a fixed proportion of appointments were allotted for a Native examination in England, do you consider that in view of the objections against a voyage to England and life there, the cost thereof, and the chances of failure, a sufficient number of suitable candidates from your Province would be available to make the competition a real competition?—Not unless special facilities are given as already indicated. But be it remembered that we are not for a separate examination at all.

62. Assuming only one examination in England for both English and Native candidates, do you consider that the subjects and standards of examination and the conditions as to age and other matters in any respect place Native candidates at a disadvantage as compared with English candidates?—Yes.

63. If so, in what respects are Native candidates placed at a disadvantage, and what alterations would you recommend with a view to remove that disadvantage?—The conditions as to age and as to the allotting of fewer marks to the Indian classics, and the omission of Indian vernaculars and history from the list of subjects while the European continental history and languages are included, certainly do place the Indian candidates at a considerable disadvantage. We would propose that the maximum limit of age be raised to 23 years, the Indian vernaculars and history be added to the subjects of examination, and the number of marks allotted to the Indian classics raised to a level with those prescribed for the European classics.

64. If there should be only one examination for all candidates, should the limits of age for Natives be higher than those at present fixed for European candidates; and if so, what should the limits for Native candidates be?—The minimum limit as regards the age of the Indian candidates should be 19, and the maximum limit 23.

65. If higher limits of age were fixed for Native than for European candidates, might not the latter complain that they were placed at a disadvantage?—No, because the examination will be conducted at their own home and in their own mother-tongue. We would not grudge them two years extra if the case were reversed.

66. What is the average age at which Natives at the Indian Universities pass the examinations for F.A., B.A., and M.A. respectively?—F.A. at 19 years.
B.A. at 21 „
M.A. at 22 „

67. From what classes of Native society are the persons who graduate at the Indian Universities usually drawn in your Province?—From the middle classes generally.

IV.—Competition in India for the Indian Civil Service.

68. Do you advocate a competition in India for the Civil Service simultaneously with the competition in England, the same question papers being used at both examinations?—Yes.

69. How would this method of selection be regarded by the Native community generally?—With much satisfaction.

70. If you advocate such a system, would you restrict the competition in India to Natives, and that in England to English candidates, or would you admit both classes freely to either examination?—We would admit both freely to either examination.

72. Do you consider that the educational institutions available in India are at present capable of giving the very high class education which it was the object of the competitive system as introduced in 1855 to secure?—Yes.

73. Would an open competition in India be likely to give decided advantages to any particular class or classes of the Native community over others?—Not.

74. Would it be likely to lead to the undue preponderance of any one class or caste in the public Service?—It may give some preponderance to the more advanced classes and castes for a short time.

75. Do you think there are any objections on political or administrative grounds to open competition in India?—None.

76. Would the introduction of an open competitive examination in India have the effect of deterring cadets of leading families from aspiring to enter the ranks of the Civil Service?—No.

77. Under such a system how would it be possible to provide against the Natives of a Province in which education is comparatively backward being excluded from appointments in their own Province?—No Province is so backward that even such a strong impetus should fail to bring it up in a short time. Also *vide* answer to question No. 26.

78. Would a system of provincial examinations be preferable to one examination for the whole of India?—No.

79. Under a system of open competition in India, would the successful candidates be regarded as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the Service through the channel of the open competition in England?—No, provided they are equally trusted and employed without distinction.

80. Supposing that the Covenanted appointments were allotted in fixed proportions, a certain number to be obtained by competition in England and a certain number by competition in India, the examinations in each case being open on fairly equal conditions to Native and English candidates alike, and the Statutory system being abolished, how would such a system be viewed?—With entire satisfaction.

81. If an open competition were established in India, what should be the preliminary qualifications required on the part of candidates in regard to age?—The candidates should be between the ages of 19 and 23.

82. In regard to minimum educational attainments?—B.A. degree.

83. In regard to moral, social, and physical fitness?—A certificate of good character from the head of the institution in which the candidate has been brought up or two other respectable gentlemen, good education, and a medical certificate of health.

84. In other respects (if any)?—None.

85. Should the subjects and conditions of the examination be the same as those prescribed for the competitive examination in England, or should they be different?—The same with the alterations proposed in answer to question 56.

87. Circumstances being different in the case of persons who enter through the examination in England and of persons who enter through the examination in India, is there any reason why the rules in regard to pay, leave, pension, &c., should not also be different?—No difference as regards pay and pension, but some indulgence might be shown in the leave rules.

88 & 89. Should successful candidates go through a period of special study in India like the English candidates, who spend two years in special preparation? *or* Would it be preferable (*a*) to require them to go to England, or (*b*) to give them the option of going to England, suitable allowances being given to enable them to prosecute their studies there?—The Indian candidates should be sent to England with suitable allowances to prosecute their studies.

90 to 92. Should successful candidates at the Indian competition be required to pass through a probationary period before final appointment? If so, what shall be the duration of the probationary period? How should it be passed—in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service or otherwise?—No.

V.—Promotion from the Uncovenanted Service.

93. What special provision, if any, do you think should be made for the appointments to Covenanted posts of deserving members of the Uncovenanted Service?—If our proposals are accepted, none.

94. If such appointments are made, should they be restricted to the holders of any particular classes of appointments in the Uncovenanted Service; and if so, what classes?—No.

95. Should persons so appointed be appointed provisionally and be required to pass through a period of probation before final confirmation?—No.

96. Should provision be made for the appointment of qualified members of the Uncovenanted Service to the higher Covenanted offices without requiring them to pass through the lower grades?—No.

97. If certain appointments in the Covenanted grades are set apart for the Statutory Service, should a fixed proportion of those appointments be expressly reserved for persons of proved merit and ability in the Uncovenanted Service?—No.

98. Should special provision be made for the promotion to Covenanted posts of European members of the Uncovenanted Service?—No.

99. Should special provision be made for the promotion to such posts of Eurasian or other members of the Uncovenanted Service who, though not Natives of pure descent, fall within the meaning attached in the Statute of 1870 to the term "Natives of India"?—No.

100. Ought not the Uncovenanted Service, equally with the Covenanted Service, to be open to all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty who possess the qualifications that may be from time to time prescribed?—No.

101. If the Uncovenanted Service is closed to any natural-born subjects of Her Majesty, on what grounds, bearing in mind the terms of Acts of Parliament and Her Majesty's Proclamation of 1st November 1858, is this to be justified?—1st—as children of the soil, the Indians have a preferential right to all appointments the duties of which they can satisfactorily discharge. Before the Queen's Proclamation this right was practically denied. Her Majesty's Proclamation of 1858, by declaring that in the distribution of patronage by the State we should not be prejudiced by our race or creed, cannot be understood to deprive us of the rights we naturally possess. It was meant simply to remove the disabilities that had been imposed upon us. The Government has hitherto recognised this principle by limiting, as far as possible, the appointments to the Uncovenanted posts to the Natives. 2ndly.—There is no necessity on political or administrative grounds for ignoring this principle. 3rdly.—The emoluments allotted to Uncovenanted posts will secure comparatively better men from among the Natives than from among the Europeans. 4thly.—It prevents to a certain extent the drain of capital out of the country.

VI.—Pay, Leave, and Pension for Natives of India appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than through the channel of competition in England.

Vol. I, Sec. III, Sub-Sec A.

Indian Association, Lahore.

102. Is the rate* of pay at present granted to Statutory Civilians during probation and on final appointment respectively sufficient?—Yes.

* Two hundred rupees a month on first appointment as probationer. Two hundred and fifty rupees a month after passing the departmental examination by the lower standard. After passing the departmental examination by the higher standard (unless specially exempted), and after having been confirmed in their appointments, 64 per cent. of what would be the gross pay or salary of the office if it were held by a Covenanted Civil Servant appointed after competitive examination in England.

104. Would these rates of pay be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes. Care should, however, be taken that the promotion does not entail loss of pay. This can be done by appointing the officer promoted to a grade the pay of which shall come up to the pay he has been already getting.

105. Would they be suitable in the cases of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the professional classes?—Yes.

106. If not, how would you treat in regard to pay persons selected from these two classes if appointed to the lowest grade of the Covenanted Service?—If appointed to the lowest grade, there should be no difference.

107. How would you treat in regard to pay such persons if appointed to any of the higher Covenanted posts without being required to pass through the lower grades?—The appointment must carry its pay with it at the rate allowed to the Statutory Civilians.

108. Do you consider that a difference should be maintained between the rates of pay granted to Covenanted Civilians who enter through the competitive channel in England and to persons holding Covenanted posts who do not enter through that channel?—No.

109. If so, what would you consider the fair rate of reduction to be made in the case of persons holding Covenanted posts who do not enter through the competitive channel in England?—None.

110. Would you approve of an arrangement by which the pay of appointments would be a fixed sum to be drawn by the holder, whether he is a Covenanted or a Statutory Civilian, with an additional staff allowance to be drawn by those only who enter the Service through the examination in England?—The pay alike of those who enter the Covenanted Service through the examination in England and in India, as we have proposed, may be put on a level with the pay now allotted to the Statutory Service; but additional allowances may be given to both, which they may get as long as they are in active service.

112. If you consider there should be no difference of pay, how do you justify the application of the same rates of pay in the case of Natives who have satisfied the very high tests required by the examination in England and Natives who have not?—We do not recommend the appointment of such Natives to the Covenanted Service as have not satisfied the same tests.

113. On the same assumption, what are your reasons for holding that the high rate of pay which is considered to be necessary to secure the services of persons of tested qualifications in a country far from their homes, and under various other unfavourable conditions, should be given to persons whose qualifications have not been so tested and who serve in their own native country?—As regards the distinction due to distance of residence, *vide* answers to questions 110 and 112.

115. At what age do you consider that Natives appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than through the competitive channel in England should be entitled to retire on pension?—At the age of 52.

116. After what length of service do you consider that such persons should be entitled to retire on pension?—Twenty-five years' service.

117. At what age should they be obliged to retire on pension?—Fifty-five.

118. After what length of service should they be obliged to retire on pension?—After 30 years' service.

119 What amount of pension should in your opinion be granted to Natives so appointed if they serve the prescribed period for voluntary and compulsory retirement respectively?—The same as now.

120. If, before serving the prescribed period for pension, they are compelled to retire on medical certificate, what gratuity, if any, would you give them?—The same as now.

VII.—General.

121. How far is the existing system of education in the higher schools and colleges in India well adapted for training young men to the public Service? Can you suggest any improvements?—The existing scheme is tolerably well adapted for the training of our young men for the public Service. To improve it still further we would suggest more attention to physical training and a more thorough and extended course in English literature.

122 & 123. In 1854 Lord Macaulay's Committee were of opinion that the best, the most liberal, and the most finished education to be procured in England was a necessary qualification for admission to

the Civil Service. Do Indian schools and colleges at present supply an education of so high a standard?—Do you consider that Indian schools at present develop the force of character and other qualities required for English administration?—We believe so, but to supply possible deficiencies we have recommended a compulsory course of two years' training in England.

124. Do we now obtain for Government Service Natives of the classes who under Native rule carried on the civil administration of the country?—Yes, in most cases.

126. How far would any system of appointment which involves a journey to and residence in England be regarded by the Native community as open to objection on the ground that it requires Hindu candidates to abandon their caste as a condition of entering the Civil Service?—There will be no objection in the Punjab. As regards the other Provinces we believe there will be no insuperable objections.

127. How far would such a system be regarded as open to objection on the ground that it restricts the field of selection to those candidates who are wealthy enough to undertake the cost of a journey to and residence in England?—The scheme proposed by us obviates the difficulty; but if that is not adopted, a sufficient number of stipends should be provided for such as cannot afford to go to England at their own expense.

128. Are the Natives who go to England from your Province for purposes of education limited to the wealthier classes?—No, most of them belong to the middle classes.

129. Are they limited to any particular section of the community or to any particular creed?—No.

130. Does a voyage to or residence in England involve the loss of social position or other unfavourable consequences in the case of any section of the Native community?—No.

131. Does it result in placing those Natives who undertake it more or less out of touch and sympathy with their fellow-countrymen on their return to India?—Not generally.

132. Would the requirement of a temporary residence in England as a condition precedent to or following on appointment to the Government Service have the effect of excluding from such appointment any considerable or important section of the Native community?—We believe not. Also *vide* answer to question 126.

133. If the Statutory system is discontinued, should special provision be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of Natives who, for religious or other sufficient reasons, are unable or unwilling to undertake a journey to and residence in England?—No.

135. If the Statutory system is discontinued, do you consider that special provision should be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of capable members of the professional classes?—Yes, particularly to judicial appointments.

136. If so, what provision should be made for this purpose?—Practising lawyers of 5, 7, and 10 years' standing may be appointed as District and Divisional Judges and Judges of the Chief Court, respectively.

137. Whatever system or systems may be adopted, ought power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts candidates of high family subject to such antecedent guarantees of fitness as may be considered sufficient in each case?—It is not desirable.

138. Ought similar power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts persons who have proved their merit and ability in Government Service, or in the exercise of a profession, without preliminary examination or competition?—If this means Judicial and Executive Officers in the Uncovenanted Service and lawyers, yes.

139. If a thorough knowledge of English were made an essential qualification for appointment to Covenanted posts, would the field of selection in the case of persons already in the Uncovenanted Service or engaged in the exercise of a profession be unduly limited thereby?—No, not unduly.

140. If such is likely to be the case, could the difficulty be obviated by requiring proficiency in the English language to be tested by periodical examinations after selection, but during a probationary period?—It is not desirable.

141. Should provision be made for the occasional appointment in very special and exceptional cases to Covenanted posts of persons of known ability and local influence whom, although they may never have held office and may not possess special professional qualifications, and although their age may exceed the limit laid down for untried candidates, it might nevertheless be considered desirable to appoint to the higher grades for political or other reasons?—No.

142. Would it be desirable to rule that the proportion of persons being Mahomedans and Hindus respectively, who are from time to time or over a series of years appointed to the Covenanted ranks in any Province, should bear a certain relation to the population of the Province concerned?—No. It will lead to the possibility of appointing unfit men, will stimulate and perpetuate ill-feeling between the two classes, and, besides, will be practically unworkable on any intelligent principle.

143. What classes, ranks, or professions of the Native community should be included among Mahomedans and Hindus, respectively, for the purpose of ascertaining the proportion of the population of each of those classes in the several Provinces?—It is difficult to give a definite reply on account of the vagueness of the question.

144. How far should appointments in each Province to Covenanted posts be restricted to Natives of the Province concerned?—No

restrictions should be allowed, but preference should be given to the Natives of the Province as suggested in answer to question 26.

145. How would the following scheme be regarded by the Native community?

(1) The Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of European officers, admission being by competition in England, confined to European candidates only.

(2) The appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, Natives only being eligible.

—We do not think the Native community will regard it with favour, because it will take away the Natives' right of competition in England, and it will at the same time perpetuate the evils of the present Statutory Service. It will also have the effect of nullifying the Queen's Proclamation of 1858.

146. How would you regard such a scheme?—Our views are the same.

147. How would the Native community regard the following?—

(1) The Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of appointments, to be filled by competition in England to which Natives and Europeans alike would be admitted.

(2) The appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, both Natives and Europeans being eligible?

—On the whole this scheme will be regarded with disfavour.

148. How would you regard such a scheme?—Unfavourably.

149. If either of the above schemes were adopted, how would the Native community view a proposal to combine the higher appointments of the Uncovenanted Service with the appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service so as to form an enlarged Civil Service to be recruited in India?—With much more disfavour.

150. How would you view such a proposal?—Our answer is the same.

151. How would the Native community regard the following scheme?—

(1) A certain number of appointments in the Covenanted Civil Service to be reserved for Natives.

(2) A certain proportion of that number to be filled by competition or by some other system in India.

(3) The remainder to be filled by competition in England?

—The Native community would probably prefer it to any of the schemes suggested in the foregoing questions.

152. How would you regard such a scheme?—With more satisfaction than any of the other schemes proposed, provided the number reserved be reasonably large.

153. Assuming a system of nomination or of limited competition among nominated candidates, would Native opinion be in favour of giving a preference, as between candidates possessed of certain preliminary essential qualifications and having on general grounds fairly equal claims, in the following or any other order to—

(*a*) members of families of tried loyalty and distinguished service;

(*b*) persons of good social status and influence in the country; and

(*c*) persons of superior educational attainments, such as persons who have taken the degree of M.A.?

—Intelligent and educated Native opinion will be in favour of giving a preference to the last class only.

154. What is your opinion as to giving such preference? Under the assumption we, too, would prefer the M.A.'s.

No. VIII.

ANSWERS BY THE KYASTHA SABHA SOCIETY, LAHORE.

I.—Statutory Civil Service.

Vol. I, Sec. III, Sub-Sec. A.

Kyastha Sabha, Lahore.

1. Is the existing system of appointing Natives as Statutory Civilians to posts reserved for the Covenanted Civil Service approved?—It is not approved.

2. If it is not, what are the grounds of disapprobation?—(1) the system of nomination is not good; (2) the pay is low; (3) men of inferior qualifications are appointed; (4) those who enter the Service are not promoted.

3. Are the defects of the existing system (if any) susceptible of remedy—

(*a*) by an amendment of the rules;

(*b*) by an amendment of the Statutory provisions in that behalf;

or should those provisions be repealed?—By amendment of the rules. All reserved posts should be given to Natives of India, and the nominee should come in by competition.

4. If the provisions of the Statute 33 Vic., Section 6, are not repealed nor substantially amended so as to take away the power conferred on the local Administrations, should they be amended in respect of the description of persons on whose behalf such powers may be exercised, or in respect of the sanction required for appointments made thereunder?—We accept the Statutory definition of Natives of India. The term "Natives of India" should extend to those who are born in India, permanently settled in India, and are subject to the criminal law pertaining to Natives.

5. If the Statutory Service is retained, should the selected candidates be required to proceed to England for training, or should they be encouraged to do so?—It is not necessary for the successful candidates to go to England; but if any of them desire to go, they should get scholarships or other aids from the Government.

II.—Covenanted Civil Service.

1. Is any dissatisfaction felt with the existing system of recruitment for the Covenanted Civil Service?—Yes.

2. Should any, and if any what, change be made in that system?—Going to England should be stopped. The competitive examination should be held in India. There should be a Civil Service College in India, where successful candidates should be trained. The limit of age should be raised. Able men from the Statutory and Uncovenanted Services should be taken into the Covenanted Civil Service.

3. Do Natives of India labour under any, and if any what, disadvantages in competing for employment in this branch of the Service?—The Natives of India have to compete in a foreign language. There is the great disadvantage in being examined in the classical languages of Europe, which are not taught in the Indian Universities, instead of in the Indian and other classical languages. Sanskrit, Arabic, and Persian should be put on an equal footing with Latin, Greek, and French respectively.

4. By what changes may those disadvantages be minimised or removed?—If sufficient provisions are not made in India by our Government for the successful candidates to complete their education in this country, then in that case—

(*a*) Scholarships should be offered, allowances provided, and passage-money supplied.

(*b*) The limit of age should be raised to 23 years.

(*c*) All Indian vernacular languages, such as Persian, Hindi, Urdu, Bengali, Panjabi, Oriya, Marathi, Tamil, and Telegu, should be included in the subjects of examination, and it should be left to the option of the candidate to take any one of them.

Distribution of marks:—

Subjects.	Marks.
Indian Jurisprudence	500
Sanskrit or Arabic	100
English Literature	300
Histories of India, England, Greece, Rome, and Europe ...	200
Other subjects	100 each.

(*d*) by holding simultaneously examinations in England and in India.

5. If an examination is held in India—

(1) Should it be identical with that held in England?—It should be identical with that held in England.

(2) Should it be held at one or more centres in India?—One centre in India.

Should the candidates in England and in India compete with one another and be selected in order of merit, or should a certain number of appointments be apportioned for competition to the candidates at the respective examinations?—A certain number of appointments should be apportioned for competition to the candidates at the respective examinations.

(3) If such an apportionment is made, on what principle is it to be regulated?—One-third of the remaining appointments (after deducting the appointments

for the Statutory Service) should be given to the Natives of India, and two-thirds to the Europeans.

(4) Should there be an apportionment between the residents in the territories of the several administrations respectively, or between the members of the principal religious sects?—Provincial.

6. If an examination is held in India, should the successful candidates be required, as a condition obligatory, to proceed to England to complete their training?—It is not necessary for the successful candidates to go to England.

7. Are the young Natives obtained under the existing system of open competition in England the best as regards character and capacity who could be obtained under any system?—No.

III.—Uncovenanted Service.

1. Should the Uncovenanted Service be recruited only from Natives of India as described in Statute 33 Vic., Cap. 3, Section 6, or from all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty?—Natives of India only as described in Statute 33 Vic., Cap. 3, Section 6.

2. Should the recruitment be by competition, or by nomination, or by both systems combined; and if by both combined, should one system be applied to all offices or classes of offices, or should the system be varied with the class of offices?—By both systems combined for all offices.

3. Whatever system be adopted, should the recruitment be made by the several Administrations only from persons resident in the territories under such Administrations respectively, or with a preference for such residents?—Provincial.

4. If the existing Statutory Service is abolished, should the proportion of offices assigned to that Service be allotted to the Uncovenanted Service?—The Statutory system should be retained; but if it is abolished, we would give all the posts reserved for the Statutory Service to the Uncovenanted Service.

PROCEEDINGS

OF THE

PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION.

VOLUME I.—PROCEEDINGS RELATING TO THE PUNJAB.

SECTION III—SUB-SECTION B

PAGE

Sub-Section B—Written answers sent in by persons who were either invited or summoned to appear, but who were unable to attend the sittings of the Commission —

I.—H M. Plowden, Esq., Barrister-at-Law, Senior Judge, Chief Court, Punjab 52

II —Dewan Ram Nath, Statutory Service, District Judge, Hoshiarpur 54

III —Sardar Mahomed Afzul Khan, Statutory Service, Assistant Commissioner, Kohat, Punjab 63

PAGE

IV.—Chaudhri Rugnath Singh, President, Local Board, Delhi; Nominee of the Deputy Commissioner, Delhi 74

V.—Ghulam Ahmed Khan, Uncovenanted Service, Tahsildar, Nominee of the Deputy Commissioner, Amritsar 81

VI.—Maulvi Pirzada Mahomed Hussain, M A., Uncovenanted Service, Extra Assistant Commissioner, Punjab ... 90

VII.—C. L. Tupper, Esq., C.S., Junior Secretary to Government, Punjab .. 91

NOTE.

Incomplete replies were received from the Editor, *Aftab-i-Punjab* newspaper, Lahore, Editor, *Danish-i-Hind* newspaper, Multan, and Daulut Ram, Pleader, Chief Court, practising at Amritsar These have not been published.

No. I.

ANSWERS BY H. M. PLOWDEN, ESQ., BARRISTER-AT-LAW, SENIOR JUDGE, CHIEF COURT, PUNJAB.

VIII.—Composition, recruitment, &c., of the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services.

Vol. I, Sec. III, Sub-Sec. B.

H. M. *Plowden*, Esq.

184. WHATEVER system or systems may at present be adopted for the purpose of regulating appointments to the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, are any class or classes of persons expressly or practically excluded from such appointments?—I think it may be said that persons of European descent are practically excluded from appointment as Munsifs in this Province. So far as those appointments depend upon nomination, there are two causes—one, that such persons rarely seek them; the other, that there is an almost inexhaustible supply of eligible Native candidates. Looking to the ordinary limits of the jurisdiction exercised, the character of the suits generally tried, the fact that these suits are almost wholly between Natives, and to the localities in which many of the Courts are situated, the appointments are probably better adapted for Natives than for persons of European descent. Going further back as to the causes of the latter class not applying for these appointments, I think they may be found partly in the smallness of pay, the rarity of vacancies, the slowness of promotion, and the fact that there is practically no prospect of higher employment, with higher remuneration, under the existing system of judicial service.

185. If so, how is such exclusion justified?—This is virtually answered in the answer to 184.

189. Is it, in your opinion, necessary that there should be a proportion of Europeans either in the Subordinate Executive Service or in the Subordinate Judicial Service, or in both of those services?—Assuming that I am not strictly bound by the form of the question, my opinion is that it is highly expedient that there should be an admixture of Europeans in the Subordinate Services, both Executive and Judicial.

190. If so, on what grounds do you consider that an admixture of Europeans is necessary?—The ground of my opinion is that it is at any rate wise policy, if not a duty incumbent upon a Government, to utilise for the public service the best material that is available for that purpose. I believe that among Europeans, especially of pure descent, are to be found commonly qualities which are more rarely found among the Natives who are employed in these branches of the public service. By descent they have qualities, aided and developed by education (of a kind rarely, if ever, attainable in India), which are of the highest value in public servants,—self-reliance, independence, with a capacity for action on their own responsibility when occasion requires,—regard for truth, honesty and integrity, with a due sense of subordination and discipline. I intend no invidious comparisons, but I believe it to be the fact that every day sees more young Europeans come to India to look for a career—men of good birth and good education, such as an English schoolboy gets from his fellows, as well as from his masters and his books—but who have not the requisite knowledge or requisite skill in producing their knowledge at the right time so as to compete successfully in open competitions. I believe that among them is to be found admirable material for moulding into useful public servants, and I think it would be a misfortune if they were not utilised for these subordinate services.

191. What, in your opinion, is the requisite proportion to be maintained between Europeans and Natives in those services?—The proportion is a matter of degree, and necessarily arbitrary. Unless a fixed proportion is indispensable (it seems undesirable as fettering the Government), a majority of Natives would seem to me sufficient. There would in all probability always be a large majority

193. Has experience shown that Europeans serving in such capacities become dissatisfied with their position and with the general conditions as to pay, promotion and retiring annuity under which they hold their appointments, and that their efficiency as public servants is consequently impaired?—I have reason to believe that there has been disappointment, amounting to dissatisfaction, among this class in the Punjab with reference to the recent reorganization scheme, but the Punjab Government has probably far better information on this point than I can offer. I believe there has been no wilful diminution of efficiency, but it can hardly be doubted that a man who is satisfied with his condition and prospects is generally more efficient than a man who is not.

194. Are you in favor of laying down a rule that high educational capacity should be regarded as an essential qualification for appointment to the Subordinate Executive and to the Subordinate Judicial Services as defined for the purposes of these questions?—I am not sure that I understand what "high educational capacity" means. *Cæteris paribus* an educated man is, in my opinion, preferable for either service to an uneducated man As to the Executive Service, I say nothing. In the Judicial Service the better

general education a man has had, the greater the likelihood of his being efficient. In this service I would insist upon good general education and some technical education as a qualification for permanent appointment to the service.

195. If so, what test would you apply?—This is very much a matter of detail. University degrees should, I think, receive practical recognition for the Judicial Service, as they do at present for admission to pleaderships. In this service, as for pleaders, I would maintain a high standard. The standard for the Bar should fix the minimum. Over ground that is common to both, the Bench, I should think, unquestionably ought to be superior to the Bar, putting aside minute technical knowledge as an inconsiderable item.

197. Generally, what system do you advocate for filling appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services as above defined?—This is a wide question. Bearing in mind the existing system, the value of any suggestion depends largely upon the possibility of grafting a new scheme upon that already accepted; but I give my idea for what it may be worth—not, I believe, a new one, and almost obvious.

Judicial administration is only a branch of general administration, important but subordinate. It has, I think, this peculiarity, that the judiciary collectively can be kept wholly or partially, especially as regards civil jurisdiction, distinct from the Executive. Why cannot that body be recruited, at least in part, from persons otherwise wholly unconnected with the public service? This is done in the highest grades—witness the Barrister Judges of High Courts, and the same might, I think, be done without detriment, if not with advantage, in the lower grades.

I advocate the same principle in this matter that I have already mentioned, viz., that the best available material for the immediate purpose ought to be utilised by the Government.

The Chief Court Bench is attainable by members of the local Bar, whether European or Native; it is also attainable, at least theoretically, by members of the Uncovenanted Service who are distinguished for judicial capacity. Whatever the practical difficulty may be, in principle there can hardly be any sound objection to opening the lower grades of the Judicial Service both to the European and the Native Bar. It seems to me that there is here material capable of being utilised. I think that an attempt might be made with advantage to introduce a new element into the judiciary body, in the subordinate grades. I cannot undertake to advance any definite scheme. There may be political objections, especially as regards pension, to some of the features of such a scheme as I have to suggest. I would put professional men in a distinct category by themselves. I would empower Government (if special power be necessary) to appoint any pleader or advocate to any subordinate judicial appointment (subject to qualifications already prescribed for certain offices). I would give no pensions; but a scale of bonuses should be laid down, graduated according to length of service and average salary. I would give liberal rules as to leave, whether privilege or furlough; and every office should be held at the pleasure of Government, both as regards promotion and as regards duration. I would not reserve any fixed number of appointments for professional men. I think it would be an advantage, rather than otherwise, to the Government if the appointments were not held long and circulated briskly, presuming, as must be done, that selections were carefully and judiciously made. Experience at the Bar would be a recommendation, and men of standing among Natives would, I think, frequently be ready to accept service for short periods, without looking forward to any long judicial career. If they proved inefficient to a marked degree, Government could remove them; if the career did not satisfy them, they could resign and be without difficulty replaced from the same or other class.

I admit that the chief difficulty is to frame a scheme in detail, which should dovetail with the general system of administration, including the Judicial Branch. But I believe it would be a distinct gain to the administration if some portion of the judiciary, in its lower grades, were persons wholly unconcerned with executive administration at every stage of their employment by the Government. My own experience inclines me towards the belief that judicial officers often approach questions, not directly connected with the Executive Government, with some bias from which they would have been free but for their previous executive service, and for habits of thought which they acquire in that service. They look at the matter in hand from a different point of view to that which a person wholly independent of the Executive Government would take, and are wholly unconscious of any bias. But their judgment is nevertheless affected, and their decisions are not as absolutely impartial as they are undoubtedly intended to be. The results are not apparent to the Executive Government, but they are felt by the persons affected.

No. II.

ANSWERS BY DEWAN RAM NATH, STATUTORY SERVICE, DISTRICT JUDGE, HOSHIARPUR, PUNJAB.

I.—Working of the existing Statutory System.

Vol. I, Sec. III. Sub-Sec. B.

Dewan *Ram Nath.*

WHAT is the prevalent feeling in your Province regarding the existing Statutory system? If the feeling is one of dissatisfaction, is the dissatisfaction general or is it confined to certain sections of the community?—I have had no occasion to meet with and to speak on this point to men of every part of this Province. I am, therefore, unable to say anything about the prevalent feeling of the whole Province, but, as far as I know, the educated class, the members of the Uncovenanted Service, and the Statutory Civilians, do not appear to be fully satisfied.

2. What are the grounds upon which any such feeling is based?—The grounds are the following:—

(*a*) The educated want open competition.

(*b*) The Uncovenanted class object that selection is confined to high family and not to special services and loyalty to Government.

(*c*) The Statutory Civilians complain—

that the men selected remain in the position of an unwelcome guest in the society of European officers;

that the pay is not full and their position is not properly respected;

the Statute admits persons to specific appointments only, and not to membership in an organized service.

3. Is the feeling of dissatisfaction, if it exists, directed against the Statute itself (33 Vic., Chapter 3, Section 6), or is it directed against the rules framed thereunder?—The above grounds show that the Statute as well as the rules are objected to.

4. If the Statute itself is objected to, is it because its provisions admit persons to specific appointments only, and not to membership in an organized "Service"?—Yes; this is the objection against the Statute.

5. Are the objections based on other, and if so what, grounds?—No other grounds against the Statute as far as I know.

6. If a desire is felt for enrolment in a general service, what are the reasons for this desire?—Better prospects and position, and a desire to remove the distinction between different races, subjects of the parental Government.

7. What amendments do you advocate in Section 6 of the Statute?—I would recommend the following amendments:—

(*a*) In the beginning after the words "*proved merit and ability*" the words "*or of special services and loyalty*" should be added.

(*b*) Add a note under the section that the men so selected will be acknowledged as members of an organized Civil Service.

8. Do you consider that Section 6 of the Statute supplies such a definition of the words "Natives of India" as describes with sufficient clearness, fulness, and accuracy the various classes of persons for whose appointment to Covenanted posts it is desirable to provide?—I think it does.

9. If not, can you suggest any more complete or more satisfactory definition?—No.

10. If the objections are directed against the rules framed under the Statute, do they relate to the mode or modes of selection actually adopted?—Yes.

11. Do they relate to the general conditions in regard to pay, promotion, and retiring annuity under which Statutory Civilians hold their offices?—Yes; they relate to the general conditions in regard to pay and promotion.

12. Assuming the Statutory system to be retained, what amendments would you suggest in the rules with a view to remove any reasonable objections which may be felt to them?—I would recommend the following changes only:—

(1) The Statutory Civilian should get 75 per cent. of the pay of Covenanted officers of the same grade, instead of 64 per cent. as they do now.

(2) Members of the Uncovenanted Service should be more largely taken into the Statutory Civil Service.

(3) In selecting candidates, the distinguished services of a man and his loyalty to the Government should receive as much consideration as his merit and ability.

13. Do Statutory Civilians regard themselves as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the Covenanted Service through the competitive channel?—I do not know, as I have had no opportunity of ascertaining their feelings.

14. Are they so regarded by the general public?—I do not think that the general public care much about it.

15. By their *confères* in the Service who have entered through the competitive channel?—I have had no opportunity of seeing two such men in one station or in one place, and therefore cannot give a positive answer to this.

16. If such a feeling exists, on what grounds is it based?—None.

17 & 18. Do the general public view with any difference the status of Statutory Civilians and that of Uncovenanted Officers? If so, on what grounds?—I think they view a Statutory Civilian with greater respect and confidence than they view an Uncovenanted servant, because they know

that the former has chances of getting higher authority some day.

19. Do competitive Civilians, English and Native, and members of the Uncovenanted Service, respectively, stand on a footing of cordiality with Statutory Civilians, or is there any friction between them? —Members of the Uncovenanted Service feel jealous, but hold their tongues, and English officers regard the Statutory Civilians as a liberal host regards his unwelcome guests.

20. Do young men among the landed aristocracy or of good family display unwillingness to accept employment under the Statutory Rules?—I do not think so; but as such men generally do not receive high education, they do not venture to ask for the employment.

21. If so, what are the reasons for this unwillingness?—None.

22. Do young men among the landed aristocracy or of good family display unwillingness to accept posts in the Uncovenanted Service, and a willingness to accept employment under the Statutory Rules?—Those who are able to pass the examination appear to be more anxious to get into the Statutory Civil Service than the Uncovenanted Service.

23. If so, on what grounds?—Better prospects and position are the grounds for this choice.

II.—Mode of Selection of Statutory Civilians.

24. On the assumption* that the Statutory system is retained, how would appointment to the Statutory Service by nomination be regarded by influential sections of the Native community in your Province?—The educated amongst the Uncovenanted servants do not like to see young men going up; but other classes of Natives, and especially men of high family, would like to see their sons specially selected by Government for the service, and would be more loyal to the Government for this distinction and respect shown to their ancestry.

25. How would a system of nomination to be followed by a period of probation be regarded by the same classes?—I do not think that they have any objection to a man being appointed on probation.

26. Would a system of nomination, with or without probation, be likely to secure well-qualified persons?—A system of nomination with probation will prove more efficient.

27. Has experience actually shown such a system to secure well-qualified officers?—I have not been able to see the work of many of them, but some of them are no doubt good selections.

28. Do you consider that nominations should be confined to persons of proved merit and ability?—It should not be confined only to these qualifications.

29. If so, how do you consider that merit and ability should be held to have been proved for this purpose?—The period in which they serve on probation will show their merit and ability.

30. How would a system of limited competition amongst persons nominated for this purpose by the Local Governments or by the Universities, or by those authorities concurrently or alternately, be regarded?—Such a system would be regarded with satisfaction by the educated class, but not by members of the Uncovenanted Service.

31. In preference to either of the above systems (nomination and limited competition) would a system of open competition pure and simple for the Statutory Service commend itself to the Native community?—Only the educated class would like it.

32 & 33. If competition (whether limited or open) is preferred, should there be one competition for all India, or separate competitions in each Province? If there were only one general competition, how would you ensure a due proportion of appointments falling to the population of the several Provinces?—I think the whole of India should not be made subject to one competition.

34. Having regard to the varying educational standards reached in the several Provinces, and the varying conditions prevalent therein, is it possible to have any one system of selection for all India which would not result in the inhabitants of some Provinces being more or less excluded from a due share of appointments?—Impossible for the present.

35. Under any of the three systems of nomination, limited competition, and open competition, would you prescribe any tests of preliminary qualifications on the part of nominees or candidates in regard to (1) age, (2) intellectual capacity, (3) moral, social, and physical fitness?—Yes.

36. If so, what should be the tests under each of the heads specified?—(1) The age of Hindus can be tested by their horoscope, and Mahomedans should be compelled to produce birth certificates of their local Municipalities, or should prove it otherwise if they are not residents of a Municipal town—

(2) Intellectual capacity,—certificates of School-masters and Principals of Colleges can prove it in my opinion.

(3) Moral, social, and physical fitness.

Physical fitness should be testified by commissioned medical officers, and moral and social fitness by local inquiries.

37. Do you consider that (after selection whether by nomination or competition) there should be a period of probation?—Certainly.

38. If so, what should be the duration of the probationary period?—Two years.

39. Should the period of probation be passed in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service, or of the Covenanted Service, or in what other manner?—I think the period should be passed in the Uncovenanted Service; for instance, the candidate should

* The questions which follow, down to No. 46 inclusive, are put subject to the same assumption.

Vol. I. Sec. III. Sub-Sec. B.

Dewan *Ram Nath.*

first be appointed as an Extra Assistant Commissioner; and if during two years he has proved his fitness, he might be taken into the higher service.

40. Do you consider that after selection and before entering on probation (or on duty) the person selected should undergo special training?—It may perhaps be better that one year of his probation be passed in the Settlement, and one year in the Judicial branch of the service; but no other training before entering on probation appears to be necessary.

41. If so, should the special training be carried out in India or in England?—If it is necessary to give him a special training, it will be proper to give it in India. It is true that a young man going to England will receive more information; but this system will, on the one hand, be very expensive, and, on the other hand, may not be liked by some men who do not wish to see their sons going to England either by reason of caste prejudices or on some other grounds.

42. If in India, would it be possible, and, if possible advisable, to establish an Indian Civil Service College on the basis of the Haileybury College which formerly existed in England?—If special training be considered necessary, such a college would do very well.

43. If you do not consider special training in England essential, would you encourage nominees or selected candidates to visit England with a view to add to their qualifications for the Service?—Yes, I would encourage them.

44. If so, what form should such encouragement take?—I think after five years service, and before the close of the sixth year such men should be allowed six months' special leave on full pay to go to England, and the man who avails himself of this leave and benefits himself by his visit to England should receive a personal allowance until he reaches the next grade of his promotion, and be always regarded senior to those who are above him in his grade, but have not been able to go to England.

45. Should it be offered before, or during, or after the probationary period, if any, through which nominees or selected candidates may be required to pass?—As I have stated above, the candidates should avail themselves of the benefit within six years of the date of their permanent employment.

46. Should it be offered before or after the nominees or selected candidates enter on their duties?—I have replied to it in Nos. 44 and 45.

47. Are you in favor of the establishment of scholarships tenable by Natives in England for the purpose of enabling them to qualify for the Civil or Statutory Service?—No.

48. If so, how would you connect such a scheme with the selection of Natives for employment in the higher administrative posts in India?—None.

49. Do you think that any distinction should be made between the emoluments of nominees or selected candidates who have been trained in England, or have gone to England to add to their qualifications, and those who have not?—Yes, I have said so in my reply to No. 44.

50. If the opportunity of residence in England at a University for two years with a sufficient allowance were offered to nominees or selected candidates, is it likely that it would be taken advantage of to any great extent?—Not in this Province.

51. If the system of examination in England were revised with the result that Natives availed themselves of it in considerable numbers, would it still be necessary to retain the Statutory system?—Yes; it would be necessary.

52. If so, to what appointments or classes of appointments would you restrict the latter system, and what conditions over and above those already existing would you impose?—If it is decided that the system of examination in England be made compulsory, I would then restrict the latter system to all judicial appointments and would not impose any other conditions beyond those which now exist.

III.—Competition in England for the Indian Civil Service.

53. Is competition of Natives in the examination in England favorably looked upon by large and important classes in India?—No.

54. Should additional facilities be given to Natives for proceeding to England and entering the Indian Civil Service by the channel of the English competition?—Yes.

55. If so, what form or forms should such facilities take?—I would suggest the following forms of facilities:—

- reserved passages in the ships, so as to preserve caste;
- the appointment of some men in England to watch their conduct and prevent them from taking any wrong course or falling into temptation;
- the grant of pecuniary assistance by the Government;
- the extension of the limit of age;
- the removal of such subjects from the examination as afford special difficulties to the Native candidates.

56. What conditions, if any, should be attached to them?—No conditions whatever.

57. What is your opinion as to giving Statutory appointments to Natives who, though they may have failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, have shown merit in the English competition?—I think that they should get employment with those Statutory Civilians who have passed an examination in India.

58. Asuming it to be advisable to appoint to the Statutory Service in India Natives who have failed in the English competition, should such persons receive the same training as successful candidates in England, and be subject to the same final examination?—Yes.

59. Should they, on appointment to the Statutory Service in India, be subject to the same incidents as apply to other persons appointed under the Statutory Rules?—Of course.

60. Can you say what number of Natives belonging to your Province have presented themselves annually at the competitive examination in England, and what degree of success they attained?—One or two appeared, but none passed.

61. What class or classes of Natives in your Province readily go to England?—Sikhs, Native Christians, and Mahomedans go readily, and men of other classes have also gone, but not so readily.

62. Are objections entertained to going to England; and, if so, what are they, and by what classes in particular are they felt?—Yes, and the objections are the following:

the heavy costs of going, and coming, and living there;

loss of caste;

apprehensions entertained with regard to the total change in dress and social manners generally found in those who have visited England.

63—65. Should the examination for Natives in England be distinct in standards and conditions from that for English candidates, or should there be one and the same examination for all? If the standards and conditions were different, how would it be possible to compare the results in the two examinations so as to bring out one list in order of merit? Would it under such circumstances be desirable to allot a fixed proportion of appointments to each of the two examinations?—The examination need not be distinct, but a little facility may be allowed to Natives in the shape of grace marks, especially in those subjects which are admittedly difficult for them.

66. If a fixed proportion of appointments were allotted for a Native examination in England, do you consider that, in view of the objections against a voyage to England and life there, the cost thereof and the chances of failure, a sufficient number of suitable candidates from your Province would be available to make the competition a real competition?—No; very few would go up.

67. If the examinations were distinct, what should be the limits of age for the Native examination?—Under twenty-three and above nineteen years of age.

68. What should be the conditions, nature, and subjects of the separate Native examination?—I have not recommended a separate examination.

69. Assuming only one examination in England for both English and Native candidates, do you consider that the subjects and standards of examination and the conditions as to age and other matters in any respect place Native candidates at a disadvantage as compared with English candidates?—Certainly they do.

70. If so, in what respects are Native candidates placed at a disadvantage, and what alterations would you recommend with a view to remove that disadvantage?—The standard of age combined with the fact that a European has greater facilities of mastering the Western languages than an Indian, particularly place the Natives at a disadvantage. It is therefore necessary to have the alterations suggested in Nos. 63 and 67 introduced.

71. If there should be only one examination for all candidates, should the limits of age for Natives be higher than those at present fixed for European candidates; and, if so, what should the limits for Native candidates be?—Yes, and the higher limit in my opinion should be four years in advance of the present standard.

72. If higher limits of age were fixed for Native than for European candidates, might not the latter complain that they were placed at a disadvantage?—There being special difficulties in the way of the Native to learn the Western languages which are foreign to him, I think it would be nothing but just to show them favor, and am therefore inclined to think that any reasonable European candidate will not complain of this; besides there would be no objection if the European standard of age is also increased.

73. What is the average age at which Natives at the Indian Universities pass the examinations for F.A., B.A., and M.A. respectively?—The average age at which they pass the examinations is the following:—F.A., nineteen years; B.A., twenty-one years; M.A., twenty-two years.

74. From what classes of Native society are the persons who graduate at the Indian Universities usually drawn in your Province?—I have no means of ascertaining the facts connected with this question, but I think Hindus are the foremost in education.

IV.—Competition in India for the Indian Civil Service.

75. Do you advocate a competition in India for the Civil Service simultaneously with the competition in England, the same question-papers being used at both examinations?—Yes, if the same means of giving education are adopted here too, and the grace recommended by me in No. 63 is allowed.

76. How would this method of selection be regarded by the Native community generally?—It would be regarded with much satisfaction and gratitude.

77. If you advocate such a system, would you restrict the competition in India to Natives, and that in England to English candidates, or would you admit both classes freely to either examination?—I would admit both classes freely to either examination.

78. If Native candidates were admitted to the competition in England, while English candidates were excluded from the competition in India, on what ground could this distinction be justified?—I am not in favor of this distinction being kept up.

79. Do you consider that the educational institutions available in India are at present capable of giving the very high class education which it was the object of the competitive system, as introduced in 1855, to secure?—I think with a little improvement they would be capable of giving such an education.

80. Would an open competition in India be likely to give decided advantages to any particular class or classes of the Native community over others?—It would give a decided advantage to the lower and the middle classes over the aristocracy.

81. Would it be likely to lead to the undue preponderance of any one class or caste in the public service?—No.

82. Do you think there are any objections on political or administrative grounds to open competition in India?—There are.

83. Would the introduction of an open competitive examination in India have the effect of deterring cadets of leading families from aspiring to enter the ranks of the Civil Service?—It would.

84. Under such a system how would it be possible to provide against the Natives of a Province in which education is comparatively backward being excluded from appointments in their own Province?—The inhabitants of backward Provinces should be given opportunities of acquiring education in those Provinces in which education is in advance, and if they fail to do so they should not aspire to the service.

85. Would a system of provincial examinations be preferable to one examination for the whole of India?—I think it would be preferable.

86. Under a system of open competition in India would the successful candidates be regarded as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the Service through the channel of the open competition in England?—They will be so regarded by English officers, because those Natives who receive their training in England will be more suitable to their society.

87. Supposing that the Covenanted appointments were allotted in fixed proportions, a certain number to be obtained by competition in England, and a certain number by competition in India, the examinations in each case being open on fairly equal conditions to Native and English candidates alike, and the Statutory system being abolished, how would such a system be viewed?—I think it would be viewed with satisfaction with modified conditions as to age, &c.

88. If an open competition were established in India, what should be the preliminary qualifications required on the part of candidates in regard to age?—Age should not be over twenty-three.

89. In regard to minimum educational attainments?—Not less than the degree of B.A.

90. In regard to moral, social, and physical fitness?—Must have an unimpeachable moral character, and must be of good social position, and free from any constitutional disease.

91. In other respects (if any)?—None.

92 & 93. Should the subjects and conditions of the examination be the same as those prescribed for the competitive examination in England, or should they be different? If different, what should they be?—They should not be different except as regards classical languages.

94. Circumstances being different in the case of persons who enter through the examination in England and of persons who enter through the examination in India, is there any reason why the rules in regard to pay, leave, pension, &c., should not also be different?—The rules must be different to some extent, but the present rules require modification in favor of the Natives.

95. Should successful candidates go through a period of special study in India like the English candidates who spend two years in special preparation?—Decidedly.

96. Would it be preferable (*a*) to require them to go to England, or (*b*) to give them the option of going to England, suitable allowances being given to enable them to prosecute their studies there?—Going to England, as I have stated before, should be left to their option.

97. Should successful candidates at the Indian competition be required to pass through a probationary period before final appointment?—Yes.

98. If so, what should be the duration of the probationary period?—Two years at the utmost.

99. How should it be passed—in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service, or otherwise?—In the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service.

V.—Promotion from the Uncovenanted Service.

100. What special provision, if any, do you think should be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of deserving members of the Uncovenanted Service?—Excellent service or high merits should be the special conditions required.

101. If such appointments are made, should they be restricted to the holders of any particular classes of appointments in the Uncovenanted Service; and, if so, what classes?—I would suggest no such restriction. It should be entirely left to the discretion of the Local Government to make a proper selection from any department.

102. Should persons so appointed be appointed provisionally and be required to pass through a period of probation before final confirmation?—No. The mere fact of such a person's extraordinary selection would be a guarantee of his abilities, and therefore he need not pass any period of probation.

103. Should provision be made for the appointment of qualified members of the Uncovenanted Service to the higher Covenanted offices without requiring them to pass through the lower grades?—I think there should be such a provision, otherwise

it will sometimes be hard for a member of the Uncovenanted Service to have his pay reduced in order to enter into the Covenanted Service, and this would afford an insuperable difficulty to the Government.

104. If certain appointments in the Covenanted grades are set apart for the Statutory Service, should a fixed proportion of those appointments be expressly reserved for persons of proved merit andability in the Uncovenanted Service?—Decidedly.

105. Should special provision be made for the promotion to Covenanted posts of European members of the Uncovenanted Service?—Special provision is unnecessary; all Uncovenanted servants, whether Europeans or Natives, should be made subject to the same rules.

106. Should special provision be made for the promotion to such posts of Eurasian or other members of the Uncovenanted Service, who, though not Natives of pure descent, fall within the meaning attached in the Statute of 1870 to the term "Natives of India?"—No special provision is required as they are Natives of India within the meaning of the Statute.

107. Ought not the Uncovenanted Service, equally with the Covenanted Service, to be open to all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty who possess the qualifications that may be from time to time prescribed?—It should be.

108. If the Uncovenanted Service is closed to any natural-born subjects of Her Majesty, on what grounds, bearing in mind the terms of Acts of Parliament and Her Majesty's Proclamation of 1st November 1858, is this to be justified?—No ground whatever.

VI.—Pay, Leave and Pension for Natives of India appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than through the channel of competition in England.

109. Is the rate* of pay at present granted to Statutory Civilians during probation and on final appointment respectively sufficient?—No, it is not sufficient.

* Two hundred rupees a month on first appointment as probationers. Two hundred and fifty rupees a month after passing the Departmental Examination by the lower standard. After passing the Departmental Examination by the higher standard (unless specially exempted) and after having been confirmed in their appointments, 64 per cent. of what would be the gross pay or salary of the office if it were held by a Covenanted Civil Servant appointed after competitive examination in England.

110. If not, on what grounds do you consider it insufficient, and what rates of pay should, in your opinion, be granted to Statutory Civilians (*a*) while on probation, and (*b*) on final confirmation in their appointments?—It is true that amongst the Natives the ordinary scale of living is cheap, but a man raised to distinction by the Government must live or should be required to live on a grand scale in order to keep up his position. By the deduction of 36 per cent. I am afraid he will be unable to improve his public and social way of life. Moreover, it is hard that a man, for instance, a District Judge of the 2nd grade, should draw Rs. 768, while an Extra Assistant Commissioner of the 1st grade being under him should receive Rs. 800. Again the same District Judge when raised to the first grade is not even equal in pay to a European District Judge of the 2nd grade.

I am, however, alive to the fact that a European officer is really entitled to get higher pay than a Native; but I think a Native officer, whether on probation or confirmed in his post, should get as pay and allowances 25 per cent. less than the European officer, and not 36 per cent. as provided by the present rules.

111. Would these rates of pay be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the Uncovenanted Service?—There should be no distinction in pay, whether the man is selected by the Indian competition, or whether taken from the Uncovenanted Service.

112. Would they be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the professional classes?—I would allow no relaxation of the rules in the case of professional classes.

113. If not, how would you treat, in regard to pay, persons selected from these two classes if appointed to the lowest grade of the Covenanted Service?—No remark.

114. How would you treat, in regard to pay, such persons if appointed to any of the higher Covenanted posts without being required to pass through the lower grades?—No remark.

115. Do you consider that a difference should be maintained between the rates of pay granted to Covenanted Civilians, who enter through the competitive channel in England, and to persons holding Covenanted posts who do not enter through that channel?—Yes. If they get full pay it will afford a good encouragement to the people to go to England.

116. If so, what would you consider the fair rate of reduction to be made in the case of persons holding Covenanted posts who do not enter through the competitive channel in England?—Not more than twenty-five per cent. less.

117. Would you approve of an arrangement by which the pay of appointments would be a fixed sum to be drawn by the holder whether he is a Covenanted or a Statutory Civilian, with an additional staff allowance to be drawn by those only who enter the service through the examination in England?—No.

118. Can you suggest any other way of providing different rates of pay?—No, I cannot.

119. If you consider there should be no difference of pay, how do you justify the application of the same rates of pay in the case of Natives who have satisfied the very high tests required by the examination in England and Natives who have not?—I have said above, in answer to No. 115, that there should be a difference.

120. On the same assumption, what are your reasons for holding that the high rate of pay which is considered to be necessary to secure the services of persons of tested qualifications in a country far from their homes, and under various other unfavorable conditions, should be given to persons whose qualifications have not been so tested and who serve in their own native country?—On that very ground I have already suggested a deduction of twenty-five per cent.

121. Have you any remarks to make on the leave rules embodied in the Civil Leave Code which apply to Statutory Civilians?—No.

122.—At what age do you consider that Natives appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than through the competitive channel in England should be entitled to retire on pension?—At fifty-five years of age.

123. After what length of service do you consider that such persons should be entitled to retire on pension?—After twenty-five years' service.

124. At what age should they be obliged to retire on pension?—At sixty years of age.

125. After what length of service should they be obliged to retire on pension?—After thirty years' service.

126. What amount of pension should, in your opinion, be granted to Natives so appointed if they serve the prescribed period for voluntary and compulsory retirement respectively?—Voluntary Rs. 5,000 a year. Compulsory Rs. 6,000 a year.

127. If, before serving the prescribed period for pension, they are compelled to retire on medical certificate, what gratuity, if any, would you give them?—I would recommend the existing rules of gratuity and annuity.

VII.—General.

128. How far is the existing system of education in the higher schools and colleges in India well adapted for training young men to the public service? Can you suggest any improvements?—I think they require some improvement, but I am unable at a moment's notice to suggest anything definitely. The Educational Department will supply full information on the point.

129. In 1854 Lord Macaulay's Committee were of opinion that the best, the most liberal, and the most finished education to be procured in England was a necessary qualification for admission to the Civil Service. Do Indian Schools and Colleges at present supply an education of so high a standard?—I do not think that they give so high an education as is given in England, but it is not impossible to improve them to that extent.

130. Do you consider that Indian schools at present develop the force of character and other qualities required for English administration?—I think they do. If there is any fault it cannot be attributed to the system of education, but to the fact that, out of school, the students do not get into proper society.

131. Do we now obtain for Government service Natives of the classes who under Native rule carried on the civil administration of the country?—The appointments in the Government service have been largely held by such classes up to this time; but as the number of appointments has so extensively increased, and as education is imparted to all classes, a portion of the appointments has naturally fallen to the share of those who were called artizan and soldier classes under the old rule. The times are so changed that it is now difficult to look for a particular class for particular service, or to expect that the representatives of the old ruling classes will be more efficient.

132. If not, where must we look for representatives of these classes, and how do you consider that their services could be best obtained?—As I have stated above they are already in Government service.

133. How far would any system of appointment which involves a journey to and residence in England be regarded by the Native community as open to objection on the ground that it requires Hindu candidates to abandon their caste as a condition of entering the Civil Service?—To a great extent.

134. How far would such a system be regarded as open to objection on the ground that it restricts the field of selection to those candidates who are wealthy enough to undertake the cost of a journey to and residence in England?—To a great extent.

135. Are the Natives who go to England from your Province for purposes of education limited to the wealthier classes?—Certainly.

136. Are they limited to any particular section of the community, or to any particular creed?—No.

137. Does a voyage to or residence in England involve the loss of social position or other unfavorable consequences in the case of any section of the Native community?—Yes, amongst the higher classes of the Hindus.

138. Does it result in placing those Natives who undertake it more or less out of touch and sympathy with their fellow-countrymen on their return to India?—Yes, amongst the higher classes of the Hindus.

139. Would the requirement of a temporary residence in England as a condition precedent to or following on appointment to the Government service, have the effect of excluding from such appointment any considerable or important section of the Native community?—I think it would.

140. If the Statutory system is discontinued, should provision be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of Natives who, for religious or other sufficient reasons, are unable or unwilling to undertake a journey to and residence in England?—Yes.

141. If so, what provision should be made for this purpose?—I have suggested this in my answers to previous questions.

142. If the Statutory system is discontinued, do you consider that special provision should be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of capable members of the professional classes?—Yes.

143. If so, what provision should be made for this purpose?—That any member of the professional class of special ability and character may be entitled to higher appointments, if no one equally competent is to be had from the Native Covenanted or Uncovenanted Services.

144. Whatever system or systems may be adopted, ought power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts candidates of high family subject to such antecedent guarantees of fitness as may be considered sufficient in each case?—Certainly.

145. Ought similar power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts persons who have proved their merit and ability in Government service, or in the exercise of a profession, without preliminary examination or competition?—Yes.

146. If a thorough knowledge of English were made an essential qualification for appointment to Covenanted posts, would the field of selection in the case of persons already in the Uncovenanted Service, or engaged in the exercise of a profession, be unduly limited thereby?—I think so.

147. If such is likely to be the case, could the difficulty be obviated by requiring proficiency in the English language to be tested by periodical examinations after selection, but during a probationary period?—I do not think so.

148. Should provision be made for the occasional appointment, in very special and exceptional cases, to Covenanted posts of persons of known ability and local influence whom, although they may never have held office and may not possess special professional qualifications, and although their age may exceed the limit laid down for untried candidates, it might nevertheless be considered desirable to appoint to the higher grades for political or other reasons?—I think such a provision to be necessary.

149. Would it be desirable to rule that the proportion of persons being Mahomedans and Hindus respectively, who are from time to time, or over a series of years appointed to the Covenanted ranks in any Province, should bear a certain relation to the number of the two classes composing the population of the Province concerned?—I think it would.

150. What classes, ranks or professions of the Native community should be included among Mahomedans and Hindus, respectively, for the purpose of ascertaining the proportion of the population of each of those classes in the several Provinces?—I have not the necessary materials to answer this question satisfactorily.

151. How far would appointments in each Province to Covenanted posts be restricted to Natives of the Province concerned?—I think one-fourth of the Covenanted Civil Service.

152. How would the following scheme be regarded by the Native community?—

(1) The Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of European officers, admission being by competition in England confined to European candidates only;

(2) The appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, Natives only being eligible—

Thankfully, if a certain number of posts in the Covenanted Civil Service are reserved for the Natives, and a proper mode of selection adopted, the system would be looked upon with much favor by the Native community.

153. How would you regard such a scheme?—I would approve of the scheme.

154. How would the Native community regard the following?—

(1) The Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of appointments to be filled by competition in England to which Natives and Europeans alike would be admitted;

(2) The appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, both Natives and Europeans being eligible?—I think the community would like it.

155. How would you regard such a scheme?—On my own part I would like it.

156. If either of the above schemes were adopted, how would the Native community view a proposal to combine the higher appointments of the Uncovenanted Service with the appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service, so as to form an enlarged Civil Service to be recruited in India?—I think they would view it with satisfaction.

157. How would you view such a proposal?—I would like it.

158. How would the Native community regard the following scheme?—

(1) A certain number of appointments in the Covenanted Civil Service to be reserved for Natives;

(2) A certain proportion of that number to be filled by competition or by some other system in India;

(3) The remainder to be filled by competition in England?—If the reserved appointments are filled up by a proper mode of selection, I think they would like it.

159. How would you regard such a scheme?—I would also approve of it.

160. Assuming a system of nomination or of limited competition among nominated candidates, would Native opinion be in favor of giving a preference, as between candidates possessed of certain preliminary essential qualifications and having on general grounds fairly equal claims, in the following or any other order, to—

(*a*) members of families of tried loyalty and distinguished service;

(*b*) persons of good social status and influence in the country; and

(*c*) persons of superior educational attainments, such as persons who have taken the degree of M.A.?—I think that the Native community would wish that preference should be given to candidates possessing the qualifications mentioned in the question, and I also think that the order of their preference would also be the same as that given in the question, though the educated class would give preference to education over other things.

161. What is your opinion as to giving such preference?—I would highly recommend the system and the order mentioned therein.

162. How would the Native community regard a system of nomination on the ground of merit and ability shown in the service of Government, or in the exercise of a profession, alternating with a system of selection by means of competition, whether entirely open or amongst nominated candidates?—They would regard it favorably.

163. How would you regard such a system?—I would recommend it.

164. If the Statutory system were maintained, and if a probationary period were required from nominees or selected candidates before final appointment, would it be necessary to insist upon such probationary period in all cases, *e.g.*, in the case of a person who has done good service in the Uncovenanted ranks?—No.

165. In the case of persons nominated from the professional classes, is it desirable that a probationary period should be prescribed?—I think so.

166. If so, is it necessary that the incidents of such period as to duration and pay should be the same as those attached thereto in the case of Statutory Civilians appointed on probation to the lowest grade of the Covenanted Service?—Yes.

167. On what principles should the promotion of Natives appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than by the channel of the competition in England be regulated?—Promotion should be regulated by the ordinary course of seniority in service.

168. Would you regulate such promotion only by considerations of fitness and approved personal merit?—No.

169. Should Natives appointed to Covenanted posts be required to pass the Departmental examinations?—Yes, if they have not already passed a similar examination in the junior service.

170—172. Should they be required to pass the Departmental examinations by both the lower and higher standards within their probationary period, subject to the penalty of forfeiture of appointment if they fail to pass within that time, unless the period is for special reasons extended? *or* Should a period longer than the probationary period be allowed for passing the Departmental examination by the higher standard? *or* Should the present rule be maintained under which probationers may be confirmed in their appointments at the close of the probationary period of two years, provided that they pass within that period the Departmental examination by the lower standard prescribed for Covenanted Civilians appointed in England, no obligatory period being fixed for passing the higher standard, but no promotion or increase of pay being attainable, until the higher standard examination has been passed, and power being retained to the Government to dispense with the services of a Statutory Civilian who may fail to pass by the higher standard within a reasonable time?—I think that the present rule will do very well.

173. What rule in regard to passing the Departmental examinations should be applied in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts on the ground of merit and ability proved in the service of Government or in the exercise of a profession?—No additional rule appears to be necessary.

174 & 175. Should subjects of Native States be eligible for appointment to Covenanted posts in British India? If so, should this be extended to all Natives States in alliance with the Crown, or only to those in subordinate alliance?—They should not be eligible.

176 & 177. What system, if any, is at present adopted in your Province for bringing into the public service persons who, from their position or otherwise, cannot be expected to enter the service of Government in the lowest grades, and for giving them the necessary apprenticeship? Does the system work well, and what improvements can you suggest?—No such system exists in this Province unless we consider the Statutory Civil Service in this light.

No. III.

ANSWERS BY SARDAR MAHOMED AFZAL KHAN, STATUTORY SERVICE, ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER, KOHAT, PUNJAB.

I.—Working of the existing Statutory System.

Vol. I, Sec. III, Sub-Sec. B.

Sardar *M. Afzal Khan.*

WHAT is the prevalent feeling in your Province regarding the existing Statutory system? If the feeling is one of dissatisfaction, is the dissatisfaction general or is it confined to certain sections of the community?

2. What are the grounds upon which any such feeling is based?—1 & 2.—I venture to observe that, like all other countries, India is inhabited by three classes of people besides the ruling chiefs, namely:—*First*—the petty chiefs and head-men of their clans, the landed aristocracy, including those descended from individuals holding higher positions in former days who, in consideration of such rank and position, gained the esteem of and became influential among the Native community. *Second*—this class comprises landlords of note, the village head-men, and the descendants of those who held high situations under Native rule, also men carrying on large trade and those who by their own exertion had raised themselves from the third class to higher standing under the British rule. *Third*—this class is composed of zemindars, petty tradesmen, shopkeepers, and other day-labourers and handicraftsmen, etc. In the beginning the system of conveying Western education to the masses was started by different missionaries in the Province who, in view to diffusing Christianity among the people, established Mission Schools at various stations and fixed scholarships as an inducement to them. Of these privileges, the men of the third class generally took advantage by sending their children to such schools. Besides the free education which they received at the hands of their kind missionaries, these boys brought home, monthly, small sums of money given them in the way of scholarships or occasional presents or gifts. The boys having thus benefited by the education and grown up to manhood entered the Government service and gradually obtained suitable appointments, and eventually attracted general respect and entered into good society, thus becoming merged among men defined to be in the second class. But, on the contrary, the men of the first and second classes abstained from sending their boys to the Mission schools, and hesitated to have them taught English, fearing lest some of the boys might be converted to Christianity, as had been the case with some of the boys of the third class. It is these self-helped boys, who have afterwards become men of rank and position, who dislike the Statutory system of admission to the Civil Service, and who wish to remove the distinction heretofore kept up between them and the upper (or men of the real first and second) classes, thus bringing themselves on to an equal footing with the leaders of society and the chiefs. The men of the first and second class mentioned above approve of the system very much, as it keeps up the distinction between them and their co-aspirers who originally belonged to the third class. The uneducated masses of the third class, who form the bulk of the population, do not take any interest in questions of this sort, and have not much to do in such matters, yet undoubtedly they prefer to have the first and second classes in Government employ rather than those of the third or upstart class of officials.

3. Is the feeling of dissatisfaction, if it exists, directed against the Statute itself (33 Vic., Chapter 3, Section 6), or is it directed against the rules framed thereunder?—The dissatisfaction felt, as stated above, by the self-made people seems to be against the Statute itself.

4. If the Statute itself is objected to, is it because its provisions admit persons to specific appointments only and not to membership in an organized "Service?"—It is objected to in its entirety by the persons indicated above.

5. Are the objections based on other, and, if so, what grounds?—Dealt with in answers to questions 1 and 2.

6. If a desire is felt for enrolment in a general service, what are the reasons for this desire?—I do not see that the existing provisions require any amendment.

7. What amendments do you advocate in Section 6 of the Statute?—None.

8. Do you consider that Section 6 of the Statute supplies such a definition of the words "Native of India" as describes with sufficient clearness, fulness, and accuracy the various classes of persons for whose appointment to Covenanted posts it is desirable to provide?—The definition of the term "Native of India" is amply sufficient.

9. If not, can you suggest any more complete or more satisfactory definition?—No.

10 to 12. If the objections are directed against the rules framed under the Statute, do they relate to the mode or modes of selection actually adopted? Do they relate to the general conditions in regard to pay, promotion, and retiring annuity under which Statutory Civilians hold their offices?—Assuming the Statutory system to be retained, what amendments would you suggest in the Rules with a view to remove any reasonable objections which may be felt to them?—I have no remarks to make under these heads.

Vol. I, Sec. III, Sub-Sec. B.

Sardar *M. Afzal Khan.*

13. Do Statutory Civilians regard themselves as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the Covenanted Service through the competitive channel?—Of course the Statutory Civilians do not regard themselves as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the Covenanted Service through the competitive channel.

14. Are they so regarded by the general public?—Yes, but the general public hold them in lighter esteem than their European *confrères* (or European Covenanted Civilians of the same rank) owing to the latter's nationality, they being members of the ruling nation. However, in no case would the Statutory Civilians be thought inferior to Natives entering the Covenanted Service through the competitive channel; nor up to the present has any Native in this Province entered the Covenanted Service through the competitive channel.

15. By their *confrères* in the Service who have entered through the competitive channel?—Officers of high birth and broad views make no distinction, but some of the narrow-minded European officers do seem to regard them as inferior to themselves.

16. If such a feeling exists, on what ground is it based?—The distinction of nationality between the ruler and the ruled.

17. Do the general public view with any difference the status of Statutory Civilians and that of Uncovenanted officers?—Yes.

18. If so, on what grounds?—In consideration of their high birth, as the members of the Statutory Civilians come from selected leading families of society and occupy a higher position than the Uncovenanted members of the Civil Service, while the latter are mostly recruited from among the general public and do not possess such a high position as the Statutory officers do.

19. Do competitive Civilians, English and Native, and members of the Uncovenanted Service, respectively, stand on a footing of cordiality with Statutory Civilians, or is there any friction between them?—The liberal-minded members of the three branches of the Service deal cordially with each other, but some narrow-minded Europeans hold both the Covenanted and Uncovenanted Native officers in a lighter sense of regard.

As regards the feeling of the Uncovenanted members towards the Statutory Civilians, I think some of the former cherish envious feeling against their Statutory Covenanted countrymen. But, as above stated, liberal-minded Europeans regard alike both the European and Native members of the Covenanted Service; and Native Uncovenanted officers of good sense look upon the Statutory Civilians with the proper esteem due to them. Anyhow, the opinion likely to be held by Natives entering the Covenanted Service through the competitive channel towards the Statutory members of that Service must remain the same for some further period.

Natives entering the service through the competitive channel will be looked upon by Europeans and also by Native Uncovenanted Civilians in the same manner as the Statutory Civilian for some time to come.

20. Do young men among the landed aristocracy or of good family display unwillingness to accept employment under the Statutory Rules?—No, but rather take pride in doing so.

21. If so, what are the reasons for this unwillingness?—They have no reasons whatever for any unwillingness.

22. Do young men among the landed aristocracy or of good family display unwillingness to accept posts in the Uncovenanted Service, and a willingness to accept employment under the Statutory Rules?—The young men of the landed aristocracy, etc., prefer employment under the Statutory Rules to the Uncovenanted Service.

23. If so, on what grounds?—Because of the distinction it gives as compared with the sort of people selected for the latter appointments.

II.—Mode of Selection of Statutory Civilians.

24. On the assumption* that the Statutory system is retained, how would appointment to the Statutory Service by nomination be regarded by influential sections of the Native community in your Province?—Members of the first and pure second class, defined above, prefer the nomination system of appointment, while those of the third class, who have risen to the status of the second class prefer the competitive system.

25. How would a system of nomination to be followed by a period of probation be regarded by the same classes?—Any period of probation will be regarded with disfavor by men of the two upper classes, while those of the third class may like it.

26. Would a system of nomination, with or without probation, be likely to secure well-qualified persons?—Nomination followed by probation would be advantageous and preferable, as the Government will thus have the means of testing the nominee's merits, etc.

27 Has experience actually shown such a system to secure well-qualified officers?—Yes.

28. Do you consider that nominations should be confined to persons of proved merit and ability?—To persons of influence and good birth combined with ability and merit who might be of great use for political purposes.

29. If so, how do you consider that merit and ability should be held to have been

* The questions which follow, down to No 46 inclusive, are put subject to the same assumption.

proved for this purpose?—By certificates obtained by the candidate from the Education Department and by the opinion of the civil authorities.

30. How would a system of limited competition amongst persons nominated for this purpose by the Local Governments or by the Universities, or by those authorities concurrently or alternately, be regarded?—No system of competition, whether limited or open, will be willingly accepted by members of the first and pure second class.

31. In preference to either of the above systems (nomination and limited competition), would a system of open competition, pure and simple, for the Statutory Service, commend itself to the Native community?—Open competition may be liked by self-made men or their descendants, but not by others.

32. If competition (whether limited or open) is preferred, should there be one competition for all India or separate competitions in each Province?—Should a system of competition be brought into force, it should be a limited one, and for each Province separately.

33. If there were only one general competition, how would you ensure a due proportion of appointments falling to the population of the several Provinces?—Candidates of one Province should not be eligible for appointment in another Province.

For instance, if the pass marks for an examination are 400 to 600, and candidates A, B, C, D, and E, belonging to Bengal, and F, G, and H, from the Punjab, compete in the same examination, and the set of questions for the two Provinces is one and the same, and there are three candidates to be selected for appointment, two for Bengal, and one for Punjab, the candidates undergoing such examination obtain marks as under—

A of Bengal Province	...	600
B of ditto	...	550
C of ditto	...	500
E of ditto	...	400

and "D" fails.

F of Punjab gains	...	450
G of ditto	...	400

and "H" fails.

In making the selections for the two Provinces, A and B should succeed in Bengal, while F should get the appointment in the Punjab—thus leaving C of Bengal among the unsuccessful candidates. A due proportion of appointments should be reserved for each Province according to the population.

34. Having regard to the varying educational standards reached in the several Provinces, and the varying conditions prevalent therein, is it possible to have any one system of selection for all India which would not result in the inhabitants of some Provinces being more or less excluded from a due share of appointments?—Candidates from one Province should not be selected to fill up vacancies in another Province, though they may stand higher in merit at the examination than the candidates of the other Province.

35. Under any of the three systems of nomination, limited competition, and open competition, would you prescribe any tests of preliminary qualifications on the part of nominees or candidates in regard to (1) age, (2) intellectual capacity, (3) moral, social, and physical fitness?—Yes.

36. If so, what should be the tests under each of the heads specified?—For a system of nomination, which is what I advocate, the candidates should (1) be not less than 25 years of age; (2) be thoroughly acquainted with the vernacular court language; (3) possess a good moral character and social status; and (4) should produce a medical certificate of physical fitness.

37. Do you consider that (after selection whether by nomination or competition) there should be a period of probation?—To have a period of probation after the nomination will tend to the advantage and interests of the Government, and will also be a safeguard to the people.

38. If so, what should be the duration of the probationary period?—At least two years.

39. Should the period of probation be passed in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service, or of the Covenanted Service, or in what other manner?—It had better be passed in the Covenanted Service.

40. Do you consider that after selection and before entering on probation (or on duty) the person selected should undergo special training?—Yes.

41. If so, should the special training be carried out in India or in England?—In England, should the candidate have no objection.

42. If in India, would it be possible, and if possible, advisable, to establish an Indian Civil Service College on the basis of the Haileybury College which formerly existed in England?—Yes. It is possible and might prove convenient and be much availed of.

43. If you do not consider special training in England essential, would you encourage nominees or selected candidates to visit England with a view to add to their qualifications for the Service?—Yes.

44. If so, what form should such encouragement take?—Free passage to and from England and suitable allowances. Period of such absence to count towards pension and to be considered as if the candidate was on duty.

45 & 46. Should it be offered before, or during, or after the probationary period, if any, through which nominees or selected candidates may be required to pass? Should it be offered before or after the nominees or selected candidates enter on their duties?—They should, on their return to India, receive some recognition for having undertaken a long journey in order to add to their qualifications for Government service.

Vol. I, Sec. III, Sub-Sec. B.

Sardar *M. Afzal Khan.*

47. Are you in favor of the establishment of scholarships tenable by Natives in England for the purpose of enabling them to qualify for the Civil or Statutory Service?—Yes.

48. If so, how would you connect such a scheme with the selection of Natives for employment in the higher administrative posts in India?—To be made eligible for higher appointments after some fixed period of service and a distinguished career in life.

49. Do you think that any distinction should be made between the emoluments of nominees or selected candidates who have been trained in England or have gone to England to add to their qualifications, and those who have not?—Certainly, in order to induce persons to get themselves trained in England.

50. If the opportunity of residence in England at a University for two years with a sufficient allowance were offered to nominees or selected candidates, is it likely that it would be taken advantage of to any great extent?—Yes.

51. If the system of examination in England were revised with the result that Natives availed themselves of it in considerable numbers, would it still be necessary to retain the Statutory system?—Yes, on political grounds, to provide for the children of the aristocracy and of those who proved faithful and loyal in times of trouble, as also for keeping the well-to-do people from declining in position.

52. If so, to what appointments or classes of appointments would you restrict the latter system, and what conditions over and above those already existing would you impose?—The existing rules will meet all requirements.

III.—Competition in England for the Indian Civil Service.

53. Is competition of Natives in the examination in England favourably looked upon by large and important classes in India?—No; people of good family are averse to the competitive system.

54. Should additional facilities be given to Natives for proceeding to England and entering the Indian Civil Service by the channel of the English competition?—Should competition be made compulsory, it would be kind on the part of the Government to afford additional facilities to the Natives.

55. If so, what form or forms should such facilities take?—The age-limit should be extended and free passages should be provided; scholarships should, if possible, be given (for political reasons) to those whose services are required by the Government, and this concession will prove to be a token of favor or reward for proved loyalty.

56. What conditions, if any, should be attached to them?—The scholarships to be refunded if the candidates fail to pass the required test through their want of energy or application.

57. What is your opinion as to giving Statutory appointments to Natives who, though they may have failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, have shown merit in the English competition?—Such candidates may also be provided for, due consideration being given to their loyalty and social and moral character, because circumstances in India are such that money alone cannot raise a man to rank among the higher classes, but high birth is given a good deal more credit than money.

58. Assuming it to be advisable to appoint to the Statutory Service in India Natives who have failed in the English competition, should such persons receive the same training as successful candidates in England, and be subject to the same final examination?—Yes, but it must be left optional with the nominees.

59. Should they on appointment to the Statutory Service in India be subject to the same incidents as apply to other persons appointed under the Statutory Rules?—Yes.

60. Can you say what number of Natives belonging to your Province have presented themselves annually at the competitive examination in England, and what degree of success they attained?—As far as I can recollect, one or two men have gone from this Province, but no one has succeeded.

61. What class or classes of Natives in your Province readily go to England?—Both Hindus and Mahomedans, and mostly the offspring of educated men who have made their own way in life.

62. Are objections entertained to going to England; and, if so, what are they, and by what classes in particular are they felt?—Besides the hesitation, if any, felt by the Hindus in regard to going to England, on account of caste prejudices, I think there are three other objections: *Firstly*—the Indians have very little chance of success when required to compete with European candidates. *Secondly*—a large amount of money is required for this purpose, which but few can afford. *Thirdly*—even if the above two objections be denied and the obstacles are overcome, the parents have the risk of losing their children's sympathies on their return to India. I remember once being told that a Native of India on his return from England abstained from visiting his mother, who desired to see him, on the plea that his paternal home was not a commodious one to visit.

63. Should the examination for Natives in England be distinct in standards and conditions from that for English candidates, or should there be one and the same examination for all?—There should be one examination for all classes.

64. If the standards and conditions were different, how would it be possible to compare the results in the two examinations so as to bring out one list in order of merit?—They should not be different.

65. Would it under such circumstances be desirable to allot a fixed proportion of appointments to each of the two examinations?—Should there be different examinations for Europeans and Natives, the appointments must necessarily be in a fixed proportion for each examination.

66. If a fixed proportion of appointments were allotted for a Native examination in England, do you consider that in view of the objections against a voyage to England and life there, the cost thereof and the chances of failure, a sufficient number of suitable candidates from your Province would be available to make the competition a real competition?—Of course more candidates will aspire to go to England than at present, but I cannot say if such a number will avail themselves of the concession as to make a real competition, because only the wealthier classes are able to send their children to England, while the others can but little afford to give a liberal education in England to their sons.

67. If the examinations were distinct, what should be the limits of age for the Native examination?—Twenty-five years should be the maximum and twenty-three years the minimum age.

68. What should be the conditions, nature, and subjects of the separate Native examination?—No separate examination is necessary.

69. Assuming only one examination in England for both English and Native candidates, do you consider that the subjects and standards of examination, and the conditions as to age and other matters, in any respect place Native candidates at a disadvantage as compared with English candidates?—Yes.

70. If so, in what respects are Native candidates placed at a disadvantage, and what alterations would you recommend with a view to remove that disadvantage?—In the age-limit they are placed at a disadvantage; it should be extended to twenty-five years.

71. If there should be only one examination for all candidates, should the limits of age for Natives be higher than those at present fixed for European candidates; and, if so, what should the limits for Native candidates be?—Yes; twenty-five years.

72. If higher limits of age were fixed for Native than for European candidates, might not the latter complain that they were placed at a disadvantage?—The English language not being the mother-tongue of the Natives, it takes them a considerable time to master it, and this interferes with their studies for the examination.

For the above reasons the complaints of the Europeans, if they are made, will not be reasonable or justifiable. If the Europeans had to pass in Sanscrit, Arabic, Hindustani, Bengali, or Persian, it would place them at the same disadvantage in competing with the Natives.

But if the Europeans do complain, let the age-limit be the same, but let all the Native languages be included in the examination and marked the same as for proficiency in the English language.

73. What is the average age at which Natives at the Indian Universities pass the examinations for F.A., B.A., and M.A., respectively?—The Natives generally pass the F.A. examination at the age of 18 years.

B.A.	ditto	ditto	20 ,,
M.A.	ditto	ditto	21 ,,

74. From what classes of Native society are the persons who graduate at the Indian Universities usually drawn in your Province?—Generally from among the third class men who by their self-culture and personal efforts have raised themselves to the social standing of the second class, and most of them are in Government employ holding high appointments.

IV.—Competition in India for the Indian Civil Service.

75. Do you advocate a competition in India for the Civil Service simultaneously with the competition in England, the same question papers being used at both examinations?—Yes. If competition were allowed in India, a great many advantages would accrue to all concerned.

76. How would this method of selection be regarded by the Native community generally?—In the absence of the Statutory Service the system will not meet with the approbation of the first and real second class, but it will be agreeable to all if the Statutory system of service were also kept in force, though the upstart people may be averse to it.

77. If you advocate such a system, would you restrict the competition in India to Natives, and that in England to English candidates, or would you admit both classes freely to either examination?—I do not see anything against their availing themselves of either examination.

78. If Native candidates were admitted to the competition in England, while English candidates were excluded from the competition in India, on what grounds could this distinction be justified?—There could be no reason to justify this anomaly.

79. Do you consider that the educational institutions available in India are at present capable of giving the very high class education which it was the object of the competitive system as introduced in 1855 to secure?—No.

80. Would an open competition in India be likely to give decided advantages to any particular class or classes of the Native

Vol. I, Sec. III, Sub-Sec. B.

Sardar *M. Afzal Khan.*

community over others?—To the Hindu community, and especially to the sons of the upstart classes whether in Government employ or otherwise.

81. Would it be likely to lead to the undue preponderance of any one class or caste in the public service?—Yes, to the Hindus.

82. Do you think there are any objections on political or administrative grounds to open competition in India—Yes. Because those families who have served the Government with loyalty and are influential will get disheartened by such a rule, and they will be at a loss to know what to do with their sons who are not sufficiently well educated to compete successfully.

83. Would the introduction of an open competitive examination in India have the effect of deterring cadets of leading families from aspiring to enter the ranks of the Civil Service?—Yes, most decidedly.

84. Under such a system how would it be possible to provide against the Natives of a Province in which education is comparatively backward being excluded from appointments in their own Province?—The candidates of each Province may be allotted a certain proportion of appointments, and candidates of one Province should not be selected for another Province; and to avoid the preponderance of one class, regard must be had to their numbers and appointments distributed among the Hindus and Mahomedans according to the ratio of their numbers, while the nomination system may be preserved for the candidates of good family.

85. Would a system of provincial examination be preferable to one examination for the whole of India?—Yes; but should the examination be one for the whole of India, then a certain number of appointments should be set apart for each Province and the residents of that Province only should get them.

86. Under a system of open competition in India would the successful candidates be regarded as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the service through the channel of the open competition in England?—No, but a difference of emoluments might be retained between the two branches of the service.

87. Supposing that the Covenanted appointments were allotted in fixed proportions, a certain number to be obtained by competition in England and a certain number by competition in India, the examinations in each case being open on fairly equal conditions to Native and English candidates alike, and the Statutory system being abolished, how would such a system be viewed?—The upper classes will not view such a system with feelings of satisfaction.

88. If an open competition were established in India, what should be the preliminary qualifications required on the part of candidates in regard to age?—Between twenty-three and twenty-five years.

89. In regard to minimum educational attainments?—B.A. examination will do.

90. In regard to moral, social, and physical fitness?—A certificate given by a medical officer; character certified by district and other authorities, also testimony of some well-known men of the town in which the candidate resides.

92. Should the subjects and conditions of the examination be the same as those prescribed for the competitive examination in England, or should they be different?—Yes, should be the same.

93. If different, what should they be?—Candidates from India might be allowed to take up as many Eastern languages as they can instead of Latin, &c.

94. Circumstances being different in the case of persons who enter through the examination in England and of persons who enter through the examination in India, is there any reason why the rules in regard to pay, leave, pension, &c., should not also be different?—The pay, furlough, and pension of Natives should be at a somewhat lower scale than that of Europeans.

95. Should successful candidates go through a period of special study in India like the English candidates who spend two years in special preparation?—Yes.

96. Would it be preferable (*a*) to require them to go to England, or (*b*) to give them the option of going to England, suitable allowances being given to enable them to prosecute their studies there?—It should be left optional with the candidates.

97. Should successful candidates at the Indian competition be required to pass through a probationary period before final appointment?—Yes.

98. If so, what should be the duration of the probationary period?—Two years.

99. How should it be passed—in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service, or otherwise?—In the ranks of the Covenanted Service.

V.—Promotion from the Uncovenanted Service.

100. What special provision, if any, do you think should be made for the appointments to Covenanted posts of deserving members of the Uncovenanted Service?—Those Uncovenanted Civilians who distinguish themselves by doing some special duty with credit or by long and faithful meritorious services which gain them a high reputation might be admitted to this branch of the service.

101. If such appointments are made, should they be restricted to the holders of any particular classes of appointments in the Uncovenanted Service, and, if so, what

classes?—Generally from among Extra Assistant Commissioners of good service.

102. Should persons so appointed be appointed provisionally and be required to pass through a period of probation before final confirmation?—No. Their merit having already been tested before nomination to the post, no further term of probation would, I should think, be required.

103. Should provision be made for the appointment of qualified members of the Uncovenanted Service to the higher Covenanted offices without requiring them to pass through the lower grades?—Unless for some special reason they should enter the lowest grade of the service only.

104. If certain appointments in the Covenanted grades are set apart for the Statutory Service, should a fixed proportion of those appointments be expressly reserved for persons of proved merit and ability in the Uncovenanted Service?—No.

105. Should special provision be made for the promotion to Covenanted posts of European members of the Uncovenanted Service?—No.

106. Should special provision be made for the promotion to such posts of Eurasian or other members of the Uncovenanted Service who, though not Natives of pure descent, fall within the meaning attached in the Statute of 1870 to the term "Natives of India?"—They may be treated like other Natives of India.

107. Ought not the Uncovenanted Service, equally with the Covenanted Service, to be open to all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty who possess the qualifications that may be from time to time prescribed?—The Uncovenanted Service was created for the Natives of the soil, and if Europeans became eligible for such posts, they should get such portions of it only as Natives do in the Covenanted Service—due regard being had to the population of the country. (2) As regards Natives of India only menial classes of the very lowest grade in the social scale may be excluded from such appointments.

108. If the Uncovenanted Service is closed to any natural-born subjects of Her Majesty, on what grounds, bearing in mind the terms of Acts of Parliament and Her Majesty's Proclamation of 1st November 1858, is this to be justified?—All natural-born subjects of Her Majesty may be allowed to share equitably, with restrictions noted above. The menial classes if they pass the competitive examination may turn out to be capable for such duties, but the general public will not give much respect to them, and on some occasions difficulties may arise in the discharge of their duties.

VI.—Pay, Leave, and Pension for Natives of India appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than through the channel of competition in England.

109. Is the rate* of pay at present granted to Statutory Civilians during probation and on final appointment respectively sufficient?—Yes.

* Two hundred rupees a month on first appointment as probationers. Two hundred and fifty rupees a month after passing the Departmental Examination by the lower standard. After passing the Departmental Examination by the higher standard (unless specially exempted) and after having been confirmed in their appointments, 64 per cent. of what would be the gross pay or salary of the office if it were held by a Covenanted Civil Servant appointed after competitive examination in England.

110. If not, on what grounds do you consider it insufficient, and what rates of pay should, in your opinion, be granted to Statutory Civilians (*a*) while on probation, and (*b*) on final confirmation in their appointments?—No reasons for any insufficiency need be given here.

111. Would these rates of pay be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes.

112. Would they be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the professional classes?—Yes.

113. If not, how would you treat in regard to pay persons selected from these two classes if appointed to the lowest grade of the Covenanted Service?—They should get the same pay as the Statutory Civilians, because they may have to lose a certain amount of their emoluments at the beginning, but will be compensated by the advantages attached to the service in other respects.

114. How would you treat in regard to pay such persons if appointed to any of the higher Covenanted posts without being required to pass through the lower grades?—They should get two-thirds of the pay which Europeans holding such appointments may be getting.

115. Do you consider that a difference should be maintained between the rates of pay granted to Covenanted Civilians, who enter through the competitive channel in England, and to persons holding Covenanted posts who do not enter through that channel?—Yes.

116. If so, what would you consider the fair rate of reduction to be made in the case of persons holding Covenanted posts who do not enter through the competitive channel in England?—By one-third.

117. Would you approve of an arrangement by which the pay of appointments would be a fixed sum to be drawn by the holder whether he is a Covenanted or a Statutory Civilian, with an additional staff allowance to be drawn by those only who enter the service through the examination in England?—If their pay is regulated at an equal footing, a sum of Rs. 50 as staff allowance should be drawn monthly by those who pass in England; and on their

Vol. I, Sec. III,

Sardar *M. Afzal Khan.*

promotion to higher grades an additional sum of Rs. 50 for each grade they rise to may be given to them.

118. Can you suggest any other way of providing different rates of pay?—No.

119. If you consider there should be no difference of pay, how do you justify the application of the same rates of pay in the case of Natives who have satisfied the very high tests required by the examination in England and Natives who have not?—There should be some difference in pay.

120. On the same assumption, what are your reasons for holding that the high rate of pay which is considered to be necessary to secure the services of persons of tested qualifications in a country far from their homes, and under various other unfavorable conditions, should be given to persons whose qualifications have not been so tested and who serve in their own native country?—I have already advocated that the pay of Natives should be at a lower scale than that of Europeans selected for such appointments.

121. Have you any remarks to make on the leave rules embodied in the Civil Leave Code which apply to Statutory Civilians?—No alteration required.

122. At what age do you consider that Natives appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than through the competitive channel in England should be entitled to retire on pension?—The minimum age for retirement should be fifty-five years reaching up to sixty years' maximum age if the officer is fit to undergo the hard work imposed on him.

123. After what length of service do you consider that such persons should be entitled to retire on pension?—After fifteen years one-third, and after twenty-five years one-half pay as pension.

124. At what age should they be obliged to retire on pension?—Sixty years.

125. After what length of service should they be obliged to retire on pension?—Thirty-five years.

127. If, before serving the prescribed period for pension, they are compelled to retire on medical certificate, what gratuity, if any, would you give them?—One month's pay for every year's actual service.

VII.—General.

128. How far is the existing system of education in the higher schools and colleges in India well adapted for training young men to the public service? Can you suggest any improvements?—This subject will be dealt with afterwards.

129. In 1854 Lord Macaulay's Committee were of opinion that the best, the most liberal, and the most finished education to be procured in England was a necessary qualification for admission to the Civil Service. Do Indian schools and colleges at present supply an education of so high a standard?—No.

130. Do you consider that Indian schools at present develop the force of character and other qualities required for English administration?—No.

131. Do we now obtain for Government service Natives of the classes who under Native rule carried on the civil administration of the country?—Only a few; those families have generally fallen into decay.

132. If not, where must we look for representatives of these classes, and how do you consider that their services could be best obtained?—By giving some aid and inducement to those families who have suffered at the hands of time and by the system of government heretofore. District officers can pick up members of the old influential and leading families for Government employment.

133. How far would any system of appointment which involves a journey to and residence in England be regarded by the Native community as open to objection on the ground that it requires Hindu candidates to abandon their caste as a condition of entering the Civil Service?—By going to England the caste observances cannot be maintained, and therefore the Hindus feel averse to it; but the Mahomedans also are not in favor of sending their children to England, as they find them on their rourn with but little feelings of sympathy and a different mode of living. Unless some facilities are given towards encouraging Natives to go to England at the recommendation of the Local Government, the wealthier classes only will avail themselves of the advantages attached to it, and a sort of dissatisfaction will be felt by the other classes.

135. Are the Natives who go to England from your Province for purposes of education limited to the wealthier classes?—Yes.

136. Are they limited to any particular section of the community, or to any particular creed?—No.

137. Does a voyage to or residence in England involve the loss of social position or other unfavorable consequences in the case of any section of the Native community?—No loss of social position is involved as long as the candidate who has been to England does not treat his countrymen with indifference or take a dislike to settle among them.

138. Does it result in placing those Natives who undertake it more or less out of touch and sympathy with their fellow-countrymen on their return to India?—Yes.

139. Would the requirement of a temporary residence in England as a condition precedent to or following on appointment to the Government service, have the effect of excluding from such appointment any considerable or important section of the Native community?—Yes; some people will be excluded.

140. If the Statutory system is discontinued, should special provision be made for the apppointment to Covenanted posts of Natives who, for religious or other sufficient reasons, are unable or unwilling to undertake a journey to and residence in England?—Yes.

141. If so, what provision should be made for this purpose?—Departmental examinations should be prescribed, and a certain number of appointments reserved for such men.

142. If the Statutory system is discontinued, do you consider that special provision should be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of capable members of the professional classes?—Yes.

143. If so, what provision should be made for this purpose?—On the very strong recommendation of the highest tribunal for justice in the Province, the members of the local Bar may be admitted into the ranks of the service should they desire to join it.

144. Whatever system or systems may be adopted, ought power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts candidates of high family subject to such antecedent guarantees of fitness as may be considered sufficient in each case?—Yes.

145. Ought similar power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts persons who have proved their merit and ability in Government service, or in the exercise of a profession, without preliminary examination or competition?—Yes, but those coming from the professional class who have never held any post under the Government should be appointed on probation.

146. If a thorough knowledge of English were made an essential qualification for appointment to Covenanted posts, would the field of selection in the case of persons already in the Uncovenanted Service, or engaged in the exercise of a profession, be unduly limited thereby?—Yes, should they in all other respects prove deserving of a special recognition for their services; their limited knowledge of the English language should not be a cause of disappointment to them.

147. If such is likely to be the case, could the difficulty be obviated by requiring proficiency in the English language to be tested by periodical examinations after selection, but during a probationary period?—No. They cannot adequately prosecute their studies in English without detriment to the discharge of their duties.

148. Should provisions be made for the occasional appointment in very special and exceptional cases to Covenanted posts of persons of known ability and local influence, whom, although they may never have held office and may not possess special professional qualifications, and although their age may exceed the limit laid down for untried candidates, it might nevertheless be considered desirable to appoint to the higher grades for political or other reasons?—Yes.

149. Would it be desirable to rule that the proportion of persons being Mahomedans and Hindus respectively, who are from time to time or over a series of years appointed to the Covenanted ranks in any Province, should bear a certain relation to the number of the two classes composing the population of the Province concerned?—Yes.

150. What classes, ranks, or professions of the Native community should be included among Mahomedans and Hindus, respectively, for the purpose of ascertaining the proportion of the population of each of those classes in the several Provinces?—Mahomedans of all sections of the community, and the Hindus, including Sikhs, Brahmins, &c.

151. How far should appointments in each Province to Covenanted posts be restricted to Natives of the Province concerned?—No Native should be eligible to serve in this capacity except in his own Province, and at least one-fourth should be the proportion to the Europeans holding such appointments.

152. How would the following scheme be regarded by the Native community:—(1) The Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of European officers, admission being by competition in England confined to European candidates only. (2) The appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, Natives only being eligible?—The system will not be met with any indifference of opinion.

153. How would you regard such a scheme?—Favourably, and as being in the interests of the Natives.

154. How would the Native community regard the following:—(1) The Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of appointments to be filled by competition in England to which Natives and Europeans alike would be admitted. (2) The appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, both Natives and Europeans being eligible?—Preference will be given to the former course.

155. How would you regard such a scheme?—I should think the former course will suit all classes better than this.

156. If either of the above schemes were adopted, how would the Native community view a proposal to combine the higher appointments of the Uncovenanted Service with the appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service so as to form an enlarged Civil Service to be recruited in India?—If Uncovenanted members of the service be made eligible to a greater extent to the service, then of course the higher posts of the Uncovenanted Service may be combined with the Covenanted Service, and the Natives will not have much reason to complain; but if the Uncovenanted servants are but rarely admitted, the field of promotion for such servants will be cut short and a general dislike might result.

Vol. I, Sec. III, Sub-Sec. B.

Sardar *M. Afzal Khan.*

157. How would you view such a proposal?—I myself hold the same view as expressed above.

158. How would the Native community regard the following scheme:—(1) a certain number of appointments in the Covenanted Civil Service to be reserved for Natives; (2) a certain proportion of that number to be filled by competition or by some other system in India; (3) the remainder to be filled by competition in England?—Any competitive system will not be liked by persons of high family.

159. How would you regard such a scheme?—I should like myself the expansion of knowledge and regard much for merit, but the nomination system should in no case be dispensed with.

160. Assuming a system of nomination or of limited competition among nominated candidates, would Native opinion be in favor of giving a preference, as between candidates possessed of certain preliminary essential qualifications, and having on general grounds fairly equal claims, in the following or any other order, to—(*a*) members of families of tried loyalty and distinguished service; (*b*) persons of good social status and influence in the country; and (*c*) persons of superior educational attainments, such as persons who have taken the degree of M.A.?—Men of classes one and two will give preference—*first*, to members of tried loyalty and distinguished merit; *secondly*, to persons of good social standing, and upstart men who have risen to the second class would like the educated class, but the general public would not like the upstart.

161. What is your opinion as to giving such preference?—I should give more regard to members of tried loyalty and good social standing.

162. How would the Native community regard a system of nomination on the ground of merit and ability shown in the service of Government, or in the exercise of a profession, alternating with a system of selection by means of competition, whether entirely open or amongst nominated candidates?—An answer to this question has already been given.

163. How would you regard such a system?—I think a due share may be allotted proportionately to each class.

164. If the Statutory system were maintained, and if a probationary period were required from nominees or selected candidates before final appointment, would it be necessary to insist upon such probationary period in all cases, *e.g.*, in the case of a person who has done good service in the Uncovenanted ranks?—No, as their merit would already have been tested by Government before nominating them.

165. In the case of persons nominated from the professional classes, is it desirable that a probationary period should be prescribed?—Yes.

166. If so, is it necessary that the incidents of such period as to duration and pay should be the same as those attached thereto in the case of Statutory Civilians appointed on probation to the lowest grade of the Covenanted Service?—Must get the same share.

167. On what principles should the promotion of Natives appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than by the channel of the competition in England be regulated?—Should get promotion alike, carrying a difference of pay all along in the different grades.

168. Would you regulate such promotion only by considerations of fitness and approved personal merit?—By seniority. But should an officer distinguish himself by some special service, his claims should be taken into consideration by giving him promotion out of turn.

169. Should Natives appointed to Covenanted posts be required to pass the Departmental examinations?—Yes.

170. Should they be required to pass the Departmental examinations by both the lower and higher standards within their probationary period, subject to the penalty of forfeiture of appointment if they fail to pass within that time, unless the period is for special reasons extended?—The lower standard must be passed within two years; but for the higher standard, if the nominee fails to pass within that period, he will lose places and get no promotion until he passes, instead of forfeiting his appointment.

171. Should a period longer than the probationary period be allowed for passing the Departmental examination by the higher standard?—Yes.

172. Should the present rule be maintained under which probationers may be confirmed in their appointments at the close of the probationary period of two years, provided that they pass within that period the Departmental examination by the lower standard prescribed for Covenanted Civilians appointed in England, no obligatory period being fixed for passing the higher standard, but no promotion or increase of pay being attainable until the higher standard examination has been passed, and power being retained to the Government to dispense with the services of a Statutory Civilian who may fail to pass by the higher standard within a reasonable time?—Yes.

173. What rule in regard to passing the Departmental examinations should be applied in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts on the ground of merit and ability proved in the service of Government or in the exercise of a profession?—To undergo a Departmental examination if he has not already passed any examination in law.

174. Should subjects of Native States be eligible for appointment to Covenanted posts in British India?—Yes.

175. If so, should this be extended to all Native States in alliance with the Crown, or only to those in subordinate alliance?

Only residents of States in subordinate alliance.

176. What system, if any, is at present adopted in your Province for bringing into the public service persons who, from their position or otherwise, cannot be expected to enter the service of Government in the lowest grades, and for giving them the necessary apprenticeship?—There seems to me no system of apprenticeship open to such men in the Province.

177. Does the system work well, and what improvements can you suggest?—To have some such a system is most desirable.

No. IV.

ANSWERS BY CHAUDHRI RUGNATH SINGH, PRESIDENT, LOCAL BOARD, DELHI; NOMINEE OF THE DEPUTY COMMISSIONER, DELHI.

I.—Working of the existing Statutory System.

Vol. I, Sec. III, Sub-Sec. B.

Chaudhri *Rugnath Singh.*

WHAT is the prevalent feeling in your Province regarding the existing Statutory system? If the feeling is one of dissatisfaction, is the dissatisfaction general, or is it confined to certain sections of the community?—The general public is dissatisfied with this system.

2. What are the grounds upon which any such feeling is based?—The men appointed under this system are generally of an inferior quality.

3. Is the feeling of dissatisfaction, if it exists, directed against the Statute itself (33 Vic., Chapter 3, Section 6), or is it directed against the rules framed thereunder?—Against the rules.

4. If the Statute itself is objected to, is it because its provisions admit persons to specific appointments only and not to membership in an organized "Service"?—The Statute is not objected to.

8. Do you consider that Section 6 of the Statute supplies such a definition of the words "Natives of India" as describes with sufficient clearness, fulness, and accuracy the various classes of persons for whose appointment to Covenanted posts it is desirable to provide?—Yes.

10. If the objections are directed against the rules framed under the Statute, do they relate to the mode or modes of selection actually adopted?—Yes.

11. Do they relate to the general conditions in regard to pay, promotion, and retiring annuity under which Statutory Civilians hold their offices?—Yes.

12. Assuming the Statutory system to be retained, what amendments would you suggest in the rules with a view to remove any reasonable objections which may be felt to them?—The educational qualifications should be expressly fixed, and nomination of candidates should not be made by local Governments only with reference to the high family connections of the candidates.

13. Are Statutory Civilians regarded by the general public as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the Covenanted Service through the competitive channel?—No.

15. Do the general public view with any difference the status of Statutory Civilians and that of Uncovenanted officers?—Yes.

16. If so, on what grounds?—It is known that Statutory Civilians will in time fill high posts in the service which Uncovenanted officers cannot get.

II.—Mode of Selection of Statutory Civilians.

17. On the assumption* that the Statutory system is retained, how would appointment to the Statutory Service by nomination be regarded by influential sections of the Native community in your Province?—Unfavorably.

18. How would a system of nomination to be followed by a period of probation be regarded by the same classes?—Better than mere nomination.

19. Would a system of nomination, with or without probation, be likely to secure well-qualified persons?—Not in every case.

20. Has experience actually shown such a system to secure well-qualified officers?—Not always.

21. Do you consider that nominations should be confined to persons of proved merit and ability?—Yes.

22. If so, how do you consider that merit and ability should be held to have been proved for this purpose?—Possession of academical honours or certificates of having received high education, and certificates of good moral character and respectability.

23. How would a system of limited competition amongst persons nominated for this purpose by the local Governments or by the Universities, or by those authorities concurrently or alternately, be regarded?—Very favorably. But the nominations should be made by the local Governments and the Universities concurrently, so that both educational and social requirements may be ensured.

24. In preference to either of the above systems (nomination and limited competition), would a system of open competition pure and simple for the Statutory Service commend itself to the native community?—Yes, provided that low caste men are not allowed to compete.

25. If competition (whether limited or open) is preferred, should there be one competition for all India or separate competitions in each Province?—Separate competitions in each Province.

26 & 27. If there were only one general competition, how would you ensure a due proportion of appointments falling to the population of the several Provinces?—Having

* The questions which follow, down to No. 39 inclusive, are put subject to the same assumption.

regard to the varying educational standards reached in the several Provinces, and the varying conditions prevalent therein, is it possible to have any one system of selection for all India which would not result in the inhabitants of some Provinces being more or less excluded from a due share of appointments?—The questions for the competitive examination and the number of qualifying marks should be the same for all the Provinces, so that one standard of qualification may be maintained.

28. Under any of the three systems of nomination, limited competition, and open competition, would you prescribe any tests of preliminary qualifications on the part of nominees or candidates in regard to (1) age, (2) intellectual capacity, (3) moral, social, and physical fitness?—Yes.

29. If so, what should be the tests under each of the heads specified?—Age, twenty-two years. Intellectual capacity, B.A. or M.A. degree. Moral, social, and physical fitness, certificates of Civil Surgeon and District Officer or other Magistrate.

30. Do you consider that (after selection whether by nomination or competition) there should be a period of probation?—Yes.

31. If so, what should be the duration of the probationary period?—Two years.

32. Should the period of probation be passed in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service, or of the Covenanted Service, or in what other manner?—In the Covenanted Service.

33. Do you consider that after selection and before entering on probation (or on duty) the person selected should undergo special training?—Yes.

34. If so, should the special training be carried out in India or in England?—In India.

35. If in India, would it be possible, and, if possible, advisable, to establish an Indian Civil Service College on the basis of the Haileybury College which formerly existed in England?—The special training in India should be carried out in the same way as the special training of English candidates is now carried out in England.

36. If you do not consider special training in England essential, would you encourage nominees or selected candidates to visit England with a view to add to their qualifications for the Service?—Yes.

37. If so, what form should such encouragement take?—Passage-money and staff allowance should be given.

38. Should it be offered before, or during, or after the probationary period, if any, through which nominees or selected candidates may be required to pass?—Before the probationary period.

39. Should it be offered before or after the nominees or selected candidates enter on their duties?—Before entering on their duties.

40. Are you in favor of the establishment of scholarships tenable by Natives in England for the purpose of enabling them to qualify for the Civil or Statutory Service?—Yes.

42. Do you think that any distinction should be made between the emoluments of nominees or selected candidates who have been trained in England or have gone to England to add to their qualifications and those who have not?—No, but candidates who have been to England should be considered to have better claims to higher administrative posts.

43. If the opportunity of residence in England at a University for two years with a sufficient allowance were offered to nominees or selected candidates, is it likely that it would be taken advantage of to any great extent?—Not to any great extent.

44. If the system of examination in England were revised with the result that Natives availed themselves of it in considerable numbers, would it still be necessary to retain the Statutory system?—Yes.

45. If so, to what appointments or classes of appointments would you restrict the latter system, and what conditions over and above those already existing would you impose?—Appointments in the Covenanted Service.

III.—Competition in England for the Indian Civil Service.

46. Is competition of Natives in the examination in England favorably looked upon by large and important classes in India?—Not favorably.

47. Should additional facilities be given to Natives for proceeding to England and entering the Indian Civil Service by the channel of the English competition?—Yes.

48. If so, what form or forms should such facilities take?—The number of scholarships should be increased, limit of age raised to twenty-three, and Vernacular languages substituted for European languages.

50. What is your opinion as to giving Statutory appointments to Natives who, though they may have failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, have shown merit in the English competition?—Failed candidates should not get Statutory appointments; they should be required to pass the competitive examination for this service in India.

51. Assuming it to be advisable to appoint to the Statutory Service in India Natives who have failed in the English competition, should such persons receive the same training as successful candidates in England, and be subject to the same final examination?—No.

52. Should they on appointment to the Statutory Service in India be subject to the same incidents as apply to other persons appointed under the Statutory Rules?—Yes.

53. Can you say what number of Natives belonging to your Province have presented themselves annually at the competitive examination in England, and what degree of

Vol. I, Sec. III, Sub-Sec. B.

Chaudhri *Rugnath Singh.*

success they attained?—No Natives have appeared from this Province.

54. What class or classes of Natives in your Province readily go to England?—Well-to-do Hindus and Mahomedans.

55. Are objections entertained to going to England; and, if so, what are they, and by what classes in particular are they felt?—Yes, by Hindus in regard to matters of food.

56. Should the examination for Natives in England be distinct in standards and conditions from that for English candidates, or should there be one and the same examination for all?—Yes, but Vernacular languages should be substituted for European languages.

57. If the standards and conditions were different, how would it be possible to compare the results in the two examinations so as to bring out one list in order of merit?—The marks for Vernacular languages should be equal to those for European languages.

58. Would it, under such circumstances, be desirable to allot a fixed proportion of appointments to each of the two examinations?—No.

59. If a fixed proportion of appointments were allotted for a Native examination in England, do you consider that, in view of the objections against a voyage to England and life there, the cost thereof and the chances of failure, a sufficient number of suitable candidates from your Province would be available to make the competition a real competition?—Yes, to some extent.

60. If the examinations were distinct, what should be the limits of age for the Native examination?—Twenty-three years.

62. Assuming only one examination in England for both English and Native candidates, do you consider that the subjects and standards of examination and the conditions as to age and other matters in any respect place Native candidates at a disadvantage as compared with English candidates?—Yes.

63. If so, in what respects are Native candidates placed at a disadvantage, and what alterations would you recommend with a view to remove that disadvantage?—Natives cannot go to England at the age of eighteen or nineteen, and European languages are not taught in Indian Universities. Age should be raised to twenty-three, and Vernacular languages substituted.

64. If there should be only one examination for all candidates, should the limits of age for Natives be higher than those at present fixed for European candidates; and, if so, what should the limits for Native candidates be?—Yes; twenty-three years.

65. If higher limits of age were fixed for Native than for European candidates, might not the latter complain that they were placed at a disadvantage?—Such a complaint would not be reasonable. At the same time if the age of English candidates is raised it would be better.

66. What is the average age at which Natives at the Indian Universities pass the examinations for F.A., B.A., and M.A. respectively?—F.A. nineteen; B.A. twenty-one; M.A. twenty-two.

67. From what classes of Native society are the persons who graduate at the Indian Universities usually drawn in your Province?—From the middle classes usually.

IV.—Competition in India for the Indian Civil Service.

68. Do you advocate a competition in India for the Civil Service simultaneously with the competition in England, the same question papers being used at both examinations?—Yes.

69. How would this method of selection be regarded by the Native community generally?—Favorably.

70. If you advocate such a system, would you restrict the competition in India to Natives, and that in England to English candidates, or would you admit both classes freely to either examination?—Both classes should be admitted freely to either examination.

71. If Native candidates were admitted to the competition in England while English candidates were excluded from the competition in India, on what grounds could this distinction be justified?—It cannot be justified.

72. Do you consider that the educational institutions available in India are at present capable of giving the very high class education which it was the object of the competitive system as introduced in 1855 to secure?—Yes.

73. Would an open competition in India be likely to give decided advantages to any particular class or classes of the Native community over others?—No.

74. Would it be likely to lead to the undue preponderance of any one class or caste in the public service?—No.

75. Do you think there are any objections on political or administrative grounds to open competition in India?—No.

76. Would the introduction of an open competitive examination in India have the effect of deterring cadets of leading families from aspiring to enter the ranks of the Civil Service?—No. On the contrary encouragement will be offered.

77. Under such a system how would it be possible to provide against the Natives of a Province in which education is comparatively backward being excluded from appointments in their own Province?—The Natives of backward Provinces will be induced, by the introduction of an open competitive examination, to make great progress in education and secure appointments.

78. Would a system of provincial examinations be preferable to one examination for the whole of India?—Yes.

79. Under a system of open competition in India would the successful candidates be regarded as occupying a position inferior to

that of persons who enter the Service through the channel of the open competition in England?—They will not be regarded as occupying an inferior position.

80. Supposing that the Covenanted appointments were allotted in fixed proportions, a certain number to be obtained by competition in England and a certain number by competition in India, the examinations in each case being open on fairly equal conditions to Native and English candidates alike, and the Statutory system being abolished, how would such a system be viewed?—Its abolition will not be disliked.

81. If an open competition were established in India, what should be the preliminary qualifications required on the part of candidates in regard to age?—Twenty-three years.

82. In regard to minimum educational attainments?—B.A. or M.A. degree or equivalent certificate.

83. In regard to moral, social, and physical fitness?—Certificate of Civil Surgeon, Principal of College, and Magistrate.

84. In other respects (if any)?—None.

85. Should the subjects and conditions of the examination be the same as those prescribed for the competitive examination in England, or should they be different?—Should be the same, excepting age and languages.

86. If different, what should they be?—See answers 65 and 66.

87. Circumstances being different in the case of persons who enter through the examination in England and of persons who enter through the examination in India, is there any reason why the rules in regard to pay, leave, pension, &c., should not also be different?—When the qualifications are the same there should be no difference in regard to pay, leave, &c.

88. Should successful candidates go through a period of special study in India like the English candidates who spend two years in special preparation?—Yes.

89. Would it be preferable (*a*) to require them to go to England, or (*b*) to give them the option of going to England, suitable allowances being given to enable them to prosecute their studies there?—Option should be given.

90. Should successful candidates at the Indian competition be required to pass through a probationary period before final appointment?—Yes.

91. If so, what should be the duration of the probationary period?—Two years.

92. How should it be passed—in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service, or otherwise? In the Covenanted Service.

V.—Promotion from the Uncovenanted Service.

93. What special provison, if any, do you think should be made for the appointments to Covenanted posts of deserving members of the Uncovenanted Service?—Members of the Uncovenanted Service may, in consideration of proved merit and ability and long service, be admitted in the Covenanted Service.

94. If such appointments are made, should they be restricted to the holders of any particular classes of appointments in the Uncovenanted Service; and, if so, what classes?—Should not be restricted to any grades particularly.

95. Should persons so appointed be appointed provisionally and be required to pass through a period of probation before final confirmation?—Yes.

96. Should provision be made for the appointment of qualified members of the Uncovenanted Service to the higher Covenanted offices without requiring them to pass through the lower grades?—Yes, provided their pay exceeds the pay of lower grades.

97. If certain appointments in the Covenanted grades are set apart for the Statutory Service, should a fixed proportion of those appointments be expressly reserved for persons of proved merit and ability in the Uncovenanted Service?—The number should not be fixed. The appointments should be given now and then to men of exceptional worth.

98. Should special provision be made for the promotion to Covenanted posts of European members of the Uncovenanted Service?—No.

99. Should special provision be made for the promotion to such posts of Eurasian or other members of the Uncovenanted Service who, though not Natives of pure descent, fall within the meaning attached in the Statute of 1870 to the term "Natives of India?—No. The provision noted in answer 93 is sufficient.

100. Ought not the Uncovenanted Service, equally with the Covenanted Service, to be open to all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty, who possess the qualifications that may be from time to time prescribed?—Yes.

VI.—Pay, Leave, and Pension for Natives of India appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than through the channel of competition in England.

102. Is the rate* of pay at present granted to Statutory Civilians during probation and on final appointment respectively sufficient?—No.

* Two hundred rupees a month on first appointment as probationers. Two hundred and fifty rupees a month after passing the Departmental Examination by the lower standard. After passing the Departmental Examination by the higher tandard (unless especially exempted) and after having been confirmed in their appointments, 64 per cent. of what would be the gross pay or salary of the office if it were held by a Covenanted Civil Servant appointed after competitive examination in England.

103. If not, on what grounds do you consider it insufficient, and what rates of pay

should, in your opinion, be granted to Statutory Civilians (*a*) while on probation, and (*b*) on final confirmation in their appointments?—Extra Assistant Commissioners get Rupees two hundred and fifty on first appointment. Statutory Civilians hold higher posts, and should not get less. While on probation they should get Rupees three hundred, and on final confirmation seventy-five per cent. of the pay of Covenanted Civil Servants.

104. Would these rates of pay be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes, but not if their present pay is more.

105. Would they be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the professional classes?—Yes.

107. How would you treat, in regard to pay, such persons if appointed to any of the higher Covenanted posts without being required to pass through the lower grades?—They should get what the Statutory Civilians would get in those posts.

108. Do you consider that a difference should be maintained between the rates of pay granted to Covenanted Civilians who enter through the competitive channel in England, and to persons holding Covenanted posts who do not enter through that channel?—No, if the qualification test is the same.

110. Would you approve of an arrangement by which the pay of appointments would be a fixed sum to be drawn by the holder, whether he is a Covenanted or a Statutory Civilian, with an additional staff allowance to be drawn by those only who enter the service through the examination in England?—Yes.

114. Have you any remarks to make on the leave rules embodied in the Civil Leave Code which apply to Statutory Civilians?—None.

115. At what age do you consider that Natives appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than through the competitive channel in England should be entitled to retire on pension?—Fifty-five years.

116. After what length of service do you consider that such persons should be entitled to retire on pension?—Thirty years.

117. At what age should they be obliged to retire on pension?—Fifty-five years.

118. After what length of service should they be obliged to retire on pension?—Thirty years.

119 and 120. What amount of pension should, in your opinion, be granted to Natives so appointed if they serve the prescribed period for voluntary and compulsory retirement respectively? If, before serving the prescribed period for pension, they are compelled to retire on medical certificate, what gratuity, if any, would you give them?—They should bear the same proportion to the pension, gratuity, &c., of the English Civilians as their pay does.

VII.—General.

124. Do we now obtain for Government service Natives of the classes who under Native rule carried on the civil administration of the country?—Yes.

126. How far would any system of appointment which involves a journey to and residence in England be regarded by the Native community as open to objection on the ground that it requires Hindu candidates to abandon their caste as a condition of entering the Civil Service?—Not very favorably.

127. How far would such a system be regarded as open to objection on the ground that it restricts the field of selection to those candidates who are wealthy enough to undertake the cost of a journey to and residence in England?—The system will not be objected to on this ground.

128. Are the Natives who go to England from your Province for purposes of education limited to the wealthier classes?—Not at all. Some are supported by their wealthy relations.

129. Are they limited to any particular section of the community, or to any particular creed?—No.

130. Does a voyage to or residence in England involve the loss of social position or other unfavorable consequences in the case of any section of the Native community?—In the case of Hindus to some extent.

131. Does it result in placing those Natives who undertake it more or less out of touch and sympathy with their fellow-countrymen on their return to India?—In the case of Hindus to some extent, but this is gradually disappearing.

132. Would the requirement of a temporary residence in England as a condition precedent to or following on appointment to the Government service have the effect of excluding from such appointment any considerable or important section of the Native community?—No.

133. If the Statutory system is discontinued, should special provision be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of Natives who, for religious or other sufficient reasons, are unable or unwilling to undertake a journey to and residence in England?—Yes.

137. Whatever system or systems may be adopted, ought power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts candidates of high family subject to such antecedent guarantees of fitness as may be considered sufficient in each case?—Yes, but the standard of educational qualifications should be strictly enforced.

138. Ought similar power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts persons who have proved their merit and ability in Government service, or in the exercise of a profession, without preliminary examination or competition?—Yes.

139. If a thorough knowledge of English were made an essential qualification for appointment to Covenanted posts, would

the field of selection in the case of persons already in the Uncovenanted Service, or engaged in the exercise of a profession, be unduly limited thereby?—No

140. If such is likely to be the case, could the difficulty be obviated by requiring proficiency in the English language to be tested by periodical examinations after selection, but during a probationary period?—This is not necessary.

141. Should provision be made for the occasional appointment, in very special and exceptional cases, to Covenanted posts of persons of known ability and local influence, whom, although they may never have held office and may not possess special professional qualifications, and although their age may exceed the limit laid down for untried candidates, it might nevertheless be considered desirable to appoint to the higher grades for political or other reasons?—Yes; provided his educational attainments are of a superior kind.

142. Would it be desirable to rule that the proportion of persons being Hindus and Mahomedans respectively, who are from time to time or over a series of years appointed to the Covenanted ranks in any Province, should bear a certain relation to the number of the two classes composing the population of the Province concerned?—No.

144. How far should appointments in each Province to Covenanted posts be restricted to Natives of the Province concerned?—All appointments in each Province should be restricted to Natives of that Province.

145. How would the following scheme be regarded by the Native community?—

(1) The Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of European officers, admission being by competition in England confined to European candidates only?—Unfavorably.

(2) The appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, Natives only being eligible?—Favorably.

146. How would you regard such a scheme?—Favorably.

147. How would the Native community regard the following?—

(1) The Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of appointments to be filled by competition in England to which Natives and Europeans alike would be admitted?—Favorably.

(2) The appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, both Natives and Europeans being eligible?—Favorably.

148. How would you regard such a scheme?—Favorably.

151. How would the Native community regard the following scheme?—

(1) a certain number of appointments in the Covenanted Civil Service to be reserved for Natives;

(2) a certain proportion of that number to be filled by competition or by some other system in India;

(3) the remainder to be filled by competition in England—Favorably.

152. How would you regard such a scheme?—Favorably.

153 & 154. Assuming a system of nomination or of limited competition among nominated candidates, would Native opinion be in favor of giving a preference, as between candidates possessed of certain preliminary essential qualifications and having on general grounds fairly equal claims, in the following or any other order, to—

(*a*) members of families of tried loyalty and distinguished service;

(*b*) persons of good social status and influence in the country; and

(*c*) persons of superior educational attainments, such as persons who have taken the degree of M.A.?

What is your opinion as to giving such preference?—Persons of classes (*a*) or (*b*), with superior educational attainments, would be preferable to persons of class (*c*.)

155 & 156. How would the Native community regard a system of nomination on the ground of merit and ability shown in the service of Government, or in the exercise of a profession, alternating with a system of selection by means of competition, whether entirely open or amongst nominated candidates?—How would you regard such a system?—Not very favorably.

157. If the Statutory system were maintained, and if a probationary period were required from nominees or selected candidates before final appointment, would it be necessary to insist upon such probationary period in all cases, *e.g.*, in the case of a person who has done good service in the Uncovenanted ranks?—Not necessary.

158. In the case of persons nominated from the professional classes, is it desirable that a probationary period shoud be prescribed?—Yes.

159. If so, is it necessary that the incidents of such period as to duration and pay should be the same as those attached thereto in the case of Statutory Civilians appointed on probation to the lowest grade of the Covenanted Service?—Yes.

160. On what principles should the promotion of Natives appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than by the channel of the competition in England be regulated?—In the same way as the promotion of Covenanted Civilians.

161. Would you regulate such promotion only by considerations of fitness and approved personal merit?—Yes, coupled with seniority of service.

162. Should subjects of Native States be eligible for appointment to Covenanted posts in British India?—No.

164. What system, if any, is at present adopted in your Province for bringing into the public service persons who, from their position or otherwise, cannot be expected to

enter the service of Government in the lowest grades, and for giving them the necessary apprenticeship?—There is no such system adopted in this Province as far as I know.

VIII.—Composition, recruitment, &c., of the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services.

166. How is the present system of regulating appointments to the Subordinate* Executive and Subordinate Judicial Service respectively regarded by influential sections of the Native community?—Regarded very favorably.

167. To what sections of Native society do the persons belong who accept, under existing conditions, appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively?—The middle classes and to some extent the aristocracy.

168. To what extent do Natives of good family and education in your Province offer themselves as candidates for Subordinate Judicial and Executive appointments?—The majority of them are of good family and education. Persons promoted from ministerial offices are occasionally not so.

169. Do Natives who have been to England for purposes of study on their return to India willingly accept such appointment?—No.

170. How far are the professional classes represented in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, in your Province?—I do not know.

171. Do members of the professional classes in your Province readily accept employment in those services?—No; they find their own profession more lucrative.

172. Whatever system or systems may at present be adopted for the purpose of regulating appointments to the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, are any class or classes of persons expressly or practically excluded from such appointments?—No; but Eurasians and Europeans do not offer themselves for the posts of Tahsildar and Munsif.

173. If so, how is such exclusion justified?—A good knowledge of vernacular is essential for these posts. Eurasians seldom acquire sufficient proficiency.

174. Is it the case that certain classes of Uncovenanted appointments are practically reserved for Natives of pure descent owing to the fact that conditions are imposed which have resulted in shutting out Eurasians and other Statutory Natives of mixed descent?—No.

176. Are you in favor of laying down a rule that high educational capacity should be regarded as an essential qualification for appointment to the Subordinate Executive and to the Subordinate Judicial Services as defined for the purposes of these questions?—Yes; strongly.

177. If so, what test would you apply?—F.A. or B.A. degree.

178. Do you think that the test should vary according to the character of the office to be filled?—Yes.

179. Generally, what system do you advocate for filling appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services as above defined?—Nomination and competition.

180. What preliminary qualifications would you require on the part of candidates for those appointments in regard to age and in other respects?—Age twenty-three; F.A. or B.A. degree, and certificates of Civil Surgeon, Magistrate, and Principal of College.

181. Is it possible to devise any one system which would be equally applicable to all Provinces, having regard to the varying educational standards reached in the several Provinces and the varying conditions prevalent therein?—Not necessary.

182. Do you advocate the requirement of a probationary period, and, if so, what should be the incidents of such period as to duration, pay, and in other respects?—Yes. Duration one year.

183. Would you require a probationary period in all cases, or would you dispense with it in certain, and, if so, in what, cases?—Probationary period should be prescribed only for newly-appointed men. It is not necessary for men promoted from lower grades.

184. If an open competitive examination were held in India for the Covenanted posts reserved for Natives, would persons who gained high marks in that examination and showed decided proficiency, but who failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, form suitable nominees for Subordinate Judicial and Executive appointments in the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes; but they should be required to pass the examination prescribed for appointments in the Uncovenanted Service.

* NOTE.—For the purposes of these questions, the terms "Subordinate Executive Service" and "Subordinate Judicial Service" may be held to include respectively all Subordinate Executive and Judicial offices down to and including the office of Tahsildar or Munsif, or other office corresponding to that of Tahsildar or Munsif, which are not reserved for or not ordinarily held by members of the Covenanted Civil Service.

No. V.

ANSWERS BY GHULAM AHMED KHAN, UNCOVENANTED SERVICE, TAHSILDAR; NOMINEE OF THE DEPUTY COMMISSIONER, AMRITSAR.

I.—Working of the existing Statutory System.

WHAT is the prevalent feeling in your Province regarding the existing Statutory system? If the feeling is one of dissatisfaction, is the dissatisfaction general, or is it confined to certain sections of the community?—The prevalent feeling in the Province regarding the existing Statutory system is of dissatisfaction, and the dissatisfaction is general.

2. What are the grounds upon which any such feeling is based?—The main ground on which such feeling is based is that they had gained nothing from this system, and, moreover, the system has failed to fulfil its object. It entails the selection of those persons who belong to respectable families, but they may be incompetent, otherwise they would have been taken in through the proper channel. Young persons educated in India and of immature experience, in the absence of any conditions as regards the standard of their education, cannot be expected to form competent Civil Servants. Secondly, it contains no such condition as may necessitate proportional selection from various communities.

3. Is the feeling of dissatisfaction, if it exists, directed against the Statute itself (33 Vic., Chapter 3, Section 6), or is it directed against the rules framed thereunder?—Such feelings are entertained, not as regards the rules only, but the Statutory system itself.

4. If the Statute itself is objected to, is it because its provisions admit persons to specific appointments only and not to membership in an organised "Service"?—The Statute itself is objected to, because its provisions admit to specific appointments only and not to membership in an organized service.

5. Are the objections based on other, and, if so, what, grounds?—As to the Statute itself, there is no other objection.

6. If a desire is felt for enrolment in a general service, what are the reasons for this desire?—The main reason for a desire for enrolment in a general service is that there can be found competent persons in this Province to perform the duties with as much ability as Europeans, if only the selection is carried on properly.

7. What amendments do you advocate in Section 6 of the Statute?—The words "Civil Service" in Section 6 of the Statute should be replaced by "Organized Service."

8. Do you consider that Section 6 of the Statute supplies such a definition of the words "Natives of India" as describes with sufficient clearness, fulness, and accuracy the various classes of persons for whose appointment to Covenanted posts it is desirable to provide?—The definition describes with sufficient clearness, fulness, and accuracy the various classes of persons for whose appointment in Covenanted posts it provides.

9. If not, can you suggest any more complete or more satisfactory definition?—No.

10. If the objections are directed against the rules framed under the Statute, do they relate to the mode or modes of selection actually adopted?—The objections as to the rules formed under the Statute do also relate to the mode or modes of selection.

11. Do they relate to the general conditions in regard to pay, promotion, and retiring annuity under which Statutory Civilians hold their offices?—Yes, they do.

12. Assuming the Statutory system to be retained, what amendments would you suggest in the rules with a view to remove any reasonable objections which may be felt to them?—The rules with regard to pay, pension, system of nomination and limitation as to specific appointments should be amended. The rules for the pay and pension for the Covenanted Servants should be likewise applicable to the Statutory Civil Servants. The nominees should be selected from the persons who prove themselves of good ability, of good character in the Uncovenanted Service and legal profession. Due consideration should be paid to the respectability of family too. The restriction as to limited posts should be removed altogether.

13. Are Statutory Civilians regarded by the general public as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the Covenanted Service through the competitive channel?—Yes, they are.

14. If such a feeling exists, on what grounds is it based?—It is based on the fact that they have spent a part of their lives in England and have imbibed lofty ideas and morals, and have obtained good experience and knowledge, whilst the others lag behind in experience, morals, and ability. Secondly, the difference of pay and difference of rules of pension, leave, &c., play a great part in creating that idea.

15. Do the general public view with any difference the status of Statutory Civilians and that of Uncovenanted officers?—Yes, they do.

16. If so, on what grounds?—The general public is of opinion that Uncovenanted officers possess superior experience to that of Statutory Civilians, and the appointment of the latter is considered nothing more than a favor.

II.—Mode of Selection of Statutory Civilians.

Vol. I, Sec. III, Sub-Sec. B.

Ghulam *Ahmed Khan.*

17. On the assumption* that the Statutory system is retained, how would appointment to the Statutory Service by nomination be regarded by influential sections of the Native community in your Province?—Such appointment would be preferred by the influential sections of the Native community in the Province if due regard is paid to experience and ability and respectability of family, provided the nomination is effected in accordance with the above-mentioned system.

18. How would a system of nomination to be followed by a period of probation be regarded by the same classes?—In case of nomination from unemployed persons, the probation shall be preferred, whilst it is unnecessary in case of those who are nominated from those who are already employed.

19. Would a system of nomination, with or without probation, be likely to secure well-qualified persons?—Yes, it will.

20. Has experience actually shown such a system to secure well-qualified officers?—Experience has amply proved that the nomination from Government servants and from the Bar is satisfactory; whilst, on the other hand, the appointment of young persons under the Statutory system is quite the contrary.

21. Do you consider that nominations should be confined to persons of proved merit and ability?—Yes.

22. If so, how do you consider that merit and ability should be held to have been proved for this purpose?—The merit and abilities of persons in employment can be easily proved from the recommendation of their superior authorities and that of others by probation.

23. How would a system of limited competition amongst persons nominated for this purpose by the local Governments or by the Universities, or by those authorities concurrently or alternately, be regarded?—Shall not be preferred.

24. In preference to either of the above systems (nomination and limited competition), would a system of open competition, pure and simple, for the Statutory Service commend itself to the Native community?—The Native feelings will be against it, Bengalis being excepted.

25. If competition (whether limited or open) is preferred, should there be one competition for all India or separate competitions in each Province?—Competition is generally not preferred; but if it be held, it should be separate in each Province.

26. If there were only one general competition, how would you ensure a due proportion of appointments falling to the population of the several Provinces?—If there be one general competition, the number of appointments should fall equally to the share of each community, viz., Hindus and Mahomedans.

27. Having regard to the varying educational standards reached in the several Provinces, and the varying conditions prevalent therein, is it possible to have any one system of selection for all India which would not result in the inhabitants of some Provinces being more or less excluded from a due share of appointments?—Not possible.

28. Under any of the three systems of nomination, limited competition, any open competition, would you prescribe any tests of preliminary qualifications on the part of nominees or candidates in regard to (1) age, (2) intellectual capacity, (3) moral, social, and physical fitness?—Yes.

29. If so, what should be the tests under each of the heads specified?—There should be no restrictions as to the age of nominees in service and legal profession; in other cases the age should not be below 21 and above 25. As to moral, social, and intellectual capacity, the certificates of the local officers will do; and for physical fitness a doctor's certificate.

30. Do you consider that (after selection whether by nomination or competition) there should be a period of probation?—In case of nomination from persons in service, no probation is required; in case of others there should be.

31. If so, what should be the duration of the probationary period?—Two years.

32. Should the period of probation be passed in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service, or of the Covenanted Service, or in what other manner?—As an Uncovenanted servant.

33. Do you consider that after selection and before entering on probation (or on duty) the person selected should undergo special training?—They should undergo a special training, with the exception of members of the Bar and men in service.

34. If so, should the special training be carried out in India or in England?—In England.

35. If in India, would it be possible, and, if possible, advisable, to establish an Indian Civil Service College on the basis of the Haileybury College which formerly existed in England?—Possible, but not advisable.

36. If you do not consider special training in England essential, would you encourage nominees or selected candidates to visit England with a view to add to their qualifications for the service?—We consider it essential, and on the contrary we encourage their visit to England.

37. If so, what form should such encouragement take?—Some allowance should be given by Government and some hopes for their future prospects.

38. Should it be offered before, or during, or after the probationary period, if any, through which nominees or selected candidates may be required to pass?—Before probation.

* The questions which follow, down to No. 39 inclusive, are put subject to the same assumption.

39. Should it be offered before or after the nominees or selected candidates enter on their duties?—Before.

40. Are you in favor of the establishment of scholarships tenable by Natives in England for the purpose of enabling them to qualify for the Civil or Statutory Service?—Yes, certainly.

41. If so, how would you connect such a scheme with the selection of Natives for employment in the higher administrative posts in India?—The rules for the selection of persons for the Civil Service will do for administrative posts too.

42. Do you think that any distinction should be made between the emoluments of nominees or selected candidates who have been trained in England or have gone to England to add to their qualifications and those who have not?—Yes.

43. If the opportunity of residence in England at a University for two years with a sufficient allowance were offered to nominees or selected candidates, is it likely that it would be taken advantage of to any great extent?—Most likely.

44. If the system of examination in England were revised with the result that Natives availed themselves of it in considerable numbers, would it still be necessary to retain the Statutory system?—It will be necessary for persons already in service and for members of the Bar.

45. If so, to what appointments or classes of appointments would you restrict the latter system, and what conditions over and above those already existing would you impose?—No restrictions required. The same conditions as have been mentioned in the answer No. 12.

III.—Competition in England for the Indian Civil Service.

46. Is competition of Natives in the examination in England favourably looked upon by large and important classes in India?—Yes, Bengalis being excepted.

47. Should additional facilities be given to Natives for proceeding to England and entering the Indian Civil Service by the channel of the English competition?—Yes.

48. If so, what form or forms should such facilities take?—A part of travelling allowances and scholarships.

49. What conditions, if any, should be attached to them?—Their literal attainments and intellectual capacities should be tested before their departure. *Secondly*, an agreement for refunding the money should be executed by the nominee, so that money might be refunded in the case of his returning without appearing in the examination and without sufficient excuse.

50. What is your opinion as to giving Statutory appointments to Natives, who, though they may have failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, have shown merit in the English competition?—There is no objection if the existing Statutory system remains in force.

51. Assuming it to be advisable to appoint to the Statutory Service in India Natives who have failed in the English competition, should such persons receive the same training as successful candidates in England, and be subject to the same final examination?—Yes.

52. Should they on appointment to the Statutory Service in India be subject to the same incidents as apply to other persons appointed under the Statutory Rules?—Yes.

53. Can you say what number of Natives belonging to your Province have presented themselves annually at the competitive examination in England, and what degree of success they attained?—As far as I know, one person only appeared in the competitive examination and failed.

54. What class or classes of Natives in your Province readily go to England?—Wealthy members of every community.

55. Are objections entertained to going to England; and, if so, what are they, and by what classes in particular are they felt?—The objections are only entertained by the uneducated class of Hindus, and these objections are giving way before the spread of civilization, and they relate to the loss of religion.

56. Should the examination for Natives in England be distinct in standards and conditions from that for English candidates, or should there be one and the same examination for all?—No distinction required.

57. If the standards and conditions were different, how would it be possible to compare the results in the two examinations so as to bring out one list in order of merit?—Not possible.

58. Would it, under such circumstances, be desirable to allot a fixed proportion of appointments to each of the two examinations?—In the case of two examinations such an allotment is only required, and I am of opinion for one examination.

59. If a fixed proportion of appointments were allotted for a Native examination in England, do you consider that in view of the objections against a voyage to England and life there, the cost thereof and the chances of failure, a sufficient number of suitable candidates from your Province would be available to make the competition a real competition?—Yes.

60. If the examinations were distinct, what should be the limits of age for the Native examination?—Twenty-five years.

61. What should be the conditions, nature, and subjects of the separate Native examination?—Subjects and conditions should be the same as in the other examinations.

62. Assuming only one examination in England for both English and Native candidates, do you consider that the subjects and standards of examination and the conditions as to age and other matters in any respect place Native candidates at a disadvantage as compared with English candidates?—They do place Natives at a disadvantage.

63. If so, in what respects are Native candidates placed at a disadvantage, and what alterations would you recommend with a view to remove that disadvantage?—In respect of age, the standard of age should be raised.

64. If there should be only one examination for all candidates, should the limits of age for Natives be higher than those at present fixed for European candidates; and, if so, what should the limits for Native candidates be?—The age of Natives should be higher, and it should be twenty-five years.

65. If higher limits of age were fixed for Native than for European candidates, might not the latter complain that they were placed at a disadvantage?—They may complain, but their complaints are unreasonable, because the Natives suffer under the disadvantage of English language being foreign to them.

66. What is the average age at which Natives at the Indian Universities pass the examination for F.A., B.A., and M.A. respectively?—F.A., twenty years; B.A., twenty-two years; M.A., twenty-three years.

67. From what classes of Native society are the persons who graduate at the Indian Universities usually drawn in your Province?—Traders, bankers, and agriculturists.

IV.—Competition in India for the Indian Civil Service.

68. Do you advocate a competition in India for the Civil Service simultaneously with the competition in England, the same question-papers being used at both examinations?—No.

69. How would this method of selection be regarded by the Native community generally?—With great dissatisfaction.

70. If you advocate such a system, would you restrict the competition in India to Natives, and that in England to English candidates, or would you admit both classes freely to either examination?—I don't advocate.

71. If Native candidates were admitted to the competition in England, while English candidates were excluded from the competition in India, on what grounds could this distinction be justified?—I do not advocate the system of two examinations, and such a proposal shall be apparently unjustifiable.

72. Do you consider that the educational institutions available in India are at present capable of giving the very high class education which it was the object of the competitive system as introduced in 1855 to secure?—Not available.

73. Would an open competition in India be likely to give decided advantages to any particular class or classes of the Native community over others?—It will.

74. Would it be likely to lead to the undue preponderance of any one class or caste in the public service?—It will.

75. Do you think there are any objections on political or administrative grounds to open competition in India?—Yes.

76. Would the introduction of an open competitive examination in India have the effect of deterring cadets of leading families from aspiring to enter the ranks of the Civil Service?—Yes.

77. Under such a system how would it be possible to provide against the Natives of a Province in which education is comparatively backward being excluded from appointments in their own Province?—To encourage education and to reserve appointments of a Province for its population.

78. Would a system of provincial examinations be preferable to one examination for the whole of India?—Yes.

79. Under a system of open competition in India would the successful candidates be regarded as occupying a position inferior to that of persons who enter the Service through the channel of the open competition in England?—Yes.

80. Supposing that the Covenanted appointments were allotted in fixed proportions, a certain number to be obtained by competition in England and a certain number by competition in India, the examinations in each case being open on fairly equal conditions to Natives and English candidates alike, and the Statutory system being abolished, how would such a system be viewed?—Not generally preferred.

81. If an open competition were established in India, what should be the preliminary qualifications required on the part of candidates in regard to age? *and*

82. In regard to minimum educational attainments? *and*

83. In regard to moral, social, and physical fitness? *and*

84. In other respects (if any)?—Age from twenty-one to twenty-five; minimum attainments, F.A.; certificate of local officers in regard to moral and social, and Civil Surgeon's certificate in regard to physical, fitness. The certificate of local officers shall do in other respects, too.

85. Should the subjects and conditions of the examination be the same as those prescribed for the competitive examination in England, or should they be different?—If the examination be allowed, the subjects should be the same, but conditions different.

86. If different, what should they be?—They should undergo a training in England for two years.

87. Circumstances being different in the case of persons who enter through the examination in England and of persons who enter through the examination in India, is there any reason why the rules in regard to to pay, leave, pension, &c., should not also be different?—If the condition mentioned in answer No. 86 is complied with, no difference is required; otherwise it is reasonable.

88. Should successful candidates go through a period of special study in India

like the English candidates who spend two years in special preparation?—They should go.

89. Would it be preferable (*a*) to require them to go to England, or (*b*) to give them the option of going to England, suitable allowances being given to enable them to prosecute their studies there?—They should be required to go.

90. Should successful candidates at the Indian competition be required to pass through a probationary period before final appointment?—Yes.

91. If so, what shuld be the duration of the probationary period?—Two years.

92. How should it be passed, in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service or otherwise?—In the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service.

V.—Promotion from the Uncovenanted Service.

93. What special provision, if any, do you think should be made for the appointments to Covenanted posts of deserving members of the Uncovenanted Service?—They should be appointed on the recommendation of their superior officers in regard to their family, fidelity and good service. They need not go through a probationary period, but they must be appointed to officiate for a short time. If any one goes to England, his rights should be superior to others.

94. If such appointments are made, should they be restricted to the holders of any particular classes of appointments in the Uncovenanted Service; and, if so, what classes?—They should be restricted to the post of Extra Assistant Commissioner or such other equal post.

95. Should persons so appointed be appointed provisionally and be required to pass through a period of probation before final confirmation?—The appointment should be provisional, but the nominees should not pass through the probationary period.

96. Should provision be made for the appointment of qualified members of the Uncovenanted Service to the higher Covenanted offices without requiring them to pass through the lower grades?—Generally they should pass through the lower grades, but with the high recommendation of their officers they might be excepted.

97. If certain appointments in the Covenanted grades are set part for the Statutory Service, should a fixed proportion of those appointments be expressly reserved for persons of proved merit and ability in the Uncovenanted Service?—Yes.

98. Should special provision be made for the promotion to Covenanted posts of European members of the Uncovenanted Service?—No.

99. Should special provision be made for the promotion to such posts of Eurasian or other members of the Uncovenanted Service who, though not Natives of pure descent, fall within the meaning attached in the Statute of 1870 to the term "Natives of India"?—No.

100. Ought not the Uncovenanted Service, equally with the Covenanted Service, to be open to all natural-born subjects of Her Majesty who possess the qualifications that, may be from time to time prescribed?—Ought not.

101. If the Uncovenanted Service is closed to any natural-born subjects of Her Majesty, on what grounds, bearing in mind the terms of Acts of Parliament and Her Majesty's Proclamation of 1st November 1858, is this to be justified?—I don't justify exclusion.

VI.—Pay, Leave, and Pension for Natives of India appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than through the channel of competition in England.

102. Is the rate* of pay at present granted to Statutory Civilians during probation and on final appointment, respectively sufficient?—Not sufficient.

* Two hundred rupees a month on first appointment as probationers. Two hundred and fifty rupees a month after passing the Departmental Examination by the lower standard. After passing the Departmental Examination by the higher standard (unless specially exempted) and after having been confirmed in their appointments, 64 per cent of what would be the gross pay or salary of the office if it were held by a Covenanted Civil Servant appointed after competitive examination in England.

103. If not, on what grounds do you consider it insufficient, and what rates of pay should, in your opinion, be granted to Statutory Civilians (*a*) while on probation, and (*b*) on final confirmation in their appointments?—It is insufficient with regard to the office expenditure. On probation they should get Rs. 400 at least, and on final confirmation they should receive the same pay as Civilians.

104. Would these rates of pay be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the Uncovenanted Service?—Would be suitable in the majority of cases.

105. Would they be suitable in the case of persons appointed to Covenanted posts from the professional classes?—Would be suitable in the majority of cases.

106. If not, how would you treat in regard to pay persons selected from these two classes if appointed to the lowest grade of the Covenanted Service?—The rate would be suitable for the persons who already in service draw less than the rate prescribed, and for persons from the professional class of the lowest grade.

107. How would you treat in regard to pay such persons if appointed to any of the

higher Covenanted posts without being required to pass through the lower grades?—In case of officiating on probation, the pay should be fixed with regard to the post, and after confirmation full pay should be allotted.

108. Do you consider that a difference should be maintained between the rates of pay granted to Covenanted Civilians, who enter through the competitive channel in England, and to persons holding Covenanted posts who do not enter through that channel?—No.

109. If so, what would you consider the fair rate of reduction to be made in the case of persons holding Covenanted posts who do not enter through the competitive channel in England?—In my opinion no difference is required; therefore I do not consider any reduction necessary.

110. Would you approve of an arrangement by which the pay of appointments would be a fixed sum to be drawn by the holder whether he is a Covenanted or a Statutory Civilian, with an additional staff allowance to be drawn by those only who enter the service through the examination in England?—The arrangement shall not be acceptable if it be restricted for those who enter the service through the examination in England, and at the same time it should be open to persons who have visited England.

111. Can you suggest any other way of providing different rates of pay?—No.

112. If you consider there should be no difference of pay, how do you justify the application of the same rates of pay in the case of Natives who have satisfied the very high tests required by the examination in England and Natives who have not?—By the arrangement of allowance.

113. On the same assumption, what are your reasons for holding that the high rate of pay, which is considered to be necessary to secure the services of persons of tested qualifications in a country far from their homes, and under various other unfavorable conditions, should be given to persons whose qualifications have not been so tested and who serve in their own native country?—As I have proposed that persons whose qualifications have not been tested should go to England far from their homes and to suffer in the same manner, therefore it is unnecessary for me to give any reason.

114. Have you any remarks to make on the leave rules embodied in the Civil Leave Code which apply to Statutory Civilians?—I remark that the rules are strict in case of pay on leave.

115. At what age do you consider that Natives appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than through the competitive channel in England should be entitled to retire on pension?—At the same age as the persons who enter through the competitive examination in England.

116. After what length of service do you consider that such persons should be entitled to retire on pension?—As other Civilians.

117. At what age should they be obliged to retire on pension?—Sixty years.

118. After what length of service should they be obliged to retire on pension?—Thirty-five years.

119. What amount of pension should, in your opinion, be granted to Natives so appointed if they serve the prescribed period for voluntary and compulsory retirement respectively?—As in the case of European Civilians.

120. If before serving the prescribed period for pension they are compelled to retire on medical certificate, what gratuity, if any, would you give them?—As in the case of European Civilians.

VII.—General.

121. How far is the existing system of education in the higher schools and colleges in India well adapted for training young men to the public service? Can you suggest any improvements?—The existing system is not well adapted. For the higher grades young men should be trained in England, and for the lower grades arrangement should be made in the chools and colleges.

122. In 1854 Lord Macaulay's Committee were of opinion that the best, the most liberal, and the most finished education to be procured in England was a necessary qualification for admission to the Civil Service. Do Indian schools and colleges at present supply an education of so high a standard?- They do not.

123. Do you consider that Indian schools at present develop the force of character and other qualities required for English administration?—To a certain extent.

124. Do we now obtain for Government service Natives of the classes who under Native rule carried on the civil administration of the country?—They do obtain to a small extent.

125. If not, where must we look for representatives of these classes, and how do you consider that their services could be best obtained?—The majority of Mahomedans and their representatives can be found in India, and their services are readily available if Government pay special attention to their education.

126. How far would any system of appointment which involves a journey to and residence in England be regarded by the Native community as open to objection on the ground that it requires Hindu candidates to abandon their caste as a condition of entering the Civil Service?—At present to a very, very small extent.

127. How far would such a system be regarded as open to objection on the ground that it restricts the field of selection to those candidates who are wealthy enough to undertake the cost of a journey to and residence in England?—It shall be objected against,

of course, but their objections shall be removed to some extent if the Government gives them some aid in their expenses.

128. Are the Natives who go to England from your Province for purposes of education limited to the wealthier classes?—Yes, they are.

129. Are they limited to any particular section of the community, or to any particular creed?—Not limited to any particular creed.

130. Does a voyage to or residence in England involve the loss of social position or other unfavorable consequences in the case of any section of the Native community?—Not at all.

131. Does it result in placing those Natives who undertake it more or less out of touch and sympathy with their fellow-countrymen on their return to India?—It does not.

132. Would the requirement of a temporary residence in England as a condition precedent to or following on appointment to the Government service have the effect of excluding from such appointment any considerable or important section of the Native community?—None.

133. If the Statutory system is discontinued, should special provision be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of Natives who, for religious or other sufficient reasons, are unable or unwilling to undertake a journey to and residence in England?—If the system be discontinued, the rules for taking Uncovenanted Servants into Covenanted Service shall do.

134. If so, what provision should be made for this purpose?—If the system be discontinued, the rules for taking Uncovenanted Servants into Covenanted Service shall do.

135. If the Statutory system is discontinued, do you consider that special provision should be made for the appointment to Covenanted posts of capable members of the professional classes?—The special provision should be made.

136. If so, what provision should be made for this purpose?—A member of five years' standing at least be appointed, due regard being made to his merits and abilities too.

137. Whatever system or systems may be adopted, ought power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts candidates of high family subject to such antecedent guarantees of fitness as may be considered sufficient in each case?—There should be.

138. Ought similar power to be reserved to Government to appoint to Covenanted posts persons who have proved their merit and ability in Government service, or in the exercise of a profession, without preliminary examination or competition?—Yes, of course.

139. If a thorough knowledge of English were made an essential qualification for appointment to Covenanted posts, would the field of selection in the case of persons already in the Uncovenanted Service, or engaged in the exercise of a profession, be unduly limited thereby?—Yes, it will be.

140. If such is likely to be the case, could the difficulty be obviated by requiring proficiency in the English language to be tested by periodical examinations after selection, but during a probationary period?—No.

141. Should provision be made for the occasional appointment in very special and exceptional cases to Covenanted posts of persons of known ability and local influence, whom, although they may never have held office and may not possess special professional qualifications, and although their age may exceed the limit laid down for untried candidates, it might nevertheless be considered desirable to appoint to the higher grades for political or other reasons?—There should be made.

142. Would it be desirable to rule that the proportion of persons being Hindus and Mahomedans, respectively, who are from time to time or over a series of years appointed to the Covenanted ranks in any Province, should bear a certain relation to the number of the two classes composing the population of the Province concerned?—It should bear no relation to population; the posts should be distributed equally.

143. What classes, ranks or professions of the Native community should be included among Mahomedans and Hindus, respectively, for the purpose of ascertaining the proportion of the population of each of those classes in the several Provinces?—Persons who are Mahomedans under the general acceptation of the term and among the Hindus, Khatris, Brahmins, and Veshis.

144. How far should appointments in each Province to Covenanted posts be restricted to Natives of the Province concerned?—Three-fourths.

145. How would the following scheme be regarded by the Native community:—

(1) The Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of European officers, admission being by competition in England, confined to European candidates only.

(2) The appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, Natives only being eligible?—Will not be acceptable to general public.

146. How would you regard such a scheme?—As a dangerous scheme.

147. How would the Native community regard the following:—

(1) The Covenanted Civil Service to be reduced to a fixed number of appointments to be filled by competition in England to which Natives and Europeans alike would be admitted.

(2) The appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service to be filled by appointment in India, both

Natives and Europeans being eligible?—The Native community will regard it with dissatisfaction.

148. How would you regard such a scheme?—My opinion is opposed to it.

149. If either of the above schemes were adopted, how would the Native community view a proposal to combine the higher appointments of the Uncovenanted Service with the appointments taken from the Covenanted Civil Service so as to form an enlarged Civil Service to be recruited in India?—The Native community is against the adoption of any of the above schemes, and so the proposal shall also be received with dissatisfaction.

150. How would you view such a proposal?—I will accept it reluctantly.

151. How would the Native community regard the following scheme?—

(1) A certain number of appointments in the Covenanted Civil Service to be reserved for Natives.

(2) A certain proportion of that number to be filled by competition or by some other system in India.

(3) The remainder to be filled by competition in England.—Unacceptable.

152. How would you regard such a scheme?—Unreasonable.

154. What is your opinion as to giving such preference?—I consider it reasonable.

155. How would the Native community regard a system of nomination on the ground of merit and ability shown in the service of Government, or in the exercise of a profession, alternating with a system of selection by means of competition, whether entirely open or amongst nominated candidates?—The system of selection by competition shall be regarded as unacceptable, Bengalis being excepted, but the nomination on the ground of merit and ability in the service of Government or in the service of a profession shall be preferred.

156. How would you regard such a system?—I am against the alternative system of selection by competition and for the other.

158. In the case of persons nominated from the professional classes, is it desirable that a probationary period should be prescribed?—There should be.

160. On what principles should the promotion of Natives appointed to Covenanted posts otherwise than by the channel of the competition in England be regulated?—Those persons who have visited England should be preferred for promotion.

161. Would you regulate such promotion only by considerations of fitness and approved personal merit?—The conditions mentioned in No. 160 should also be paid due consideration.

162. Should subjects of Native States be eligible for appointment to Covenanted posts in British India?—No.

163. If so, should this be extended to all Native States in alliance with the Crown, or only to those in subordinate alliance?—In my opinion this condition should not be extended to the subject of any State, whether in alliance or subordination.

164. What system, if any, is at present adopted in your Province for bringing into the public service persons who, from their position or otherwise, cannot be expected to enter the service of Government in the lowest grades, and for giving them the necessary apprenticeship?—None to my knowledge.

165. Does the system work well, and what improvements can you suggest?—No system in existence within my knowledge.

VIII.—Composition, recruitment, &c., of the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services.

166. How is the present system of regulating appointments to the Subordinate* Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, regarded by influential sections of the Native community?—Not satisfactory, especially to Mahomedans.

167. To what sections of Native society do the persons belong who accept under existing conditions appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively?—The Hindus and Mahomedans both are ready to accept; the Hindus succeed and Mahomedans cannot get somehow.

168. To what extent do Natives of good family and education in your Province offer themselves as candidates for Subordinate Judicial and Executive appointments?—To some extent.

169. Do Natives who have been to England for purposes of study on their return to India willingly accept such appointments?—They do not.

170. How far are the professional classes represented in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, in your Province?—To a very, very small extent.

171. Do members of the professional classes in your Province readily accept employment in those services?—Yes, they do.

172. Whatever system or systems may at present be adopted for the purpose of regulating appointments to the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services, respectively, are any class or classes of persons expressly or practically excluded from such appointments?—The posts should be equally distributed among Hindus and

* NOTE.—For the purposes of these questions the terms "Subordinate Executive Service" and "Subordinate Judicial Service" may be held to include, respectively, all Subordinate Executive and Judicial Offices down to and including the office of Tahsildar or Munsif, or other office corresponding to that of Tahsildar or Munsif, which are not reserved for or not ordinarily held by members of the Covenanted Civil Service.

Mahomedans; the members of the Bar should also be taken notice of.

173. If so, how is such exclusion justified?—Such exclusion is not justified.

174. Is it the case that certain classes of Uncovenanted appointments are practically reserved for Natives of pure descent owing to the fact that conditions are imposed which have resulted in shutting out Eurasians and other Statutory Natives of mixed descent?—No such case.

175. If so, how is such reservation justified?—No case and no justification.

176. Are you in favor of laying down a rule that high educational capacity should be regarded as an essential qualification for appointment to the Subordinate Executive and to the Subordinate Judicial Services as defined for the purposes of these questions?—I am not in favor.

177. If so, what test would you apply?—Entrance examination will do.

178. Do you think that the test should vary according to the character of the office to be filled?—It should not.

179. Generally, what system do you advocate for filling appointments in the Subordinate Executive and Subordinate Judicial Services as above defined?—Persons of respectable family and of good moral and social character, and the appointment should be by nomination without competition.

180. What preliminary qualifications would you require on the part of candidates for those appointments in regard to age and in other respects?—Age twenty-one or above, and other qualifications mentioned in No. 179.

181. Is it possible to devise any one system which would be equally applicable to all Provinces, having regard to the varying educational standards reached in the several Provinces and the varying conditions prevalent therein?—It is possible if the preliminary education qualifications be Entrance examination, and the mukhtar and pleader being considered as possessing these qualifications.

182. Do you advocate the requirement of a probationary period; and, if so, what should be the incidents of such period as to duration, pay, and in other respects?—A probationary period is required. It should be six months, and pay 80 per cent.

183. Would you require a probationary period in all cases, or would you dispense with it in certain, and, if so, in what, cases?—It should not be dispensed with in any case.

184. If an open competitive examination were held in India for the Covenanted posts reserved for Natives, would persons who gained high marks in that examination and showed decided proficiency, but who failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, form suitable nominees for Subordinate Judicial and Executive appointments in the Uncovenanted Service?—They will form suitable nominees, but they should be preferred to the exclusion of others.

No. VI.

ANSWERS BY MAULVI PIRZADA MAHOMED HUSSAIN, M.A., EXTRA ASSISTANT COMMISSIONER, PUNJAB.

Entered the Punjab Commission by competition in May 1884.

Vol. I, Sec. II, Sub Sec B.

Maulvi *P Mahomed Hussain.*

Statutory Service.—The service is so young that no opinion can be passed as to its working. I would wish to retain this service, for the most part as it is, but with the modification that a quarter of the appointments be guaranteed to that service, and that one-half of the appointments so reserved be allotted as rewards for the Uncovenanted Service, and the other half be given to cadets of aristocratic families. All appointments to be given by nomination and not by competition, whether general or limited. Local Governments should exercise the utmost discretion in their selections that only persons of approved merits, which includes education to a certain fixed standard, be nominated, and that no class or religion be unduly made predominant. If the Supreme Government see that any religion is not entirely or is deficiently represented in the result of the Civil Service examination, they should issue directions to the Local Governments to confine their choice as far as possible to the votaries of that religion and class. All persons nominated to the Statutory Service, whether selected from the Uncovenanted Service, or from high families in the Province, should be compelled to proceed to England for two years to complete their education there at the expense of the Government.

I would extend the definition of "Natives of India" to Europeans in the Uncovenanted Service and their children without any restriction, and to the Natives of the Native States and foreign refugees in India.

Nomination is the soul of the Statutory Service; and if competition or limited competition is to take its place, then there is no necessity to have this service set apart from the organized Civil Service.

Civil Service.—I would like the open competition for the Civil Service to be held in England only. To hold the whole of such examination or any part of it in India will be a great mistake both politically and economically. I would propose the following changes in the Civil Service examination :—

(1) Elementary Urdu written in Roman character to be made compulsory.

(2) Persian to be made alternate with German and French, with equal marks for each.

(3) Equal marks to be allotted to Arabic, Sanscrit, Latin, and Greek.

(4) The limit of age to be raised to twenty-two; and if this limit be objected to by European candidates on considerations peculiar to them, the limit should certainly be raised, in the case of Natives only, to twenty-one.

There should be no distinction between the Natives and Europeans in point of pay and furlough and putting the Natives in charge of executive administration. Distinctions like this will give rise to unnecessary heartburning and jealousy. As to the Natives being put in charge of the executive administration, there should be no absolute prohibition; but the Local Governments might be directed to exercise great discretion and caution in matters like this, and to make experiments with unbiassed minds.

Uncovenanted Service.—The higher posts should be filled partly by nomination and partly by competition. The proportion of the former to the latter should be 3 to 1. Competition should not be extended to the posts of Tahsildars and Naib Tahsildars for the present.

No. VII.

MEMORANDUM AND ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS BY C. L. TUPPER, ESQ., C.S., JUNIOR SECRETARY TO GOVERNMENT, PUNJAB.

Memorandum on the employment of Natives of India in the Civil Administration of the country.

Vol. I, Sec. III, Sub-Sec B.

C. L. *Tupper*, Esq.

I RECOMMEND that the Statutory system be entirely given up, and I concur generally in the remark made in paragraph 7 of Punjab Government letter No. 2534 of the 7th November 1885, that the true solution of the question is to raise the age for admission to the competitive examination in England, to close the side door of admission to the Covenanted Civil Service by nomination in India, to considerably reduce the cadre of that service, reserving it strictly for those who enter by the examination, and, in lieu of the reduced numbers, to create a parallel service to be officered exclusively in India.

I shall not attempt to exhaust the objections which may be taken to the Statutory system. Some of them are stated in the letter of the Punjab Government which I have just quoted. Whether regard be had to the policy of Government, to the intention of the Legislature, to the interests of the people, or to service claims, the Statutory system seems to me, under every one of these heads, a very bad one. The policy of Government is, I understand, by gradual and cautious measures to arrange for "the admission of subjects of whatever race or creed to offices for which they may be qualified by education, ability, and integrity;" and to "devise a scheme which may reasonably be hoped to possess the necessary elements of finality, and to do full justice to the claims of Natives of India to higher and more extensive employment in the public service." A characteristic, therefore, of a good system should be a capacity for safe extension; and assuredly the Statutory system does not admit of this. The more men with inferior attainments you admit on a reduced rate of pay into the ranks of the Covenanted Service, the more heart-burnings will be caused in the present, and the thicker will be the crop of future difficulties. The intention of the Statute is to admit Natives of India of proved merit and ability to particular offices, places and employments in the Civil Service. So far as the system admits untried men, whether they be the products of old or new India, the sons of the leaders of the people, or brand-new B. A's of departmental manufacture and no family, it ignores proof of merit and ability; for I cannot admit that the educational tests heretofore applied afford the sort of proof which must have been intended by the Statute. Once untried men are brought in, the principle of appointment to particular offices is not in practice carried out. They are of necessity placed at the bottom of the list, and equally of necessity, even though it be declared that they are not members of the Covenanted Civil Service, they are promoted in their turn, unless they expose themselves to supersession by actual misconduct. In the matter of service claims the system works extraordinary confusion. It throws into uncertainty the official prospects of the Covenanted Civil Service and of the Military officers ranked with them in non-Regulation Provinces. For the security of these prospects it is of little avail to limit the nominations allotted to Natives of India to one-fifth of the total number of Civil Servants appointed by the Secretary of State in the year, if persons held to be of proved merit and ability may stop promotion by being appointed, without previous service in the Commission proper, to high places in the list. The Uncovenanted Service, outside the Commission proper, are also drawn into jealousy and disgust. The rates of pay in the highest grades of the Uncovenanted Service being double the rates in the lowest grade of the Commission proper, there can be no equable promotion from one service to the other. If an officer some way down in the Uncovenanted list is promoted to the Commission, there is a grievance at once for his Uncovenanted seniors; and if such an officer is promoted to a high place in the Commission, the resentment of the officers of the Commission, not indeed against the particular man, but against the action of Government which has retarded their promotion, is apt to be bitter in the extreme. I have said that the untried men brought in as Statutory recruits at the bottom of the Covenanted list must in practice be promoted in their turn like others; but the system itself pointedly asserts that their claim to promotion is something lower and something less than that of their brother-officers doing the same work. Add to all this that the men obtained for the Statutory Service are, at least in the Punjab, of just the same classes as the men of whom our Uncovenanted Service is composed; hence, in all probability, a cause of discontent to the veteran Extra Assistants, themselves often men of birth and breeding, who see mere lads taking substantially a higher rank. From a field thus thickly sown with the seeds of official discontent, we should hardly expect to reap the fruit of successful administration; or if success is attained in the sense of popular contentment, it will be gained in spite of the system not as its consequence. Moreover, the principles of the open competition are a guarantee to the country that the chief body of Indian civil servants shall be recruited by merit and not

Vol. I, Sec. III, Sub-Sec. B.

C. L. *Tupper*, Esq.

by patronage. The Statutory system infringes these principles, because it provides no effective test of merit, and resorts to local patronage just where mistakes or misuse of power will do most harm.

We have, as I have said, "to do full justice to the claims of Natives of India to higher and more extensive employment in the public service." To be just we must not sacrifice the interests of the great mass of the people who do not seek office, nor of the official classes who already hold it. It is admitted that more Natives must be brought into the public service and that Native public servants, as a class, must be enabled to rise to higher positions than are ordinarily open to them now; but we are not to yield every point raised by interested clamour or to seek, regardless of the cost, the silence and contentment of vociferous youth eager to gratify vanity and disport an half-educated mind in the ill-realized responsibilities of actual government. What then are the classes whose claims to employment or promotion we have to meet without injuring the rights or legitimate interests of other classes equally deserving consideration? If that question were asked in a newly-annexed country, immediately after annexation, the reply, unless the officials of the Government which preceded us were manifestly hostile or incapable, would probably be that those already in office, and the classes from which officials had been habitually drawn by our predecessors, had the first claims to share in the administration. Classes and traditions are long lived; and I do not think the question, what men would have been prominent servants of Government under the Native rule which preceded us, should be forgotten in any part of British India. The classes which would have found well-paid and responsible employment would not have been the same throughout the empire; they would have differed, for example, under the Sikhs, under the Mahrattas, and in the organized provinces of the Mughal dominion. Whatever these classes in any province may be ascertained to be, I think their claims to employment under the British Government should be very fully considered, both on account of the class interest, which should no more be overlooked than any other, and because in the general interest we should be wise to presume the probability of hereditary aptitude and to secure the advantages of customary exercise of power. In addition to these classes, there are others owing their existence to British rule, the Native officials of the judicial and executive departments, no doubt including many who would have obtained service in a former state of things, and the Native members of learned or scientific professions, the Engineers and Medical men, who are indeed Government servants, and the pleaders and other legal practitioners who are not in public employ. While we do our utmost to promote education, the number of posts for which the services of educated men are wanted is limited by the claims of Covenanted officers, by the actual requirements of the administration, and by strict regard to financial considerations. Hence there is a tendency to increase in the number of not very well-educated persons, who accept positions below their own estimate of their abilities or become pettifoggers or journalists of no repute, and relieve their discontent by agitation, which does not represent the real feeling of the country, and by writing articles to abuse their betters in vernacular newspapers of no importance and of very limited circulation. In some provinces, particularly, I believe, in Bengal, Madras, and Bombay, English education has made great advances; and there are many really well-educated men who owe their training to the British educational policy. In nothing said do I intend the slightest disrespect to the cultivated Mahratta Brahmans and leading members of the Bengal Zemindari Associations, whose intellectual strength is well known. With reference to these classes in Western India and Bengal, the Government has, no doubt, incurred a great responsibility. The Government has also a very serious responsibility in regard to the persons of European descent, born and domiciled in the country, both Eurasians and others, whose presence is a consequence of British occupation For people of this kind, the usual avocations of the mass of the Native population are very generally unsuited. They have shown aptitude for public business in the positions which are open to them, and no scheme for the further employment of Natives could be regarded as complete if it left the interest of this class out of view.

Of course, some of these various classes overlap each other to a great extent, and I shall make my meaning clearer by referring to the actual distribution of classes in my own Province. The vast majority of the population, the agricultural tribes and castes, self-cultivating proprietors and tenants of small holdings, the village servants, the menials and artizans and small shopkeepers of the big towns, men of no particular family and without education, or at best able to do merely so much reading, writing and counting as is necessary to carry on a small trade, are not candidates for office. The question affects them in another way. It is of great consequence to them what sort of man we set over them as Judges as District Officers, and Assistants to District Officers, as Munsifs and Tahsildars. The claimants for Government employment as for offices higher than those now usually open to Natives, may, I think, be grouped thus:—

I. Men of good family.
II. Servants of Government of proved merit and ability.
III. Native Lawyers.
IV. Other educated Natives, not in Government service.
V. Eurasians and Europeans born and domiciled in India.

VI. The hereditary penmen of the country, men of the writer castes or classes, such as Kaiths and Khatris and Kashmiri Pandits, and the like.

The first group includes the Kháns of the frontier districts and their families, and the headmen of tribes in some of the north-western districts where the tribal organization is much the same as on the frontier. In the Central Punjab, it includes the Sikh Sardars, the chiefs who, in the old days, would have organized *misls* or soldier bands not unlike the free companies of medieval Europe, led armies in the field, administered provinces for the Khalsa, and exercised some of the functions of sovereignty within their own domains. In the north, it includes the Hill Rajas, the Rajput Chiefs of petty territories, not classed by us as foreign territory like that of the Simla Hill Chiefs, but nevertheless such that, in other days and in the hands of a capable ruler, almost any part of it might have become the nucleus of political power. Here, too, I would reckon the descendants of some of the leading officials employed by the Sikhs, both Hindus and Mahomedans. These last would be able to hold their own with bookmen and lawyers; but we must not forget that the rest belong to a state of society which existed in Europe in præfeudal times, long before the revival of learning, the rise of the Universities, the commercial development of towns and the increase of kingly power, raised up classes of scholars and burgesses to contend with territorial and military aristocracies for the possession of political authority. We must do and are doing all we can to educate the sons of Punjab Chiefs; but we should certainly commit a grave political error if we cut ourselves off from using the services of these men unless they could be squeezed through the narrow door of a competitive examination. I say this not only because an unemployed aristocracy is, if discontented, itself a political danger; but because the leaders of the people, if no longer permitted to exercise authority, will gradually lose their power to lead. In France, jurisdiction passed from the old nobility into the hands of bourgeois officials belonging to a highly centralized official heirarchy; and the nobility become mere rent receivers, not only lost their influence with the peasantry but incurred their bitterest hatred.

The second group may be limited for the present to officers of the judicial and executive departments, the Extra Assistants, Extra Judicial Assistants, Munsifs and Tahsildars, and clerks of the higher grades. I understand that the cases of Engineers and Medical men and the very large and important question of Military service for Natives will be separately taken up. Native servants of Government in the department which I am now considering should, I think, be enabled to rise to high positions, perhaps, in course of time, to positions as high as those which would have been open under Native rule to hereditary servants of the State unconnected with ruling families. If a man of good family comes into any of these departments, he should be treated like any one else as regards promotion and discipline. Ordinarily, the promotion from Tahsildar or Munsif to Extra Assistant would be to the bottom of the list. But it should be understood that for very exceptional service and ability a man might be promoted to certain reserved posts in any part of the list.

For both the first and second group a power of nomination is required. It is also required for the third group. Some may think we should have done better if we had determined to have no lawyers at all.

At best this opinion is a barren regret. Having got the lawyers, we must make the best of them. The way to raise the tone and capacity of the Bar is to make it here, as in Europe, a stepping stone to the Bench. Men in good practice will not accept petty pay. In organizing the higher grades of the Native Civil Service—I would call the newly-organized body the Indian Civil Service and designate the present Indian Civil Service either the Imperial Civil Service or by the Presidency names of the Bengal, Bombay, or Madras Civil Service, as the case might be—I would reserve a certain proportion, say, one-third, of the appointments in each grade, and would exclude this proportion from the category of appointments to be made in ordinary course in accordance with seniority. It should be understood that if the Government nominated to any of the appointments so reserved persons of proved merit and ability belonging to groups I, II, and III, officers expecting promotion on grounds of seniority would have no cause of complaint. On the other hand, when it was unnecessary to make any exceptional appointment the reserved posts might go by seniority like the others.

The three remaining groups may be considered together. In the case of untried men, when there are no political reasons for special arrangements, the best test of relative claims certainly seems to be an educational one; but in the case of men to whom a large share in the government of such a country as the Punjab will be committed, we cannot depend upon educational tests alone. I think the present principles should be maintained and admission to the service be made from a nominated list by competition amongst the candidates, subject to the rule that no one shall be appointed who does not satisfy some minimum educational test.

The scheme which has to be devised being intended for expansion, we must endeavour to forecast the political effects of any principles which may now be advocated when applied on a large scale. Here I would repeat the trite remark that a besetting danger of such a Government as ours is the tendency to overlook local differences

of history, popular character, composition of classes and political and social combinations and chances, and to apply broad uniform systems generally to the country at large. The political interests of the country are bound up with the political interests of the Government, and it is not in accordance with these interests that the populations of different Provinces should grow to conformity with a single type. From people unacquainted with India or seeking to enlist in favor of their objects the political partisanship of the English parliamentary arena, we often hear language which suggests that there is such a thing as nationality in India; and that there is an Indian people or nation, as much united in tradition and feeling as a European nation, inhabiting a determinate territory under British sway. I need not waste the time of the Commission by demonstrating the entire falsity of this theory of the position. The Mahrattas and the Sikhs did, it is true, show the signs of incipient nationality; but in both cases it was, in their strongest days, quite inchoate, and there are now no nationalities in India. There are races, and tribes, and castes, scattered over vast territories and in most parts of the country intimately intermingled with each other in strata which never blend. There is no more an Indian people than there is one nation inhabiting the whole of Europe, and in my humble judgment it is not to the true political interest of the country that there should be one Indian people in the European sense of the word. I think, therefore, that in any thing which may now be done we should study the important principle of maintaining and even extending provincial variety.

That is a matter of political principle. Another guide in framing a satisfactory scheme is, of course, experience; and here I would point out that we have a wide experience extending over the greater part of a century, of populations, now amounting to nearly sixty millions, governed by Native agency under British influence and occasionally under close British supervision. Successes and failures in Native States should afford useful indications both of what may be done and of what we should endeavour to avoid. In the administrative character of Native Governments and in the consequent security and contentment of the populations, there are, of course, enormous differences. But under the Native Governments which are best administered, it is not, I think, rash to assert that security and contentment are well established. I do not, of course, intend to suggest that for territory for which we are directly responsible we should establish precisely that system of administration which obtains in well-ordered Native States. There are claims and expectations raised and interests created by the steady application of the British system, which it would be unjust to impair by any sweeping alterations in the form of local government or the incidence of laws; and there are influences controlling the whole governing body which would peremptorily forbid any considerable departure from the methods of administration which the experience and necessities of direct government have gradually formed. I only say that the precedent of well governed Native States should be borne in mind when we consider both what it is safe to do in providing further employment for Natives, what it is practicable to do, and how to do it.

This leads me to the remark which, of any I venture to offer, seems to me to possess most consequence. I think a scheme for the further employment of Natives to be effective, permanent, and safe, should rest on a territorial basis. In parts of India prepared for such a change, and where we could find a sufficiency of trained, upright and capable men without importing Indian foreigners, I would set apart certain districts to be administered judicially and executively by Native agency under Local Governments. The supervision of these districts should rest in the first instance with British Commissioners, but I would distinctly contemplate the ultimate appointment of Native Commissioners when the particular province could produce men of the type of the late Dewan Rangacharlu, of Sir Madhava Rao, Sir Dinkar Rao and others. In the selected districts I would aim at the gradual simplification of the British system in such ways as to make it more easily workable by Native agency. If in any selected tract there should occur large towns or cantonments with mixed populations and conflicting interests, or any other place which for political or strategic reasons called for local administration by a British officer, I would deal with the town or place exterritorially, just as we deal with cantonments or assigned tracts in Native territory. I do not think such arrangements would require any immediate alteration of the law. It would be practicable to schedule the districts under Chapter 33 Vic., C. 3, and then to introduce by regulation such changes as experience might show to be required. The districts should be selected with the greatest care; political and strategic considerations should be given full weight; and ample securities should be afforded to the inhabitants that they should have no reason to complain of the change. In the Punjab, for instance, they would continue to be able to carry their grievances to the Chief Court, the British Commissioner and the Local Government. We should take particular pains to guard against slothfulness, the sacrifice of individual interests to official intrigues and quarrels, partiality of race, caste or religion, corruption and the various forms of oppression, which result from pride of place and the inconsiderate, harsh or deliberately vindictive use of power; because we know by sad experience that these are faults which have disgraced ill-conducted Native administration and called from time to time for interposition on the part of the

British Government. If the experiment failed in any district, a corrective could be applied by the temporary reintroduction of British officers. If it succeeded, more districts could in course of time be added to the selected number.

Of this general idea the Native State in which I happen to be writing these remarks affords a practical illustration. The State of Mysore has an area of 24,723 square miles and a population of 4,186,188. The administration was assumed by the British Government on the ground of the misrule of the Maharaja, and it was retained in British hands for half a century. The British system and British laws were introduced and a British Commission organized of the type familiar to us in non-Regulation Provinces. In 1867 Her Majesty's Government decided to maintain the family of the late Maharaja on the throne in the person of his adopted son. The minority of the son afforded ample time for preparation; and in 1881 the Province was restored to Native rule, that is to a Maharaja and Native officials to be administered on the British system and under British laws The Instrument of Transfer provides that all laws and rules having the force of law in force in the Mysore territories when the Maharaja was placed in possession of them shall be maintained and efficiently administered, the Maharaja having no power to repeal or modify them except with the previous consent of the Governor-General in Council; that no material change in the established system of administration shall be made without that consent; and that title-deeds granted and settlements of land revenue made shall be duly maintained. Ample power is reserved in the most explicit language to resume the possession of the territory if the conditions of transfer are broken or left unobserved. In dealing with British territory, there would, of course, be no Maharaja in the case, and we should be still more free to take effective securities for good government. There would be no occasion for express stipulations; but I have mentioned some which occur in the Mysore Instrument to show how closely the Mysore Province approximates to the arrangement I have in view, that is the management of British districts by Native officials under sufficient precautions for proper administration. The Mysore experiment has now been tried for nearly six years. The British officials were for the most part pensioned or provided with employment elsewhere, but there are still some European officers in high positions in the State. I have good ground for the remark that the machinery works smoothly at present, though inclined to be a little slack. I submit that, on the whole, the experience of Mysore is sufficient to show that the idea I suggest is not chimerical.

The requirements of the administration being generally the same before and after the further employment of Natives, we cannot give them more and better appointments without taking appointments away from the Covenanted Civilians and their Military and Uncovenanted brother-officers of the non-Regulation Commission. It is no consolation to existing incumbents to say that the figure of recruitment can be altered so as to place their successors in as good a position as they expected for themselves. I think, therefore, that efforts should be made to secure for existing incumbents as good promotion as they would have had if offices reserved exclusively for them had not been thrown open to others; and in this I include not merely pay, but position, responsibility and consideration.

I come now to the organization of the parallel Civil Service to be officered exclusively in India. If the principle of administering selected districts by Native agency be recognized as suitable for application wherever local circumstances admit, the question of recruiting for this agency then arises as an entirely distinct one, which might and indeed should be solved in different ways in different provinces, variety of system following the degree in which the province has advanced, the different claims of different classes in the part of the country concerned, the extent of the application of the principle, the usual form of local administration and other similar considerations of a local nature. Care should be taken to make as little alteration as possible in existing arrangements consistently with giving real effect to the scheme. In the Punjab I would add some District and Divisional Judgeships and Deputy Commissionerships to the list of appointments tenable by Uncovenanted officers outside the Commission proper, entirely give up recruiting in India for the Covenanted ranks, and adjust the pay of the whole Uncovenanted service, expanded as above, on the principle that in the case of the higher appointments to be officered from the service recruited in India, the pay should be two-thirds of that assigned to the parallel appointments filled by competition civilians and military officers in civil employ The work of the Commissioners of Divisions, already onerous, would be increased by the supervision they would exercise over districts administered by Native agency, and in time other Commissionerships would need to be established. For the cost of these the saving caused by the above arrangements would in whole or part provide.

In this way we should have a Native or Indian Civil Service ranging from Tahsildars (or perhaps Naib Tahsildars) to Divisional Judges, and eventually, when suitable men could be found, to Commissioners; and from this service the districts selected for administration by Native agency would be officered, the rest of the service discharging the functions of Assistants and Magistrates and judicial officers in the districts administered by British agency as at present. It is needless to say that too hard-and-fast rules as to appointment to the

Vol. I, Sec. III, Sub-Sec. B.

C. L. *Tupper*, Esq.

selected districts would be objectionable; and we should have to provide that the selected districts and judgeships might be held by officers of the Bengal Civil Service and Military civilians whenever a competent member of the Native or Indian Civil Service was not available for the charge.

As regards admission to the Native or Indian Civil Service, I should have been disposed to require every one to enter as a Tahsildar or Naib Tahsildar or Munsif were it not for certain practical difficulties. The appointments of Tahsildars and Munsifs, if we look to their responsibilities and the usual scale of living among Native gentry, are by no means inconsiderable posts. The Tahsildar is a very big man in his country neighbourhood; and as, fortunately for us, all Government service is considered honourable, there would be no disinclination on the part of men of good family to see their sons begin at this or a like grade. The conditions under which men accept employment after competition in Europe are wholly different; and no argument can, I think, be drawn from the position assigned to Assistant Magistrates and Assistant Commissioners appointed in that way to prove that in recruiting for the Native Civil Service we should usher in the recruits at the same stage. But for the Tahsildarships especially we want experience, and the numbers of Tahsildars' and Munsifs' charges are necessarily so large that men of family appointed to the bottom of the list would take too long to work their way up to the high positions which we should wish them to have, while to promote them, otherwise than for very special service or ability, out of their turn would be invidious and for many reasons objectionable. On the whole I would keep to the existing plan, recruiting Tahsildars and Munsifs as at present. I would fill up the Extra Assistantships under the present rules or with such small alterations in the rules as might be necessary to bring them into harmony with the general objects of the whole scheme.

I have already said that I would reserve a certain proportion, perhaps one-third, of the higher appointments for special promotions or appointments when necessary or expedient. This provision would be essential to the satisfactory working of any such scheme as that which has occurred to me. I would add the free use of honorary agency in the selected and other districts. To improve this and provide for cases of men whose services we should desire to enlist, but who would not care to attach themselves to a graded service, I would give every Honorary Magistrate or Civil Judge a fairly good stipend, say perhaps Rs. 100 a month, requiring him to find his own court, contingencies and clerical assistance; —the stipend to be increased possibly to Rs. 150 a month, when the officer received full powers and to cease whenever the powers were no longer exercised. Service of this kind would carry no claim to promotion or pension. But men who proved their merit and ability by long or exceptionally good service of this almost honorary kind should be eligible for direct appointment at an age under fifty-five years to the reserved posts in the higher ranks of the Native Civil Service. A man so appointed would not be eligible for pension, nor would he be able to claim promotion on grounds of seniority.

27th January 1887.

Answers by Mr. C. L. Tupper.

I.—Working of the existing Statutory System.

* 7 & 8. What amendments do you advocate in Section 6 of the Statute? Do you consider that Section 6 of the Statute supplies such a definition of the words "Natives of India" as describes with sufficient clearness, fulness, and accuracy the various classes of persons for whose appointment to Covenanted posts it is desirable to provide?—I advocate the repeal of the section, because (1)—Though entirely in favor of the more extended employment of the Natives of India, I think it a wrong principle to arrange for this by breaking down the guarantees afforded to the Civil Service by 24 and 25 Vic., Chapter 54, without substituting other guarantees in room of those rescinded. (2) The general removal of all guarantee in favor of Natives of India of proved merit and ability tends to complicate official jealousies with questions of race. Australians, Canadians, Englishmen and Bengalis who may win their way into the service by open competition may alike ask why appointments formerly reserved by Statute to them should be given to others, simply because the latter are Natives of India. If the reply be that the more extended employment of Natives is politically and administratively desirable, the competition service may legitimately rejoin—in what way then is it proposed to safeguard our interests? This consideration the section overlooks. (3) Unless equitable safeguards are provided for the interests of the competition service (which includes Natives of India with others), it will never be practicable to act on the section widely enough to do justice to the legitimate claims

* Note.—The numbers refer to Section B of the questions framed.

of Natives of good education and good family who have not passed the open competition. (4) The section is defective because it might be read to relate to only one class from which we should recruit, and it defines that too vaguely. How are merit and ability to be proved? The section supplies no answer. We require to recruit Natives of India who (*a*) have proved their merit and ability in the practice of a profession [illegible] the discharge of public duties; and [illegible]ied men who may be considered [illegible] by reason of their character and [illegible]onal attainments. The preamble of [illegible]ection seems to refer to (*a*). The [illegible]tive part of it appears wide enough [illegible] include (*b*), and has so been interpreted in [illegible]ractice. The uncertainty as to the real [illegible]ntention of the Legislature should be cleared [illegible]up. If the section is retained, I would amend it by inserting (*i*) after the words "Native of India" in line 15, the words and figures "who has (1) proved his merit and ability by practising a profession or discharging public duties for not less than five years, or (2) satisfied the Governor-General in Council by passing an examination and other evidence that he is, in point of character and educational attainments, fit for the office, place or employment to which it is proposed to appoint him."

I prefer the term "discharging public duties" to "in the service of Government," because I think we should include amongst persons eligible Honorary Magistrates and Judges, members, and perhaps servants of local bodies and officials of Native States.

I would further add after the words "dominions of Her Majesty in India" the words "or any Indian Native State in subordinate alliance with the British Government."

23. Has the Statutory system had the effect of securing men, who, in point of education or natural ability, are superior to the average of those appointed or promoted to the higher ranks of the Uncovenanted Service?—Not in the Punjab. Of seven officers who may be considered Statutory Civilians in the Punjab, that is, including Dewan Ram Nath and Muhammad Hayat Khan, I should say, speaking from their reputations as known in the Secretariat, that three are somewhat above the Uncovenanted average, though they are in no way better than the best of our Uncovenanted men; while one, at least, is distinctly below that average.

24. Has the result of the Statutory system been to secure the services of men of better social position and better family than those who usually accept posts in the Uncovenanted Service?—On the whole we get much the same class of men in both services.

25 & 27. Do young men among the landed aristocracy or of good family display unwillingness to accept employment under the Statutory Rules? Do young men among the landed aristocracy or of good family display unwillingness to accept posts in the Uncovenanted Service, and a willingness to accept employment under the Statutory Rules?—I never heard of any unwillingness on the part of the young men mentioned to accept posts either in the Uncovenanted Service or under the Statutory Rules.

29. Has experience shown that the Statutory Civilians of aristocratic family are as punctual and regular in the discharge of their duties as those selected from other classes?—Two Statutory Civilians of aristocratic family in the Punjab appeared to be turning out badly up to the time when I ceased to officiate as Secretary to Government, viz., February last.

31. Has the appointment of Natives under the Statutory Rules or under 24 and 25 Vic., Chapter 54, produced uncertainty or uneasiness in the minds of Covenanted Civil Servants as to their promotion and prospects?—Great uneasiness was caused by the appointment of Dewan Ram Nath to be a District Judge in the Punjab.

32. Seeing that the proportion of Natives has been fixed, and that the scale of recruitment for the Civil Service has been adjusted accordingly, is this feeling of uncertainty or uneasiness, if it exists, well-founded?—As regards the particular appointment just mentioned, it is not necessary for me to express any opinion here, though I am prepared to give my opinion if required to do so. I think, however, that such uneasiness would be well founded in so far as there is uncertainty as to the position which may be assigned to Natives appointed otherwise than by open competition in the list of any Commission, Regulation or Non-Regulation.

II.—Mode of Selection of Statutory Civilians.

42. If competition (whether limited or open) is preferred, should there be one competition for all India or separate competitions in each Province?—I think there are strong political reasons against one competition for all India.

45. Under any of the three systems of nomination, limited competition, and open competition would you prescribe any test of preliminary qualifications on the part of nominees or candidates in regard to (1) age, (2) intellectual capacity, (3) moral, social, and physical fitness?—On the assumption that the Statutory system is retained, I concur generally in the views expressed in Punjab Government letter No. 2554, dated 7th November 1885, and in the rules annexed to Punjab Government letter No. 144, dated 19th January 1886. These rules (*vide* Rule 3) provide for indispensable preliminary qualifications. I answer the next four questions very briefly in accordance with the above remarks.

Vol. I, Sec. III, Sub-Sec. B.

C. L. *Tupper*, Esq.

47. Do you consider that (after selection whether by nomination or competition) there should be a period of probation?—Yes.

48. If so, what should be the duration of the probationary period?—Two years at least.

49. Should the period of probation be passed in the ranks of the Uncovenanted Service, or of the Covenanted Service, or in what other manner?—In the ranks of the Covenanted Service.

50. Do you consider that after selection and before entering on probation (or on duty) the person selected should undergo special training?—No. He should be trained in practical work and by reading for the Assistant Commissioner's examination in accordance with the draft rules annexed to the letter of the Government of India in the Home Department, No. 25—1078, dated 18th June 1885.

53 to 56. If you do not consider special training in England essential, would you encourage nominees or selected candidates to visit England with a view to add to their qualifications for the service? If so, what form should such encouragement take? Should it be offered before, or during, or after the probationary period, if any, through which nominees or selected candidates may be required to pass? Should it be offered before or after the nominees or selected candidates enter on their duties?—I am not in favor of encouraging nominees or selected candidates to visit England [illegible] they have had several years' exper[illegible]sary practical work in India. After gaini[illegible]d be experience, I think they may usefu[illegible]any encouraged, by the prospect of the app[illegible] to tion of Government, to visit England du[illegible]ry periods of furlough; but I would [illegible] offer them any special facilities for th[illegible] purpose.

57. Are you in favor of the establi[illegible]ment of scholarships tenable by Natives in England for the purpose of enabling them to qualify for the Civil or Statutory Service?—I am entirely opposed to any such scheme.

III.—Competition in England for the Indian Civil Service.

67. Should additional facilities be given to Natives for proceeding to England and entering the Indian Civil Service by the channel of the English competition?—None, except that the limit of age should be raised.

70. What is your opinion as to giving Statutory appointments to Natives who, though they may have failed to secure a place amongst the successful candidates, have shown merit in the English competition?—Any such arrangement would be a very bad one.

76. Should the examination for Natives in England be distinct in standards and conditions from that for English candidates, or should there be one and the same examination for all?—There should be one and the same examination for all.

84 & 85. If there should be only one examination for all candidates, should the limits of age for Natives be higher than those at present fixed for European candidates? and, if so, what should the limits for Native candidates be? If higher limits of age were fixed for Natives than European candidates, might not the latter complain that they were placed at a disadvantage?—I would raise the limit of age to twenty-three for all candidates, European, Colonial, and Native.

IV.—Competition in India for the Indian Civil Service.

89. Do you advocate a competition in India for the Civil Service simultaneously with the competition in England, the same question papers being used at both examinations?—I am strongly opposed to such a competition. If simultaneous examinations are to be held, why not also in Australia, Canada and at the Cape? What security could there be for a uniform standard? Further, there would be danger in India of the papers getting out.

90. How would this method of selection be regarded by the Native community generally?—I believe this method would be highly popular with Natives educated in European style.

93. Do you consider that the educational institutions available in India are at present capable of giving the very high class education which it was the object of the competitive system as introduced in 1855 to secure?—No.

94. Would an open competition in India be likely to give decided advantages to any particular class or classes of the Native community over others?—Yes, to Bengali Babus and Mahratta Brahmins, and, in a less degree, Parsis.

96. Do you think there are any objections on political or administrative grounds to open competition in India?—Very strong objections on these grounds. When we are obliged to have foreign administrations in particular provinces, it is much the best plan to have Europeans or men of European descent. There would be no advantage but the reverse in employing Bengali Babus and Mahratta Brahmins in high positions in such a province as the Punjab. It is of consequence that in recruiting for the Public Service we should look to classes upon which we can politically rely in times of grave danger.

99. Would a system of provincial examinations be preferable to one examination